Date: 26 June 2002
Time: 9.30am
Venue: Committee Room 3

Title: **LIFTING EVERY VOICE – PROGRESS ON ACTION PLAN**

Purpose

1. To inform the Committee on Equality of Opportunity of progress that has been made on achieving the Permanent Secretary's action plan to take forward the recommendations of the Lifting Every Voice report to eliminate employment practices and procedures which could discriminate against members of the black and minority ethnic communities.

Summary

2. This paper reports on the consultation that was undertaken on the draft Recruitment and Deployment strategy and provides a summary of the comments received highlighting the main issues that were raised. It also provides a progress report on the Permanent Secretary's action plan for the implementation of the recommendations of the 'Lifting Every Voice' Report.

Timing

4. At the January meeting of the Committee, the Permanent Secretary undertook to report back on progress in implementing the action plan at six-monthly intervals. This paper fulfils that commitment.

Background

5. The Lifting Every Voice report was presented to the Committee by its author, Roger McKenzie, at its meeting on 21 March 2001. At that meeting the Permanent Secretary undertook to produce an action plan for the Committee's consideration at the end of three months setting out proposals for implementing each of the recommendations in the Lifting Every Voice report. An implementation group, chaired by Roger McKenzie, was established to produce the action plan. The plan was presented to the Committee for information in July 2001. The Permanent Secretary is working to make the Assembly an exemplar equality employer and will use the Lifting Every Voice report as one of his main means of achieving this.

6. Since July 2001, a steering group, chaired by Peter Gregory, has been overseeing progress on the action plan. The updated action plan is attached at **Annex A** and indicates the progress that has been made on each recommendation. Proposals made regarding specific actions to implement the recommendations are being checked for compliance with any relevant legal requirements as they are developed.

Current position

7. Of the 43 recommendations contained in the report, 17 are already in place, many having been Assembly practice for some time. Work on a further 24 is underway. 2 of the recommendations are yet to be actioned as they relate to the audit of the other recommendations once they are in place.

Draft Staff Deployment and Recruitment Strategy

8. The recruitment and staff deployment strategy which the Committee saw at its January meeting and commented on was issued for consultation in March 2002. The main consultees were National Assembly staff and their comments have been analysed and a summary is at **Annexes B and C**. In addition the three equality commissions in Wales, the Civil Service Commissioners and Roger McKenzie were invited to comment and a summary is at **Annex D**.

9. Overall the general approach proposed in the strategy to more open and job specific recruitment was welcomed. There was a recognition that the Assembly needed to be more representative of the community it served and in particular that more opportunities should be created for under represented groups to join the Assembly as employees. However a number of issues were raised the key ones being:

- **Impact on career development and progression of Assembly staff as a result of removing the opportunities for internal progression.**

The majority of those who responded were concerned at the impact the removal of internal progression opportunities would have on staff morale. Many commented that they had joined the civil service as a career and had expectations of progressing within its structure if they achieved the required competencies and skills. These concerns were also shared by the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Civil Service Commissioners. There were many suggestions on how progression could be achieved in a more open manner but the one that was most frequently put forward was that a three stage process should be put in place when filling vacancies:

1. advertise vacancy laterally within the Assembly;
2. advertise vacancy on promotion within the Assembly;
3. advertise the vacancy externally.

- **The assessment process and in particular the use of assessment centres.**

Staff in the main agreed with the three stage assessment process although there was quite a spread of views about the effectiveness of each stage. The main message was the need to make sure that all candidates (internal and external) were given clear guidance on the process and where appropriate training should be offered. Most felt that the training opportunities should be made available to both internal staff and to the wider communities so that a level playing field was created at open competitions. There was also concern about the fairness of assessment centres and the need to ensure that they were equality proofed and relevant to the competencies of the band and job that was being recruited to.

11. The Permanent Secretary has been impressed by the constructive approach staff have taken to the consultation on the strategy and will take the views and suggestions made into consideration in finalising the strategy. The strategy will be subject to detailed negotiations with the Trade Union Side before it can be finalised.

12. As an indication of the staff deployment and recruitment activities currently undertaken by the Assembly, details of staff movements up to May 2002 are attached at **Annexes E and F**. There are also details of the number of job specific recruitment exercises undertaken to date in the year 2001-2002. A number of job specific promotion boards have been held over the last few months where it is clear that the expertise is present in the Assembly and that a credible field of candidates can be attracted.

Timing of implementation

13. An implementation plan will be drawn up as part of these negotiations with a target date of October 2002 for introducing the strategy.

Compliance

14. There are no issues of regularity or propriety in relation to this paper.

Cross-cutting themes

15. By implementing the recommendations of the Lifting Every Voice report, the Assembly will be further demonstrating its commitment to equality of opportunity.

Action

16. The Committee is invited to note progress on the Permanent Secretary's action plan and the outcome of the consultation on the draft staff deployment and recruitment strategy.

Contact Point - Delyth Thomas

Annex A - Update on Lifting Every Voice Action Plan (Matrix)

Annex B - Analysis of questionnaire - Summary quantitative

Annex C - Analysis of questionnaire - Summary Qualitative

Annex D - Summary of comments from external consultees

Annex E - National Assembly - Vacancies Filled - October 2002 to May 2003

Annex F - Recruitment - specific posts openly advertised during 2001-02 to date.

ANNEX A

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS OF "LIFTING EVERY VOICE" REPORT AND IDENTIFIED ACTIONS – PROGRESS REPORT AS AT 9 JANUARY, 2002

RECOMMENDATION	ACTION/COMMENTS	BY WHOM	TARGET DATE/STATUS

Recommendations falling to Perm Sec and/or Ministers: **Total 12** **Status: Underway 6** **Completed 6** **To be actioned 0**			
1. The Assembly should formally adopt the definition of institutional racism as put forward by the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report. (Page 11)	1) Proposal to restate formal adoption to be considered by Equal Opps Committee 2) Formal adoption in Assembly plenary session	Equal Opps Committee, Perm Sec and First Minister	Completed **1) 11 July Committee meeting** 2) 17 July 2001 – Plenary statement on institutional racism 3) Definition integrated into equality training for all staff
2. The acceptance of the definition should be circulated to all Assembly staff and Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies (ASPBs). (Page 11)	Notice to all staff	First Minister and Perm Sec	**Completed** Definition included in Links magazine article of August 2001. Letter sent from Finance Minister to Chairs and from officials to CEOs of ASPBs.
3. ASPBs should be formally told to adopt the same definition of institutional racism where they have not already done so. (Page 11)	ASPB Chief Executives to be required to adopt this definition in their annual remit.	Relevant Cabinet Minister (via ACO)	**Completed** see 2 above.

30. The team of staff within the EPU who are directly involved in developing and monitoring race equality initiatives should be substantially increased. (Page 30)	Business case for enlarged EPU commissioned by Permanent Secretary.	Perm Sec	**Business case produced -** Permanent Secretary agreed proposals, December 2001. Additional funding being provided to take proposals forward. Two additional G7s appointed , one already in post and other to join in August. Recommendations 30, 31 and 33 being implemented. For recommendation 32, see below.
31. The relocation of the EPU outside its current position within the structure of the Assembly. (Page 30)	To be considered within business case at recommendation 30.	Perm Sec	Now being implemented.
32. The EPU should report directly to one of the Senior Assembly Directors. (Page 30)	To be considered within business case at recommendation 30.	Perm Sec	Permanent Secretary decided that EPU will report directly to him once Head of Unit is appointed - Autumn 2002.
33. There should be an upgrading of the Head of Unit post to one commensurate with the Senior Civil Service. (Page 30)	To be considered within business case at recommendation 30.	Perm Sec	Now being implemented – Recruitment process commenced in February 2002 with tender to appoint recruitment consultant. Advert planned for June 2002..
37. Assembly members should be subject to the same mandatory training requirement as staff. (Page 33)	Part of equality training strategy. Equal Opps Committee considered mandatory requirement not practical for AMs but they should be encouraged to participate. Chair of Committee to be invited to write to party leaders.	Chair of Equal Opps Committee and Party Leaders	**Completed** Training strategy for members presented to Committee, 31 October 2001
38. A written implementation strategy to be presented to Assembly members within no more than three months. (Page 35)	To be presented to Permanent Secretary by 11 June and to Equal Opps Committee on 11 July	Implementation Group and Perm Sec	**Completed** – July 2001
39. The implementation strategy should be made public. (Page 35)	Will be made public as a committee paper – requirement one week before committee meeting.	Perm Sec	**Completed** – July 2001

40. Endorsement of part one of the action plan. (Page 39)	**1) Assessment of position regarding reviews and audits highlighted.** 2) Proposal for endorsement by Committee and subsequent statement to the Assembly	1) EPU Division 2) Perm Sec/ Ministers	EPU undertaking assessment of position
41. Endorsement of part two of the action plan. (Page 41)	As 40 above	1) EPU Division 2) Perm Sec/ Ministers	As 40 above.

Recommendations falling to Personnel Division **Total: 29** **Status: Underway 12** **Completed 17** **To be actioned 0**			
4. The establishment of a joint working party with representatives of the black community and the trade union to bring forward recommendations on the establishment of pre-entry training programmes for the black community. (Page 22)	Establish working party by identifying relevant participants. Consider models and best practice used by other bodies.	Personnel Division with Trade Union Side	Preliminary meeting held on 12 November. Assistance given for Band A recruitment exercise in December 2001. First meeting held 17 April 2002 with Race Equality Councils, AWEMA and unions.
5. All persons who are likely to be involved in any part of this process should be trained in the policies and procedures as regards equality as well as the law. (Page 22)	Link into new equality training strategy document issued for very limited consultation week of 16 May by EPU.	Personnel Division	Draft training strategy agreed by Permanent Secretary. Introductory seminars began in September. Now taking place for all groups in Assembly. Expected completion date Autumn 2002.

6. No member of staff should be allowed to participate in this process unless they have undertaken this training. (Page 22)	**1) Evaluation of current training underway.** 2) Implement with adoption of equality training strategy.	Personnel Division	**Completed** New training course being delivered and no staff are permitted to take part in the recruitment process until they have attended the course.
7. All posts, of whatever grade, should be advertised and open to competition. (Page 23)	New recruitment strategy and vacancy management system to be introduced.	Personnel Division	Consultation on draft recruitment strategy completed and analysed. Presented to Equality Committee on 26th June. Final strategy subject to detailed negotiations with Trade Unions.
8. Equal weight should be given to external and internal applicants for posts with the only principle being that an applicant meets the job and person specifications. (Page 23)	Already in place.	Personnel Division	**Completed**
9. The practice of recruiting to generic grades, such as Clerical Officer, Executive Officer or Higher Executive Officer, should be ended and replaced with specific job titles with their own competencies and job descriptions etc. (Page 23)	Linked to recommendation 7.	Personnel Division	As 7 above. Band F pilot recruitment scheme completed and evaluation in progress.
10. There should be one standard application form that is used for all vacant posts. (Page 23)	Linked to recommendation 7.	Personnel Division	**Completed** A standard application form is now in use supported by competency questionnaire relevant to each Band /Job. The application forms will be reviewed as part of the evaluation of the Band F pilot recruitment scheme.
11. Monitoring forms should be retained by the personnel section on an entirely confidential basis with strictly no access by an appointment panel. (Page 24)	Already in place	Personnel Division	**Completed**

12. The data from these forms should form part of the basis of the annual report of progress on equal opportunities. (Page 24)	Already in place	Personnel Division	**Completed** Part of annual reporting process of equality monitoring issues processed by Personnel Division
13. All appointments must be on the basis of the individual competence to do the job. (Page 24)	Already in place	Personnel Division	**Completed**
14. Appointment panels should be involved in the whole process from short-listing to final appointment. (Page 24)	Already in place	Personnel Division	**Completed**
15. Any panel member not able to take part in any one part of the process should not be able to participate in the final selection process. (Page 24)	In majority of cases, panel members involved in all stages of process. Best practice will be addressed within new recruitment strategy.	Personnel Division	As 7 above. Guidelines indicate this requirement.
16. Panels should be no larger than 3 persons for most posts and should consist of the relevant head of division or section, a personnel specialist and one person, of a grade senior to that being appointed, from another division. (Page 24)	Panels normally consist of three people and mostly meet the suggested requirement. Best practice will be addressed within new recruitment strategy. Panels for larger recruitment exercises for Bands A and B may consist of two people.	Personnel Division	As 7 above. A requirement of the new procedures but also reflects current practice where practicable.
17. The sifting of applications to agree a shortlist should be a two level process. (Page 24)	Current arrangements go further than recommendation. All panel members discuss and agree on final list.	Personnel Division	**Completed**
18. All questions asked during the interview must only relate to the person specification. (Page 24)	Linked to recommendation 7.	Personnel Division	**Completed**
19. All candidates must be asked the same questions. (Page 24)	Implemented with 2001 promotion boards. Linked to recommendation 7.	Personnel Division	**Completed** Initial structured questions areall the same. Follow up questions depend on response to initial questions.
20. All interviews should be scored on the basis of a common scoring system. (Page 24)	Already in place	Personnel Division	**Completed**
21. The discussion on scores given to each candidate should take place on the completion of all interviews. (Page 25)	Already in place	Personnel Division	**Completed**

22. Trade union representatives should be invited (with proper notice) to observe all interviews. (Page 25)	Linked to recommendations 7 and 9.	Personnel Division	As 7 above. To be built into process where practicable and acceptable to candidates.
23. Every new member of staff should have an induction programme. (Page 25)	Already in place. Review of content and delivery of current programme completed and new procedures and welcome pack in place. Available in hard copy and on personnel website on Assembly intranet. Further improvements to be introduced by April 2002 as part of the rollout of the Excellence Model.	Personnel Division	**Completed.**
24. A system of mentoring should also be introduced. (Page 25)	System in place but currently being reviewed.	Personnel Division	20 Band F staff now trained as mentors. Pilot to be undertaken with some members of Management Development Programme for Minority Ethnic staff. Band F staff recruited from January 2002 will also receive mentoring.
25. A new and separately funded development scheme should be created specifically for black members of staff. (Page 25)	Already in place. Scheme launched on 30 April.	Personnel Division	**Completed.** Review carried out in Autumn 2001.
26. A joint management and trade union working party should be established to develop the details of such a scheme. (Page 26)	Current scheme developed in conjunction with Trade Union Side.	Personnel Division	**Completed**
27. An equality clause for inclusion in the appraisal scheme of all members of staff at the earliest opportunity. (Page 26)	Review of appraisal system underway as part of People Performance Management stream of Better Government	Personnel Division	**Completed.** As from April 2002 every member of staff has to have a diversity objective
28. There should be specific training on the use of this clause for all staff. (Page 26)	To be considered as part of review project.	Personnel Division	Training in the new Performance Management System includes this. Commenced in April 2002 to be concluded in the autumn.
29. That the Assembly works with the trade union to agree a system of equality proofing for appraisal schemes.(Page 29)	Trade Union Side involved in development of project.	Personnel Division	**Completed**

34. Training on race should be compulsory for all staff at all levels of the organisation. (Page 33)	Part of equality training strategy. See rec 5.	Personnel Division	Training programme commenced September 2001.
35. This training should be specific on race at induction level with more detailed specific sessions at later dates. (Page 33)	See rec 34 above.	Personnel Division	See rec 34 above. Included in new staff induction programme.
36. Race related training should also be mainstreamed within all training offered by the Assembly. (Page 33)	See rec 34 above.	Personnel Division	See rec 34 above.
Recommendations falling to Public Administration, Equality and Public Appointments Division (Now Equality Policy Unit) **Total: 2** **Status: Underway 0** **Completed 0** **To be actioned 2**			
42. The Assembly should make sufficient funds available for the CRE to commission an independent audit of progress on the action plan. (Page 42)	Consideration to be given to Race Relations Amendment Act requirements and how they dovetail with recommendation as well as funding implications. Inappropriate to invite CRE to monitor/audit as it might conflict with statutory role.	EPU Division	Independent audit to be undertaken by body to be agreed.
43. This independent audit should be conducted on an agreed timetable (between the Assembly and the CRE) and should make suggestions on any adjustments that the Assembly should make in its implementation strategy. (Page 42)	Timetable to be drawn up and process agreed.	EPU Division	As rec 42 above.

STAFF DEPLOYMENT AND RECRUITMENT STRATEGY: CONSULTATION QUESTIONNAIRE - Summary of Responses

The numbering is not sequential as the questions are those requiring quantitative responses. The responses to the questions requiring qualitative answers or comment have been analysed separately and are at Annex C.

Open recruitment process

1. *In future, posts should be filled by lateral transfer (a sideways move).*

Agree	55%
Neither agree nor disagree	16%
Disagree	29%

2. *If lateral transfer does not identify a suitable candidate, posts should be filled by open recruitment.*

Agree	49%
Neither agree nor disagree	16%
Disagree	35%

4. *The new system would mean that the current system of promotion boards would no longer exist. Progression within the Assembly would be achieved only by success at an open recruitment exercise. Please indicate whether you agree or disagree with the following statements.*

a) The present system of promotion boards should be discontinued.

Agree	45%
Neither agree nor disagree	13%
Disagree	42%

b) Promotion should be achieved only through success at an open recruitment exercise.

Agree	26%
Neither agree nor disagree	12%
Disagree	63%

d) There should be no bar on the posts for which staff should apply through open competition.

Agree	71%
Neither agree nor disagree	18%
Disagree	11%

6. The lateral transfer process is conducted appropriately at present.

Agree	32%
Neither agree nor disagree	33%
Disagree	35%

7. The lateral transfer process should be conducted on a more formal basis than at present.

Agree	26%
Neither agree nor disagree	37%
Disagree	37%

9.Successful candidates should take up their new posts after four weeks

Agree	71%
Neither agree nor disagree	20%

Disagree	9%

10. *Successful candidates should remain in post for a minimum of two years following posting unless there are exceptional circumstances.*

Agree	31%
Neither agree nor disagree	11%
Disagree	58%

11. *How long should candidates remain in post?*

No Minimum period	63%
6 months	11%
1 year	29%
2 years	6%
More than 2 years	>1%

12. a) The suggested process for open recruitment should involve the following stages:

- *Stage 1 - application for a specific job;*
- *Stage 2 - assessment centre to test competencies for the grade;*
- *Stage 3 - job specific interview.*

Agree	43%
Neither agree nor disagree	14%
Disagree	43%

b) If you disagree with 12a) above, with what part(s) of the process do you agree?

Stage	1: job specific applications	2: assessment centres	3: job specific interview
Agree	38%	50%	12%

Disagree	13%	56%	31%
Neither	40%	52%	8%

13. a) Candidates who are successful at the assessment centre have demonstrated that they meet the competencies for the grade. If they fail the job specific interview, they should have a 'ticket' to apply in open competition with other candidates for other posts advertised openly at the appropriate level without having to re-sit the assessment centre.

Agree	77%
Neither agree nor disagree	11%
Disagree	12%

b) If you agree with 13a) above how long should the 'ticket' last?

1 year	42%
2 years	27%
3 years	6%
Unlimited	26%

Recruitment panels

15. a) The line manager of the post being advertised will always be a member of the interview panel. Other members should be identified and selected randomly via a 'jury service' system.

Agree	62%
Neither agree nor disagree	16%
Disagree	22%

16. Panel members should receive training in structured interviewing techniques, setting selection criteria, assessment centres, equality issues, employment law.

Agree	88%
Neither agree nor disagree	8%
Disagree	3%

17. Do you think panel members should receive any additional training?

Agree	20%
Neither agree nor disagree	67%
Disagree	13%

Candidates

19. Candidates should receive training in structure interview techniques, completing application forms and the working of assessment centres.

Agree	60%
Neither agree nor disagree	18%
Disagree	22%

Annex C

STAFF DEPLOYMENT AND RECRUITMENT STRATEGY: CONSULTATION QUESTIONNAIRE - Qualitative Responses

The numbering is not sequential as the questions are those requiring qualitative responses. The responses to the questions requiring quantitative responses have been analysed separately at Annex B. In analysing the comments from consultees common themes have been identified and the comments grouped accordingly. Below is a summary of the key issues raised.

Open recruitment process

3.Do you have any comments on the open recruitment proposals?

- Impact on career development and progression

  Some staff commented that the salary alone was not a motivating factor for seeking employment in the Assembly, a key factor was the opportunities to develop their skills and gain progression. Staff were also concerned at the impact such a system would have on the Assembly's commitment to staff development. If the Assembly was going to recruit openly to fill any vacancy there was no incentive for managers to develop their staff. A few felt that the Assembly's IiP status would be in danger if this new system was introduced as one of the aims of IiP was to enable the development of internal staff to gain progression within their organisation.

- Impact on staff morale

  A large proportion of staff felt the strategy would have a detrimental effect on staff morale. They commented that hard working staff would feel that their contribution was not valued. Some also said that the result could be a higher turnover in staff and lead to retention difficulties

- Training for staff on assessment process

  This was seen as essential by the majority of those who commented

- Cost

  A sizeable proportion of respondents expressed concern at the cost of open recruitment in both financial and staff resourcing

- Timescale for introducing the new approach

  Respondents were concerned that whichever process was introduced was not rushed in but that time to explain it to staff and to put all the training support in place were factored in.

4c). If you disagree with the statement at 4b)(promotion should be achieved only through success at an open recruitment exercise), what system would you like to see in place to achieve progression within the Assembly?

- As proposed in strategy

  All respondents agreed that vacant posts should be filled through open recruitment but the majority believed that this should be after internal options had been exhausted.

- Advertise posts internally for lateral transfer or promotion at same time

  This was the most widely advocated system but as can be seen from below there were a number of options proposed on how the assessment should be conducted.

- Advertise posts internally for lateral transfer and then if the post remains unfilled advertise it internally for promotion

Most who made this suggestion thought that the board should not be limited to specific grades but open to all, a few did suggest that promotion by this means should be limited to the grade below. The later suggestion would mean that staff could only 'grade skip' by competing in open recruitment.

- Current process of internal promotion boards based on annual staff reports/competencies

  There were some variations to this proposal mainly that promotion boards should be held locally, that boards should not be limited to the grade below but be open and invite applications. Some staff also suggested that job specific promotion boards only should be held.

- Regular promotion boards generating ticket holders and supported by open recruitment when necessary

  A small minority suggested that regular promotion boards should be held and successful candidates are given tickets which they could cash in against internally advertised posts. Where a short fall between tickets and vacancies occurred open recruitment should be undertaken.

- Promotion boards on a generic basis up to Band D and then open recruitment as it would be easier to identify job specific posts at the more senior levels.

  Some respondents felt that from Band A to D it would be difficult to identify job specific posts. Therefore for posts where there were generic competencies a system of generic promotion boards should be retained. For Band E and above where it was easier to identify job specific post job specific promotion should be introduced. Similarly this approach should be applied to open recruitment.

- Automatic promotion on acquisition of academic/professional qualifications.

  This was a suggestion made mainly by professional and specialist staff who have limited opportunities for internal progression in their professional/specialist field. A small number also suggested that if the immediate line manager and senior manager assessed an individual as 'fitted for promotion' there should be no further assessment and that individual could apply for posts at the next grade.

- Internal staff should be exempt from assessment centres as assessment panels should have access to their performance assessment against competencies as contained in the ASR.

- Staff to have the right to apply to attend an assessment centre at any stage and at any level.

  Some said they thought that the opportunity for internal staff to attend an assessment centre should be an annual one with successful staff being able to 'cash' their tickets against lateral transfer adverts.

5. *Do you have any further comments on question 4?*

(The new system would mean that the current system of promotion boards would no longer exist. Progression within the Assembly would be achieved only by success at an open recruitment exercise. Please indicate whether you agree or disagree with the following statements:

a. *the present system of promotion boards should be discontinued.*
b. *Promotion should be achieved only through success at an open recruitment exercise?)*

- <u>A system where Band A staff could progress to Band B without the need for promotion boards</u>

  This suggestion involved Band A staff being assessed by managers against the competencies and once they achieved these being able to apply for Band B posts.

- <u>One respondent was concerned that the proposed system would disadvantage disabled applicants, both internal and external applicants.</u>

8. *How should the (lateral transfer) process be changed?*

- <u>The lateral transfer process should parallel the open recruitment process.</u> Those who suggested this supported the use of a structured application form and panel interview but felt that an assessment centre was not necessary. It was also felt that assessment should be made against band competencies and an independent assessor or a personnel representative should be part of the assessment panel

- The lateral process should be open to staff at the band in which the vacancy exists and the band below on promotion.

- An annual preference exercise open to all staff to move into vacant posts administered centrally by Personnel Division

- <u>The lateral transfer process should be monitored more rigorously to ensure equity of opportunity.</u>

  There was a widely held view that the current process was not being conducted in a consistent manner across the Assembly.

- Personnel Division should have more input in the system to post staff in certain circumstances

14. *Do you have any other comments?*

- <u>Assessment process</u>

  Staff were concerned that the process of assessment was open and transparent and based on ability to do the job. Concern about assessment centres focused mainly on a perception that graduates would have an advantage in attending them.

- <u>Specifying length of time an individual stays in a specific post</u>

  There was overall agreement that this is not an appropriate requirement to place on staff. A number of reasons covering personal and business needs were given to support this view.

- <u>How does the strategy address the developmental needs of fast stream staff</u>

The fast stream scheme requires people to move regularly and to work in lots of different areas to build up generic skills. The proposals to move to job specific recruitment will work against fast stream staff. Others made similar points about established civil servants who had through their career been encouraged to develop generic skills.

- Explain the process clearly

A clear message was that there is a need to communicate effectively with all staff the details of the proposals and the intention behind them. This should be supplemented by the provision of training opportunities for staff to acquire the skills and confidence in the new system.

Recruitment Panels

15b) How do you think other panel members should be identified?

There was a great deal of consistency in these responses. The following are the key points:

- For administrative grades only two people panels are necessary.

One member should be the line manager and the other an impartial person from Personnel or independent

- The line manager should always be a member of the panel. The line manager would know what was required for the specific post being recruited to. In addition where specialist skills were required the panel should be supplemented with a member with those skills if necessary.

- A second member should be from a different part of the Assembly to avoid allegations of nepotism

_

- The second member should be drawn from a centrally held list of trained volunteers. Staff who are trained should accept that their name will be placed on the central list. No members of staff who had not been trained could take part in an interview panel.

- The third member should be present to ensure impartiality and that the standard required by the civil service commissioners and legislation are upheld.

This person could be from Personnel Divisions or an external independent person.

- All panel members should be trained.

Some respondent commented that they felt that there should be an assessment at the end of the training to ensure that a certain level of competency was achieved.

- All panels should be gender representative and where possible representation of other under represented groups should also be represented.

- A need to ensure that sufficient Welsh speaking panel members were trained in order that bilingual assessment could take place.

18. What additional training do you think panel members should receive?

- Opportunities to practice interviewing skills in safe environment with feedback

- The following should be included in the training course:

    ○ Recruiting within the law
    ○ Requirements of the Civil Service Commissioners Code
    ○ How to write board reports, assessments etc
    ○ Basic psychology e.g. body language
    ○ Equality
    ○ Giving feedback

- A refresher course to be held every two years

- Courses should be certified with assessment at end.

Candidates

20. What additional training do you think candidates should receive?

- Training should be given to internal candidates

- Training should be given to both internal and external potential candidates. This could take the form of pre-employment training offered at regular intervals.

- Training should cover:
    ○ Interview techniques and practical experience with feedback
    ○ Writing CVs and how to map across to competencies and job requirements
    ○ Presentation skills
    ○ Assessment centers

- No training should be given as up to individuals to prepare themselves for interviews etc.

  It was also felt that by providing training to internal candidates only they would be at an advantage in open recruitment which defeated the object of having open recruitment

- Clear guidance notes provided to all candidates so that a level playing field between all candidates was established.

-

21. Do you have any further comments on any part of the proposed strategy?

The responses to this section mainly repeated comments made earlier in the questionnaire and focused on:

- The proposals being an improvement on the current system
- Cumbersome and expensive
- Demoralizing to existing staff
- Career progression being less restricted.

A number of respondent made detailed comments about how the system could be made to work which will be considered when detailed guidance are drafted.

Annex D

STAFF DEPLOYMENT AND RECRUITMENT STRATEGY: CONSULTATION WITH EXTERNAL ORGANISATIONS

Below is a summary of the key issues raised by the following bodies who responded to the invitation to comment on the draft staff deployment and recruitment strategy.

Equal Opportunities Committee

- Overall welcomed the new approach.
- Emphasised the need to achieve a balance between open recruitment for all new jobs, with opportunities for development and progression once staff had been recruited.
- Welcome commitment to evaluation and review.
- Need to ensure that all those involved in the recruitment process are trained.
- Concern that the assessment centres are equality proofed and kept under close scrutiny.
- Assessment panels should include at least one woman, an observer of the missing gender is not adequate.

Disability Rights Commission

- Overall fell strategy is positive in terms of advancing equality of opportunity within the Assembly.
- Welcomed move away from promotion boards to open recruitment.
- Key reservation is about the role of assessment centres in process - and make a number of constructive suggestions about how to ensure equity of treatment at assessment.
- Need to review the practical application of the 'Two Ticks' scheme in the open recruitment process.

The Office of the Civil Service Commissioners

- In general found the broad thrust of the strategy to be a very sound one.

- Surprise at proposal to abandon entirely internal promotion boards in particular the potential impact on staff morale.
- Use of equality proofed assessment centres is seen as sound development.
- Impressed by proposed training programme for assessment panel members and the structure for giving feedback to applicants.
- Welcome the proposals for evaluation and review of recruitment systems and the monitoring of effectiveness of individual selection decisions related to subsequent work performance.

Roger McKenzie (author of the Lifting Every Voice report)

- Please to see that Assembly had understood and accepted that change of this nature is a gradual one of sustained change underpinned by commitment at every level of the organisation.
- Not support the use of assessment centres to test generic competencies, especially if they were to include psychometric testing.
- The detail of any arrangements on the position of existing staff will be for discussion and negotiation between the Assembly and trade unions.

Annex D

STAFF DEPLOYMENT AND RECRUITMENT STRATEGY: CONSULTATION WITH EXTERNAL ORGANISATIONS

Below is a summary of the key issues raised by the following bodies who responded to the invitation to comment on the draft staff deployment and recruitment strategy.

Equal Opportunities Committee

- Overall welcomed the new approach.
- Emphasised the need to achieve a balance between open recruitment for all new jobs, with opportunities for development and progression once staff had been recruited.
- Welcome commitment to evaluation and review.
- Need to ensure that all those involved in the recruitment process are trained.
- Concern that the assessment centres are equality proofed and kept under close scrutiny.
- Assessment panels should include at least one woman, an observer of the missing gender is not adequate.

Disability Rights Commission

- Overall fell strategy is positive in terms of advancing equality of opportunity within the Assembly.
- Welcomed move away from promotion boards to open recruitment.
- Key reservation is about the role of assessment centres in process - and make a number of constructive suggestions about how to ensure equity of treatment at assessment.
- Need to review the practical application of the 'Two Ticks' scheme in the open recruitment process.

The Office of the Civil Service Commissioners

- In general found the broad thrust of the strategy to be a very sound one.
- Surprise at proposal to abandon entirely internal promotion boards in particular the potential impact on staff morale.
- Use of equality proofed assessment centres is seen as sound development.
- Impressed by proposed training programme for assessment panel members and the structure for giving feedback to applicants.
- Welcome the proposals for evaluation and review of recruitment systems and the monitoring of effectiveness of individual selection decisions related to subsequent work performance.

Roger McKenzie (author of the Lifting Every Voice report)

- Please to see that Assembly had understood and accepted that change of this nature is a gradual one of sustained change underpinned by commitment at every level of the organisation.
- Not support the use of assessment centres to test generic competencies, especially if they were to include psychometric testing.
- The detail of any arrangements on the position of existing staff will be for discussion and negotiation between the Assembly and trade unions.

Annex E

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: JANUARY 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	46:
	SCS – 1
	Band F – 1
	Band E – 1
	HEO'D' – 1
	Band D – 9
	Band C – 17
	Band B – 13
	Band A – 3

Lateral transfer: **casual staff**	**4:** Band C – 1 Band A – 3
Returners	**5:** From unpaid leave – 2 (Band C – 1: Band B – 1) From maternity leave – 3 (Band C – 2; Band B – 1)
Open recruitment	**4:** **Band F – 1** Band E – 1 Band D – 1 Band B – 1
Casual appointments	**10:** Band C – 1 Band B – 4 Band A – 4
Promotions	**28:** To Band E – 3 To Band D – 4 To Band C – 15 To Band B – 6

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: JANUARY 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	**12:** **Band F – 1** Band D – 3 Band C – 3 Band B – 3 Band A – 2
Casual staff	**27:** Band B – 3 Band A – 24 (including 1 New Deal participant)

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: FEBRUARY 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	**7:** SCS – 1 Band D – 1 Band C – 5
Lateral transfer: **casual staff**	**0:**

Returners	**8:** Band F - 1 (Maternity Leave) Band D - 3 (career break, maternity leave and unpaid leave) Band C - 1 (maternity leave) Band B - 1 (Career Break) Band A - 2 (career break, maternity Leave)
Open recruitment	**3:** SCS – 1 Band A – 1
Casual appointments	**49:** Band C – 5 Band B – 13 Band A – 31
Promotions	**15:** To Band E – 1 To Band D – 1 To Band C – 5 To Band B – 7 To Band A - 1

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: FEBRUARY 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	7: **Band F – 2** Band B – 3 Band A – 2
Casual staff	31: Band F – 1 Band C – 4 Band B – 13 Band A – 13 (including 1 New Deal participant)

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: MARCH 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	**6** Band D – 1 Band C – 2 Band B – 2 Band A – 1
Lateral transfer: **casual staff**	**0:**
Returners	**7:** Band D - 2 (Maternity Leave. Unpaid Leave) Band C - 1 (Maternity leave) Band B - 2 (Career Break) Band A - 1 (Career Break)
Open recruitment	**6:** **Band G – 1** **Band F – 2** Band C – 1 Band A – 2

Casual appointments	22: Band C – 4 Band B – 7 Band A – 11
Promotions	21: SCS – 1 To Band F – 2 To Band E – 2 To Band C – 5 To Band B – 11

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: MARCH 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	11: Band D – 1 Band C – 2 Band B – 4 Band A – 4

Casual staff	35:
	Band E – 1
	Band C – 2
	Band B – 8
	Band A – 24

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: APRIL 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	**11:** Band F – 2 Band D – 3 Band C – 4 Band B – 2
Lateral transfer: **casual staff**	**0:**
Returners	**3:** Band C - 2 (Maternity leave) Band A - 1 (Maternity leave)
Open recruitment	**26:** **<u>Band F – 5</u>** Band E – 3 Band D – 17 Band A – 1
Casual appointments	**21:** Band C – 2 Band B – 4 Band A – 15

Promotions	**5:** To Band E – 1 To Band D – 1 To Band C – 3

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: APRIL 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	4: **Band F – 1** Band D – 1 Band A – 2
Casual staff	23: Band C – 1 Band B – 9 Band A – 13

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: MAY 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	**6:** Band F – 1 Band E – 1 Band D – 1 Band C – 1 Band B – 2
Lateral transfer: **casual staff**	**0**
Returners	**7:** Band D - 2 (Career Break) Band C - 2 (Maternity leave, Unpaid Leave) Band B - 1 (Career Break, Maternity leave(2)) Band A - 1 (Career Break)
Open recruitment	**27:** **Band D – 12** Band C – 2 Band B – 1 Band A – 12
Casual appointments	**2:** Band A – 2

Promotions	**8:** To Band F – 3 To Band D – 3 To Band B – 2

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: MAY 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	8: **Band F – 2** Band E – 1 Band D – 1 Band C – 2 Band A – 2
Casual staff	26: Band C – 3 (inc.1 New Deal participant) Band B – 5 Band A – 18 (inc.1 New Deal participant)

Annex E

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: JANUARY 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	**46:** SCS – 1 Band F – 1 Band E – 1 HEO'D' – 1 Band D – 9 Band C – 17 Band B – 13 Band A – 3
Lateral transfer: **casual staff**	**4:** Band C – 1 Band A – 3
Returners	**5:** From unpaid leave – 2 (Band C – 1: Band B – 1) From maternity leave – 3 (Band C – 2; Band B – 1)
Open recruitment	**4:** **Band F – 1** Band E – 1 Band D – 1 Band B – 1

Casual appointments	10: Band C – 1 Band B – 4 Band A – 4
Promotions	28: To Band E – 3 To Band D – 4 To Band C – 15 To Band B – 6

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: JANUARY 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	**12:** **Band F – 1** Band D – 3 Band C – 3 Band B – 3 Band A – 2
Casual staff	**27:** Band B – 3 Band A – 24 (including 1 New Deal participant)

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: FEBRUARY 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	**7:** SCS – 1 Band D – 1 Band C – 5
Lateral transfer: **casual staff**	**0:**
Returners	**8:** Band F - 1 (Maternity Leave) Band D - 3 (career break, maternity leave and unpaid leave) Band C - 1 (maternity leave) Band B - 1 (Career Break) Band A - 2 (career break, maternity Leave)
Open recruitment	**3:** SCS – 1 Band A – 1
Casual appointments	**49:** Band C – 5 Band B – 13 Band A – 31

Promotions	15: To Band E – 1 To Band D – 1 To Band C – 5 To Band B – 7 To Band A - 1

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: FEBRUARY 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	7: **Band F – 2** Band B – 3 Band A – 2
Casual staff	31: Band F – 1 Band C – 4 Band B – 13 Band A – 13 (including 1 New Deal participant)

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: MARCH 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	6 Band D – 1 Band C – 2 Band B – 2 Band A – 1
Lateral transfer: casual staff	0:

Returners	**7:** Band D - 2 (Maternity Leave. Unpaid Leave) Band C - 1 (Maternity leave) Band B - 2 (Career Break) Band A - 1 (Career Break)
Open recruitment	**6:** **<u>Band G – 1</u>** **<u>Band F – 2</u>** Band C – 1 Band A – 2
Casual appointments	**22:** Band C – 4 Band B – 7 Band A – 11
Promotions	**21:** SCS – 1 To Band F – 2 To Band E – 2 To Band C – 5 To Band B – 11

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: MARCH 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	11: Band D – 1 Band C – 2 Band B – 4 Band A – 4
Casual staff	35: Band E – 1 Band C – 2 Band B – 8 Band A – 24

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: APRIL 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	11: Band F – 2 Band D – 3 Band C – 4 Band B – 2
Lateral transfer: casual staff	0:
Returners	3: Band C - 2 (Maternity leave) Band A - 1 (Maternity leave)
Open recruitment	26: **Band F – 5** Band E – 3 Band D – 17 Band A – 1

Casual appointments	**21:** Band C – 2 Band B – 4 Band A – 15
Promotions	**5:** To Band E – 1 To Band D – 1 To Band C – 3

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: APRIL 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	4: **Band F – 1** Band D – 1 Band A – 2
Casual staff	23: Band C – 1 Band B – 9 Band A – 13

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY VACANCIES FILLED: MAY 2002

Lateral transfer: permanent staff	**6:** Band F – 1 Band E – 1 Band D – 1 Band C – 1 Band B – 2
Lateral transfer: **casual staff**	**0**
Returners	**7:** Band D - 2 (Career Break) Band C - 2 (Maternity leave, Unpaid Leave) Band B - 1 (Career Break, Maternity leave(2)) Band A - 1 (Career Break)
Open recruitment	**27:** **Band D – 12** Band C – 2 Band B – 1 Band A – 12
Casual appointments	**2:** Band A – 2

Promotions	8: To Band F – 3 To Band D – 3 To Band B – 2

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LEAVERS: MAY 2002

Permanent staff (including retirements)	8: **Band F – 2** Band E – 1 Band D – 1 Band C – 2 Band A – 2
Casual staff	26: Band C – 3 (inc.1 New Deal participant) Band B – 5 Band A – 18 (inc.1 New Deal participant)

Annex F

RECRUITMENT TO THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY FOR WALES: SPECIFIC POSTS OPENLY ADVERTISED DURING 2001-02 TO DATE

Band to which recruited	**Number of posts: total 267**

SCS	13
Band G	8
Band F	43
Band E	6
Fast Stream	1
Band D	44
Band C	25
Band B	29
Band A	98

Please note that not all these recruitment schemes have yet been completed. Some are at offer stage, some at interview, some at advertisement and some at the initial planning stage.