



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Iau 14 Mawrth 2002

Thursday 14 March 2002

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd
Questions to the Minister for Economic Development
- 14 Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions on Finance to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities
- 24 Datganiad ar Arian Cyfalaf ar gyfer Cyfleuster Newydd yn Shotton i Ailbroesu Papur
Statement on Capital Funding for the New Waste Paper Reprocessing Capacity at Shotton
- 30 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 43 Adroddiad Terfynol yr Adolygiad i Ddyrannu Adnoddau'r GIG
The Final NHS Resource Allocations Review Report
- 83 Gweithdrefn Gwyno'r GIG
The NHS Complaints Procedure
- 106 Cymeradwyo'r Penderfyniad ar Gyflogau a Lwfansau Aelodau
Approval of the Determination on Members' Pay and Allowances
- 110 Dadl Fer: Cyllid Cymunedol—Datgloi ein Potensial
Short Debate: Community Funding—Unlocking our Potential

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd Questions to the Minister for Economic Development

Isadeiledd Trafnidiaeth Transport Infrastructure

Q1 Eleanor Burnham: Will the Minister make a statement on the Objective 1 initiative to improve the transport infrastructure in Wales? (OAQ16310)

C1 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog wneud datganiad ynghylch y fenter Amcan 1 i wella isadeiledd trafndiaeth Cymru? (OAQ16310)

The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies): The infrastructure regional partnership is now fully operational, and all the infrastructure measures—including the transport measure—are open for business. A number of projects are being developed and some applications for funding have been made.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies): Mae'r bartneriaeth ranbarthol isadeiledd yn llawn weithredol bellach, ac mae'r holl fesurau isadeiledd—gan gynnwys y mesur trafndiaeth—ar waith. Mae nifer o brosiectau'n cael eu datblygu a gwnaethpwyd rhai ceisiadau am arian.

Eleanor Burnham: In yesterday's presentation by train operators to the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee meeting, members were told by First North Western Trains that Railtrack is responsible for 50 per cent of the decline in performance since 2000-01, and that the forecast for the current year is worse. Do you agree that we must invest in this fragile and inadequate infrastructure, using any funds available—including Objective 1—before European Union enlargement in 2006?

Eleanor Burnham: Yn y cyflwyniad gan y cwmnïau trenau ddoe i gyfarfod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, dywedwyd wrth yr aelodau gan First North Western Trains fod Railtrack yn gyfrifol am 50 y cant o'r dirywiad yn y perfformiad ers 2000-01, a bod y rhagolwg am eleni'n waeth. A gytunwch fod rhaid inni fuddsoddi yn yr isadeiledd bregus ac annigonol hwn, gan ddefnyddio unrhyw arian sydd ar gael—gan gynnwys Amcan 1—cyn ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn 2006?

Andrew Davies: The railway system has a crucial role to play in our transport infrastructure. In terms of Objective 1, there is only £59 million for that priority. It must be used strategically. The benefit of such investment must be considered. If Railtrack were to put forward a proposal, it would have to be discussed by the partnership. On the broader issue outside the Objective 1 area, my colleague, Sue Essex, has been working with the Strategic Rail Authority to improve the rail network in Wales. We are confident that, at the end of that period, the rail system will be greatly enhanced.

Andrew Davies: Mae gan y system rheilffyrdd rôl hollbwysig i'w chwarae yn ein hisadeiledd trafndiaeth. Yng nghyd-destun Amcan 1, nid oes ond £59 miliwn i'r flaenoriaeth honno. Rhaid ei ddefnyddio'n strategol. Rhaid ystyried budd buddsoddiad o'r fath. Pe byddai Railtrack yn cyflwyno cynnig, byddai'n rhaid i'r bartneriaeth ei drafod. Ynghylch y mater ehangach y tu allan i'r ardal Amcan 1, bu fy nghyd-Aelod, Sue Essex, yn gweithio gyda'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol i wella'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn ffyddiog y bydd y system rheilffyrdd yn well o lawer ar ddiwedd y cyfnod hwnnw.

Helen Mary Jones: You should be aware that there has been a difference of opinion on the capacity to use Objective 1 funding to support rail programmes and development, particularly with regard to rolling stock acquisition. Will you use the mid-term review as an opportunity to revisit this matter in the light of what most of us—despite what you have just said—consider to be a disappointing deal for Wales in the SRA settlement? It may be time to go back to the European Commission to reconsider the capacity to invest in rolling stock.

Andrew Davies: We must agree to disagree on what you regard to be inadequate funding. In my opinion, the negotiations leading to the deal that Sue Essex was able to broker with the SRA will greatly enhance the railway network in Wales.

Alun Cairns: It was clearly an embarrassment to the Assembly Government that the spending under the infrastructure priority of Objective 1 hardly made the grade at the two-year stage of the Objective 1 opportunity. The reason is that the infrastructure partnership was not established until November 2001—almost two years into the process. Was that an oversight or was it a strategic decision?

Andrew Davies: We were not embarrassed because of this. I reiterate my earlier point: there is only £59 million under that priority and measure. It was clear that the European Commission was limiting the amount of money that we could invest in infrastructure. Given the scale of funding, it is unlikely that this programme can support large infrastructure capital projects. I return to the point I made to Eleanor Burnham: the partnership must consider these issues in the round. Given that bids probably oversubscribe the amount of money in that part of the budget, it must be spent strategically and cost-effectively.

Helen Mary Jones: Dylech fod yn ymwybodol bod gwahaniaeth barn am y gallu i ddefnyddio arian Amcan 1 i gynnal rhaglenni a datblygiad rheilffyrdd, yn enwedig o ran cael cerbydau. A wnewch ddefnyddio'r adolygiad canol tymor yn gyfle i ailystyried y mater hwn yng ngolwg yr hyn y mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom—er gwaethaf yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud—yn ei ystyried yn fargen siomedig i Gymru yn setliad yr SRA? Efallai ei bod yn bryd mynd yn ôl at y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a gofyn iddo ailystyried y capasiti i fuddsoddi mewn cerbydau.

Andrew Davies: Rhaid inni gytuno i anghytuno ar yr hyn a ystyriwch yn arian annigonol. Yn fy marn i, bydd y negodiadau a arweiniodd at y fargen yr oedd Sue Essex yn gyfrwng i'w tharo gyda'r SRA yn gwella'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru yn fawr.

Alun Cairns: Yr oedd yn amlwg yn beth chwithig i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad fod y gwariant o dan flaenoriaeth isadeiledd Amcan 1 heb brin gyrraedd y safon ar gam dwy flynedd y cyfle Amcan 1. Y rheswm yw na sefydlwyd y bartneriaeth isadeiledd hyd fis Tachwedd 2001—bron ddwy flynedd ar ôl dechrau'r broses. Ai amryfusedd oedd hynny ynteu a oedd yn benderfyniad strategol?

Andrew Davies: Nid oedd hynny'n beth chwithig i ni. Ailadroddaf y pwynt a wneuthum yn gynharach: nid oes ond £59 miliwn o dan y flaenoriaeth a'r mesur hwnnw. Yr oedd yn amlwg bod y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn cyfyngu ar swm yr arian y gallem ei fuddsoddi mewn isadeiledd. O ystyried maint y cyllid, mae'n annhebygol y gall y rhaglen hon gynnal prosiectau cyfalaf isadeiledd mawr. Dychwelaf at y pwynt a wneuthum wrth Eleanor Burnham: rhaid i'r bartneriaeth ystyried y materion hyn yn eu cyfanrwydd. O gofio bod y ceisiadau am fwy na'r swm o arian yn y rhan honno o'r gyllideb, yn ôl pob tebyg, rhaid ei wario'n strategol ac yn gost-ffeithiol.

Ansicrwydd yn y Farchnad Waith Insecurity in the Labour Market

Q2 Mick Bates: What measures is the Minister taking to reduce insecurity in the labour market in Wales? (OAQ16274) [R]

Andrew Davies: Our national economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales', sets out our agenda for the Welsh economy over the next 10 years. The skills and employment action plan published on 27 February by Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, builds on the framework set out in 'A Winning Wales', and provides more details of policies and programmes to develop the skills of the Welsh workforce and to help more people into work.

Mick Bates: I am concerned about the current insecurity in the aerospace industry. In Newtown, in my constituency, 61 jobs are threatened. What are you doing to bring security to the aerospace industry, which is particularly important in north Wales?

Andrew Davies: Although we have considerable powers, in terms of managing the Welsh economy, we do not have complete power at a macro-economic level. However, we work closely with the aerospace forum, other sectoral forums and the Welsh Development Agency to ensure that we can give every support possible to that sector. It is a vital sector—given its contribution to gross domestic product and the number of people it employs. If there are specific issues in your constituency, Mick, you can write or speak to me about them and I will seek to reassure you.

Jonathan Morgan: Your Government intends to introduce its climate change tax in April. Many believe that that tax will lead to thousands more job losses in manufacturing throughout Wales and the United Kingdom. Are you content with those job losses, in a sector that is already deep in recession?

Andrew Davies: Our major commitment is

C2 Mick Bates: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i beri bod llai o ansicrwydd yn y farchnad waith yng Nghymru? (OAQ16274) [R]

Andrew Davies: Mae'n strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol, 'Cymru'n Ennill', yn nodi'n hagenda ar gyfer economi Cymru dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu sgiliau a chyflogaeth a gyhoeddwyd ar 27 Chwefror gan Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn adeiladu ar sail y fframwaith a nodir yn 'Cymru'n Ennill', ac yn darparu rhagor o fanylion am bolisiau a rhaglenni i ddatblygu sgiliau gweithlu Cymru a helpu rhagor o bobl i gael gwaith.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch yr ansicrwydd yn y diwydiant awyrofod ar hyn o bryd. Yn y Drenewydd, yn fy etholaeth i, mae 61 o swyddi dan fygythiad. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i ddod â sicrwydd i'r diwydiant awyrofod, sy'n arbennig o bwysig yn y Gogledd?

Andrew Davies: Er bod gennym bwerau sylweddol, o ran rheoli economi Cymru, nid oes gennym bŵer llwyr ar lefel facro-economaidd. Er hynny, yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos â'r fforwm awyrofod, fforymau sectoraidd eraill ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i sicrhau y gallwn roi pob cymorth posibl i'r sector hwnnw. Mae'n sector hollbwysig—o ystyried ei gyfraniad at y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a'r nifer y mae'n ei chyflogi. Os oes materion penodol sy'n codi yn eich etholaeth, Mick, cewch ysgrifennu neu siarad â mi yn eu cylch a cheisiaf dawelu'ch meddwl.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae'ch Llywodraeth yn bwriadu cyflwyno treth newid hinsawdd yn Ebrill. Cred llawer y bydd y dreth honno'n arwain at golli miloedd yn rhagor o swyddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu ledled Cymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig. A ydych yn fodlon ar y colledion swyddi hynny, mewn sector sydd eisoes mewn dirwasgiad mawr?

Andrew Davies: Mae ein prif ymrwymiad i

to the long-term future of Wales and its sustainable economy. As you know, the Economic Development Committee is currently conducting an energy review. That is driven by the desperate need to reduce carbon emissions in Wales and throughout the world. We must consider the bigger picture. Obviously we must consider individual companies' concerns and, as an Assembly Member, I know that companies in my area are expressing concerns about it. However, we are in discussion with companies and those concerned, and we must wait and see whether there will be job losses arising from such industries. However, with a new energy review and policy, I am confident that they will create jobs and contribute to increasing Wales's gross domestic product.

Dafydd Wigley: What comfort has the Minister for the 300 workers in the Sharp Electronics plant in Wrexham who learned yesterday that they would be losing their jobs? That is in addition to 2,000 jobs lost in the Wrexham area over the last year. Is that not a further kick in the teeth, compounded by today's news that Wrexham will not get city status? Does it not underline the need for regional job targets for such areas? When will this Government, which is seen as the Government of the M4 corridor, start considering the rest of Wales?

Andrew Davies: Obviously, Dafydd, I share your deep disappointment at Sharp's announcement yesterday and the loss of 300 jobs in Llay. I have asked officials and the WDA, working with the local authority, the company and the trade unions, to examine this to see what can be done to help the company and also to help any workers who will be made redundant. However, in broad terms, certain parts of the manufacturing sector have experienced difficulty, but it is not affecting the entire manufacturing sector. There have been significant job increases and investments in north Wales. There was a meeting of the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board this week, and I am confident that there will be significant

ddyfodol tymor hir Cymru a'i heconomi gynaliadwy. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn cynnal adolygiad o ynni ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny wedi'i gymell gan y taer angen i leihau gollyngiadau carbon yng Nghymru a ledled y byd. Rhaid inni ystyried y darlun ehangach. Wrth gwrs, rhaid inni ystyried pryderon cwmnïau unigol ac, fel Aelod Cynulliad, gwn fod y cwmnïau yn fy ardal i'n mynegi pryderon yn ei chylch. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn trafod â'r cwmnïau a'r rhai sy'n gysylltiedig, a rhaid inni aros i weld a fydd colledion swyddi'n digwydd mewn diwydiannau o'r fath. Er hynny, o gael adolygiad a pholisi ynni newydd, yr wyf yn ffyddiog y byddant yn creu swyddi ac yn cyfrannu at gynyddu cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Cymru.

Dafydd Wigley: Pa eiriau o gysur sydd gan y Gweinidog i'r 300 o weithwyr yng ngwaith Sharp Electronics yn Wrecsam a gafodd wybod ddoe y byddant yn colli eu swyddi? Mae hynny ar ben y 2,000 o swyddi a gollwyd yn ardal Wrecsam dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Onid yw hynny'n sarhad ychwanegol arnynt, a ddwyseir gan y newyddion heddiw na fydd Wrecsam yn derbyn statws dinas? Onid yw'n tanlinellu'r angen am dargedau swyddi rhanbarthol i ardaloedd o'r fath? Pa bryd y bydd y Llywodraeth hon, a ystyrir yn Llywodraeth coridor yr M4, yn dechrau ystyried gweddill Cymru?

Andrew Davies: Wrth gwrs, Dafydd, yr wyf yn rhannu'ch siom fawr yng nghyhoeddiad Sharp ddoe a cholli 300 o swyddi yn Llay. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r swyddogion ac i'r WDA, drwy weithio gyda'r awdurdod lleol, y cwmni a'r undebau llafur, archwilio hyn i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i helpu'r cwmni a hefyd i helpu unrhyw weithwyr a ddiswyddir. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, mae rhai rhannau o'r sector gweithgynhyrchu wedi profi anhawster, ond nid yw'n effeithio ar y cyfan o'r sector gweithgynhyrchu. Bu cynnydd mewn swyddi a buddsoddiadau sylweddol yn y Gogledd. Bu cyfarfod o Fwrdd Ymgynghorol Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru yr wythnos hon, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd gan y bwrdd gyhoeddiadau o

announcements in terms of assistance and growth, and the safeguarding of existing jobs by WIDAB soon.

bwys o ran cymorth a thwf, a diogelu swyddi presennol cyn hir.

The Presiding Officer: Question 3 (OAQ16297) has been transferred for written answer.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 3 (OAQ16297) i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

Fforwm Optoelectroneg Gogledd Cymru North Wales Optoelectronics Forum

Q4 Ann Jones: What discussions has the Minister had with the north Wales optoelectronics forum? (OAQ16279)

C4 Ann Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael â fforwm optoelectroneg gogledd Cymru? (OAQ16279)

Andrew Davies: I met representatives of the forum last year as Minister for Assembly Business and e-minister at the St Asaph business park.

Andrew Davies: Cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr o'r fforwm y llynedd yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel Trefnydd ac e-weinidog ym mharc busnes Llanelwy.

My predecessor, the First Minister, met representatives of the Wales optoelectronics forum when officially opening the WDA optoelectronic materials research chemistry laboratory at the University of Wales, Bangor last June. During those discussions, he was fully apprised of the plans to establish an optronics technology and incubator centre at St Asaph with Objective 1 funding, to help with the further development of this important sector. As part of his comprehensive itinerary that day, Rhodri Morgan also opened the new facilities of prominent forum member-company, Optokem.

Cyfarfu fy rhagflaenydd, Prif Weinidog Cymru, â chynrychiolwyr fforwm optoelectroneg Cymru pan oedd yn agor yn swyddogol labordy cemeg y WDA ar gyfer ymchwil i ddefnyddiau optoelectroneg ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Bangor fis Mehefin diwethaf. Yn ystod y trafodaethau hynny, cafodd ei hysbysu'n llawn am y cynlluniau i ddefnyddio arian Aman 1 i sefydlu canolfan technoleg oproneg a deorydd yn Llanelwy, i helpu i ddatblygu'r sector pwysig hwn ymhellach. Fel rhan o'i raglen gynhwysfawr y diwrnod hwnnw, agorodd Rhodri Morgan gyfleusterau newydd un o aelod gwmmiau blaenllaw y fforwm, Optokem, hefyd.

Ann Jones: I am glad to see that we are taking optoelectronics seriously as a key technology for the twenty-first century, because it generates about £400 million and employs some 3,600 people in Wales. As you pointed out, the Vale of Clwyd is the main hub for the north Wales optoelectronics cluster. Will you visit the new site in the St Asaph business park and meet representatives of this vital, high-value, export-led industry, which is thriving in the Vale of Clwyd?

Ann Jones: Yr wyf yn falch o weld ein bod yn cymryd optoelectroneg o ddifrif fel technoleg allweddol i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, oherwydd mae'n creu tua £400 miliwn ac yn cyflogi oddeutu 3,600 o bobl yng Nghymru. Fel yr ydych wedi nodi, Dyffryn Clwyd yw prif ganolbwynt clwstwr optoelectroneg y Gogledd. A wnewch ymweld â'r safle newydd ym mharc busnes Llanelwy a chyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y diwydiant hollbwysig, uchel ei werth, sy'n dilyn gofynion allforio, sy'n ffynnu yn Nyffryn Clwyd?

9:15 a.m.

Andrew Davies: I would be delighted to do

Andrew Davies: Byddwn wrth fy modd yn

that. My office will discuss a possible date for that visit with you. I am delighted that the forum is going from strength to strength in the area, and that Objective 1 will be used to establish what is, effectively, an optoelectronics technium in north Wales. The roll-out of the knowledge economy and spin-out from our universities is crucial for our economy's future prosperity. Optoelectronics has a vital role to play in that and I look forward to a more in-depth presentation at a future visit.

Gareth Jones: Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, fe gollodd y sector hollbwysig hwn dros 400 o swyddi y llynedd pan gaewyd gwaith Corning Optical Fiber ar lannau Dyfrdwy. Faint o'r rhai a gollodd eu swyddi bryd hynny sydd wedi cael gwaith o fewn y sector, a faint oedd yn gorfod cymryd swydd â thâl is er mwyn aros yn yr ardal? Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu delio â'r broblem gyffredinol yn economi Cymru, lle mae colli swyddi sy'n talu'n dda yn golygu bod yn rhaid i gynifer o weithwyr, megis cyn-weithwyr Corus, orfod derbyn cyflogau is os ydynt am aros yn eu cymunedau?

Andrew Davies: I do not have the information to hand on the specific issue of Corning Optical Fiber. However, I will find it and write to you. On the general issue of job losses, we are always disappointed when that happens, be it Corus, or Sharp Electronics at Llay, as we saw yesterday. However, although jobs are lost in some parts, there are also substantial gains. We now have the lowest level of unemployment in Wales for over 25 years. We have good prospects: Cardiff Chamber of Commerce stated in its quarterly review that business optimism, particularly in manufacturing, was at its highest since about December 1999. The underlying position is strong, but some sectors are experiencing great difficulties for many reasons, some of which, such as world trading conditions, are completely beyond our control. However, when faced with substantial job losses, we work with all the agencies, including local authorities, to address the concerns and to ensure that employment or training opportunities are

gwneud hynny. Bydd fy swyddfa yn trafod dyddiad posibl i'r ymweliad hwnnw â chi. Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod y fforwm yn mynd o nerth i nerth yn yr ardal, ac y caiff Amcan 1 ei ddefnyddio i sefydlu'r hyn sydd, i bob pwrpas, yn dechniwm optoelectroneg yn y Gogledd. Mae cyflwyno'r economi gwybodaeth a'r hyn sy'n deillio o'n prifysgolion yn hollbwysig i ffyniant ein heconomi yn y dyfodol. Mae gan optoelectroneg rôl hanfodol i'w chwarae yn hynny ac edrychaf ymlaen at gael cyflwyniad manylach ar ymweliad yn y dyfodol.

Gareth Jones: As you know, Minister, over 400 jobs were lost in this essential sector last year with the closure of the Corning Optical Fiber site on Deeside. How many of those made redundant at that time have found employment within the sector, and how many have been forced to take lower paid jobs in order to remain in the area? How do you intend to deal with the general problem in the Welsh economy, where the loss of well-paid jobs forces so many workers, such as former Corus employees, to accept lower wages if they wish to stay in their communities?

Andrew Davies: Nid yw'r wybodaeth ar gael gennyf ar fater penodol Corning Optical Fiber. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn dod o hyd iddi ac yn ysgrifennu atoch. Ar fater cyffredinol colli swyddi, yr ydym bob amser yn siomedig pan ddigwydd hynny, boed yn Corus, neu Sharp Electronics yn Llai, fel y gwelsom ddoe. Fodd bynnag, er colli swyddi mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae enillion sylweddol hefyd. Mae diweithdra ar ei isaf yng Nghymru yn awr ers 25 mlynedd. Mae gennym ragolygon da: dywedodd Siambr Fasnach Caerdydd yn ei hadolygiad chwarterol fod optimistiaeth byd busnes, yn enwedig mewn gweithgynhyrchu, ar ei uchaf ers tua Rhagfyr 1999. Mae'r sefyllfa sylfaenol yn gadarn, ond mae rhai sectorau'n profi anawsterau mawr am lawer o resymau, y mae rhai ohonynt, fel amodau masnach byd-eang, y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth yn gyfan gwbl. Fodd bynnag, pan wynebwn golledion swyddi mawr, yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r holl asiantaethau, gan gynnwys yr awdurdodau lleol, i roi sylw i'r pryderon a

available for those facing redundancy.

sicrhau bod cyfleoedd o ran gwaith neu hyfforddiant ar gael i'r rhai sy'n wynebu diweithdra.

Y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu The Manufacturing Industry

Q5 David Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of the level of the pound on the manufacturing industry in Wales? (OAQ16326)

C5 David Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch effaith gwerth y bunt ar y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru? (OAQ16326)

Andrew Davies: The Welsh Assembly Government recognises the difficulties currently being experienced by certain parts of the manufacturing sector in Wales. The current trading situation is partially due to the strength of sterling, particularly against the euro. However, global trading conditions have also had a significant impact.

Andrew Davies: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cydnabod yr anawsterau a brofir ar hyn o bryd gan rai rhannau o'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Mae'r sefyllfa masnachu bresennol yn ganlyniad yn rhannol i gryfder sterling, yn enwedig yn erbyn yr ewro. Fodd bynnag, mae amodau masnach byd-eang wedi cael cryn effaith hefyd.

David Davies: I am grateful to you for recognising that sterling's strength makes it difficult for manufacturers to export. However, we currently have the opportunity to do something about it by adjusting interest rates. Can you not see, Minister, that, if we enter a single currency, we will have no control whatsoever over interest rates, and our manufacturing industry will be at the mercy of non-elected, unaccountable bankers based in Frankfurt?

David Davies: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi am gydnabod bod cryfder sterling yn ei gwneud yn anodd i weithgynhyrchwyr allforio. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyfle gennym ar hyn o bryd i wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch drwy newid y cyfraddau llog. Oni allweh weld, Weinidog, na fydd gennym unrhyw reolaeth o gwbl dros y cyfraddau llog os ymunwn â'r arian sengl, ac y bydd ein diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu ar drugaredd bancwyr anetholedig, anatebol sydd wedi'u lleoli yn Frankfurt?

Andrew Davies: I am not sure from that question whether you are asking that control over the exchange rate be devolved to the Welsh Assembly Government, bearing in mind that during questions to the First Minister last week, you said that it would be morally reprehensible for greater powers to be given to the Assembly.

Andrew Davies: Nid wyf yn sicr, ar sail y cwestiwn hwnnw, a ydych yn gofyn am ddatganioli rheolaeth dros y gyfradd gyfnewid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, o gofio eich bod wedi dweud, yn ystod y cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, y byddai'n bechod moesol mwy o bwerau i'r Cynulliad.

Phil Williams: The announcement of job losses at Sharp Electronics comes in addition to a total loss of 9,000 manufacturing jobs in Wales over the past year. A case by case analysis would show that about two thirds of those losses depended, to a large extent, on the high value of the pound. Will you publicly accept that the UK Government, and the Chancellor of the Exchequer in particular, has not taken any of the three

Phil Williams: Daw'r cyhoeddiad am golli swyddi yn Sharp Electronics ar ben y cyfanswm colled o 9,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Byddai dadansoddiad fesul achos yn dangos bod tua dwy ran o dair o'r colledion hynny'n dibynnu, i raddau helaeth, ar werth uchel y bunt. A wnewch dderbyn yn gyhoeddus nad yw Llywodraeth y DU, a Changhellor y Trysorlys yn benodol,

measures necessary to bring the pound down to a competitive value? What pressure can you put on the Government in London to put Wales's interests before those of the south-east of England?

Andrew Davies: As I said in my answer to David Davies, the exchange rate is a factor in the impact on manufacturing. On the macro-economic policy, returning to the point I made in the previous answer, we now have stable economic conditions, with interest rates at a record low. There are also record levels of low unemployment throughout Wales, which continue to fall compared to other parts of the UK. Businesses want economic stability, and we therefore need stable economic conditions. The exchange rate contributes to that. There have been adjustments in the exchange rate, as Phil knows, and they are, in fact, moving towards benefiting the manufacturing sector in Wales.

wedi cymryd yr un o'r tri cham sydd eu hangen i ddod â'r bunt i lawr i werth cystadleuol? Pa bwysau y gallwch ei roi ar y Llywodraeth yn Llundain i roi buddiannau Cymru o flaen rhai de-ddwyrain Lloegr?

Andrew Davies: Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i David Davies, mae'r gyfradd gyfnewid yn ffactor yn yr effaith ar weithgynhyrchu. Ynghylch y polisi macro-economaidd, gan fynd yn ôl at y pwynt a wneuthum yn yr ateb blaenorol, mae gennym amodau economaidd sefydlog yn awr, gyda chyfraddau llog sydd ar eu hisaf erioed. Mae'r lefelau gorau erioed o ddiweithdra isel ledled Cymru hefyd, sy'n parhau i ddisgyn o'u cymharu â rhannau eraill o'r DU. Mae busnesau am gael sefydlogrwydd economaidd, ac felly mae arnom angen amodau economaidd sefydlog. Mae'r gyfradd gyfnewid yn cyfrannu at hynny. Bu newidiadau i'r gyfradd gyfnewid, fel y gŵyr Phil, ac, mewn gwirionedd, maent yn dechrau dod â budd i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

Datblygiad Economaidd Porthcawl The Economic Development of Porthcawl

Q6 Peter Black: How is the Minister promoting the economic development of Porthcawl? (OAQ16286)

Peter Law: Free ice cream.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I remind Members that supplementary questions must be asked, in order, to the Minister. If I do not call for a remark, however amusing it may be, it may not be recorded, and may, therefore, be lost to posterity.

Andrew Davies: I was tempted to say 'Stop me and buy one'.

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is now on the record, Minister.

Andrew Davies: Economic development, in general, in Wales is being taken forward in accordance with the principles of 'A Winning Wales', the national economic development strategy of the Welsh Assembly Government. Porthcawl has specific

C6 Peter Black: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn hyrwyddo datblygiad economaidd Porthcawl? (OAQ16286)

Peter Law: Hufen iâ am ddim.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Aelodau bod yn rhaid gofyn cwestiynau atodol, yn eu trefn, i'r Gweinidog. Os na alwaf am sylw, pa mor ddoniol bynnag y gallo fod, efallai na chaiff ei gofnodi ac, felly, gallai'r oesoedd i ddod ei golli.

Andrew Davies: Cefais fy nhemtio i ddweud 'Stopiwch fi a phrynwch un'.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hynny ar y cofnod yn awr, Weinidog.

Andrew Davies: Mae datblygu economaidd, yn gyffredinol, yng Nghymru'n cael ei hyrwyddo'n unol ag egwyddorion 'Cymru'n Ennill', strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae materion datblygu economaidd penodol

economic development issues, in terms of the regeneration of the town centre and the development of tourism. The Assembly Government, together with the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board, is working closely with Bridgend County Borough Council to address these issues.

Peter Black: Putting aside Peter Law's *cornetto*, and given the collapse of the partnership driving the regeneration process of Porthcawl, will you make it a priority in your new role to talk to the Welsh Government agencies involved in this process, to find ways in which they can re-engage with residents, local groups and Bridgend council to seek to put this back on track?

Andrew Davies: We will work with all agencies in addressing economic regeneration issues throughout Wales. We believe in partnership and in a Team Wales approach, and we will go forward in that spirit.

Janet Davies: There is a major problem in Porthcawl since the withdrawal of the WDA and the Wales Tourist Board, and local groups are springing up across the town to try to drive the regeneration forward on their own. I believe that this is an important issue. Will you write to me to explain how you see your role in driving that regeneration forward, and perhaps in bringing the different groups together?

Andrew Davies: I am prepared to consider this issue. I believe that the First Minister, in his previous role, had been in contact with the agencies to ascertain the position on the ground. However, we must abide by the principle of subsidiarity, in that decisions are best taken at the lowest possible level. This is a matter for the local authority working with the WDA and WTb. I will, however, consider the issue, and if there is anything we can do to facilitate the process, we will do it.

Alun Cairns: I note your response regarding

ynghylch Porthcawl, o ran adfywio canol y dref a datblygu twristiaeth. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ynghyd ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, yn cydweithio'n agos â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr i ymdrin â'r materion hyn.

Peter Black: Gan roi *cornetto* Peter Law o'r neilltu, ac o wybod am gwmp y bartneriaeth a oedd yn hybu'r broses o adfywio Porthcawl, a wnewch hi'n flaenoriaeth yn eich rôl newydd i siarad ag asiantaethau Llywodraeth Cymru sy'n gysylltiedig â'r broses hon, i ddarganfod dulliau iddynt allu ailgysylltu â'r trigolion, y grwpiau lleol a chyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr i geisio rhoi hyn ar waith eto?

Andrew Davies: Byddwn yn gweithio gyda'r holl asiantaethau wrth ymdrin â materion adfywio economaidd ledled Cymru. Credwn mewn dull partneriaeth a Thîm Cymru o weithredu, ac awn ymlaen yn yr ysbryd hwnnw.

Janet Davies: Mae problem fawr ym Mhorthcawl ers i'r WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru dynnu allan, ac mae grwpiau lleol yn codi ym mhob cwr o'r dref i geisio hybu'r adfywiad ar eu pen eu hunain. Credaf fod hyn yn fater pwysig. A wnewch ysgrifennu ataf i egluro sut y gwelwch eich rôl wrth hybu'r adfywiad hwnnw, ac wrth ddod â'r gwahanol grwpiau at ei gilydd, o bosibl?

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf yn barod i ystyried y mater hwn. Credaf fod Prif Weinidog Cymru, yn ei rôl flaenorol, wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â'r asiantaethau i gael gwybod am y sefyllfa ymarferol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gadw at egwyddor datganoliaeth, i'r graddau ei bod yn well gwneud penderfyniadau ar y lefel isaf posibl. Mae hyn yn fater i'r awdurdod lleol gan weithio gyda'r WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Er hynny, byddaf yn ystyried y mater, ac os oes rhywbeth y gallwn ei wneud i hwyluso'r broses, fe wnawn hynny.

Alun Cairns: Nodaf eich ymateb ynghylch

the attitude of the local authority, and you will be more than familiar with the vindictive attitude of Bridgend County Borough Council's leader towards the partnership agreement within the Assembly. However, this attitude also applies to the people of Porthcawl in many ways. This vindictive attitude has led to the withdrawal of all forms of investment and all forms of facilitation or co-operation with the Welsh Development Agency in terms of providing the people of Porthcawl with positive options. Will you intervene to seek to bring about a positive choice for the people of Porthcawl for sustained, prosperous redevelopment?

Andrew Davies: I refer you to the answer I gave to Janet. This is not a matter in which I should intervene or interfere; it is for the local agencies to do that, as we believe in community-based regeneration. However, I will consider the situation. The leader of Bridgend council was a colleague of mine when I was a lecturer; I got on well with him and we had a productive relationship, so I do not go along with the sideswipes that you are taking at him. This is a matter for the local agencies, but if there is anything that I can do to facilitate the process, I will do it.

9:25 a.m.

Hyrwyddo Buddsoddiad Promoting Investment

C7 Elin Jones: Pa asesiad a gafwyd o effaith polisi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar hyrwyddo buddsoddi yng Nghymru? (OAQ16295)

Andrew Davies: Regional selective assistance is the Assembly's main direct support for business investment in Wales. The most recent independent evaluation of the scheme throughout Great Britain was in 2000. It concluded that RSA remains cost-effective and that it contributed to convergence between assisted and non-assisted areas.

Elin Jones: Gan na wnaethoch ateb y

ymagwedd yr awdurdod lleol, ac yr ydych yn fwy na chyfarwydd ag ymagwedd ddialgar arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr at y cytundeb partneriaeth o fewn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ymagwedd hon yn cynnwys pobl Porthcawl hefyd ar lawer ystyr. Mae'r ymagwedd ddialgar hon wedi arwain at dynnu'n ôl pob math o fuddsoddiad a phob math o hwyluso neu gydweithredu ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru o ran darparu dewisiadau cadarnhaol i bobl Porthcawl. A wnewch ymyrryd i geisio peri bod dewis cadarnhaol i bobl Porthcawl ar gyfer ailddatblygu ffyniannus, parhaus?

Andrew Davies: Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at yr ateb a roddais i Janet. Nid yw hyn yn fater y dylwn ymyrryd neu ymhel ag ef; lle'r asiantaethau lleol yw gwneud hynny gan ein bod yn credu mewn adfywio yn y gymuned. Er hynny, byddaf yn ystyried y sefyllfa. Yr oedd arweinydd cyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn gydweithiwr i mi pan oeddwn yn ddarlithydd; yr oeddwn yn cyd-dynnu'n dda ag ef ac yr oedd gennym berthynas gynhyrchiol, felly nid wyf yn cyd-fynd â'r cildrawiadau yr ydych yn eu hanelu ato. Mater i'r asiantaethau lleol yw hyn, ond os oes rhywbeth y gallaf ei wneud i hwyluso'r broses, fe wnaaf hynny.

Q7 Elin Jones: What assessment has been made of the effect of National Assembly policy in promoting investment in Wales? (OAQ16295)

Andrew Davies: Cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yw prif ddull y Cynulliad o gefnogi buddsoddiad busnes yn uniongyrchol yng Nghymru. Cynhaliwyd y gwerthusiad annibynnol diweddaraf o'r cynllun ledled Prydain Fawr yn 2000. Daeth i'r casgliad bod cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn dal i fod yn gost-effeithiol a'i fod yn cyfrannu at gyddyfeiriant rhanbarthau cymorth a rhanbarthau digymorth.

Elin Jones: Since you did not answer this

cwestiwn hwn pan gafodd ei holi gan Dafydd Wigley, ceisiaf eto. A ydych chi yn credu bod angen i'ch Llywodraeth osod targedau rhanbarthol penodol ar fuddsoddi economaidd er mwyn dosbarthu ffyniant a buddsoddiad yn deg ar draws Cymru?

Andrew Davies: I agree with my predecessor. I fully support regional co-operation. The five counties regeneration package, which was presented to the Economic Development Committee last week, and which the Cabinet working group will consider on 25 March, shows that we command a regional approach. However, for many reasons—technical and practical—we do not agree with having regional job targets. It is difficult to disaggregate some of the figures and the statistics. Separate figures are not available for the four economic regions. There are, therefore, many reasons why we do not agree with regional job targets. However, we do believe in regional working and co-operation, and support such an approach.

Glyn Davies: Do you agree that the British Government's decision to remain outside the eurozone has not affected the proportion of inward investment that comes to Wales? It would be entirely wrong and misleading for a Minister to be interviewed on a television programme and make a statement otherwise.

Andrew Davies: I agree with the First Minister's view. I think that he is on record as saying that the euro may be something to which we aspire—our version of heaven. However, the practicalities of achieving it remain to be considered in detail.

question when Dafydd Wigley asked it, I will try again. Do you believe that your Government should set specific regional targets for economic investment in order to ensure that prosperity and investment are equitably spread throughout Wales?

Andrew Davies: Cytunaf â'm rhagflaenydd. Yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogi cydweithredu rhanbarthol. Mae pecyn adfywio'r pum sir, a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf, ac y bydd gweithgor y Cabinet yn ei ystyried ar 25 Mawrth, yn dangos ein bod yn mynnu dull gweithredu rhanbarthol. Fodd bynnag, am lawer o resymau—technegol ac ymarferol—nid ydym yn cytuno y dylid cael targedau swyddi rhanbarthol. Mae'n anodd dadgyfuno rhai o'r ffigurau a'r ystadegau. Nid oes ffigurau ar wahân ar gael am y pedwar rhanbarth economaidd. Mae llawer o resymau, felly, pam nad ydym yn cytuno y dylid cael targedau swyddi rhanbarthol. Er hynny, yr ydym yn credu mewn gweithio a chydweithredu rhanbarthol, ac yr ydym yn cefnogi dull gweithredu o'r fath.

Glyn Davies: A ydych yn cytuno nad yw penderfyniad Llywodraeth Prydain i aros y tu allan i gylch yr ewro wedi effeithio ar gyfran y mewnfuddsoddiad a ddaw i Gymru? Byddai'n gwbl anghywir a chamarweiniol i Weinidog gael ei gyfweld ar raglen deledu a gwneud datganiad fel arall.

Andrew Davies: Cytunaf â barn Prif Weinidog Cymru. Credaf ei fod wedi dweud ar goedd y gallai'r ewro fod yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn dyheu amdano—ein fersiwn ni o'r nefoedd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth fanwl i'r agweddau ymarferol o'i gyflawni.

**Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r
Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions on Finance to the
Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities**

**Cynigion ar gyfer Cyllidebau yn y Dyfodol
Future Budget Proposals**

C1 Geraint Davies: Pa ymchwil y mae'r Gweinidog wedi gofyn i'r uned polisi strategol ei gwneud a fyddai'n ei

Q1 Geraint Davies: What research has the Minister asked the strategic policy unit to carry out that would assist her in ensuring

chynorthwyo i sicrhau bod ei chynigion yn y dyfodol, o ran cyllideb, yn seiliedig ar ddealltwriaeth glir o anghenion gwahanol ranbarthau Cymru? (OAQ16319)

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): The First Minister and the Cabinet commission the work of the strategic policy unit. At the Cabinet's request, the unit is working with the Assembly's finance group to identify policy priorities for the spending review period that are driven by the needs—wherever they arise—of individuals, communities and businesses across Wales. Budget decisions at the local level are often the outcome of several separate steps in the process of budget allocation in a number of areas.

Geraint Davies: Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o alwad Plaid Cymru i gael strategaeth gynhwysfawr i ddelio ag anghenion dybryd Cymoedd y De. A ydyw wedi trafod y pwnc hwn gyda'r uned, ac a wnaiff ystyried ei chyfarwyddo i lunio strategaeth o'r fath gyda chyllid digonol i'w gwireddu?

Edwina Hart: There are several sources of data on local deprivation and need which would be applicable to the former coalfields area, such as the index of multiple deprivation, which was based on objective research, and which would be drawn on as appropriate. The unit draws upon the available research to enable us to make the correct policy decisions. It has the necessary budgetary provisions to enable it to undertake the strategic work that is required in this area.

Tom Middlehurst: Do you agree, in your determination to tackle underinvestment and deprivation in many of our communities in Wales, that it is in no-one's interest to see the relatively prosperous areas of Wales suffer as a result? Given the announcement of 60 job losses at Burlington Toiletries in my constituency earlier this week, and yesterday's announcement of 300 job losses at Sharp Electronics in Wrexham, is it not the case that we must continue to help local and

that her future budget proposals are based on a clear understanding of the needs of the various regions of Wales? (OAQ16319)

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Cabinet sy'n comisiynu gwaith yr uned polisi strategol. Ar gais y Cabinet, mae'r uned yn gweithio gyda grŵp cyllid y Cynulliad i nodi blaenoriaethau polisi ar gyfer cyfnod yr adolygiad o wariant a bennir gan anghenion unigolion, cymunedau a busnesau ledled Cymru—lle bynnag y maent yn codi. Mae penderfyniadau cyllideb ar y lefel leol yn ganlyniad yn aml i sawl cam gwahanol yn y broses o ddyrannu'r gyllideb mewn nifer o feysydd.

Geraint Davies: The Minister will be aware of Plaid Cymru's call for a comprehensive strategy to tackle the dire needs of the south Wales Valleys. Has she discussed this with the unit, and will she consider directing it to draft such a strategy with sufficient funding to realise it?

Edwina Hart: Mae sawl ffynhonnell data ar amddifadedd ac angen lleol a fyddai'n berthnasol i ardal y cyn meysydd glo, fel y mynegrif amddifadedd lluosog, a seiliwyd ar ymchwil gwrthrychol, ac a ddefnyddid fel y byddai'n briodol. Mae'r uned yn defnyddio'r ymchwil sydd ar gael i'n galluogi i wneud y penderfyniadau polisi cywir. Mae ganddi'r darpariaethau cyllidebol sydd eu hangen i'w galluogi i wneud y gwaith strategol sy'n ofynnol yn y maes hwn.

Tom Middlehurst: A ydych yn cytuno, yn eich penderfyniad i fynd i'r afael â thanfuddsoddiad ac amddifadedd mewn llawer o'n cymunedau yng Nghymru, nad yw er budd neb gweld y rhannau cymharol ffyniannus o Gymru'n dioddef o ganlyniad? O ystyried y cyhoeddiad am golli 60 o swyddi yn Burlington Toiletries yn fy etholaeth i'n gynharach yr wythnos hon, a chyhoeddiad ddoe am golli 300 o swyddi yn Sharp Electronics yn Wrecsam, onid yw'n

regional economies to grow? That requires an ongoing investment in all parts of Wales. Can you assure me that you will act in the best interests of all parts of Wales and all our people?

Edwina Hart: It is important to ensure the correct balance across Wales in terms of investment. It is essential that we continue to ensure, as my colleague the Minister for Economic Development will do, that the Welsh Development Agency's priority is job creation in every part of Wales and that we are creative in distributing jobs from certain parts of Wales. However, we must also ensure that we maintain our base in certain areas. I was saddened to hear of the job losses in north Wales at Sharp. I was even more saddened when comments were made in the media about the number of part-time jobs that will be lost, as if part-time jobs were not valid. A job is a job, whether full-time or part-time.

Glyn Davies: Do you accept that any genuine commitment by the Government to encouraging young people to remain in rural areas or to protect the Welsh language will mean a greater emphasis on directing investment away from south-east Wales over the next few years?

Edwina Hart: The Minister for Economic Development, in conjunction with the Welsh Development Agency, will make decisions on direct investment. It is essential that we try to keep our young people within all areas of Wales so that they can add to the life of the local economy and so that their children, if they have any, can go to local schools to keep them open. That is an important issue.

Opsiynau Amgen i Bartneriaethau Cyhoeddus-Preifat a Mentrau Cyllid Preifat Alternatives to Public-Private Partnerships and Private Finance Initiatives

Q2 Helen Mary Jones: Will the Minister outline the guidance she has made available to her Cabinet colleagues on alternatives to PPP/PFI? (OAQ16321)

wir bod rhaid inni barhau i helpu economïau lleol a rhanbarthol i dyfu? Mae hynny'n gofyn buddsoddi parhaus ym mhob rhan o Gymru. A allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn gweithredu er budd mwyaf pob rhan o Gymru a'n pobl i gyd?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir ledled Cymru o ran buddsoddi. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn parhau i sicrhau, fel y gwnaiff fy nghyd-Aelod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, mai blaenoriaeth Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yw creu swyddi ym mhob rhan o Gymru a'n bod yn greadigol wrth wasgaru swyddi o rai rhannau o Gymru. Er hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd ein bod yn cynnal ein sylfaen mewn rhai ardaloedd. Fe'm tristawyd o glywed am y colledion swyddi yn y Gogledd yng ngwaith Sharp. Fe'm tristawyd yn fwy byth pan wnaethpwyd sylwadau ar y cyfryngau am nifer y swyddi rhan amser a gollir, fel pe na bai swyddi rhan amser yn ddilys. Mae swydd yn swydd, pa un a yw'n llawn amser neu'n rhan amser.

Glyn Davies: A dderbyniwch y bydd unrhyw ymrwymiad gwirioneddol gan y Llywodraeth i annog pobl ifanc i aros mewn ardaloedd gwledig neu i ddiogelu'r Gymraeg yn golygu mwy o bwyslais ar gyfeirio buddsoddiad oddi wrth y De-ddwyrain dros y blynyddoedd nesaf hyn?

Edwina Hart: Bydd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, ar y cyd ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar fuddsoddi uniongyrchol. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn ceisio cadw ein pobl ifanc ym mhob ardal yng Nghymru fel y gallant ychwanegu at fywyd yr economi leol ac fel bod eu plant, os oes rhai ganddynt, yn gallu mynychu ysgolion lleol i'w cadw'n agored. Mae hynny'n fater pwysig.

C2 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu'r canllawiau y mae wedi'u dosbarthu i'w chydweithwyr yn y Cabinet ar opsiynau amgen i PPP/PFI? (OAQ16321)

Edwina Hart: I circulated a paper outlining the alternatives to PPP/PFI to Cabinet colleagues following the Cabinet meeting on 10 December. I will be pleased to share the information contained in the paper with the Member.

Helen Mary Jones: Thank you for that, Minister. Does that guidance include an exploration of the possibilities of using public service trusts?

Edwina Hart: The guidance does not currently contain any reference to that. However, there is an issue regarding public service trusts. The guidance issued so far relates to where I have reached in the discussions on this. However, it is an ongoing process and I am reviewing every avenue within these areas.

David Davies: Will PPP or PFI be used to build the £15 million ULTra transport system, which will apparently be used to convey Assembly Members between Cardiff bay and County Hall in science-fiction style, driverless pods?

Edwina Hart: I will decide on that if I receive a business case submission on it.

Edwina Hart: Cylchredais bapur a oedd yn amlinellu'r opsiynau amgen i PPP/PFI i'm cyd-aelodau yn y Cabinet ar ôl cyfarfod y Cabinet ar 10 Rhagfyr. Byddaf yn falch o rannu'r wybodaeth a geir yn y papur gyda'r Aelod.

Helen Mary Jones: Diolch i chi am hynny, Weinidog. A yw'r canllawiau hynny'n cynnwys archwiliad o'r posibilïadau o ddefnyddio ymddiriedolaethau gwasanaeth cyhoeddus?

Edwina Hart: Nid yw'r canllawiau'n cynnwys unrhyw gyfeiriad at hynny ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, mae mater i'w drafod ynghylch ymddiriedolaethau gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Mae'r canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd hyd yn hyn yn ymwneud â'r man a gyraeddais yn y trafodaethau ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n broses barhaus ac yr wyf yn adolygu pob llwybr o fewn y meysydd hynny.

David Davies: A ddefnyddir PPP neu PFI i adeiladu'r system drafnidiaeth ULTra am £15 miliwn, a ddefnyddir, mae'n ymddangos, i gludo Aelodau Cynulliad rhwng bae Caerdydd a Neuadd y Sir mewn codennau heb yrrwr yn null ffuglen wyddonol?

Edwina Hart: Penderfynaf ar hynny os cyflwynir achos busnes arno i mi.

Gwariant ar Hysbysebu a Chyhoedduswydd Spending on Advertising and Publicity

Q3 David Melding: How much does the Assembly expect to spend on advertising and publicity in this financial year? (OAQ16305)

Edwina Hart: Expenditure on advertising in the current financial year to date is £1 million and is expected to reach £1.1 million. Expenditure on publicity is more difficult to forecast, but is currently £2.2 million.

David Melding: Do you agree that the imaginative use of the publicity budget can greatly help key campaigns such as that for

C3 David Melding: Faint y mae'r Cynulliad yn disgwyl ei wario ar hysbysebu a chyhoedduswydd yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon? (OAQ16305)

Edwina Hart: Y gwariant ar hysbysebu yn y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol hyd yn hyn yw £1 filiwn a disgwylir iddo gyrraedd £1.1 miliwn. Mae'n anos rhagweld y gwariant ar gyhoedduswydd, ond mae'n £2.2 miliwn ar hyn o bryd.

David Melding: A ydych yn cytuno y gall defnydd creadigol o'r gyllideb cyhoedduswydd fod o gymorth mawr i

equal pay, which is starting now? Will you ensure that that is rolled out effectively and that we use innovative methods to disseminate the information?

Edwina Hart: We must use innovative methods to disseminate information on equal pay and other public information campaigns. How we deal with public information campaigns is an issue. The equal pay campaign will give us the opportunity to consider how we have utilised them and their success. If successful, it will, hopefully, influence any future campaigns.

Brian Gibbons: Do you think that there is a need to audit in which papers advertisements are placed in Wales? Some of the mass-circulation newspapers seem to get few advertisements compared to some papers with a circulation of only 40,000 to 50,000 that most of my constituents never see, never mind read.

Edwina Hart: There are issues about ensuring that advertisements reach everyone across Wales. We must consider innovative means of undertaking that, such as placing advertisements on the internet and guiding people in that direction so that everyone has the opportunity to apply for jobs. The issue of advertising is important and is currently being discussed with the Permanent Secretary and senior civil service staff.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you agree that it is important to advertise everything throughout Wales, including campaigns, such as those that David Melding mentioned, jobs and grants. How was the availability of funding for chamber orchestras advertised in north Wales and how were people in north Wales made aware that £150,000 was available for the development of such music?

Edwina Hart: I made a budget statement on that issue, and the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language reported on it to the Culture Committee on 5 December.

ymgyrchoedd allweddol fel honno am dâl cyfartal, sy'n dechrau'n awr? A wnewch sicrhau y caiff honno ei rhoi ar waith yn effeithiol ac y defnyddiwn dulliau arloesol i ledaenu'r wybodaeth?

Edwina Hart: Rhaid inni ddefnyddio dulliau arloesol i ledaenu gwybodaeth ar dâl cyfartal ac ymgyrchoedd gwybodaeth gyhoeddus eraill. Mae ein dull o ddelio ag ymgyrchoedd gwybodaeth gyhoeddus yn fater i'w drafod. Bydd yr ymgyrch tâl cyfartal yn rhoi cyfle inni ystyried ein defnydd ohonynt a'u llwyddiant. Os llwydda, bydd yn dylanwadu, gobeithio, ar unrhyw ymgyrchoedd yn y dyfodol.

Brian Gibbons: A gredwch bod angen archwiliad ar ba bapurau newydd y rhoddir hysbysebion ynddynt yng Nghymru? Mae'n ymddangos mai ychydig o hysbysebion a gaiff y papurau newydd sydd â chylchrediad torfol o'u cymharu â rhai papurau sydd â chylchrediad o ddim ond 40,000 i 50,000 na fydd y rhan fwyaf o'm hetholwyr byth yn eu gweld, heb sôn am eu darllen.

Edwina Hart: Mae materion i'w trafod ynghylch sicrhau bod hysbysebion yn cyrraedd pawb ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni ystyried dulliau arloesol o wneud hynny, megis gosod hysbysebion ar y rhynggrwyd ac arwain pobl i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw fel y caiff pawb gyfle i ymgeisio am swyddi. Mae mater hysbysebu'n bwysig ac fe'i trafodir ar hyn o bryd gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol a staff uwch y gwasanaeth sifil.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn sicr y cytunwch ei bod yn bwysig hysbysebu popeth ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys ymgyrchoedd, fel y rhai y soniodd David Melding amdanynt, swyddi a grantiau. Sut yr hysbysebwyd bod cyllid ar gael i gerddorfeydd siambr yn y Gogledd a sut y rhoddwyd gwybod i bobl yn y Gogledd fod £150,000 ar gael i ddatblygu cerddoriaeth o'r fath?

Edwina Hart: Gwneuthum ddatganiad cyllideb ar y mater hwnnw, ac adroddodd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg arno i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar 5 Rhagfyr.

9:35 a.m.

Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol Social Inclusion

Q4 Huw Lewis: How will the Minister ensure that spending by the Assembly is consistent with our commitment to social inclusion? (OAQ16323)

Edwina Hart: The community regeneration and social inclusion policy board, which I chair, will advise on how Assembly spending can be used to support and reinforce our strategies to promote social inclusion.

Tackling social exclusion is about helping communities and helping people to help themselves to turn their lives around. Strategies are in place across Wales to raise educational achievement, spread prosperity, promote health and improve housing. Social inclusion is an important issue which cuts across all portfolios. As Minister for Finance, I overview expenditure through the budget planning round to ensure that resources are directed at high-priority groups and target particular problems to support the mainstreaming of health, local government and other budgets. We have projects such as Sure Start, Communities First and the children and youth partnership. The Assembly offers support and expertise to discover what does and does not work in partnership with service deliverers.

Huw Lewis: Will you consider implementing a social justice spending review of Assembly expenditure and that of our sponsored public bodies? Such a review would start from zero budgets, and would examine every pound spent by the Assembly and its contribution towards meeting our targets of tackling poverty and delivering social justice. We should do that rather than follow the habits inherited from the Welsh Office. They are still too evident in many of our funding streams. Do you agree, Edwina, that until we do this, the full weight of the

C4 Huw Lewis: Sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau bod gwariant y Cynulliad yn gyson â'n hymrwymiad i gynhwysiant cymdeithasol? (OAQ16323)

Edwina Hart: Bydd y bwrdd polisi adfywio cymunedol a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol, yr wyf yn gadeirydd arno, yn rhoi gwybod ynghylch sut y gellir defnyddio gwariant y Cynulliad i gynnal ac atgyfnerthu ein strategaethau i hybu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol.

Mae ymladd allgáu cymdeithasol yn ymwneud â helpu cymunedau a helpu pobl i'w helpu eu hunain i newid cwrs eu bywydau. Mae strategaethau ar waith ledled Cymru i wella cyflawniad addysgol, lledaenu ffyniant, hybu iechyd a gwella tai. Mae cynhwysiant cymdeithasol yn fater pwysig sy'n torri ar draws pob portffolio. Fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, yr wyf yn arolygu gwariant drwy'r cylch cynllunio cyllideb i sicrhau y caiff adnoddau eu cyfeirio at grwpiau blaenoriaeth uchel a'u bod yn targedu problemau penodol i roi cyllidebau iechyd, llywodraeth leol a chyllidebau eraill yn y brif ffrwd. Mae gennym brosiectau fel Cychwyn Cadarn, Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a'r partneriaethau plant a phobl ifanc. Mae'r Cynulliad yn cynnig cymorth ac arbenigedd i ddarganfod beth sy'n gweithio a beth nad yw'n gweithio mewn partneriaeth â chyflenwyr y gwasanaethau.

Huw Lewis: A wnewch ystyried rhoi adolygiad gwariant cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ar waith ar wariant y Cynulliad a'r cyrff cyhoeddus yr ydym yn eu noddi? Byddai adolygiad o'r fath yn dechrau o gyllidebau sero, ac yn archwilio pob punt a warir gan y Cynulliad a'i gyfraniad at gyrraedd ein targedau o fynd i'r afael â thlodi a sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Dylem wneud hynny yn hytrach na dilyn yr arferion a etifeddwyd oddi wrth y Swyddfa Gymreig. Maent yn rhy amlwg o hyd mewn llawer o'n ffrydiau ariannu. A ydych yn cytuno,

Assembly will not be behind the campaign for social justice?

Edwina Hart: I have already started down the road of changing the arrangements for how we deal with the budget areas that you outlined. It is important to see how the anti-poverty agenda pans-out in terms of expenditure, and I am mindful of that when I undertake the budget process. I have already taken some of those points on board in how I deal with the budget. The old habits have gone, and we have started to consider how we justify budgets in terms of Assembly priorities.

Jonathan Morgan: It is always a good idea to ensure that we get a good return for the money that we spend. Can you give practical examples of the successes of the Communities First project, which you outlined earlier?

Edwina Hart: It is early days for the Communities First project, and a tremendous amount of money has been paid out this year. In light of your question, Jonathan, I will examine some positive examples, and perhaps share them with the Local Government and Housing Committee in my ministerial report. We can then put some flesh on the bones of the project in terms of the value for money we are getting from it—that is crucial to this agenda.

Pauline Jarman: Community enterprise is an effective model of regeneration, is financially viable and is controlled by local communities disadvantaged by economic and social forces beyond their control. What plans do you have to increase funding to community enterprises?

Edwina Hart: I will take up that matter in the round in budget planning discussions with my colleagues.

Edwina, na fydd holl bwysau'r Cynulliad y tu ôl i'r ymgyrch dros gyfiawnder cymdeithasol nes y gwnawn hyn?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf eisoes wedi dechrau ar y gwaith o newid y trefniadau i'n dull o ddelio â'r meysydd cyllideb yr ydych wedi'u disgrifio. Mae'n bwysig gweld sut y bydd yr agenda wrth-dlodi'n datblygu o ran gwariant, ac yr wyf dal hynny mewn cof wrth ymgymryd â phroses y gyllideb. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ystyried rhai o'r pwyntiau hynny o ran y modd yr wyf yn delio â'r gyllideb. Mae'r hen arferion wedi mynd, ac yr ydym wedi dechrau ystyried sut yr ydym yn cyfiawnhau cyllidebau yng nghyd-destun blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae bob amser yn syniad da sicrhau elw da ar yr arian a wariwn. A allwch roi enghreifftiau ymarferol o lwyddiannau'r prosiect Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, a ddisgrifiasoch yn gynharach?

Edwina Hart: Mae'r prosiect Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn ei ddyddiau cynnar, ac mae swm aruthrol o arian wedi'i dalu eleni. Yng ngolwg eich cwestiwn, Jonathan, gwnaf archwilio rhai o'r enghreifftiau cadarnhaol, a'u rhannu efallai â'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn fy adroddiad gweinidogol. Wedyn gallwn roi rhywfaint o gig am esgyrn y prosiect o ran y gwerth am arian yr ydym yn ei gael ohono—mae hynny'n hanfodol i'r agenda hon.

Pauline Jarman: Mae'r fenter gymunedol yn fodel adfywio effeithiol, mae'n ariannol hyfyw ac fe'i rheolir gan gymunedau lleol sydd wedi'u hanfanteisio gan rymoedd economaidd a chymdeithasol sydd y tu hwnt i'w rheolaeth. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i roi mwy o arian i fentrau gymunedol?

Edwina Hart: Byddaf yn trafod pob agwedd ar y mater hwnnw yn y trafodaethau cynllunio cyllideb gyda'm cyd-aelodau.

Cost Hysbysebu Swyddi Cost of Advertising Jobs

Q5 Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on the cost of advertising jobs for the National Assembly? (OAQ16304)

Edwina Hart: In accordance with the Civil Service Order in Council 1995, every individual appointed to a post in the home civil service must be selected on merit on the basis of fair and open competition. Openness is a fundamental principle, and is about making jobs accessible by ensuring that opportunities are publicised. The National Assembly for Wales's advertising and recruitment policy is aimed at achieving this, and is constantly reviewed to ensure that it fulfils that principle in the most cost-effective way.

Alun Cairns: Do you think that it is acceptable to spend £11,229 advertising a job offering a salary of £13,000? To add insult to injury, was it acceptable for that advertisement to be placed in a south Wales-based paper, when the job was based in Colwyn Bay in north Wales? Was the Minister surprised that only one application was received, and that that applicant did not progress further because he did not possess the necessary basic skills?

Edwina Hart: Like you, Alun, I saw that advertisement and made the inquiries of civil servants that you have made of me. I assure you that even though I am not directly responsible for placing the advertisement, a thorough review of advertising policy is now ongoing in light of your comments.

John Griffiths: To return to an earlier theme, Edwina, do you share my concern that regional newspapers, such as the *South Wales Argus*, are not used often enough to advertise Assembly jobs? That paper is read by over 30,000 people a day in the former Gwent area, from across the social classes. Assembly job advertisements should reach

C5 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gost hysbysebu swyddi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ16304)

Edwina Hart: Yn unol â Gorchymyn y Cyfrin Gyngor ar y Gwasanaeth Sifil yn 1995, rhaid dethol pob un a benodir i swydd yn y gwasanaeth sifil cartref yn ôl ei deilyngdod ar sail cystadlu teg ac agored. Mae gweithredu agored yn egwyddor sylfaenol, ac mae'n ymwneud â gwneud swyddi'n hygyrch drwy sicrhau cyhoeddusrwydd i'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael. Bwriad polisi hysbysebu a recriwtio Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yw cyflawni hynny, ac fe'i hadolygir yn gyson i sicrhau ei fod yn cyflawni'r egwyddor honno yn y modd mwyaf cost-effeithiol.

Alun Cairns: A ydych yn credu ei bod yn dderbyniol gwario £11,229 i hysbysebu swydd sy'n cynnig cyflog o £13,000? A rhoi halen ar y briw, a oedd yn dderbyniol rhoi'r hysbyseb honno mewn papur newydd sydd â'i ganolfan yn y De, a'r swydd wedi'i lleoli ym Mae Colwyn yn y Gogledd? A oedd y Gweinidog wedi synnu mai dim ond un cais a dderbyniwyd, ac nad oedd yr ymgeisydd hwnnw wedi mynd ymhellach gan nad oedd yn meddu ar y sgiliau sylfaenol yr oedd eu hangen?

Edwina Hart: Fel chithau, Alun, gwelais i'r hysbyseb honno a gofynnais yr un cwestiynau i'r gweision sifil ag a ofynasoch i mi. Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau, er nad wyf yn uniongyrchol gyfrifol am osod yr hysbyseb, fod adolygiad trwyadl o'r polisi hysbysebu'n mynd ymlaen yn awr yng ngolwg eich sylwadau.

John Griffiths: A mynd yn ôl at thema flaenorol, Edwina, a ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder na ddefnyddir papurau newydd rhanbarthol, fel y *South Wales Argus*, yn ddigon aml i hysbysebu swyddi'r Cynulliad? Darllenir y papur hwnnw gan fwy na 30,000 y diwrnod yng nghyn ardal Gwent, ym mhob dosbarth cymdeithasol. Dylai hysbysebion

more such people. Obtaining a wider reach, and equal opportunities, requires that the Assembly advertise more widely, but that need not mean an increase in the overall cost.

Edwina Hart: It is important that we get our advertising policy for jobs correct. We must advertise in local newspapers to ensure that people read the advertisements. Local newspapers are popular. For example, most people in Swansea pick up the *Evening Post* and flick through it, especially the job advertisement pages.

We have also had some representations from local newspapers and I am ensuring that my officials discuss positively with them how we can use the whole of the Welsh media to deliver the best quality staff for the Assembly, while also bearing in mind value for money.

Elin Jones: Fel Alun Cairns, yr wyf wedi fy synnu â rhai o hysbysebion swyddi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Y llynedd, hysbysebwyd swydd yn Aberystwyth gyda chyflog o £16,000 y flwyddyn ar dudalen lawn yn *The Western Mail*. Yr oedd yr hysbyseb honno yn costio rhywbeth tebyg i gyflog blwyddyn. Gellid bod wedi creu swydd arall yn Aberystwyth am flwyddyn am gost yr hysbyseb honno. Erfyniaf arnoch, fel y gwnaeth Alun Cairns, i sicrhau ein bod yn mabwysiadu system fwy cost-effeithiol ar gyfer hysbysebu swyddi.

Edwina Hart: It is important that we have a more cost-effective system. Placing advertisements is a civil service responsibility, but I am mindful of concerns about the administration budget and public perception. I take Elin's points on board.

Defnydd o Bartneriaethau Cyhoeddus-Preifat i Ychwanegu at Wariant y Cynulliad Use of Public-Private Partnerships to Supplement Assembly Spending

Q6 Kirsty Williams: Will the Minister comment on the use of public-private partnerships to supplement Assembly

swyddi'r Cynulliad gyrraedd mwy o bobl o'r fath. Mae sicrhau cyrhaeddiad ehangach, a chyfleoedd cyfartal, yn golygu bod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad hysbysebu'n fwy eang, ond ni raid i hynny olygu cynnydd yn y gost gyffredinol.

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig inni gael ein polisi hysbysebu swyddi'n iawn. Rhaid inni hysbysebu mewn papurau newydd lleol i sicrhau bod pobl yn darllen yr hysbysebion. Mae papurau newydd lleol yn boblogaidd. Er enghraifft, mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn Abertawe'n codi'r *Evening Post* ac yn bodio drwyddo, yn enwedig y tudalennau hysbysebion swyddi.

Yr ydym hefyd wedi cael rhai sylwadau oddi wrth bapurau newydd lleol ac yr wyf yn sicrhau bod fy swyddogion yn trafod yn gadarnhaol â hwy ynghylch sut y gallwn ddefnyddio holl gyfryngau Cymru i ddod â staff o'r safon orau i'r Cynulliad, gan ddal gwerth am arian mewn cof hefyd.

Elin Jones: Like Alun Cairns, I have been shocked by some of the Assembly's job advertisements. Last year, a £16,000 a year post in Aberystwyth was advertised on a full page in *The Western Mail*. That advertisement cost nigh on a year's wages. For the cost of that advertisement, another post could have been created in Aberystwyth for a year. I implore you, as did Alun Cairns, to ensure that we adopt a more cost-effective system for advertising jobs.

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig inni gael system fwy cost-effeithiol. Mae gosod hysbysebion yn gyfrifoldeb i'r gwasanaeth sifil, ond yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bryderon ynghylch y gyllideb weinyddu a chanfyddiad y cyhoedd. Cymeraf bwyntiau Elin i ystyriaeth.

C6 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog sylwadau ar y defnydd o bartneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat i ychwanegu at wariant y

spending? (OAQ16318)

Edwina Hart: Public-private partnerships will be developed as appropriate to maximise the delivery speed of improvements to the public sector infrastructure.

Kirsty Williams: Do you agree with the conclusions of a report written by the European Observatory on Health Care Systems and the World Bank, which stated that no European country had found a better way of funding health services than through general taxation?

Edwina Hart: I am aware of the report and, in the main, concur with it.

Dafydd Wigley: If £1 million was spent on a public-private partnership investment, how much more would it cost over 25 years than direct public funding?

Edwina Hart: I would have to look at some figures before I could respond accurately. However, there is an issue about the long-term impact of the private finance initiative, which needs to be thoroughly explored.

Peter Rogers: Do you agree that the private sector has an important role to play, particularly in hospital building?

Edwina Hart: If you need to build a building, dogma should not be an issue. However, there are issues about the structure of PFI projects and staff involvement, which we must address in Wales.

Cynulliad? (OAQ16318)

Edwina Hart: Datblygir partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat fel y bo'n briodol i gyflawni gwelliannau yn isadeiledd y sector cyhoeddus yn y modd cyflymaf.

Kirsty Williams: A ydych yn cytuno â chasgliadau adroddiad a ysgrifennwyd gan yr Wylfa Ewropeaidd ar Systemau Gofal Iechyd a Banc y Byd, a ddywedodd nad oedd yr un wlad Ewropeaidd wedi dod o hyd i ddull gwell o ariannu gwasanaethau iechyd na thrwy threthiant cyffredinol?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad ac yr wyf yn cyd-fynd ag ef, ar y cyfan.

Dafydd Wigley: Pe byddai £1 filiwn yn cael ei wario ar fuddsoddiad partneriaeth gyhoeddus-preifat, faint yn fwy a fyddai'n costio dros 25 mlynedd nag ariannu cyhoeddus uniongyrchol?

Edwina Hart: Byddai'n rhaid imi edrych ar ychydig o ffigurau cyn y gallwn roi ateb manwl. Fodd bynnag, mae mater i'w drafod ynghylch effaith dymor hir y fenter cyllid preifat, y mae angen ei archwilio'n drwyadl.

Peter Rogers: A ydych yn cytuno bod rôl bwysig i'w chwarae gan y sector preifat, yn enwedig o ran adeiladu ysbytai?

Edwina Hart: Os oes arnoch angen codi adeilad, ni ddylai dogma fod yn ystyriaeth. Er hynny, mae materion ynghylch strwythur prosiectau PFI a chysylltiad y staff, y mae'n rhaid inni roi sylw iddynt yng Nghymru.

Yr Adolygiad Cynhwysfawr o Wariant The Comprehensive Spending Review

C7 Cynog Dafis: Pryd y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi adroddiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar y ceisiadau am gyllid y mae wedi'u cyflwyno i'r Llywodraeth ganolog fel rhan o'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant? (OAQ16313)

Edwina Hart: As you know, Cynog, this is a UK Government spending review, and it is

Q7 Cynog Dafis: When will the Minister report to Plenary on the funding bids she has submitted to central Government as part of the comprehensive spending review? (OAQ16313)

Edwina Hart: Fel y gwyddoch, Cynog, adolygiad o wariant gan Lywodraeth y DU

for the Secretary of State for Wales to engage in that process on Wales's behalf. However, both the First Minister and I have made clear to the Secretary of State that the spending review settlement should reflect the continued need for match funding outside the normal Barnett arrangements.

Cynog Dafis: A gawn ymrwymiad y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n pwysu am y canlynol yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant: cynnydd mewn gwariant cyhoeddus fel cyfran o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau a buddsoddi; system drethiant deg fel sylfaen i hynny; ychwanegedd llawn a chyllid cyfatebol i'r cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd—a diolch am y sylw ar hynny; ac adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett i adlewyrchu angen? Disgwyliwn i'r Gweinidog, fel sosialydd a Chymraes frwd, gefnogi'r camau hyn i gyd.

Edwina Hart: We are concerned to ensure that the public spending profile is relevant to how we can make use of the money in Wales. It is also important that the comprehensive spending review is equitable in terms of priorities. We will continue to press for funding outside the Barnett formula, particularly in relation to structural funds. However, on the Barnett formula itself, if I were convinced that reopening the Barnett issue would be of benefit to Wales, I would do that. However, I am not yet convinced of that.

William Graham: Minister, rural communities are particularly reliant upon motor transport, and are therefore directly affected by the recent and anticipated increases in petrol prices. Will you give an undertaking to reconsider sparsity and rurality indicators in that respect?

Edwina Hart: Petrol prices are an issue in relation to the economy in general. I always consider sparsity, particularly in relation to the local government formula and, as you know, William, we are considering aspects of

yw hwn, ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru sydd i gymryd rhan yn y broses honno ar ran Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Prif Weinidog Cymru a minnau wedi rhoi ar ddeall i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol y dylai setliad yr adolygiad o wariant adlewyrchu'r angen parhaus am arian cyfatebol y tu allan i'r trefniadau Barnett arferol.

Cynog Dafis: Will you give a commitment that the Government of Wales will press for the following in the comprehensive spending review: an increase in public expenditure as a percentage of gross domestic product in order to improve services and investment; an equitable taxation system as a foundation to that; full additionality and match funding for European structural funds—and I thank you for the comment on that; and a review of the Barnett formula so that it reflects needs? I would expect the Minister, as a keen socialist and Welsh woman, to support every one of these steps.

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig gennym sicrhau bod y proffil gwariant cyhoeddus yn berthnasol i'r modd y gallwn ddefnyddio'r arian yng Nghymru. Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn deg o ran ei flaenoriaethau. Byddwn yn parhau i bwysu am gyllid y tu allan i fformiwla Barnett, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â chronfeydd strwythurol. Fodd bynnag, ynghylch fformiwla Barnett ei hun, pe byddwn yn argyhoeddedig y byddai ailagor mater Barnett o fudd i Gymru, fe wnawn hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi o hynny eto.

William Graham: Weinidog, mae cymunedau gwledig yn arbennig o ddibynnol ar drafnidiaeth fodur, ac felly mae codiadau diweddar a disgwylidiedig mewn prisiau petrol yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol arnynt. A wnewch ymgymryd i ailystyried y dangosyddion teneurwydd a gwledigrwydd mewn cysylltiad â hynny?

Edwina Hart: Mae prisiau petrol yn fater sy'n berthnasol i'r economi'n gyffredinol. Yr wyf bob amser yn ystyried teneurwydd, yn enwedig o ran y fformiwla llywodraeth leol ac, fel y gwyddoch, William, yr ydym yn

that formula in terms of how we deal with social services data and other issues. If that is a general point, then I will feed it into the system.

ystyried rhai agweddau ar y fformiwla honno o ran y modd yr ydym yn delio â data gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a materion eraill. Os yw hynny'n bwynt cyffredinol, yna fe'i porthaf i'r system.

9:45 a.m.

**Datganiad ar Arian Cyfalaf ar gyfer Cyfleuster Newydd
yn Shotton i Ailbroesu Papur
Statement on Capital Funding for the
New Waste Paper Reprocessing Capacity at Shotton**

The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies): My statement is on the investment by the Waste and Resources Action Programme on increased paper recycling at the Shotton Paper Company. I am sure that all members will have been pleased by the announcement last week that WRAP will invest up to £23 million as part of an overall £128 million investment in new paper recycling capacity at UPM-Kymmene (UK) Ltd, at Shotton in Flintshire.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies): Mae fy natganiad yn ymwneud â'r buddsoddiad drwy'r Rhaglen Weithredu Gwastraff ac Adnoddau mewn cynnydd mewn ailgylchu papur yn y Shotton Paper Company. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yr holl Aelodau wedi'u bodloni gan y cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd WRAP yn buddsoddi hyd at £23 miliwn fel rhan o fuddsoddiad cyffredinol o £128 miliwn mewn cyfleuster newydd i ailgylchu papur yn UPM-Kymmene (UK) Cyfyngedig, yn Shotton yn Sir y Fflint.

With its partners, the Scottish and Northern Ireland Executives, the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and the Department of Trade and Industry, the Welsh Assembly Government has established WRAP to increase the use of recycled material in Britain. While welcoming this investment, I do not for one moment forget the enormous challenges faced by Wales in a competitive global economy. As I said earlier, I was disappointed to hear Sharp Electronics announce yesterday that 300 staff will be made redundant between April and October 2002 at the company's manufacturing operation in Llay. I recognise the contribution Sharp has made to the north Wales economy and regret the announcement. Government officials, the Welsh Development Agency and Education and Learning Wales will work closely with the company and unions to do all that we can to maximise opportunities for those who have lost their jobs.

Ar y cyd â'i bartneriaid, Gweithrediaethau'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi sefydlu WRAP i gynyddu'r defnydd o ddeunydd wedi'i ailgylchu ym Mhrydain. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r buddsoddiad hwn, nid wyf am un eiliad yn anghofio'r her anferth y mae Cymru'n ei hwynebu mewn economi fyd-eang gystadleuol. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr oeddwn yn siomedig o glywed y cyhoeddiad gan Sharp Electronics ddoe am ddiswyddo 300 o staff rhwng Ebrill a Hydref 2002 yng ngweithrediad gweithgynhyrchu'r cwmni yn Llai. Cydnabyddaf y cyfraniad a wnaeth Sharp i economi gogledd Cymru ac mae'r cyhoeddiad yn ofid i mi. Bydd swyddogion y Llywodraeth, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn cydweithio'n agos â'r cwmni a'r undebau i wneud popeth a allwn i amlhau'r cyfleoedd i'r rhai a gollodd eu swyddi.

However, we will continue to work closely with companies across Wales to help them

Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn parhau i gydweithio'n agos â chwmnïau ledled Cymru

innovate and become more competitive, and to encourage further investment. On the WRAP investment, an arm's-length company has been set up specifically to develop a recyclates market that will work by removing barriers to the use of recyclates and, where appropriate, by funding new recycling capacity. WRAP has four current priority areas: paper, plastic, wood and glass. Its first major project will make a dramatic increase to newsprint recycling in the UK.

Following a closely contested competitive tender, WRAP has announced that the project will go ahead at the Shotton Paper Company in Flintshire. The landfill tax credit scheme and public sector grants will provide £23 million between them. UPM Kymmene, the Finnish parent company of the Shotton plant, will fund the remainder of the £128 million investment. The scheme is still subject to European Union state aids clearance, but together with WRAP and UPM Kymmene, I hope that that will be no more than a formality. The project will provide an additional 300,000 tonnes capacity for recycled paper by 2004. I am pleased that the Shotton Paper Company has won this important contract from WRAP. The new plant funded by this contract will help secure jobs in north Wales, and the new paper recycling capacity will complement the new waste strategy for Wales, as outlined by Sue Essex.

On the Wales waste strategy, WRAP sits firmly within the objectives of achieving more sustainable waste strategy management. As I said earlier, the Minister for Environment will publish the new waste strategy for Wales later this spring. That will emphasise the need to increase recycling, particularly of paper, and WRAP fits in with our commitment to targets, backed by resources, on delivering recycling in Wales.

i'w helpu i arloesi a dod yn fwy cystadleuol, ac i hybu rhagor o fuddsoddi. Ynghylch buddsoddiad WRAP, mae cwmni hyd braich wedi'i sefydlu'n benodol i ddatblygu marchnad defnyddiau ailgylchedig a fydd yn gweithio drwy ddileu'r rhwystrau rhag defnyddio defnyddiau ailgylchedig a, lle y bo'n briodol, drwy ariannu cyfleusterau ailgylchu newydd. Mae gan WRAP bedwar maes blaenoriaeth ar hyn o bryd: papur, plastig, coed a gwydr. Bydd ei brosiect mawr cyntaf yn sicrhau cynnydd sylweddol yn yr ailgylchu o bapur papur newydd yn y DU.

Ar ôl tindr cystadleuol a ymladdwyd yn glòs, mae WRAP wedi cyhoeddi y bydd y prosiect yn mynd ymlaen yn y Shotton Paper Company yn Sir y Fflint. Bydd y cynllun credyd treth tirlenwi a grantiau sector cyhoeddus yn darparu £23 miliwn rhyngddynt. Bydd UPM Kymmene, y rhiant gwmmi o'r Ffindir i'r gwaith yn Shotton, yn ariannu gweddill y buddsoddiad o £128 miliwn. Mae'n rhaid i'r cynllun gael ei glirio o hyd o ran cymhorthion gwladol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ond ynghyd â WRAP ac UPM Kymmene, yr wyf yn gobeithio mai ffurfioldeb yn unig fydd hynny. Bydd y prosiect yn darparu cyfleuster ychwanegol o 300,000 o dunelli metrig ar gyfer papur ailgylchedig erbyn 2004. Yr wyf yn falch mai Shotton Paper Company a enillodd y contract pwysig hwn oddi wrth WRAP. Bydd y gwaith newydd a ariennir drwy'r contract hwn yn gymorth i ddiogelu swyddi yn y Gogledd, a bydd y cyfleuster newydd ar gyfer ailgylchu papur yn ategu'r strategaeth gwastraff newydd i Gymru, fel y mae Sue Essex wedi amlinellu.

Ynghylch strategaeth gwastraff Cymru, mae WRAP yn cyd-fynd yn llwyr â'r amcanion o sicrhau rheolaeth fwy cynaliadwy yn y strategaeth gwastraff. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, bydd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn cyhoeddi'r strategaeth gwastraff newydd i Gymru yn ddiweddarach y gwanwyn yma. Bydd honno'n pwysleisio'r angen i gynyddu ailgylchu, yn enwedig ailgylchu papur, ac mae WRAP yn cyd-fynd â'n hymrwymiad i'r targedau, gyda chymorth adnoddau, i gyflawni ailgylchu yng Nghymru.

This project, delivered through WRAP's programme, is a good example of the proactive approach Government is adopting in Wales and across the UK to increase recycling in our economy and reduce the lost opportunities and potential environmental damage arising from our current waste management methods.

Janet Ryder: This is good news for the north and for Shotton. It is also good news for recycling because it is always better to invest in re-use and recycling rather than in other forms of waste disposal, such as incineration. Therefore, it is good that a venture to develop recycling is being supported. It is also interesting that this venture is being funded partly by the landfill tax scheme. Do you agree that we need to level the playing field on waste disposal? Just as there is a landfill tax scheme, do you agree that an equal tax should be applied to waste incineration, and will you use your position to lobby strongly for such a tax to be included in Gordon Brown's budget this year?

You mentioned the terrible job losses in Llay. Clearly this venture will help create jobs in Shotton, but, as Dafydd Wigley said earlier, this area of Wales has lost over 2,000 jobs in the last year. Although I welcome the measures that you mentioned for supporting and helping those workers who may lose their jobs, will you revisit your economic development strategy and introduce regional job creation targets? In that way, north Wales can be assured that your overall job creation targets will not be met purely by job creations in the south.

Andrew Davies: Thank you for welcoming this announcement, but then off you went again on regional job creation targets. Plaid Cymru is like a stuck record—it keeps coming back to the same question. I answered that question earlier today, and put it firmly back in the box.

Mae'r prosiect hwn, a gyflawnir drwy raglen WRAP, yn enghraifft dda o'r dull rhagweithiol y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei mabwysiadu yng Nghymru a ledled y DU i gynyddu ailgylchu yn ein heconomi a lleihau'r cyfleoedd coll a'r posibilid o ddifrod amgylcheddol oherwydd ein dulliau presennol o reoli gwastraff.

Janet Ryder: Mae hyn yn newyddion da i'r Gogledd ac i Shotton. Mae'n newyddion da hefyd i ailgylchu am ei bod bob amser yn well buddsoddi mewn ailddefnyddio ac ailgylchu yn hytrach nag mewn mathau eraill o waredu gwastraff, megis llosgi. Felly, mae'n beth da bod cymorth wedi'i roi i fenter i ddatblygu ailgylchu. Mae'n ddi-ddorol hefyd fod y fenter hon wedi'i hariannu'n rhannol drwy'r cynllun treth tirlenwi. A ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni sicrhau tegwch ynghylch gwaredu gwastraff? Yn yr un modd ag y mae cynllun treth tirlenwi, a ydych yn cytuno y dylid cymhwyso treth gyfwerth at losgi gwastraff, ac a wnewch ddefnyddio'ch swydd i lobïo'n gryf dros gynnwys treth o'r fath yng nghyllideb Gordon Brown eleni?

Soniasoch am y colledion swyddi ofnadwy yn Llai. Mae'n amlwg y bydd y fenter hon yn helpu i greu swyddi yn Shotton, ond, fel y dywedodd Dafydd Wigley yn gynharach, mae'r rhan hon o Gymru wedi colli dros 2,000 o swyddi yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r camau yr ydych wedi'u crybwyll ar gyfer cefnogi a helpu'r gweithwyr a allai gollu'u swyddi, a wnewch ailystyried eich strategaeth datblygu economaidd a chyflwyno targedau creu swyddi rhanbarthol? Drwy wneud hynny, gall y Gogledd fod yn sicr na chyrrhaeddir eich targedau creu swyddi cyffredinol drwy greu swyddi yn y De yn unig.

Andrew Davies: Diolch i chi am groesawu'r cyhoeddiad hwn, ond i ffwrdd â chi wedyn i sôn am dargedau creu swyddi rhanbarthol. Mae Plaid Cymru fel record sydd wedi mynd yn sownd. Mae'n dod yn ôl at yr un cwestiwn dro ar ôl tro. Atebais y cwestiwn hwnnw'n gynharach heddiw, ac yr wyf wedi ei roi'n ôl yn bendant yn y blwch.

Waste and recycling is a matter for my colleague, Sue Essex. I cannot comment on specific projects under consideration. However, we must bear in mind that recycling and waste reduction is one of our key priorities. Incineration is an option, but recycling is a more favoured option by the Government in both Wales and Westminster. We will try to reduce the use of disposable waste as well as increasing our emphasis on recycling. The thrust of the Waste and Resources Action Programme announcement for Shotton is to move away from landfill. We would all agree that landfill is the least desirable option in terms of waste disposal and management. We are committed to more sustainable waste management methods, and I am delighted to make this announcement today. It demonstrates our commitment to a sustainable waste management strategy.

Tom Middlehurst: I welcome this statement. It is good news for my constituency, and for the North-east. It will make an important contribution to our waste strategy, which I am sure will be welcomed by other Ministers. It will help to underpin the Shotton paper facility, which is an important part of our business community and which provides high-quality jobs. This recognises the work undertaken over many years by the local authority, agencies and the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that we reward the excellent business community that exists in my constituency. This does, however, come on the back of some bad news, as was mentioned earlier. Nevertheless, we should recognise the importance of this statement. It will be widely welcomed in all parts of Wales, not least in my constituency. In one of your visits to north Wales—an area that I hope you will visit many times—will you visit the Shotton Paper Company to see this work for yourself?

Andrew Davies: I join you in congratulating all those concerned in delivering this welcome announcement and development in Flintshire, especially the First Minister and the Minister for Environment, Sue Essex.

Mae gwastraff ac ailgylchu'n fater i'm cyd-Aelod, Sue Essex. Ni allaf wneud sylw am y prosiectau penodol sydd o dan ystyriaeth. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio mai ailgylchu a lleihau gwastraff yw un o'n blaenoriaethau allweddol. Mae llosgi'n un dewis, ond mae ailgylchu'n ddewis sy'n well gan y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan. Byddwn yn ceisio lleihau'r defnydd o wastraff tafladwy yn ogystal â chynyddu'n pwyslais ar ailgylchu. Y pwyslais yng nghyhoeddiad y Rhaglen Weithredu Gwastraff ac Adnoddau ar gyfer Shotton yw symud oddi wrth dirlenwi. Byddem oll yn cytuno mai tirlenwi yw'r dewis lleiaf dymunol o ran gwaredu a rheoli gwastraff. Yr ydym wedi ymrwmo i ddulliau rheoli gwastraff mwy cynaliadwy, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd yn gwneud y cyhoeddiad hwn heddiw. Mae'n dangos ein hymrwymiad i strategaeth rheoli gwastraff gynaliadwy.

Tom Middlehurst: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn. Mae'n newyddion da i'm hetholaeth i, ac i'r Gogledd-ddwyrain. Bydd yn gyfraniad o bwys at ein strategaeth wastraff, a groesewir, yr wyf yn siŵr, gan y Gweinidogion eraill. Bydd o gymorth i gynnal cyfleuster papur Shotton, sy'n rhan bwysig o'n cymuned fusnes ac sy'n darparu swyddi o ansawdd da. Mae hyn yn gydnabyddiaeth i'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd dros flynyddoedd lawer gan yr awdurdod lleol, yr asiantaethau a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau ein bod yn gwobrwyo'r gymuned fusnes ragorol yn fy etholaeth i. Serch hynny, mae hyn yn dod ar ôl newyddion drwg, fel y dywedwyd yn gynharach. Er hynny, dylem gydnabod pwysigrwydd y datganiad hwn. Caiff groeso cyffredinol ym mhob rhan o Gymru, nid lleiaf yn fy etholaeth i. Ar un o'ch ymweliadau â gogledd Cymru—ardal yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn ymweld â hi lawer gwaith—a wnewch ymweld â Shotton Paper Company i weld y gwaith hwn drosoch eich hun?

Andrew Davies: Ymunaf â chi wrth longyfarch pawb sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflawni'r cyhoeddiad a'r datblygiad derbyniol hwn yn Sir y Fflint, yn enwedig Prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros yr

They have done a huge amount of work on this project.

As I said earlier this morning, there have been job losses but, to a large extent, they have been cancelled out by job gains. This investment is a major contribution in that direction. We now have the lowest unemployment for over 25 years in virtually all parts of Wales. Some parts of the economy are doing extremely well, but others less so. We must consider the issue in a balanced way. I will be visiting Flintshire, at your invitation, in the near future, and, if possible, I would like to visit the Shotton Paper Company. My father came from that area.

David Davies: I also welcome this statement. I appreciate that it is a brief statement, but I hope that you do not underestimate the problems involved with such recycling work. In paper recycling, huge price fluctuations can occur over a short period of time. I have been told that one week, paper can be worth a fair bit of money, and the following week one has to pay to have it taken away. There is no mention here of dealing with such problems, and no mention of local authorities. If this plant is to work properly, those running it will have to work in partnership with the local authority, which will be responsible for collecting the paper.

We welcome the use of landfill tax for this scheme, but currently only a small percentage of such tax is recycled into environmental schemes. The Government is still primarily using this as a revenue-based fund raising measure, and by and large the money does not go back into recycling—some does, but not nearly enough. Do not take this personally, but in coming here today to trumpet your Government's commitment to paper recycling, you lay yourself open to a few charges of hypocrisy. A few weeks ago, I tabled a question to find out what percentage of the paper used by the Assembly—and we use a lot—is recycled paper. The mealy-mouthed reply suggested that the answer is zero. We do not use one sheet of recycled paper in the National Assembly. The next

Amgylchedd, Sue Essex. Gwnaethant waith aruthrol ar y prosiect hwn.

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach y bore yma, bu colledion swyddi ond, i raddau helaeth, maent wedi'u diddymu gan enillion swyddi. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn yn gyfraniad o bwys yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw. Yn awr mae gennym y diweithdra isaf ers dros 25 mlynedd ym mron bob rhan o Gymru. Mae rhai rhannau o'r economi'n gwneud yn dda dros ben, ac eraill yn llai felly. Rhaid inni edrych ar y mater yn gytbwys. Byddaf yn ymweld â Sir y Fflint, ar eich gwahoddiad, yn y dyfodol agos, ac, os bydd modd, hoffwn ymweld â Shotton Paper Company. Yr oedd fy nhad yn hanu o'r ardal honno.

David Davies: Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r datganiad hwn. Sylweddolaf ei fod yn ddatganiad byr, ond gobeithiaf nad ydych yn bychanu'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â gwaith ailgylchu o'r fath. Mewn ailgylchu papur, gall prisiau amrywio'n aruthrol dros gyfnod byr. Dywedwyd wrthyf y gall papur fod yn werth cryn dipyn o arian un wythnos, a'ch bod, yr wythnos ddilynol, yn gorfod talu iddo gael ei ddwyn ymaith. Nid oes sôn yma am ddelio â phroblemau o'r fath, nac am yr awdurdodau lleol. Os yw'r gwaith hwn i weithredu'n briodol, bydd y rhai sy'n ei redeg yn gorfod gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r awdurdod lleol, a fydd yn gyfrifol am gasglu'r papur.

Croesawn y defnydd o'r dreth tirlenwi ar gyfer y cynllun hwn, ond ar hyn o bryd dim ond canran fach o'r dreth honno a gaiff ei hailgylchu drwy gynlluniau amgylcheddol. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn dal i ddefnyddio'r mesur hwn i godi arian ar sail refeniw yn bennaf, ac at ei gilydd nid yw'r arian yn mynd yn ôl at ailgylchu—rhywfaint, ond nid digon o bellffordd. Peidiwch â chymryd hyn yn bersonol, ond wrth ddod yma heddiw i ganu clodydd i ymrwymiad eich Llywodraeth i ailgylchu papur, yr ydych yn eich rhoi'ch hun mewn perygl o gael rhai cyhuddiadau o ragrith. Ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, cyflwynais gwestiwn i ddarganfod pa ganran o'r papur a ddefnyddir gan y Cynulliad—ac yr ydym yn defnyddio llawer—sy'n bapur wedi'i ailgylchu. Yr oedd yr ateb mursesnaidd a

time you come here to talk about paper recycling, and its importance, I hope that we will be using some of that paper.

9:55 a.m.

Andrew Davies: I hope to avoid the charge of hypocrisy, David. Like all public and private bodies, we must consider our procurement methods. If we can use recycled material, we should lead by example in doing so. That would help in creating demand, and could contribute to levelling the price fluctuations in the paper market. It is a myth that there is a form of waste management that has no costs and no downside—they all have advantages and disadvantages. We must move away from landfill. Our waste management strategy will demonstrate that landfill is by far the worst option. We must look at all forms of waste management, including reducing the demand for packaging and other forms of what may be termed unnecessary production and use. We must also place greater emphasis on recycling. Local authorities and others have a crucial role in this work, and we are working in partnership with local authorities to implement a sustainable waste management strategy. This project demonstrates that we and the UK Government and its agencies are using landfill tax for environmental purposes, as it was designed to be used.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I thank you for your statement, and for the much welcomed investment in north-east Wales. We have also heard bad news from that area recently, so this investment is much needed. In addition, I congratulate you on the level of leverage that this public sector investment will bring from the private sector. This proposal will dramatically increase the amount of newsprint passing through the Shotton papermill. Is this likely to displace the wood from Welsh sources which is recycled at Shotton? The timber that passes

gefais yn awgrymu mai'r ateb yw dim. Ni ddefnyddiwn yr un ddalen o bapur wedi'i ailgylchu yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Y tro nesaf y dewch yma i sôn am ailgylchu papur, a'i bwysigrwydd, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn defnyddio rhywfaint o'r papur hwnnw.

Andrew Davies: Gobeithiaf osgoi'r cyhuddiad o ragrith, David. Fel yr holl gyrff cyhoeddus a phreifat, rhaid inni ystyried ein dulliau caffael. Os gallwn ddefnyddio deunydd wedi'i ailgylchu, dylem arwain drwy esiampl wrth wneud hynny. Byddai hynny o gymorth i greu galw, a gallai gyfrannu at wastatáu'r amrywiadau mewn prisiau yn y farchnad papur. Nid oes y fath beth â ffurf ar reoli gwastraff sydd heb gostau a gostyngiadau—mae i bob un ei manteision a'i hanfanteision. Rhaid inni symud oddi wrth dirlenwi. Bydd ein strategaeth reoli gwastraff yn dangos mai tirlenwi yw'r dewis gwaethaf o bellffordd. Rhaid inni edrych ar bob ffurf ar reoli gwastraff, gan gynnwys lleihau'r galw am ddeunydd lapio a ffurfiau eraill o'r hyn y gellir ei alw'n gynhyrchu a defnyddio diangen. Rhaid inni roi mwy o bwyslais ar ailgylchu hefyd. Mae rôl hollbwysig i'r awdurdodau lleol ac eraill yn y gwaith hwn, ac yr ydym yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r awdurdodau lleol i roi strategaeth reoli gwastraff gynaliadwy ar waith. Mae'r prosiect hwn yn dangos ein bod ni a Llywodraeth y DU a'i hasiantaethau'n defnyddio'r dreth tirlenwi i ddibenion amgylcheddol, fel y bwriadwyd ei defnyddio.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Diolchaf i chi am eich datganiad, ac am y buddsoddiad derbyniol iawn yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain. Clywsom newyddion drwg o'r ardal honno'n ddiweddar hefyd, felly mae mawr angen y buddsoddiad hwn. Yn ogystal â hynny, fe'ch llongyfarchaf ar faint yr arian y bydd y buddsoddiad sector cyhoeddus hwn yn ei godi o'r sector preifat. Bydd y cynllun hwn yn peri cynnydd trawiadol ym maint y papur newydd a aiff drwy felin bapur Shotton. A yw'n debygol o ddisodli'r coed o ffynonellau yng Nghymru a ailgylchir yn

through Shotton has around 40 megawatts of generation potential; if it were displaced would there be a problem in finding alternative resources to deal with that wood? Can you reassure us that the paper will be in addition to existing material from Wales which is recycled at Shotton? If not, what biomass strategy plans do you have to use the waste timber that will be available?

Andrew Davies: I cannot give you a definitive answer. I will have to make inquiries, and write to you with an answer. On the wider issue of energy use and biomass, the Economic Development Committee is conducting a major review of energy production and use in Wales. It would be premature for me to comment on that matter before the Committee has published its final report, and before I give my response to the review.

Shotton? Mae potensial cynhyrchu o oddeutu 40 megawatt gan y coed sy'n mynd drwy Shotton; os caiff ei ddisodli, a fyddai anhawster o ran dod o hyd i gyfleusterau eraill i ddelio â'r coed hwnnw? A allwch roi sicrwydd i ni y bydd y papur yn ychwanegol at y deunydd presennol o Gymru a ailgylchir yn Shotton? Os na fydd, pa gynlluniau strategaeth bio-màs sydd gennych i ddefnyddio'r coed gwastraff a fydd ar gael?

Andrew Davies: Ni allaf roi ateb pendant i chi. Bydd yn rhaid imi wneud ymholiadau, ac ysgrifennu atoch gydag ateb. Ynghylch mater ehangach y defnydd o ynni a bio-màs, mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn cynnal adolygiad helaeth ar gynhyrchu a defnyddio ynni yng Nghymru. Byddai'n rhy gynnar imi wneud sylw ar y mater hwnnw cyn i'r Pwyllgor gyhoeddi ei adroddiad terfynol, a chyn imi roi fy ymateb i'r adolygiad.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Point of order. You will recall that on 5 March 2002, the First Minister made a statement on what he called the channel of communication between the Permanent Secretary and the assistant chief constable of South Wales Police, regarding the investigation involving Mike German. Has the First Minister requested under Standing Order No. 6.8 that he be allowed to make a further statement to clarify some of his comments during that statement? He has issued a note to Assembly Members which clarifies that but, because several other issues arise, it would be appropriate for the First Minister to make a further statement.

One issue demands that he make that statement. During the statement, the First Minister told us repeatedly that the only basis on which the assistant chief constable was prepared to provide information to the Permanent Secretary was that it should remain confidential. He repeated that several times, and I refer to the record of that statement. In reply to my question, the First Minister said:

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Pwynt o drefn. Byddwch yn cofio bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi gwneud datganiad ar 5 Mawrth 2002, ar yr hyn a alwodd yn sianel gyfathrebu rhwng yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol a phrif gwnstabl cynorthwyol Heddlu De Cymru, ynghylch yr ymchwiliad sy'n ymwneud â Mike German. A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi gwneud cais yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8 am gael gwneud datganiad pellach i egluro rhai o'i sylwadau yn ystod y datganiad hwnnw? Mae wedi rhoi nodyn i'r Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n egluro ar hynny ond, am fod sawl mater arall yn codi, byddai'n briodol i Brif Weinidog Cymru wneud datganiad pellach.

Mae un mater yn mynnu ei fod yn gwneud y datganiad hwnnw. Yn ystod y datganiad, dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru wrthym dro ar ôl tro nad oedd y prif gwnstabl cynorthwyol ond yn barod i ddarparu gwybodaeth i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol os byddai'n aros yn gyfrinachol. Dywedodd hynny sawl gwaith, a chyfeiriai at gofnod y datganiad hwnnw. Mewn ymateb i'm cwestiwn, dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru:

‘The suggestion that we should have made this arrangement between the South Wales Police and the Permanent Secretary public is inherently absurd, given that it is clear to me and to anyone who is reasonable, that had it been made public, it would not have existed.’

I then wrote to the chief constable of South Wales Police, asking him whether that was the case. In his reply, the chief constable did not confirm or deny the accuracy of that statement. However, it is significant that the First Minister has chosen to clarify that statement in a note to Members. I quote from that note:

‘Finally, the First Minister would like to correct the misunderstanding reflected in some of the reporting upon his statement. The South Wales Police did not make it a precondition that the line of communication with the Permanent Secretary should be private to him.’

The clear implication of that is that there was no such understanding between the Permanent Secretary and the assistant chief constable. In that event, and to clarify the matter, it is important that the First Minister makes a further statement.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Further to that point of order, I have received a letter from the First Minister indicating that he does not intend to respond further to my request for a list of Cabinet Ministers who knew about this, although he undertook to give that information. The letter said that the statement that the First Minister has issued clarifies a few points. I am not sure what it clarifies, but it raises questions which I hope the First Minister can answer.

First, confidentiality. The First Minister made it clear that the South Wales Police was only content with this line of communication as long as it was not known. Now that it is known, it has presumably dried up. He must deal with that point. It is not a misunderstanding in the press; it is what the

‘Mae’r awgrym y dylem fod wedi cyhoeddi’r trefniant hwn rhwng Heddlu De Cymru a’r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn hollol wirion, o gofio ei fod yn amlwg i mi ac i unrhyw un sy’n rhesymol, pe byddai wedi’i gyhoeddi, na fyddai wedi bodoli.’

Ysgrifennais wedyn at brif gwnstabl Heddlu De Cymru, gan ofyn iddo a oedd hynny’n wir. Yn ei ateb, ni chadarnhaodd y prif gwnstabl gywirdeb y datganiad hwnnw na’i wadu. Fodd bynnag, mae’n arwyddocaol bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi dewis egluro’r datganiad hwnnw mewn nodyn i’r Aelodau. Dyfynnaf o’r nodyn hwnnw:

‘Yn olaf, carai Prif Weinidog Cymru gywiro’r camddealltwriaeth a adlewyrchir yn rhai o’r adroddiadau ar ei ddatganiad. Nis gwnaethpwyd yn rhagamod gan Heddlu De Cymru y dylai’r llinell gyfathrebu â’r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol fod yn breifat iddo ef.’

Goblygiad clir hynny yw nad oedd dealltwriaeth o’r fath rhwng yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol a’r prif gwnstabl cynorthwyol. Os felly, ac i egluro’r mater, mae’n bwysig bod Prif Weinidog Cymru’n gwneud datganiad pellach.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Ymhellach i’r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae llythyr wedi dod i’r llaw oddi wrth Brif Weinidog Cymru sy’n dangos nad yw’n bwriadu ymateb ymhellach i’r cais am restr o Weinidogion Cabinet a wyddai am hyn, er iddo ymgymryd i roi’r wybodaeth honno. Dywedodd y llythyr fod y datganiad a roddodd Prif Weinidog Cymru’n egluro ychydig o bwyntiau. Nid wyf yn sicr beth y mae’n ei egluro, ond mae’n codi cwestiynau yr wyf yn gobeithio y gall Prif Weinidog Cymru eu hateb.

Yn gyntaf, cyfrinachedd. Rhoddodd Prif Weinidog Cymru ar ddeall nad oedd Heddlu De Cymru ond yn fodlon ar y llinell gyfathrebu hon ar yr amod nad oedd yn hysbys. Gan ei bod yn hysbys bellach, rhaid cymryd ei bod wedi sychu. Rhaid iddo ddelio â’r pwynt hwnnw. Nid yw’n

First Minister told us.

Secondly, the First Minister says in the statement that he kept the acting Deputy First Minister informed, in accordance with the established protocol. What is that established protocol? I do not think that anyone is aware of it.

Thirdly, the First Minister did not regard the existence of the link as something to be kept strictly from all Cabinet members. We know that the acting Deputy First Minister knew about it. Which other Cabinet Ministers knew? He told the *Welsh Mirror* that Andrew Davies knew, and that has been confirmed in a written answer. He should tell us which Cabinet members knew about it and whether the established line of communication with the police will now cease, as he said would happen if it became known publicly. That is an important issue.

The Presiding Officer: I have listened carefully to the leader of the Welsh Conservatives and the leader of the opposition, but I fail to see that this is a point of order for me. Both leaders must pursue this through the usual activities of the Assembly, such as questions to the First Minister next Tuesday. The First Minister has communicated in writing, he has not volunteered a further statement and, therefore, I cannot take any further action at this point.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Further to that point of order, I understand your response that there is no way in which the First Minister can be forced to make a statement to the Assembly, because that is the strict position as it appears in Standing Orders. However, this is not a normal request. It goes to the heart of the integrity of this institution. The First Minister has sought to clarify something that he originally said in an oral statement. Given the spirit in which the original oral statement was made to the Assembly, do you think that the least the First Minister could do to clarify that is to make another oral statement?

gamddealltwriaeth yn y wasg; dyna a ddywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru wrthym.

Yn ail, dywed Prif Weinidog Cymru yn y datganiad ei fod wedi gadael i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gweithredol wybod beth a oedd yn digwydd, yn unol â'r protocol sefydledig. Beth yw'r protocol sefydledig hwnnw? Nid wyf yn credu bod neb yn ymwybodol ohono.

Yn drydydd, nid oedd Prif Weinidog Cymru'n ystyried bodolaeth y cyswllt yn rhywbeth i'w gadw'n gyfan gwbl oddi wrth holl aelodau'r Cabinet. Gwyddom fod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gweithredol yn gwybod amdano. Pa Weinidogion Cabinet eraill a wyddai? Dywedodd wrth y *Welsh Mirror* fod Andrew Davies yn gwybod, a chadarnhawyd hynny mewn ateb ysgrifenedig. Dylai ddweud wrthym pa aelodau Cabinet a wyddai amdano ac a fydd y llinell gyfathrebu sefydledig â'r heddlu yn dod i ben yn awr, fel y dywedodd y byddai pe deuai'n hysbys i'r cyhoedd. Mae hynny'n fater pwysig.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi gwranddo'n ofalus ar arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru ac arweinydd yr wrthblaid, ond methaf â gweld ei fod yn bwynt o drefn i mi. Rhaid i'r ddau arweinydd fynd ynghylch hyn drwy weithgareddau arferol y Cynulliad, fel y cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru ddydd Mawrth nesaf. Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi cyfathrebu mewn ysgrifen, nid yw wedi cynnig datganiad pellach ac, felly, ni allaf gymryd unrhyw gamau pellach ar hyn o bryd.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr wyf yn deall eich ymateb nad oes dim modd gorfodi Prif Weinidog Cymru i wneud datganiad gerbron y Cynulliad, oherwydd dyna'r sefyllfa fanwl fel y'i nodir yn y Rheolau Sefydlog. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hwn yn gais arferol. Mae'n mynd at hanfod uniondeb y sefydliad hwn. Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi ceisio egluro rywbeth a ddywedodd yn wreiddiol mewn datganiad llafar. O wybod ym mha ysbryd y gwnaethpwyd y datganiad llafar gwreiddiol gerbron y Cynulliad, a gredwch mai'r lleiaf y gallai Prif Weinidog Cymru ei

wneud i egluro hyn yw gwneud datganiad llafar arall?

The Presiding Officer: I note that you are pressing me. I do not deal in matters of spirit; I only deal in matters that relate to Standing Orders.

Y Llywydd: Sylwaf eich bod yn pwysu arnaf. Nid wyf yn ymdrin â materion ysbryd; nid wyf ond yn ymdrin â materion sy'n berthnasol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog.

Nick Bourne: Further to that point of order, I am sorry to stretch the matter out, but this relates to the integrity of the institution. It relates, first of all, to a promise made by the First Minister. He told me that he would let me know if his recollection was faulty as to which Cabinet Ministers knew about it. I have not received that information, and I feel that his statement is unsatisfactory. He should clarify whether the police are still involved. Having given us one version of events, he now blames the press for misleading everyone. The press has not misled anyone; the First Minister has done that. This needs to be cleared up by the First Minister. He is present in the Chamber, so why does he not stand up and give us the information?

Nick Bourne: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae'n ddrwg gennyf ymestyn y mater, ond mae hyn yn ymwneud ag uniondeb y sefydliad hwn. Mae'n ymwneud, yn gyntaf oll, ag addewid gan Brif Weinidog Cymru. Dywedodd wrthyf y rhoddai wybod i mi os oedd ei gof yn ddiffygiol o ran pa Weinidogion Cabinet a wyddai amdano. Nid wyf wedi cael yr wybodaeth honno, a theimlaf fod ei ddatganiad yn anfoddfaol. Dylai egluro a yw'r heddlu'n gysylltiedig o hyd. Ar ôl rhoi inni un fersiwn o'r digwyddiadau, mae'n rhoi'r bai ar y wasg yn awr am gamarwain pawb. Nid yw'r wasg wedi camarwain neb; Prif Weinidog Cymru a wnaeth hynny. Mae angen i Brif Weinidog Cymru egluro hyn. Mae'n bresennol yn y Siambr, felly pam na wnaiff sefyll ar ei draed a rhoi'r wybodaeth i ni?

The Presiding Officer: It is clear that no member of the Cabinet wishes to respond to this point. I am grateful for that, because this is not a point of order. I understand how important it is for the opposition to carry out its role, but the Government has the option to remain silent when it wishes to do so. People can interpret that accordingly.

Y Llywydd: Mae'n amlwg nad oes neb o aelodau'r Cabinet yn dymuno ymateb i'r pwynt hwn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny, oherwydd nid yw'n bwynt o drefn. Deallaf mor bwysig ydyw i'r wrthblaid gyflawni ei rôl, ond mae dewis gan y Llywodraeth i aros yn fud pan yw'n dymuno. Gall pobl ddehongli hynny fel y mynnant.

10:05 a.m.

David Melding: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.33. It relates to a series of written questions I tabled to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, the reply to which I received yesterday. In relation to the information I sought, she said,

David Melding: Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf yn codi hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.33. Mae'n ymwneud â chyfres o gwestiynau ysgrifenedig a gyflwynais i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, y cefais ateb iddynt ddoe. Mewn cysylltiad â'r wybodaeth a geisiais, dywedodd,

'I will write to the Member and place a copy of the letter in the Libraries at Cathays park and Cardiff bay.'

'Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod ac yn gosod copi o'r llythyr yn y Llyfrgelloedd ym mharc Cathays a bae Caerdydd.'

My questions related to the analysis of how subordinate legislation has been dealt with in

Yr oedd fy nghwestiynau'n ymwneud â'r dadansoddiad o'r modd yr ymdriniwyd ag is-

the Assembly since 1999. The same questions were put to all Cabinet members. All of them replied on time, with the exception of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, who replied late, and all the other Ministers provided me with the information in a concise and easy to analyse table. However, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has told me that she cannot provide an immediate reply, but that she will write to me.

I am concerned about this because, had I wished to enter into correspondence with the Minister, I would have done so. She has now relegated my written questions to an exchange of correspondence, which means that her substantive answer, when I actually receive it, will not be included in the Record of Proceedings, and will therefore be denied to people who look for it on the Assembly's internet site. I believe that this is a matter for you, Presiding Officer as it could amount to an abuse of procedure. This device could lead to Cabinet Ministers always responding to Members' questions by saying that they will write to them with the information requested. That would add considerably to the time taken to answer the substantive points raised in written questions. I seek your ruling on this, Presiding Officer.

The Presiding Officer: This is not substantively a matter for me because the content of ministerial answers, as returned to Members, is not a matter of order. However, Ministers, in all places and at all times, should provide as much information as possible for Members on the record. However, this is not a matter for me. It is up to you, as a Member, to publish any correspondence you receive from the Minister, if you feel that the publication of the information through the Libraries is inadequate.

David Melding: Further to that point of order, I am disappointed with your ruling. However, I must accept it, even if I do not support it. This practice is irregular when compared with that of the Minister's colleagues. They have all put the information

ddeddfwriaeth yn y Cynulliad ers 1999. Gofynnwyd yr un cwestiynau i holl aelodau'r Cabinet. Atebodd pob un ohonynt mewn pryd, ar wahân i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, a atebodd yn hwyr, a rhoddodd yr holl Weiniogion eraill yr wybodaeth imi mewn tabl cryno a hawdd ei ddadansoddi. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi dweud wrthyf na all ddarparu ateb ar unwaith, ond y bydd yn ysgrifennu ataf.

Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch hynny oherwydd, pe byddwn wedi dymuno gohebu â'r Gweinidog, byddwn wedi gwneud hynny. Yn awr mae wedi trosglwyddo fy nghwestiynau ysgrifenedig i ohebiaeth, sy'n golygu na fydd sylwedd ei hateb, pan gaf ef, wedi'i gynnwys yng Nghofnod y Trafodion, ac felly ni fydd ar gael i rai sy'n chwilio amdano ar safle'r Cynulliad ar y rhyngwyd. Credaf fod hyn yn fater i chi, Lywydd, gan y gallai olygu bod y weithdrefn wedi'i chamddefnyddio. Gallai'r ystryw hon arwain at Weiniogion Cabinet yn ateb cwestiynau'r Aelodau bob amser drwy ddweud y byddant yn ysgrifennu atynt â'r wybodaeth a geisiwyd. Byddai hynny'n ychwanegu'n sylweddol at yr amser a gymerir i ateb y pwyntiau o sylwedd a godir mewn cwestiynau ysgrifenedig. Gofynnaf am eich dyfarniad ar hyn, Lywydd.

Y Llywydd: Nid yw hyn yn fater i mi yn ei hanfod oherwydd nid yw cynnwys atebion gweinidogol, fel y'u dychwelir i'r Aelodau, yn fater o drefn. Fodd bynnag, fe ddylai Gweinidogion, ym mhob man ac ar bob adeg, sicrhau bod cymaint ag y bo modd o wybodaeth i'r Aelodau yn cael ei gofnodi. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n fater i mi. Eich lle chi, fel Aelod, yw cyhoeddi unrhyw ohebiaeth a gewch oddi wrth y Gweinidog, os teimlwch fod cyhoeddi'r wybodaeth drwy'r Llyfrgelloedd yn annigonol.

David Melding: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr wyf wedi fy siomi yn eich dyfarniad. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ei dderbyn, hyd yn oed os nad wyf yn ei gefnogi. Mae'r arfer hwn yn afreolaidd o'i gymharu ag arfer cyd-Aelodau'r Gweinidog.

sought by my written questions on record and that information is now included in the Record of Proceedings. That is the point. We must have some substance here. When we table written questions, we expect the answers to be in the written record. I cannot include my correspondence in the written record, and therefore I believe that my rights as an Assembly Member are being infringed.

Dafydd Wigley: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, efallai mai un ateb fyddai sicrhau bod darpariaeth i Weinidogion, pan fyddant yn ateb cwestiwn drwy lythyr—fel sydd yn digwydd o bryd i'w gilydd—gyhoeddi llythyron fel rhan o gofnodion y Cynulliad, er mwyn iddynt fod ar gael i'r cyhoedd.

Y Llywydd: Diolch am y pwynt hwnnw. Gallaf gadarnhau ei bod yn bosibl cynnwys gohebiaeth yn ein cofnodion, neu ei chyhoeddi mewn man addas ar safle'r Cynulliad ar y we a thynnu sylw ati yn y fan honno.

David Davies: Further to that point of order, is this technique of hiding behind procedures and not answering questions one that the Minister picked up in Cuba?

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is not a point of order.

Rod Richards: Point of order. My interpretation of your answer to David Melding is that a Minister may ignore a tabled question. Is that correct?

The Presiding Officer: Of course it is not correct. A Minister is asked a question and replies to it. The content of that reply, whether a direct reply or not, is not a matter for me. My concern is with ensuring that questions are answered in order. I cannot dictate the content of answers. However, as has happened today, Members are free to express their deep dissatisfaction with the content of an answer. It is not a matter upon which I can pronounce in the Chamber, but it

Mae pob un ohonynt wedi cofnodi'r wybodaeth a geisiwyd yn fy nghwestiynau ysgrifenedig ac mae'r wybodaeth honno wedi'i chynnwys bellach yng Nghofnod y Trafodion. Dyna'r pwynt. Rhaid inni gael rhywfaint o sylwedd yma. Pan gyflwynwn gwestiynau ysgrifenedig, yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r atebion fod yn y cofnod ysgrifenedig. Ni allaf gynnwys fy ngohebiaeth yn y cofnod ysgrifenedig, ac felly credaf fod fy hawliau fel Aelod Cynulliad yn cael eu torri.

Dafydd Wigley: Further to that point of order, perhaps one solution would be to make provision for Ministers, when answering questions by means of a letter—as happens from time to time—to publish those letters as part of the Assembly record, so that they are available to the public.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you for that point. I can confirm that it is possible to include correspondence in our record, or publish it in an appropriate place on the Assembly website and draw attention to it there.

David Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, a yw'r dechneg hon o guddio y tu ôl i weithdrefnau a pheidio ag ateb cwestiynau'n un a ddysgodd y Gweinidog yng Nghiwba?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid pwynt o drefn yw hwnnw.

Rod Richards: Pwynt o drefn. Fy nehongliad i o'ch ateb i David Melding yw y gall Gweinidog anwybyddu cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd. A yw hynny'n gywir?

Y Llywydd: Wrth gwrs nad yw hynny'n gywir. Gofynnir cwestiwn i Weinidog ac mae'n ei ateb. Nid mater i mi yw cynnwys yr ateb hwnnw, boed yn un uniongyrchol neu beidio. Yr wyf fi'n ymwneud â sicrhau y caiff cwestiynau eu hateb mewn trefn. Ni allaf roi gorchymyn ynghylch cynnwys yr atebion. Fodd bynnag, fel a ddigwyddodd heddiw, mae'r Aelodau'n rhydd i fynegi anfodlonrwydd mawr ar gynnwys ateb. Nid yw'n fater y gallaf ddatgan barn yn ei gylch

is one that Ministers and the public, who follow our proceedings, will note.

Rod Richards: In that case, Llywydd, is the answer 'I will write to the Member' sufficient from your point of view, even though the Minister might then decide not to write to the Member? Is that allowed?

The Presiding Officer: Order. You are as well versed as I in the procedures of other parliamentary institutions. A parliamentary answer is a parliamentary answer.

Peter Law: Point of order. Have you received notification from the acting Deputy 'temporary Liberal acrobat' First Minister that she will now do the honourable thing and resign, given that she swung a vote by one on Tuesday and failed to support the Government?

The Presiding Officer: That is not a matter for me.

William Graham: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.8. Do you, Presiding Officer, or the Executive wish to join me in acknowledging Her Majesty's gracious intention to grant city status to a town in Wales? Do you agree that the people of Newport are particularly grateful for this singular distinction, which recognises the forward-looking attitude of the council and the people of Newport, particularly in view of the current economic difficulties that they face? [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I understand that no announcement has been made. Even if it had been, it is not a devolved matter. However, I appreciate William Graham's ingenuity in raising the issue in that form.

John Griffiths: Further to that non-point of order, I understand that the decision is due to be announced at 11 a.m., and we anticipate that Newport will have been successful. However, having taken part in campaigns in Newport in the past which were not successful, I offer my commiserations to

yn y Siambr, ond mae'n un y bydd y Gweinidogion a'r cyhoedd, sy'n dilyn ein trafodion, yn sylwi arno.

Rod Richards: Os felly, Lywydd, a yw'r ateb 'Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod' yn ddigonol o'ch safbwynt chi, er y gallai'r Gweinidog wedyn penderfynu peidio ag ysgrifennu at yr Aelod? A ganiateir hynny?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych mor hyddysg â minnau yng ngweithdrefnau sefydliadau seneddol eraill. Mae ateb seneddol yn ateb seneddol.

Peter Law: Pwynt o drefn. A ydych wedi derbyn hysbysiad oddi wrth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog 'acrobat Rhyddfrydol dros dro' gweithredol y bydd yn gwneud y peth cywir yn awr ac yn ymddiswyddo, o ystyried ei bod wedi troi pleidlais o un ddydd Mawrth ac wedi methu â chefnogi'r Llywodraeth?

Y Llywydd: Nid mater i mi yw hynny.

William Graham: Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf yn codi hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8. A ydych chi, Lywydd, neu'r Weithrediaeth yn dymuno ymuno â mi wrth gydnabod bwriad rhadlon Ei Mawrhydi i roi statws dinas i dref yng Nghymru? A ydych yn cytuno bod pobl Casnewydd yn arbennig o ddiolchgar am yr anrhydedd neilltuol hwn, sy'n cydnabod ymagwedd flaengar y cyngor a phobl Casnewydd, yn enwedig yng ngolwg yr anawsterau economaidd y maent yn eu hwynebu ar hyn o bryd? [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Deallaf nad oes cyhoeddiad wedi ei wneud. Hyd yn oed pe buasai, nid yw'n fater datganoledig. Er hynny, gwerthfawrogaf ddyfeisgarwch William Graham wrth godi'r mater ar y ffurf honno.

John Griffiths: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw nad yw'n bwynt o drefn, deallaf fod y penderfyniad i'w gyhoeddi am 11 a.m., ac yr ydym yn disgwyl y bydd Casnewydd wedi llwyddo. Fodd bynnag, a minnau wedi cymryd rhan mewn ymgyrchoedd aflwyddiannus yng Nghasnewydd yn y

Wrexham and mid Wales, which failed, and hope that they too will be successful in future.

Gareth Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yn hytrach na dathlu, a gawn ni ddatgan ein siom bod gogledd Cymru unwaith eto wedi cael ei hanwybyddu?

Y Llywydd: Fel y gwyddoch, Gareth, nid yw hwnnw'n bwynt o drefn.

Rod Richards: Further to that point of order, would it be in order for this Assembly to write officially to everyone who lives in north Wales expressing its sympathy for the fact that, yet again north Wales has been ignored? Indeed, your deputy has had yet another smack in the face from this administration, given that he is the Assembly Member for Wrexham. Would it be in order for you to write officially to those people?

The Presiding Officer: As you well know, Rod, this Assembly can only write by resolution. If you were to present a resolution to this Assembly and obtain support for it, then we might write. However, we can only do so on that basis.

10:15 a.m.

Peter Rogers: Point of order. I raise it under Standing Order Nos. 8.15 and 2.4. The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee is currently scrutinising the Assembly's handling of the foot and mouth disease outbreak. Yesterday, we set aside a session to examine the outbreak's impact on the rural economy. After initially accepting an invitation to appear before the Committee on Wednesday, the First Minister backtracked and offered as a replacement Mike German, an ordinary Liberal Democrat Member, to answer questions on the period when he was Minister for Economic Development. It was crucial that the First Minister was present, but he refused to attend. As a result, the Committee could not perform its scrutiny role properly. The

gorffennol, cynigiau fy nghydymdeimlad i Wrecsam a'r Canolbarth, a fethodd, a gobeithiaf y byddant hwythau'n llwyddiannus yn y dyfodol.

Gareth Jones: Further to that point of order, rather than celebrate, can we state our disappointment that, once again, north Wales has been ignored?

The Presiding Officer: As you know, Gareth, that is not a point of order.

Rod Richards: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, a fyddai mewn trefn i'r Cynulliad hwn ysgrifennu'n swyddogol at bawb sy'n byw yng ngogledd Cymru gan fynegi ei gydymdeimlad oherwydd bod gogledd Cymru wedi ei hanwybyddu eto byth? Yn wir, cafodd eich dirprwy ergyd gas arall eto gan y weinyddiaeth hon, o ystyried mai ef yw'r Aelod Cynulliad dros Wrecsam. A fyddai mewn trefn ichi ysgrifennu'n swyddogol at y bobl hynny?

Y Llywydd: Fel y gwyddoch yn dda, Rod, ni all y Cynulliad hwn ond ysgrifennu drwy benderfyniad. Pe byddech yn cyflwyno cynnig i'r Cynulliad hwn ac yn cael cefnogaeth iddo, yna fe allem ysgrifennu. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn ond gwneud hynny ar y sail honno.

Peter Rogers: Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf yn ei godi o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 8.15 a 2.4. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn archwilio dull y Cynulliad o drafod achos clwy'r traed a'r genau. Ddoe, neilltuasom sesiwn i archwilio effaith yr achos ar yr economi wledig. Ar ôl derbyn gwahoddiad yn gyntaf i ddod gerbron y Pwyllgor ddydd Mercher, ailfeddyliodd Prif Weinidog Cymru a chynnig yn ei le Mike German, Aelod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol cyffredin, i ateb cwestiynau ar y cyfnod pan oedd yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Yr oedd yn hollbwysig i Brif Weinidog Cymru fod yn bresennol, ond gwrthododd fod yn bresennol. O ganlyniad, ni allai'r Pwyllgor gyflawni ei rôl archwilio'n briodol. Yr

impression given was that the First Minister, as usual, was hiding at the first sign of any awkward questions being asked. Standing Order No. 2.4 states that the First Minister must appoint Cabinet Members who are responsible and accountable to the Assembly. A clear lack of accountability was demonstrated on this occasion. The First Minister effectively prevented the Committee from performing its scrutiny role properly, which seems to be in clear breach of Standing Orders. Has the Presiding Officer received a request from the First Minister to make a statement on this issue?

The Presiding Officer: No, I have not received a request from the First Minister on this or any other matter today. Attendance at Committee meetings is a matter for the Committee Chair in conducting the Committee's activities. That is governed by Standing Order No. 9.12, which states:

'Members who are not members of a subject committee may attend the committee's meetings.'

It does not say that they shall attend.

Elin Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, a gredwch ei bod yn briodol i gyn-Weinidog gael ei anfon i Bwyllgor i ateb cwestiynau ar ran y Cabinet? A gredwch mai'r Gweinidog presennol ddylai ateb cwestiynau Pwyllgor ar unrhyw fater, nid cyn-Weinidog?

Y Llywydd: Mater i'r Llywodraeth yw hwnnw. Mater i'r Cabinet yw penderfynu pa Weinidog y mae am ei anfon i ble, cyhyd ag y bod presenoldeb y person hwnnw o fewn Rheolau Sefydlog. Mae beth fyddai'n digwydd pe byddai Gweinidog sy'n aelod o Bwyllgor yn dewis bod yn absennol am gyfnod, heb reswm digonol, yn gwestiwn cyfansoddiadol diddorol. Byddai hynny yn fater i mi. Fodd bynnag, nid yw presenoldeb mewn pwyllgor Aelod nad yw'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw yn fater uniongyrchol i mi o dan Reolau Sefydlog. Mater o ddewis ydyw fel y nodais wrth ddyfynu'r Rheolau Sefydlog.

argraff a roddwyd oedd bod Prif Weinidog Cymru, yn ôl yr arfer, yn cuddio ar yr awgrym cyntaf y byddai unrhyw gwestiynau anodd yn cael eu gofyn. Noda Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 fod yn rhaid i Brif Weinidog Cymru benodi Aelodau Cabinet sy'n gyfrifol ac yn atebol i'r Cynulliad. Dangoswyd diffyg atebolrwydd pendant y tro hwn. I bob pwrpas, ataliodd Prif Weinidog Cymru'r Pwyllgor rhag cyflawni ei rôl archwilio'n briodol, sy'n ymddangos yn doriad amlwg ar y Rheolau Sefydlog. A yw'r Llywydd wedi cael cais gan Brif Weinidog Cymru i wneud datganiad ar y mater hwn?

Y Llywydd: Nac ydwyf, nid wyf wedi cael cais gan Brif Weinidog Cymru ar y mater hwn na'r un arall heddiw. Mae presenoldeb mewn cyfarfodydd Pwyllgor yn fater i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor wrth gynnal gweithgareddau'r Pwyllgor. Llywodraethir hynny gan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 9.12, sy'n datgan:

'Gall aelodau nad ydynt yn aelodau o bwyllgor pwnc fynychu cyfarfodydd y pwyllgor.'

Ni ddywed fod yn rhaid iddynt eu mynychu.

Elin Jones: Further to that point of order, do you believe that it is appropriate for a former Minister to be sent to a Committee to answer questions on the Cabinet's behalf? Do you believe that the incumbent Minister should answer Committee questions on any issue, rather than a former Minister?

The Presiding Officer: That is a matter for the Government. It is for the Cabinet to decide which Minister to send where, provided that the attendance of that person is in accordance with Standing Orders. What would happen if a Minister who is a Committee member chose not to be present for period, without adequate reason, is an interesting constitutional question. That would be a matter for me. However, the presence in a Committee of a Member who is not a member of the that Committee is not directly an issue for me under Standing Orders. It is a matter of choice, as I noted in quoting from Standing Orders.

Owen John Thomas: Pwynt o drefn. Ddydd Mawrth, bu i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad addo y byddai cyfle yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ddoe, i gwestiynau ar gyllido cerddorfa siambr Cymru gael eu hateb. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn bresennol yn y cyfarfod ac ni chawsom ateb i'r cwestiynau hyn. Galwaf felly ar y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad i drefnu amser yr wythnos nesaf er mwyn i'r cwestiynau pwysig hyn gael eu hateb.

Y Llywydd: Mae cyfle i Aelodau ofyn cwestiynau yn ystod pob sesiwn cwestiynau. Yr wyf yn cymryd y bydd Owen John yn codi'r cwestiwn hwnnw bob tro y bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg neu unrhyw Weinidog priodol arall yn ateb cwestiynau. Os yw'n ddigon ffodus i ddal fy llygad, a bod amser, caiff ofyn ei gwestiwn.

Owen John Thomas: Daeth cwestiynau i ben cyn i mi gael y cyfle hwnnw.

Dafydd Wigley: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr oeddwn yn y Pwyllgor ddoe pan godwyd y mater hwn. Mae anhawster yn codi, oherwydd yn ystod cwestiynau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, i'r Gweinidog sy'n ateb cwestiynau yn unig y gallwch ofyn cwestiwn. Os bydd y Gweinidog hwnnw yn dweud mai mater ar gyfer Gweinidog arall ydyw, ni chawn ateb yn y Siambr. Gall y gwrthwyneb ddigwydd hefyd, fel a ddigwyddodd yn y Pwyllgor ddoe, sy'n golygu na chawn ateb boddhaol ar fater o bwys cyhoeddus.

Y Llywydd: Yr ydych oll yn Aelodau profiadol o'r gwrthbleidiau. Yr wyf yn sicr bod modd i chi ganfod amser i ofyn eich cwestiynau. Ar adeg cwestiynau, yr wyf yn ymestyn yr amser ar gyfer un cwestiwn o leiaf ym mhob sesiwn hyd at chwe munud. Os yw'n amlwg i mi fod nifer o Aelodau am godi cwestiynau atodol, gallaf, fel y gwelaf yn ddoeth, ymestyn amser y cwestiwn hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer y

Owen John Thomas: Point of order. On Tuesday, the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business promised that there would be an opportunity in yesterday's Culture Committee meeting for questions on the funding of a chamber orchestra in Wales to be answered. However, the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities was not present at the meeting and we did not get answers to these questions. I therefore call on the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business to allocate time next week so that these important questions are answered.

The Presiding Officer: Members have the opportunity to ask questions during each question session. I presume that Owen John will raise that question every time that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language or any other appropriate Minister is answering questions. If he is fortunate enough to catch my eye, and there is time, he may ask his question.

Owen John Thomas: Questions came to an end before I had that opportunity.

Dafydd Wigley: Further to that point of order. I was in the Committee yesterday when this issue was raised. A difficulty arises, because during questions in Plenary, you can only ask a question of the Minister who is answering questions. If that Minister says that it is a matter for another Minister, we do not receive an answer in the Chamber. The reverse can also be true, as happened in Committee yesterday, which means that we do not get an adequate answer on an issue of public importance.

The Presiding Officer: You are all experienced opposition Members. I am sure that you can find time to ask your questions. During question time, I allow an extension of up to six minutes for at least one question in every session. If it is clear to me that many Members wish to raise supplementary questions, I can allow additional time for that question at my discretion. However, the number of supplementary questions you wish

cwestiynau atodol yr ydych am eu gofyn, a faint o rybudd yr ydych yn ei roi imi, yn eich dwylo chi.

Owen John Thomas: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr oeddwn am ofyn cwestiwn 9 i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau heddiw. Fodd bynnag, ni chyrrhaeddwn y cwestiwn hwnnw, felly ni ddeallaf eich pwynt. Pa gyfle oedd gennyf i ofyn cwestiwn iddi?

Y Llywydd: Gallwch ofyn cwestiwn atodol ar y cwestiynau a gyflwynwyd sydd gerbron. Galwaf am gwestiynau mewn trefn, ac mae nifer y cwestiynau a ofynnir yn dibynnu ar faint o amser a dreulir ar y cwestiynau eraill. Os ydych am gyrraedd cwestiwn 9, gallwch ofyn llai o gwestiynau atodol ar y cwestiynau blaenorol. Gallwch hefyd ddefnyddio ambell i dric arall.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gweldig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones): Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, dywedais ddydd Mawrth y byddai datganiad i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Digwyddodd hynny. Deallaf gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg y bu cwestiynau ar hyn ac iddynt barhau am awr a 10 munud. Felly gwnaeth Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor sicrhau chwarae teg a rhoddodd ddigon o gyfle i'r aelodau ofyn cwestiynau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, cadarnhaf y bu inni drafod y mater hwn am dros awr. Fodd bynnag, mae cyfrifoldeb arnaf i ddatgan, ar ran yr aelodau, mai'r teimlad cyffredinol oedd y gofynnwyd cwestiynau sylweddol nad oedd modd eu trafod, na chael atebion boddhaol iddynt, oherwydd bod angen eu cyfeirio at y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, nad oedd yn bresennol. Yr oedd mwyafrif yr aelodau yn teimlo na chawsant gyfle i ofyn, a chael atebion i'r cwestiynau yr oeddent am eu codi.

Glyn Davies: Further to this point of order, I said in Committee, and will say again, that transferring this matter to the Committee, where it could not be dealt with, was a strategic move by the Government to avoid dealing with the important issue of the

to ask, and the amount of notice you give me, is in your hands.

Owen John Thomas: Further to that point of order, I was to ask question 9 to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities today. However, we did not reach that question, so I do not understand your point. What opportunity did I have to ask her a question?

The Presiding Officer: You can ask a supplementary question on the tabled questions before us. I call the questions in order, and the number of questions asked depends on how much time we spend on the other questions. If you want to reach question 9, you could ask fewer supplementary questions on the previous questions. There are also other tricks you can employ.

The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones): Further to that point of order, I said on Tuesday that a statement would be made to the Culture Committee. That happened. I understand from the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language that questions were asked on this and that they went on for an hour and 10 minutes. Therefore, the Chair of the Committee ensured fair play and gave members ample opportunity to ask questions.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Further to that point of order, I can confirm that we discussed this matter for over an hour. However, it is my duty to state, on behalf of the members, that it was generally felt that significant questions could not be discussed, nor answered satisfactorily, because they needed to be addressed to the Minister for Finance, who was not present. The majority of members felt that they had not had the opportunity to ask, or receive answers to, the questions they wished to raise.

Glyn Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, fe'i dywedais yn y Pwyllgor, ac fe'i dywedaf eto, bod trosglwyddo'r mater hwn i'r Pwyllgor, lle na ellid delio ag ef, yn gam strategol gan y Llywodraeth i osgoi delio â mater pwysig y datganiad a wnaethpwyd ar

statement made on 22 November in this Chamber. It was a disgraceful attempt to avoid dealing with this important issue.

Delyth Evans: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor ac nid oedd unfrydedd ar y mater hwn. Atebodd y Gweinidog yn llawn y cwestiynau a ofynnwyd iddi, a rhoddodd ymrwymiad i roi atebion ysgrifenedig i gwestiynau ar ddyddiadau ac ati na allai ateb ar y pryd. Yr oedd aelodau Llafur y Pwyllgor, felly, yn fodlon â sut y deliwyd â'r mater. Problem yr wrthblaid yw nad yw'n hoffi'r atebion. Atebwyd y cwestiynau yn llawn, a chredaf y deliwyd â'r mater yn effeithiol.

Owen John Thomas *a gododd—*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chaniatâf i drafodaethau Pwyllgor barhau yn y Siambr drwy bwyntiau o drefn. Mae'r pwyntiau wedi cael eu gwneud, mae Aelodau wedi mynegi eu hanfodlonrwydd, ac mae safbwyntiau amrwyiol y Pwyllgor wedi cael eu cyfleu yn y Siambr. Caeaf bwyntiau o drefn yn awr, neu ni allwn gwblhau ein busnes arall.

Rod Richards: Point of order.

The Presiding Officer: Is this a new point of order?

Rod Richards: It is a new point of order. A moment ago you advised me to table a resolution if I wanted to proceed with a matter. As you know, I am in a minority of one—we are alone here. How would I go about that?

The Presiding Officer: There are various parliamentary means open to you. For example, you could table a written statement of opinion and seek signatures, or you could table a no named day motion and seek support. These are the traditional parliamentary ways of operating, which are equally open to minorities and majorities.

Rod Richards: Those are not resolutions, Llywydd.

22 Tachwedd yn y Siambr hon. Yr oedd yn ymgais warthus i osgoi delio â'r mater pwysig hwn.

Delyth Evans: Further to that point of order, I am a member of the Committee, and there was not unanimity on this issue. The Minister answered the questions put to her fully, and gave a commitment to provide written answers to questions on dates and so on that she could not answer at the time. The Labour members of the Committee, therefore, were satisfied with how the matter was dealt with. The opposition's problem is that it does not like the answers. The questions were answered fully, and I believe that the matter was dealt with effectively.

Owen John Thomas *rose—*

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will not allow Committee discussions to continue in the Chamber via points of order. The points have been made, Members have expressed their dissatisfaction, and the Committee's diverse opinions have been expressed in the Chamber. I will bring points of order to a close now, or we will not be able to get on with our other business.

Rod Richards: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Llywydd: Ai pwynt o drefn newydd yw hwn?

Rod Richards: Pwynt o drefn newydd ydyw. Funud yn ôl fe'm cyngorasoch fi i gyflwyno cynnig os oeddwn yn dymuno mynd ymlaen â mater. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf mewn lleiafrif o un—yr ydym ar ein pen ein hunain yma. Sut yr awn ynghylch hynny?

Y Llywydd: Mae amryw o ddulliau seneddol ar gael i chi. Er enghraifft, gallech gyflwyno datganiad o farn ysgrifenedig a cheisio llofnodion, neu gallech gyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod a cheisio cefnogaeth. Dyma'r dulliau gweithredu seneddol traddodiadol, sydd ar gael i leiafrifoedd a mwyafrifoedd i'r un graddau.

Rod Richards: Nid penderfyniadau yw'r rheini, Lywydd.

The Presiding Officer: They become resolutions when they are debated in the Assembly and voted on. You may find yourself in a minority on such a vote, but the procedures are open to all of us.

Ron Davies: Further to that point of order, far be it from me to leap to the defence of a persecuted species, but an important principle emerges from your exchange with Rod Richards. Are you suggesting that if he, as a Member of the National Assembly, were to table a motion for debate, you would ensure that time was available for that motion to be debated?

The Presiding Officer: I am unable to ensure that time is available. That is a matter for the Business Committee. However, the Business Committee must consider the position of all Assembly Members, including independent Members.

Rod Richards: Further to that point of order, when will I have my opposition day, Llywydd?

The Presiding Officer: You know full well that the allocation of such debates depends on numbers.

Y Llywydd: Fe ddeuant yn benderfyniadau pan fo dadl a phleidlais arnynt yn y Cynulliad. Gallech weld eich bod mewn lleiafrif mewn pleidlais o'r fath, ond mae'r gweithdrefnau ar gael i bob un ohonom.

Ron Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, nid fy lle i yw codi i amddiffyn rhywogaeth dan erlidigaeth, ond mae egwyddor bwysig yn codi o'r geiriau rhyngoch a Rod Richards. A ydych yn awgrymu, pe byddai ef, fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn cyflwyno cynnig ar gyfer dadl, y byddech yn sicrhau bod amser ar gael i gynnal dadl ar y cynnig hwnnw?

Y Llywydd: Ni allaf sicrhau bod amser ar gael. Mae hynny'n fater i'r Pwyllgor Busnes. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ystyried sefyllfa pob Aelod Cynulliad, gan gynnwys Aelodau annibynnol.

Rod Richards: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, pa bryd y caf fy niwrnod gwrthblaid, Lywydd?

Y Llywydd: Fe wyddoch o'r gorau bod dyraniad dadleuon o'r fath yn dibynnu ar niferoedd.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10.24 a.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 10.24 a.m.*

Adroddiad Terfynol yr Adolygiad i Ddyrannu Adnoddau'r GIG The Final NHS Resource Allocations Review Report

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendments 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Before I call the Minister for Health and Social Services to propose the motion, I inform you that there is a long list of speakers for this and the following debate today. Members who have already spoken at length this morning will find it harder to catch my eye. I appeal for brief contributions so that as many Members as possible can participate, but I cannot give guarantees at this stage.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Cyn imi alw ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gynnig y cynnig, rhoddaf wybod i chi fod rhestr hir o siaradwyr ar gyfer y ddadl hon a'r un sy'n ei dilyn heddiw. Bydd yr Aelodau sydd eisoes wedi siarad yn hir y bore yma yn ei chael yn anodd dal fy llygad. Apeliaf am gyfraniadau byr fel y gall cynifer ag y bo modd o'r Aelodau gymryd rhan, ond ni allaf roi sicrwydd ar hyn o bryd.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. *welcomes Professor Townsend's report on targeting poor health in Wales;*

2. *endorses the principles set out in it for addressing health inequalities in Wales;*

3. *recognises that implementation will be based upon differential distribution of growth, in which all parts of Wales will continue to receive an annual increase in allocation, covering both NHS cost inflation and an allowance for funding of agreed priorities and service development;*

4. *reaffirms the ongoing part which the health inequalities fund will play in addressing areas of health deprivation in all parts of Wales;*

5. *looks forward to the start of the implementation process in April 2003;*

6. *notes the further work required to refine the formula prior to implementation including general medical services, urban and rural issues. (NDM974)*

Matching NHS spending to the patterns of health need in our communities is a challenge that has faced—and eluded—many administrations since the foundation of the NHS some 50 years ago. In the National Assembly for Wales's first year, the Health and Social Services Committee agreed to set up a review of NHS resource allocations in Wales. The review's objective was to ensure more equitable access to health services for Wales's population in accordance with its health needs. Today, I report on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the review and our proposals for the way forward. I will not support any of the opposition parties' amendments as they either re-state existing intentions or negate them.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. *yn croesawu adroddiad yr Athro Townsend ar dargeddu iechyd gwael yng Nghymru;*

2. *yn cymeradwyo'r egwyddorion a nodir yn yr adroddiad ar gyfer mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru;*

3. *yn cydnabod y bydd y broses o'i roi ar waith yn dibynnu ar lefel twf mewn gwahanol ardaloedd, lle bydd pob rhan o Gymru yn parhau i weld cynnydd yn y swm a ddyrennir, er mwyn cyllido cynnydd yng nghostau'r GIG a lwfans i ariannu'r blaenoriaethau y cytunwyd arnynt a datblygu gwasanaethau;*

4. *yn ailddatgan pwysigrwydd cyfraniad parhaus y gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd wrth fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd iechyd ym mhob rhan o Gymru;*

5. *yn edrych ymlaen at ddechrau'r broses weithredu ym mis Ebrill 2003;*

6. *yn nodi'r gwaith ychwanegol sydd angen ei wneud er mwyn mireinio'r fformwla cyn ei rhoi ar waith gan gynnwys gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol, a materion gwledig a threfol. (NDM974)*

Mae cydweddu gwariant y GIG â'r patrymau anghenion iechyd yn ein cymunedau yn her sydd wedi wynebu—ac osgoi—llawer o weinyddiaethau ers sefydlu'r GIG tua 50 mlynedd yn ôl. Ym mlwyddyn gyntaf Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, cytunodd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i sefydlu adolygiad o ddyraniadau adnoddau'r GIG yng Nghymru. Amcan yr adolygiad oedd sicrhau mynediad tecach i wasanaethau iechyd i bobl Cymru yn unol â'i hanghenion iechyd. Heddiw, yr wyf yn adrodd ar ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r adolygiad a'n cynigion ar gyfer y ffordd ymlaen. Ni wnafr gefnogi'r un o welliannau pleidiau'r wrthblaid gan eu bod un ai'n ailddatgan y bwriadau presennol neu'n eu nacáu.

The complexities involved in addressing health inequalities were recognised from the outset. We were fortunate that Professor Peter Townsend, an international authority on poverty and inequality, agreed to chair the national steering group, whose membership consisted of our health and social services spokespersons and senior NHS representatives from across Wales. We wanted an authoritative, speedily conducted and wide-ranging review. The research team, headed by Dr David Gordon of the University of Bristol, produced an independent report, which considered issues of poor health and inequalities and set out proposals for a new resource allocation formula that is unique to Wales. Professor Townsend's report from the national steering group was considered by the Health and Social Services Committee last July. Together with other supplementary work, this formed the basis of a seven-week consultation.

Professor Townsend's report, 'Targeting Poor Health: Next Steps', recommended a three-part approach. The first part sets out proposals to develop a dual strategy of actions, inside and outside the NHS, to halt health inequalities by working across the Assembly to agree strategies and policies to reduce deprivation in our poorest communities, where poor health prevails. A number of initiatives such as Communities First are in train and will help to progress this. We have been closely influenced by evidence such as the Black report, 'Inequalities in Health', published in 1980. In 1990, the Chief Medical Officer for England, Sir Donald Acheson, said that the issue is quite clear in health terms: that there is a link, there has been a link, and that he suspects that there will continue to be a link between deprivation and ill-health. The clearest links with poor health to which he draws attention are low income, unhealthy behaviour, poor housing, and environmental amenities.

The second key part of the work produced by Professor Townsend and his team

Yr oedd yr anawsterau sydd ynglŷn ag ymdrin ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd wedi'u cydnabod o'r dechrau. Yr oeddem yn ffodus bod yr Athro Peter Townsend, sy'n awdurdod rhyngwladol ar dlodi ac anghydraddoldeb, wedi cytuno i gadeirio'r grŵp llywio cenedlaethol, yr oedd ei aelodaeth yn cynnwys ein llefarwyr ar iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a chynrychiolwyr uwch o'r GIG ledled Cymru. Yr oeddem am gael adolygiad awdurdodol, cyflym ac eang. Cynhyrchwyd adroddiad annibynnol gan y tîm ymchwil, o dan arweiniad Dr David Gordon o Brifysgol Bryste, a roddodd ystyriaeth i faterion iechyd gwael ac anghydraddoldebau ac a nododd gynigion ar gyfer fformiwla dyrannu adnoddau newydd sy'n unigryw i Gymru. Rhoddwyd ystyriaeth i adroddiad yr Athro Townsend o'r grŵp llywio cenedlaethol gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fis Gorffennaf diwethaf. Yr oedd hyn, ynghyd â gwaith atodol arall, yn sylfaen i ymgynghoriad saith wythnos o hyd.

Yr oedd adroddiad yr Athro Townsend, 'Targedu Afiechyd: Y Camau Nesaf', yn argymhell dull gweithredu tair rhan. Mae'r rhan gyntaf yn nodi cynigion i ddatblygu strategaeth ddeuol o gamau, y tu allan a'r tu mewn i'r GIG, i atal anghydraddoldebau iechyd drwy weithio ar draws y Cynulliad i gytuno ar strategaethau a pholisïau i leihau amddifadedd yn ein cymunedau tlotaf, lle y mae iechyd gwael yn bodoli. Mae nifer o fentrau, fel Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf ar waith a byddant yn helpu i hyrwyddo hyn. Mae tystiolaeth fel adroddiad Black, 'Inequalities in Health', a gyhoeddwyd yn 1980, wedi dylanwadu'n fawr arnom. Yn 1990, dywedodd Prif Swyddog Meddygol Lloegr, Syr Donald Acheson, fod y mater yn eithaf pendant yng nghyd-destun iechyd: bod cysylltiad yn bod, ac wedi bod, a'i fod yn amau y bydd cysylltiad yn parhau rhwng amddifadedd ac afiechyd. Y cysylltiadau amlycaf ag iechyd gwael y mae'n tynnu sylw atynt yw incwm isel, ymddygiad afiach, tai gwael, a mwynderau amgylcheddol.

Yr oedd ail ran allweddol y gwaith a gynhyrchwyd gan yr Athro Townsend a'i

emphasised the critical importance of improving information on the distribution of NHS expenditure to ensure that resources are deployed on those with the poorest health.

The third part involves proposals for a new resource allocation approach based on directly measuring our population's health needs at local health ward level. This approach is innovative and uses data that is unique to Wales, which is from the Welsh health survey.

To address the wide range of issues raised by this direct method of measuring health need, the Office of National Statistics was asked to validate the use of Welsh health survey for resource allocation purposes. Its conclusions provided sufficient assurance on the use of the Welsh health survey for those purposes. The Welsh Assembly Government intends to undertake another Welsh health survey in 2003. We will take advantage of that and ensure that we improve on the data available for the allocation of NHS resources as a result. We know that the cost of treatment is affected by factors that any formula must take into account. The new resource allocation formula has been designed to include an age-weighting adjustment to compensate areas with more than the average number of older people for the additional cost of treatment. It also includes an adjustment to reflect the unavoidable travel-intensive additional costs of community services in rural areas. In the coming months, further refinement work will be undertaken on the prescribing and general medical services elements of the formula, along with further work on unavoidable additional costs associated with rural and urban environments. On urban factors, the work proposed covers ethnic minorities, HIV/AIDS, haemophilia, forensic psychiatry and homelessness. I am prepared, Jocelyn, to give an undertaking to the Assembly that a further report on the amended formula will be made as work is completed.

Bringing this work to fruition remains a substantial challenge. I am delighted that

dîm yn pwysleisio ei bod yn hollbwysig gwella'r wybodaeth ar ddyrannu gwariant y GIG i sicrhau y caiff yr adnoddau eu cyfeirio at y rhai gwaelaf eu hiechyd.

Mae'r drydedd ran yn ymwneud â chynigion ar gyfer dull newydd o ddyrannu adnoddau sy'n seiliedig ar fesur anghenion iechyd ein poblogaeth yn uniongyrchol ar lefel y ward iechyd leol. Mae'r dull hwn yn arloesol ac mae'n defnyddio data sy'n unigryw i Gymru, a ddeilliodd o arolwg iechyd Cymru.

Er mwyn ymdrin â'r amrediad eang o faterion a godir gan y dull uniongyrchol hwn o fesur anghenion iechyd, gofynnwyd i'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol ddilysu'r defnydd o arolwg iechyd Cymru at ddibenion dyrannu adnoddau. Yr oedd ei chasgliadau'n rhoi digon o sicrwydd ar y defnydd o arolwg iechyd Cymru i'r dibenion hynny. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu cynnal arolwg arall o iechyd Cymru yn 2003. Byddwn yn manteisio ar hynny ac yn sicrhau gwelliant yn y data sydd ar gael ar gyfer dyrannu adnoddau'r GIG o ganlyniad. Gwyddom fod cost triniaeth yn cael ei heffeithio gan ffactorau y mae'n rhaid i unrhyw fformiwla eu cymryd i ystyriaeth. Cynlluniwyd y fformiwla dyrannu adnoddau newydd i gynnwys addasiad pwysoliad oedran i ddigolledu ardaloedd sydd â nifer uwch na'r cyfartaledd o bobl hŷn am gost ychwanegol y triniaethau. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys addasiad i adlewyrchu'r costau ychwanegol anochel oherwydd teithio i'r gwasanaethau cymunedol mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Yn y misoedd nesaf, gwneir rhagor o waith mireinio ar yr elfennau rhagnodi a gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol sydd yn y fformiwla, ynghyd â gwaith pellach ar y costau ychwanegol anochel sy'n gysylltiedig ag amgylcheddau gwledig a threfol. Ynghylch y ffactorau trefol, mae'r gwaith arfaethedig yn ymdrin â lleiafrifoedd ethnig, HIV/AIDS, haemoffilia, seiciatreg ffrensig a digartrefedd. Yr wyf yn barod, Jocelyn, i roi addewid i'r Cynulliad y bydd adroddiad pellach ar y fformiwla ddiwygiedig wrth gwblhau'r gwaith.

Mae dod â'r gwaith hwn i'w derfyn yn gryn her o hyd. Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod yr Athro

Professor Peter Townsend has agreed to chair a standing group that will oversee the formula's development and ensure progress on its refinement work. That work will begin immediately. Our deadlines for this work are ambitious precisely because it is vital that health inequalities are addressed as quickly as possible. Given that urgency, I agree with Professor Townsend's recommendations, endorsed by the majority of the Health and Social Services Committee in January, that the new direct resource allocations formula be introduced from April 2003-04. I will not support the Conservatives' amendment 3, which would delay its implementation. Together with the new financial baselines, implementation from April 2003 would allow the new local health boards to begin to deploy their resources to tackle health inequalities.

I state clearly that all areas will not receive less than its current level of resources, and that they will receive agreed cost inflation and an allowance for funding and agreed priorities and development, for example, initiatives such as improving the treatment of coronary heart disease and cancer.

The change will, therefore, be achieved as rapidly as possible, consistent with an acceptable level of growth for all, which the Assembly considers necessary to ensure a planned transition to the new shares. The national steering group expects the formula to be refined year on year. Although the group recommended implementation in three years—five years at the most—the Government will take a decision in the first year about the pace of redistribution and will need to take a similar decision in succeeding years. Even in three years' time, the ongoing need to address health inequalities will be urgent. I intend to continue the operation of the health inequalities fund to stimulate and support new local action to address disparities and inequities in access to services. A total of £14 million has already been earmarked over three years and 67 projects geared to tackling heart disease are

Peter Townsend wedi cytuno i fod yn gadeirydd ar grŵp sefydlog a fydd yn arolygu'r gwaith o ddatblygu'r fformiwla ac yn sicrhau cynnydd ar ei mireinio. Bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n dechrau ar unwaith. Mae ein dyddiadau terfyn ar gyfer y gwaith hwn yn uchelgeisiol am ei bod yn hollbwysig ymdrin â'r anghydraddoldebau iechyd mor gyflym â phosibl. Oherwydd y brys hwnnw, cytunaf ag argymhellion yr Athro Townsend, a gymeradwywyd gan y mwyafrif o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn Ionawr, y dylid cyflwyno'r fformiwla dyrannu adnoddau uniongyrchol newydd o Ebrill 2003-04. Ni fyddaf yn cefnogi gwelliant 3 y Ceidwadwyr, a fyddai'n gohirio ei gweithredu. Gyda'r llinellau sylfaenol ariannol newydd, byddai ei gweithredu o Ebrill 2003 yn caniatáu i'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd ddechrau cyfeirio eu hadnoddau i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd.

Dywedaf yn glir na fydd yr un ardal yn cael llai na'r adnoddau a dderbynia ar hyn o bryd, ac y bydd pob un yn cael swm a gytunir ar gyfer cynnydd mewn costau a lwfans ar gyfer ariannu a blaenoriaethau cytunedig a datblygu, er enghraifft, mentrau fel gwella triniaethau canser a chlefyd coronaidd y galon.

Felly, cyflawnir y newid mor gyflym â phosibl, i gyd-fynd â graddfa dwf sy'n dderbyniol gan bawb, a ystyrir yn angenrheidiol gan y Cynulliad i sicrhau'r newid cynlluniedig i'r cyfrannau newydd. Mae'r grŵp llywio cenedlaethol yn disgwyl y caiff y fformiwla ei mireinio o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Er bod y grŵp yn argymhell ei gweithredu ymhen tair blynedd—pum mlynedd ar y mwyaf—bydd y Llywodraeth yn penderfynu yn y flwyddyn gyntaf ynghylch cyflymder yr aiddosbarthu a bydd yn rhaid iddi wneud penderfyniad tebyg yn y blynyddoedd dilynol. Hyd yn oed ymhen tair blynedd, bydd angen parhaus i ymdrin ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd ar frys. Bwriadaf barhau i weithredu'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd i ysgogi a chefnogi camau newydd lleol i ymdrin ag anghyfartaleddau ac anghydraddoldebau yn y mynediad i wasanaethau. Mae cyfanswm o

taking place in our poorest communities as a result of that fund.

£14 miliwn wedi'i glustnodi eisoes dros dair blynedd ac, o ganlyniad i'r gronfa honno, mae 67 o brosiectau ar waith yn ein cymunedau tlotaf i fynd i'r afael â chlefyd y galon.

Today represents a major milestone in this administration's determination and, I believe, the Assembly's determination to create a fairer Wales in which we make our money match the needs of all our people. Dr Hall's report to the Committee yesterday highlights the unacceptable range and levels of inequality in Wales, which affects life expectancy, morbidity and quality of life. We must address those. We are able to do that because of the unprecedented levels of growth in health service spending that this Government secured, which will mean that we can improve on what is provided to those who are most in need, while protecting and developing the NHS in Wales as a whole.

Mae heddiw'n garreg filltir o bwys ym mhenderfyniad y weinyddiaeth hon ac, fe gredaf, penderfyniad y Cynulliad i greu Cymru decach lle'r ydym yn peri i'n harian gydweddu ag anghenion pawb. Mae adroddiad Dr Hall i'r Pwyllgor ddoe yn tynnu sylw at amrediad a lefel annerbyniol yr anghydraddoldebau yng Nghymru, sy'n effeithio ar ddisgwyliad einioes, ariachusurwydd ac ansawdd bywyd. Rhaid inni ymdrin â'r rheini. Gallwn wneud hynny oherwydd y twf digyffelyb yn y gwariant ar y gwasanaeth iechyd a sicrhaodd y Llywodraeth hon, a fydd yn golygu y gallwn wella'r hyn a ddarperir i'r rhai mwyaf anghenus tra'n diogelu a datblygu'r GIG yng Nghymru yn ei gyfanrwydd.

David Melding: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: in point 1 replace 'welcomes' with 'notes'.

David Melding: Cynigiau y gwellianau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 1 rhoi 'nodi' yn lle 'croesawu'.

I propose amendment 2. Delete points 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 and replace with:

Cynigiau welliant 2. Dileu pwyntiau 2, 3, 4, 5 a 6 a rhoi yn eu lle:

2. further notes that the Townsend report was commissioned before the administration abruptly decided to abolish health authorities;

2. yn nodi ymhellach y comisiynwyd adroddiad Townsend cyn i'r weinyddiaeth benderfynu'n ddisymwth y dylid cael gwared ar yr awdurdodau iechyd;

3. recognises that the resource reallocation recommendations of the Townsend report have not yet been analysed at local health board level;

3. yn cydnabod nad yw'r argymhellion ynghylch ailddyrrannu adnoddau yn adroddiad Townsend wedi'u dadansoddi eto ar lefel y byrddau iechyd lleol;

4. believes that the new local health boards should be allowed to bed down before the introduction of a new resource allocation formula is considered;

4. yn credu y dylid caniatáu i'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd ymsefydlu cyn ystyried cyflwyno fformiwla newydd i ddyrrannu adnoddau;

5. welcomes those recommendations of the Townsend report that deal with matters other than the resource allocation formula, and calls for their prompt implementation;

5. yn croesawu'r argymhellion hynny yn adroddiad Townsend sy'n trafod materion ac eithrio'r fformiwla dyrannu adnoddau, ac yn galw am eu rhoi ar waith ar unwaith;

6. in the absence of changes to the resource allocation formula, recognises the need to

6. yn cydnabod y bydd angen rhoi mwy o arian i'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd

increase the level of funding for the health inequalities fund.

I start by saying how much I welcome the Townsend report. It contains much that is welcome. It is a thorough document and an excellent study of many of the health issues affecting us. It goes far beyond the sometimes rather dry question of how you allocate resources. It takes a holistic approach and emphasises the socio-economic factors that influence health. I reiterate that the Welsh Conservative group accepts that those factors must be considered seriously as they impact on every decision that we make on health policy.

This approach is sometimes called, and it is so called by Peter Townsend, the dual approach. It focuses not just on how much is allocated and the method by which it is allocated, but concentrates on the wider factors that influence health. The socio-economic factors are quite well known, but poor housing, lack of jobs, and economic deprivation have a powerful effect on people's lives. There is also the wider preventative agenda and health promotion, of which we must not lose sight when we consider issues such as resource allocation.

10:35 a.m.

Peter Law: Do not take this personally, David, but do you accept that the Conservative amendments are the usual political dross that we have come to expect from your party? That is probably why there is only one other Conservative Member in the Chamber at present. The Conservative Party is the author of much of the difficulties facing poor and deprived people in terms of health services. Would it not be far better for you to withdraw these amendments and to support the motion that will mean reallocating money to improve people's lives?

David Melding: That was a typical contribution from Peter Law. Our amendments are measured and considered. We have not dismissed the Townsend report.

oni newidir y fformiwla dyrannu adnoddau.

Dechreuaf drwy ddweud cymaint yr wyf yn croesawu adroddiad Townsend. Mae'n cynnwys llawer sydd i'w groesawu. Mae'n ddogfen drylwyr ac yn astudiaeth ragorol o lawer o'r materion iechyd sy'n effeithio arnom. Mae'n mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i'r cwestiwn braidd yn sych, ar brydiau, o sut y dyrannwch adnoddau. Mae ei hymagwedd yn un gyfannol ac mae'n pwysleisio'r ffactorau cymdeithasol-economaidd sy'n dylanwadu ar iechyd. Dywedaf eto fod grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n derbyn bod yn rhaid ystyried y materion hynny o ddifrif am eu bod yn effeithio ar bob penderfyniad a wnawn ar bolisi iechyd.

Gelwir y dull hwn weithiau, a dyna'r enw y mae Peter Townsend yn ei roi arno, yn ddull deuol. Mae'n canolbwyntio nid yn unig ar faint a ddyrennir a'r dull o'i ddyrannu, ond yn canolbwyntio ar y ffactorau ehangach sy'n dylanwadu ar iechyd. Mae'r ffactorau cymdeithasol-economaidd yn eithaf cyfarwydd, ond mae tai gwael, prinder swyddi ac amddifadedd economaidd yn cael effaith bwerus ar fywydau pobl. Ceir hefyd yr agenda ataliol ehangach a hybu iechyd, na ddylem golli golwg arnynt wrth ystyried materion fel dyrannu adnoddau.

Peter Law: Peidiwch â chymryd hyn yn bersonol, David, ond a ydych yn derbyn mai'r sothach gwleidyddol arferol yr ydym wedi dod i'w disgwyl oddi wrth eich plaid yw gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr? Mae'n debyg mai dyna pam nad oes ond un Aelod Ceidwadol arall yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd. Y Blaid Geidwadol yw lluniwr llawer o'r anawsterau sy'n wynebu pobl dlawd a difreintiedig o ran gwasanaethau iechyd. Oni fyddai'n well o lawer ichi dynnu'n ôl y gwelliannau hyn a chefnogi'r cynnig a fydd yn golygu ailddyrrannu arian i wella bywydau pobl?

David Melding: Yr oedd hwnnw'n gyfraniad nodweddiadol gan Peter Law. Mae ein gwelliannau'n ystyriol ac yn fwriadus. Nid ydym wedi wfftio adroddiad Townsend. Mae

Socio-economic factors are deeply rooted in society. The gap between the richest and the poorest in our society has grown since 1997, for reasons that are difficult to fully understand. You should not throw stones at the Conservative group on the grounds that everything that goes wrong in the economy is the result of past Conservative action. This is a serious contribution to this debate, as it is an important matter. There are some practical difficulties, and that is what has motivated our amendments.

As the Minister said, a decision was taken early on to consider the resource allocation formula. We supported that. It is important that we consider the formula. We should not merely accept, for historical reasons, that these matters are fixed and final. It is logical and rational to reconsider the formula. I have no problems with agreeing to that. Thorough work has been done on it and I am not trying to undermine that. However, we must face the practical point that that decision was taken when we had five health authorities. Any change in the resource allocation formula over five units would, to some extent, be dampened down, because those five units would have a balance of gains and losses. We now have a situation whereby the new health commissioning bodies will be 22 local health boards. The difference between five units and 22 units in applying a new formula is massive. There is a danger—

Brian Gibbons *rose*—

David Melding: I will give way shortly, Brian.

There is a danger that we could create some big winners and some severe losers, because the formula's effect will be intensified. With five health authority areas, it is likely that, within each authority, some factors would increase the allocation and some would depress it. There would therefore be an overall balance in the change in resources, thereby moderating the overall impact. With 22 units, some areas would appear to be wealthy according to the formula and others

ffactorau cymdeithasol-economaidd wedi ymwreiddio'n ddwfn yng nghymdeithas. Mae'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethocaf a'r tlotaf yn ein cymdeithas wedi cynyddu ers 1997, am resymau sy'n anodd eu deall yn llwyr. Ni ddylech daflu cerrig at y grŵp Ceidwadol ar y sail bod popeth a aiff o'i le yn yr economi yn ganlyniad i gamau gan y Ceidwadwyr yn y gorffennol. Mae hwn yn gyfraniad difrifol i'r ddadl hon, gan ei fod yn fater pwysig. Mae rhai anawsterau ymarferol, a hynny sydd wedi cymhell ein gwelliannau.

Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, gwnaed penderfyniad yn gynnar i ystyried y fformiwla dyrannu adnoddau. Rhoesom ein cefnogaeth i hynny. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried y fformiwla. Ni ddylem dderbyn bod y materion hyn, am resymau hanesyddol, yn sefydlog ac yn derfynol. Mae'n rhesymegol ac yn rhesymol y dylid ailystyried y fformiwla. Nid yw cytuno â hynny'n peri anhawster i mi. Gwnaed gwaith trwyadl arni ac nid wyf yn ceisio tanseilio hynny. Er hynny, rhaid inni wynebu'r pwynt ymarferol bod y penderfyniad hwnnw wedi'i wneud pan oedd gennym bum awdurdod iechyd. Byddai unrhyw newid yn y fformiwla dyrannu adnoddau dros bum uned yn cael ei leddfu, gan y byddai gan y pum uned hynny gydbwysedd o enillion a cholledion. Mae gennym sefyllfa'n awr lle y bydd y cyrff comisiynu iechyd newydd yn 22 o fyrddau iechyd lleol. Mae'r gwahaniaeth rhwng pum uned a 22 uned wrth gymhwyso fformiwla newydd yn anferth. Mae perygl—

Brian Gibbons *a gododd*—

David Melding: Ildiaf cyn hir, Brian.

Mae perygl y gallem beri i rai fod ar eu hennill yn sylweddol ac i eraill gollu'n ddifrifol, gan y bydd effaith y fformiwla wedi'i dwysáu. Gyda phum ardal awdurdod lleol, mae'n debygol y byddai, o fewn pob awdurdod, rhai ffactorau'n cynyddu'r dyraniad ac eraill yn ei ostwng. Felly byddai cydbwysedd cyffredinol yn y newid mewn adnoddau, gan leddfu'r effaith gyffredinol. Gyda 22 uned, byddai rhai ardaloedd yn ymddangos yn gyfoethog yn ôl y fformiwla

more acutely socially deprived. Therefore, there would be a sudden and big shift in the resource allocation. That would have to be done—as the Minister has said—by next April. Unless some dampening is introduced, it could have a great impact on how health services are managed. The people of the Vale of Glamorgan and Monmouth deserve a full range of health services, as do the people of Blaenau Gwent. Any big shift in the system has to be practically managed. That is why I say that we should delay matters, at least until the medium term

Brian Gibbons: I accept that dampening is necessary, but your saying that this would lead to a big shift reflects Peter Law's point that there has been one law for the poor and another for the rich. The health service that we have for the poor has never been good enough. This report addresses that point. The quicker we do this, the better.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: David, you must begin to wind up your remarks.

David Melding: I accept, to some extent, that we must review the allocation formula, as it is not fully fit for purpose. We have tended to use devices such as direct grants through the health inequalities fund, which I will return to briefly. I remind Members that we do not yet know how local health boards will be affected, as the formula has not been analysed at that level. The Minister has brought this debate forward too soon. It is premature. We should have the main debate when we have the figures at local health board level. We do not have those figures as yet, but that is what we will be putting into effect in April 2003. We only have historical information about health authorities which will be abolished. Therefore, we are in many ways having a mock debate rather than dealing with the situation that we will be facing next April. In the meantime, I accept the points made by Peter Law and Dr Gibbons, namely that we must bring additional resources into our poorest areas. Until we have a new formula, the best way to proceed is to concentrate effort on the health inequalities fund and increasing its resources.

ac eraill yn amlygu amddifadedd cymdeithasol mwy difrifol. Byddai'n rhaid gwneud hynny—fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog—erbyn mis Ebrill nesaf. Oni chyflwynir rhywfaint o leddfu, gallai gael effaith fawr ar y dull o reoli'r gwasanaethau iechyd. Mae pobl Bro Morgannwg a Mynwy'n haeddu amrediad cyflawn o wasanaethau iechyd, fel y mae pobl Blaenau Gwent. Rhaid i unrhyw symudiad mawr yn y system gael ei reoli'n ymarferol. Dyna pam y dywedaf y dylem ohirio pethau, o leiaf tan y tymor canolig.

Brian Gibbons: Derbyniaf fod angen lleddfu, ond mae dweud y byddai hyn yn arwain at symudiad mawr yn adlewyrchu pwynt Peter Law y bu un gyfraith i'r tlodion ac un arall i'r cyfoethogion. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth iechyd sydd gennym i'r tlodion erioed wedi bod yn ddigon da. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ymdrin â'r pwynt hwnnw. Gorau po gyntaf inni wneud hyn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: David, rhaid ichi ddechrau dirwyn eich sylwadau i ben.

David Melding: Derbyniaf, i raddau, fod yn rhaid inni adolygu'r fformiwla dyrannu, gan nad yw'n gwbl addas i'w phwrpas. Yr ydym wedi tueddu i ddefnyddio dyfeisiau fel grantiau uniongyrchol drwy'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, y dychwelaf ati'n fyr. Yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Aelodau na wyddom eto beth fydd yr effaith ar y byrddau iechyd lleol, gan nad yw'r fformiwla wedi'i dadansoddi ar y lefel honno. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyflwyno'r ddadl hon yn rhy gynnar. Mae'n gynamserol. Dylem gael y brif ddadl pan yw'r ffigurau ar lefel y byrddau iechyd lleol gennym. Nid yw'r ffigurau hynny gennym hyd yn hyn, ond hynny y byddwn yn ei roi ar waith yn Ebrill 2003. Nid oes gennym ond gwybodaeth hanesyddol am yr awdurdodau iechyd a ddiddymir. Felly, ar lawer ystyr, yr ydym yn cael dadl ffug yn hytrach na delio â'r sefyllfa y byddwn yn ei hwynebu fis Ebrill nesaf. Yn y cyfamser, derbyniaf y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Peter Law a Dr Gibbons, sef bod rhaid inni ddod ag adnoddau ychwanegol i'n hardaloedd tlotaf. Hyd nes y bydd gennym fformiwla newydd, y ffordd orau ymlaen yw

That point is included in our amendments.

canolbwyntio'r ymdrech ar y gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd a chynyddu ei hadnoddau. Mae'r pwynt hwnnw wedi'i gynnwys yn ein gwelliannau.

David Lloyd: Cynigiau y gwellianau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 3: ym mhwynt 5, ar ôl 'Ebrill 2003' rhoi:

ond yn nodi bod dyrannu adnoddau yn yr adroddiad hwn yn seiliedig ar yr awdurdodau iechyd, a fydd yn peidio â bod ar ôl y dyddiad hwnnw.

David Lloyd: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 3: in point 5, after 'April 2003', insert:

but notes that the allocation of resources in this report is based on the health authorities, which will cease to exist after this date.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ym mhwynt 6 ar ôl 'gwledig a threfol' rhoi:

ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i sicrhau y daw'r fformiwla ddiwygiedig yn ôl i'r cyfarfod llawn i'w chymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

I propose amendment 4. In point 6, after 'rural issues', insert:

and calls upon the Minister to ensure that the revised formula is brought back to the Plenary session for approval by the National Assembly.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi bod y cyllid annigonol a geir drwy fformiwla Barnett yn cael effaith uniongyrchol ar allu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i sicrhau bod digon o gapasiti yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru i ateb yr angen.

I propose amendment 5. Add as new point at the end of the motion:

notes that the inadequacies of funding through the Barnett formula are having a direct impact on the ability of the National Assembly to ensure there is sufficient capacity within the national health service in Wales to meet need.

Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu a chynghorydd sir.

I declare an interest as a general practitioner and a county councillor.

Fel aelod o grŵp llywio cenedlaethol adroddiad Townsend, hoffwn gydnabod y cyfraniad pwysig a wnaeth yr Athro Townsend a'i dîm i'r maes pwysig hwn. Mae'r adroddiad yn sylweddol ac yn arloesol mewn sawl ffordd, yn benodol wrth geisio mesur a diffinio anghenion yn uniongyrchol yn hytrach nag yn anuniongyrchol, sef yr hyn a geir mewn mesurau yn awr. Y mae cefndir yr adroddiad yn allweddol bwysig. Yng Nghymru, ceir rhai o'r ystategau iechyd gwaethaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac Ewrop. Mae tlodi ac allgáu cymdeithasol yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at y safon iechyd gwael hwn. Mae anghydraddoldebau incwm yn golygu anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Wrth i anghydraddoldebau incwm waethygu dros y

As a member of the Townsend report national steering group, I wish to acknowledge the important contribution of Professor Townsend and his team in this important area. The report is substantial and innovative in many ways, specifically in trying to define needs directly rather than indirectly, as is the case under current measures. The report's background is of key importance. Wales has some of the worst health statistics in the United Kingdom and Europe. Poverty and social exclusion contribute greatly to this poor standard of health. Income inequalities lead to health inequalities. As income inequalities have worsened over the years—and they are still worsening—health inequalities have also

blynyddoedd—ac maent yn gwaethygu o hyd—mae anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn gwaethygu hefyd, fel y dengys adroddiad Dr Ruth Hall a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos hon. Yn gefndir i hynny, mae lefel gwariant y Deyrnas Unedig ar iechyd yn is na'r cyfartaledd Ewropeaidd. Caiff 7.6 y cant o gyfoeth y Deyrnas Unedig ei wario ar iechyd. Fodd bynnag, ar gyfartaledd, mae gwledydd Ewrop yn gwario 8.6 y cant o'u cyfoeth ar iechyd. Mae nifer o wledydd yn gwario llawer mwy na hynny.

Mae mynediad at wasanaethau mewn sawl rhan o Gymru hefyd yn broblem. Felly, yr oedd her sylweddol yn wynebu'r Athro Townsend a'i dîm wrth lunio'r adroddiad hwn, yn enwedig oherwydd y diffyg cyffredinol mewn ystadegau—

Brian Gibbons: There is no doubt about the concern regarding the present level of NHS funding in the United Kingdom. However, do you agree that no other government in the world is increasing health expenditure as rapidly as the Government in Wales and in Westminster?

David Lloyd: The increase in health expenditure is long overdue and based on 30 years of underinvestment.

Cyfeiriaf eto at y problemau a oedd yn wynebu'r Athro Townsend oherwydd y diffyg cyffredin mewn ystadegau mewn llawer maes a'r diffyg yn y rhwydwaith ysbytai cyffredinol, sydd yn awr yn cyflwyno gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru. Yr oedd hefyd yn wynebu problemau oherwydd y pwysau cynyddol ar y gwasanaeth iechyd o ran nifer cynyddol yr henoed yng Nghymru, y cynnydd yn nisgwyliadau pobl o ran y triniaethau newydd sydd ar gael, a'r dechnoleg ddrudfawr sydd yn awr yn helpu i ddarparu gwasanaeth iechyd i'r cyhoedd.

Yn y bôn, yr ydym yn siarad am sut y dylid rhannu'r gacen, sy'n cynrychioli'r cyllid iechyd. Mae'r gacen bresennol yn annigonol. Rhaid ei rhannu mewn modd sy'n adlewyrchu anghenion pobl Cymru yn well. Nid yw'r fformiwla honno yn berffaith, ond byddai'n well na'r hyn sydd yn bodoli ar hyn

worsened, as was shown in Dr Ruth Hall's report, which was published this week. To put this in its context, the United Kingdom's level of expenditure on health is lower than the European average. In the United Kingdom, 7.6 per cent of the country's wealth is spent on health. However, on average, European countries spend 8.6 per cent of their wealth on health. Many countries spend much more than that.

Access to services in many parts of Wales is also a problem. Therefore, Professor Townsend and his team faced a significant challenge in producing this report, especially in light of the general paucity of statistics—

Brian Gibbons: Nid oes amheuaeth am y gofid o ran lefel bresennol cyllid y GIG yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cytuno nad oes yr un llywodraeth yn y byd sy'n cynyddu'r gwariant ar iechyd mor gyflym ag y mae'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan?

David Lloyd: Mae'r cynnydd yn y gwariant ar iechyd yn hir-ddisgwyliedig ac yn seiliedig ar 30 mlynedd o danfuddsoddiad.

I will refer again to the problems that faced Professor Townsend because of the general paucity of statistics in several areas and the deficiency in the general hospital network, which now delivers health services in Wales. He also faced problems because of the mounting pressure on the health service as a result of the increasing number of elderly people in Wales, the increase in people's expectations regarding the new treatments available, and the expensive technology which aids the provision of health services to the public.

In essence, we are talking about how the cake, which represents the health budget, should be divided. The cake we have at present is too small. It must be divided in a way that better reflects the needs of the people of Wales. That formula is not perfect, but it would be an improvement on what

o bryd. Mae Plaid Cymru yn dadlau y dylid diwygio fformiwla Barnett hefyd i adlewyrchu anghenion pobl Cymru. Mae angen fformiwla ar gyfer iechyd sydd wedi ei seilio ar anghenion. Dylid newid y darlun ehangach hefyd i gynyddu maint y gacen sydd i'w rhannu. Mae angen gweithredu ar argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn yn awr. Cafwyd trin a thrafod ar fformiwla ariannu ein hawdurdodau iechyd ers blynyddoedd. Mae angen sicrhau bod arian ychwanegol yn cyrraedd y claf. Aeth y trafodaethau ymlaen cyhyd fel y bydd yr awdurdodau iechyd yn cael eu diddymu ar yr union adeg y bwriedir newid y ffordd y cânt eu hariannu. Dylid croesawu'r ffaith yn yr adroddiad na fydd unrhyw ardal yn colli arian wrth aildrefnu'r fformiwla. Fodd bynnag, mae arnom angen mwy o fanylion ar sut y bydd hyn oll yn digwydd, a dyna yw sail un o'n gwelliannau.

Erys pryderon ymhlith pobl y Gogledd am eu gwasanaethau. Beth fydd y pwysoli a ddefnyddir yn y fformiwla rhwng ariannu'n hardaloedd gwledig a'n hardaloedd dinesig? Ni wyddom.

Mae adroddiad Townsend yn waith clodwiw. I gloi, erys sialens sylweddol i wireddu'r holl argymhellion, a dechrau ar y gwaith o unioni anghydraddoldebau iechyd brawychus ein gwlad.

10:45 a.m.

Ann Jones: I am happy to welcome the principles contained in the Townsend report on health inequalities, and we can now move forward to address them. Health inequality is, quite simply, a matter of life and death. Published figures show that people in Monmouthshire can expect to live for almost five years longer than those in Merthyr Tydfil, so David Davies will be all right.

The Chief Medical Officer for Wales published a report this week highlighting that mortality rates in the most deprived fifth of electoral wards in Wales are 25 per cent higher than those in the least deprived fifth of electoral wards. The underlying cause of that difference is clearly spelt out by

exists at present. Plaid Cymru believes that the Barnett formula should also be amended to reflect the needs of the people of Wales. We need a formula for health based on needs. The bigger picture should also be changed to increase the size of the cake that is to be divided. We must act on this report's recommendations now. The funding formula for our health authorities has been discussed for years. We must ensure that the additional funding reaches the patient. The discussions have been going on for so long that the health authorities are being abolished at the very time that the funding structures are being changed. The fact that, according to this report, the revision of the formula will not lead to cutbacks in any areas is to be welcomed. However, we need more details on how all this will happen, and that is the rationale behind one of our amendments.

The people of north Wales remain anxious about their services. What weighting will be used in the funding formula for our rural and urban areas? We do not know.

The Townsend report is commendable work. To close, we still face a great challenge in implementing all the recommendations, and in getting to grips with the startling health inequalities of our country.

Ann Jones: Yr wyf yn falch o groesawu'r egwyddorion a geir yn adroddiad Townsend ar anghydraddoldebau iechyd, a gallwn symud ymlaen yn awr i ymdrin â hwy. Mae anghydraddoldeb iechyd, yn gwbl syml, yn fater o fywyd a marwolaeth. Mae'r ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd yn dangos y gall pobl yn Sir Fynwy ddisgwyl byw ymron i bum mlynedd yn hwy na'r rhai ym Merthyr Tudful, felly bydd yn iawn ar David Davies.

Cyhoeddodd Prif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru adroddiad yr wythnos hon sy'n tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod y cyfraddau marwolaethau yn y bumed ran fwyaf difreintiedig o wardiau etholaethol Cymru 25 y cant yn uwch na'r rhai yn y bumed ran leiaf difreintiedig. Mae achos sylfaenol y gwahaniaeth hwnnw wedi'i

Professor Townsend: poor health is the consequence of poverty.

That conclusion was spelt out in the Black report, commissioned by Labour and published in 1980. Needless to say, that analysis did not commend itself to Mrs Thatcher's Government. The Black report was buried by the Tories, along with the issue of the causes of poor health. Health inequalities were not focused on again by central Government until 1997. The 1998 Acheson report updated Black's findings, and made similar recommendations—tackling health inequalities cannot be done by the NHS alone, but must be accompanied by a wider assault on poverty and deprivation, which are the root causes of ill health. That is why Professor Townsend has recommended a dual strategy.

The NHS cannot fix the problems of health inequalities on its own. It can help to counter the worst effects, or it can exacerbate them. We have heard much in other debates about the inverse care law, which can be seen in the west end of Rhyl—the most deprived ward in Wales. It is not something that can be tackled simply by playing with funding formulae. It is about how money is spent and on whom.

Ensuring that money goes where the need is greatest is key to addressing the inverse care issue. The Townsend report tells us which places suffer the worst health. The Vale of Clwyd has the sixth worst health ranking of all 40 constituencies in Wales. I grant you that that is better than Merthyr Tydfil or Blaenau Gwent, but it has much the worst standard mortality rate in north Wales.

The new direct formula proposed by Professor Townsend is both radical and robust. It is a distinctive Welsh solution, which is already creating interest elsewhere in the UK and further afield. No local health boards, once set up, will end up with less money than they receive at the moment. All

fynegi'n groyw gan yr Athro Townsend: mae iechyd gwael yn ganlyniad i dlodi.

Mynegwyd y casgliad hwnnw yn adroddiad Black, a gomisiynwyd gan Lafur ac a gyhoeddwyd yn 1980. Afraid dweud nad oedd y dadansoddiad hwnnw wrth fodd Llywodraeth Mrs Thatcher. Claddwyd adroddiad Black gan y Torïaid, ynghyd â mater achosion iechyd gwael. Ni chanolbwyntiwyd ar anghydraddoldebau iechyd wedyn gan y Llywodraeth ganolog tan 1997. Diweddarwyd canfyddiadau Black gan adroddiad Acheson yn 1998, a gwnaeth argymhellion tebyg—ni all y GIG fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd ar ei ben ei hun, a rhaid i hynny gyd-fynd ag ymgyrch ehangach yn erbyn tlodi ac amddifadedd, sef achosion sylfaenol iechyd gwael. Dyna pam y mae'r Athro Townsend wedi argymhell strategaeth ddeuol.

Ni all y GIG ddatrys problemau anghydraddoldebau iechyd ar ei ben ei hun. Gall helpu i wrthweithio'r effeithiau gwaethaf, neu gall eu gwaethygu. Clywsom lawer mewn dadleuon eraill am y ddeddf gofal gwrthgyfartal, y gellir ei gweld ym mhen gorllewinol y Rhyl—y ward fwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Nid yw'n rhywbeth y gellir mynd i'r afael ag ef dim ond drwy chwarae â fformiwlâu ariannu. Mae'n ymwneud â'r modd y caiff arian ei wario ac ar bwy.

Mae sicrhau bod yr arian yn mynd lle bo'r angen fwyaf yn allweddol wrth ymdrin â mater gofal gwrthgyfartal. Dywed adroddiad Townsend wrthym pa leoedd sy'n dioddef gan yr iechyd gwaethaf. Dyffryn Clwyd yw'r chweched gwaethaf o ran iechyd o blith y 40 etholaeth yng Nghymru. Derbyniaf ei fod yn well na Merthyr Tudful neu Flaenau Gwent, ond ganddo ef y mae'r gyfradd marwolaethau safonol waethaf o lawer yn y Gogledd.

Mae'r fformiwla uniongyrchol a gynigir gan yr Athro Townsend yn radical ac yn gryf. Mae'n ateb Cymreig arbennig, sydd eisoes yn ennyn diddordeb mewn mannau eraill yn y DU a'r tu hwnt. Ni fydd yr un o'r byrddau iechyd lleol, ar ôl eu sefydlu, â llai o arian yn y diwedd nag y maent yn ei dderbyn ar hyn o

will receive real increases in funding, but some will increase more than others.

You may wonder how we can make such a promise. It is because Labour is delivering record sustained increases in funding for the national health service: a 7.7 per cent increase in health funding this year, with further increases of 7.6 per cent and 7.9 per cent over the next two years. That takes the health budget from £2.6 billion in 1999-2000 to £3.6 billion in 2003-04. The UK Government and the Government of Wales are committed to raising health spending, and further increases can be expected over the next few years. However, if we postpone implementing this formula now, it may be more painful to introduce it later. When David Melding says 'later', I fear that he and his party mean that it will never happen.

As a socialist, I believe that health services should be provided on the basis of need alone. We are delivering record increases in health spending, which will allow for real growth in every part of Wales. We are increasing spending most in the areas of greatest need. Therefore, we are giving most to those who need it most.

We are confident about our vision for the health service. We will judge the sincerity of others by how they vote in this debate.

Geraint Davies: I declare my usual interests as a pharmacist and a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. I welcome the thrust of this report, which recognises that much work must be done to address the health needs of the people of Wales. Undoubtedly, these proposals will help to tackle inequalities in the health service. My constituency—which, along with other deprived Valleys communities, has lost out in the past—can hope to benefit.

bryd. Bydd pob un yn derbyn cynnydd gwirioneddol mewn arian, ond bydd cynnydd rhai yn fwy na'i gilydd.

Gallech feddwl tybed sut y gallwn wneud addewid o'r fath. Y rheswm am hynny yw bod Llafur yn rhoi'r cynnydd cyson mwyaf erioed mewn arian i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol: cynnydd o 7.7 y cant mewn arian i iechyd eleni, gyda chynnydd pellach o 7.6 y cant a 7.9 y cant dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Mae hynny'n codi'r gyllideb iechyd o £2.6 biliwn yn 1999-2000 i £3.6 biliwn yn 2003-04. Mae Llywodraeth y DU a Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwmo i godi'r gwariant ar iechyd, a gellir disgwyl cynnydd pellach yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf hyn. Fodd bynnag, os gohiriwn roi'r fformiwla hon ar waith yn awr, gallai fod yn fwy poenus ei chyflwyno'n ddiweddarach. Pan ddywed David Melding 'yn ddiweddarach', ofnaf mai'r hyn a olyga ef a'i blaid yw na fydd byth yn digwydd.

Fel sosialydd, credaf y dylid darparu gwasanaethau iechyd ar sail angen yn unig. Yr ydym yn gwario mwy ar iechyd nag erioed o'r blaen, a bydd hynny'n caniatáu twf gwirioneddol ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Yr ydym yn cynyddu'r gwariant yn fwyaf yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus. Felly, yr ydym yn rhoi'r mwyaf i'r rhai y mae arnynt ei angen fwyaf.

Yr ydym yn hyderus ynghylch ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd. Byddwn yn barnu ynghylch diffuantrwydd eraill yn ôl y modd y maent yn bwrw eu pleidlais yn y ddadl hon.

Geraint Davies: Datganaf fy muddiannau arferol fel fferylllydd ac aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Croesawaf fyrddwn yr adroddiad hwn, sy'n cydnabod bod angen llawer o waith i ymdrin ag anghenion iechyd pobl Cymru. Yn ddi-os, bydd y cynigion hyn o gymorth i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae gobaith y bydd fy etholaeth i—sydd, ynghyd â chymunedau difreintiedig eraill yn y Cymoedd, wedi bod ar ei cholled yn y gorffennol—ar ei hennill.

However, if we are to address the health divide, we must address the wealth divide. It is disgraceful that the wealth divide has increased since the Labour Government has been in power in Westminster. There is a tremendous need to target these areas, which suffer from some of the worst health statistics in the whole of western Europe.

We must recognise where the problems lie. This means going below the level of health authorities—which are to be abolished—and even below local health group level, to analyse the statistics available and allocate necessary resources. For instance, the standard mortality rate for Rhondda Cynon Taff stands at 119.3, which is a bad enough statistic on its own. However, when we focus on areas within Rhondda Cynon Taff, we see that the real situation is widely variable. Taff Ely has a standard mortality rate of 82, while in the Rhondda it is more than double that figure, at 189.8. Such inequalities must be addressed and resourced accordingly.

We know that health inequalities develop quicker as a result of deficient primary care, which is the most important level of healthcare. People in the Valleys must wait for weeks to see their GP and, when they finally get an appointment, the facilities offered to them are often poor; surgeries are often held in unsuitable premises.

As well as tackling inequalities within Wales, we must also fight for a larger slice of the cake in general. Wales has significantly higher rates of mental illness, coronary and stroke mortality, and limiting long-term illness than England. We have the highest teenage pregnancy rate in Europe. Too many of our people are living in poverty, and too many suffer from educational underachievement. There are insufficient resources to tackle the problems of drug abuse within our communities. All these factors contribute to the poor health of our nation.

Fodd bynnag, os ydym i ddelio â'r rhaniad iechyd, rhaid inni ddelio â'r rhaniad cyfoeth. Mae'n warthus bod y rhaniad cyfoeth wedi cynyddu ers i'r Llywodraeth Lafur ddod i rym yn San Steffan. Mae taer angen targedu'r ardaloedd hynny, sy'n dioddef rhai o'r ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf yn y cyfan o orllewin Ewrop.

Rhaid inni sylweddoli lle y mae'r problemau. Mae hynny'n golygu mynd yn is na lefel yr awdurdodau iechyd—sydd i'w diddymu—a hyd yn oed yn is na lefel y grwpiau iechyd lleol, i ddadansoddi'r ystadegau sydd ar gael a dyrannu'r adnoddau sydd eu hangen. Er enghraifft, y gyfradd marwolaethau safonol ar gyfer Rhondda Cynon Taf yw 119.3, sy'n ystadegyn digon drwg ar ei ben ei hun. Fodd bynnag, pan ganolbwyntiwn ar ardaloedd o fewn Rhondda Cynon Taf, gwelwn fod y wir sefyllfa'n amrywiol dros ben. Mae gan Daf Elái gyfradd marwolaethau safonol o 82, tra bo'r ffigur yn y Rhondda'n fwy na dwywaith hynny, sef 189.8. Rhaid rhoi sylw i anghydraddoldebau o'r fath a rhoi'r adnoddau priodol.

Gwyddom fod anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn datblygu'n gyflymach o ganlyniad i ofal sylfaenol diffygiol, sef y lefel gofal iechyd bwysicaf. Rhaid i bobl yn y Cymoedd ddisgwyl am wythnosau i weld eu meddyg teulu ac, wedi iddynt gael ei weld o'r diwedd, mae'r cyfleusterau a gynigir iddynt yn aml yn wael; cynhelir llawer o feddygfeydd mewn adeiladau anaddas.

Yn ogystal â mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau o fewn Cymru, rhaid inni hefyd ymladd i gael darn mwy o'r deisen yn gyffredinol. Mae gan Gymru gyfraddau uwch o lawer o salwch meddwl, marwolaethau oherwydd clefyd coronaidd y galon a strôc, a salwch tymor hir cyfyngol na Lloegr. Gennym ni y mae'r gyfradd beichiogrwydd uchaf ymysg rhai yn eu harddegau yn Ewrop. Mae gormod o'n pobl yn byw mewn tldi, ac mae gormod yn dioddef oherwydd tangyrhaeddiad addysgol. Mae'r adnoddau i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau camddefnyddio cyffuriau yn ein cymunedau yn annigonol. Mae'r holl ffactorau hyn yn cyfrannu at iechyd gwael ein cenedl.

Wales also has a higher proportion of older people. While we welcome the fact that additional provision has been included in the new health resource allocation formula for older people, and that additional work has been proposed in this area, the underlying problem remains.

The Barnett formula, from which health spending in Wales is derived, does not take Wales's needs into account, as Dai has said. We are therefore being short-changed, and we will continue to be short-changed until the funding system is revised. The Townsend formula slices the cake in a slightly fairer way than previously. However, the problem is the size of the cake. The cake needs to grow substantially before we can start to tackle the scandal of the health inequalities that face our deprived communities.

Lynne Neagle: This report and its recommendations are welcome. They will, at long last, inject a measure of fairness and social justice into the funding of the health service in Wales. It is a Labour Government and a Labour-led administration in the Assembly that is delivering the investment that our health service so badly lacked under the Tories.

This new formula will take us even further. It will mean that we will start to direct resources to those communities that have the greatest health needs. I am not surprised that the Tories are not in favour of this proposal, but I am disappointed that William Graham will not support a reform that will undoubtedly benefit the health service in Gwent. Plaid Cymru's amendments are equally unsurprising. It has little to say on this important issue for the NHS. Its only response is to resort to the begging-bowl politics of blaming Barnett rather than adding something constructive to the debate.

I will not pretend that I do not have concerns. In particular, I am disappointed at the timetable for implementation. The nettle of reform should have been grasped sooner and

Mae gan Gymru gyfran fwy o bobl hŷn hefyd. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r ffaith bod darpariaeth ychwanegol wedi'i chynnwys yn y fformiwla dyrannu adnoddau iechyd newydd i bobl hŷn, a bod gwaith ychwanegol wedi'i gynnig yn y maes hwn, mae'r broblem sylfaenol yn aros.

Nid yw fformiwla Barnett, y mae'r gwariant ar iechyd yng Nghymru'n deillio ohoni, yn cymryd anghenion Cymru i ystyriaeth, fel y dywedodd Dai. Yr ydym yn cael ein twyllo, felly, a byddwn yn parhau i gael ein twyllo nes caiff y system ariannu ei hadolygu. Mae fformiwla Townsend yn rhannu'r deisen ychydig yn decach nag o'r blaen. Er hynny, maint y deisen yw'r broblem. Rhaid i'r deisen fynd yn fwy o lawer cyn y gallwn ddechrau delio â sgandal yr anghydraddoldebau iechyd sy'n wynebu ein cymunedau difreintiedig.

Lynne Neagle: Mae'r adroddiad hwn a'i argymhellion i'w groesawu. O'r diwedd, byddant yn chwistrellu rhywfaint o degwch a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol i'r dull o ariannu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Llywodraeth Lafur a gweinyddiaeth o dan arweiniad Llafur yn y Cynulliad sy'n rhoi'r buddsoddiad yr oedd ein gwasanaeth iechyd mor brin ohono o dan y Torïaid.

Bydd y fformiwla newydd hon yn mynd â ni ymhellach byth. Bydd yn golygu y byddwn yn dechrau cyfeirio adnoddau at y cymunedau hynny sydd â'r anghenion iechyd mwyaf. Nid wyf yn synnu nad yw'r Torïaid o blaid y cynnig hwn, ond yr wyf yn siomedig na wnaiff William Graham gefnogi diwygio a fydd yn sicr o fod er lles y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Ngwent. Mae gwelliannau Plaid Cymru yr un mor ansyfrdanol. Ychydig sydd ganddi i'w ddweud ar y mater pwysig hwn i'r GIG. Ei hunig ymateb yw troi at wleidyddiaeth y ffiol gardod o roi'r bai ar Barnett yn hytrach nag ychwanegu rhywbeth adeiladol i'r ddadl.

Ni chymeraf arnaf nad oes gennyf bryderon. Yn benodol, fe'm siomwyd gan yr amserlen weithredu. Dylid bod wedi gwasgu'r ddanhadlen o ran diwygio'n gynt ac ni ddylid

the original implementation date should not have been allowed to slip. No new delays should be allowed. The report states that the changes can be brought in within three years of the start date. I would like a guarantee from Jane today that this deadline will be met. The Townsend report said that there are serious unmet needs in my constituency. My constituents have a right to expect the Assembly to move swiftly to address this problem. The new formula will help, but on its own it will not be enough and neither will the health inequalities fund under current arrangements. The answer is not simply to provide more resources, as welcome as they would be. How the fund allocates money must also be radically changed. Allocating funding purely on a bidding process will ensure that the money is spread around Wales and not targeted at the areas of greatest need. Despite the serious unmet need in my constituency, the fund has hitherto made only one award in Torfaen, out of a total of 67 across Wales. The approach of a little bit for everyone will never realise this Assembly's often-stated aspiration to tackle health inequality. That is why the Tory amendment on the health inequalities fund is not the answer. It would be wrong to simply increase the level of resources without addressing the wider problems of how that money is allocated. Geographic parity is not an answer to the problem of the concentration of ill health in the Valleys and it never will be; neither is allowing the new formula to be distorted by adjustments for additional costs in rural areas, when they are not evidence-based.

10:55 a.m.

David Davies: You have obviously given this matter a great deal of thought. Why do you think that this problem exists in the Valleys? Do you think that because someone earns £200 a week, they will be automatically less healthy than someone earning £400 a week?

bod wedi gadael i'r dyddiad gweithredu gwreiddiol lithro ymlaen. Ni ddylid caniatáu unrhyw ohirio pellach. Noda'r adroddiad y gellir cyflwyno'r newidiadau o fewn tair blynedd ar ôl y dyddiad dechrau. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd gan Jane heddiw y cwblheir hyn mewn pryd. Dywed adroddiad Townsend fod anghenion difrifol yn fy etholaeth i sydd heb eu diwallu. Mae gan fy etholwyr hawl i ddisgwyl i'r Cynulliad gymryd camau'n gyflym i ymdrin â'r broblem hon. Bydd y fformiwla newydd o gymorth, ond ni fydd yn ddigon ar ei phen ei hun ac ni fydd y gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn ddigon o dan y trefniadau presennol ychwaith. Nid darparu mwy o adnoddau yw'r holl ateb, er mor dderbyniol y byddent. Rhaid cael newid sylfaenol hefyd yn null y gronfa o ddyrannu arian. Bydd dyrannu arian ar sail proses ymgeisio'n unig yn sicrhau y caiff yr arian ei wasgaru o gwmpas Cymru ac na chaiff ei dargedu ar yr ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus. Er gwaethaf yr angen difrifol sydd heb ei ddiwallu yn fy etholaeth i, hyd yn hyn nid yw'r gronfa ond wedi rhoi un dyfarniad yn Nhor-faen, o gyfanswm o 67 ledled Cymru. Ni fydd y dull o roi ychydig bach i bawb byth yn gwireddu'r dyhead a fynegir yn aml gan y Cynulliad hwn o fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb iechyd. Dyna pam nad yw gwelliant y Torïaid ar y gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn ateb. Byddai'n anghywir rhoi mwy o adnoddau'n unig heb roi sylw i'r problemau ehangach o ran y modd y dyrennir yr arian hwnnw. Nid cydraddoldeb daearyddol yw'r ateb i broblem y crynodiad o iechyd gwael yn y Cymoedd ac ni fydd byth; nid yw caniatáu ystumio'r fformiwla newydd drwy addasiadau ar gyfer costau ychwanegol mewn ardaloedd gwledig ychwaith, os nad ydynt yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth.

David Davies: Mae'n amlwg eich bod wedi meddwl llawer am y mater hwn. Pam yr ydych yn meddwl bod y broblem hon yn bod yn y Cymoedd? A ydych yn credu, am fod rhywun yn ennill £200 yr wythnos, y bydd yn llai iach oherwydd hynny na rhywun sy'n ennill £400 yr wythnos?

Lynne Neagle: I am stunned that you ask that question. I would have thought that you would have realised that the chronic ill health in the Valleys is due to deprivation, to which the havoc and chaos that the Conservatives wreaked on the Valleys for around 20 years seriously contributed. Therefore, the responsibility lies fairly and squarely with you.

I would be deeply concerned if further work on the formula and the effects of rurality were to be used as a back door way of levelling out the effects of redistribution. Any adjustments for rurality must be clearly and indisputably evidence-based, as they will be for my constituency and for the formula as a whole.

That should also be the case with the ambulance service. As well as distances travelled, consideration must also be given to the impact of a higher volume of call outs in areas such as south-east Wales. There must be recognition that there are far greater pressures on the health service in areas where the population is the highest and the people are the sickest. Today is a step forward in our efforts to bring greater fairness and social justice to the health service. Although I still have some concerns, this formula will be good news for Gwent and Torfaen. It is good news delivered by Welsh Labour in the Assembly through resources made available by the UK Labour Government—Labour in partnership at Westminster and in Wales delivering investment, reform, and social justice for the NHS.

Brian Hancock: We welcome the Townsend report because it recognises that we must do more to deliver healthcare provision because of the need throughout Wales—there is a great deal to be done and little time in which to do it. Members have mentioned deprivation. My constituency, Islwyn, forms half of the county borough of Caerphilly. Our deprivation is extremely high and well recognised. Thirteen wards in Islwyn are in the 100 most deprived. We must tackle deprivation because it affects how people live, their health, education and housing.

Lynne Neagle: Yr wyf yn synnu eich bod yn gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw. Buaswn wedi meddwl y byddech wedi sylweddoli bod yr iechyd gwael cronig yn y Cymoedd yn ganlyniad i'r amddifadedd, y mae'r llastr a'r distryw a wnaeth y Ceidwadwyr ar y Cymoedd am tuag 20 mlynedd wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol ato. Felly, a bod yn hollol deg, chi sy'n gyfrifol.

Byddwn yn bryderus iawn pe byddai'r gwaith pellach ar y fformiwla ac effeithiau gwledigrwydd yn cael eu defnyddio fel drws cefn i wastatáu effeithiau'r aiddosbarthu. Rhaid i unrhyw addasiadau ar gyfer gwledigrwydd fod yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth eglur a diamheuol, fel y byddant ar gyfer fy etholaeth i a'r fformiwla yn ei chyfanrwydd.

Dylai hynny fod yn wir hefyd am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Yn ogystal â'r pellteroedd a deithir, rhaid ystyried hefyd effaith y nifer fwy o alwadau allan mewn ardaloedd fel y De-ddwyrain. Rhaid cael cydnabyddiaeth bod pwysau mwy o lawer ar y gwasanaeth iechyd mewn ardaloedd lle y mae'r boblogaeth fwyaf a'r bobl salaf. Mae heddiw'n gam ymlaen yn ein hymdrechion i ddod â mwy o degwch a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Er bod gennyf rai pryderon o hyd, bydd y fformiwla hon yn newyddion da i Went a Thor-faen. Mae'n newyddion da a roddwyd gan Lafur Cymru yn y Cynulliad drwy adnoddau a ddarparwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur y DU—Llafur mewn partneriaeth yn San Steffan ac yng Nghymru yn dod â buddsoddiad, diwygio, a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol i'r GIG.

Brian Hancock: Yr ydym yn croesawu adroddiad Townsend am ei fod yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid inni wneud rhagor i ddarparu gofal iechyd oherwydd yr angen ledled Cymru—mae llawer o waith ac ychydig o amser i'w wneud. Mae'r Aelodau wedi sôn am amddifadedd. Fy etholaeth i, Islwyn, yw hanner bwrdeistref sirol Caerffili. Mae'n hamddifadedd yn fawr iawn ac yn gydnabyddedig. Mae 13 ward yn Islwyn ymhlith y 100 mwyaf difreintiedig. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd am ei fod yn effeithio ar ffordd o fyw pobl, eu hiechyd,

Work is one way of getting around that, which I hope that David Davies notes, even though he is now engaged in conversation. In the past year, the Valleys have lost so many jobs that perhaps we should call for the Valleys to be made a city. One way of getting more jobs to an area is for a town to be made a city; Newport now has that advantage. That is something to consider for the future.

The bigger picture is the Barnett formula. Amendment 5 is key because the formula does not address the needs of the people of Wales. Lord Barnett has said that this formula is no longer relevant in this day and age; it was a temporary arrangement. We must consider provision over time and the additional costs to deal with the additional needs of the people of Wales. The Barnett formula is the underlying problem because that is how Wales derives its spending power. That is how we can spend money to improve the health of the people of Wales. If we are short of money, then we have been left short and we must lift our aspirations to get our fair, just and worthy share.

Let us not forget that we are starting from a position where the UK spends less on its health system than other European countries. Wales spends around 13 per cent more per head on the NHS than England. However, it is patently obvious that our needs are still not being met when you consider that the people of Wales are forced to wait much longer for treatment than their English counterparts.

Brian Gibbons: Notwithstanding what you said, do you agree that spending on the NHS from 1997 to the end of the current comprehensive spending review will have increased by 50 per cent, which is a record compared with any other European country?

Brian Hancock: That is an interesting question, but there was an underspend on health last year. We could have spent even more. Was that money underspent to fund Objective 1?

On the health authority anomaly, the allocation of resources in the report was

eu haddysg a'u tai. Mae gwaith yn un modd i ddatrys hynny, y gobeithiaf fod David Davies yn ei nodi, er ei fod yn sgwrsio ar hyn o bryd. Y llynedd, colodd y Cymoedd gynifer o swyddi fel y dylem efallai alw am wneud y Cymoedd yn ddinas. Un dull o gael mwy o swyddi i ardal yw troi tref yn ddinas; mae'r fantais honno gan Gasnewydd yn awr. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth i'w ystyried at y dyfodol.

Y darlun ehangach yw fformiwla Barnett. Mae gwelliant 5 yn allweddol gan nad yw'r fformiwla'n cyflawni anghenion pobl Cymru. Mae'r Arglwydd Barnett wedi dweud nad yw'r fformiwla hon yn berthnasol bellach yn yr oes sydd ohoni; yr oedd yn drefniant dros dro. Rhaid inni ystyried y ddarpariaeth dros amser a'r costau ychwanegol i ymdrin ag anghenion ychwanegol pobl Cymru. Fformiwla Barnett yw'r broblem sylfaenol oherwydd dyna sut y caiff Cymru ei phŵer gwario. Dyna sut y gallwn wario arian i wella iechyd pobl Cymru. Os ydym yn brin o arian, yna yr ydym wedi'n gadael yn brin a rhaid inni godi'n dyheadau i gael ein cyfran deg, gyfiawn a theilwng.

Gadewch inni beidio ag anghofio ein bod yn cychwyn o sefyllfa lle y mae'r DU yn gwario llai ar ei system iechyd na gwledydd Ewropeaidd eraill. Mae Cymru'n gwario tua 13 y cant yn fwy y pen ar y GIG nag y mae Lloegr. Er hynny, mae'n gwbl amlwg nad yw'n hanghenion yn cael eu diwallu o hyd pan ystyriwch fod pobl Cymru'n gorfod aros yn hwy o lawer am driniaeth na'u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr.

Brian Gibbons: Er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedasoch, a ydych yn cytuno y bydd y gwariant ar y GIG o 1997 hyd ddiwedd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant presennol wedi codi 50 y cant, sy'n fwy na'r un wlad arall yn Ewrop?

Brian Hancock: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn diddorol, ond yr oedd tanwariant ar iechyd y llynedd. Gallasem fod wedi gwario mwy byth. A danwariwyd yr arian hwnnw i ariannu Amcan 1?

Ynghylch yr anghysondeb o ran yr awdurdodau lleol, yr oedd y dyraniad

based on health authorities, as David Melding mentioned earlier. It raises questions about the effectiveness of these reforms in dealing with the problems at the sharp end. Will the Minister's changes be superficial if they do not improve the quality of the service provided to patients in Wales?

This is a review report and we must consider these issues further. We must bear in mind the costs of restructuring, which we have still not received, even though Jane Hutt has promised to present them to us. We need a further, fuller debate when we have those other costs. I urge everyone to support our amendments.

Kirsty Williams: I welcome this debate and thank Professor Townsend and the project team for the considerable amount of work undertaken and time spent on behalf of the Health and Social Services Committee and the Government of Wales. When the Committee commissioned the review in February 2000, not one Committee member could have envisaged the complexity of the work undertaken and the time spent on it.

The principal motivating factor behind the Committee's decision was the desire to address health inequalities in Wales. Those inequalities have grown over the last 50 years and, as reported starkly by the Chief Medical Officer for Wales yesterday, there are substantial geographic variations in mortality and morbidity. Merthyr Tydfil's mortality rate is 50 per cent higher than that of Ceredigion, with a life expectancy that is four or five years less. No-one in this Chamber—not even David Davies—could consider that to be acceptable. It was right for the Committee to seek out this review to consider a formula allocation that was based on out-of-date data and that was not addressing the real needs of the people of Wales.

The three areas identified for action by Professor Townsend are welcome. I have

adnoddau yn yr adroddiad yn seiliedig ar yr awdurdodau iechyd, fel y soniodd David Melding yn gynharach. Mae'n codi cwestiynau ynghylch effeithiolrwydd y diwygiadau hyn wrth ddelio â'r problemau yn y pen blaen. A fydd newidiadau'r Gweinidog yn arwynebol os nad ydynt yn gwella ansawdd y gwasanaeth a ddarperir i gleifion yng Nghymru?

Adroddiad adolygiad yw hwn a rhaid inni ystyried y materion hyn ymhellach. Rhaid inni gofio costau'r ailstrwythuro, nad ydym wedi'u cael eto, er bod Jane Hutt wedi addo eu cyflwyno inni. Rhaid inni gael dadll bellach, lawnach pan fydd y costau eraill hynny gennym. Anogaf bawb i gefnogi'n gwelliannau.

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddadl hon ac yn diolch i'r Athro Townsend a thîm y prosiect am y gwaith mawr a wnaethpwyd a'r amser a dreuliwyd ar ran y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Cymru. Pan gomisiynodd y Pwyllgor yr adolygiad yn Chwefror 2000, ni fyddai'r un aelod pwyllgor wedi gallu rhagweld cymhlethdod y gwaith a wnaethpwyd a'r amser a dreuliwyd arno.

Y prif reswm dros benderfyniad y Pwyllgor oedd yr awydd i ymdrin â'r anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru. Mae'r anghydraddoldebau hynny wedi cynyddu dros y 50 mlynedd diwethaf ac, fel yr adroddwyd yn blaen ddoe gan Brif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru, mae amrywiadau daearyddol mawr mewn marwolaethau ac afiachusrwydd. Mae cyfradd marwolaethau Merthyr Tudful yn 50 y cant yn uwch nag un Ceredigion, gyda disgwyliad einioes sy'n bedair neu bum mlynedd yn llai. Ni allai neb yn y Siambr hon—nid David Davies hyd yn oed—ystyried bod hynny'n dderbynol. Yr oedd yn iawn i'r Pwyllgor geisio'r adolygiad hwn i ystyried dyrannu yn ôl fformiwla a oedd yn seiliedig ar hen ddata ac nad oedd yn bodloni gwir anghenion pobl Cymru.

Mae'r tri maes y mae'r Athro Townsend wedi'u henwi ar gyfer gweithredu i'w

long argued that it is not the role of the NHS alone to improve and protect the health of the people of Wales. Policy measures must be taken and monitored inside and outside the NHS. It is no coincidence that the Chief Medical Officer devoted an entire chapter of her annual report to the role of local government and another to the role of the voluntary sector in developing and protecting the health of the people of Wales. Local government is crucial given its responsibility for services that have a huge influence on the social, economic and environmental determinants of health inequalities such as transport, planning, education, housing and economic development.

The second area identified by Townsend is no less important, and I am somewhat disappointed that the speakers in the debate so far have not mentioned this important aspect. The report shockingly illustrates how NHS financial resources have been badly managed in the past. To describe the understanding of how resources have been spent and monitored in the past as sketchy would be kind to former administrations and their civil servants. I am aware that the new director of NHS Wales shares these concerns. Measures are already in hand to improve accountancy and monitoring practices within the Welsh Assembly Government. As guardians of the public purse, we must be assured of how we are spending vital, and often, scarce resources.

Finally, I turn to the recommendation on the new direct method of funding for the NHS in Wales. No Member who has berated the Westminster Government for not funding this Assembly based on the needs of the people of Wales can now say that we do not need an NHS formula that is funded in the same way. I also think that in taking these measures forward, we must ensure that we stress that these proposals are about raising standards for all to the highest and not bringing everyone down to the lowest common denominator. To get that right, we must acknowledge that there is more work to be done on this formula to fine-tune it and to get it right.

croesawu. Yr wyf yn dadlau ers tro nad rôl y GIG yn unig yw gwella a diogelu iechyd pobl Cymru. Rhaid cymryd a monitro camau polisi y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r GIG. Nid cyd-ddigwyddiad yw bod y Prif Swyddog Meddygol wedi neilltuo pennod gyfan o'i adroddiad blynyddol i rôl llywodraeth leol ac un arall i rôl y sector gwirfoddol wrth ddatblygu a diogelu iechyd pobl Cymru. Mae llywodraeth leol yn hollbwysig o ystyried ei chyfrifoldeb dros wasanaethau sy'n fawr iawn eu dylanwad ar benderfynyddion cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol anghydraddoldebau iechyd fel trafniadaeth, cynllunio, addysg, tai a datblygu economaidd.

Mae'r ail faes a enwyd gan Townsend yr un mor bwysig, ac yr wyf yn siomedig braidd nad yw'r siaradwyr yn y ddadl hyd yn hyn wedi sôn am yr agwedd bwysig hon. Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos, yn frawychus, y rheolaeth wael a fu ar adnoddau ariannol y GIG yn y gorffennol. Byddai galw'r ddealltwriaeth o'r modd y cafodd yr adnoddau eu gwario a'u monitro yn y gorffennol yn arwynebol yn garedigrwydd â'r gweinyddiaethau blaenorol a'u gweision sifil. Gwn fod cyfarwyddwr newydd GIG Cymru yn rhannu'r pryderon hyn. Cymerwyd camau eisoes i wella'r arferion cyfrifeg a monitro o fewn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fel ceidwaid y pwrs cyhoeddus, rhaid inni gael sicrwydd am y modd yr ydym yn gwario adnoddau hollbwysig, sy'n aml yn brin.

Yn olaf, trof at yr argymhelliad ar y dull uniongyrchol newydd o ariannu'r GIG yng Nghymru. Ni all yr un Aelod sydd wedi cystwyo Llywodraeth San Steffan am beidio ag ariannu'r Cynulliad hwn ar sail anghenion pobl Cymru ddweud yn awr nad oes arnom angen fformiwla GIG sydd wedi'i hariannu yn yr un modd. Credaf hefyd fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau, wrth gymryd y camau hyn, ein bod yn pwysleisio bod y cynigion hyn yn ymwneud â chodi'r safonau i bawb at yr un uchaf ac nid dod â phawb i lawr at y safon fwyaf cyffredin. I gael hynny'n iawn, rhaid inni gydnabod bod angen mwy o waith ar y fformiwla hon i'w mireinio a'i chael yn iawn.

It is incumbent on me as Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee to be realistic about the effects that this formula will achieve. This cannot be, and is not, the end of the matter. It is estimated that the new formula would redistribute only 1.3 per cent of the budget between the current health authority boundaries. Professor Townsend states that this new formula will merely prevent the gap from getting wider between our richer and poorer communities and will not address significantly the existing inequalities in Wales.

Tackling inequalities is a matter of attitudes and practice. We, and those outside this Chamber, can no longer pretend that the health of the people of Wales is simply a matter for Jane Hutt, the Health and Social Services Committee, and health practitioners. We must break down the silos that protect policy-thinking inside and outside this Assembly. Only by working together and considering existing resources creatively will we address these inequalities.

11.05 a.m.

David Davies: I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. Like all other Members, I believe that it is unacceptable that life expectancy varies across different parts of Wales. However, it is disappointing that, instead of thinking about its underlying causes, the Welsh Assembly Government has simply made the assumption that someone earning £200 a week is more likely to fall ill than someone earning £400 a week. That is a simplistic argument. Therefore, it follows that, according to the Welsh Assembly Government, the answer is to invest more money into areas where there are lower-than-average wages. I would contend that that is a classic case of treating the symptoms rather than curing the disease. There is no physical reason why someone earning less money should be worse off. Therefore, the answer must be that a great deal of ill health is down to differing lifestyles. I contend strongly that

Mae'n ddyletswydd arnaf fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fod yn realistig ynghylch yr effeithiau a gaiff y fformiwla hon. Nid hwn yw diwedd y mater, wrth reswm. Amcangyfrifir na fyddai'r fformiwla newydd ond yn ailddosbarthu 1.3 y cant o'r gyllideb rhwng y ffiniau awdurdod iechyd presennol. Dywed yr Athro Townsend na fydd y fformiwla newydd hon ond yn atal y bwlch rhwng ein cymunedau cyfoethocaf a thlotaf rhag mynd yn fwy ac na fydd yn cael effaith sylweddol ar yr anghydraddoldebau presennol yng Nghymru.

Mae mynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldebau'n fater o agweddau ac ymarfer. Ni allwn ni, a'r rhai y tu allan i'r Siambr hon, barhau i gymryd arnom bod iechyd pobl Cymru'n fater i Jane Hutt, y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a'r ymarferwyr iechyd yn unig. Rhaid inni chwalu'r gwahanfuriau o gwmpas y meddwl ynghylch polisi y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r Cynulliad hwn. Dim ond drwy weithio gyda'n gilydd ac ystyried yr adnoddau presennol yn greadigol y byddwn yn ymdrin â'r anghydraddoldebau hyn.

David Davies: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle hwn i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Fel pob Aelod arall, credaf ei bod yn annerbyniol bod y disgwyliad einioes yn amrywio mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, testun siom yw bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn lle meddwl am ei achosion sylfaenol, wedi rhagdybio'n syml fod rhywun sy'n ennill £200 yr wythnos yn fwy tebygol o fynd yn sâl na rhywun sy'n ennill £400 yr wythnos. Mae honno'n ddadl orsyml. Mae'n dilyn, gan hynny, yn ôl Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mai'r ateb yw buddsoddi rhagor o arian mewn ardaloedd lle y mae cyflogau is na'r cyfartaledd. Byddwn yn dadlau bod hyn yn achos clasurol o drin y symptomau yn hytrach na gwella'r clefyd. Nid oes rheswm corfforol pam y dylai rhywun sy'n ennill llai o arian fod yn waeth ei fyd. Felly, y rheswm, o reidrwydd, yw bod llawer o iechyd gwael yn ganlyniad i wahanol ffyrdd o fyw. Yr wyf yn dadlau'n

instead of throwing money into the 22 extra health quangos that this Government has set up, we should be educating people on the benefits of regular exercise, healthy eating—

Peter Black: Do you not accept that if you receive a lower income, inevitably your lifestyle will be much different from that of a millionaire or someone who has a higher income, and that your eating habits and how you live will affect your health?

David Davies: Beer and fags are much more expensive than fresh fruit and regular exercise.

Huw Lewis: David Davies's comments are beneath contempt in the view of my constituents. I represent a community that is literally sick and tired of health inequality and is literally dying for change. Kirsty has quoted the most telling statistic from the CMO's report for this year. The mortality rate in Merthyr Tydfil is 50 per cent higher than in Ceredigion, which has the lowest lowest rate in Wales. The potential for losing years from your life is 50 per cent higher in Merthyr Tydfil than in David Davies's constituency of Monmouth. To quote from the CMO's report, people from the south Wales Valleys:

'report worse physical and mental health than anywhere else in Wales.'

This report puts social justice and redistribution at the heart of the health service. Under these proposals, spending on the health service will be targeted at those communities with the greatest need. It will enshrine the clear principle that such areas will receive the greatest resources. This is a simple, Socialist principle being followed by this administration and is being delivered because of the record increase in resources being made available by Labour in partnership in Wales and in Westminster.

Peter Rogers: David Davies raised an

gryf mai'r hyn y dylem ei wneud, yn lle taflu arian at y 22 cwango iechyd ychwanegol a sefydlodd y Llywodraeth hon, yw addysgu pobl ynghylch manteision ymarfer corff rheolaidd, bwyta'n iach—

Peter Black: Onid ydych yn derbyn, os yw'ch incwm yn llai, ei bod yn anorfod y bydd eich ffordd o fyw'n wahanol iawn i un miliynydd neu rywun sydd ag incwm mwy, ac y bydd eich arferion bwyta a sut yr ydych yn byw'n effeithio ar eich iechyd?

David Davies: Mae cwrw a sigarennau'n ddrutach o lawer na ffrwythau ffres ac ymarfer corff rheolaidd.

Huw Lewis: Mae sylwadau David Davies islaw dirmyg yng ngolwg fy etholwyr i. Yr wyf yn cynrychioli cymuned sydd wedi hen flino, yn llythrennol, ar anghydraddoldeb iechyd ac sy'n marw'n llythrennol o eisiau newid. Mae Kirsty wedi dyfynnu'r ystadegyn mwyaf dadlennol o adroddiad y Prif Swyddog Meddygol am eleni. Mae'r gyfradd marwolaethau ym Merthyr Tudful yn 50 y cant yn uwch nag yng Ngheredigion, sydd â'r gyfradd isaf yng Nghymru. Mae'r posibilïad o golli blynyddoedd o'ch oes yn 50 y cant yn uwch ym Merthyr Tudful nag yn etholaeth David Davies ym Mynwy. Dywed y Prif Swyddog Meddygol yn ei adroddiad bod trigolion Cymoedd y De:

'yn dioddef gwaeth iechyd corfforol ac iechyd meddwl nac unrhyw le arall yng Nghymru.'

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn rhoi lle canolog i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac ailddosbarthu yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. O dan y cynigion hyn, caiff y gwariant ar y gwasanaeth iechyd ei dargedu ar y cymunedau mwyaf anghenus. Bydd yn ymgorffori'r egwyddor amlwg mai ardaloedd o'r fath a fydd yn derbyn yr adnoddau mwyaf. Mae hon yn egwyddor Sosialaidd, syml a ddilynir gan y weinyddiaeth hon ac fe'i cyflawnir oherwydd y cynnydd mwyaf erioed yn yr adnoddau a ddarperir gan Lafur mewn partneriaeth yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan.

Peter Rogers: Cododd David Davies fater o

important issue. You mentioned the figures for your area. I live in an area in Anglesey that has the highest—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Peter, please speak into the microphone, so that we can all hear you.

Peter Rogers: Yes, that is common sense.

I live in an area with the highest unemployment rate in Wales. We also probably have the highest incidence of heart conditions in Wales. What David Davies said about a healthy lifestyle, changing our diets, taking exercise and addressing problems early in life would undoubtedly bring about health improvements. Huw, you are right in what you say about your area, but it is true that we can put much emphasis on taking our health in our own hands.

Huw Lewis: Precisely, Peter, but are we to follow your advice and direct resources to the areas of greatest need, or to listen to David Davies's homilies to the poor? Your party must make up its mind—

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Huw Lewis: I will not give way now, Alun, time is running out.

We must see more of such measures in Wales from this administration. We need more redistribution and more social justice, building on what has already been achieved by Labour in partnership with Westminster and taking the tough decisions on which communities come first in our list of priorities. We must not run away from those decisions. The opposition parties' amendments make interesting reading, but not much more. The Tory amendments show support for the principle of tackling inequalities but then they reject the means by which it will be achieved. The Tory prayer in this debate is, 'Oh, Lord, make me just, but not yet.' Plaid Cymru's amendments simply illustrate that when it has nothing of

bwys. Cyfeiriasoch at y ffigurau am eich ardal chi. Yr wyf yn byw mewn ardal yn Ynys Môn sydd â'r uchaf—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Peter, siaradwch i'r microfôn, os gwelwch yn dda, fel y gall pawb eich clywed.

Peter Rogers: Ie, mae hynny'n beth synhwyrol.

Yr wyf yn byw mewn ardal sydd â'r gyfradd diweithdra uchaf yng Nghymru. Gennym ni hefyd y mae'r nifer fwyaf o achosion o anhwylder ar y galon yng Nghymru, yn ôl pob tebyg. Mae'n sicr y byddai'r hyn a ddywedodd David Davies am ffordd o fyw iach, newid ein deiet, ymarfer corff ac ymdrin â phroblemau'n gynnar mewn bywyd yn sicr o ddod â gwelliannau mewn iechyd. Huw, yr ydych yn iawn yn yr hyn a ddywedwch am eich ardal chi, ond mae'n wir y gallwn roi pwyslais mawr ar ymorol am ein hiechyd ein hunain.

Huw Lewis: Yn union, Peter, ond a ydym i fod i ddilyn eich cyngor chi a chyfeirio adnoddau i'r ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus, neu wrando ar bregethau David Davies i'r tlodion? Rhaid i'ch plaid benderfynu—

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Huw Lewis: Nid ildiaf yn awr, Alun, mae'r amser yn dod i ben.

Rhaid inni weld rhagor o fesurau o'r fath yng Nghymru gan y weinyddiaeth hon. Mae arnom angen mwy o ailddosbarthu a mwy o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, gan ddatblygu'r hyn a gyflawnwyd eisoes gan Lafur mewn partneriaeth â San Steffan a gwneud y penderfyniadau anodd ynghylch pa gymunedau a ddaw'n gyntaf ar ein rhestr flaenoriaethau. Rhaid inni beidio â rhedeg oddi wrth y penderfyniadau hynny. Mae gwelliannau pleidiau'r wrthblaid yn ddeunydd darllen diddorol, ond fawr mwy na hynny. Mae gwelliannau'r Torïaid yn dangos cefnogaeth i'r egwyddor o fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau ond maent yn gwrthod y dull o gyflawni hynny. Gweddi'r Torïaid yn y ddadl hon yw, 'O, Arglwydd, gwna fi'n

substance to say on the big issues it resorts to attacking the Barnett formula.

David Melding *rose*—

Huw Lewis: I do not have time to accept an intervention, David, even though I would love to hear what you have to say.

Plaid Cymru resorts to attacking the Barnett formula, expecting justice from Britain, but running away from implementing justice in Wales. Reforming the Barnett formula is not the answer to capacity in the NHS, but providing for the programme of investment and reform to which the Labour Party is committed is.

However, there are concerns about this formula. In particular there is some disappointment on my part that it does not go far enough. The proposed redistribution is too modest—only 1.3 per cent. The redistribution through growth will mean that change will not be quick enough for my liking. I am also concerned about the use of the Welsh health survey as the basis for the new formula. I am happy to accept assurances that it is robust, but nevertheless I would welcome an assurance from the Minister that any examples of under-reporting, particularly from deprived communities, are considered and given appropriate weighting.

I will just wind up, John.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Do so quickly: you have ten seconds.

Huw Lewis: Finally, I have serious concerns about the work that is still to be undertaken by the research team on searching for additional costs in rural areas. They were not found in the initial study—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Huw, you are not winding up; you are going on to

gyfiawn, ond nid eto.' Nid yw gwelliannau Plaid Cymru ond yn dangos, pan nad oes ganddi rywbeth sylweddol i'w ddweud ar y materion pwysig, ei bod yn troi at ymosod ar fformiwla Barnett.

David Melding *a gododd*—

Huw Lewis: Nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser i dderbyn ymyriad, David, er y byddwn wrth fy modd yn clywed beth sydd gennych i'w ddweud.

Mae Plaid Cymru'n troi at ymosod ar fformiwla Barnett, gan ddisgwyl cyfiawnder gan Brydain, ond yn ffoi rhag gweithredu cyfiawnder yng Nghymru. Nid diwygio fformiwla Barnett yw'r ateb o ran capasiti yn y GIG, ond darparu ar gyfer y rhaglen o fuddsoddi a diwygio y mae'r Plaid Lafur wedi ymrwmo iddi.

Er hynny, mae pryderon ynghylch y fformiwla hon. Yn benodol, yr wyf wedi siomi braidd nad yw'n mynd yn ddigon pell. Mae'r ailddosbarthu arfaethedig yn rhy fach—dim ond 1.3 y cant. Bydd yr ailddosbarthu drwy dwf yn golygu na fydd y newid yn ddigon cyflym at fy nant i. Yr wyf yn bryderus hefyd ynghylch defnyddio arolwg iechyd Cymru yn sail i'r fformiwla newydd. Yr wyf yn falch o dderbyn sicrwydd ei fod yn ddibynadwy ond, er hynny, hoffwn gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd unrhyw enghreifftiau o danadrodd, yn enwedig mewn cymunedau difreintiedig, yn cael eu hystyried a'u pwysoli'n briodol.

Ni wnaf ond terfynu, John.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gwnewch hynny'n gyflym: mae gennych ddeg eiliad.

Huw Lewis: Yn olaf, mae gennyf bryderon o ddifrif ynghylch y gwaith sydd i'w wneud o hyd gan y tîm ymchwil ar chwilio am gostau ychwanegol mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ni ddaethpwyd o hyd iddynt yn yr astudiaeth ddechreuol—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Huw, nid ydych yn terfynu; yr ydych yn mynd ymlaen at

another topic. 'Wind up' means that you bring your remarks to a close. Please do so.

Huw Lewis: Just to wind up, John, this report is welcome, socially just, and right. However, it is not enough and it is time for us to turn our minds to other spending streams within this institution, not just health. If it is just for health, it is also just for other areas.

Peter Law: David Davies's remarks in relation to the deprived and poor communities that need a change in the formula underline my previous comments when I said that the Conservative amendments are political dross—as indeed they are. What he said this morning was a disgrace, but that is not unusual. He should be apologising for the 18 years of Conservative Government that put those people in such a position.

Alun Cairns: Do you accept that fresh fruit and vegetables are relatively cheap in comparison to ready-made meals? It would be far better for resources to be spent on educating young people to use fresh fruit and vegetables in a more productive way. That would lead to them spending less on food, allowing them to improve their lifestyle in other ways.

Peter Law: That is another disgraceful and humiliating comment from a well-heeled Tory who should know better than to say such things about people whom he and his party helped to keep down. It is because of the Conservatives that my constituency has the lowest average wage in Britain.

I thank the Minister, Jane Hutt, for her work on this, which is vital.

Kirsty Williams: Do you agree that David Davies's crass and insulting comments and those of some of his colleagues this morning show a lack of understanding of what drives this report? It is not about fruit and vegetables; it is about the effects of living in a dangerous environment, in a poorly

bwnc arall. Mae 'terfynu' yn golygu'ch bod yn dirwyn eich sylwadau i ben. Gwnewch hynny, os gwelwch yn dda.

Huw Lewis: A dim ond terfynu, John, mae'r adroddiad hwn i'w groesawu, mae'n gymdeithasol gyfiawn, ac yn gywir. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ddigon ac mae'n bryd inni droi ein meddyliau at ffynonellau cyllido eraill o fewn y sefydliad hwn, nid iechyd yn unig. Os yw'n gyfiawn i iechyd, mae hefyd yn gyfiawn i feysydd eraill.

Peter Law: Mae sylwadau David Davies ynghylch y cymunedau difreintiedig a thlawd y mae arnynt angen newid yn y fformiwla yn tanlinellu fy sylwadau blaenorol pan ddywedais mai sothach gwleidyddol yw gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr—ac felly y maent. Yr oedd yr hyn a ddywedodd y bore yma'n warthus, ond nid yw hynny'n anarferol. Dylai ymddiheuro am y 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Geidwadol a roddodd y bobl hynny mewn sefyllfa o'r fath.

Alun Cairns: A ydych yn derbyn bod ffrwythau a llysiau ffres yn gymharol rad o'u cymharu â phrydau parod? Byddai'n well o lawer gwario adnoddau ar addysgu pobl ifanc i ddefnyddio ffrwythau a llysiau ffres yn fwy cynhyrchiol. O ganlyniad i hynny byddent yn gwario llai ar fwyd, fel bod modd iddynt wella eu ffordd o fyw drwy ddulliau eraill.

Peter Law: Mae hwnnw'n sylw gwarthus a gwaradwyddus arall gan Dori da ei fyd a ddylai wybod yn well na dweud pethau o'r fath am bobl y mae ef a'i blaid wedi helpu i'w gormesu. Oherwydd y Ceidwadwyr y mae gan fy etholaeth i y cyflog cyfartalog isaf ym Mhrydain.

Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog, Jane Hutt, am ei gwaith ar hyn, sy'n hollbwysig.

Kirsty Williams: A ydych yn cytuno bod sylwadau di-ddeall a gwaradwyddus David Davies a rhai ei gyd-Aelodau y bore yma yn amlygu diffyg dealltwriaeth o'r hyn sy'n cymhell yr adroddiad hwn? Nid yw'n ymwneud â ffrwythau a llysiau; mae'n ymwneud ag effeithiau byw mewn

ventilated or insulated house, and of not having a job. It is not about whether you drink or smoke, or eat fresh fruit and vegetables. It is about living in a poor environment—

11:15 a.m.

David Davies *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I cannot allow an intervention on an intervention. There are only 10 minutes left for this debate.

Peter Law: This is not about failing; it is about ignoring. That is what the Conservatives do; they ignore people in deprived communities, as they have always done. My community is an example of that. That is why it is where it is today, as is Merthyr Tydfil and Rhondda. The Conservatives should never forget that.

Gareth Jones: Cytunaf 100 y cant â chi, Peter. Mae gennym anghenion, a chymunedau sy'n dioddef. Dylem flaenoriaethu a thargedu'r cymunedau hynny. Serch hynny, a gytunwch fod y Llywodraeth hon wedi gwastraffu bron i £40 miliwn ar yr awdurdodau iechyd hynny na allai dalu'u ffordd? Y rhai na lwyddai i gyfrifo a gafodd yr arian hwnnw ar draul y cymunedau y cyfeiriwch atynt, ac yn sicr ar draul awdurdodau iechyd yn y Gogledd.

Peter Law: I will talk on that in a moment. However, it ill behoves anyone who voted in favour of giving £56 million to a concert hall across the road to talk to me about money going on anything else. Unfortunately, that is what your party did.

I thank Jane for her excellent work. I also thank Professor Townsend because this report will make a difference, certainly in Blaenau Gwent. Quite frankly, the Plaid Cymru amendments are either about history or an obsession with the Barnett formula. People are dying while we fiddle. We must pursue this matter now. This needs all-party

amgylchedd peryglus, mewn tŷ sydd wedi'i awyru neu'i inswleiddio'n wael, a bod heb swydd. Nid yw'n ymwneud â pha un a ydych yn yfed neu'n ysmegu, neu'n bwyta ffrwythau a llysiau ffres. Mae'n ymwneud â byw mewn amgylchedd tlawd—

David Davies *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni allaf ganiatáu ymyriad ag ymyriad. Dim ond 10 munud sydd ar ôl ar gyfer y ddatl hon.

Peter Law: Nid oes a wnelo hyn â methu; mae'n ymwneud ag anwybyddu. Dyna a wnaiff y Ceidwadwyr; maent yn anwybyddu pobl mewn cymunedau difreintiedig, fel y gwnaethant erioed. Mae fy nghymuned i'n enghraifft o hynny. Dyna pam y mae fel y mae heddiw, fel y mae Merthyr Tudful a Rhondda. Ni ddylai'r Ceidwadwyr fyth anghofio hynny.

Gareth Jones: I agree with you 100 per cent, Peter. We have needs, and communities that are suffering. We should prioritise and target those communities. However, do you agree that this Government has squandered nearly £40 million on health authorities that could not pay their way? Those that could not balance their books obtained that money at the expense of the communities to which you refer, and certainly at the expense of health authorities in north Wales.

Peter Law: Siaradaf am hynny ymhen eiliad. Er hynny, prin ei fod yn briodol i rywun a bleidleisiodd o blaid rhoi £56 miliwn at neuadd gyngerdd dros y ffordd siarad â mi am roi arian at rywbeth arall. Gwaetha'r modd, dyna a wnaeth eich plaid chi.

Diolchaf i Jane am ei gwaith rhagorol. Diolchaf hefyd i'r Athro Townsend oherwydd bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth, yn sicr ym Mlaenau Gwent. A bod yn hollol onest, mae gwelliannau Plaid Cymru'n ymwneud naill ai â hanes neu ag obsesiwn â fformiwla Barnett. Mae pobl yn marw tra ydym yn ffidlan. Rhaid inni fynd i'r

support. My constituency of Blaenau Gwent—and I spoke of this in November 2000 when we discussed a fairer funding formula—has the second-highest mortality rate in Wales. Page 61 of the document shows that it now has the highest rate for heart disease. It has the highest rate of low birth weights in Wales, the highest level of tooth decay for under-fives, and the highest level of conceptions among those aged under-18. Speech therapy is a major concern, of which I have spoken many times. All of this is compounded by the lowest average wage. Everything comes from economic stability; without it, you cannot develop a community that has those things that give people a reasonable quality of life. That has been the case in my area for a long time. That is why, as I am sure you will understand, I support this report. I am concerned that Gwent has the lowest number of hospital beds per 1,000 of the population. I hope that that will be considered. When you examine the document, you will see that women's life expectancy in parts of Wales between 1995 and 1997 had not reached the 1986 UK level. That was in Caerphilly, Merthyr Tydfil and Blaenau Gwent. We should be concerned. We must move forward with a fairer system of funding as soon as possible.

I believe that it was courageous to write-off the debt of Dyfed Powys Health Authority. I welcome the move, and will not criticise it. However, Gwent has a similar problem that must be considered. There are general practitioners in Gwent who feel that they will be unable to advance the recovery plan there because they face further cuts in the future. I hope that the Minister can give that problem sympathetic consideration. We are picking up the tab for past years of underfunding. If we are serious about wanting to do something positive, providing social justice, and improving people's health in deprived areas, we must support this report and its recommendations. Anything less would render us guilty of perpetuating inequality and injustice in areas of high social

afael â'r mater hwn yn awr. Mae'n gofyn cefnogaeth gan yr holl bleidiau. Mae gan fy etholaeth i, Blaenau Gwent—a soniais am hyn yn Nhachwedd 2000 pan oeddem yn trafod fformiwla ariannu decach—y gyfradd marwolaethau ail uchaf yng Nghymru. Mae tudalen 61 o'r ddogfen yn dangos mai ganddi hi'n awr y mae'r gyfradd uchaf ar gyfer clefyd y galon. Ganddi hi y mae'r gyfradd uchaf o bwysau geni isel yng Nghymru, a'r lefel uchaf o bydredd y dannedd ymysg rhai o dan bum mlwydd oed, a'r lefel uchaf o genhedlu ymysg y rhai o dan 18 mlwydd oed. Mae therapi lleferydd yn destun pryder mawr y soniais amdano lawer gwaith. Gwaethygir hyn oll gan y cyflog cyfartalog isaf. Daw popeth o sefydlogrwydd economaidd; hebdo, ni allwch ddatblygu cymuned sy'n meddu ar y pethau hynny sy'n rhoi ansawdd bywyd rhesymol i bobl. Mae hynny'n wir am fy ardal i ers amser hir. Dyna pam yr wyf fi, fel y byddwch yn deall yr wyf yn siŵr, yn cefnogi'r adroddiad hwn. Yr wyf yn bryderus mai gan Went y mae'r nifer leiaf o welyau ysbyty y 1,000 o'r boblogaeth. Gobeithiaf y rhoddir ystyriaeth i hynny. Pan edrychwch ar y ddogfen, fe welwch nad oedd disgwyliad einioes benywod mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru rhwng 1995 a 1997 wedi cyrraedd lefel y DU yn 1986. Yr oedd hynny yng Nghaerffili, Merthyr Tudful a Blaenau Gwent. Dylem fod yn bryderus. Rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen â system ariannu decach cyn gynted â phosibl.

Credaf mai cam dewr oedd dileu dyled Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys. Croesawaf y cam hwnnw, ac ni wnaef ei feirniadu. Fodd bynnag, mae gan Went broblem debyg y mae'n rhaid ei hystyried. Mae ymarferwyr cyffredinol yng Ngwent sy'n teimlo na fyddant yn gallu hyrwyddo'r cynllun adfer yno am eu bod yn wynebu toriadau pellach yn y dyfodol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu ystyried y broblem honno â chydymdeimlad. Yr ydym yn talu'r pris am danariannu yn y blynyddoedd a fu. Os ydym o ddifrif am wneud rhywbeth cadarnhaol, darparu cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, a gwella iechyd pobl mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, rhaid inni gefnogi'r adroddiad hwn a'i argymhellion. Byddai dim llai na hynny'n peri ein bod yn euog o barhau

exclusion. I hope that all Members support the motion.

Lorraine Barrett: My point pales into insignificance, perhaps, following the contributions made by Huw and Peter Law. However, I raise it now with the Minister, whom I know is sympathetic to the special health needs of Cardiff. I highlight the pressures on the city's accident and emergency services, now that Cardiff is virtually a 24/7 city—which means 24 hours, seven days a week. There has been an increase in alcohol-related crime, injuries and accidents. The findings of the targeting alcohol-related street crime project, which was set up by the South Wales Police and the University Hospital of Wales in response to this increase, help to highlight the special needs of the capital city, as well as the needs of Swansea and Newport—which will become a city in 10 minutes or so—in dealing with the extra pressures related to city life, which also include homelessness and drug abuse. This is a small but important point that I hope that the Minister will consider.

Christine Chapman: This report is long overdue. We know that, for too long, people in the poorer areas have suffered poorer healthcare and this level of inequality must be addressed if we are to overcome the disparity of health that exists across Wales. In the Cynon Valley, as in other Valley areas, many of our communities suffer from a substantial level of ill health, associated with some of the highest incidents of poverty and deprivation in Wales. Life expectancy varies depending on where you live, and it is appalling to contemplate that a child born in the Cynon Valley today can expect to live for a shorter time than a child born in one of our more affluent areas. On average, residents in the Cynon Valley are more likely to suffer from heart disease, respiratory problems, joint conditions and diabetes. In addition to this, the number admitted to hospital is higher than the Welsh average; there are higher levels of teenage pregnancy; they are

anhydraddoldeb ac anghyfiawnder mewn ardaloedd lle y mae llawer o allgáu cymdeithasol. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr holl Aelodau'n cefnogi'r cynnig.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae'r pwynt sydd gennyf yn un dibwys, o bosibl, ar ôl y cyfraniadau gan Huw a Peter Law. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ei godi'n awr gyda'r Gweinidog, sydd â chydymdeimlad, fe wn, ag anghenion iechyd arbennig Caerdydd. Tynnaf sylw at y pwysau ar wasanaethau damweiniau ac argyfwng y ddinas, gan fod Caerdydd yn awr ymron â bod yn ddinas 24/7—sy'n golygu 24 awr, saith niwrnod yr wythnos. Bu cynnydd mewn troseddu, anafiadau a damweiniau sy'n gysylltiedig ag alcohol. Mae canfyddiadau'r prosiect targedu troseddu ar y stryd sy'n gysylltiedig ag alcohol, a sefydlwyd gan Heddlu De Cymru ac Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru mewn ymateb i'r cynnydd hwn, o gymorth i dynnu sylw at anghenion arbennig y brifddinas, yn ogystal ag anghenion Abertawe a Chasnewydd—a ddaw'n ddinas ymhen rhyw 10 munud—wrth ddelio â'r pwysau ychwanegol sy'n ymwneud â bywyd dinas, sydd hefyd yn cynnwys digartrefedd a chamddefnyddio cyffuriau. Pwynt bach ond pwysig yw hwn y gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei ystyried.

Christine Chapman: Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn un hir-ddisgwyliedig. Gwyddom fod pobl yn yr ardaloedd tlotaf, ers gormod o amser, yn dioddef gan ofal iechyd gwaeth a rhaid rhoi sylw i anhydraddoldeb o'r fath os ydym i drechu'r anghyfartaledd mewn iechyd a geir ledled Cymru. Yng Nghwm Cynon, yn yr un modd ag mewn ardaloedd eraill yn y Cymoedd, mae nifer fawr o'n cymunedau'n dioddef llawer o afiechyd, sy'n gysylltiedig â rhai o'r achosion gwaethaf o dlodi ac amddifadedd yng Nghymru. Mae'r disgwyliad einioes yn amrywio yn ôl pa le'r ydych yn byw, ac mae'n ofnadwy meddwl y gall plentyn a enir yng Nghwm Cynon heddiw ddisgwyl byw am lai o amser na plentyn a enir yn un o'n hardaloedd mwy cefnog. Ar gyfartaledd, mae trigolion Cwm Cynon yn fwy tebygol o ddiodeff gan glefyd y galon, problemau resbiradol, anhwylderau ar y cymalau a'r clefyd siwgwr. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r nifer a dderbynnir i'r ysbyty yn

more likely to smoke; and there is a low uptake of preventative healthcare such as screening and immunisation programmes. These problems do not appear overnight; they are symptoms of years of poverty and deprivation. It is right and proper for the review of funding to address that and the Assembly should not shrink from it.

This review has also highlighted the importance of a more joined-up approach to health and wellbeing. This is welcome and I appreciate the comments made by Kirsty and Brian Gibbons. We have talked about other factors, including education and joblessness, which are important. The health inequalities fund has been a welcome initiative in targeting our most vulnerable groups.

I take issue with Geraint Davies because we are seeing many good initiatives: in Cynon Valley, for example, we are already attracting more GPs. There is much more to do, but we know that things are happening. One of the successes of the Assembly Government's policies is the commitment it has given to ensuring that health professionals work in partnership and not in competition, because that way of working serves no-one.

Brian Gibbons: The Chief Medical Officer for Wales told us yesterday that the teenage pregnancy rate in Wales is falling. Presumably David Davies and Alun Cairns would say that this is due to young women saying no, but the more likely reason is that our Labour Government offers people better social prospects and the chance of a better lifestyle.

Christine Chapman: You are right, it concerns low aspirations. Expectations have been low in areas such as the Valleys for too many years. I hope that that will be addressed through the Assembly's policies.

Alun Cairns: Will the Member give way?

uwch na'r cyfartaledd yng Nghymru; mae mwy o feichiogrwydd ymysg rhai yn eu harddegau; maent yn fwy tebygol o ysmegu; ac mae derbyniad isel i ofal iechyd ataliol fel rhaglenni sgrinio ac imiwneiddio. Nid yw problemau o'r fath yn ymddangos dros nos; maent yn symptomau o flynyddoedd o dlodi ac amddifadedd. Mae'n iawn ac yn briodol i'r adolygiad o ariannu ymdrin â hynny ac ni ddylai'r Cynulliad ymgadw rhagddo.

Mae'r adolygiad hwn wedi tynnu sylw hefyd at bwysigrwydd dull mwy cydgyssylltiedig o ymwneud ag iechyd a lles. Mae hyn i'w groesawu a gwerthfawrogi y sylwadau gan Kirsty a Brian Gibbons. Yr ydym wedi sôn am ffactorau eraill, gan gynnwys addysg a diweithdra, sy'n bwysig. Bu'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn fenter i'w chrosawu am ei bod yn targedu'r grwpiau sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed.

Anghytunaf â Geraint Davies oherwydd yr ydym yn gweld llawer o fentrau da: yng Nghwm Cynon, er enghraifft, yr ydym eisoes yn denu mwy o feddygon teulu. Mae llawer rhagor i'w wneud, ond gwyddom fod pethau'n digwydd. Un o lwyddiannau polisïau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw ei hymrwymiad i sicrhau bod gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn gweithio ar y cyd ac nid yn cystadlu, oherwydd nid yw'r dull hwnnw o weithio o fudd i neb.

Brian Gibbons: Dywedodd Prif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru wrthym ddoe fod y gyfradd beichiogrwydd ymysg rhai yn eu harddegau yng Nghymru'n disgyn. Mae'n debyg y byddai David Davies ac Alun Cairns yn dweud bod hynny am fod benywod ifanc yn dweud na, ond y rheswm mwy tebygol yw bod ein Llywodraeth Lafur yn cynnig gwell rhagolygon cymdeithasol i bobl a chyfle i gael gwell ffordd o fyw.

Christine Chapman: Yr ydych yn iawn, mae'n ymwneud â dyheadau isel. Mae'r disgwyliadau'n isel mewn ardaloedd fel y Cymoedd ers gormod o flynyddoedd. Gobeithiaf y caiff hynny sylw drwy bolisiau'r Cynulliad.

Alun Cairns: A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Christine Chapman: No. I want to finish. I draw Members' attention to the collaborative work already being undertaken by the local health group in our area with the health professionals and the community. All of us are pleased that, finally, we have draft plans to modernise healthcare in the Cynon Valley. Once approved, these plans will include two new primary care resource centres, and a new redesigned neighbourhood hospital. I will be closely involved with this over the coming months.

Christine Chapman: Na wnaf. Yr wyf am orffen. Tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at y gwaith cydweithredol a wneir eisoes gan y grŵp iechyd lleol yn ein hardal gyda'r gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol a'r gymuned. Yr ydym oll yn falch bod gennym, o'r diwedd, gynlluniau drafft i foderneiddio gofal iechyd yng Nghwm Cynon. Ar ôl eu cymeradwyo, bydd y cynlluniau hyn yn cynnwys dwy ganolfan adnoddau gofal sylfaenol, ac ysbyty cymdogaethol newydd wedi'i ailgynllunio. Byddaf yn ymwneud yn fanwl â hyn dros y misoedd sydd i ddod.

In conclusion, I welcome the Townsend report, as will my constituents. Cynon Valley has felt for many years that it has been the poor relation. This report will fundamentally change that, and it is testimony once again to the way in which this Labour-led Assembly is getting on with the job of delivering for the people of Wales.

I derfynu, yr wyf yn croesawu adroddiad Townsend, fel y bydd fy etholwyr. Mae Cwm Cynon yn teimlo ers blynyddoedd lawer mai ef yw'r perthynas tlawd. Bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn newid hynny'n sylfaenol, ac mae'n brawf unwaith eto o'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad hwn o dan arweiniad Llafur yn mynd ymlaen â'r gwaith o gyflawni er mwyn pobl Cymru.

11:25 a.m.

The Minister for Health and Social Service (Jane Hutt): I thank the contributors to today's debate. We had consensus at the beginning of the debate on the need to tackle the causes of ill health. That slipped when David Melding spoke, but I will refer to it again. There are notable exceptions in terms of understanding the causes of ill health in Wales. However, there is considerable unanimity in the Assembly that we must combat poverty and ill health by tackling the causes of ill health and by allocating our resources according to proven health needs—based on scientific evidence as well as political principle—in our poorest communities.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Diolchaf i'r cyfranwyr i'r ddadl heddiw. Yr oedd gennym gonsensws ar ddechrau'r ddadl ar yr angen i fynd i'r afael ag achosion afiechyd. Fe lithrodd y pwnc pan siaradodd David Melding, ond byddaf yn cyfeirio ato eto. Mae eithriadau nodedig o ran deall achosion afiechyd yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae cryn unfrydedd yn y Cynulliad bod yn rhaid inni ymladd tlodi ac afiechyd drwy fynd i'r afael ag achosion afiechyd a thrwy ddyrannu'n hadnoddau yn ôl anghenion iechyd a brofwyd—ar sail tystiolaeth wyddonol yn ogystal ag egwyddor wleidyddol—yn ein cymunedau tlotaf.

David Melding said that he wanted to delay the implementation process although he was supportive of the Townsend review. I appreciate his involvement in the national steering group. However, with respect, April 2003 is the best time to implement this process. As Lynne Neagle, Huw Lewis, Peter Law, Christine Chapman and others have said, we must address health inequalities

Dywedodd David Melding ei fod yn dymuno gohirio'r broses weithredu er ei fod yn cefnogi adolygiad Townsend. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'r rhan a gymerodd yn y grŵp llywio cenedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, gyda pharch, Ebrill 2003 yw'r adeg orau i roi'r broses hon ar waith. Fel y dywedodd Lynne Neagle, Huw Lewis, Peter Law, Christine Chapman ac eraill, rhaid inni roi sylw i

now. I am committed to that.

The Welsh Health Survey is also helping to identify health needs. The survey is based on unitary authority boundaries, which are the same as those of our existing local health groups and the new local health boards that will be developed. Health needs are highlighted in the Welsh Health Survey. The 'Mapping Social Exclusion in Wales' directory, which came from the Welsh Health Survey in 1999, showed figures for life expectancy, mortality, and health and wellbeing across Wales. The Office for National Statistics has backed the robust nature of that survey.

Geraint Davies: Do you agree that we must go beneath the local health group level to get to the problem? As I explained in my speech, there are big discrepancies within local health group areas.

Jane Hutt: I will deal with that point in a minute. First, I want to answer Huw Lewis's point about the validity of the Welsh Health Survey. We held a sample survey through NOP Research Group of those who had not participated in the Welsh Health Survey, which was also validated by the Office for National Statistics. That is why it is so important to be guided by an independent research team, which enables us to back-up the use of the health survey. The findings of the 1998 resource allocation working groups and the census on life-limiting illness lean in the same direction in terms of targeting resources as a result of the Welsh Health Survey.

I will repeat what I said in my opening speech: no area will receive less than its current level of resources, including cost inflation and allowance to reflect the unavoidable costs of travel in rural areas and age-related adjustments. That is the significance of the growth that this Government has introduced to the health service. Geraint's point is important. The health inequalities fund of £14 million, in which we will continue to invest in, is

anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn awr. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i hynny.

Mae Arolwg Iechyd Cymru hefyd o gymorth wrth ganfod anghenion iechyd. Mae'r arolwg yn seiliedig ar ffiniau'r awdurdodau unedol, sydd yr un peth â rhai'r grwpiau iechyd lleol presennol a'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd a gaiff eu datblygu. Amlygir yr anghenion iechyd yn Arolwg Iechyd Cymru. Yr oedd y cyfarwyddiadur 'Mapio Dieithrwrch Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru', a ddeilliodd o Arolwg Iechyd Cymru yn 1999, yn cynnwys ffigurau am ddisgwyliad einioes, marwolaeth, ac iechyd a lles ledled Cymru. Mae'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol wedi cadarnhau bod yr arolwg hwnnw'n ddibynadwy.

Geraint Davies: A gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni fynd yn is na lefel y grwpiau iechyd lleol i gyrraedd y broblem? Fel yr eglurais yn fy araith, mae gwahaniaethau mawr oddi mewn i ardaloedd y grwpiau iechyd lleol.

Jane Hutt: Deliaf â'r pwynt hwnnw yn y munud. Yn gyntaf, yr wyf am ateb pwynt Huw Lewis am ddilysrwydd Arolwg Iechyd Cymru. Bu inni gynnal arolwg sampl drwy Grŵp Ymchwil NOP o'r rhai nad oeddent wedi cymryd rhan yn Arolwg Iechyd Cymru, a dilyswyd hwnnw hefyd gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol. Dyna pam y mae mor bwysig cael arweiniad tîm ymchwil annibynnol, sy'n ein galluogi i ategu'r defnydd o'r arolwg iechyd. Mae canfyddiadau'r gweithgorau dyrannu adnoddau yn 1998 a'r cyfrifiad o salwch sy'n cyfyngu ar fywyd yn tueddu i'r un cyfeiriad o ran targedu adnoddau o ganlyniad i Arolwg Iechyd Cymru.

Dywedaf eto yr hyn a ddywedais yn fy araith agoriadol: ni fydd yr un ardal yn derbyn llai o adnoddau nag y mae ar hyn o bryd, gan gynnwys cynnydd mewn costau a lwfans i adlewyrchu costau teithio anochel mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac addasiadau sy'n gysylltiedig ag oedran. Dyna bwysigrwydd y twf a feijjrinodd y Llywodraeth hon yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae pwynt Geraint yn bwysig. Mae'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd o £14 miliwn, y byddwn yn parhau i

targeting communities in local authority and local health board areas. In my constituency in the Vale of Glamorgan, we have the Barry Healthy Heart scheme. In Ann's constituency in north Wales, and across Wales, health inequalities—particularly in relation to heart disease—are tackled by such schemes that can target beneath the unitary authority areas.

As my colleagues have said, in March 2000, the Labour Chancellor of the Exchequer heralded the largest ever increase in spending since the inception of the NHS. When I became Minister for Health and Social Services, we had a budget of £2.6 billion, which will rise to £3.7 billion by 2003. That is the largest ever increase in funding in the NHS, and we must target that now, David. We cannot allow any slippage on that resource allocation, on which we are agreed. On Brian Hancock's point about the Barnett formula, we are spending more on health as a result of devolution. The Assembly decided to spend more as a result of the increase in our allocation in the Chancellor's 2000 budget—an increasingly sensible budget. You have the gall, Brian, to say that we do not spend the money. Do you not read your Committee papers? You are a member of the Health and Social Services Committee—

Brian Hancock and Peter Rogers *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I cannot allow several Members to be standing at the same time.

Brian Hancock: Why was there an underspend of £45 million on last year's health budget.

Jane Hutt: So you do not read your Committee papers?

Brian Hancock: I do.

Jane Hutt: You do not recognise that the

fuddsoddi ynnddi, yn targedu cymunedau o fewn ffiniau awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd lleol. Yn fy etholaeth i ym Mro Morgannwg, mae gennym gynllun o'r enw Barry Healthy Heart. Yn etholaeth Ann yn y Gogledd, a ledled Cymru, fe ymdrinnir ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd—yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun clefyd y galon—drwy gynlluniau tebyg y gellir eu targedu at lefel is nag ardaloedd awdurdodau unedol.

Fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelodau, ym Mawrth 2000, cyhoeddodd y Canghellor y Trysorlys y cynnydd mwyaf erioed mewn gwariant ers sefydlu'r GIG. Pan gefais fy mhenodi yn Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yr oedd gennym gyllideb o £2.6 biliwn, a bydd hynny'n codi i £3.7 biliwn erbyn 2003. Dyna'r cynnydd mwyaf erioed yng nghyllideb y GIG, a rhaid inni dargedu hwnnw'n awr, David. Ni allwn ganiatáu unrhyw lithriant ar ddyrannu'r adnoddau yr ydym wedi cytuno arnynt. Ynghylch pwynt Brian Hancock am fformiwla Barnett, yr ydym yn gwario mwy ar iechyd o ganlyniad i ddatganoli. Penderfynodd y Cynulliad wario mwy o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd yn ein dyraniad yng nghyllideb y Canghellor yn 2000—cyllideb sy'n fwyfwy synhwyrol. Buoch yn ddigon haerllug, Brian, â dweud nad ydym yn gwario'r arian. Onid ydych yn darllen eich papurau Pwyllgor? Yr ydych yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—

Brian Hancock a Peter Rogers *a godasant*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni allaf ganiatáu i nifer o Aelodau fod ar eu traed yr un pryd.

Brian Hancock: Pam yr oedd £45 miliwn o danwariant yng nghyllideb iechyd y llynedd?

Jane Hutt: Felly nid ydych yn darllen eich papurau Pwyllgor?

Brian Hancock: Yr ydwyf.

Jane Hutt: Nid ydych yn sylweddoli bod y

Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, Edwina Hart, by careful management enabled us to obtain £48 million last October for an all-Wales capital renewal programme, which is means new equipment and new adaptations in hospitals and communities across Wales. Financial management is ensuring that every penny of our health budget is being spent.

Kirsty, you are right to draw us back to the dual strategy. It is about listening to our Chief Medical Officer, who spoke to us yesterday about the importance of local government and the voluntary sector in tackling the causes of health inequality. That is at the heart of our reforms in Wales. Who sits on our local health boards? It is local government, the voluntary sector and health professionals that will guide us in dealing with housing, the environment, public protection, and all the issues that local health groups address. Christine described what a local health group in her area is already doing under the leadership of general practitioners, local government and the voluntary sector.

Peter Rogers: Do you agree that all the extra money that you are investing in the health service will be to no avail unless the crisis in the care and residential homes sector is addressed? When you consider that hospital costs are £1,000 per day, and £1,000 per week in community hospitals, unless we can move the occupiers of beds into secondary care, the whole service will face complete shutdown.

Jane Hutt: I am addressing this issue firmly and, as I announced yesterday, and additional £7 million will be invested to deal with it.

In considering David and Peter's misguided notions, based on Tory principles, about health and health promotion, we must recognise that we are doing a great deal across the board. It was national no-smoking day yesterday, and a smoking cessation event will be held at lunchtime. We are doing a

Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, Edwina Hart, drwy reoli gofalus wedi'n galluogi i gael £48 miliwn fis Hydref diwethaf ar gyfer rhaglen adnewyddu cyfalaf i Gymru gyfan, sy'n golygu y bydd offer newydd ac addasiadau newydd mewn ysbytai a chymunedau ledled Cymru. Mae'r rheolaeth ariannol yn sicrhau y caiff pob ceiniog o'n cyllideb iechyd ei gwario.

Kirsty, yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddod â ni'n ôl at y strategaeth ddeuol. Mae'n bwysig inni wrando ar ein Prif Swyddog Meddygol, a siaradodd â ni ddoe am bwysigrwydd llywodraeth leol a'r sector gwirfoddol wrth fynd i'r afael ag achosion anghydraddoldeb iechyd. Mae hynny wrth wraidd ein diwygiadau yng Nghymru. Pwy sy'n eistedd ar ein byrddau iechyd lleol? Llywodraeth leol, y sector gwirfoddol a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yw'r rhai a fydd yn ein harwain wrth ddelio â thai, yr amgylchedd, gwarchod y cyhoedd, a'r holl faterion y mae'r grwpiau iechyd lleol yn ymwneud â hwy. Disgrifiodd Christine beth y mae grŵp iechyd lleol yn ei hardal hi'n ei wneud eisoes o dan arweiniad ymarferwyr cyffredinol, llywodraeth leol a'r sector gwirfoddol.

Peter Rogers: A ydych yn cytuno na fydd yr holl arian ychwanegol yr ydych yn ei fuddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn tycio dim os na roddir sylw i'r argyfwng yn y sector cartrefi gofal a phreswyl? Pan ystyriwch fod costau ysbytai yn £1,000 y diwrnod, ac yn £1,000 yr wythnos mewn ysbytai cymunedol, os na allwn symud y rhai sydd yn y gwelyau i ofal eilaidd, mae'n bosibl y bydd yr holl wasanaeth yn gorfod cau'n gyfan gwbl.

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn ymdrin yn benderfynol â'r mater hwn ac, fel y cyhoeddais ddoe, buddsoddir £7 miliwn ychwanegol i ddelio ag ef.

Wrth ystyried syniadau cyfeiliornus David a Peter, sy'n seiliedig ar egwyddorion Toriaidd, am iechyd a hybu iechyd, rhaid inni sylweddoli ein bod yn gwneud llawer yn gyffredinol. Yr oedd yn ddiwrnod dim ysmegu cenedlaethol ddoe, a chynhelir digwyddiad rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu amser

great deal in our communities to improve health. That is the key point. This is about improving health, but it also concerns how we move matters forward. First, David, people want jobs, good housing and a good environment, a decent income, fairness, justice and equality. They do not want David Davies preaching to them about their smoking and health habits.

David Davies: The Minister is just repeating what we all know. Of course people want jobs and good houses. We all know that, so why is she bothering to tell us? The fact is that you accept that a high level of smoking, drinking and eating unhealthily causes health problems. You have accepted that. That was precisely the point that Alun Cairns and I made. Why must you turn everything into political point scoring?

Jane Hutt: You chose to stand up to try to undermine these important programmes that are part of health improvement. Peter Townsend said that we must address this as a strategy recognised by everyone in the Assembly: the Economic Development Committee and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning; and the Minister for Environment and every Member. We must all consider the whole picture of improving health and opportunities, not decry how people, particularly the poorest people in Wales, live.

David Melding: I raise a point of consensus, or agreement: as it is national no-smoking week, do you welcome the fact that David Davies and Alun Cairns are now committed to an aggressive campaign against tobaccoists and brewers?

Jane Hutt: You have done your best in trying to let them off the hook. However, we need to move on; I have taken many interventions.

Alun Cairns *rose—*

Jane Hutt: No, Alun, I have taken many interventions. [*Interruption.*]

cinio. Yr ydym yn gwneud llawer yn ein cymunedau i wella iechyd. Dyna'r pwynt allweddol. Mae a wnelo hyn â gwella iechyd, ond mae hefyd yn ymwneud â'r modd yr ydym yn symud y materion yn eu blaen. Yn gyntaf, David, mae ar bobl angen swyddi, tai da ac amgylchedd da, incwm gweddus, tegwch, cyfiawnder a chydarddoldeb. Nid ydynt am gael David Davies yn pregethu wrthynt am eu harferion ysmegu ac iechyd.

David Davies: Nid yw'r Gweinidog ond yn ailadrodd yr hyn yr ydym ni i gyd yn ei wybod. Wrth gwrs bod ar bobl eisiau swyddi a thai da. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod hynny, felly pam y mae'n trafferthu dweud wrthym? Y ffaith yw eich bod yn derbyn bod llawer o ysmegu, yfed a bwyta'n afiach yn achosi problemau iechyd. Yr ydych wedi derbyn hynny. Dyna'r union bwynt a wnaeth Alun Cairns a minnau. Pam y mae'n rhaid ichi droi pob dim yn sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol?

Jane Hutt: Chi a ddewisodd godi a cheisio tansilio'r rhaglenni pwysig hyn sy'n rhan o wella iechyd. Dywedodd Peter Townsend fod yn rhaid inni ymwneud â hyn fel strategaeth sydd wedi'i chydabod gan bawb yn y Cynulliad: y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes; a'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a phob Aelod. Rhaid inni oll ystyried y darlun cyflawn o wella iechyd a chyfleoedd, nid dilorni sut y mae pobl, yn enwedig y bobl dlotaf yng Nghymru, yn byw.

David Melding: Codaf bwynt o gonsensws, neu gytundeb: gan ei bod yn wythnos dim ysmegu genedlaethol, a ydych yn croesawu'r ffaith bod David Davies ac Alun Cairns wedi ymrwymo'n awr i ymgyrch ymosodol yn erbyn y gwerthwyr tybaco a'r bragwyr?

Jane Hutt: Gwnaethoch eich gorau i geisio achub eu croen. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni symud ymlaen; yr wyf wedi derbyn llawer o ymyriadau.

Alun Cairns *a gododd—*

Jane Hutt: Nace, Alun, yr wyf wedi derbyn llawer o ymyriadau. [*Torri ar draws.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is not giving way.

Jane Hutt: To respond to points made by Huw and Lynne about how we are moving this forward, I assure you that the areas that are currently furthest from their target shares will receive the highest rate of growth. However, that will be done over time. This must be managed responsibly, and I have already outlined the information that we are seeking to collate to inform us. This must be based on the Welsh Assembly Government moving this forward responsibly, by allocating resources based on growth. Those areas that have a disproportionate number of deprived people will benefit. It relates to the inverse care law that we have discussed in this Chamber, and which Dr Julian Tudor Hart described. He is another great Welsh GP to whom we look, and he has played an important part in informing us on the way forward, in that we must consider targeting resources and improving health.

Kirsty reiterated Peter Townsend's important point that, unless we know how we spend our money on health and know what the outcome is, we could be spending money unwisely. There are three parts to this strategy.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must wind up now.

Jane Hutt: To answer Lorraine's point, community safety is also about local partnerships, involving local government and the police.

This is about improving health, targeting our poorest communities—where the worst health exists—and ensuring that they have their fair share of resources. It is also about targeting poor health through working in partnership, which will be taken forward from April 2003 by our local health boards.

11:35 a.m.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

Jane Hutt: Er mwyn ymateb i'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Huw a Lynne am ein dull o hyrwyddo hyn, yr wyf yn eich sicrhau mai'r ardaloedd sy'n bellaf oddi wrth eu cyfrannau targed ar hyn o bryd a gaiff y cynnydd mwyaf. Fodd bynnag, fe wneir hynny dros amser. Rhaid rheoli hyn yn gyfrifol, ac yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am y wybodaeth yr ydym yn ceisio'i chasglu i'n goleuo. Rhaid seilio hyn ar gamau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fynd â hyn ymlaen yn gyfrifol, drwy ddyrannu adnoddau ar sail twf. Bydd yr ardaloedd hynny sydd â nifer anghyfartal o bobl ddifreintiedig ar eu hennill. Mae'n gysylltiedig â'r ddeddf gofal gwrthgyfartal yr ydym wedi'i thrafod yn y Siambr hon, a ddisgrifiwyd gan Dr Julian Tudor Hart. Mae ef yn feddyg teulu mawr arall o Gymru yr ydym yn dibynnu arno, a chwaraeodd ran bwysig wrth ein cyfarwyddo ar y ffordd ymlaen, i'r graddau bod yn rhaid inni ystyried targedu adnoddau a gwella iechyd.

Ailadroddodd Kirsty bwynt pwysig Peter Townsend y gallem fod yn gwario'r arian yn annoeth, oni bai ein bod yn gwybod sut yr ydym yn gwario'n harian ar iechyd ac yn gwybod beth yw'r canlyniad. Mae tair rhan i'r strategaeth hon.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi derfynu'n awr.

Jane Hutt: Ac ateb pwynt Lorraine, mae diogelwch cymunedol yn ymwneud hefyd â phartneriaethau lleol, sy'n cynnwys llywodraeth leol a'r heddlu.

Mae hyn yn ymwneud â gwella iechyd, targedu'n cymunedau tlotaf—lle y mae'r iechyd gwaethaf—a sicrhau y cânt gyfran deg o'r adnoddau. Mae a wnelo hefyd â thargeddu iechyd gwael drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth, a hyrwyddir hynny o Ebrill 2003 gan ein byrddau iechyd lleol.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 7, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 40.
Amendment 2: For 7, Abstain 2, Against 40.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Jarman, Pauline
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 3: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 4: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 5: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Sinclair, Karen
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.
 Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter

Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Gweithdrefn Gwyno'r GIG The NHS Complaints Procedure

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. welcomes the responses to the consultation exercise on reform of the NHS complaints procedure;

1. yn croesawu'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghori ar ddiwygio gweithdrefn gwyno'r GIG;

2. recognises that the outcome will lead to reforms which will embody the principles of:

2. yn cydnabod y bydd y canlyniad yn arwain at ddiwygiadau a fydd yn ymgorffori'r egwyddorion a ganlyn:

a) resolving as many complaints as possible through local resolution;

a) datrys cymaint o gŵynion â phosibl yn lleol;

b) making the process quicker and more independent;

b) gwneud y broses yn un gyflymach ac yn un fwy annibynnol;

c) providing adequate support for people who wish to complain and for those complained against;

c) rhoi digon o gymorth i bobl sydd am wneud cwyn ac i'r rhai y gwneir cwyn yn eu herbyn;

d) ensuring that the NHS in Wales learns from complaints;

d) sicrhau bod y GIG yng Nghymru yn dysgu oddi wrth gŵynion a wneir yn ei erbyn;

3. endorses the intention of the Minister for Health and Social Services to draw up an implementation plan for the introduction of a revised complaints procedure by April 2003, (and to report further to the National Assembly). (NDM989)

3. yn cymeradwyo bwriad y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i lunio cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer cyflwyno gweithdrefn gwyno ddiwygiedig erbyn mis Ebrill 2003, (ac i adrodd ymhellach i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol). (NDM989)

The current NHS complaints procedure was introduced in 1996. Like any such system, it

Cyflwynwyd gweithdrefn gwyno bresennol y GIG yn 1996. Fel unrhyw system o'r fath,

has to keep pace with the changing face of the NHS to ensure that it is effective and that it meets the needs of patients and those who work in the health service. The NHS complaints procedure deals with a wide range of issues relating to all aspects of healthcare and treatment. It must be flexible and sensitive to the needs of patients and health service staff. For that reason, we must ensure that any changes are given careful consideration. We will proceed carefully, with full involvement from a wide range of stakeholders.

On the theme of change, four amendments to the motion have been tabled. Jocelyn Davies and Jonathan Morgan have both proposed amendments supporting the role of community health councils in Wales. As Members know, proposals to strengthen community health councils, which will be retained in Wales, will be pursued through the NHS (Wales) Bill, which will go out for consultation prior to the parliamentary summer recess. I do not believe that those two amendments are needed and we will not support them. Jocelyn Davies has also tabled two amendments on criminal negligence claims. At present, there is no link between clinical negligence and the NHS complaints procedure. However, we intend to consider the possibility of making a link, while reforming the complaints procedure. It would be inappropriate to make a commitment at this stage, before we have fully considered the implications of that.

The NHS complaints procedure has been independently evaluated on a UK-wide basis over a two-year period, which ended last March. The primary aim of the evaluation was to assess how the procedures were operating across parts of the NHS, including community and family health, as well as hospital services. It was based, as far as possible, on the experiences of those using the procedure and took account of the views of patients and their carers, patient organisations, those operating the procedure and staff or practitioners who had complaints made against them. The report made 27 suggestions to make the complaints

rhaid iddi gadw'n wastad â'r newid yn y GIG i sicrhau ei bod yn effeithiol a'i bod yn diwallu anghenion y cleifion a'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae gweithdrefn gwyno'r GIG yn delio ag amrediad eang o faterion sy'n ymwneud â phob agwedd ar ofal iechyd a thriniaeth. Rhaid iddi fod yn hyblyg ac yn sensitif i anghenion y cleifion a staff y gwasanaeth iechyd. Oherwydd hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau bod unrhyw newidiadau wedi'u hystyried yn ofalus. Awn ymlaen yn ofalus, gyda chyfranogiad llawn gan amrywiaeth mawr o gyfranogion.

Ar thema newid, mae pedwar gwelliant i'r cynnig wedi'u cyflwyno. Mae Jocelyn Davies a Jonathan Morgan ill dau wedi cynnig gwelliannau o blaid rôl y cynghorau iechyd cymuned yng Nghymru. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, eir ynghylch y cynigion i gryfhau'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned, sydd i'w cadw yng Nghymru, drwy Fesur y GIG (Cymru), y bydd ymgynghori arno cyn toriad y Senedd yn yr haf. Ni chredaf fod angen y ddau welliant hynny ac ni fyddwn yn eu cefnogi. Mae Jocelyn Davies wedi cyflwyno dau welliant hefyd ar hawliadau esgeulustod troseddol. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes cysylltiad rhwng esgeulustod clinigol a gweithdrefn gwyno'r GIG. Fodd bynnag, bwriadwn ystyried y posibiliad o greu cysylltiad, tra ydym yn diwygio'r weithdrefn gwyno. Byddai'n amhriodol ymrwymo i hynny ar hyn o bryd, cyn inni ystyried holl oblygiadau hynny.

Mae gweithdrefn gwyno'r GIG wedi'i gwerthuso'n annibynnol drwy'r DU dros gyfnod o ddwy flynedd a ddaeth i ben fis Mawrth diwethaf. Prif nod y gwerthusiad oedd asesu sut yr oedd y gweithdrefnau'n gweithredu mewn rhannau o'r GIG, gan gynnwys iechyd cymunedol a theuluol, yn ogystal â gwasanaethau ysbyty. Yr oedd yn seiliedig, hyd yr oedd modd, ar brofiadau'r rhai a oedd yn defnyddio'r weithdrefn a chymerodd i ystyriaeth barn y cleifion a'u gofalwyr, cyrff a mudiadau cleifion, y rhai sy'n gweithredu'r weithdrefn a'r staff neu'r ymarferwyr y gwnaethpwyd cwynion yn eu herbyn. Gwnaeth yr adroddiad 27 o

procedure more effective, fair and consistent. These suggestions formed the basis of the consultation process in Wales, which ended last November.

We received several positive responses, which will help to make the necessary changes to move this forward. However, we must also ensure that our system remains compatible with complaints procedures being developed in other UK countries.

Several issues need to be considered and resolved. First, most people do not like making a formal complaint about NHS services. They prefer to sit down with someone who will listen to their concern and sort it out on the spot before it escalates into a formal complaint. That is why the services of patient support officers and complaints advocates, under the pathfinder schemes that we are funding, are now being piloted in eight locations across Wales to determine how best to provide this on-the-spot support. We are testing out different models in different settings and locations to find out what works best for patients and the public.

However, there will be times when things go wrong and people will want to make a formal complaint. We must ensure that the procedure is in place so that local resolution—the first stage of the complaints procedure—is timely, accessible and responsive. At this stage of the process, benefits can be brought about quickly. A great deal of good practice already exists in the NHS on effective complaints handling and we must build on that to ensure that local resolution is strengthened across all parts of the NHS.

The vast majority of complaints are resolved at the local resolution stage. However, sadly, attempts at resolving concerns locally can sometimes fail. In these cases, the clear message is that we must make the independent review stage—the second

awgrymiadau i wneud y weithdrefn gwyno'n fwy effeithiol, teg a chyson. Yr awgrymiadau hyn oedd yn sail i'r ymgynghoriad yng Nghymru, a ddaeth i ben fis Tachwedd diwethaf.

Cawsom nifer o ymatebion cadarnhaol, a fydd o gymorth i wneud y newidiadau sydd eu hangen er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â hyn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd fod ein system ni'n parhau i gydweddu â'r gweithdrefnau cwyno a ddatblygir yng gwledydd eraill y DU.

Mae angen ystyried nifer o faterion a phenderfynu arnynt. Yn gyntaf, nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn hoffi gwneud cwyn ffurfiol am wasanaethau'r GIG. Mae'n well ganddynt eistedd gyda rhywun a fydd yn gwrandao ar yr hyn sy'n peri pryder iddynt ac yn ei ddatrys yn y fan a'r lle cyn iddo ddatblygu'n gwyn ffurfiol. Dyna pam y mae gwasanaethau swyddogion cymorth cleifion ac eiriolwyr cwynion, o dan y cynlluniau agor llwybr yr ydym yn eu hariannu, yn cael eu rhagbrofi'n awr mewn wyth lle ledled Cymru i benderfynu ar y modd gorau i ddarparu'r cymorth hwn yn y fan a'r lle. Yr ydym yn rhoi prawf ar wahanol fodelau mewn gwahanol sefyllfaoedd a lleoliadau i ddarganfod beth sy'n gweithio orau i'r cleifion a'r cyhoedd.

Er hynny, fe fydd adegau pan aiff pethau o chwith a bydd pobl yn dymuno gwneud cwyn ffurfiol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y weithdrefn briodol ar waith fel bod y penderfyniad lleol—cam cyntaf y weithdrefn gwyno—yn amserol, yn hygyrch ac yn ymatebol. Ar y cam hwn yn y broses, gellir gwneud lles yn gyflym. Mae llawer iawn o arfer da yn y GIG eisoes ar drafod cwynion yn effeithiol a rhaid inni ddatblygu hynny i sicrhau bod penderfynu lleol wedi'i gryfhau ym mhob rhan o'r GIG.

Mae'r mwyafrif helaeth o gwynion yn cael eu datrys ar gam y penderfyniad lleol. Fodd bynnag, gwaetha'r modd, mae'r ymdrechion i ddatrys pryderon yn lleol yn gallu methu weithiau. Yn yr achosion hynny, y neges amlwg yw bod rhaid inni wneud cam yr

stage—more independent, easier to access and quicker to deliver. The responses to the consultation support establishing a complaints panel for Wales, completely independent of the NHS, which might be made accountable to the Assembly. I would be interested to hear your views on that proposal.

Ensuring that adequate and sympathetic support is available for the complainant and the individuals against whom complaints are made was also a key message that emerged from the consultation exercise. It is stressful for those who are so upset about their care or treatment that they feel they must make a complaint. However, it is also stressful to be the subject of that complaint. In both cases, there are particular difficulties and we must recognise them and offer help toward overcoming them.

Learning from complaints can contribute significantly to creating a truly patient-centred NHS in Wales, and will benefit those delivering and receiving healthcare in Wales. Following today's debate, a conference of key stakeholders will be held, and a national working group will be set up with a view to introducing revised complaints procedures in Wales by April 2003. I will report on progress later this year, and I look forward to listening to Members' views.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Jane took less than her allocated time. However, we are running behind. I ask those who spoke in the previous debate and wish to contribute to this one to voluntarily limit themselves to three minutes, rather than five. I do not want to impose a three-minute limit, therefore, I ask those who did not speak in the previous debate to keep their speeches as short as possible.

Janet Davies: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add at end of point 2c:

, including a greater role for community

adolygiad annibynnol—yr ail gam—yn fwy annibynnol, yn haws ei gyrraedd ac yn gyflymach. Mae'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad yn bleidiol i sefydlu panel cwynion i Gymru, a fyddai'n gwbl annibynnol ar y GIG, y byddai modd ei wneud yn atebol i'r Cynulliad. Byddai o ddiddordeb imi glywed eich barn ar y cynnig hwnnw.

Neges allweddol arall a gododd o'r ymgynghoriad oedd yr angen i sicrhau bod cymorth digonol a chydymdeimladol ar gael i'r achwynydd a'r unigolion y gwneir cwynion yn eu herbyn. Mae straen ar y rhai sydd mor ofidus ynghylch eu gofal neu eu triniaeth fel eu bod yn teimlo bod yn rhaid iddynt gwyno. Fodd bynnag, mae straen yn codi hefyd drwy fod yn destun i'r gwyn honno. Mae anawsterau penodol yn codi yn y ddau achos a rhaid inni eu cydnabod a chynnig cymorth at eu goresgyn.

Mae'r hyn a ddysgir oddi wrth gwynion yn gallu cyfrannu'n sylweddol at greu GIG yng Nghymru sy'n wirioneddol glaf-ganolog, a daw hynny â manteision i'r rhai sy'n rhoi ac yn derbyn gofal iechyd yng Nghymru. Ar ôl y ddadl heddiw, fe gynhelir cynhadledd i'r prif gyfranogion, a sefydlir gweithgor cenedlaethol gyda golwg ar gyflwyno'r gweithdrefnau cwyno diwygiedig yng Nghymru erbyn Ebrill 2003. Byddaf yn adrodd ar y cynnydd yn ddiweddarach eleni, ac edrychaf ymlaen at wrando ar farn yr Aelodau.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cymerodd Jane lai o amser nag a ddyrannwyd iddi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n mynd yn hwyr arnom. Gofynnaf i'r rhai a siaradodd yn y ddadl flaenorol ac sy'n dymuno cyfrannu i hon eu cyfyngu eu hunain yn wirfoddol i dair munud, yn hytrach na phump. Nid wyf am osod cyfyngiad tair munud, felly, gofynnaf i'r rhai nad oedd wedi siarad yn y ddadl flaenorol gadw eu hareithiau mor fyr â phosibl.

Janet Davies: Cynigiau y gwellianau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ar ddiwedd pwynt 2c, ychwaneger:

, gan gynnwys rhoi mwy o rôl i gynghorau

health councils in representing patients through the complaints process.

I propose amendment 2. Add at end of point 2d:

, aided by the completion of the all-Wales register of clinical negligence claims at the earliest possible opportunity.

I propose amendment 4. Add as new point at the end of the motion:

notes the enormous annual cost to the NHS in Wales incurred through clinical negligence claims and that annual cash payments and the estimated future costs of such claims have quadrupled in the last four years.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales welcomes the reform of the national health service complaints procedure. At present, it often does not seem to work, either for the patients and relatives, the staff or, indeed, the taxpayer at times. Everyone concerned needs complaints to be dealt with quickly and efficiently. Fairness is equally important, and the reformed code must find the best possible balance between the tension of quick resolution and a full and fair investigation. Our amendments introduce two issues that will enhance and improve the motion. Community health councils, if involved, could give patients impartial and responsible help. They neither have a financial interest in pursuing a claim nor in stifling it. I am pleased to hear that this will be considered in the Bill, but I am sorry that the Government does not feel that it can support these amendments.

11:45 a.m.

That type of role would add to the proposed monitoring role. Some dissatisfaction with the review process was expressed in the consultation. That process must be independent. Community health councils could play a full role in that, which would be welcome.

iechyd cymuned i gynrychioli cleifion trwy'r broses gwynion.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ar ddiwedd pwynt 2d, ychwaneger:

, ac y bydd cofrestr Cymru gyfan o hawliadau esgeulustod clinigol, o'i chwblhau ar fyrder, o gymorth i hynny.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi'r costau blynyddol aruthrol a ysgwyddir gan y GIG yn sgîl hawliadau esgeulustod clinigol a bod taliadau ariannol blynyddol a'r rhagolygon ar gyfer costau hawliadau o'r fath bedair gwaith yn uwch nag oeddynt bedair blynedd yn ôl.

Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn croesawu diwygio gweithdrefn gwyno'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n ymddangos yn aml nad yw'n gweithio, i'r cleifion a'r perthnasau, i'r staff nac, yn wir, i'r trethdalwr ar brydiau. Mae pawb sy'n gysylltiedig am i gwynion gael eu trafod yn gyflym ac yn effeithlon. Mae tegwch yr un mor bwysig, a rhaid i'r cod diwygiedig ganfod y cydbwysedd gorau posibl rhwng pwyso am benderfyniad cyflym ac am ymchwiliad llawn a theg. Mae ein gwelliannau'n cyflwyno dau fater y mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn credu y byddant yn hyrwyddo ac yn gwella'r cynnig. Os yw cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn gysylltiedig, gallent roi cymorth diduedd a chyfrifol i'r cleifion. Nid oes ganddynt fuddiant ariannol mewn canlyn hawliad na'i guddio. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y caiff hyn ei ystyried yn y Mesur ond mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn teimlo y gall gefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn.

Byddai rôl o'r fath yn ychwanegu at y rôl monitro arfaethedig. Mynegwyd peth anfodlonrwydd ar y broses adolygu yn yr ymgynghoriad. Rhaid i'r broses honno fod yn annibynnol. Gallai cynghorau iechyd cymuned chwarae rôl lawn yn hynny o beth, a byddai hynny i'w chroesawu.

On our amendments 2 and 4 on clinical negligence, as you know, the Auditor General for Wales produced a report that was considered by the Audit Committee last year, which then produced its own report. An all-Wales register of cases was considered to be vital so that lessons could be learnt and unforeseen dangers exposed. It is also important that the NHS has a register of near-misses. That may not apply in detail to the complaints procedure as it is set out, but complaints about clinical negligence can arise out of general complaints, therefore it is not irrelevant. The cost of clinical negligence is increasing fast. We have just debated NHS resource allocation and I point out that claims opened in March 2000 were likely to be settled at a cost of between £60 and £154 million. That is a great deal of money to come out of the health service's budget, and it comes from patient care, not from insurance companies. We must bear that in mind.

A new, improved code would benefit the patients and relatives affected, who are often emotionally traumatised. This is not just about money, but about trauma. Those people should not have to suffer further. The new code would also benefit staff, and the third group who would benefit is taxpayers. If we can invest more money in the health service and get the value that we need out of that in terms of patient care, that would be much better than the money being spent on pursuing claims.

However, that demands a change of culture and the willingness to hold up a hand and admit to being at fault when that is clearly the case. Currently, some of the reluctance to do that can be reasonably attributed to a fear that it may prejudice court action. However, there is a culture in the NHS of being reluctant to do that. I hope that a new code would not only put structures in place to help people come to terms with that, but provide a lead to make that happen. Many people simply want an apology when things go wrong. I complained to the chief executive of my local trust some years ago and the brush-off that I received was unpleasant. It does not

Ynghylch gwelliannau 2 a 4 ar esgeulustod clinigol, fel y gwyddoch, cynhyrchodd Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru adroddiad a ystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio y llynedd, a chynhyrchodd hwnnw ei adroddiad ei hun wedyn. Barnwyd bod cofrestr achosion i Gymru gyfan yn hollbwysig fel y gellid dysgu gwersi a datgelu peryglon annisgwyl. Mae'n bwysig hefyd fod gan y GIG gofrestr o fethiannau agos. Efallai nad yw hynny'n ymwneud yn fanwl â'r weithdrefn gwyno fel y mae wedi'i nodi, ond fe all cwynion am esgeulustod clinigol godi o gwynion cyffredinol, felly nid yw'n amherthnasol. Mae cost esgeulustod clinigol yn cynyddu'n gyflym. Yr ydym newydd drafod dyrannu adnoddau'r GIG a thynnaf sylw at y ffaith bod yr hawliadau a ddechreuwyd ym Mawrth 2000 yn debygol o gael eu setlo ar gost o rhwng £60 a £154 miliwn. Mae hynny'n swm mawr o arian i'w dynnu o gyllideb y gwasanaeth iechyd, a daw oddi wrth ofal am gleifion, nid oddi wrth y cwmnïau yswiriant. Rhaid inni gofio hynny.

Byddai cod newydd, gwell, o fudd i'r cleifion a'r perthnasau a effeithir, sy'n aml wedi'u hysgwyl yn emosiynol. Nid ag arian yn unig y mae a wnelo hyn, ond â thrawma. Ni ddylai fod rhaid i'r bobl hynny ddiodeff ymhellach. Byddai'r cod newydd o fudd i'r staff hefyd, a'r trydydd grŵp a gâi fantais yw'r trethdalwyr. Os gallwn fuddsoddi rhagor o arian yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, a chael y gwerth y mae arnom ei angen o hynny o ran gofal am gleifion, byddai hynny'n well o lawer na gwario'r arian ar ganlyn hawliadau.

Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n gofyn am newid mewn arferion a pharodrwydd i godi llaw a chyfaddef pan yw'n amlwg bod rhywun ar fai. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n rhesymol priodoli rhywfaint o'r amharodrwydd i wneud hynny i'r ofn y gallai ddylanwadu ar achos llys. Fodd bynnag, mae diwylliant o fewn y GIG o fod yn amharod i wneud hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd cod newydd nid yn unig yn sefydlu strwythurau i helpu pobl i ddod i delerau â hynny, ond yn rhoi arweiniad i beri i hynny ddigwydd. Y cwbl y mae ar lawer o bobl ei eisiau pan yw pethau'n mynd o chwith yw ymddiheuriad. Gwneuthum gŵyn i brif weithredwr fy ymddiriedolaeth leol rai

leave you feeling any happier about what is happening in the health service. Often you do not want more than an admission of fault, an apology and a promise that matters will be put right. If this code can help to achieve that, it will be well worth our time.

The staff must also have a fair deal. They must be allowed to present their cases fairly and to get a fair response and judgment. Complaints procedures being dragged out over years leave staff coping with an uncertain future, sometimes after an unjustified accusation. How can anyone cope with being pressured to admit that they have or have not done something just to get their job back? That must demoralise staff.

Making the complaints procedure integral to clinical governance is important, and I look forward to further reports on this issue and to the publication of the new code. I hope that it will instil greater confidence among the public in healthcare provision in the NHS and greater confidence among staff that they too will be treated fairly.

David Melding: I propose amendment 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. At the end of motion add a new point:

believes that community health councils have a key role to play in any reformed NHS complaints procedure.

We all agree that we need an effective NHS complaints procedure. It is timely to review the processes that have been adopted for many years. Most of what the Government is proposing and considering is welcome. I will highlight the probable or possible role of community health councils. I accept the spirit of the Minister's remarks that the issue is getting attention and will be addressed in the draft NHS Wales Bill when we receive it.

blynyddoedd yn ôl ac yr oedd y gwrthodiad a gefais yn annymunol. Nid yw'n eich gadael yn ddim hapusach ynghylch yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yn aml, nid oes amoch eisiau dim mwy na chyfaddefiad o fai, ymddiheuriad ac addewid y caiff pethau eu cywiro. Os bydd modd i'r cod hwn gyflawni hynny, bydd wedi bod yn werth treulio amser arno.

Rhaid i'r staff gael bargaen deg hefyd. Rhaid caniatáu iddynt gyflwyno eu hachos yn deg a chael ymateb a dyfarniad teg. Os caiff gweithdrefn gwyno ei hestyn dros flynyddoedd lawer, mae hynny'n gadael y staff i orfod ymdopi â dyfodol ansicr, weithiau ar ôl cyhuddiad sydd heb gyfiawnhad. Sut y gall rhywun ymdopi â phwysau i gyfaddef ei fod wedi gwneud rhywbeth, neu heb wneud rhywbeth, dim ond i gael ei swydd yn ôl? Mae hynny'n sicr o ddigalonn staff.

Mae'n bwysig gwneud y weithdrefn gwyno'n rhan annatod o lywodraethu clinigol, ac edrychaf ymlaen at adroddiadau pellach ar y mater hwn ac at gyhoeddi'r cod newydd. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn ennyn mwy o hyder ymysg y cyhoedd yn y ddarpariaeth gofal iechyd yn y GIG a mwy o hyder ymysg y staff y cânt hwythau eu trin yn deg.

David Melding: Cynigiau welliant 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig, ychwaneger pwynt newydd:

yn credu y bydd gan gynghorau iechyd cymuned ran allweddol i'w chwarae mewn unrhyw weithdrefn gwyno newydd o fewn y GIG.

Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod arnom angen gweithdrefn gwyno effeithiol i'r GIG. Mae hon yn adeg briodol i adolygu'r prosesau gan eu bod wedi'u mabwysiadu ers blynyddoedd lawer. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei gynnig a'i ystyried i'w groesawu. Tynnaf sylw at rôl debygol neu bosibl y cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Derbyniaf ysbryd sylwadau'r Gweinidog, sef bod y mater yn derbyn sylw ac y caiff ei drafod yn y drafft o Fesur y GIG (Cymru) pan ydym yn ei dderbyn.

However, in a debate on complaints procedures, we must focus on community health councils even if there will be more specific proposals for those bodies in the future. Community health councils need to be at the centre of an effective complaints procedure because they are, after all, the patient's voice and the most independent body that is able to help patients through the complaints procedure. There will always be problems if patients do not believe that those who advise them in taking their complaints forward are not on their side. If there is too much emphasis on the trust dealing with the complaints process, there will always be a sense that it is not giving patients a full and fair hearing.

Community health councils, for instance, could be asked to review the complaints procedure of NHS trusts, and that of the new local health boards when they come into being. It would be a good and effective monitoring role for CHCs to perform. They could also offer training for frontline NHS staff. This would allow CHCs to provide valuable services and to secure some remuneration that would increase their capacity and ability to act as a strong body on behalf of patients. In turn, the councils ought to receive regular reports on the way in which complaints have been dealt with and analysed by NHS trust boards and the new local health boards.

Community health councils need to be central to the direct complaints process, by ensuring that we have an effective national network of patient support officers. They could be based in CHCs but perhaps located in hospital trusts, and acting as part of a CHC network, managed by the councils and involved in national fora made up of council patient support officers. That would give such officers the independence and capacity needed to do the job. When a more formal procedure is required, for example, when issues are not resolved at the initial stage—although we hope that the majority of complaints will be resolved at that stage—the councils should be the bodies that employ advocates to help patients take their

Fodd bynnag, mewn unrhyw ddadl am weithdrefnau cwyno, rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar y cynghorau iechyd cymuned hyd yn oed os bydd cynigion mwy penodol ar gyfer y cyrff hynny yn y dyfodol. Rhaid i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned fod ar ganol gweithdrefn gwyno effeithiol oherwydd hwy, wedi'r cwbl, yw llais y claf a'r corff mwyaf annibynnol sy'n gallu helpu cleifion i fynd drwy'r weithdrefn gwyno. Bydd problemau'n codi bob amser os nad yw'r cleifion yn credu bod y rhai sy'n eu cynghori wrth fynd ymlaen â'u cwynion ar eu hochr hwy. Os oes gormod o bwyslais ar ddelio â'r broses gwyno gan yr ymddiriedolaeth, bydd ymdeimlad bob amser nad yw'n rhoi gwrandawriad llawn a theg i'r cleifion.

Er enghraifft, gellid gofyn i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned adolygu gweithdrefn gwyno'r ymddiriedolaethau GIG, ac un y byrddau iechyd lleol pan ddeuant i fodolaeth. Byddai'n rôl monitro dda ac effeithiol i'w chyflawni gan y cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Gallent hefyd gynnig hyfforddiant i staff rheng flaen y GIG. Byddai hynny'n caniatáu i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned ddarparu gwasanaethau gwerthfawr a sicrhau rhywfaint o dâl a fyddai'n cynyddu eu capasiti a'u gallu i weithredu'n gadarn ar ran y cleifion. Yn eu tro, dylai'r cynghorau gael adroddiadau rheolaidd ar y modd yr ymdriniwyd â chwynion a'u dadansoddi gan fyrddau'r ymddiriedolaethau GIG a'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd.

Rhaid i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned fod ar ganol y broses gwyno uniongyrchol, drwy sicrhau bod gennym rwydwaith cenedlaethol effeithiol o swyddogion cymorth cleifion. Gellid eu sefydlu yn y cynghorau iechyd cymuned ond eu lleoli efallai yn yr ymddiriedolaethau ysbyty, a gallent weithredu fel rhan o rwydwaith o gynghorau iechyd cymuned, wedi'u rheoli gan y cynghorau ac yn gysylltiedig â fforymau cenedlaethol o swyddogion cymorth cleifion y cynghorau. Byddai hynny'n rhoi'r annibyniaeth a'r gallu y byddai ar swyddogion o'r fath eu hangen i wneud y gwaith. Pan fo angen gweithdrefn fwy ffurfiol, er enghraifft, pan na chaiff y materion eu penderfynu ar y cam cyntaf—er

complaints forward. It is time that the role of the councils was extended to the primary sector, so that they can oversee the complaints process in local health boards.

Alison Halford: I am pleased to add my voice to a matter of great concern. As a member of the Audit Committee, I have a small amount of knowledge of the complexities of the clinical negligence process. Almost 75 per cent of UK complainants feel that the procedure is biased and unfair. I welcome the high priority that the Minister is giving to this issue and her search for a flexible approach to achieving the best model.

The Audit Committee found that almost £27 million was paid out in 1999-2000 as a result of clinical negligence, with the remaining 1,600 cases that remain unresolved in Wales alone having a potential cost of £107 million. More often than not, all that patients want is an apology at the early stage. If that could be achieved, the more costly and tortuous road of the formal complaints process could be avoided. The Auditor General for Wales also found that a large number—almost one third—of all clinical negligence cases resulted from non-clinical mistakes. This is why I am pleased that most of the recommendations made in the evaluation report centre on procedural reforms. Administrative or communication breakdown often led to mistakes that were devastating for the patient.

I am also pleased that the new losses and special payments register, set up by Jane Hutt and the Assembly, will allow solutions to be targeted more accurately. I welcome the news that patients will not have to approach their GPs if they wish to complain. Fear of being removed from the register or being seen as a troublemaker is all too common. I agree with David Melding, and congratulate the Minister on keeping the more robust

ein bod yn gobeithio y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn achos y rhan fwyaf o gwynion—y cynghorau yw'r cyrff a ddylai gyflogi eiriolwyr i helpu'r cleifion i fynd â'u cwynion ymlaen. Mae'n bryd ymestyn rôl y cynghorau i'r sector gofal sylfaenol, fel y gallant arolygu'r broses gwyno yn y byrddau iechyd lleol.

Alison Halford: Yr wyf yn falch o ychwanegu fy llais at fater sy'n peri pryder mawr. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio, mae gennyf ychydig o wybodaeth am gymhlethdodau'r broses esgeulustod clinigol. Mae bron 75 y cant o'r achwynwyr yn y DU yn teimlo bod y weithdrefn yn unochrog ac yn annheg. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r flaenoriaeth uchel y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei rhoi i'r mater hwn a'i hymchwil am ddull hyblyg o sicrhau'r model gorau.

Canfu'r Pwyllgor Archwilio fod ymron i £27 miliwn wedi'i dalu yn 1999-2000 o ganlyniad i esgeulustod clinigol, ac y gallai'r 1,600 o achosion sydd heb eu penderfynu eto yng Nghymru'n unig gostio £107 miliwn. Yn amlach na pheidio, y cwbl y mae ar y cleifion ei eisiau yw ymddiheiriad ar y cam cynnar. Os gellid sicrhau hynny, ni fyddai'n rhaid dilyn llwybr mwy costus a throfaus y broses gwyno ffurfiol. Canfu Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru hefyd fod nifer fawr—ymron i draean—o'r holl achosion esgeulustod clinigol yn ganlyniad i gamgymeriadau anghlinigol. Dyna pam yr wyf yn falch bod y rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad gwerthuso'n canolbwyntio ar ddiwygio gweithdrefnau. Yr oedd methiannau mewn gweinyddu neu gyfathrebu'n arwain yn aml at gamgymeriadau a oedd yn ddistrywiol i'r claf.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch y bydd y gofrestr colledion a thaliadau arbennig newydd, a sefydlwyd gan Jane Hutt a'r Cynulliad, yn caniatáu targedu atebion yn fwy manwl. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r newydd na fydd cleifion yn gorfod cysylltu â'u meddyg teulu os ydynt yn dymuno cwyno. Mae'r ofn o gael eich tynnu oddi ar y gofrestr neu'ch ystyried yn godwr twrw'n rhy gyffredin o lawer. Cytunaf â David Melding, a llongyfarchaf y

community health councils, rather than going down the English road of the patient advocacy and liaison service.

Presently, at the local level, we do not know how many justified complaints are turned away by medical practitioners. I would welcome a system where every complaint, even if resolved at this level, was recorded in some manner.

I would also welcome a section on whistleblowing, or some provision for staff to register concerns in a confidential and possibly anonymous way. I would appreciate hearing the Minister's view on this, and I draw her attention to the fact that the Public Notice Disclosure Act 1998 was designed to protect whistleblowers. We all remember Alison Taylor, who was sacked as a result of voicing her fears, which led to the north Wales child abuse inquiry.

Local resolution is a good idea, but it needs more structure. It is good news that staff managing complaints within GP practices will be given more training and information. We must ensure that as much information as possible is available in surgeries and hospitals to help would-be complainants.

11:55 a.m.

We all have, or have had, constituents who have suffered for years as a result of bodged operations, and being moved from pillar to post. Anything that Jane can do—as she is doing—to improve the fast-tracking of complaints would be welcome. Surely, in a perfect world, it would be possible to fast-track all complaints that appear to be genuine. Work must be done on this. We all agree that we must stop the haemorrhaging of tens of millions of pounds of public money in compensating patients for mistakes. I commend Jane Hutt for her excellent work and I support her initiatives wholeheartedly.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fy muddiant arferol

Gweinidog ar gadw'r cyngorau iechyd cymuned, sy'n fwy cadarn, yn hytrach na dilyn y llwybr yn Lloegr o gael gwasanaeth eiriolaeth a chydgyssylltu cleifion.

Ar hyn o bryd, ar lefel leol, ni wyddom ba nifer o gwynion cyfiawn a wrthodir gan ymarferwyr meddygol. Byddwn yn falch o weld system lle y câi pob cwyn, hyd yn oed os penderfynid arno ar y lefel honno, ei chofnodi yn yr un modd.

Byddwn hefyd yn croesawu adran ar ddatgelu camarfer, neu ryw ddarpariaeth i'r staff gael cofnodi pryderon yn gyfrinachol ac yn ddi-enw o bosibl. Byddai'n dda gennyf glywed barn y Gweinidog ar hynny, a thynnaf ei sylw at y ffaith mai bwriad Deddf Datgelu Rhybudd Cyhoeddus 1998 oedd amddiffyn datgelwyr camarfer. Yr ydym oll yn cofio Alison Taylor, a ddiswyddwyd am iddi fynegi'i hofnau, a hynny'n arwain at ymchwiliad cam-drin plant gogledd Cymru.

Mae penderfynu lleol yn syniad da, ond mae angen mwy o strwythur iddo. Mae'n dda clywed y bydd y staff sy'n rheoli cwynion o fewn practisiau meddygon teulu'n cael mwy o hyfforddiant a gwybodaeth. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod cymaint o wybodaeth ag y bo modd ar gael mewn meddygfeydd ac ysbytai i helpu darpar achwynwyr.

Mae gan bob un ohonom etholwyr sy'n dioddef, neu a fu'n dioddef, am flynyddoedd lawer o ganlyniad i lawdriniaethau a gafodd eu cawlio, a chael eu symud o bared i bost. Byddai unrhyw beth y gall Jane ei wneud—fel y mae'n gwneud—i wella'r dull carlam o drin cwynion i'w groesawu. Mewn byd perffaith, mae'n siŵr y byddai modd trin pob cwyn sy'n ymddangos yn ddilys drwy ddull carlam. Rhaid gweithio ar hynny. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod yn rhaid inni atal y gwaedlif o ddegau o filiynau o bunnoedd o arian cyhoeddus wrth dalu iawndal i gleifion am gamgymeriadau. Canmolaf Jane Hutt ar ei gwaith rhagorol a chefnogaf ei mentrau o waelod calon.

David Lloyd: I declare my usual interest as a

fel meddyg teulu. Soniaf yn frysio am rai pwyntiau sydd gennyf. Mae meddygon teulu yn gweld, ar gyfartaledd, tua 50 o gleifion bob dydd, 250 bob wythnos a thua 10,000 bob blwyddyn. Gall meddyg teulu, ar gyfartaledd, ddisgwyl cwyn swyddogol yn ei erbyn bob pedair blynedd, sef un gŵyn am bob 40,000 o gleifion. Diffyg cyfathrebu sydd yn aml yn gyfrifol am y gŵyn, a hynny, yn ei dro, yn gallu deillio o ddiffyg sgiliau cyfathrebu a diffyg amser. Byddai cael mwy o amser i drin a thrafod â chleifion yn golygu mwy o staff.

Mae camgymeriadau yn rhwym o ddigwydd mewn system sydd dan bwysau. Mae natur y driniaeth a'r cyffuriau a ddefnyddir yn golygu y gall pethau anffodus ddigwydd weithiau heb fod bai ar unrhyw un. Fel cymdeithas, dylem feddwl cyn dechrau taflu'r bai. Pan fydd claf yn cael profiad anffodus, mae esboniad cynnar, clir, gonest ac agored o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn hanfodol bwysig. Yn aml, ac yn anfaddeuol, nid yw hynny'n digwydd. Esboniad ac eglurhad—ac ymddiheuriad pan fo angen—yw'r hyn y mae pobl yn dymuno eu cael; nid ydynt am ddod wyneb yn wyneb â wal oeraidd, swyddogol sydd yn gwrthod dweud dim.

Mae'n amlwg bod y system gŵynion bresennol yn aml yn hirwyntog ac yn gymhleth, a gall gymryd blynyddoedd i gyrraedd canlyniad. Nid yw'r system yn ymddangos yn annibynnol, ac mae pobl yn tueddu i gredu bod y gyfundrefn iechyd gyfan yn eu herbyn. Mae angen diwygio'r weithdrefn gŵynion ar fyrder, i adennill hyder y cyhoedd yn y system. Mae angen cefnogaeth a chyngor ar y sawl sy'n cwyno, ac ar y sawl sy'n destun cwyn. Y llynedd, bu farw ffrind i mi, a oedd yn feddyg teulu yn Nhre-gŵyr, yn sgîl bod yn destun cwyn swyddogol. Fel meddygon teulu, mae ein perfformiad proffesiynol wedi ei glymu yn annatod â'n perfformiad personol. Ni allwn adael y gwaith ac anghofio ein bod yn feddygon, gan ein bod yn byw ymhlith y bobl a ddaw atom fel cleifion; mae'r meddyg lleol bob amser ar alwad. Ond pan fydd pethau'n mynd o chwith, mae'r pwysau'n enbyd, a bydd cwmwl du yn hofran uwchben meddyg

general practitioner. I will race through some of the points I wish to raise. General practitioners, on average, see about 50 patients every day, 250 every week and about 10,000 every year. A GP can, on average, expect an official complaint to be lodged against him or her every four years—one complaint for every 40,000 patients. Complaints often arise from lack of communication which, from time to time, can stem from lack of communication skills and lack of time. More time to deal with patients would require more staff.

Mistakes are bound to occur in a system which is under pressure. The nature of the treatment and the drugs used can lead to regrettable incidents for which no-one is to blame. As a society, we should stop to think before we apportion blame. When patients have unfortunate experiences, it is vitally important that they receive a swift, clear, honest and transparent explanation of what happened. Often, and unforgivably, this is not the case. People want an explanation and clarification, and an apology where necessary; they do not want to experience cold, official stonewalling.

It is clear that the existing complaints system is often longwinded and complicated, and it can take years to reach a conclusion. The system is not seen to be independent, and people tend to believe that the entire health system is stacked against them. The complaints procedure needs to be reformed without delay, in order to regain the public's confidence in the system. The complainant, and the subject of the complaint, need support and advice. Last year, a friend of mine, who was a GP in Gowerton, died as a result of being the subject of a complaint. As GPs, our professional performance is intertwined with our personal performance. We cannot leave the workplace and forget that we are GPs, because we live among our patients; the local doctor is always on call. However, when things go wrong, the pressure can be difficult to bear and a black cloud can hang over a GP throughout the months and years it takes for the current

yn ystod y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd y cymer y weithdrefn bresennol i ddelio â chŵyn.

Gall hyn oll danseilio hyder meddyg, neu nyrs, a'u gwneud yn fwy amddiffynnol. Golyga hynny y byddant yn fwy parod i anfon cleifion i'r ysbyty ac i gynnal profion gwaed ac unrhyw brawf arall fel modd i amddiffyn eu hunain yn erbyn cwyn arall.

Mae goblygiadau mawr a phellgyrhaeddol i weithdrefn gwyno sy'n aneffeithiol, araf a thrwsgl ac sy'n peri anfodlonrwydd mawr i'r claf a'r meddyg. Mae angen diwygio'r weithdrefn gwyno, ac mae angen gwneud hynny ar frys.

Kirsty Williams: I have some brief comments on the consultation paper and exercise. It reveals that the current complaints procedure fails to serve the needs of all involved—those who voice a grievance, those who are the subject of a complaint and the NHS staff who have the stressful and difficult task of managing a complaints procedure. Complaints procedures need strong, underlying principles, the first of which should be that every system in Wales is open and uniform. Wherever you are in Wales, there should be a uniform complaints procedure.

Secondly, the complaints procedure must be accessible to all, and for some people that means advocacy and support to help them make a complaint. Even though we have moved away from a culture that does not question medical practitioners, it can be intimidating and difficult for a patient, often in stressful circumstances, to make a complaint.

The procedural channels must also be independent, and must be seen to be so, because, at present, that is not the case. I share David's concerns that any attempt to locate complaints procedures within the NHS would mean that the system would not be perceived as independent. Complainants would always question whether the person dealing with their complaint had an ulterior

system to investigate a complaint.

All this can undermine the confidence of the doctor, or the nurse, and makes him or her more defensive. It means that they become more willing to send patients to hospital and to carry out blood tests and all sorts of other tests as a means of defending themselves against other complaints.

There are major and far-reaching implications to a complaints procedure that is ineffective, slow and cumbersome, and which causes considerable dissatisfaction to patients and doctors alike. The complaints procedure needs to be reformed without delay.

Kirsty Williams: Mae gennyf rai sylwadau byr ar y papur a'r ymarfer ymgynghori. Mae'n dangos bod y weithdrefn gwyno bresennol yn methu â bodloni anghenion pawb sy'n gysylltiedig—y rhai sy'n cwyno, y rhai sy'n destun cwyn a'r staff GIG sydd â'r gwaith anodd ac ingol o reoli gweithdrefn gwyno. Rhaid i weithdrefnau cwyno wrth egwyddorion sylfaenol cadarn, a'r gyntaf ohonynt yw y dylai pob system yng Nghymru fod yn agored ac yn unffurf. Ym mha le bynnag yr ydych yng Nghymru, dylid cael gweithdrefn gwyno unffurf.

Yn ail, rhaid i'r weithdrefn gwyno fod yn hygyrch i bawb, ac yn achos rhai mae hynny'n golygu eiriolaeth a chymorth i'w helpu i wneud cwyn. Er ein bod wedi symud oddi wrth ddiwylliant nad yw'n cwestiynu ymarferwyr meddygol, fe all y claf brofi ofn ac anhawster wrth wneud cwyn, a hynny'n aml mewn amgylchiadau ingol.

Rhaid i'r sianeli trefniadol fod yn annibynnol hefyd, a rhaid iddi fod yn amlwg eu bod felly, oherwydd, ar hyn o bryd, nid yw hynny'n wir. Rhannaf bryderon David y byddai unrhyw ymgais i leoli'r gweithdrefnau cwyno o fewn y GIG yn golygu na fyddai canfyddiad bod y system yn annibynnol. Byddai'r achwynwyr yn amau bob amser fod gan y sawl a oedd yn delio â'u

motive to protect the organisation and the individuals within it.

The system must be administered in a way that keeps everybody informed of the way in which the complaint is progressing. Some of these matters are technical and complex, and, although we would all wish for a speedy system that would seek to resolve complaints quickly, in some cases that is not easy to achieve. Complex mistakes require substantial background information and investigation. That is not to excuse those who draw out the procedure in order to try to protect individuals, but we must acknowledge that sometimes it takes a long time. However, we could ease the concerns of complainants by ensuring that they remain involved and informed during the process.

The consultation responses highlighted specific concerns regarding the primary sector, and these must be addressed. We must find creative ways of ensuring that complaints against independent practitioners working outside the NHS come to somebody's attention. Increasingly, people are working in this capacity outside the NHS, and we must find ways of protecting individuals.

I agree with David Melding and welcome the steps contained in the motion to strengthen the role of community health councils. However, in order to develop and strengthen that role, we must provide the CHCs with better resources than they have at present.

John Griffiths: My local paper—and I am sure that this is true across Wales—is full of letters of gratitude from patients who have received excellent treatment in the national health service. That is the general background to this debate—there is high standard of care, and a good service, delivered by hard-working NHS staff day in, day out. I have noticed from my constituency caseload, that there has been substantial improvement in the way in which the complaints are handled within the NHS in

cywyn gymhelliad cudd i amddiffyn y corff a'r unigolion oddi mewn iddo.

Rhaid gweinyddu'r system mewn modd sy'n sicrhau bod pawb yn cael gwybod sut y mae'r gŵyn yn mynd yn ei blaen. Mae rhai o'r materion hyn yn dechnegol ac yn gymhleth, ac, er y byddem oll yn dymuno cael system gyflym a fyddai'n ceisio penderfynu ar gwynion yn gyflym, nid yw'n hawdd cyflawni hynny mewn rhai achosion. Mae camgymeriadau cymhleth yn galw am wybodaeth gefndir ac ymchwil sylweddol. Nid yw hynny'n esgusodi'r rhai sy'n ymestyn y weithdrefn er mwyn ceisio amddiffyn unigolion, ond rhaid inni gydnabod ei bod yn cymryd cryn amser weithiau. Fodd bynnag, gallem leddfyr pryderon yr achwynwyr drwy sicrhau eu bod mewn cysylltiad ac yn cael eu hysbysu yn ystod y broses.

Yr oedd yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad yn tynnu sylw at bryderon penodol ynghylch y sector gofal sylfaenol, a rhaid rhoi sylw iddynt. Rhaid inni ganfod dulliau creadigol o sicrhau bod cwynion yn erbyn ymarferwyr annibynnol sy'n gweithio y tu allan i'r GIG yn cael eu dwyn i sylw rhywun. Ceir nifer gynyddol sy'n gweithio mewn swyddi o'r fath y tu allan i'r GIG, a rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ddulliau o amddiffyn unigolion.

Cytunaf â David Melding a chroesawaf y camau a geir yn y cynnig i gryfhau rôl y cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn datblygu a chryfhau'r rôl honno, rhaid inni roi gwell adnoddau i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned na'r rhai sydd ganddynt ar hyn o bryd.

John Griffiths: Mae fy mhapur newydd lleol i—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n wir ledled Cymru—yn llawn llythyrau diolch oddi wrth gleifion a gafodd driniaeth ragorol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Dyna gefndir cyffredinol y ddadl hon—rhoddir gofal o safon dda, a gwasanaeth da, gan staff GIG gweithgar ddydd ar ôl dydd. Yr wyf wedi sylwi, yn ôl fy llwyth gwaith o achosion etholaeth, fod gwelliant sylweddol wedi bod yn y dull o drafod cwynion yn y GIG yng Nghymru. Mae'r gwelliannau a fu wedi

Wales. People are impressed by the improvements that have taken place.

There is a recognition that the whole system should be more open, that matters should be dealt with more quickly, and that there should be greater honesty. These issues are being taken forward effectively. We must also support the hard-working staff who will be experiencing the new procedure. They will need adequate training and support because they are under great pressure. Things occasionally go wrong, and when they do, they must be dealt with as effectively as possible.

I want to touch, as Alison Halford has done, on the cost of medical negligence claims. It is a substantial amount of money that does not then go into patient care. We must recognise that there is a close interaction between the complaints system and medical negligence claims that go on into the legal arena. At the less serious level of negligence, people are often happy with apologies and an admission of fault, if made at an early stage. Unfortunately, when this does not happen, positions become entrenched and legal action becomes more likely, leading to legal and settlement costs. Therefore, it would be good if we could deal with matters effectively and adequately at an early stage. That must be part of an integrated approach. I received a letter from Jane Hutt stating that, in 1999-2000, £47,500,000 million was spent on clinical negligence claims in Wales. In 2000-01, the amount was £45,862,000. Those figures show the gross cost of clinical negligence claims; they exclude the Welsh Risk Pool contributions and the expected reimbursement from the pool. They are substantial figures. The total budget for Welsh Health Legal Services is in excess of £1 million a year. We must contain and reduce those costs.

12:05 p.m.

I would like an integrated system in which the complaints procedure is as effective as possible in heading off legal action. As part

gwneud argraff ar bobl.

Mae cydnabyddiaeth y dylai'r holl system fod yn fwy agored, y dylai materion gael eu trafod yn gyflymach, ac y dylid cael mwy o onestrwydd. Mae'r materion hyn yn cael eu hyrwyddo'n effeithiol. Rhaid inni gefnogi hefyd y staff gweithgar a fydd yn profi'r weithdrefn newydd. Bydd arnynt angen hyfforddiant a chymorth digonol oherwydd maent o dan bwysau mawr. Mae pethau'n mynd o'i le weithiau, a phan ydynt, rhaid delio â hwy mor effeithiol â phosibl.

Yr wyf am gyfeirio, fel y gwnaeth Alison Halford, at gost hawliadau esgeulustod meddygol. Mae'n swm sylweddol o arian nad yw'n mynd wedyn at ofal am gleifion. Rhaid inni sylweddoli bod rhyngweithio clòs rhwng y system gwyno a hawliadau esgeulustod meddygol sy'n mynd ymlaen i faes y gyfraith. Yn achos esgeulustod llai difrifol, mae pobl yn fodlon yn aml ar ymddiheuriad a chyfaddefiad o fai, os gwneir hynny'n gynnar. Gwaetha'r modd, pan nad yw hynny'n digwydd, mae safbwyntiau'n caledu ac mae camau cyfreithiol yn dod yn fwy tebygol, gan arwain at gostau cyfreithiol a chostau setliadau. Felly, byddai'n beth da pe gallem ddelio â'r materion hyn yn effeithiol ac yn ddigonol ar gam cynnar. Rhaid i hynny fod yn rhan o ddull gweithredu integredig. Cefais lythyr oddi wrth Jane Hutt a nododd fod £47,500,000 wedi'i wario, yn 1999-2000, ar hawliadau am esgeulustod clinigol yng Nghymru. Yn 2000-01, y swm oedd £45,862,000. Mae'r ffigurau hynny'n dangos cost grynsyth yr hawliadau am esgeulustod clinigol; nid ydynt yn cynnwys y cyfraniadau i Gronfa Risg Cymru a'r ad-daliadau disgwylidig o'r gronfa. Maent yn ffigurau sylweddol. Mae cyfanswm y gyllideb i Wasanaethau Cyfreithiol Iechyd Cymru'n fwy na £1 filiwn y flwyddyn. Rhaid inni ffrwyno a lleihau'r costau hynny.

Hoffwn gael system integredig lle y mae'r weithdrefn gwyno mor effeithiol ag y bo modd wrth atal achosion cyfreithiol. Yn rhan

of that, I would like Welsh Health Legal Services to adopt an approach that recognises that, if claims where there is negligence can be accepted at an early stage, there will be lower settlements and much reduced legal costs. We must work towards that. If we can do that, we will save money which, in turn, can be put into front-line patient care.

Christine Chapman: I broadly welcome this report, which has two elements: the impact on healthcare staff and the impact on patients. On the patient side, I agree with the Assembly's recommendation to allow some discretion to waive the time limit of 12 months in which to make a complaint following an incident, in appropriate circumstances. In my experience, in the event of a death, families take time to grieve and it is difficult for them to be coherent and organised enough to complain within that time limit.

I welcome the priority given to how NHS staff deal with complaints. Patients, and their families, who become victims of negligence, are at their most vulnerable at that time. Care, support and good communication are a must. I welcome that the need for staff to be well trained in communication skills is underlined. I think that we have inherited a culture of 'doctor knows best'. I hope that the days of Sir Lancelot Sprat are over, but who knows? Patients want to be listened to and treated with respect.

I move on to discuss staff, and I declare an interest as I am married to a GP. I get the impression that a disproportionate level of complaints is made against black and ethnic minority doctors. If that is so, it suggests deep-rooted racism, which cannot be tolerated. I ask that that be reviewed.

We should remember that when complaints are made against staff, it has a demoralising effect on them, their colleagues and the wider health service. Dr Dai Lloyd reminded us of the tragic case of Dr Philip Evans of Gowerton. I welcome the fact that this procedure will ensure that those complained

o hynny, hoffwn weld Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol Iechyd Cymru'n mabwysiadu dull o weithredu sy'n cydnabod, os gellir derbyn hawliadau lle y mae esgeulustod yn gynnar, y bydd setliadau llai a chostau cyfreithiol llai o lawer. Rhaid inni geisio cyflawni hynny. Os gallwn wneud hynny, byddwn yn arbed arian y bydd modd ei roi, yn ei dro, at ofal am gleifion yn y rheng flaen.

Christine Chapman: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn yn gyffredinol, ac mae iddo ddwy elfen: yr effaith ar staff gofal iechyd a'r effaith ar gleifion. O ran y cleifion, cytunaf ag argymhelliad y Cynulliad y dylid caniatáu rhywfaint o ryddid i hepgor y cyfyngiad o 12 mis ar y cyfnod i wneud cwyn ar ôl digwyddiad, mewn amgylchiadau priodol. Yn fy mhrofiad i, pan fo marwolaeth, mae'r teuluoedd yn cymryd amser i alaru ac mae'n anodd iddynt fod yn ddigon rhesymegol a threfnus i wneud cwyn o fewn y cyfyngiad amser hwnnw.

Croesawaf y flaenoriaeth a roddir i'r modd y mae staff GIG yn delio â chwynion. Mae'r cleifion, a'u teuluoedd, sy'n dioddef o ganlyniad i esgeulustod, ar eu mwyaf bregus ar yr adeg honno. Rhaid wrth ofal, cymorth a chyfathrebu da. Croesawaf y pwyslais ar y gofyniad i'r staff gael eu hyfforddi'n dda mewn sgiliau cyfathrebu. Credaf ein bod wedi etifeddu diwylliant 'y meddyg a wŷr orau'. Gobeithiaf fod dyddiau Syr Lancelot Sprat ar ben, ond pwy a wŷr? Mae'r cleifion am gael gwrandawriad ac am gael eu trin gyda pharch.

Af ymlaen i drafod staff, a datganaf fuddiant gan fy mod yn briod â meddyg teulu. Caf yr argraff bod nifer anghyfartal o gwynion yn erbyn meddygon du a rhai o leiafrifoedd ethnig. Os yw hynny'n wir, mae'n awgrymu hiliaeth ddwfn, ac ni ellir goddef hynny. Gofynnaf am adolygiad o hynny.

Dylem gofio, pan wneir cwynion yn erbyn staff, fod hynny'n eu digalonni hwy, eu cydweithwyr a'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gyffredinol. Fe'n hatgoffaodd Dr Dai Lloyd ni am achos trist Dr Philip Evans o Dre-gŵyr. Croesawaf y ffaith y bydd y weithdrefn hon yn sicrhau y bydd y rhai y gwneir cwyn

against will be adequately supported throughout.

Helen Mary Jones: I concur with much of what has been said. I agree with John Griffiths's comment that the procedure must be seen in the context of the thousands of positive patient contacts that happen every week in the NHS in Wales. Members will be aware that, in my constituency, we have had two high profile medical negligence cases in the last few years. They were both initially dealt with through the complaints procedure, but were unsatisfactorily resolved. That has made me well aware of the devastating emotional impact that such occurrences can have on the complainant, the complainant's family, the individuals who are directly complained against and, in these two cases, on other staff in the institutions involved.

The current complaints procedure does not meet anyone's needs, and I am pleased that it is being reviewed. I am concerned that the review is taking so long, but I understand the need to take time to get it right. Above all, I believe that those wishing to make complaints need clarity; they need to understand to whom they can make a complaint and how they can do it. I am glad that the issue of making complaints to GP practices is being re-examined. It can be incredibly difficult to make a complaint against a GP, particularly in practices where there is only one practitioner—there are still such practices in Wales, including some in my constituency. I am also pleased to see the emphasis on the need for sensitivity and emotional support for all involved. The staff involved can often feel abandoned, as can the individuals making the complaints. There is a difficult balance between getting the quickest possible resolution to a complaint and the need for people to feel that the process has been independent. The information in the responses to the consultation raises those concerns. There are still steps that need to be taken to ensure that those concerns are addressed and an appropriate balance achieved.

yn eu herbyn yn cael cymorth digonol drwy gydol yr amser.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedwyd. Cytunaf â sylw John Griffiths bod rhaid gweld y weithdrefn yng nghyd-destun y miloedd o gysylltiadau cadarnhaol â chleifion sy'n digwydd bob wythnos yn y GIG yng Nghymru. Bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol ein bod wedi cael dau achos amlwg o esgeulustod meddygol yn fy etholaeth i yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf hyn. Trafodwyd y ddau ohonynt yn gyntaf drwy'r weithdrefn gwyno, ond yr oedd y penderfyniad arnynt yn anfodddhaol. Oherwydd hynny, yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r effaith emosiynol ddinistriol y gall digwyddiadau o'r fath ei chael ar yr achwynydd, teulu'r achwynydd, yr unigolion y gwneir cwyn yn eu herbyn yn uniongyrchol ac, yn y ddau achos hyn, ar staff eraill yn y sefydliadau dan sylw.

Nid yw'r weithdrefn gwyno bresennol yn diwallu anghenion unrhyw un, ac yr wyf yn falch ei bod yn cael ei hadolygu. Yr wyf yn pryderu bod yr adolygiad yn cymryd cymaint o amser, ond deallaf fod angen cymryd amser i'w gael yn iawn. Yn fwy na dim, credaf fod eisiau eglurder ar y rhai sy'n dymuno gwneud cwyn; mae angen iddynt ddeall wrth bwy y gallant wneud cwyn a sut y gallant wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn falch bod y mater o wneud cwynion wrth bractisiau meddygon teulu yn cael ei ailystyried. Gall fod yn anghredadwy o anodd gwneud cwyn yn erbyn meddyg teulu, yn enwedig mewn practisiau lle nad oes ond un ymarferwr—mae practisiau o'r fath yng Nghymru o hyd, a rhai ohonynt yn fy etholaeth i. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o weld y pwyslais ar yr angen am sensitifrwydd a chymorth emosiynol i bawb dan sylw. Mae gan y staff sy'n gysylltiedig le'n aml i deimlo eu bod wedi'u gadael, a'r unigolion sy'n gwneud y gwyn yr un modd. Rhaid dal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng sicrhau penderfyniad cyn gynted â phosibl ar gyfer yr achwynydd a'r angen i bobl deimlo bod y broses wedi bod yn annibynnol. Mae'r wybodaeth yn yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad yn codi'r pryderon hynny. Mae camau i'w cymryd o hyd i sicrhau bod y pryderon hynny'n derbyn sylw a bod y

cydbwysedd yn gywir.

It is crucial that we reduce the culture of defensiveness that exists within NHS bodies when a complaint is raised. Too often, the first instinct is to 'defend our position', rather than to consider the needs of the individual making the complaint, his or her family and the staff members involved. As David Melding said, it is vital that we involve community health councils in providing training and support to members of staff, so that we move from talking about 'managing complaints' to talking about 'seriously investigating' them.

Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn lleihau'r diwylliant amddiffynnol sy'n bodoli yn y cyrff GIG pan wneir cwyn. Yn rhy aml, yr ymateb greddfoll ar y dechrau yw 'amddiffyn ein sefyllfa', yn hytrach nag ystyried anghenion yr unigolyn sy'n gwneud y gŵyn, ei deulu ef neu hi a'r aelodau staff sy'n gysylltiedig. Fel y dywedodd David Melding, mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn cynnwys y cynghorau iechyd cymuned wrth ddarparu hyfforddiant a chymorth i aelodau staff, fel ein bod yn eu symud oddi wrth sôn am 'reoli cwynion' at sôn am 'ymchwilio iddynt o ddifrif'.

This is a step forward, and I am glad that the Government of Wales is giving priority to this. We must build in good practice as a requirement for all health providers across the health service in Wales. We must also ensure consistency. To that end, we must use the national service framework to ensure good standards across Wales. I know that that is being considered, and I would welcome further comment from the Minister on it.

Mae hwn yn gam ymlaen, ac yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n rhoi blaenoriaeth i hyn. Rhaid inni ymgorffori arfer da fel gofyniad i'r holl ddarparwyr iechyd ym mhob rhan o'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni sicrhau cysondeb hefyd. I'r perwyl hwnnw, rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i sicrhau safonau da ledled Cymru. Gwn fod hynny o dan ystyriaeth, a byddwn yn falch o gael sylw pellach arno gan y Gweinidog.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I am grateful to Members for their informed and serious contributions. John Griffiths's comment about putting complaints into context was interesting. For example, during a three-month period last year, Bro Morgannwg NHS Trust received 1,420 letters of appreciation for the service received and 33 complaints. Such figures are collected, and the results are the same across Wales. We must acknowledge that the number of complaints is still small given the number of patients treated and compared to the number who express satisfaction with their treatment. Seventy thousand people are treated every day in the NHS, and the vast majority are satisfied with the care that they receive and they appreciate the care and dedication of staff—in the community and in hospitals.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau gwybodus a difrif. Yr oedd sylw John Griffiths am roi cwynion yn eu cyd-destun yn ddiddorol. Er enghraifft, yn ystod cyfnod o dri mis y llynedd, cafodd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Bro Morgannwg 1,420 o lythyrau o werthfawrogiad am y gwasanaeth a dderbyniwyd a 33 o gwynion. Cesglir ffigurau o'r fath, ac mae'r canlyniadau'r un fath ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod nifer y cwynion yn dal i fod yn fach, o ystyried nifer y cleifion sy'n cael eu trin, o'i gymharu â'r nifer sy'n mynegi bodlonrwydd ar eu triniaeth. Caiff 70,000 o bobl eu trin bob diwrnod yn y GIG, ac mae'r mwyafrif helaeth yn fodlon ar y gofal y maent yn ei dderbyn a gwerthfawrogant ofal ac ymroddiad y staff—yn y gymuned ac yn yr ysbytai.

Janet Davies and David Melding rightly extol

Mae Janet Davies a David Melding yn

the important role of community health councils. They offer an independent voice for patients, and the Assembly endorses and supports them. We are strengthening their role, for example, in primary care, so that CHCs have an interface with hospitals. This will be fully discussed as part of the NHS (Wales) Bill. The role and function of community health councils is being reviewed. They are part of the Pathfinder project, so they are engaged in piloting the complaints advocacy role that is being developed, and are employing their own advocates. They are also linking with patient support officers, in terms of the work in hospitals, and with local health groups. There is also a potential for CHCs to offer training, as David suggested, and to receive independent review panel reports, if the complainants consent. They will be fully involved in the working group which will take the new complaints strategy forward. We must engage CHCs because they are at the forefront of this. I am glad that David made those points. The Association of Welsh Community Health Councils is important in bringing this together strategically. We are considering ways of supporting CHCs and strengthening their funding throughout Wales.

Janet, Alison, John and Helen Mary mentioned important issues involving clinical negligence and complaints. As I said in my opening remarks, while reforming the complaints procedure I will consider the possibility of linking the complaints procedure and clinical governance. We must consider the implications of making that link. We have developed a set of risk management standards for the NHS in Wales, and we are confident that they will reduce the number of incidents that give rise to clinical negligence claims, thus reducing the cost to the NHS, which is a cost to patient care. We want to make the system of dealing with clinical negligence faster and fairer, because delay causes stress and can have financial consequences. We are also considering

canmol yn briodol rôl y cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Maent yn cynnig llais annibynnol dros y cleifion, ac mae'r Cynulliad yn eu cymeradwyo a'u cefnogi. Yr ydym yn cryfhau eu rôl, er enghraifft, mewn gofal sylfaenol, fel bod cysylltiad rhwng y cynghorau iechyd cymuned a'r ysbytai. Trafodir hyn yn llawn fel rhan o Fesur y GIG (Cymru). Mae rôl a swyddogaeth y cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn cael eu hadolygu. Maent yn rhan o'r prosiect Agor Llwybr, felly maent yn gysylltiedig â rhagbrofi'r rôl eiriolaeth cwynion sy'n cael ei datblygu, ac maent yn cyflogi eu heiriolwyr eu hunain. Maent yn cysylltu hefyd â'r swyddogion cymorth cleifion, yng nghyd-destun y gwaith mewn ysbytai, a chyda'r grwpiau iechyd lleol. Mae posibilïad hefyd y gallai'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned gynnig hyfforddiant, fel yr awgrymodd David, a chael adroddiadau'r paneli adolygu annibynnol, os yw'r achwynwyr yn cydsynio. Byddant yn cymryd rhan lawn yn y gweithgor a fydd yn bwrw ymlaen â'r strategaeth gwyno newydd. Rhaid inni gynnwys y cynghorau iechyd cymuned gan eu bod yn y rheng flaen yn hyn o beth. Yr wyf yn falch bod David wedi gwneud y pwyntiau hynny. Mae Cymdeithas Cynghorau Iechyd Cymuned Cymru'n chwarae rhan bwysig wrth drefnu hyn yn strategol. Yr ydym yn ystyried dulliau o gynorthwyo'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned a chynyddu eu cyllid ledled Cymru.

Cyfeiriodd Janet, Alison, John a Helen Mary at faterion pwysig sy'n gysylltiedig ag esgeulustod clinigol a chwynion. Fel y dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, wrth ddiwygio'r weithdrefn gwyno byddaf yn ystyried y posibilïad o gysylltu'r weithdrefn gwyno a llywodraethu clinigol. Rhaid inni ystyried goblygiadau gwneud y cysylltiad hwnnw. Yr ydym wedi datblygu set o safonau rheoli risg ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym yn ffyddiog y byddant yn lleihau nifer y digwyddiadau sy'n achosi hawliadau esgeulustod clinigol, gan leihau'r gost i'r GIG, sy'n gost i ofal am gleifion. Yr ydym am wneud y system o ddelio ag esgeulustod clinigol yn gyflymach ac yn decach, oherwydd mae oedi'n peri straen ac fe all arwain at ganlyniadau ariannol. Yr

alternatives to legal action in dealing with clinical negligence. We are working with the Department of Health to consider how we can find alternatives.

12:15 p.m.

Thank you for your informed comments, Janet. Your work as Chair of the Audit Committee has been important and you have brought this to my, and the Assembly's, attention. We have learned much from that. You and others have also reflected on the difficult and sensitive situations around dealing with complaints—human situations—for patients and staff and how we can be supportive, open and transparent at all levels. Dai talked about the importance of being clear, open and swift in how we handle such situations. He speaks as a GP and Assembly Member. Christine Chapman spoke about the pressures on NHS staff. The tragedy that you both mentioned, concerning the loss of a colleague, has made us consider occupational health support. That needed to be revised and revitalised. We are considering that with professional colleagues.

Christine also spoke about the importance of addressing racism and of recognising that the GP community is often isolated. She also addressed the importance of patients being engaged in an open and transparent complaints system so that they feel that they can take these issues forward.

Alison, it is important that we develop a learning culture in the NHS where we can reduce the need for whistleblowing, so that staff will be able to come forward when they have concerns. We saw what happened to people who took that brave and courageous step, in the Bristol Royal Infirmary and in the north Wales inquiries. Unfortunately, we know that problems still exist. However, we must develop that open and honest culture in the NHS.

All Assembly Members' points will be fed

ydym hefyd yn ystyried dewisiadau eraill yn lle camau cyfreithiol wrth ddelio ag esgeulustod clinigol. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r Adran Iechyd i ystyried sut y gallwn ganfod dewisiadau eraill.

Diolch i chi am eich sylwadau gwybodus, Janet. Mae'ch gwaith fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio wedi bod yn bwysig ac yr ydych wedi dwyn hyn i'm sylw ac i sylw'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi dysgu llawer oddi wrth hynny. Yr ydych chi ac eraill wedi myfyrio ynghylch y sefyllfaoedd anodd a sensitif sy'n gysylltiedig â thrafod cwynion—sefyllfaoedd dynol—ar gyfer y cleifion a'r staff a sut y gallwn fod yn gefnogol, yn agored ac yn dryloyw ar bob lefel. Soniodd Dai am bwysigrwydd bod yn glir, agored a chyflym yn y modd yr ydym yn trafod sefyllfaoedd o'r fath. Mae'n siarad fel meddyg teulu ac Aelod Cynulliad. Soniodd Christine am y pwysigrwydd o drafod y pwysau ar staff y GIG. Mae'r drasiedi y mae'r ddau ohonoch wedi'i chrybwyll, ynghylch colli cydweithiwr, wedi peri inni ystyried mater cymorth iechyd galwedigaethol. Yr oedd angen ailystyried hynny a'i adfywiogi. Yr ydym yn ystyried hynny gyda chydweithwyr proffesiynol.

Soniodd Christine hefyd am y pwysigrwydd o wynebu hiliaeth a chydabod bod modd yn aml i feddygon teulu fel cyfangorff gael eu hynysu. Cyfeiriodd hefyd at bwysigrwydd cynnwys y cleifion mewn system gwyno agored a thryloyw fel y gallant deimlo bod modd iddynt fwrw ymlaen â'r materion hyn.

Alison, mae'n bwysig inni ddatblygu diwylliant sy'n dysgu yn y GIG lle y gallwn leihau'r angen am ddatgelu camarfer, fel y gall staff ddod ymlaen pan fo ganddynt bryderon. Fe welsom yr hyn a ddigwyddodd i bobl a gymerodd y cam dewr ac eofn hwnnw, yn yr ymchwiliadau i Ysbyty Brenhinol Bryste ac yng ngogledd Cymru. Gwyddom fod problemau'n bodoli o hyd, gwaetha'r modd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ddatblygu'r diwylliant agored a gonest hwnnw yn y GIG.

Porthir pwyntiau pob Aelod Cynulliad i'n

into our review. We are taking it forward, as I said, with a conference and a national working group. We must make the right decisions. Therefore, although there is concern about time, we must get this right and ensure that we protect our patients. That will lead to fewer complaints and less clinical negligence, as well as a robust, open and fair system for our staff.

hadolygiad. Yr ydym yn ei hyrwyddo, fel y dywedais, gyda chynhadledd a gweithgor cenedlaethol. Rhaid inni wneud y penderfyniadau iawn. Felly, er bod pryder ynghylch amser, rhaid inni gael hyn yn iawn a sicrhau ein bod yn amddiffyn ein cleifion. Bydd hynny'n arwain at lai o gwynion a llai o esgeulustod clinigol, yn ogystal â system gadarn, agored a theg i'n staff.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.

Amendment 1: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 27.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment defeated.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.

Amendment 2: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 27.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue

Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 6, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 3: For 6, Abstain 12, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Davies, David
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Geraint
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline

Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
 Amendment 4: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 12.20 p.m.
 The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 12.20 p.m.*

Cymeradwyo'r Penderfyniad ar Gyflogau a Lwfansau Aelodau Approval of the Determination on Members' Pay and Allowances

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):
 Marek):** I propose that Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly approves the National y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cymeradwyo
 Assembly for Wales (Assembly Members and Penderfyniad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
 Officials) (Salaries, Allowances etc) (Aelodau a Swyddogion y Cynulliad)
 Determination 2002 laid in the Table Office (Cyflogau, Lwfansau etc) 2002 a osodwyd yn
 on 6 March 2002. (NDM990) y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mawrth 2002.
 (NDM990)*

Time is short, but I hope that Members will Mae amser yn brin, ond gobeithiaf y bydd yr

forgive me if I make a brief statement on the purpose of this determination. The changes in the determination before us have three components. The first deals with the office costs allowance. There are no changes as such, but the list of allowable examples is more comprehensive, and will therefore guide Members better. The House of Commons has moved away from the office costs allowance and now has an incidental costs allowance. This is a possibility that will be investigated by the House Committee, in order to allow Members more flexibility in recovering expenses. I remind Members that whether those expenses are reimbursed is always subject to them being wholly, exclusively and necessarily incurred with regard to National Assembly duties.

The second component of the determination will enable Members to visit regional capitals of European Union member states. I am sure that that will be welcomed. We had considerable difficulty in securing that change, but we have now been able to do so. I remind Members that there is no extra provision for such visits—it will be possible either to visit a capital of a European Union member state or a regional capital. The provision remains at one visit in any one year.

The third change is that Members' salaries will increase to £41,500. There are four strands to consider in arriving at this figure. This year's salary is increased by the agreed formula, which is tied to civil service scales of a 2.5 per cent increase. After that, £1,500 is added. This amount was awarded last year. Newspaper editors in Wales commented freely upon the award at the time. I hope that they remember that it is last year's award, should they decide to comment on this issue this year. The third strand is unfortunate, as it arose from a mistake by the Senior Salaries Review Board. Without going into great detail, it transpires that the amount fixed for Assembly Members' salaries should have been 74.3 per cent of a Member of Parliament's salary, as opposed to the 73.3 per cent that we have been paid over the past three years. The SSRB recommends that we

Aelodau'n maddau i mi os gwnaf ddatganiad byr ar bwrpas y penderfyniad hwn. Mae tair elfen i'r newidiadau yn y penderfyniad sydd ger ein bron. Mae'r gyntaf yn ymwneud â'r lwfans costau swyddfa. Nid oes newidiadau fel y cyfryw, ond mae'r rhestr o enghreifftiau derbyniadwy yn fwy cynhwysfawr, ac yn well arweiniad i'r Aelodau o'r herwydd. Mae Tŷ'r Cyffredin wedi symud oddi wrth y lwfans costau swyddfa a bellach mae ganddo lwfans mân dreuliau. Mae'n bosibl y bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn ymchwilio i hyn, er mwyn caniatáu mwy o hyblygrwydd i'r Aelodau wrth adfer treuliau. Yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Aelodau mai dim ond os aethpwyd i'r costau hynny yn gyfan gwbl, yn llwyr ac yn anochel mewn cysylltiad â dyletswyddau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol y cânt eu had-dalu.

Bydd ail elfen y penderfyniad yn galluogi'r Aelodau i ymweld â phrifddinasoedd rhanbarthol aelod wladwriaethau o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd croeso i hynny. Cawsom gryn anhawster wrth sicrhau'r newid hwnnw, ond yr ydym wedi gallu gwneud bellach. Yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Aelodau nad oes darpariaeth ychwanegol ar gyfer ymweliadau o'r fath—bydd modd un ai ymweld â phrifddinas aelod wladwriaeth o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd neu â phrifddinas ranbarthol. Un ymweliad y flwyddyn yw'r ddarpariaeth o hyd.

Y trydydd newid yw y bydd cyflogau'r Aelodau'n codi i £41,500. Mae pedwar llinyn i'w hystyried wrth gyrraedd y ffigur hwn. Cynyddir y cyflog eleni yn ôl y fformiwla a gytunwyd, sydd ynghlwm wrth raddfeydd y gwasanaeth sifil o gynydd o 2.5 y cant. Ar ôl hynny, ychwanegir £1,500. Dyfarnwyd y swm hwn y llynedd. Gwnaeth golygyddion papurau newydd yng Nghymru sylwadau bras ar y dyfarniad bryd hynny. Gobeithiaf eu bod yn cofio mai dyfarniad y llynedd yw hwn, os byddant yn penderfynu gwneud sylw ar y mater hwn eleni. Mae'r trydydd llinyn yn un anffodus, gan ei fod yn codi o gamgymeriad gan y Bwrdd Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch. Heb fynd i fanylion, cafwyd gwybod mai'r swm a ddylai fod wedi'i bennu ar gyfer cyflogau Aelodau'r Cynulliad yw 74.3 y cant o gyflog Aelod Seneddol, yn hytrach na'r 73.3 y cant a dalwyd i ni dros y

make up the difference, so, £500 has been added, on its suggestion,

tair blynedd diwethaf. Mae'r Bwrdd Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch yn argymhell ein bod yn talu'r gwahaniaeth, felly, ychwanegwyd £500, yn ôl ei awgrym.

To recover the deficit incurred over the past three years, a similar figure is added for the next two years only so that Members will reach the amount that they would have received had this mistake not occurred. I understand that it is unfair, and I know that some Members are not happy with adding recovery in the future as opposed to receiving back payment. However, we consulted the SSRB and, although I will quote its words selectively, the meaning does not change. Although the SSRB recognised the Assembly's right to do as it wished, it was not content with the proposal to backdate payments. The letter received by the Assembly states:

Er mwyn adfer y diffyg yr aethpwyd iddo dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, ychwanegir ffigur tebyg am y ddwy flynedd nesaf yn unig, fel y bydd yr Aelodau'n cyrraedd y swm y byddent wedi'i dderbyn pe na bai'r camgymeriad hwn wedi digwydd. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod hynny'n annheg, a gwn fod rhai Aelodau'n anfodlon ar ychwanegu'r adfeddiant yn y dyfodol yn hytrach na derbyn ôl-daliad. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi ymgynghori â'r Bwrdd Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch ac, er y byddaf yn dyfynnu'n ddetholus o'i eiriau, nid yw hynny'n newid eu ystyr. Er bod y Bwrdd Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch yn cydnabod hawl y Cynulliad i wneud fel y mynno, nid oedd yn fodlon ar y bwriad i ôl-ddyddio'r taliadau. Mae'r llythyr a gafodd y Cynulliad yn dweud:

'the proposal to backdate payment is not one the Review Body could support...Such a course would be without precedent, and contrary to normal practice.'

Faced with that, it was not possible for the House Committee, or me, to recommend backdating, and therefore an element of fairness has been lost. However, I hope that Members will accept that the decisions we have reached are the best possible ones.

Yn wyneb hynny, nid oedd yn bosibl i Bwyllgor y Tŷ, nac i minnau, argymhell ôl-ddyddio, ac felly mae rhywfaint o degwch wedi'i gollu. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau'n derbyn mai'r penderfyniadau a wnaethom yw'r rhai gorau posibl.

We are dealing with public money and should therefore be properly accountable. It is, of course, invidious for us to set our own salaries, and we should do this as infrequently as possible. I am sorry that I have to speak to you on this matter only a year since the last time.

Yr ydym yn trafod arian cyhoeddus ac felly dylem fod yn briodol atebol. Wrth gwrs, peth atgas yw ein bod yn pennu'n cyflogau'n hunain, a dylem wneud hyn mor anaml â phosibl. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf fy mod yn gorfod siarad â chi ar y mater hwn dim ond blwyddyn ers y tro diwethaf.

In this instance, we are not recommending paying ourselves a penny more than the Senior Salaries Review Body would have recommended had the mistake not been made. I ask you to accept these recommendations.

Y tro hwn, nid ydym yn argymhell talu'r un geiniog yn fwy i ni'n hunain nag y byddai'r Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch wedi'i argymhell pe na bai'r camgymeriad wedi digwydd. Gofynnaf ichi dderbyn yr argymhellion hyn.

12:25 p.m.

David Melding: I noted what the Deputy Presiding Officer said in terms of the pay package being precisely what the Senior

David Melding: Nodaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Dirprwy Lywydd o ran bod y pecyn tâl yn union beth yr oedd y Corff Adolygu

Salaries Review Body recommended. If that is the case, that submission should be made available to us in writing so that we can see that it agrees to this bizarre practice, whereby we will make up what was notionally lost in previous years, despite the fact that we voted for those settlements and did not complain about them at the time. Presumably, we felt that our salaries were adequate and that we were not reduced to the status of paupers.

The recovery of the alleged loss of the last three years over the next two will take us past the 2003 election. Retiring or defeated Members will therefore not be fully compensated, while, most bizarrely, newly-elected Members will receive compensation for a loss that never affected them. Such convoluted bells and whistles make us look pretty poor and money grabbing, frankly. We should just accept with dignity that this miscalculation occurred and write it off. It has been put right for the future. We should not recover the losses by means of such an inelegant system. It is unjust to many Members here and will give newly-elected Members a windfall that they do not deserve.

I will not accept the proposed element of back pay. However, I fully accept the other elements of the body's recommendations in terms of last year's settlement, which reviewed our salary compared to MPs, and the inflationary uplift. Those are perfectly justified. However, we are trying to over-egg the custard, and I do not think that it will play well with the electorate and it has a right to condemn us.

Y Llywydd: Nid oes siaradwr arall, ond cyn imi roi'r mater i bleidlais, fe'ch atgoffaf o dan adran 16(7) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, bod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig hwn.

Cyflogau Uwch wedi'i argymhell. Os felly, dylai'r cyflwyniad hwnnw fod wedi'i roi i ni mewn ysgrifen fel ein bod yn gallu gweld ei fod yn gyson â'r arfer rhyfedd hwn, sy'n golygu y byddwn yn cael yn ôl yr hyn a gollwyd yn dybiannol yn y blynyddoedd blaenorol, er gwaethaf y ffaith ein bod wedi pleidleisio dros y setliadau hynny a heb gwyno amdanynt ar y pryd. Mae'n debyg ein bod yn teimlo bod ein cyflogau'n ddigonol ac nad oeddem wedi'n darostwng i statws tlodion.

Bydd adfer colled honedig y tair blynedd diwethaf dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf yn mynd â ni y tu hwnt i etholiad 2003. Felly ni fydd yr Aelodau sy'n ymddeol neu'n cael eu trechu yn cael ad-daliad llawn, tra bydd yr Aelodau a etholir o'r newydd, yn fwyaf rhyfedd, yn cael iawn am gollod nad oedd erioed wedi effeithio arnynt. Mae dyfais astrus o'r fath yn peri inni ymddangos yn eithaf gwael a chribinllyd, a dweud y gwir. Ni ddylem ond derbyn gydag urddas fod y camgyfrif hwn wedi digwydd a'i ddiystyru. Fe'i cywirwyd at y dyfodol. Ni ddylem adfer y colledion drwy system mor amrwd. Mae'n annheg â llawer o'r Aelodau sydd yma a bydd yn rhoi arian annisgwyl i Aelodau a etholir o'r newydd nad ydynt yn ei haeddu.

Ni wnaf dderbyn yr elfen o ôl-daliad a gynigiwyd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn llwyr dderbyn yr elfennau eraill yn argymhellion y corff o ran setliad y llynedd, a adolygodd ein cyflog o'i gymharu â chyflog Aelodau Seneddol, a'r cynnydd ar gyfer chwyddiant. Mae'r rheini'n berffaith gyfiawn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn mynd yn rhy bell, ac ni chredaf y bydd yn dderbyniol iawn gan yr etholwyr ac mae ganddynt hawl i'n collfarnu.

The Presiding Officer: There are no more speakers, but before I put the matter to the vote, I remind you that under section 16(7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, a two-thirds majority is required for this motion to be carried.

Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 2.

Motion: For 47, Abstain 1, Against 2.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Black, Peter
Melding, David

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Richards, Rod

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 12.28 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 12.28 p.m.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Cyllid Cymunedol—Datgloi ein Potensial Community Funding—Unlocking our Potential

Janice Gregory: If time allows, I have agreed that William Graham, Mike German and Janet Davies may make brief contributions.

The recent debate surrounding the new Wales Millennium Centre has had a high profile and been well documented, and has sparked considerable interest from the media and the public alike. I am confident that the centre will be a landmark project that will reach out and benefit all of Wales, not least through economic, social and cultural spin-offs to areas such as my constituency. After all, Wales needs a thriving capital city, confident on the world stage, for the rest of Wales to prosper.

As other Members have said time and again, it is difficult to justify spending money on grandiose projects in Cardiff, when so many communities, not least in the Ogmore constituency, are crying out for regeneration. It is difficult to make the case for a national arts centre when community, church and welfare halls are falling down around people's ears. Pensioners, teenagers, adult learners and mothers and toddlers use those facilities day in, day out.

Many of these people may or may not benefit from the Wales Millennium Centre. However, they are certainly more likely to benefit from the renovation of a community hall, a lifelong learning centre or a sports centre in their own community, on their own doorsteps.

That was why I was extremely disappointed to discover that, as of 4 March this year, only £4 million of lottery money has been spent in the Ogmore constituency, out of over £503 million in Wales as a whole. During the 2000-01 financial year, my constituency

Janice Gregory: Os bydd yr amser yn caniatáu, yr wyf wedi cytuno y caiff William Graham, Mike German a Janet Davies roi cyfraniadau byr.

Mae'r ddadl ddiweddar ynghylch y Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru newydd wedi derbyn llawer o sylw ac wedi'i chofnodi'n helaeth, ac wedi ennyn cryn ddiddordeb yn y cyfryngau a gyda'r cyhoedd fel ei gilydd. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd y ganolfan yn brosiect nodedig a fydd yn estyn allan ac yn dod â budd i Gymru gyfan, nid lleiaf drwy'r sgîl-ffeithiau economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol a fydd i'w gweld mewn ardaloedd fel fy etholaeth i. Wedi'r cwbl, mae ar Gymru angen prifddinas ffyniannus sy'n hyderus ar lwyfan y byd, er mwyn ffyniant gweddill Cymru.

Fel y mae Aelodau eraill wedi dweud dro ar ôl tro, mae'n anodd cyfiawnhau gwario arian ar brosiectau mawreddog yng Nghaerdydd, pan fo cynifer o gymunedau, nid lleiaf y rhai yn etholaeth Ogwr, yn galw'n daer am eu hadfywio. Mae'n anodd dadlau dros ganolfan gelfyddydau genedlaethol pan fo neuaddau cymunedol, neuaddau eglwys a neuaddau lles yn cwmpo'n ddarnau. Mae pensiynwyr, rhai yn eu harddegau, dysgwyr o oedolion a mamau a phlant bach yn defnyddio'r cyfleusterau hynny ddydd ar ôl dydd.

Efallai y bydd llawer o'r bobl hynny'n cael budd o Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru, neu efallai na fyddant. Fodd bynnag, maent yn sicr yn fwy tebygol o gael budd o adnewyddu neuadd gymuned, canolfan dysgu gydol oes neu ganolfan chwaraeon yn eu cymuned eu hunain, ar eu carreg drws eu hunain.

Dyna pam yr oeddwn yn hynod siomedig o ddarganfod mai dim ond £4 miliwn o arian y loteri, fel yr oedd ar 4 Mawrth eleni, sydd wedi'i wario yn etholaeth Ogwr, o'r £503 miliwn yng Nghymru gyfan. Yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol 2000-01, cafodd fy

received £747,000, out of the almost £65 million distributed across Wales. During the same financial year, the Arts Council of Wales approved grants totalling £90,000 in Ogmore, out of an all-Wales total of over £13 million.

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language is confident that the arts council is not an elitist organisation, but the perception on the ground among the community groups, workers and volunteers with whom I speak is different. Their view and, indeed, mine, is that the arts council is elitist, and there appears to be a significant problem in deprived communities accessing their fair share of funding from the arts council, the National Lottery, Sportlot and so forth.

I welcome the Fair Share initiative announced by the Government to try to redress the imbalance in the distribution of lottery funds. Such measures should be backed up by a more concerted medium to long-term effort to remedy the problems that exist in deprived areas in drawing down funding for community projects.

Communities First, one of the Assembly's most celebrated policies, will go a long way in many areas across Wales. However, I speak to people in my constituency who live in villages that are not included in the Communities First programme and in wards that may be numbered 200 or 300 on the index of multiple deprivation. They are just as eager, anxious and impatient to get money for their villages.

Those who are most active in the community know exactly what local people need and want, but they do not know where to get the money. There is a lack of information on the sources of funding. There are many organisations that provide funding, including the arts council, the National Lottery, Sportlot, the new opportunities fund and the coalfields regeneration fund, not forgetting Communities First and Objective 1. There are so many that I challenge any Assembly

etholaeth i £747,000, o'r ymron i £65 miliwn a ddosbarthwyd ledled Cymru. Yn ystod yr un flwyddyn ariannol, cymeradwyodd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru gyfanswm o £90,000 o grantiau yn Ogwr, o'r cyfanswm o dros £13 miliwn i Gymru gyfan.

Mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg yn ffyddiog nad yw cyngor y celfyddydau'n gorff elitaidd, ond mae'r canfyddiad ar lawr gwlad ymysg y grwpiau cymunedol, y gweithwyr a'r gwirfoddolwyr yr wyf fi'n siarad â hwy'n wahanol. Eu barn hwy, a'm barn innau'n wir, yw bod cyngor y celfyddydau'n elitaidd, ac mae'n ymddangos bod cymunedau difreintiedig yn profi cryn anhawster wrth gael eu cyfran deg o arian gan gyngor y celfyddydau, y Loteri Genedlaethol, Sportlot ac yn y blaen.

Croesawaf y fenter Fair Share a gyhoeddwyd gan y Llywodraeth i geisio gwneud iawn am y diffyg cydbwysedd wrth ddosbarthu arian y loteri. Dylid ategu camau o'r fath drwy ymdrech fwy pendant yn y tymor canolig a hir i gywiro'r problemau sy'n wynebu ardaloedd difreintiedig wrth sicrhau arian ar gyfer prosiectau cymunedol.

Bydd Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, un o bolisiau enwocaf y Cynulliad, yn cyfrannu'n helaeth mewn llawer o ardaloedd ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siarad â phobl yn fy etholaeth i sy'n byw mewn pentrefi sydd heb eu cynnwys yn y rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf ac mewn wardiau a allai fod â'r rhif 200 neu 300 yn y mynegrif amddifadedd lluosog. Maent yr un mor awyddus, pryderus a diamynedd yn eu dymuniad i gael arian ar gyfer eu pentrefi.

Mae'r rhai sy'n fwyaf gweithgar yn y gymuned yn gwybod yn union beth y mae ar bobl leol ei eisiau a'i angen, ond ni wyddant ym mhle y gallant gael yr arian. Mae diffyg gwybodaeth am y ffynonellau ariannu. Ceir llawer o gyrff sy'n darparu arian, gan gynnwys cyngor y celfyddydau, y Loteri Genedlaethol, Sportlot, y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd a chronfa adfywio'r meysydd glo, heb sôn am Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf ac Amcan 1. Mae cynifer ohonynt fel y byddwn

Member to get his or her head around that plethora of red tape and bureaucracy, let alone a committee of community volunteers.

I am sure that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities would oblige and take up that challenge, but—and she will surely agree with me—she is not one of those community volunteers on the ground. Ordinary people without the information or the training to submit funding bids are turned off by the bureaucracy yet turned on by the desire to effect change in their community. The Minister cannot go out and write every submission for every voluntary organisation, but actions can be taken in the Assembly which would make a difference.

Could we look at raising awareness in communities, providing more information to community groups, community workers and volunteers? They are the local people that really matter. Could the whole process be streamlined, cutting bureaucracy and red tape, and making life easier on the ground? Could we consider having more direct help for communities, such as trained co-ordinators—people well versed in the tricks of the trade—to go out and help local people to secure funding? We already have community development workers in many areas. Could we build on best practice in that regard? Most importantly, will the Minister consider establishing a one-stop shop at the National Assembly to act as a first point of contact for people who need help?

We might also like to consider new initiatives, such as providing direct support for the renovation of community halls, church halls, welfare halls and so forth. This issue affects communities in all parts of Wales—urban and rural, villages and valleys, towns and cities. I can think of many examples in my constituency, both of best practice and of desperate need.

Pencoed welfare hall is a prime example of how people with the know-how and the desire to do good work in their community can make a difference, and provide the

yn rhoi her i unrhyw Aelod Cynulliad geisio deall y fath fiwrocratiaeth, heb sôn am bwyllgor o wirfoddolwyr yn y gymuned.

Yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau'n cytuno ac yn derbyn yr her honno, ond—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn cytuno â mi—nid yw hi'n un o'r gwirfoddolwyr cymunedol ar lawr gwlad. Mae pobl gyffredin sydd heb yr wybodaeth na'r hyfforddiant i gyflwyno ceisiadau am gyllid yn cael eu diflasu gan y fiwrocratiaeth ond yn cael eu cyffroi gan yr awydd i beri newid yn eu cymuned. Ni all y Gweinidog fynd allan ac ysgrifennu pob cais i bob mudiad gwirfoddol, ond gellir cymryd camau yn y Cynulliad a fyddai'n gwneud gwahaniaeth.

A allem ystyried hybu ymwybyddiaeth mewn cymunedau, darparu rhagor o wybodaeth i grwpiau cymunedol, gweithwyr a gwirfoddolwyr cymunedol? Hwy yw'r bobl leol sy'n wirioneddol bwysig. A ellid symleiddio'r broses gyfan, gan leihau'r fiwrocratiaeth, a gwneud bywyd yn haws ar lawr gwlad? A allem ystyried cael mwy o gymorth uniongyrchol i gymunedau, fel trenfu bod cyd-drefnwyr hyfforddedig—rhai sy'n gyfarwydd â chyfrinachau'r grefft—yn mynd allan a helpu pobl leol i sicrhau cyllid? Mae gennym weithwyr datblygu cymunedol eisoes mewn llawer o ardaloedd. A allem adeiladu ar sail yr arfer gorau yn hynny o beth? Yn bwysicaf oll, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried sefydlu siop un stop yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i fod yn bwynt cyswllt cyntaf i rai y mae arnynt angen cymorth?

Gallem hefyd ystyried mentrau newydd, fel darparu cymorth uniongyrchol i adnewyddu neuaddau cymunedol, neuaddau eglwys, neuaddau lles ac yn y blaen. Mae'r mater hwn yn effeithio ar gymunedau ym mhob rhan o Gymru—rhai trefol a gwledig, pentrefi a chymoedd, trefi a dinasoedd. Gallaf feddwl am lawer o enghreifftiau yn fy etholaeth i, o ran arfer gorau ac angen taer.

Mae neuadd les Pen-coed yn enghraifft ardderchog o'r modd y mae pobl sydd â'r wybodaeth a'r awydd i wneud gwaith da yn eu cymuned yn gallu gwneud gwahaniaeth, a

community with a facility for everyone, of which they can be proud.

Maesteg town hall is another such example. So much good work goes on there, yet, a few years ago, a group of local volunteers had to fight to secure the hall's existence. Groups such as the Friends of Maesteg Town Hall do a fantastic job and deserve every credit and support.

Like the Maesteg town hall, the Berwyn centre in Nantymoel—which celebrates its centenary this year—is also at the heart of its community. It provides a superb theatre venue, as well as a library and a meeting place for a host of community groups.

12:35 a.m.

There are other examples: the Bettws centre; Blaengarw workmen's hall; a day centre in Gilfach Goch; and the drop-in centre in Llanharan, where I had the honour of opening a lottery-funded extension last autumn. The Noddfa chapel project in Caerau is also a much-valued resource, used by bingo-lovers and boxers alike. It has recently been awarded almost £150,000 from the Assembly to turn the old vestry into a family information communications technology suite and a library. That will make a huge difference to the most deprived community in my constituency.

However, for each of these wonderful places, there is another which needs help, such as the Richard Price centre in Llangeinor, Llanharan welfare hall, Blackmill community centre and the senior citizens' hall in Llangynwyd. The children of Nantymffyllon need a new playing field, the Nantymoel boys and girls club needs refurbishing, and Cwm Ogwr Project for Youth wants to open a drop-in centre. Only this week, I was handed a letter from Heol-y-cyw's old age pensioners' association. It was pleading to the Assembly for help, as it does not know how to start to access funding to stop the decline in its membership, which has been brought about by the cold and inhospitable conditions in the welfare hall where it

darparu cyfleuster i bawb yn y gymuned, y gallant ymfalchïo ynddo.

Mae neuadd dref Maesteg yn enghraifft arall o'r fath. Gwneir llawer iawn o waith da yno, ac eto, ychydig o flynyddoedd yn ôl, bu'n rhaid i grŵp o wirfoddolwyr lleol ymladd i sicrhau parhad y neuadd. Mae grwpiau fel Cyfeillion Neuadd Dref Maesteg yn gwneud gwaith rhyfeddol ac yn haeddu pob clod a chefnogaeth.

Fel neuadd dref Maesteg, mae canolfan y Berwyn yn Nant-y-moel—sy'n dathlu ei chanmlwyddiant eleni—yng nghalon y gymuned. Mae'n ganolfan theatr wych, ac yn cynnig llyfrgell a man cyfarfod i lu o grwpiau cymunedol.

Mae enghreifftiau eraill: canolfan y Bettws; neuadd weithwyr Blaengarw; canolfan dydd yn y Gilfach Goch; a'r ganolfan galw heibio yn Llanharan, y cefais y fraint o agor estyniad ati a noddwyd gan y loteri yr hydref diwethaf. Mae prosiect capel Noddfa yn y Caerau yn adnodd gwerthfawr hefyd, a chaiff ei ddefnyddio gan garedigion bingo a bocswyr fel ei gilydd. Dyfarnwyd ymron i £150,000 iddo'n ddiweddar gan y Cynulliad i droi'r hen festri'n ystafell technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu deuluol ac yn llyfrgell. Bydd hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth aruthrol i'r gymuned fwyaf difreintiedig yn fy etholaeth.

Fodd bynnag, am bob un o'r manau rhyfeddol hyn, mae un arall sydd ag angen cymorth, fel canolfan Richard Price yn Llangeinor, neuadd les Llanharan, canolfan gymunedol Melin Ifan Ddu a'r neuadd hen bensynwyr yn Llangynwyd. Mae ar blant Nantymffyllon angen cae chwarae newydd, mae angen adnewyddu clwb bechgyn a merched Nant-y-moel, ac mae Prosiect Cwm Ogwr i Bobl Ifanc yn dymuno agor canolfan galw heibio. Yr wythnos hon, daeth llythyr i'm llaw oddi wrth gymdeithas hen bensynwyr Heol-y-cyw. Yr oedd yn apelio i'r Cynulliad am gymorth, gan nad yw'n gwybod sut i ddechrau sicrhau arian i atal y gostyngiad yn ei haelodaeth, a achoswyd gan yr amodau oer a digroeso yn y neuadd les lle

meets—the only facility in the village.

The problems in Ogmore are illustrated by the fact that, even in the third year of the Assembly's existence, the South East Wales Regional Committee has still not been able to find a suitable venue in which to meet in the constituency.

The Assembly, in partnership with local people and communities, can surely take positive action to support projects and initiatives that need our help. Accessing the funding is key. We need to break down the barriers, open doors and help our communities to unlock their potential. [*Applause.*]

William Graham: I endorse all of Janice's cogent remarks. Her 'one-stop shop' is a welcome and positive initiative. Many people get good ideas, take them forward and win the finance to start new projects. They then find that they spend most of the first year of their project trying to finance the second and third years. I know that the Minister has heard this before, and she will hear it again, no doubt. Can we incorporate a provision to prevent that from happening? It is one of the few ways of ensuring that a local community can take ownership of its scheme, and provide proper continuity. From remarks made today, I know that this initiative will be well received by all Members and by those listening today. It is a pity that there are so few people here, but that is usual for a short debate. I thoroughly endorse Janice's remarks, and hope that the Minister can take action on this shortly.

Janet Davies: I congratulate Janice on bringing this subject forward. I also wish to point out that various funding regimes exist and it is crucial to use them all as effectively as possible, to unlock the potential that exists in the most deprived communities. They have been disappointed too many times in the past.

y mae'n cyfarfod—yr unig gyfleuster yn y pentref.

Amlygir y problemau yn Ogwr gan y ffaith nad yw Pwyllgor Rhanbarthol De Ddwyrain Cymru, hyd yn oed yn y drydedd flwyddyn ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, byth wedi gallu dod o hyd i ganolfan addas i gyfarfod yn yr etholaeth.

Mae'n sicr y gall y Cynulliad gymryd camau cadarnhaol, ar y cyd â phobl leol a chymunedau, i gynorthwyo prosiectau a mentrau y mae arnynt angen cymorth gennym. Cyrraedd y cyllid yw'r peth allweddol. Rhaid inni chwalu'r rhwystrau, agor drysau a helpu'n cymunedau i ddatgloi eu potensial. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

William Graham: Cymeradwyaf bob un o'r sylwadau effeithiol a wnaeth Janice. Mae ei siop un stop yn fenter gadarnhaol sydd i'w chrosawu. Mae llawer o bobl yn cael syniadau da, maent yn eu datblygu ac yn sicrhau'r cyllid i gychwyn prosiectau newydd. Wedyn maent yn canfod eu bod yn treulio'r rhan fwyaf o flwyddyn gyntaf eu prosiect yn ceisio ariannu'r ail a'r drydedd flwyddyn. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi clywed hyn o'r blaen, a bydd yn ei glywed eto, mae'n siŵr. A allwn gynnwys darpariaeth i atal hynny? Mae'n un o'r ychydig ddulliau o sicrhau y gall cymuned leol fod yn berchen ar ei chynllun, ac o ddarparu parhad priodol. Yn ôl y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd heddiw, gwn y bydd y fenter hon yn dderbyniol iawn gan yr holl Aelodau a'r rhai sy'n gwranddo heddiw. Mae'n drueni bod cyn lleied o bobl yma, ond mae hynny'n arferol ar gyfer dadl fer. Yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogi sylwadau Janice, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu cymryd camau ar hyn cyn hir.

Janet Davies: Llongyfarchaf Janice ar godi'r pwnc hwn. Yr wyf finnau'n dymuno tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod amryw o gyfundrefnau ariannu a'i bod yn hollbwysig defnyddio pob un ohonynt mor effeithiol ag y bo modd i ddatgloi'r potensial sy'n bodoli yn y cymunedau mwyaf diffreintiedig. Maent wedi'u siomi gormod o weithiau yn y gorffennol.

I live in the eastern part of the Ogmore constituency, which is part of Rhondda Cynon Taff, and I thank Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council for the help that it has given to my community to access new funding.

We need to welcome everyone who wants to be involved, whether they have specific short-term aims, or whether they want to be involved for longer periods. We are talking about social inclusion. That means including those who may be loud in their criticism, or who may find it difficult to come to terms with the constraints and the rules. Exclusion is not acceptable.

Including everyone is particularly important in communities such as those at the tops of the Valleys, where disillusionment is so severe that most people have given up. Learning to work together is the first step in releasing potential.

Michael German: I congratulate Janice on her comments, particularly on local people who know best what their communities need and how best to sort it out, but who look for help from the bigger and broader political community which resides in the National Assembly. I will raise three brief points which I want the Minister to address.

First, over recent years, we have devalued our town and community councils in Wales. Some of them are working well. However, some are working badly, and that is probably because we have not given them a specific task. Some time in the future, the weakened base of local town and community councils will have to be addressed and strengthened.

Secondly, on Communities First, Janice quite rightly said that local people know how best to deal with local issues. I am slightly worried about the tendency to move overarching operators in from outside communities to help promote the Communities First project. What we need are facilitators—people who can unlock the skills of local people to do things for

Yr wyf yn byw yn y rhan ddwyreiniol o etholaeth Ogwr, sy'n rhan o Rondda Cynon Taf, a diolchaf i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf am y cymorth a roddodd i'm cymuned gael at gyllid newydd.

Mae angen inni groesawu pawb sy'n dymuno cymryd rhan, boed ganddynt nodau tymor byr penodol, neu ddymuniad i gymryd rhan am gyfnod hwy. Cynhwysiant cymdeithasol yw'r hyn sydd dan sylw. Mae hynny'n golygu cynnwys y rhai allai fod yn groch eu beirniadaeth, neu a allai'i chael yn anodd dygymod â'r cyfyngiadau a'r rheolau. Nid yw allgáu'n dderbyniol.

Mae'n arbennig o bwysig cynnwys pawb mewn cymunedau fel y rhai ym mlaenau'r Cymoedd, lle y mae cymaint o ddadrithiad fel bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl wedi rhoi'r ffidil yn y to. Dysgu i gydweithio yw'r cam cyntaf wrth ddatgloi potensial.

Michael German: Llongyfarchaf Janice ar ei sylwadau, yn enwedig y rhai ar y bobl leol sy'n gwybod orau beth y mae ar eu cymuned ei angen a sut i'w ddatrys orau, ond sy'n chwilio am gymorth oddi wrth y gymuned wleidyddol fwy ac ehangach sydd yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Codaf dri phwynt byr y dymunaf i'r Gweinidog roi sylw iddynt.

Yn gyntaf, dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi dibrisio'n cynghorau tref a chymuned yng Nghymru. Mae rhai ohonynt yn gweithio'n dda. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai'n gweithio'n wael, a'r rheswm am hynny, yn ôl pob tebyg, yw nad ydym wedi rhoi gorchwyl penodol iddynt. Rywbryd yn y dyfodol, bydd yn rhaid ymdrin â sylfaen wan y cynghorau tref a chymuned a'i chryfhau.

Yn ail, ynghylch Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, fe ddywedodd Janice yn gwbl briodol mai pobl leol a wŷr orau sut i ddelio â materion lleol. Yr wyf yn poeni braidd ynghylch y duedd i ddod â gweithredwyr cyffredinol i mewn o'r tu allan i gymunedau i helpu i hyrwyddo'r prosiect Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Yr hyn y mae arnom ei angen yw hwyluswyr—pobl sy'n gallu datgloi sgiliau

themselves.

The third issue is the recurrent one that I—and I am sure we all—hear from the voluntary sector: what slows them down is that they do not have core funding on a longer-than-annual basis. People spend six months of the year trying to get funding for the following year, and the following six months seeking funding for the next year. They are struggling to spend the money in-year. Is there a way to consider core funding for the voluntary sector on a more permanent, or at least a longer-term, basis?

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): In choosing this topic, Janice has struck a chord with all Assembly Members. Within our various communities, we all see wonderful examples of community halls and facilities. I also want to mention church halls, which are essential to communities. That is particularly true of church halls in rural areas, which do not seem to attract any additional money or resources simply because they are owned by the church, yet they are at the heart of the community. We must consider these issues.

I will deal specifically with some of Mike's points. Town and community councils are more valued now, because their issues are brought to the table via the partnership council. They have more access than ever to Government Ministers if they want to discuss community issues.

I am concerned about Communities First and the overarching operators, because I have anecdotal evidence of what is happening in that regard. Members should let me know if they have anything they wish to draw to my attention. The correct balance needs to be struck between the overarching operation of the scheme and the involvement of local people.

On core funding for the voluntary sector, the

pobl leol i wneud pethau drostynt eu hunain.

Y trydydd mater yw'r un sy'n codi dro ar ôl tro ac yr wyf fi—a phawb ohonom, yr wyf yn siŵr—yn ei glywed gan y sector gwirfoddol: yr hyn sy'n eu harafu yw nad oes ganddynt gyllid craidd am fwy na blwyddyn. Maent yn treulio chwe mis o'r flwyddyn yn ceisio cael cyllid ar gyfer y flwyddyn ddilynol, a'r chwe mis wedyn yn chwilio am gyllid i'r flwyddyn nesaf. Maent yn cael trafferth gwario'r arian o fewn y flwyddyn. A oes modd ystyried rhoi cyllid craidd i'r sector gwirfoddol ar sail fwy parhaol, neu sail dymor hir o leiaf?

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Wrth ddewis y pwnc hwn, mae Janice wedi taro tant gyda holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Yn ein gwahanol gymunedau, yr ydym yn gweld enghreifftiau ardderchog o neuaddau a chyfleusterau cymunedol. Yr wyf finnau am sôn am neuaddau eglwys, sy'n hollbwysig i gymunedau. Mae hynny'n arbennig o wir am neuaddau eglwys mewn ardaloedd gwledig, y mae'n ymddangos nad ydynt yn denu unrhyw arian neu adnoddau ychwanegol dim ond am eu bod yn eiddo i'r eglwys, ac eto maent yng nghalon y gymuned. Rhaid inni ystyried y materion hyn.

Ymdriniaf yn benodol â rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Mike. Yr ydym yn rhoi mwy o bris ar gynghorau tref a chymuned yn awr, oherwydd mae'r materion sydd o bwys iddynt yn cael eu dwyn i'n sylw drwy'r cyngor partneriaeth. Mae ganddynt fwy o gyfle nag erioed i weld Gweinidogion y Llywodraeth os ydynt yn dymuno trafod materion cymunedol.

Yr wyf fi'n bryderus ynghylch Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a'r gweithredwyr cyffredinol, oherwydd mae gennyf dystiolaeth anecdotaidd am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn hynny o beth. Dylai'r Aelodau roi gwybod i mi os oes ganddynt rywbeth y maent yn dymuno ei ddwyn i'm sylw. Rhaid dal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng gweithrediad cyffredinol y cynllun a'r rhan a gymerir gan bobl leol.

Ynghylch cyllid craidd i'r sector gwirfoddol,

Assembly is putting its house in order and considering possible three-year funding cycles. The Welsh Local Government Association and I have initiated a discussion with the voluntary sector about similar agreements in local government for the core servicing of the voluntary sector. Some local authorities already have excellent funding arrangements, but others do not.

William said that we need to assess the issues, and suggested how we could do so in terms of how much money we give. Both William and Janice mentioned the idea of a one-stop shop. If we are going to examine that area, it is important to assess what current help is available, how it is marshalled and how we could assist further.

William also raised a wider issue of what happens in the years following initial grants, and the implications of the continuity of revenue. Perhaps people also need more assistance in that regard. That picks up on Janet Davies's points on the surrounding funding issues. Some are better than others at sorting out their funding.

I now turn to several points raised by Janice. We all understand her point on lottery money and the Arts Council of Wales. Jenny Randerson, the Minister for Culture, Sports and the Welsh Language, is aware of this issue. Arts council money invariably concerns substantial sums, and much of it goes to large organisations, such as the Welsh National Opera or the BBC National Orchestra of Wales. There is concern that we must get arts closer to people and communities, and Jenny is aware of the need to consider that in the funding agenda.

Janice mentioned the fair share of lottery funding. Jenny Randerson has been anxious about this, and has taken recent action on this. She met all the lottery distributors in Wales to discuss their strategic approaches to funding. One of her key messages to them

mae'r Cynulliad yn rhoi trefn ar ei bethau ac yn ystyried y posibilid o gylchoedd ariannu tair blynedd. Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a minnau wedi dechrau trafodaeth â'r sector gwirfoddol am gytundebau tebyg mewn llywodraeth leol ar gyfer gwasanaethau craidd y sector gwirfoddol. Mae gan rai awdurdodau lleol drefniadau ariannu rhagorol eisoes, ond nid eraill.

Dywedodd William fod angen inni asesu'r materion dan sylw, ac awgrymodd sut y gallem wneud hynny o ran faint o arian yr ydym yn ei roi. Soniodd William a Janice am y syniad o siop un stop. Os ydym i edrych ar y maes hwnnw, mae'n bwysig asesu pa gymorth sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd, sut y caiff ei drefnu a sut y gallem gynorthwyo ymhellach.

Cododd William y mater mwy cyffredinol hefyd o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y blynyddoedd ar ôl y grantiau cyntaf, a'r goblygiadau o ran parhad y referniw. Efallai fod ar bobl angen mwy o gymorth yn hynny o beth. Mae hynny'n cyffwrdd â'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Janet Davies ar y materion ariannu cysylltiedig. Mae rhai'n well na'i gilydd wrth roi trefnu ar eu cyllid.

Trof yn awr at sawl pwynt a gododd Janice. Yr ydym oll yn deall ei phwynt am arian y loteri a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Mae Jenny Randerson, y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg, yn ymwybodol o'r mater hwn. Mae arian cyngor y celfyddydau yn golygu symiau sylweddol yn ddi-ffael, ac aiff llawer ohono at gyrff mawr, fel Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru neu Gerddorfa Genedlaethol Gymreig y BBC. Mae teimlad bod yn rhaid inni ddod â'r celfyddydau'n agosach at bobl a chymunedau, ac mae Jenny yn ymwybodol o'r angen i ystyried hynny yn yr agenda ariannu.

Soniodd Janice am y gyfran deg o gyllid y loteri. Mae Jenny Randerson wedi bod yn bryderus am hynny, ac wedi cymryd camau'n ddiweddar yn ei gylch. Cyfarfu â holl ddosbarthwyr y loteri yng Nghymru i drafod eu strategaethau ariannu. Un o'i negeseuon

was that they must seek to ensure that people in all parts of Wales have the opportunity to access lottery funds. Where there are inequalities, the distributors must seek to build capacity, to ensure that they receive a number of applications. Capacity building is important.

Janice made this point well: it is easy for me, or other Assembly Members, to tell any group, 'this is where you go for funding'. It is different for me to say that and to seek assistance, than for the many people who are just working in their communities. There are central issues here. It is important to target the most deprived areas with a fair share of lottery funding. That aims to raise the capacity in those areas. It is important that we keep our fingers on the pulse of how these distributors deal with lottery funding—in the arts or sport—to ensure that funds go to the areas of greatest need.

Community halls and centres are able to apply for Communities First funding. There is also the community fund, which has allocated £4.4 million for the refurbishment of community halls. The Millennium Commission also considered good causes in terms of community halls. From what Janice and others have said, I see that we must bring these together so that people have a focus for a quick answer. I will also probably have to undertake more work through the Communities First directorate to ensure easier access to funds, and to ensure that they are easily understandable. We must undertake further work in cutting down on the jargon and giving people access to funds.

We are all committed to our communities. Community halls, in urban and rural Wales, are at the heart of all activities. When I accompanied Janice to Pencoed, I was pleased to see that it had a beautiful hall. I also saw an interesting project with Noddfa chapel, working in a deprived community, and making excellent use of a former chapel. All those involved were enthusiastic for the project. It made a great difference to the

allweddol iddynt oedd bod yn rhaid iddynt geisio sicrhau cyfle i bob rhan o Gymru gael at arian y loteri. Pan fo anghydraddoldebau, rhaid i'r dosbarthwyr geisio datblygu capasiti, i sicrhau eu bod yn derbyn nifer o geisiadau. Mae datblygu capasiti yn bwysig.

Gwnaeth Janice y pwynt hwn yn dda: mae'n ddigon hawdd i mi, neu Aelodau Cynulliad eraill, ddweud wrth ryw grŵp, 'i'r fan honno y dylech fynd i gael cyllid'. Un peth yw hi i mi ddweud hynny a cheisio cymorth, peth arall yw hi i'r nifer fawr o bobl sy'n gweithio yn eu cymunedau. Mae materion sylfaenol i'w trafod yma. Mae'n bwysig inni dargedu cyfran deg o arian y loteri ar yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Bwriad hynny yw cynyddu'r capasiti yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae'n bwysig inni fod yn effro i'r modd y mae'r dosbarthwyr hyn yn delio â chyllid y loteri—yn y celfyddydau neu chwaraeon—i sicrhau bod arian yn mynd at yr ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus.

Mae neuaddau a chanolfannau cymunedol yn gallu ymgeisio am gyllid Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Ceir y gronfa gymunedol hefyd, sydd wedi dyrannu £4.4 miliwn at adnewyddu neuaddau cymunedol. Yr oedd Comisiwn y Mileniwm hefyd yn ystyried neuaddau cymunedol yn achosion da. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedodd Janice ac eraill, gwelaf fod yn rhaid inni ddod â'r rhain at ei gilydd fel bod gan bobl un lle i droi ato am ateb sydyn. Mae hefyd yn debyg y bydd yn rhaid imi wneud rhagor o waith drwy gyfarwyddiaeth Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf i sicrhau ei bod yn haws cyrraedd cronfeydd, ac i sicrhau bod modd eu deall yn hawdd. Rhaid inni wneud rhagor o waith o ran lleihau'r jargon a rhoi mynediad i bobl at gronfeydd

Yr ydym oll wedi ymrwymo i'n cymunedau. Mae'r neuaddau cymunedol, yn y Gymru drefol a'r Gymru wledig, ynghanol yr holl weithgareddau. Pan euthum gyda Janice i Ben-coed, yr oeddwn yn falch o weld bod neuadd hyfryd yno. Gwelais brosiect ddiddorol hefyd yng nghapel Noddfa, sy'n gweithio mewn cymuned ddifreintiedig, ac yn gwneud defnydd rhagorol o gyn gapel. Yr oedd pawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig yn frwd

children who attended the after-school club. Food was provided there, and the children were looking forward to the new library facilities. If the Assembly does anything at all, it should build up such communities, so that people see the benefit of Assembly money going out across Wales to all small communities, delivering a real change in people's lives.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

dros y prosiect. Gwnaeth wahaniaeth mawr i'r plant a fynychai'r clwb ar ôl ysgol. Yr oedd bwyd yn cael ei ddarparu yno, ac yr oedd y plant yn edrych ymlaen at y cyfleusterau llyfrgell newydd. Os yw'r Cynulliad yn gwneud rhywbeth o gwbl, dylai gryfhau cymunedau o'r fath, fel bod pobl yn gweld y budd o arian y Cynulliad yn mynd allan ledled Cymru at bob cymuned fach, gan beri newid gwirioneddol ym mywydau pobl.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.46 p.m.

The session ended at 12.46 p.m.