



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 25 Mehefin 2002**

**Tuesday 25 June 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |   |
|----|---|
| 3  | Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru<br><i>Questions to the First Minister</i>  |
| 25 | Datganiad ar Dawn Meats Cyf<br><i>Statement on Dawn Meats Ltd</i>   |
| 31 | Datganiad Busnes<br><i>Business Statement</i>   |
| 33 | Datganiad gan y Llywydd<br><i>Statement by the Presiding Officer</i>  |
| 36 | Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Addysg<br><i>Composite Motion: Approval of Education Orders</i>   |
| 38 | Cod Ymarfer ar Benodiadau Cyhoeddus<br><i>Code of Practice on Public Appointments</i>   |
| 60 | Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Difyriad Economaidd yng Nghefn Gwlad Cymru<br><i>Minority Party Debate (Conservative Party): Economic Decline in Rural Wales</i> |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

### Camddefnyddio Sylweddau Substance Misuse

**Q1 Brian Gibbons:** Has the First Minister had any communication with South Wales Police regarding the problem of substance misuse in Wales? (OAQ18492)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Correspondence has been received from Dyfed Powys Police and South Wales Police about the spread of heroin and crack cocaine in Wales. I announced last week that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, Edwina Hart, will combine her responsibilities for local government and communities with responsibility for action on drug and alcohol abuse. This will ensure that greater priority is given to Assembly Government responsibilities for crime reduction and safer communities. Arrangements are in hand for a meeting between Edwina, me and the four Welsh chief constables.

**Brian Gibbons:** I have had a number of reports of the increased availability of many hard drugs in my constituency. However, thankfully, the increased levels of criminality and social dysfunction usually associated with this problem have not yet emerged. Do you think it would be appropriate to consider, perhaps in conjunction with the Secretary of State for Wales, calling an all-Wales conference to examine this problem, with a view to trying to head off the more serious problems highlighted by the assistant chief constable of South Wales Police?

**The First Minister:** The idea of an all-Wales conference is promising but perhaps it should not be considered until after Edwina and I have met the four chief constables to discuss the best way forward. I visited Cardiff central police station to discuss this, among other issues, on 14 June. You wrote to me on that day, Brian, about how we should head off the

**C1 Brian Gibbons:** A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Heddlu De Cymru ynghylch problem camddefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghymru? (OAQ18492)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Derbyniwyd gohebiaeth oddi wrth Heddlu Dyfed Powys a Heddlu De Cymru ynglŷn â lledaeniad heroin a chocêr crac yng Nghymru. Cyhoeddais yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, Edwina Hart, yn cyfuno'i chyfrifoldebau dros lywodraeth leol a chymunedau gyda chyfrifoldeb dros weithredu ar y camddefnydd o gyffuriau ac alcohol. Bydd hyn yn sicrhau y rhoddir mwy o flaenoriaeth i gyfrifoldebau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros leihau torcyfraith a diogelu cymunedau. Mae trefniadau mewn llaw ar gyfer cyfarfod rhwng Edwina a minnau a phedwar prif gwnstabl Cymru.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf wedi clywed bod mwy o gyffuriau caled ar gael yn fy etholaeth. Fodd bynnag, diolch i'r drefn, nid yw'r lefelau uwch o dorcyfraith a thrafferthion cymdeithasol a gysylltir fel arfer â'r broblem hon wedi dod i'r wyneb eto. A ydych yn meddwl y byddai'n briodol ystyried, ar y cyd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru efallai, cynnal cynhadledd Cymru gyfan i ystyried y broblem hon, gyda'r nod o geisio achub y blaen ar y problemau mwy difrifol a amlygwyd gan brif gwnstabl cynorthwyol Heddlu De Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r syniad o gynhadledd Cymru gyfan yn un addawol ond efallai na ddylid ei ystyried hyd nes bydd Edwina a mi wedi cyfarfod â'r pedwar prif gwnstabl i draffod y ffordd orau ymlaen. Euthum i swyddfa heddlu ganolog Caerdydd i draffod hyn, ymhlið materion eraill, ar 14 Mehefin. Bu ichi ysgrifennu ataf ar y

problem before it becomes serious. That is the right way to approach this situation. I understand that the problem is serious in Bristol, which is not far away, and in Liverpool, which is not far from north Wales. It is important that the problem is headed off before it becomes as serious in Wales.

diwrnod hwnnw, Brian, ynghylch sut y dylem ymdrin â'r broblem cyn iddi fynd yn ddifrifol. Dyna'r ffordd gywir i ddelio â'r sefyllfa hon. Deallaf fod y broblem yn ddifrifol ym Mryste, sydd nid nepell i ffwrdd, ac yn Lerpwl, nad yw ymhell o'r Gogledd. Mae'n bwysig rhwystro'r broblem cyn iddi ddatblygu i fod yr un mor ddifrifol yng Nghymru.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a pharmacist. You will be aware of the recent tragic, drugs-related deaths in my constituency. In view of the fact that there is a mortality rate of 10 per cent for addicts waiting for more than a year for drug rehabilitation services, what urgent action is your Government taking to alleviate the horrendous waiting times, often up to 18 months, for such treatment in my constituency?

**The First Minister:** I am grateful to you for raising that point. I raised the issue of the drug deaths in the Rhondda with South Wales Police during my recent visit to Cardiff central police station. The police told me that the picture is complex. I do not remember them raising the issue of waiting times for drug treatment, but that does not mean that it is not a serious issue. If there are specific problems in the Rhondda in terms of the numbers of beds available for drug treatment, I would be grateful if you would write to me. The main burden of Assistant Chief Constable Francis's letter—sent on behalf of the South Wales, Gwent and Dyfed Powys police forces—was that we need much tighter co-ordination between drug and alcohol advisory treatment and policing. That is why I put Edwina in charge of that issue, to fit in with her existing responsibilities.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel fferyllydd. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r marwolaethau trasig diweddar a oedd yn gysylltiedig â chyffuriau yn fy etholaeth i. Yn wyneb y ffaith bod 10 y cant o bobl gaeth i gyffuriau sy'n gorfol aros dros flwyddyn am wasanaethau adsefydlu defnyddwyr cyffuriau yn marw, pa gamau brys y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i liniaru'r amserau aros echrydus, hyd at 18 mis yn aml, am driniaeth o'r fath yn fy etholaeth ?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am godi'r pwynt hwnnw. Codais fater y marwolaethau oherwydd cyffuriau yn y Rhondda gyda Heddlu De Cymru yn ystod fy ymweliad diweddar â swyddfa heddlu ganolog Caerdydd. Dywedodd yr heddlu wrthyf ei fod yn fater cymhleth. Nid wyf yn cofio iddynt sôn am fater amserau aros am driniaeth cyffuriau, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu nad yw'n fater difrifol. Os oes problemau penodol yn y Rhondda o ran y niferoedd o welyau sydd ar gael i drin pobl sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddech yn ysgrifennu ataf. Prif fyrdwn llythyr y Prif Gwnstabl Cynorthwyol Francis—a anfonwyd ar ran heddluoedd De Cymru, Gwent a Dyfed Powys—oedd fod angen cydgysylltu llawer tynnach rhwng triniaeth a chyngor cyffuriau ac alcohol a phlismona. Dyna pam y rhoddais y cyfrifoldeb am y mater hwnnw i Edwina, i gyd-fynd â'r cyfrifoldebau sydd ganddi eisoes.

**Alun Cairns:** Having spent an evening with officers from South Wales Police in Swansea city centre some weeks ago, I observed the potential for conflict when large numbers of people congregate together. Many substance misuse problems arise from such situations, and the police were keen to present their local answer, which is a scheme called TASSC—tackling alcohol and substance related street

crime in Swansea. Is the First Minister familiar with this scheme, and, if not, will he make plans to discuss the matter with South Wales Police so that we can consider what support we can give, as many of the responsibilities will fall upon local authorities?

**The First Minister:** I shall certainly attempt to familiarise myself with the scheme, although not necessarily in the way you have, Alun—that would be well past my bedtime. The way in which voluntary sector and health sector activities are co-ordinated with the police is important in preventing the problem from getting out of hand, as it has done in the large metropolitan areas of England, including those which are close to Wales, such as Liverpool, Manchester and Bristol. These areas may be a source of cheaper drugs for Wales, which may lead to turf wars and enforcement problems.

**Alison Halford:** Can you comment on the reported suggestion by the chief constable of North Wales Police that part of the police budget should go towards the rehabilitation of drugs offenders?

**The First Minister:** I cannot comment on that because I have not seen it, but if you direct me to where you have seen the comment, I will ensure that either I or Edwina replies with the Assembly Government's view on it.

### **Gwasanaethau Trafnidiaeth rhwng y Gogledd a'r De Transport Services between North and South Wales**

**C2 Dafydd Wigley:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar bryd y bydd y nod o wella gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth rhwng gogledd a de Cymru'n cael ei gyrraedd? (OAQ18497)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae llawer yn digwydd yn y maes hwn; er enghraift, mae'r cytundeb am waith ar yr A470 yng Nghwm Lledr, rhwng Dolwyddelan a Phont-yr-Afanc, ar fin cael ei osod. Mae hwn yn gynllun mawr a fydd yn costio mwy na £10 miliwn. Gobeithiwn gyhoeddi cyn bo hir pa gwmni sydd wedi ennill y cytundeb, a phryd y bydd

o'r enw TASSC, sy'n taclo torcyfraith sy'n gysylltiedig ag alcohol a chanddefnyddio sylweddau ar strydoedd Abertawe. A ydyw'r Prif Weinidog yn gyfarwydd â'r cynllun hwn, ac, os nad ydyw, a wnaiff gynlluniau i drafod y mater gyda Heddlu De Cymru fel y gallwn ystyried pa gefnogaeth y gallwn ni ei rhoi, gan y bydd llawer o'r cyfrifoldebau'n syrthio ar awdurdodau lleol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yn sicr fe geisaf ymgynnarwyddo â'r cynllun, er nad o reidrwydd yn y ffordd y gwnaethoch chi, Alun—byddai hynny ymhell ar ôl fy amser gwely i. Mae'r modd y cydlynir gweithgareddau'r sector gwirfoddol a'r sector iechyd gyda'r heddlu'n bwysig i atal y broblem rhag mynd yn rhemp, fel y gwnaeth yn ardaloedd metropolitan mawr Lloegr, gan gynnwys rhai sy'n agos i Gymru, fel Lerwpl, Manceinion a Bryste. Gall yr ardaloedd hyn fod yn ffynhonnell cyffuriau rhatach i Gymru, a all arwain at ryfeloedd rhwng gangiau a phroblemau plismona.

**Alison Halford:** A allwch wneud sylw ar yr awgrym gan brif gwnstabl Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, yn ôl yr adroddiadau, y dylai rhan o gyllideb yr heddlu fynd tuag at adsefydlu troseddwyr cyffuriau?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni allaf wneud sylw ar hynny oherwydd nid wyf wedi ei weld, ond os cyfeiriwch fi at y fan lle gwelsoch y sylw, fe wnaif yn siŵr y byddaf fi neu Edwina'n ymateb gan roi barn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad arno.

**Q2 Dafydd Wigley:** Will the Minister make a statement on when the aim for improving transport services between north and south Wales will be achieved? (OAQ18497)

**The First Minister:** There are many developments in this area; for example, the contract for work on the A470 in Lledr Valley, between Dolwyddelan and Beaver Bridge, is about to be awarded. This is a large-scale scheme, costing more than £10 million. An announcement on the successful contractor and when the work will begin—

y gwaith yn dechrau—rywbryd yn ystod yr haf hwn—a bydd y gwaith yn cael ei gwblhau erbyn diwedd 2005.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Mae rhoi'r holl sylw i ffyrdd a dim sylw i reilffyrdd yn nodwediadol o'r Llywodraeth hon. Mae'r gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd rhwng Caergybi a Chaerdydd yn echrydus. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod trenau *inter-city* yn rhedeg rhwng Lerpwl a Poole? Os yw'n bosibl cael trenau felly yn rhedeg rhwng dinasoedd o'r fath yn Lloegr, pam nad yw'n bosibl cael trenau o'r un safon yn rhedeg rhwng y Gogledd a Chaerdydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddiddorol bod Dafydd yn dweud, wrth ymateb i'r ateb cyntaf a roddais, fy mod yn anwybyddu ochr arall y ddadl, sef y sector cyhoeddus ar yr achlysur hwn. Pe bawn wedi rhoi ateb ar yr hyn y mae'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol yn ei wneud i sefydlu masnachfraint Cymru gyfan, byddai wedi gofyn pam fy mod yn anwybyddu'r sector preifat, a'r gwelliannau sydd eu hangen ar yr A470. Ni allaf gynnwys y ddau beth mewn un ateb cryno. Disgwyliwn wybod pa gwmni a fydd wedi ennill masnachfraint Cymru gyfan erbyn Ebrill 2003 a gwelwn ddatblygiadau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ar y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru wedi hynny.

**Alun Pugh:** It is good to hear news of the road improvements, but do you accept that only rail offers a cost-effective, safe and environmentally-friendly way of getting people from north Wales to the capital for work or leisure purposes? Do you also accept that the single rail franchise must contain guarantees of frequency and quality on north-south services?

**The First Minister:** I am not familiar with the exact details of the all-Wales franchise that the SRA is currently considering, but we need a balance between road, rail, and bus developments. The road schemes on the A470 will be paralleled by schemes on the Welsh borders and on the A483 between Wrexham and Swansea. There is also the prospect of developments between Pant and Llanymynech. However, I agree that travelling by rail has its benefits, such as the

sometime during this summer—is imminent and the work will be completed by the end of 2005.

**Dafydd Wigley:** It is typical of this Government to focus solely on roads, and ignore the railways. The rail service between Holyhead and Cardiff is appalling. Are you aware that there is an inter-city service between Liverpool and Poole? If it is possible to have these trains running between such cities in England, why is it not possible to have trains of the same standard running between north Wales and Cardiff?

**The First Minister:** It is interesting that, in responding to my first answer, Dafydd accuses me of ignoring the other side of the argument, in this case the public sector. If I had answered on what the Strategic Rail Authority is doing to set up an all-Wales franchise, he would have asked why I was ignoring the private sector and the improvements needed to the A470. I cannot refer to both issues in one concise answer. We expect to know which company will be awarded the all-Wales franchise by April 2003, and we will then see developments in public railway services in Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n dda clywed newyddion am welliannau ffyrdd, ond a dderbyniwch mai dim ond y rheilffyrdd sy'n cynnig ffordd gost-effeithiol, diogel ac amgylcheddol garedig o fynd â phobl o'r Gogledd i'r brifddinas i ddibenion gwaith neu hamdden? A dderbyniwch hefyd fod yn rhaid i'r fasnachfraint rheilffyrdd sengl gynnwys gwarantau amlder ac ansawdd ar wasanaethau de-gogledd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd ag union fanylion y fasnachfraint i Gymru gyfan y mae'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol yn ei hystyried ar hyn o bryd, ond mae angen cydwysedd rhwng datblygiadau ffyrdd, rheilffyrdd a bysus. Ochr yn ochr â'r cynlluniau ffyrdd ar yr A470 ceir cynlluniau ar y gororau ac ar yr A483 rhwng Wrecsam ac Abertawe. Mae rhagolygon hefyd ar gyfer datblygiadau rhwng Pant a Llanymynech. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf fod manteision i

option to work on the train, which you cannot do if you are driving a car.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn hanfodol inni sicrhau bod yr SRA yn trin gogledd Cymru yn deg, gan ariannu'r gwasanaeth yn well, yn enwedig y gwasanaeth rhwng Wrecsam a Chaerdydd?

2:10 p.m.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym yn siarad am fwy na'r gwasanaeth rhwng Caergybi a Chaerdydd yn unig. Un o'r problemau ynglŷn â'r system reilffyrdd yng Nghymru yw nad yw'r gwasanaeth o Gaergybi yn teithio drwy Wrecsam; yn hytrach, mae'n mynd drwy Gaer. Mae'r gwasanaeth sy'n osgoi Wrecsam yn teithio tuag at Crewe, Manceinion neu Lerpwl. Felly, mae anghysondeb yn y system yr ydym wedi ei hetifeddu.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I refer you to the jam in the sandwich caught in the middle between north and south Wales. Without wanting to decry the importance of rail services, much of mid Wales is not served by trains at all. What is the Government of Wales doing to implement the Babtie report recommendations on the need for bypasses for Rhayader, Builth Wells, Llanrwst and Newtown?

**The First Minister:** With regard to the schemes that I have cited on the north-south route through mid Wales, the Pant and Llanymynech bypass is either in or close to mid Wales; it covers parts of Shropshire where the English-Welsh border tends to yo-yo back and forth even though the road is straight and where the Severn valley merges into the area around Oswestry. The Talgarth relief road, also in mid Wales, is another early scheme, and we expect this work on the A479 to start in the next three years. That relief road will also benefit those travelling through mid Wales.

deithio ar drenau, fel y dewis i weithio ar y trêñ, rhywbeth nad yw'n bosibl os ydych yn gyrru car.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you agree that we must ensure that the SRA deals equitably with north Wales by increasing funding, especially for services between Wrexham and Cardiff?

**The First Minister:** We are talking about more than just the service between Holyhead and Cardiff. One problem regarding the rail system in Wales is that the service from Holyhead does not travel through Wrexham; it goes through Chester instead. The service that bypasses Wrexham travels towards Crewe, Manchester or Liverpool. Therefore, there are inconsistencies in the system that we have inherited.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Cyfeiriaf at y jam yn y frechdan sydd yn y canol rhwng de a gogledd Cymru. Heb ddymuno bychanu pwysigrwydd gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd, ni wasanaethir rhannau helaeth o'r Canolbarth gan drenau o gwbl. Beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n ei wneud i weithredu argymhellion adroddiad Babtie ar yr angen am ffyrdd osgoi i Raeadr Gwy, Llanfair ym Muallt, Llanrwst a'r Drenewydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** O ran y cynlluniau a enwais ar y ffordd o'r de i'r gogledd drwy'r Canolbarth, mae ffordd osgoi Pant a Llanymynech naill ai yn y Canolbarth neu'n agos ato; aiff drwy rannau o Swydd Amwythig lle tuedda'r ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr i bendilio'n ôl a blaen er bod y ffordd yn syth a lle ymuna dyffryn Hafren ag ardal Croesoswallt. Mae ffordd liniaru Talgarth, eto yn y Canolbarth, yn gynllun arall a ddaw'n fuan, a disgwyliwn i'r gwaith hwn ar yr A479 gychwyn o fewn y tair blynedd nesaf. Bydd y ffordd liniaru honno hefyd o fantais i rai sy'n teithio drwy'r Canolbarth.

### Economi Sir Benfro Economy of Pembrokeshire

**C3 Cynog Dafis:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cael gyda'r

**Q3 Cynog Dafis:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Minister for

Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ynghylch cryfau economi Sir Benfro? (OAQ18495)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn cael cyfarfodydd rheolaidd â'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd i drafod amrywiaeth o faterion yn ymwneud â datblygu economaidd yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys economi Sir Benfro.

**Cynog Dafis:** Beth yw'r sefyllfa bresennol o ran denu cwmnïau newydd i'r ganolfan alwadau yn Noc Penfro? Yr oedd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn hyderus ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa yn ei ddatganiad yn y Siambra, a dywedodd y cai'r broblem ei datrys. Ei eiriau oedd:

'We have done it once and we will do it again.'

A wnewch ymchwilio i'r honiadau bod o leiaf un cwmni wedi cefnu ar y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r ganolfan alwadau oherwydd bod y ffi yr oedd Manpower yn ei chodi'n rhy uchel? A wnewch chi neu Andrew Davies ystyried beth y gallwch ei wneud i helpu gyda'r sefyllfa hon?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn parhau i fod yn dawel hyderus y gallwn ganfod cwmni arall i gymryd lle ITV Digital ar y safle yn Noc Penfro lle mae gan Manpower y contract o ran y staff a 7C y contract o ran materion technegol. Nid ydym wedi llwyddo eto i greu 1,000 o swyddi er ein bod wedi sicrhau 200 o swyddi dros dro lle y caiff y gwaith ei wneud gan Manpower a 7C ar ran NTL. Ni chlywais yr honiad ynglŷn â chwmni yn troi ei gefn ar Sir Benfro. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwelwn sawl esiampl o hynny cyn inni lwyddo yn y pen draw.

**Richard Edwards:** You will be aware of the wonderful last invasion tapestry in Fishguard. Will you support the bid to establish a permanent centre to exhibit this national treasure, which is a glorious example of community art and enterprise?

**The First Minister:** I agree with your last point. I have seen the tapestry so many times I sometimes feel that I sewed it myself. I pay

Economic Development regarding boosting the economy of Pembrokeshire? (OAQ18495)

**The First Minister:** I regularly meet with the Minister for Economic Development to discuss a range of issues relating to economic development in Wales, including the economy of Pembrokeshire.

**Cynog Dafis:** What is the current situation regarding attracting new companies to the call centre at Pembroke Dock? The Minister for Economic Development was confident about the situation in his statement to the Chamber, and said that the problem would be resolved. He said:

'Gwnaethom hynny unwaith ac fe'i gwnawn eto.'

Will you investigate the allegation that at least one company has turned its back on the opportunity to use the call centre because the fee charged by Manpower was too high? Will you or Andrew Davies consider what you can do to help with this situation?

**The First Minister:** I am still quietly confident that we can find another company to take over from ITV Digital on the Pembroke Dock site where Manpower has the contract with regard to staff and 7C has the contract with regard to technical issues. We have not yet succeeded in creating 1,000 jobs, although we have secured 200 temporary jobs where the work is carried out by Manpower and 7C on behalf of NTL. I have not heard the allegation that a company has turned its back on Pembrokeshire. I am sure that we will see several examples of that before we finally succeed.

**Richard Edwards:** Mae'n siŵr y gwyddoch am dapestri bendigedig yr ymosodiad olaf yn Abergwaun. A wnewch chi gefnogi cais i sefydlu canolfan barhaol i arddangos y trysor cenedlaethol hwn, sy'n enghraift odidog o gelfyddyd a menter gymunedol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf â'ch pwynt olaf. Yr wyf wedi gweld y tapestri gymaint o weithiau nes y teimlaf weithiau fy mod

tribute to the women of the area whose efforts produced such an incredible memorial to the period of the last invasion in 1797. It is a wonderful piece of work. It is unfortunate that it is temporarily in storage, until it finds a permanent home. I am not aware of the current state of negotiations, but I will get the latest information and write to you about it.

**Christine Gwyther:** The company I believe that Cynog Dafis was referring to has turned its back on Manpower, but not on Pembroke Dock, and is seeking alternative accommodation. I hope that your Ministers will give the company every opportunity and assistance in this regard. Education and Learning Wales has created a scheme whereby the ex-workers at the Cleddau Bridge call centre can enhance their skills before returning to work at the centre.

The Department of Trade and Industry is currently considering the state aid regulations in this respect, and I understand that we are breaking new ground with this whole project. However, will you use your good offices to bring about a speedy resolution to the state aid issue, to get those people who need those jobs so much, upskilled and back into work?

**The First Minister:** You are correct: call centres come in all shapes and sizes and different kinds of call centres require different training before the jobs can be accessed. They sometimes deal with outgoing calls, which require cold selling using the telephone directory. That is a basic grade call centre. There are others where high net worth individuals give financial advice. One might be on the phone for an hour, on incoming calls. That calls for different training requirements. I am aware of ELWa's problems with regard to state aid for its employer recruitment subsidy. The DTI will advise on that. I will come back to you when that problem is resolved—it will hopefully be soon.

wedi'i bwytho fy hun. Talaf deyrnged i fenywod yr ardal a gynhyrchedd drwy eu hymdrehchion gofeb mor anhygoel i gyfnod yr ymosodiad olaf yn 1797. Mae'n waith bendigedig. Mae'n anffodus ei fod mewn stordy dros dro, hyd nes ceir cartref parhaol iddo. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o hynt y negodi, ond fe gaf y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ac ysgrifennu atoch amdani.

**Christine Gwyther:** Mae'r cwmni y credaf yr oedd Cynog Dafis yn cyfeirio ato wedi troi ei gefn ar Manpower, ond nid ar Ddoc Penfro, ac mae'n chwilio am safle arall. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff eich Gweinidogion roi pob cyfle a chymorth i'r cwmni yn hyn o beth. Mae Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru wedi creu cynllun i gyn-weithwyr canolfan alwadau Pont Cleddau wella'u sgiliau cyn dychwelyd i weithio yn y ganolfan.

Mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried y rheoliadau cymorth gwladrwaethol yn hyn o beth, a deallaf ein bod yn torri tir newydd gyda'r prosiect hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch chi ddefnyddio'ch sefyllfa i sicrhau datrysiaid buan i gwestiwn cymorth gwladrwaethol, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y bobl hynny, sydd angen y swyddi hynny gymaint, ddiweddar eu sgiliau ac ailfael mewn gwaith?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydych yn iawn: ceir canolfannau galwadau o bob lliw a llun ac mae gwahanol ganolfannau'n galw am wahanol hyfforddiant cyn y gellir cael swyddi ynddynt. Mewn rhai canolfannau bydd staff yn gwneud galwadau, sy'n galw am werthu drwy ddewis enwau ar hap o'r llyfr ffôn. Canolfan alwadau gradd sylfaenol yw honno. Ceir eraill lle bydd unigolion â gwerth net uchel yn rhoi cyngor ariannol. Gellid bod ar y ffôn am awr, yn delio â galwadau i'r ganolfan. Mae hynny'n galw am hyfforddiant gwahanol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o broblemau ELWa ynghylch cymorth gwladrwaethol ar gyfer ei gymhorthdal reciwtio i gyflogwyr. Cawn gyngor gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ar hynny. Deuaf yn ôl atoch pan fydd y broblem honno wedi'i datrys—a hynny'n fuan, gobeithio.

## Cysylltiadau Trafnidiaeth yng Nghymoedd y De Transport Links in the South Wales Valleys

**C4 Geraint Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar wella cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth yng Nghymoedd y De i hybu eu datblygiad economaidd? (OAQ18492)

Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Oherwydd ymateb Dafydd i fy ateb cynharach, mae'n well imi sicrhau fy mod yn cadw cydbwysedd rhwng trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus a phreifat. O ran yr ochr breifat a ffyrdd newydd, disgwyliwn i waith ddechrau o ddifrif cyn bo hir ar y darn cyntaf o'r prosiect enfawr i wneud ffordd blaenau'r Cymoedd—sef y darn o Ddowlais hyd at Dredegar—yn ffordd ddeuol, yn hytrach na ffordd tair lôn. Yn ogystal, mae prosiect enfawr arall ar y gweill i gael gwared ar y tagfeydd i'r gogledd o or saf drenau Stryd y Frenhines yng Nghaerdydd. Bydd hynny'n rhoi gwell cyswllt ar y rheilffordd rhwng cymoedd Rhymni, Rhondda, Taf a Chynon a chanol Caerdydd.

**Geraint Davies:** A gytunwch fod y stiwdios ffilm arfaethedig ym Mhont-y-clun, sydd â photensial am 2,000 o swyddi, yn brosiect cyffrous? A ydych yn difaru bod cyfarwyddyd diweddar gan y Cynulliad i wrthod caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer ffordd gyswllt i'r stiwdios yn gosod marc cwestiwn difrifol dros yr holl gynllun? A wnewch roi ymrwymiad y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud ei gorau i sicrhau y bydd y cynllun yn cael ei wireddu?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r ymrwymiad yn bodoli eisoes, Geraint. Ni fyddwn yn rhoi'r gorau i'r prosiect hwn. Yr ydym yn gwneud ein gorau i geisio datrys y problemau sydd wedi codi ynglŷn â'r ffordd gyswllt. Yr ydym yn parhau i drafod y sefyllfa gyda'r awdurdodau lleol a'r cwmni.

**Peter Law:** Your commitment to re-opening the passenger rail service between Cardiff and Ebbw Vale is to be commended, and the Minister for Environment has worked hard on this project. Unfortunately, the economic regeneration of the area will be deterred to

**Q4 Geraint Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on improving transport links in the South Wales Valleys to aid economic development? (OAQ18492)

I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council.

**The First Minister:** Given Dafydd's response to my earlier question, I shall endeavour to keep a balance between public and private transport. On the private side and new roads, we expect work to start in earnest on the first phase of the enormous project to make the heads of the Valleys road—between Dowlais and Tredegar—a dual carriageway rather than a three lane road. In addition, work is being done on another enormous project to get rid of the bottleneck to the north of Queen Street rail station in Cardiff. That will ensure a better rail link between the Rhymney, Rhondda, Taf and Cynon valleys and the centre of Cardiff.

**Geraint Davies:** Do you agree that the proposed film studios in Pontyclun, which could attract 2,000 jobs, is an exciting project? Do you regret that recent guidance given by the Assembly to refuse planning permission for a link road to the studio places a serious question mark over the future of this project? Will you give a commitment that the Assembly Government will do its best to ensure that this scheme goes ahead?

**The First Minister:** The commitment already exists, Geraint. We will not give up on this project. We are doing our best to try to solve the problems that have arisen with regard to the link road. We continue to discuss the situation with the local authorities and with the company.

**Peter Law:** Mae'ch ymrwymiad i ailagor y gwasanaeth trêñ i deithwyr rhwng Caerdydd a Glynebw y i'w gymeradwyo, ac mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd wedi gweithio'n galed ar y prosiect hwn. Yn anffodus, rhwystrir adfywiad economaidd yr

some extent by the fact that there is no access available into Newport station because of a signalling problem, which, according to Railtrack, cannot be resolved until 2009. Will you take steps to ensure that the UK Minister for Transport intervenes in this, and ask him to bring pressure on Railtrack to open that line?

**The First Minister:** Railtrack has other problems at present; it needs to come out of administration before you know who you are dealing with. Allegedly, that problem will be solved this week, but we must wait and see if that happens. We can then start to make serious approaches to Railtrack to see if we can solve the problem as regards the signal box covering that section from Ebbw junction to Newport central station. It is barely credible that it may take seven years to resolve that problem.

**William Graham:** Will you confirm that the requirements for the M4 relief road and the uncertainty over the Sirhowy enterprise way, impair the economic development of our valley communities in south-east Wales?

2:20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** It is always possible to ask for a greater investment in road schemes. We know that Newport, and the Brynglas tunnels in particular, is a potential bottleneck for economic investment west of the river Usk. It is important that that problem is resolved.

However, we must also investigate methods of trying to disconnect economic growth from an increase in traffic on motorways. Everyone is searching for this holy grail. At the moment, economic growth means an increase of 2 per cent per year in road traffic. Ideally, we want economic growth without increased traffic. That is part of our search for more sustainable economic development. Successive Governments have sought the answer, but have not yet found it.

**Christine Chapman:** Do you agree that improving the cross Valleys transport network is vital to the development of

ardal i ryw raddau gan y ffaith nad oes mynediad ar gael i mewn i orsaif Casnewydd oherwydd problem gyda'r signalau, na ellir ei datrys, yn ôl Railtrack, tan 2009. A wnewch chi gymryd camau i sicrhau bod Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth y DU yn ymyrryd yn hyn, a gofyn iddo ddwyn pwysau ar Railtrack i agor y lein honno?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae gan Railtrack broblemau eraill ar hyn o bryd; mae angen iddo ddod allan o weinyddiaeth cyn ichi wybod â pwy yr ydych yn delio. Yn ôl y sôn, caiff y broblem honno ei datrys yr wythnos hon, ond bydd rhaid inni aros i weld a ddigwydd hynny. Wedyn gallwn ddechrau cyfathrebu o ddifrif â Railtrack i weld a allwn ddatrys y broblem gyda'r blwch signalau ar gyfer y darn lein o gyffordd Ebwy i orsaif ganolog Casnewydd. Anodd credu y gall gymryd saith mlynedd i ddatrys y broblem honno.

**William Graham:** A wnewch chi gadarnhau bod y gofynion ar gyfer ffordd liniaru'r M4 a'r ansicrwydd dros ffورد fenter Sirhywi yn amharu ar ddatblygiad economaidd ein cymunedau yng nghymoedd y de-ddwyrain?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae bob amser yn bosibl gofyn am fwy o fuddsoddiad mewn cynlluniau ffyrdd. Gwyddom fod Casnewydd, a thwneli Brynglas yn arbennig, yn rhwystr possibl i fuddsoddiad economaidd i'r gorllewin o afon Wysg. Mae'n bwysig datrys y broblem honno.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ymchwilio hefyd i ddulliau o geisio datgysylltu twf economaidd oddi wrth gynnydd mewn traffig ar draffyrdd. Mae pawb yn chwilio am y grell sanctaidd hwn. Ar hyn o bryd, golyga twf economaidd gynnydd o 2 y cant y flwyddyn mewn traffig ar y ffyrdd. Yn ddelfrydol, hoffem weld twf economaidd heb gynnydd mewn traffig. Dyna ran o'n hymchwil am ddatblygu economaidd mwy cynaliadwy. Mae Llywodraeth ar ôl Llywodraeth wedi ceisio'r ateb, ond heb ei gael eto.

**Christine Chapman:** A gytunwch fod gwella'r rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth ar draws y Cymoedd yn hanfodol i ddatblygiad

tourism in the Valleys, as it can open up access to some of the best facilities and attractions in Wales? If we are maximise the opportunities, we must raise awareness of the beautiful scenery, the mountain trails and other destinations, which are currently difficult to access or are poorly signposted.

**The First Minister:** You are right in that we are not only talking about the industrial heritage trail from Blaenafon to Hirwaun and further west, but also about potential tourist attractions such as the project in the upper Afan valley. Securing a viable tourist trade in the Valleys, based on these attractions or a series of smaller attractions that link together to form a trail, would diversify the Valleys' economy. It would take the Valleys back to what they were before their over hasty industrialisation 200 years ago, when they were, without doubt, among the outstanding beauty spots of the United Kingdom.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** From your comments on transport this afternoon, you obviously agree that improving transport links is essential to regenerate the economy of the south Wales Valleys. However, I return to Eleanor Burnham's question about the Strategic Rail Authority's attitude to improvements in rail infrastructure within Wales and to railways that serve Wales. Will you undertake to speak to the SRA on behalf of the people of Wales and ask it to readdress its investment priorities to ensure that Wales benefits from future investment?

**The First Minister:** Sue Essex and I have met Richard Bowker, the chair of the Strategic Rail Authority, and impressed upon him the importance of investing in railways in Wales from the point of view of sustainable development, public transport and addressing pressure points. For example, there is the bottleneck to the north of Queen Street station on the Valleys line into Cardiff, and there are problems with the Wrexham, Chester, Crewe and Flint quadrangle where the railway lines are inconveniently laid out—those lines were laid out 100 years ago and it is difficult to deal with that now.

twristiaeth yn y Cymoedd, gan y gall agor mynediad i rai o gyfleusterau ac atyniadau gorau Cymru? Os ydym am wneud y mwyaf o'r cyfleoedd, rhaid inni godi ymwybyddiaeth o'r golygfeydd hardd, y llwybrau mynyddig a chyrchfannau eraill, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn anodd mynd atynt neu heb arwyddion da iddynt.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydych yn iawn o ran ein bod yn sôn nid yn unig am y llwybr treftadaeth ddiwydiannol o Flaenafon i Hirwaun ac ymhellach i'r gorllewin, ond hefyd am atyniadau posibl i ymwelwyr fel y prosiect yng nghwm Afan uchaf. Byddai sicrhau diwydiant ymwelwyr hyfyw yn y Cymoedd, yn seiliedig ar yr atyniadau hyn neu gyfres o atyniadau llai sy'n cydgysylltu i ffurfio taith, yn arallgyfeirio economi'r Cymoedd. Byddai'n mynd â'r Cymoedd yn ôl i'r hyn oeddent cyn y diwydiannu gorfrysio 200 mlynedd yn ôl, pan oeddent, heb os, yn un o lecynnau prydferthaf y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** O'ch sylwadau ar drafnidiaeth y prynhawn yma, mae'n amlwg eich bod yn cytuno bod gwella cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth yn hanfodol i adfywio economi Cymoedd y De. Fodd bynnag, dof yn ôl at gwestiwn Eleanor Burnham am agwedd yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol at welliannau i'r isadeiledd rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru ac i reilffyrdd sy'n gwasanaethu Cymru. A wnewch chi ymgymryd i siarad â'r awdurdod ar ran pobl Cymru a gofyn iddo ailedrych ar ei flaenoriaethau buddsoddi i sicrhau bod Cymru'n elwa oddi wrth fuddsoddi yn y dyfodol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae Sue Essex a mi wedi cyfarfod â Richard Bowker, cadeirydd yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, ac wedi pwysgo arno mor bwysig yw buddsoddi mewn rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru o safbwyt datblygu cynaliadwy, cludiant cyhoeddus a lliniaru pwyntiau gwasgedd. Er enghraift, ceir tagfa i'r gogledd o orsaf Heol y Frenhines ar lein y Cymoedd i mewn i Gaerdydd, ac mae problemau gyda phedrongl Wrecsam, Caer, Crewe a'r Fflint lle mae'r rheilffyrdd wedi'u gosod yn anghyfleus—gosodwyd y rheilffyrdd hynny 100 mlynedd yn ôl ac mae'n anodd gwneud dim am

However, we impressed a range of problems on Richard Bowker, not long after his appointment as chair of the SRA. We shall continue to press him on those matters.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am pleased that you will have further meetings with Richard Bowker. However, the status of Railtrack also affects the future of the railways in Wales. You may be aware of the announcement today by the National Union of Rail, Maritime and Transport Workers that it is slashing its contribution to the Labour Party because of the party's failure to recommit itself to renationalisation. Are you in favour of renationalisation?

**The First Minister:** The important announcement that we are hoping for this week is on when Railtrack is to come out of administration and become Network Rail. We will then have a body that we can deal with and to which we can put questions. The Government in London, which is still responsible for railway administration, will then have a body with which to discuss its investment plans. We should concentrate on those key points, because the people of Wales are concerned about whether they will have a better railway service, with more stations and more trains, which are more reliable and cleaner, not about the major ideological issues that you would like to wander off onto discussing, Ieuan.

hynny'n awr. Fodd bynnag, bu inni bwysleisio nifer o broblemau wrth Richard Bowker, yn fuan wedi iddo gael ei benodi'n gadeirydd yr awdurdod. Byddwn yn parhau i bwysio arno ynghylch y materion hyn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch y byddwch yn cael cyfarfodydd pellach gyda Richard Bowker. Fodd bynnag, mae statws Railtrack hefyd yn effeithio ar ddyfodol y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r cyhoeddiad heddiw gan Undeb Cenedlaethol y Gweithwyr Rheilffordd, Môr a Thrafnidiaeth ei fod yn cwtogi ei gyfraniad i goffrau'r Blaid Lafur oherwydd methiant y blaid i ailymrwymo i ailwladoli. A ydych chi o blaid ailwladoli?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Y cyhoeddiad pwysig yr ydym yn gobeithio'i glywed yr wythnos hon yw pa bryd y bydd Railtrack yn dod allan o weinyddiad ac yn troi'n Network Rail. Wedyn bydd gennym gorff y gallwn ddelio ag ef ac y gallwn ei holi. Wedyn bydd gan y Llywodraeth yn Llundain, sydd yn dal i fod yn gyfrifol am weinyddu'r rheilffyrdd, gorff i drafod ei chynlluniau buddsoddi ag ef. Dylem ganolbwytio ar y pwyntiau allweddol hynny, oherwydd yr hyn sy'n poeni pobl Cymru yw a fydd ganddynt well gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd, gyda mwy o orsafoedd a mwy o drenau, a'r rheini'n fwy dibynadwy ac yn lanach, ac nid y cwestiynau ideolegol mawr yr hoffech chi grwydro i'w trafod, Ieuan.

### Statws Caerdydd The Status of Cardiff

**C5 Owen John Thomas:** Pa gamau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog mewn golwg er mwyn hyrwyddo statws Caerdydd? (OAQ18477)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Manteisiaf ar bob cyfle i godi proffil Cymru yma a thramor; mae hyn yn naturiol yn adlewyrchu ar Gaerdydd fel y brifddinas. Mae 11 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru yn byw yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'n bwysig codi proffil Caerdydd ond mae hefyd yn bwysig cofio am yr 89 y cant o bobl Cymru nad ydynt yn byw yng Nghaerdydd.

**Owen John Thomas:** O ran tynnu sylw at ddinas a rhoi statws iddi, nid oes amheuaeth fod perfformiad ei thîm pêl-droed yn bwysig.

**Q5 Owen John Thomas:** What plans does the First Minister have to promote the status of Cardiff? (OAQ18477)

**The First Minister:** I take every opportunity to raise Wales's profile here and abroad; that naturally reflects on Cardiff as its capital city. Eleven per cent of Wales's population lives in Cardiff. It is important to raise Cardiff's profile but you must bear in mind the 89 per cent of Welsh people who do not live in Cardiff.

**Owen John Thomas:** The performance of its football team is undoubtedly important in raising a city's profile and giving it status.

Byddai dyrchafiad Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd i'r brif gynghrair o les i bêl-droed drwy Gymru gyfan. A oes rhywbeth y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei wneud i hybu ymdrechion Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae gan Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad lawer o bwerau, ond mae arnaf ofn nad yw rhoi'r bêl yn y rhwyd ar ran Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd, neu unrhyw glwb pêl-droed arall, yn eu plith. Mater pwysig arall yw'r ymgyrch i ennill statws Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop i Gaerdydd yn 2008. Edrychwn ymlaen at gyfarfod â Jeremy Isaacs, cadeirydd y pwylgor ymgynghorol, a fydd yn dod i Gaerdydd i gyfarfod y bobl berthnasol, gan gynnwys Jenny Randerson a minnau, yr wyf yn gobeithio, ar 10 Gorffennaf.

**John Griffiths:** To continue the sporting theme, do you agree that yesterday's Wales versus England cricket international further reinforced Cardiff's status as a prestige sporting venue? Do you also agree that the provision of such cricket lessons by Wales to England should become regular fixtures?

**The First Minister:** I was at the game for the first 45 minutes. Wales played brilliantly and continued to do so throughout the day, resulting in a thunderous eight-wicket victory. I had thought that Ieuan Wyn Jones would change Plaid Cymru's policy of seeking independence to seeking full test-match status for Wales, but he has not caught up with that yet. It was important as a bit of a showcase for a Welsh cricket team. I do not know yet what the long-term consequences are for the United Kingdom's cricket culture. Welsh players have, in general, played for England, as have Scottish players—though they are much rarer in the England team. Robert Croft put it well when he said that, when he played for Glamorgan, he considered himself to be playing for Wales, and when he played for England, he considered it to be the equivalent of being selected for the British Lions team. I think that we would all say 'amen' to that.

**David Melding:** To turn the clock back, do you agree that Cardiff ought to be promoted as one of the world's great centres of

Cardiff City Football Club's promotion to the premiership would benefit football throughout Wales. Is there anything that the Assembly Government can do to boost Cardiff City Football Club's efforts?

**The First Minister:** The Assembly First Minister has many powers, but I am afraid that putting the ball into the back of the net on behalf of Cardiff City Football Club, or any other football club, is not among them. Another important matter is the campaign to win Cultural Capital of Europe status for Cardiff in 2008. We look forward to meeting Jeremy Isaacs, the chairman of the advisory committee, who will come to Cardiff to meet the relevant people, including, I hope, Jenny Randerson and myself on 10 July.

**John Griffiths:** I barhau â'r thema chwaraeon, a gytunwch fod y gêm griced ryngwladol ddoe rhwng Cymru a Lloegr wedi atgyfnerthu statws Caerdydd fel canolfan chwaraeon o fri? A gytunwch hefyd y dylai Cymru ddarparu gwersi criced o'r fath yn rheolaidd i Loegr?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oeddwn yn y gêm am y 45 munud cyntaf. Chwaraeodd Cymru'n wych a daliasant ati i wneud hynny drwy'r dydd, gan ennill buddugoliaeth ysgubol o wyth wiced. Yr oeddwn wedi meddwl y byddai Ieuan Wyn Jones yn newid polisi Plaid Cymru o geisio annibyniaeth i geisio statws gemau prawf llawn i Gymru, ond nid yw wedi mynd ar y trywydd hwnnw eto. Yr oedd yn bwysig fel tipyn o arddangosiad o blaid tîm criced i Gymru. Ni wn eto beth yw'r canlyniadau tymor hir i ddiwylliant criced y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae chwaraewyr Cymru, yn gyffredinol, wedi chwarae i Loegr, a chwaraewyr o'r Alban hefyd—er eu bod hwy'n llawer prinnach yn nhîm Lloegr. Rhoddodd Robert Croft ddisgrifiad da o'r sefyllfa wrth ddweud yr ystyriai ei fod, wrth chwarae i Forgannwg, yn chwarae i Gymru, a bod chwarae i Loegr yn gyfystyr â chael eich dewis i chwarae dros dîm Llewod Prydain. Yr wyf yn meddwl y byddem i gyd yn dweud 'amen' i hynny.

**David Melding:** A throi'r cloc yn ôl, a gytunwch y dylid hyrwyddo Caerdydd fel un o ganolfannau mawr y byd o ran

Victorian and Edwardian architecture? It has Burgess house in Park Place, St German's church in Roath—a dreadful name, but an exquisite building—and the incomparable neo-Baroque City Hall. Should we not promote that?

**The First Minister:** We could make more of Cardiff's architecture. You are right about the church that you mentioned—you cannot choose your saints. You must note that when you commend church architecture. Glasgow has made a tourist industry out of the Rennie Mackintosh buildings sprinkled around the city, and we could do the same with the Gothic revival, late Victorian and early Edwardian buildings in Cardiff. They are fantastic. Cathedral Road in my constituency is said, by some architectural critics, to be the finest Edwardian street in the world. As the local Assembly Member, I will not disagree with that. There are many other architectural treasures. They are not very historic—apart from Cardiff castle and St John's church—but in terms of buildings of 100 years ago, they are amazing and have been extremely well preserved.

pensaerniaeth Fictoriaidd ac Edwardaidd? Mae gennym dŷ Burgess ym Mhlas y Parc, eglwys Sant German yn y Rhath—enw ofnadwy, ond adeilad anfarwol—a neo-Barociaeth ddigymar Neuadd y Ddinas. Oni ddylem hyrwyddo hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gallem wneud mwy o bensaerniaeth Caerdydd. Yr ydych yn iawn am yr eglwys a grybwyllasoch—ni allwch ddewis eich seintiau. Rhaid ichi nodi hynny pan gymeradwywch bensaerniaeth eglwysi. Mae Glasgow wedi creu diwydiant twristaidd o'r adeiladau Rennie Mackintosh sydd yma ac acw o gwmpas y ddinas, a gallem ni wneud yr un peth gydag adeiladau'r dadeni Gothig, diwedd oes Fictoria a dechrau'r oes Edwardaidd yng Nghaerdydd. Maent yn anhygoel. Dywed rhai beirniaid pensaerniol mai Heol y Gadeirlan, yn fy etholaeth i, yw'r stryd Edwardaidd orau yn y byd. Fel yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol, nid anghytunaf â hynny. Mae llawer mwy o drysorau pensaerniol. Nid ydynt yn hanesyddol iawn—ar wahân i castell Caerdydd ac eglwys Sant Ioan—ond yn nhermau adeiladau o ganrif yn ôl, maent yn rhyfeddol ac wedi'u cadw'n eithriadol o dda.

### Dyffryn Clwyd Vale of Clwyd

**Q6 Ann Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the delivery of the Welsh Assembly Government's policies in the Vale of Clwyd? (OAQ18487)

**The First Minister:** We have recently approved Communities First project bids totaling over £370,000 for three projects in the Vale of Clwyd. In the Rhyl West ward we have approved a People in Communities project worth some £85,000. That indicates that, where there is deprivation in the Vale of Clwyd, we are taking appropriate action to deal with it.

**Ann Jones:** Do you agree that community regeneration should be a high priority in my constituency? Many good schemes have been initiated with Assembly funding, as you mentioned. Some of them are schemes to help communities that face drugs problems. Do you agree, therefore, that David

**C6 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar roi polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar waith yn Nyffryn Clwyd? (OAQ18487)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym yn ddiweddar wedi cymeradwyo ceisiadau Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf gwerth cyfanswm o dros £370,000 ar gyfer tri phrosiect yn Nyffryn Clwyd. Yn ward Gorllewin y Rhyl yr ydym wedi cymeradwyo prosiect Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf gwerth rhyw £85,000. Dengys hynny ein bod yn gweithredu'n briodol, lle ceir amddifadedd yn Nyffryn Clwyd, i ddelio ag ef.

**Ann Jones:** A gytunwch y dylai adfywio cymunedol fod yn flaenoriaeth uchel yn fy etholaeth? Cychwynnwyd llawer o gynlluniau da gyda chyllid y Cynulliad, fel y crybwyllasoch. Cynlluniau yw rhai ohonynt i helpu cymunedau sy'n wynebu problemau cyffuriau. A gytunwch, felly, fod sylwadau

A'Herne's unfortunate comments about the west end of Rhyl are damaging and hurtful to my constituents, many of whom are working to revitalise that community?

**The First Minister:** I agree. I keep that front page of the *Daily Post* near at hand as an object lesson in how to have the right intent, but to put it in the wrong way and stigmatise deprivation and drug problems. It is a lesson about which politicians must always be reminded—how do you describe deprivation and attribute deprivation to an area without stigmatising it, but rather emphasise what you are doing to rehabilitate the area? That, fundamentally, means empowering the area to help itself, which is the theme behind Communities First and its predecessor programme, People in Communities. That is the right way forward for areas such as Rhyl West.

2:30 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** First Minister, you have just acknowledged that Communities First is one of your flagship policies, and that areas such as Rhyl desperately need to succeed. Therefore, how do you respond to the increasing concerns about the Communities First programme? For example, Councillor Lynda Thorne, the Deputy Lord Mayor of Cardiff, has said that the national implementation of the scheme has been marred by confusion, a failure to clarify the responsibilities of local agencies, a lack of links to other plans and uncertainty over financial and accounting procedures. To be blunt, Minister, it is a poorly funded and badly implemented strategy. Lynne Thorne's words are stark criticism from a member of your own party. What action will you take to ensure that the Communities First scheme works and succeeds in communities such as Rhyl?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The question is not about national strategies or the Deputy Lord Mayor of Cardiff; it is about the Vale of Clwyd.

**The First Minister:** We accept that the first year was a pathfinder year. We have learned from experience and have refined the scheme

anffodus David A'Herne ynglŷn â gorllewin y Rhyl yn niweidiol ac yn brifo fy etholwyr i, sydd, lawer ohonynt, yn gweithio i adfywio'r gymuned honno?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf. Cadwaf y dudalen flaen honno o'r *Daily Post* wrth law fel gwers ar sut i weithredu gyda'r bwriad cywir, ond ei roi yn y ffordd anghywir a gwarthnodi amddifadedd a phroblemau cyffuriau. Mae'n wers y dylid atgoffa gwleidyddion ohoni o hyd—sut mae disgrifio amddifadedd a phriodoli amddifadedd i ardal heb warthnodi'r ardal honno, ond yn hytrach bwysleisio beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i'w hadfer? Ystyr sylfaenol hynny yw galluogi'r ardal i'w helpu ei hun, sef y thema y tu ôl i Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a'r rhaglen a'i rhagflaenodd, Pobl mewn Cymunedau. Dyna'r ffordd gywir ymlaen i ardaloedd fel Gorllewin y Rhyl.

**Janet Ryder:** Brif Weinidog, yr ydych newydd gydnabod bod Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn un o'ch polisiau pwysicaf, a bod angen dirfawr i ardaloedd fel y Rhyl lwyddo. Felly, sut yr ydych yn ymateb i'r pryderon cynyddol ynghylch y rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf? Er enghraifft, dywedodd y Cyngorydd Lynda Thorne, Dirprwy Arglwydd Faer Caerdydd, yr amharwyd ar weithrediad y cynllun yn cenedlaethol gan ddryswn, methiant i ddiffinio cyfrifoldebau asiantaethau lleol, diffyg cysylltiadau â chynlluniau eraill ac ansicrwydd ynghylch gweithdrefnau ariannol a chadw cyfrifon. A siarad yn blaen, Brif Weinidog, strategaeth ydyw sydd wedi'i hariannu'n wael a'i gweithredu'n wael. Mae geiriau Lynda Thorne yn feirniadaeth lem gan aelod o'ch plaid eich hun. Beth wnewch chi i sicrhau bod y cynllun Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn gweithio ac yn llwyddo mewn cymunedau fel y Rhyl?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid cwestiwn am strategaethau cenedlaethol na Dirprwy Arglwydd Faer Caerdydd yw hwn; cwestiwn am Ddyffryn Clwyd ydyw.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Derbyniwn mai blwyddyn o ganfod ein ffordd oedd y flwyddyn gyntaf. Yr ydym wedi dysgu o

so that deprived areas such as Rhyl West and others throughout Wales will be able to make full use of the scheme. It will empower the people living in those wards to use Communities First to develop community leadership, and to help themselves out of the deprivation from which they currently suffer.

brofiad ac wedi caboli'r cynllun fel y bydd ardaloedd difreintiedig fel Gorllewin y Rhyl ac eraill drwy Gymru benbaladr yn gallu gwneud defnydd llawn o'r cynllun. Bydd yn galluogi trigolion y wardiau hynny i ddefnyddio Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf i ddatblygu arweinyddiaeth gymunedol, ac i'w helpu'u hunain i ddod allan o'r amddifadedd y maent yn ei ddioddef ar hyn o bryd.

**Peter Rogers:** What financial support can you give poultry farmers—particularly those in the Vale of Clwyd? Mr Ian Sharples's business faces closure following the amendment passed by the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, to the draft Welfare of Farmed Animals (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2002, which brings forward the date for banning enriched cages from 2012 to 2006. He has invested £60,000 in enriched cages, and if this amendment is approved in Plenary, 60 per cent of egg producers in Wales will be out of business. That business will transfer to France, and we will end up eating French eggs produced under the conditions that we have banned here.

**Peter Rogers:** Pa gymorth ariannol y gallwch ei roi i ffermwyr dofednod—yn enwedig y rheini yn Nyffryn Clwyd? Mae Mr Ian Sharples yn wynebu cau ei fusnes yn sgil y gwelliant a basiwyd gan y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig i'r Rheoliadau Lles Anifeiliaid Fferm (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2002 drafft, sy'n dod â'r dyddiad ar gyfer gwahardd cewyll dwysffermio ymlaen o 2012 i 2006. Mae wedi buddsoddi £60,000 mewn cewyll dwysffermio, ac os cymeradwyir y gwelliant yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, bydd 60 y cant o'r cynhyrchwyr wyau yng Nghymru allan o fusnes. Bydd y busnes hwnnw yn trosglwyddo i Ffrainc, ac yn y diwedd byddwn yn bwyta wyau Ffrengig wedi'u cynhyrchu dan amodau sydd wedi'u gwahardd yma.

**The First Minister:** Animal welfare is reflected in the quality of food that we eat and in the way that we think about food. Occasionally, improvements in the minimum standards of animal welfare in farms are proposed. People have thought seriously about egg production and when battery farming will be replaced by the use of larger cages, a deep litter system, or an entirely free range system. I do not know the answer. We are all wary of taking measures that would, in effect, close down the UK industry, only to open up the market to imports from other EU countries.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Adlewyrchir lles anifeiliaid yn ansawdd y bwyd a fwytawn ac yn y ffordd y meddyliwn am fwyd. Yn achlysurol, cynigir gwelliannau i'r safonau isaf ar gyfer lles anifeiliaid ar ffermydd. Mae pobl wedi meddwl o ddifrif am y busnes cynhyrchu wyau ac am ba bryd y disodlir ffermio batri a defnyddio cewyll mwy, system wasarn dwfn neu system ieir cwbl rydd. Ni wn yr ateb. Yr ydym i gyd yn gyndyn o gymryd camau a fyddai, o ran eu heffaith, yn cau'r diwydiant yn y DU, dim ond i agor y farchnad i fewnforion o wledydd eraill yr UE.

### Urdd Gobaith Cymru

**C7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynglŷn â chyllid craidd i Urdd Gobaith Cymru yn dilyn Eisteddfod yr Urdd, Caerdydd 2002? (OAQ18496)

**Q7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on core funding for Urdd Gobaith Cymru following the Urdd Eisteddfod at Cardiff in 2002? (OAQ18496)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae Urdd Gobaith Cymru yn derbyn tua £1 filiwn o gymorth tuag at ei chostau blynnyddol gan ffynonellau o'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r awdurdodau unedol,

Urdd Gobaith Cymru receives around £1 million towards its annual costs from public sector sources. The unitary authorities, the Welsh Language Board, the

Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, is-adran polisi ieuencid Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, y gronfa gwirfoddoli yng Nghymru a Chyngor Llyfrau Cymru oll yn cyfrannu.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A gytuna'r Prif Weinidog y byddai cylido craidd unioengyrchol yn galluogi'r Urdd i gynllunio tuag at y dyfodol? Byddai hefyd yn ei galluogi i ganolbwytio ar geisio arian o ffynonellau eraill ar gyfer mentrau arbennig.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cododd Jim O'Rourke, prif weithredwr yr Urdd, bwyntiau felly gyda mi yn ystod fy ymweliad ag Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd Caerdydd, a oedd yn arbennig o lwyddiannus, ryw dair wythnos yn ôl. Heblaw am godi'r pwynt am fod yn hyblyg o ran ariannu'r Urdd o un ffynhonnell yn hytrach na chwech neu saith, pwysleisiodd fod yr Urdd am ganolbwytio mwy ar chwaraeon, ac nid ar ddiwylliant yn unig, sef y canolbwyt traddodiadol. Cefnogaïs y syniad o godi'r pwyslais ar chwaraeon i'r un lefel â'r pwyslais ar ddiwylliant. Mae'n ffordd addawol ymlaen.

**Mick Bates:** The Urdd movement was, of course, founded by Sir Ifan ab Owen Edwards, son of the Meirionnydd Liberal MP, Sir Owen M. Edwards. Do you agree that this year's festival once again demonstrated the relevance of the Urdd in celebrating a confident and exuberant Welsh youth culture?

**The First Minister:** It was phenomenally successful for the Urdd, all the children who took part, the parents who encouraged them—before the children reach an age where they no longer want encouragement from their parents—the local organisers, and Cardiff County Council, which invested £300,000 in its success. Although the weather was variable, I believe that the Urdd well exceeded record attendance across the whole week. It shows that it is possible, even in what we regard as an Anglicised area, to hold an extremely successful Urdd National Eisteddfod, if not a record-breaking one such as that we had this time.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cardiff provided a first-class venue for the prestigious event. Those

Sports Council for Wales, the Arts Council of Wales, the Welsh Assembly Government's youth policy division, the volunteering in Wales fund, and the Welsh Books Council all contribute.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Does the First Minister agree that direct core funding would enable the Urdd to plan for the future? It would also enable it to concentrate on attracting funding for specific initiatives from other sources.

**The First Minister:** Jim O'Rourke, the Urdd's chief executive, raised such points with me during my visit some three weeks ago to the enormously successful Urdd National Eisteddfod in Cardiff. Apart from raising the point about being flexible in relation to funding the Urdd from one source rather than six or seven, he stressed that the Urdd wants to place more emphasis on sport, rather than on culture alone, as it has traditionally done. I supported the idea of putting the same emphasis on sport and culture. It is a promising way forward.

**Mick Bates:** Sefydlwyd mudiad yr Urdd, wrth gwrs, gan Syr Ifan ab Owen Edwards, mab yr AS Rhyddfrydol dros Feirionnydd, Syr Owen M. Edwards. A gytunwch fod yr wyl eleni wedi dangos unwaith eto mor berthnasol yw'r Urdd o ran dathlu diwylliant ieuencid Cymreig hyderus a byrlymus?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oedd yn llwyddiant hynod i'r Urdd, i'r holl blant a gymerodd ran, i'r rhieni a'u hanogodd—cyn i'r plant gyrraedd oed lle nad oes arnynt mwyach eisiau anogaeth o du eu rhieni—i'r trefnwyr lleol, ac i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd, a fuddsoddodd £300,000 yn ei llwyddiant. Er mai cyfnewidiol oedd y tywydd, credaf i'r Urdd ddenu niferoedd gryn dipyn yn uwch nag erioed o'r blaen i fynychu'r wyl ar draws yr wythnos gyfan. Mae'n dangos bod modd, hyd yn oed mewn ardal yr ystyriwn ni yn un Seisnigedig, gynnal Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd hynod o lwyddiannus, os nad un sy'n torri pob record fel yr un a gawsom eleni.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Darparodd Caerdydd leoliad o'r radd flaenaf ar gyfer y digwyddiad

of us who found time to attend the festival can say that it was a highly successful week. However, will you join me in expressing concern that the capital city of Wales was let down by its Lord Mayor, who failed to turn up, apparently because he was too busy?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is not about the Lord Mayor of Cardiff; it is about the funding of the Urdd.

### Camdrin Cyffuriau Drug Abuse

**Q8 Janice Gregory:** What discussions has the First Minister had with representatives of the UK Government regarding the development of a cross-cutting and co-ordinated strategy to tackle drug abuse? (OAQ18489)

**The First Minister:** The first British-Irish Council meeting I attended was in Dublin on 30 November 2001. The key issue on the agenda, which I discussed with the Prime Minister, the Taoiseach and the various justice ministries of the Republic of Ireland, and other heads of the devolved administrations, was how to develop cross-cutting and co-ordinated strategies to tackle drug abuse.

**Janice Gregory:** I welcome an Assembly Minister's being given responsibility for tackling crime and drug abuse. You mentioned the British-Irish Council meeting that you attended on 30 November. Will you explain what Wales's involvement will be, and what other UK-wide groups and organisations will we be able to work with on this vital issue?

**The First Minister:** Since the British-Irish Council meeting in November, an official has represented the Assembly Government at a further meeting to discuss targeting the proceeds of the drugs trade and asset confiscation. The Republic of Ireland is probably ahead of any other European country in this regard, in that it ensures that the proceeds of the drugs trade are confiscated even when it cannot get at the drug barons themselves. Removing their property, removes much of the financial

pwysig. Gall y rheini o honom a gafodd amser i fynychu'r wyl ddweud y cafwyd wythnos lwyddiannus dros ben. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i fynegi pryder y siomwyd prifddinas Cymru gan ei Harglywydd Faer, na ddangosodd ei wyneb, oherwydd ei fod yn rhy brysur, mae'n debyg?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid cwestiwn am Arglwydd Faer Caerdydd yw hwn; ond cwestiwn am ariannu'r Urdd.

**C8 Janice Gregory:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda chynrychiolwyr o Lywodraeth y DU ynghylch datblygu strategaeth drawsbynciol a chydlynol i ddelio â cham-drin cyffuriau? (OAQ18489)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mynychais fy nghyfarfod cyntaf o Gyngor Prydain-Iwerddon yn Nulyn ar 30 Tachwedd 2001. Y prif bwnc ar yr agenda, a drafodais gyda Phrif Weinidog y DU, y Taoiseach ac amryfal weinyddiaethau cyflawnder Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, a phenaethiaid eraill y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig, oedd sut i ddatblygu strategaethau trawsbynciol a chydlynol i ddelio â cham-drin cyffuriau.

**Janice Gregory:** Croesawaf roi cyfrifoldeb i Weinidog o'r Cynulliad am ddelio â thorcyfraith a cham-drin cyffuriau. Soniasoch am y cyfarfod o Gyngor Prydain-Iwerddon a fynychwyd gennych ar 30 Tachwedd. A wnewch chi egluro beth fydd cyfranogiad Cymru, a chyda pha grwpiau a sefydliadau eraill ledled y DU y byddwn yn gallu gweithio ar y mater allweddol hwn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ers cyfarfod Cyngor Prydain-Iwerddon ym mis Tachwedd, mae swyddog wedi cynrychioli Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn cyfarfod pellach i drafod targedu elw'r fasnach gyffuriau ac atafaelu asedau. Mae'n debyg fod Gweriniaeth Iwerddon ar y blaen i unrhyw wlad Ewropeidd arall yn hyn o beth, gan sicrhau y caiff elw'r fasnach gyffuriau ei atafaelu hyd yn oed pan na all gael gafael ar y prif werthwyr cyffuriau. Mae cymryd eu heiddo'n dileu llawer o'r cymhelliant ariannol dros

incentive for their wanting to be in the drug trade.

In terms of educational programmes, we support treatment for substance misuse through the drug and alcohol treatment fund. By 2003-04, the fund will have nearly doubled from its level in the year commencing 1 April 1999, to almost £3 million.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. Beth y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn bwriadu ei wneud i ddarparu mwy o welyau ar gyfer cleifion yng Nghymru sy'n derbyn triniaeth ddadwenwyno ac yn ymadfer o effeithiau cyffuriau?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Caiff y mater hwn ei drafod gan Edwina Hart, fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb am fynd i'r afael â chamdefnyddio cyffuriau, a Jane Hutt, fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, er mwyn sicrhau nad yw prinder gwelyau yn broblem. Edwina Hart sydd bellach yn bennaf gyfrifol am gydlynú'r polisiau hyn, ond mae cyflenwi'r gwelyau angenrheidiol yn parhau'n gyfrifoldeb i awdurdodau iechyd.

**David Davies:** British embassies' officials have stated that a high percentage of people arriving in this country on certain flights carry hard drugs. However, there are nowhere near enough customs officials to deal with the problem, and, it seems, no political will to do so. What do you think should be done?

**The First Minister:** To say that nothing is being done is an overstatement, but you are right to draw Members' attention to the need to target the drugs couriers—or the mules, as I think that they are known. These people are asked to carry drugs by various means, including by the ingestion of drugs in packets, which can burst with invariably fatal results—frequently on journeys from Kingston, Jamaica to London and elsewhere. How to detect mules on such flights is a difficult issue for Her Majesty's Customs and Excise, but it is receiving every attention. However, it is not always possible to identify all carriers. Poverty in Jamaica is so great

iddynt fod eisaiu bod yn rhan o'r fasnach gyffuriau.

O ran rhaglenni addysgol, cefnogwn driniaeth ar gyfer camddefnydd sylweddau drwy'r gronfa drin dibyniaeth ar gyffuriau ac alcohol. Erbyn 2003-04, bydd y gronfa bron wedi dyblu o'i lefel yn y flwyddyn a ddechreuodd ar 1 Ebrill 1999, i bron £3 miliwn.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a general practitioner. What steps does the First Minister intend to take to ensure that more beds are available in Wales for patients receiving detox treatment and recovering from the effects of drugs?

**The First Minister:** This issue will be discussed by Edwina Hart, the Minister responsible for tackling drugs misuse, and Jane Hutt, the Minister for Health and Social Services, in order to ensure that shortage of beds is not a problem. Edwina Hart has overall responsibility for co-ordinating these policies, but the responsibility for providing adequate numbers of beds remains with the health authorities.

**David Davies:** Mae swyddogion llysgenadaethau Prydain wedi dweud bod canran uchel o bobl sy'n cyrraedd y wlad hon ar rai teithiau hedfan penodol yn cario cyffuriau caled. Fodd bynnag, nid oes yn agos ddigon o swyddogion tollau i ddelio â'r broblem, nac, fe ymddengys, yr ewyllys wleidyddol i weithredu. Beth gredwch chi y dylid ei wneud?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gor-ddweud yw datgan nad oes dim yn cael ei wneud, ond yr ydych yn iawn i dynnu sylw'r Aelodau at yr angen i dargedu'r cludwyr cyffuriau—neu'r mulod, fel y'u gelwir, yn ôl a gredaf. Gofynnir i'r bobl hyn gario cyffuriau trwy sawl modd, gan gynnwys llyncu'r cyffuriau mewn pecynnau, a all dorri gyda chanlyniadau sydd yn ddieithriad yn angheuol—yn aml ar deithiau o Kingston, Jamaica i Lundain a mannau eraill. Mae sut i ganfod mulod ar deithiau hedfan o'r fath yn gwestiwn anodd i Swyddfa Dollau Tramor a Chartref Ei Mawrhydi, ond mae'n cael pob sylw. Fodd bynnag, nid yw bob amser yn

that there are always more volunteers, however dreadful the methods of smuggling and however high the risk of being caught when they arrive in the UK.

bosibl canfod pob cariwr. Mae tlodi yn Jamaica mor ddrwg nes bod mwy o wirfoddolwyr bob amser ar gael, pa mor erchyll bynnag yw'r dulliau smyglo a pha mor uchel bynnag yw'r perygl o gael eu dal pan gyrhaeddant y DU.

2:40 p.m.

### Datganiadau Cyhoeddus Public Pronouncements

**Q9 Helen Mary Jones:** What steps is the First Minister taking to ensure that his Cabinet colleagues act in accordance with their public pronouncements at all times? (OAQ18494)

**The First Minister:** I delegate powers to Ministers and it is for them to take decisions in their areas of responsibility in light of the overall objectives agreed by the Cabinet.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Will you, First Minister, as leader of the team, take responsibility for your Ministers' actions and words? Are you prepared to explain why your Minister for Health and Social Services, Jane Hutt, has failed to deliver on her public commitment, made on 6 April 2001, to open the beds at Tŷ Bryngwyn hospice in Llanelli by last September? Will you take responsibility for ensuring that she keeps her word, however belatedly?

**The First Minister:** I am not familiar with the project to which you refer. I have heard of it, but do not have the details on the progress, or otherwise, of its construction. However, I will investigate the matter and ensure that either Jane or I write to you with an update.

**Kirsty Williams:** Earlier this year there was the much-welcomed announcement of the Assembly investment grants. The associated guidance stated that those grants would be available to the service sector working beyond the immediate local market. Does that now not conflict with the advice given to some of my constituents, who hoped to benefit from such grants in the light of the

**C9 Helen Mary Jones:** Pa gamau y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod ei gydweithwyr yn y Cabinet yn ymddwyn yn unol â'u datganiadau cyhoeddus bob amser? (OAQ18494)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddaf yn dirprwyo pwerau i Weinidogion a mater iddynt hwy yw gwneud penderfyniadau yn eu meysydd cyfrifoldeb yng ngoleuni'r amcanion cyffredinol y cytunwyd arnynt gan y Cabinet.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A wnewch chi, Brif Weinidog, fel arweinydd y tîm, gymryd cyfrifoldeb am weithredoedd a geiriau eich Gweinidogion? A ydych yn barod i egluro pam y mae eich Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Jane Hutt, wedi methu cadw at ei hymrwymiad cyhoeddus, a wnaed ar 6 Ebrill 2001, i agor y gwelyau yn hosbis Tŷ Bryngwyn yn Llanelli erbyn mis Medi diwethaf? A gymerwch gyfrifoldeb dros sicrhau ei bod yn cadw'i gair, er hwyred y bo?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r prosiect y cyfeiriwch ato. Yr wyf wedi clywed amdano, ond nid oes gennyl fanylion ar hynt, neu ddifyg hynt, y gwaith adeiladu arno. Fodd bynnag, ymchwiliad i'r mater a sicrhaf y byddaf i neu Jane yn ysgrifennu atoch gyda'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn gynharach eleni cyhoeddwyd grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, i groeso brwd. Yn ôl y canllawiau cysylltiedig, byddai'r grantiau hynny ar gael i'r sector gwasanaeth sy'n gweithio y tu hwnt i'r farchnad leol uniongyrchol. Onid yw hynny yn awr yn gwrthdaro â'r cyngor a roddwyd i rai o'm hetholwyr, a oedd wedi gobeithio elwa ar y grantiau hyn yn sgl

devastating effects of foot and mouth disease on the rural economy?

**The First Minister:** There is a well established principle of regional assistance, which to my knowledge—and that covers over 30 years of familiarity with industrial investment grants—has never been departed from, which is that such grants are never given to companies which service a local market. Therefore, that they will not be available to a corner shop, post office or local garage. However, if a company does specialist work, which has an appeal or potential market outside the local area, it is eligible. I understood that that was the principle of the Assembly investment grants and, therefore, they should be available in areas such as Powys. Given that there are many small firms there, it seemed an ideal scheme to promote the economic development and recovery of Powys from the devastating effects of foot and mouth disease. If you inform me or Andrew Davies of your constituents' problems, I hope that a satisfactory explanation can be given.

**Nick Bourne:** A well known public pronouncement made by your deputy was on performance-related pay. He made it before he got into the Cabinet, and we all thought that it was not a good idea then. However, perhaps it was that rare thing, a Liberal Democrat good idea—it is about as rare as a sighting of Mayor Goodway at the Urdd National Eisteddfod. However, is it worth considering that idea, now that there are Liberal Democrats in the Cabinet, particularly given the situation in rural Wales? Perhaps the Deputy First Minister will then return some of his salary.

**The First Minister:** I have never been in favour of performance-related pay. I am not sure, Nick, whether you are now saying that you are in favour of it. All Conservatives should consider this matter, particularly given that they now say that care in the community was a great mistake, even though they were responsible for it. Oliver Letwin, the Shadow Home Secretary, said this morning that he thought that the Dublin convention was a

effeithiau trychinebus clwy'r traed a'r genau ar yr economi wledig?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae egwyddor wedi'i hen sefydlu o roi cymorth rhanbarthol, a hyd y gwn i—ac mae gennyd dros 30 mlynedd o fod yn gyfarwydd â grantiau buddsoddi diwydiannol—ni symudwyd oddi wrth yr egwyddor honno erioed, sef na roddir y cyfryw grantiau fyth i gwmniau sy'n gwasanaethu marchnad leol. Felly, ni fyddant ar gael i siop gornel, swyddfa bost na modurdy lleol. Fodd bynnag, os yw cwmni'n ymgymryd â gwaith arbenigol, ac iddo apêl neu farchnad bosibl y tu allan i'r ardal leol, mae'n gymwys. Deellais mai dyna oedd egwyddor grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad ac, felly, y dylent fod ar gael mewn ardaloedd fel Powys. Gan fod llawer o gwmniau bach yn y fan honno, ymddangosai'n gynllun delfrydol i hybu datblygiad economaidd ac adferiad Powys o effeithiau trychinebus clwy'r traed a'r genau. Os rhoddwch wybod i mi neu Andrew Davies am broblemau'ch etholwyr, gobeithiaf y gellir rhoi eglurhad boddhaol.

**Nick Bourne:** Datganiad cyhoeddus adnabyddus a wnaethpwyd gan eich dirprwy oedd hwnnw ar gyflog wedi'i seilio ar berfformiad. Fe'i gwnaeth cyn cael ei ddyrchafu i'r Cabinet, ac yr oeddem i gyd yn meddwl nad oedd yn syniad da bryd hynny. Er hynny, efallai mai'r peth prin hwnnw ydoedd, syniad da gan Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol—mae tua'r un mor brin â chyfle i weld y Maer Goodway ar Faes Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd. Fodd bynnag, a ydyw'n werth ystyried y syniad hwnnw, gan fod gennym Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cabinet yn awr, yn enwedig yn wyneb y sefyllfa yn y Gymru wledig? Efallai wedyn y gwnaiff y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ddychwelyd peth o'i gyflog.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni fûm erioed o blaid cyflog wedi'i seilio ar berfformiad. Nid wyf yn siŵr, Nick, a ydych chi'n dweud eich bod bellach o'i blaid. Dylai pob Ceidwadwr ystyried y mater hwn, yn enwedig gan eu bod yn dweud erbyn hyn mai camgymeriad mawr oedd gofal yn y gymuned, er mai hwy oedd yn gyfrifol amdano. Dywedodd Oliver Letwin, Ysgrifennydd Cartref yr Wrthblaid, y bore yma ei fod yn credu bod cytundeb

great mistake, even though the Conservatives were responsible for that. The present Westminster opposition leaders would be handing back much of their former Ministers' pay, given the frequency with which they are now blaming their own predecessors for what is wrong in British society.

Dulyn yn gamgymeriad mawr, er mai'r Ceidwadwyr oedd yn gyfrifol am honno. Byddai arweinwyr presennol yr wrthblaid yn San Steffan yn talu'n ôl gyfrannau mawr o'u hen gyflogau fel Gweinidogion, gan mor aml y maent erbyn hyn yn beio'u rhagflaenwyr eu hunain am yr hyn sydd o'i le ar gymdeithas ym Mhrydain.

### Ail-ddosbarthu Cyfoeth Redistribution of Wealth

**Q10 Richard Edwards:** What discussions has the First Minister had with his Westminster colleagues regarding fiscal measures aiming to redistribute wealth throughout Wales? (OAQ18491)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly Government has been party to discussions with the UK Government in this regard and welcomes measures introduced in the recent budget, in particular, the new research and development tax credit for large companies to promote innovation, which complements the existing research and development tax credit for small and medium sized enterprises, and the reduction of the small companies' corporation tax rate by 1 per cent. Allied to other measures, that package supports the aims and objectives described in 'A Winning Wales'.

**Richard Edwards:** Do you agree that the Assembly Government's 'Better Advice: Better Health' scheme, which will spread to include my constituency, Preseli Pembrokeshire, next month when the Haverfordwest citizens advice bureau will provide welfare rights advice in primary healthcare settings, is a practical way of ensuring that money reaches some of the most disadvantaged individuals and communities in Wales?

**The First Minister:** Yes; we are almost back to Ann Jones's earlier question of how to do that without stigmatising people. There are many people who are eligible for benefits, but who find the process of asking for means-tested benefits stigmatising, and therefore, do not do it. We must find a way of promoting their access to benefits and their willingness to ask for their rights, without any stigma being attached. The welfare rights advice

**C10 Richard Edwards:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda'i gydweithwyr yn San Steffan ynghylch mesurau cyllidol sy'n anelu at ailddosbarthu cyfoeth drwy Gymru? (OAQ18491)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cael trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â hyn ac mae'n croesawu mesurau a gyflwynwyd yn y gyllideb ddiweddar, yn enwedig y credyd treth newydd ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu i gwmniau mawr i hyrwyddo gwaith arloesi, sy'n cyd-fynd â'r credyd treth datblygu i fentrau bach a chanolig, a'r lleihad o 1 y cant yn y gyfradd dreth gorfforaethol i gwmniau bychain. Ynghyd â mesurau eraill, mae'r pecyn hwnnw'n cefnogi'r nodau ac amcanion a ddisgrifir yn 'Cymru'n Ennill'.

**Richard Edwards:** A ydych yn cytuno bod cynllun Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, 'Cyngor Gwell: Iechyd Gwell', a fydd yn ymledaenu i gynnwys fy etholaeth i, Preseli Sir Benfro, y mis nesaf pan fydd canolfan gynghori Hwlffordd yn darparu cyngor ar hawliau lles mewn lleoliadau gofal iechyd sylfaenol, yn ffordd ymarferol o sicrhau bod arian yn cyrraedd rhai o'r unigolion a'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ydwyt; yr ydym bron yn ôl at gwestiwn cynharach Ann Jones ynghylch sut i wneud hynny heb warthnodi pobl. Mae llawer o bobl sydd â hawl i gael budd-dal, ond sy'n teimlo y caint eu gwarthnodi gan y broses o ofyn am fudd-dal sy'n seiliedig ar brawf modd, ac sydd, felly, yn peiddio â gofyn. Rhaid inni ganfod ffordd o hyrwyddo'u hawl i fudd-daliadau a'u parodrwydd i ofyn am eu hawliau, heb osod

initiative has been successful in spreading this message. Advice can be given in a primary care setting—you see it in a GP's surgery or sometimes in the Citizens Advice Bureau. It is astonishing how frequently the people who make the gentlest of inquiries receive £30 or £40 less in benefit—be that invalidity benefit, incapacity benefit or whatever—than they should do. The scheme has been a great success.

**Elin Jones:** Mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn cydnabod yr angen am ailddosbarthu cyfoeth drwy bolisi rhanbarthol, megis Amcan 1. A ddylai Llywodraeth San Steffan ddangos yr un ymrwymiad drwy sicrhau cyllid cyfatebol llawn i Amcan 1 yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn yr haf, yn hytrach na'n bod yn gorfod tynnu arian oddi wrth gyllidebau prin addysg ac iechyd yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn siŵr am ba wlad yr oeddech yn sôn ar ddiwedd eich cwestiwn. Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi gosod egwyddor, drwy gytundeb gyda'r Llywodraeth, yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn 2000. Yr ydym yn dod at yr wythnosau olaf o drafod adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant 2003, a gobeithiwn barhau gyda'r un egwyddor lwyddiannus.

**Brian Gibbons:** I was pleased that Richard tabled this question, as these advice clinics were started in my practice in the upper Afan valley, in conjunction with Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council and West Glamorgan Health Authority. It was the equivalent of a small factory in terms of the income that was being generated for local people. Do you agree that more work needs to be done to improve the uptake of welfare rights to tackle social exclusion and low incomes in many communities across Wales?

**The First Minister:** The emphasis must be on the word 'rights'. You must persuade people to demand their rights. It is not asking for charity. Unfortunately, an older generation still believes that it is the equivalent of going to the parish and asking for charity. It is not. The emphasis must be

unrhyw warthnod ynglwm wrtho. Bu'r fenter cyngor hawliau lles yn llwyddiannus o ran lledaenu'r neges hon. Gellir rhoi cyngor mewn lleoliad gofal sylfaenol—fe'i gwelwch ym meddygfa meddyg teulu neu weithiau yn y Ganolfan Gynghori. Mae'n syndod mor aml y mae'r bobl sy'n gwneud yr ymholiadau mwyaf petrus yn cael £30 neu £40 yn llai nag y dylent mewn budd-dal—boed fudd-dal anabledd, budd-dal analluedd neu beth bynnag. Bu'r cynllun yn llwyddiant mawr.

**Elin Jones:** The European Union recognises the need for the redistribution of wealth through a regional policy, such as Objective 1. Should the Westminster Government not show the same commitment by securing full match funding for Objective 1 in the comprehensive spending review in the summer, rather than forcing us to redirect money from the already scant health and education budgets in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure to which country you were referring at the end of your question. That has not happened in Wales. We established a principle, by agreement with the Government, during the comprehensive spending review in 2000. We are now approaching the last few weeks of discussions on the 2003 comprehensive spending review, and we hope to uphold the same successful principle.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oeddwn yn falch fod Richard wedi cyflwyno'r cwestiwn hwn, gan y cychwynnwyd y clinigau cynggor hyn yn fy meddygfa i yng nghwm Afan uchaf, ar y cyd â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot ac Awdurdod Iechyd Gorllewin Morgannwg. Yr oedd yn gyfwerth â ffatri fach o ran yr incwm a gynhyrchid i bobl leol. A gytunwch fod angen gwneud mwy o waith i wella'r niferoedd sy'n manteisio ar eu hawliau lles er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol ac incwm isel mewn cymunedau lawer ar draws Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Rhaid i'r pwyslais fod ar y gair 'hawliau'. Rhaid ichi berswadio pobl i fynnu eu hawliau. Nid gofyn am elusen mohono. Yn anffodus, mae to hŷn sy'n dal i gred ei fod yn gyfwerth â mynd ar y plwyf a gofyn am elusen. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Rhaid i'r pwyslais fod ar hawliau. Nid oeddwn yn

on rights. I was not aware, Brian, of your involvement in the origination of these schemes with Neath and Port Talbot County Borough Council, but I visited the successful Skewen welfare advice scheme, which in that authority area. This is a great success story, not only in Neath and Port Talbot, but in other areas with a high level of deprivation in Wales.

ymwybodol, Brian, eich bod wedi ymwneud â chychwyniad y cynlluniau hyn gyda Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, ond ymwelais â'r cynllun cyngor lles llwyddiannus yn Sgiwen, sydd yn ardal yr awdurdod hwnnw. Mae hon yn enghraifft o lwyddiant mawr, nid yn unig yng Nghastell-nedd a Phort Talbot, ond mewn ardaloedd eraill â lefel uchel o amddfadedd yng Nghymru.

## **Datganiad ar Dawn Meats Cyf Statement on Dawn Meats Ltd**

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** The First Minister, myself and all Members, were saddened to hear of the fire at the Crosshands meat processing facility of Dawn Meats UK Ltd, formally Dawn Pac, on 11 June. Although 160 staff were working at the site at the time of the fire, I am relieved that nobody was injured during the evacuation of the building. I understand that a full inquiry into the cause of the fire is now underway. Around half of the meat processing facility was destroyed. This has obviously reduced the amount of raw meat that can be processed on the Crosshands site. The company has therefore taken the decision to make 183 members of staff redundant, although 163 staff will remain at the site. This will be a major blow to the area, since Dawn Meats is one of the largest employers in the vicinity. Regional selective assistance was provided to assist the company to establish in Crosshands in 1992. We have subsequently assisted two further expansions, helping to increase the number of employees to over 350. Dawn Meats processes raw meat into pre-packed joints and minced meat for leading supermarkets across the UK. Given the obvious problems following the fire, it has managed to divert orders to its other UK operations to maintain continuity of supply to its customers.

2:50 p.m.

It is planned to resume production, albeit at a reduced rate, at the Crosshands site on 5 July. The Welsh Assembly Government has remained in close contact with the company throughout its time in Wales, as has the Welsh Development Agency. Assembly

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Yr oedd y newyddion am y tân yn ffatri brosesu cig Dawn Meats UK Cyf, sef Dawn Pac gynt, yn Crosshands ar 11 Mehefin yn dristwch mawr i minnau, y Prif Weinidog a gweddill Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Er bod 160 o staff yn gweithio ar y safle ar adeg y tân, yr wyf yn falch nad anafwyd neb wrth wacáu'r adeilad. Deallaf fod ymchwiliad llawn i achos y tân bellach ar droed. Dinistriwyd tua hanner y ffatri brosesu cig. Mae hyn yn amlwg wedi lleihau faint o gig amrwd y gellir ei brosesu ar safle Crosshands. Mae'r cwmni felly wedi penderfynu diswyddo 183 aelod o'i staff, er y bydd 163 o staff yn aros ar y safle. Bydd hyn yn ergyd drom i'r ardal, gan fod Dawn Meats yn un o'r cyflogwyr mwyaf yn y cyffiniau. Darparwyd cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i helpu'r cwmni i ymsefydlu yn Crosshands yn 1992. Ers hynny yr ydym wedi cynorthwyo'r cwmni i ehangu ddwy waith, gan helpu i gynyddu'r nifer o bobl a gyflogir i dros 350. Mae Dawn Meats yn prosesu cig amrwd yn olwythion a briwgig wedi'u pacio ar gyfer archfarchnadodd blaenllaw ledled y DU. Yn dilyn y problemau amlwg o ganlyniad i'r tân, mae wedi llwyddo i gyfeirio archebion i'w ffatrioedd eraill yn y DU er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn parhau i gyflenwi ei gwsmeriaid.

Bwriedir ailddechrau cynhyrchu, er ar raddfa lai, yn safle Crosshands ar 5 Gorffennaf. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cadw mewn cysylltiad agos â'r cwmni drwy gydol ei amser yng Nghymru, fel y gwnaeth Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Cyfarfu

officials together with representatives of the WDA, Carmarthenshire County Council and the company met on 14 June to discuss what assistance could be provided following the fire. The WDA and the Assembly described what additional assistance they might be able to provide. The WDA offered to find the company alternative premises in order to assist it through these difficult times.

A taskforce is now being set up comprising ELWa—our training agency—the employment service, job centres, the WDA and the local council to ensure that all possible assistance is provided to the 183 staff affected. On the remaining 163 staff, the WDA, the local council and members of the Irish parent group are meeting tomorrow to discuss the situation in more detail. In addition, the Assembly is happy to support added value processing in Wales through its processing and marketing grant, which is managed by the WDA.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am grateful to the Minister for making a statement today in response to our request for an urgent question. I concur with his remarks about the fire. It was fortunate that no-one was hurt and the company and workforce can be congratulated for undertaking their emergency procedures effectively. I am sure that you agree that these job losses will have a serious impact on this area. It may not sound like a large number in terms of larger, more urban areas, but it is a serious loss for us in an area that has already been badly hit by job losses. I am glad that the company has been made aware of what support is available, but what was offered? Can you assure us that you will press the company to accept the offers that have been made in light of the importance of these jobs for this locality? Will you stress the opportunity in the longer term to enhance the quality of its products, perhaps by using local agricultural produce for more specialised markets than those it has traditionally catered for?

Do you also agree that trying to find jobs in plants in other parts of the UK is not the answer—even though it may be the answer for some of the affected workers? No-one could blame workers for taking such opportunities. However, once again jobs have

swyddogion y Cynulliad ynghyd â chynrychiolwyr y WDA, Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin a'r cwmni ar 14 Mehefin i drafod pa gymorth y gellid ei gynnig o ganlyniad i'r tân. Disgrifiodd y WDA a'r Cynulliad pa gymorth ychwanegol y gallent ei gynnig efallai. Cynigiodd y WDA ganfod adeilad arall i'r cwmni er mwyn ei gynorthwyo drwy'r adeg anodd hwn.

Mae tasglu'n cael ei sefydlu ar hyn o bryd, sy'n cynnwys ELWa—ein hasiantaeth hyfforddi—y gwasanaeth cyflogi, canolfannau gwaith, y WDA a'r cyngor lleol, i sicrhau y rhoddir pob cymorth posibl i'r 183 o staff yr effeithir arnynt. Gyda'r 163 o staff sy'n weddill, mae'r WDA, y cyngor lleol ac aelodau'r rhiant gwmni o Iwerddon yn cyfarfod yfory i drafod y sefyllfa mewn mwy o fanylder. At hynny, mae'r Cynulliad yn hapus i gefnogi prosesu â gwerth ychwanegol yng Nghymru drwy ei grant prosesu a marchnata, a reolir gan y WDA.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am wneud datganiad heddiw mewn ymateb i'n cais am gwestiwn brys. Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'i sylwadau am y tân. Yr oedd yn ffodus nad anafwyd neb a gellir llongyfarch y cwmni a'r gweithlu am gyflawni eu gweithdrefnau argyfwng yn effeithiol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch y caiff y colledion effaith ddifrifol ar yr ardal hon. Efallai nad yw'n swnio fel nifer fawr yng nghyd-destun ardaloedd trefol mwy o faint, ond mae'n golled ddifrifol i ni mewn ardal sydd eisoes wedi'i tharo gan golledion swyddi. Yr wyf yn falch fod y cwmni wedi cael gwybod pa gefnogaeth sydd ar gael, ond beth a gynigiwyd? A allwch chi roi sicrwydd inni y gnewch chi bwysio ar y cwmni i dderbyn y cynigion a wnaethpwyd yn wyneb pwysigrwydd y swyddi i'r ardal hon? A gnewch chi bwysleisio'r cyfle yn y tymor hwy i wella ansawdd ei nwyddau, efallai drwy ddefnyddio cynnyrch amaethyddol lleol ar gyfer marchnadoedd mwy arbenigol na'r rhai y darparodd ar eu cyfer yn draddodiadol?

A gytunwch hefyd nad ceisio dod o hyd i swyddi mewn gweithfeydd mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU yw'r ateb—er y gall fod yn ateb i rai o'r gweithwyr yr effeithir arnynt? Ni allai neb feio gweithwyr am gymryd cyfleoedd o'r fath. Er hynny, unwaith eto

been lost in a Welsh-speaking community, which risks further damaging Welsh as a community language in an area, which we all acknowledge, is on the border of the linguistic continuum. Do you agree that it makes it all the more important that you, your officials and the WDA explore the possibility of replacing the jobs in this locality?

I welcome the establishment of the taskforce and congratulate all the agencies responsible for responding promptly. I am glad that further meetings are planned. Will you undertake to report on further developments to the Assembly?

**Andrew Davies:** I agree with you. As I said in my statement, these are serious job losses in an Objective 1 and substantially rural area, which has already suffered problems following the decline in the agriculture sector and in the mining industry. It would not be appropriate for me to say anything further before tomorrow's meeting and until we get more information about the company's intention. Clearly, it is a commercial company and where to locate a production is for the company to decide. We have made offers to assist the company if it wishes to continue the previous level of production at the Crosshands plant. It is up to individual employees to decide whether to take up the offer of a job elsewhere in the UK, which is to be welcomed. However, the Assembly will do all that it can to encourage job creation and retention in Wales, particularly in rural west Wales. These points will be made to the company. I give a commitment that I will keep the Assembly, the Economic Development Committee or the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee—whichever is most appropriate—informed as I already do with the Economic Development Committee when there are major job losses.

**Mick Bates:** We all share your concern about these job losses and your relief that no-one was injured in the fire. A similar situation existed in Montgomeryshire in my constituency whereby many jobs depended on one employer. The task group principle worked extremely well in that case. I endorse

mae swyddi wedi'u colli mewn cymuned Gymraeg, sy'n bygwth mwy o niwed i'r Gymraeg fel iaith gymunedol mewn ardal sydd, fel y mae pawb ohonom yn cydnabod, ar ffin y continwwm ieithyddol. A gytunwch fod hynny'n ei gwneud yn bwysicach byth eich bod chi, eich swyddogion a'r WDA yn archwilio'r posibilrwydd o greu swyddi newydd yn yr ardal i gymryd lle'r rhai a gollir?

Croesawaf sefydlu'r tasglu a llonyfarchaf yr holl asiantaethau cyfrifol am ymateb mor gyflym. Yr wyf yn falch fod cyfarfodydd pellach wedi'u cynllunio. A wnewch chi ymgymryd i ddod ag adroddiadau i'r Cynulliad ar unrhyw ddatblygiadau pellach?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, mae'r rhain yn golledion difrifol mewn ardal Amcan 1 ac ardal wledig i raddau helaeth, sydd eisoes wedi dioddef yn sgil y dirywiad yn y sector amaeth a'r diwydiant glo. Ni fyddai'n briodol imi ddweud dim byd pellach cyn cyfarfod yfory a hyd nes y cawn ragor o wybodaeth am fwriad y cwmni. Yn amlwg, mae'n gwmni masnachol a mater i'r cwmni yw penderfynu ym mhle i leoli'r gwaith cynhyrchu. Yr ydym wedi cynnig cymorth i'r cwmni os dymuna barhau gyda'r lefel flaenorol o gynhyrchu yn ffatri Crosshands. Mater i weithwyr unigol hefyd yw penderfynu a ydynt am dderbyn y cynnig o swydd yn rhywle arall yn y DU, sydd i'w groesawu. Er hynny, fe wna'r Cynulliad bopeth o fewn ei allu i annog cwmnïau i greu a chadw swyddi yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yn y gorllewin gwledig. Gwneir y pwytiau hyn i'r cwmni. Rhoddaf ymrwymiad y sicrhaf y caiff y Cynulliad, y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd neu'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig—pa un bynnag yw'r mwyaf priodol—bob gwybodaeth, fel y gwnaf eisoes gyda'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd pan gollir nifer fawr o swyddi.

**Mick Bates:** Yr ydym i gyd yn rhannu'ch pryder am y colledion hyn a'ch teimlad o ryddhad na chafodd neb ei anafu yn y tân. Yr oedd sefyllfa debyg yn Sir Drefaldwyn yn fy etholaeth, lle'r oedd llawer o swyddi'n dibynnu ar un cyflogwr. Gweithiodd egwyddor y tasglu yn eithriadol o dda yn yr

it because it saved 200 jobs in Llanidloes. I only hope that it can be as successful with regard to this situation.

I am pleased that there has been considerable support for Dawn Meats Ltd in the past and I hope that the Minister's work will provide support to retain the threatened jobs. However, I am concerned: when companies are supported in this way—in this case an Irish parent company—can we encourage them to use local products, and local meats in particular? I am sure that the Minister is aware of the problems in Wales regarding imported meat and the depression of the home market. Can you take action to encourage the company to use local products that add value to our communities and not producers elsewhere in the world?

**Andrew Davies:** I agree with the thrust of your comments. I thank you for your comments on the success of the taskforce established to help the company affected in Llanidloes. As I said in a short debate led by Janice Gregory some weeks ago, we are trying wherever possible to ensure that companies, such as supermarkets and retail sector companies, purchase their products, such as agriculture goods, in Wales. The WDA, through Source Wales and other schemes, tries to ensure that companies, such as those established by inward investors, source components and supplies through Welsh companies wherever possible. The thrust of our economic development strategy is to ensure that added value is kept in Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** I thank the Minister for his statement and for clarifying a number of points. I underline the relief that we share that no-one was injured or lost their lives in the fire and concur with his comments on the jobs lost. I am concerned, however, that the number of jobs lost is significant because the economy in this part of world is at such a low ebb. If the west Wales economy was more dynamic, the job losses would not have had such a major impact. Mick Bates is right about overdependence on certain employers. What specific plans will the Minister

achos hwnnw. Yr wyf yn ei gymeradwy oherwydd arbedodd 200 o swyddi yn Llanidloes. Gobeithiaf y gall fod yr un mor llwyddiannus yn y sefyllfa hon.

Yr wyf yn falch y bu cefnogaeth sylweddol i Dawn Meats Cyf yn y gorffennol a gobeithiaf y bydd gwaith y Gweinidog yn cynnig cefnogaeth i gadw'r swyddi sydd dan fygythiad. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus: pan gefnogir cwmniau yn y modd yma—rhiant gwmni Gwyddelig yn yr achos hwn—a allwn eu hannog i ddefnyddio cynyrrch lleol, a chigoedd lleol yn arbennig? Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r problemau yng Nghymru ynghylch cig wedi'i fewnforio a dirwasgiad y farchnad gartref. A allwch weithredu i annog y cwmni i ddefnyddio cynhyrchion lleol sy'n ychwanegu gwerth i'n cymunedau ac nid cynhyrchwyr o rannau eraill o'r byd?

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf ag ergyd eich sylwadau. Diolchaf ichi am eich sylwadau ar lwyddiant y tasglu a sefydlwyd i helpu'r cwmni yr effeithiwyd arno yn Llanidloes. Fel y dywedais mewn dadl fer a arweiniwyd gan Janice Gregory rai wythnosau'n ôl, yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau, lle bynnag y bo modd, fod cwmniau, megis archfarchnadoedd a chwmniau'r sector manwerthu, yn prynu eu nwyddau, fel cynyrrch amaethyddol, yng Nghymru. Mae'r WDA, drwy Ffynhonnell Cymru a chynlluniau eraill, yn ceisio sicrhau bod cwmniau, megis y rheini a sefydlir gan fuddsoddwyr o wledydd eraill, yn mynd at gwmniau Cymreig am gydrannau a chyflenwadau lle bynnag y bo modd. Bwriad ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd yw sicrhau y cedwir gwerth ychwanegol yng Nghymru.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad ac am egluro nifer o bwyntiau. Pwysleisiaf y rhyddhad a rannwn na chafodd neb ei anafu na'i ladd yn y tân ac ategaf ei sylwadau ar y swyddi a gollwyd. Yr wyf yn bryderus, foddy bynnag, fod y nifer o swyddi a gollir yn arwyddocaol oherwydd fod pethau mor fain ar yr economi yn y rhan hon o'r byd. Pe bai economi gorllewin Cymru'n fwy deinamig, ni chawsai'r colledion effaith mor fawr. Mae Mick Bates yn iawn ynghylch gorddibynnu ar rai cyflogwyr. Pa gynlluniau penodol a gyflwyna'r Gweinidog yn y

introduce in west Wales to make the economy more dynamic?

I am glad that a taskforce is now being set up—the statement announced some of its members. Will the Minister commit to returning to this issue, either at the Economic Development Committee or in a future Plenary session, to highlight the progress of the taskforce? Many taskforces are in operation, but few details are made public. Will the Minister take the opportunity to introduce openness into this decision-making and steering body?

**Andrew Davies:** In my reply to Helen Mary Jones I referred to the fact that this particular part of west Wales has suffered as the result of problems associated with the agriculture sector and job losses in the mining industry. Our strategy aims to ensure that the whole of Wales has a more prosperous and dynamic economy. The west Wales local economy is far more diverse than it was in the past—it is not as prosperous as other parts of Wales, but I do not accept that it is at a low ebb. The unemployment rate is lower than at any time in the last 35 years, and a substantial number of jobs are being created. Nevertheless, there is great scope for taking a sub-regional view of economic development in this area. I have taken up this issue with my officials, Mike King, the executive director of the south-west Wales division of the WDA, local authorities and other agencies. We need to take a more holistic and regional approach to economic development. Our work on economic development issues has been too narrowly focused. I have taken steps to introduce this change.

3:00 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf innau hefyd yn gwerthfawrogi ymateb mor gyflym i'r sefyllfa hon a'r ffaith bod tasglu wedi'i sefydlu. Edrychaf yn ofalus ar ddatganiad y Gweinidog ynglŷn â chylch gorchwyl y tasglu a chaf yr argraff ei fod wedi rhoi'r gorau i geisio cadw'r swyddi a'i fod yn derbyn eu bod wedi mynd. Derbyniad ein bod yn ymdrin â chwmni masnachol, ond mae'r cwmni hwn yn y gorffennol wedi cael llawer

Gorllewin i wneud yr economi'n fwy deinamig?

Yr wyf yn falch fod tasglu bellach yn cael ei sefydlu—enwyd rhai o'r aelodau yn y datganiad. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo i ddychwelyd at y mater hwn, naill yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd neu mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn y dyfodol, i sôn am gynnydd a wnaed gan y tasglu? Mae llawer o dasgloedd ar waith, ond ychydig o fanylion a gyhoeddir. A wnaiff y Gweinidog fanteisio ar y cyfle i sicrhau bod y corff llywio a gwneud penderfyniadau hwn yn un agored?

**Andrew Davies:** Yn fy ateb i Helen Mary Jones cyfeiriais at y ffaith bod y rhan arbennig hon o orllewin Cymru wedi dioddef yn sgîl problemau cysylltiedig â'r sector amaethyddol a cholledion swyddi yn y diwydiant glo. Ein strategaeth ni yw sicrhau bod gan Gymru gyfan economi mwy ffyniannus a deinamig. Mae economi leol y Gorllewin yn llawer mwy amrywiol nag y bu yn y gorffennol—nid yw mor ffyniannus â rhannau eraill o Gymru, ond nid wyf yn derbyn ei bod yn fain arni. Mae'r gyfradd ddiweithdra'n is nag ar unrhyw adeg yn y 35 mlynedd diwethaf, ac mae nifer sylweddol o swyddi'n cael eu creu. Er hynny, mae lle i gymryd golwg is-ranbarthol ar ddatblygu economaidd yn yr ardal hon. Yr wyf wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda fy swyddogion, Mike King, cyfarwyddwr gweithredol adran de-orllewin Cymru Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau eraill. Mae angen inni ystyried datblygu economaidd mewn modd mwy holistaidd ac yn y cyddestun rhanbarthol. Mae ein gwaith ar faterion datblygu economaidd wedi bod yn rhy gul. Yr wyf wedi cymryd camau i gyflwyno'r newid hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I also appreciate the swiftness of the response to this situation and the establishment of a taskforce. I am looking carefully at the Minister's statement on the taskforce's remit and I get the impression that he has given up on trying to save the jobs and that he accepts that they are lost. I accept his point that we are dealing with a commercial company but, in the past, this company has been given a great deal of support and

o gefnogaeth, cynhaliaeth a chymorthdaliadau oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cymru a'r asiantaethau sydd yn atebol iddi. A yw'n parhau i roi pwysau ar y cwmni i aros yn Crosshands ac yn pwysleisio'r manteision a ddaw yn sgîl hynny?

Mae'r Gweinidog yn cyfeirio at 183 o swyddi o dan fygythiad, ond a yw'n derbyn bod llawer o gwmniau lleol yn ddibynnol ar Dawn Meats Cyf o ran sicrhau eu proffidioldeb? A fydd y tasglu'n cynorthwyo'r cwmniau hynny hefyd? Os byddwn yn colli'r swyddi yn y pen draw, a wnaiff ymroi i geisio sicrhau bod canolfan brosesu arall yn cael ei sefydlu yn sir Gaerfyrddin? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n derbyn bod canolfannau o'r fath sy'n prosesu cymaint o gynnrych amaethyddol yn sir Gaerfyrddin yn hollbwysig?

**Andrew Davies:** I have not given up. We will work with the company and make the case for it to retain its previous level of production. However, as I said in my reply to Helen Mary, it is a commercial decision to be made by the company initially, but, where possible, we will make the case to persuade it to stay. I accept your point about the support that the company has received in the past; that argument has already been made to the company and will continue to be made.

As always with major job losses, it is not only a case of the headline figure of people being made redundant, there are also implications for suppliers of components and so on. There are effects downstream. We will take those into account when the taskforce meets, as we have done following other major job losses.

On setting up another processing centre, we would consider that if there were a case for it. We would do everything to encourage that. As ever, with farming and fishing produce, the major economic impact is in terms of the added value of the food processing. Too often in the past we have exported our produce and have not had the added value. We would look at that with the WDA and others to develop a facility, if that proved to be necessary.

funding and numerous subsidies by the Government of Wales and the various agencies accountable to it. Will he continue to put pressure on the company to remain in Crosshands and is he emphasising the benefits of doing so?

The Minister refers to 183 jobs under threat, but does he accept that many local companies are dependent on Dawn Meats Ltd in terms of ensuring their profitability? Will the taskforce also assist those companies? If we ultimately lose these jobs, will he commit to ensuring that another processing centre is established in Carmarthenshire? I am sure that he would accept that such centres that process so much agricultural produce in Carmarthenshire are vitally important?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid wyf wedi rhoi'r ffidil yn y to. Byddwn yn gweithio gyda'r cwmni ac yn cyflwyno achos iddo dros gadw ei lefel flaenorol o gynhyrchu. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Helen Mary, penderfyniad masnachol ydyw, sydd i'w wneud gan y cwmni yn gyntaf, ond, lle bo modd, ceisiwn ei berswadio i aros. Derbyniad eich pwynt am y gefnogaeth a gafodd y cwmni yn y gorffennol; mae'r pwynt hwnnw eisoes wedi ei wneud i'r cwmni a pharheir i'w wneud.

Pan gollir nifer fawr o swyddi, nid yw'n fater o nifer y rhai sy'n colli eu swyddi yn unig; mae goblygiadau hefyd i gyflenwyr cydrannau ac ati. Effeithir ar eraill, felly. Byddwn yn ystyried y rheini pan fydd y tasglu'n cyfarfod, fel y gwnaethom yn y gorffennol pan gollwyd nifer fawr o swyddi.

Ynghylch sefydlu canolfan brosesu arall, byddem yn ystyried hynny pe bai achos drosti, ac fe wnaem bopeth i annog hynny. Fel ag erioed, gyda chynnyrch ffermio a physgota, y prif effaith economaidd yw'r gwerth ychwanegol a ddaw o brosesu bwyd. Yn rhy aml yn y gorffennol yr ydym wedi allforio'n cynnyrch a heb gael y gwerth ychwanegol. Byddem yn edrych ar hynny gyda'r WDA, ac eraill, i ddatblygu cyfleuster, pe gwelid bod hynny'n angenrheidiol.

## Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

**The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones):** There are some changes to this week's business. Jane Hutt's statement on the youth offending strategy will now be made on Thursday 27 June. Today's scheduled motion to approve under Standing Order No. 27 the Youth Support Services Directions (Wales) 2002 has been moved to Tuesday 2 July. On Thursday, with the Llywydd's agreement, I will seek to move a procedural motion that will allow me to bring forward the motion to approve under Standing Order No. 23 the Plant Breeders' Rights (Fees) (Amendment) Regulations 2002. I had to include that at the last minute and I apologise if insufficient notice was given to members of the Business Committee. The Committee agreed that these regulations could be moved without debate.

On the next three weeks' business, this morning the Business Committee discussed my draft statement as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. The Deputy Presiding Officer determined that, under Standing Order No. 22.5, the following seven pieces of legislation need not be referred to Subject Committees for extended consideration: the National Health Service (General Medical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) (No.2) Regulations 2002; the National Health Service (General Medical Services Supplementary List) Regulations 2002; the National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (Wales) (No.2) Regulations 2002; the National Health Service (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002; the Children Leaving Care (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002; the Undersized Spider Crabs (Wales) Order 2002 and the Shellfish (Specification of Crustaceans) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

**Y Llywydd:** Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau?

**Janet Ryder:** There is already much talk

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones):** Mae rhai newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Gwneir datganiad Jane Hutt ar y strategaeth troseiddwyr ifanc ar ddydd Iau 27 Mehefin bellach. Mae'r cynnig a drefnwyd ar gyfer heddiw i gymeradwyo dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 27 y Cyfarwyddiadau Gwasanaeth Cymorth Ieuenciad (Cymru) 2002 wedi'i symud i ddydd Mawrth 2 Gorffennaf. Ddydd Iau, gyda chytundeb y Llywydd, ceisiaf gyflwyno cynnig trefniadol a fydd yn caniatáu imi ddod ymlaen â'r cynnig i gymeradwyo dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23 Reoliadau Hawliau Bridwyr Planhigion (Ffioedd) (Diwygio) 2002. Bu raid imi gynnwys hynny ar y funud olaf ac ymddiheuraf os na roddwyd rhybudd digonol i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Busnes. Cytunodd y Pwyllgor y gellid cynnig y rheoliadau hyn heb ddadl.

Ynghylch busnes y tair wythnos nesaf, y bore yma trafododd y Pwyllgor Busnes fy natganiad drafft fel y'i gwelir ar we'r Siambro o dan ddogfennau ategol. Penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oedd angen cyfeirio'r saith darn deddfwriaeth canlynol i Bwyllgorau Pwnc ar gyfer ystyriaeth estynedig: Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2002; Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestr Atodol Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) 2002; Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2002; Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2002; Rheoliadau Plant yn Gadael Gofal (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2002; Gorchymyn Crancod Heglog Rhy Fach (Cymru) 2002 a Rheoliadau Pysgod Cregyn (Dynodi Cramenogion) (Cymru) 2002.

**The Presiding Officer:** I see that there are no objections to the business statement. Are there any comments?

**Janet Ryder:** Mae llawer o siarad yn barod

about the forthcoming comprehensive spending review announcement from Westminster. Given the importance of that announcement to the National Assembly's budget, will you ensure that a statement is made to Plenary on this matter before the recess?

**Alun Pugh:** Many people in north Wales feel that the selectors for the Commonwealth Games should hang their heads in shame, following the publication of the members of the Wales team. There are 300 members representing Wales, but only a handful of them are from the North. Could you take this up with the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language and schedule a statement urgently?

**Carwyn Jones:** On Janet's point, I will consult with the appropriate Minister and report back to the Business Committee next week on what is proposed regarding the comprehensive spending review.

Alun feels passionately about the under-representation, as he sees it, of people from north Wales in Wales's Commonwealth Games team. I am sure that he is doing all that he can to improve on what he sees as a deficient situation. Jenny Randerson is not here today, but I am sure that Alun will do his utmost to ensure that she understands his concerns.

**The Presiding Officer:** I apologise, Minister; the leader of the Welsh Conservatives also wished to comment.

**Nick Bourne:** We note from your statement, Minister, that the election of the Chair of the Committee on European and External Affairs is scheduled for next week. However, in an Assembly Review of Procedure Committee meeting, a view was taken unanimously, and by all parties—including the Liberal Democrats, who were represented on that Committee along with all the other parties—that the chairmanship of that Committee should be open to all Assembly Members. We are now proposing to elect a new Chair in advance of that being implemented. Would it not be better for us to have a wider pool of potential Chairs to choose from? Many people feel that it would be better for the

am y cyhoeddiad sydd yn yr arfaeth gan San Steffan ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Oherwydd pwysigrwydd y cyhoeddiad hwnnw i gyllideb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a wnewch chi sicrhau y gwneir datganiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ar y mater hwn cyn y gwyliau?

**Alun Pugh:** Teimla llawer o bobl yn y Gogledd y dylai bod cywilydd ar ddewiswyr Gemau'r Gymanwlad, yn dilyn cyhoeddi aelodau tîm Cymru. Mae 300 o aelodau'n cynrychioli Cymru, ond dim ond dyrnaid ohonynt sydd o'r Gogledd. A allech godi hyn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg a threfnu datganiad ar fyrder?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ar bwynt Janet, ymgynghoraf â'r Gweinidog priodol ac adroddaf yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor Busnes yr wythnos nesaf ar yr hyn sydd ar y gweill parthed yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant.

Mae Alun yn teimlo'n angerddol am yr hyn a wêl ef fel diffyg cynrychiolaeth i bobl o'r Gogledd yn nhîm Cymru ar gyfer Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn gwneud popeth a all i wella sefyllfa sy'n ddiffygiol yn ei olwg ef. Nid yw Jenny Randerson yma heddiw, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff Alun ei orau glas i sicrhau ei bod yn deall ei bryderon.

**Y Llywydd:** Ymddiheuraf, Weinidog, yr oedd arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru am wneud sylw hefyd.

**Nick Bourne:** Nodwn o'ch datganiad, Weinidog, fod etholiad Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol wedi'i drefnu ar gyfer yr wythnos nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mewn cyfarfod o Bwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad, barnwyd yn unfrydol, a chan bob plaid—gan gynnwys y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a oedd wedi'u cynrychioli ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw ynghyd â'r holl bleidiau eraill—y dylai cadeiryddiaeth y Pwyllgor hwnnw fod yn agored i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn awr yn cynnig ethol Cadeirydd newydd cyn i hynny gael ei weithredu. Oni fyddai'n well inni gael cronfa ehangach o ddarpar Gadeiryddion i ddewis ohoni? Teimla llawer o bobl y

position to be opened up to a prominent ordinary Assembly Member. The Committee is not run on a party-political basis and often takes a consensual view. Would it not be better, in light of that, to withdraw this contentious election and wait until the Assembly Review of Procedure Committee's proposal has been included in Standing Orders? That will happen shortly and could happen even sooner should the Minister choose to bring it forward.

**Carwyn Jones:** I am aware of the Assembly Review of Procedure Committee's report and what it says about the Chair of this Committee. Nevertheless, at present, our Standing Orders state that the election of the Chair of this Committee shall take place under Standing Order No. 15, and that is what is proposed for next Tuesday.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**The Presiding Officer:** I now return to the issues raised by Ron Davies and others on 18 June. I have received a letter from the First Minister which indicates that accountability for cross-cutting issues, including relations between Wales and Europe and the rest of the world, freedom of information, and human rights, falls on the Minister who is accountable for the areas of responsibility under which such issues arise. That means, for example, that Jane Davidson, as Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, would be accountable to the Assembly for human rights issues arising from education policies. Similarly, Jane Hutt, as the Minister for Health and Social Services, would be accountable for a matter affecting Wales and Europe if that matter were related to health.

As a result of receiving that letter, I am satisfied that section 57(4) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 is being complied with and that the division between Subject Committees of the areas for which those Committees have responsibility is the same as the division between Ministers of the areas

byddai'n well agor y swydd i Aelod cyffredin blaenllaw o'r Cynulliad. Nid yw'r Pwyllgor wedi'i redeg ar sail bleidiol wleidyddol ac yn aml ceir consensws barn. Oni fyddai'n well, yn wyneb hynny, tynnu'r etholiad dadleuol hwn yn ôl ac aros nes y bydd cynnig Pwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad wedi'i gynnwys yn y Rheolau Sefydlog? Bydd hynny'n digwydd yn fuan a gallai ddigwydd yn fwy buan byth pe bai'r Gweinidog yn dewis ei symud ymlaen.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o adroddiad Pwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad a'r hyn a ddywed am Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor hwn. Serch hynny, ar hyn o bryd, dywed ein Rheolau Sefydlog y cynhelir etholiad Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 15, a dyna a fwriedir ddydd Mawrth nesaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Trof yn awr at y materion a godwyd gan Ron Davies ac eraill ar 18 Mehefin. Yr wyf wedi derbyn llythyr oddi wrth Brif Weinidog Cymru sy'n nodi bod atebolrwydd am faterion trawsbynciol, gan gynnwys y berthynas rhwng Cymru ac Ewrop a gweddill y byd, rhyddid gwybodaeth, a hawliau dynol, yn disgyn ar y Gweinidog sy'n atebol am y meysydd cyfrifoldeb y cyfyd y cyfryw faterion o danynt. Golyga hynny, er enghrafft, y byddai Jane Davidson, fel Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn atebol i'r Cynulliad am faterion hawliau dynol yn codi o bolisiau addysg. Yn yr un modd, byddai Jane Hutt, fel Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn atebol am fater a effeithiai ar Gymru ac Ewrop pe bai'r mater hwnnw'n gysylltiedig ag iechyd.

Yn sgîl derbyn y llythyr hwnnw, yr wyf yn fodlon y cydymffurfir ag adran 57(4) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a bod y rhaniad rhwng y Pwyllgorau Pwnc dros feysydd cyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgorau hynny yr un fath â'r rhaniad rhwng y Gweinidogion dros y meysydd cyfrifoldeb hynny. Fodd bynnag,

for which they have been allocated accountability. However, I would also expect Ministers who have cross-cutting responsibilities in areas for which they do not have formal accountability, to answer to the Assembly in Plenary and Committee in appropriate circumstances.

3:10 p.m.

Our Standing Orders already recognise that the Minister with responsibility for Assembly business may answer questions on matters related to his other responsibilities. That provides an opportunity for that Minister to be questioned on his cross-cutting responsibilities. Otherwise, Standing Orders do not provide for the questioning of Ministers, other than the First Minister, on cross-cutting issues. However, I have observed that some Ministers already answer questions on cross-cutting issues. This situation needs to be regularised. I am therefore asking the Business Committee to consider whether—and if so, how—Standing Orders might provide for other Ministers with cross-cutting responsibilities to be questioned on those responsibilities. I will place a copy of the First Minister's letter in the Library.

**Ron Davies:** I am grateful to you, Llywydd, for considering this matter and arranging to receive the views of the First Minister. I am also grateful that you will place a copy of his letter in the Library. However, having re-read section 57(4) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, I find no reference whatsoever in that section to cross-cutting issues. I fail to see at the outset, not having had the chance to read through and reflect on your comments, how calling the Deputy First Minister's world-wide responsibilities cross-cutting responsibilities excuses him from appearing before a Committee as every other Minister has to do. Nevertheless, I acknowledge that this matter will go before the Business Committee.

Perhaps you would consider it appropriate, Llywydd, to ask the Business Committee to reflect on this matter, as it does not only relate to the Deputy First Minister. I am sure that my colleague, Edwina Hart, the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, would not want to be drawn

byddwn yn disgwyld hefyd i Weinidogion sydd â chyfrifoldebau trawsbynciol mewn meysydd lle nad oes ganddynt atebolwydd ffurfiol, ateb i'r Cynulliad mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn a Phwyllgorau o dan amgylchiadau priodol.

Mae ein Rheolau Sefydlog eisoes yn cydnabod y gall y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros fusnes y Cynulliad ateb cwestiynau ar faterion cysylltiedig â'i gyfrifoldebau eraill. Mae hynny'n rhoi cyfle i holi'r Gweinidog hwnnw ar ei gyfrifoldebau trawsbynciol. Fel arall, nid yw'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn darparu ar gyfer holi Gweinidogion, ac eithrio'r Prif Weinidog, ar faterion trawsbynciol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi sylwi bod rhai Gweinidogion eisoes yn ateb cwestiynau ar faterion trawsbynciol. Mae angen rheoleiddio'r sefyllfa hon. Gofynnaf felly i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ystyried a allai'r Rheolau Sefydlog ddarparu ar gyfer holi Gweinidogion eraill â chyfrifoldebau trawsbynciol ar y cyfrifoldebau hynny—ac os gallent, sut. Rhoddaf gopi o lythyr y Prif Weinidog yn y Llyfrgell.

**Ron Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi, Lywydd, am ystyried y mater hwn a threfnu i dderbyn barn y Prif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar hefyd eich bod am osod copi o'i lythyr yn y Llyfrgell. Fodd bynnag, wedi ailddarllen adran 57(4) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, ni welaf unrhyw gyfeiriad o gwbl yn yr adran honno at faterion trawsbynciol. Methaf weld ar y dechrau, heb gael y cyfle i ddarllen drwy eich sylwadau a myfyrio arnynt, sut y mae galw cyfrifoldebau byd-eang y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gyfrifoldebau trawsbynciol yn ei esgusodi rhag ymddangos gerbron Pwyllgor fel y mae'n rhaid i bob Gweinidog arall. Serch hynny, cydnabyddaf yr aiff y mater hwn gerbron y Pwyllgor Busnes.

Efallai y barnech ei bod yn briodol, Lywydd, gofyn i'r Pwyllgor Busnes fyfyrir ar y mater hwn, gan nad â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn unig y mae'n ymwneud. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai ar fy nghyd-Aelod, Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, eisiau cael ei thynnu i mewn i

into an unseemly debate about whether she should report to the Local Government and Housing Committee on her finance responsibilities. Again, section 57(4) seems to be quite clear on this matter. Nevertheless, I thank you for your response to the point of order that I raised. Perhaps you would now consider referring all these matters to the Business Committee for its full consideration.

**The Presiding Officer:** In response to that, my request to the Business Committee is a broad one. As I said in my ruling, I would expect Ministers who have cross-cutting responsibilities in areas for which they do not have formal accountability to answer questions in Plenary and Committee in appropriate circumstances. There is provision in Standing Orders for Ministers other than the Ministers who are members of the Committee to attend Committee meetings. That Standing Order has already been used on several occasions and I would envisage it being used again in future. However, I want the Business Committee to consider all aspects of this issue.

**Ron Davies:** I do not want to pursue the matter at this moment, Llywydd, but I put on record the fact that to me, section 57(4) makes clear that the arrangement of responsibilities between Ministers and Committees 'shall be the same'. That is the wording in the Act, and I presume that appropriate legal advice will be given to the Business Committee when it considers the matter.

**The Presiding Officer:** Indeed. I have already received legal advice, which led me to say today that I believed that that section of the Act had been complied with. The advice that was available to me—and any other advice that it may require—will be available to the Business Committee.

**Nick Bourne:** The section is clear. It mentions the fields of accountability being the same as that of the Committees. It would be difficult to conceive that it should be otherwise. The position with the Deputy First Minister is different from that with the cross-cutting responsibilities given to other Ministers, in that the full title of his post, in

ddadl anweddai ar a ddylai hi adrodd i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar ei chyfrifoldebau cyllid. Eto, mae adran 57(4) yn ymddangos yn berffaith glir ar y mater hwn. Er hynny, diolchaf ichi am eich ymateb i'r pwyt o drefn a godais. Efallai yn awr yr ystyried gyfeirio'r holl faterion hyn i'r Pwyllgor Busnes i'w hystyried yn llawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Mewn ymateb i hynny, mae fy nghais i'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn un eang. Fel y dywedais yn fy nyfarniad, byddwn yn disgwyl i Weinidogion sydd â chyfrifoldebau trawsbynciol mewn meysydd lle nad oes ganddynt atebolwydd ffurfiol ateb cwestiynau mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn a Phwyllgorau mewn amgylchiadau priodol. Mae darpariaeth yn y Rheolau Sefydlog i Weinidogion ar wahân i'r Gweinidogion sy'n aelodau o'r Pwyllgor fynychu cyfarfodydd Pwyllgor. Defnyddiwyd y Rheol Sefydlog honno eisoes ar sawl achlysur a gallaf weld y caiff ei defnyddio eto yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ystyried holl agweddau'r mater hwn.

**Ron Davies:** Nid oes arnaf eisiau mynd ar ôl y mater ar hyn o bryd, Lywydd, ond hoffwn gofnodi'r ffaith bod adran 57(4) yn dweud yn glir, i mi, y bydd trefniadaeth cyfrifoldebau rhwng Gweinidogion a Phwyllgorau yr un fath. 'Shall be the same' yw'r geiriad yn y Ddeddf, a chymeraf y rhoddir cyngor cyfreithiol priodol i'r Pwyllgor Busnes pan ystyria'r mater.

**Y Llywydd:** Yn wir. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cael cyngor cyfreithiol, a'm harweiniodd i ddweud heddiw fy mod yn credu y cydymffurfifiwyd â'r adran honno o'r Ddeddf. Bydd y cyngor a oedd ar gael i mi—ac unrhyw gyngor arall a fyn—ar gael i'r Pwyllgor Busnes.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r adran yn glir. Mae'n sôn bod y meysydd atebolwydd yr un fath â rhai'r Pwyllgorau. Byddai'n anodd dychmygu y dylai fod fel arall. Mae'r sefyllfa gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn wahanol i honno gyda'r cyfrifoldebau trawsbynciol a roddir i Weinidogion eraill, gan fod teitl llawn ei swydd, wrth gynnwys 'a Chymru

including ‘and Wales Abroad’ is similar to the title ‘Minister for Health and Social Services’. I cannot see how the legal advice can be otherwise than that the Committee has to mirror the Minister’s responsibilities. Furthermore, that section must be read in conjunction with Standing Orders, in which it is clear that this does not just affect the Deputy First Minister. Under Standing Orders, which can only be changed by a two-thirds majority vote in favour, only two Ministers may have no Committees. Those Committees, according to section 57(4), have to mirror the responsibilities of their Minister. Given that the First Minister does not have a Subject Committee, a Committee must either shadow the Minister for Open Government’s responsibilities or scrutinise the areas for which he is responsible, or the Local Government and Housing Committee must broaden its ambit to include finance. Having examined the Act again as dispassionately as I could, I can reach no other conclusion.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the leader of the Welsh Conservatives for his comments, which are now on record. I will not respond further as I have indicated that I want this matter to be discussed fully by the Business Committee. Nick Bourne is free to pursue these issues in Business Committee, or with me privately at any stage, should he wish to do so.

### Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Addysg Composite Motion: Approval of Education Orders

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn destun dadl.

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25:*

1. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymwysterau Athrawon Addysg Bellach (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mai 2002; ac

2. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Ddeddfau

Dramor’, yn debyg i’r teitl ‘Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol’. Ni welaf sut y gall y cyngor cyfreithiol ddweud unrhyw beth ond bod yn rhaid i’r Pwyllgor adlewyrchu cyfrifoldebau’r Gweinidog. Ymhellach, rhaid darllen yr adran honno ochr yn ochr â’r Rheolau Sefydlog, lle mae’n glir nad dim ond ar y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y mae hyn yn effeithio. O dan y Rheolau Sefydlog, na ellir eu newid ond drwy bleidlais fwyafri o ddau draean o blaidd, dim ond dau Weinidog a all fod heb Bwyllgorau. Rhaid i’r Pwyllgorau hynny, yn ôl adran 57(4), adlewyrchu cyfrifoldebau’r Gweinidog. Gan nad oes gan y Prif Weinidog Bwyllgor Pwnc, naill ai rhaid i Bwyllgor gysgodi cyfrifoldebau’r Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored neu graffu ar y meysydd y mae’n gyfrifol amdanyst, neu rhaid i’r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ledu ei faes llafur i gynnwys cyllid. Wedi archwilio’r Ddeddf eto mor ddiuedd ag y gallwn, ni allaf ddod i unrhyw gasgliad arall.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru am ei sylwadau, sydd bellach ar gofnod. Ni wnaf ymateb ymhellach gan fy mod wedi nodi fy mod am i’r mater hwn gael ei drafod yn llawn gan y Pwyllgor Busnes. Mae Nick Bourne yn rhydd i ddilyn y materion hyn yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, neu gyda mi’n breifat ar unrhyw adeg, os dymuna.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:*

1. approves the Further Education Teachers’ Qualifications (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 28 May 2002; and

2. considers the report of the Legislation

*nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun  
pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau  
Cymwysterau Athrawon Addysg Bellach  
(Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa  
Gyflwyno ar 11 Mehefin 2002;*

*3. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Addysg (Cyrff  
sy'n Cael eu Cydnabod) (Cymru) 2002 a  
osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mai  
2002; ac*

*4. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Ddeddfau  
nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun  
pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn  
Addysg (Cyrff sy'n Cael eu Cydnabod)  
(Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa  
Gyflwyno ar 11 Mehefin 2002;*

*5. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Addysg (Cyrff  
sy'n Cael eu Rhestru) (Cymru) 2002 a  
osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mai  
2002; ac*

*6. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Ddeddfau  
nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun  
pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn  
Addysg (Cyrff sy'n Cael eu Rhestru) (Cymru)  
2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar  
11 Mehefin 2002. (NDM1088)*

*Committee, which has not identified any  
matters for concern in the draft Order, the  
Further Education Teachers' Qualifications  
(Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table  
Office on 11 June 2002;*

*3. approves the Education (Recognised  
Bodies) (Wales) Order 2002 laid in the Table  
Office on 28 May 2002; and*

*4. considers the report of the Legislation  
Committee, which has not identified any  
matters for concern in the draft Order, the  
Education (Recognised Bodies) (Wales)  
Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 11  
June 2002;*

*5. approves the Education (Listed Bodies)  
(Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office  
on 28 May 2002; and*

*6. considers the report of the Legislation  
Committee, which has not identified any  
matters for concern in the draft Order, the  
Education (Listed Bodies) (Wales) Order  
2002, laid in the Table Office on 11 June  
2002. (NDM1088)*

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cynog, Dafis  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison

Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Law, Peter  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Johnathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.15 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.15 p.m.*

### **Cod Ymarfer ar Benodiadau Cyhoeddus Code of Practice on Public Appointments**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*1. approves the revised 'Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies', which was e-mailed to Members on 18 June 2002; and*

*2. endorses the proposed issuing of the code by the First Minister in September 2002. (NDM1090)*

This is a revised version of the Assembly's code, as originally agreed in May 1999, and it takes full account of the Commissioner for Public Appointments's revisions to her code of practice last summer. However, it goes further than that. As part of our commitment

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. yn cymeradwyo'r fersiwn ddiwygiedig o'r 'Cod Ymarfer ar Benodiadau'r Gweinidigion i Gyrrff Cyhoeddus' a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at yr Aelodau ar 18 Mehefin 2002; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bwriad Prif Weinidog Cymru i gyhoeddi'r cod ym mis Medi 2002. (NDM1090)*

Fersiwn diwygiedig yw hwn o god y Cynulliad, fel y'i cytunwyd yn wreiddiol ym Mai 1999, ac mae'n rhoi ystyriaeth lawn i ddiwygiadau'r Comisiynydd Penodiadau Cyhoeddus i'w chod ymarfer hi yr haf diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, aiff ymhellach na

to improving the effectiveness of public bodies in Wales, through openness, transparency and equality of opportunity, we have sought to ensure that the code fully reflects the National Assembly's view.

The commissioner, Dame Rennie Fritchie, has been fully consulted on this revised code, and will address the Committee on Equality of Opportunity tomorrow. I am sure that we will all be interested to hear the outcome of today's Plenary debate.

The revised code goes further than the commissioner's code in the following respects: first, it formalises our approach to cross-party scrutiny through the involvement of Subject Committee members where Ministers take part in the selection process, thus guarding against political bias. We are already applying this approach, and I am grateful for the enthusiasm and commitment of Members who have taken part in the appointments process so far. Secondly, it provides for a much stronger process in recruiting and deploying independent assessors, whose scrutiny role is vital. The process for their appointment to our list of assessors—for example, via open advertisement, criteria and interviews—will be as robust as for other public appointments. We will undertake a major recruitment exercise in the autumn. Following their appointment, the new assessors must undergo induction training, in accordance with the commissioner's code, and an annual training event, which is an Assembly requirement. Thirdly, we propose that candidates for public appointments who are unsuccessful at the sift stage or at interview should be routinely offered feedback. We need to respond positively to interested parties and new talent, and encourage those who may be unsuccessful at their first attempt.

It is all about having a public appointment system that sets the standards in fairness and transparency that the Government wishes to see, and it wants Wales to lead the way on this. The code is not the end of the story. We are also committed to ensuring that appointments are more representative of the communities that they serve.

hynny. Fel rhan o'n hymrwymiad i wella effeithiolwydd cyrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, drwy sicrhau eu bod yn agored, yn dryloyw ac yn cynnig cyfle cyfartal, yr ydym wedi ceisio sicrhau bod y cod yn adlewyrchu'n llawn farn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Ymgynghorwyd yn llawn â'r comisiynydd, y Fonesig Rennie Fritchie, ar y cod diwygiedig hwn, a bydd hi'n annerch y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yfory. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gan bawb ohonom ddiddordeb mewn clywed canlyniad y ddadl hon.

Mae'r cod diwygiedig yn mynd ymhellach na chod y comisiynydd yn y pethau canlynol: yn gyntaf, mae'n ffurfioli ein hymagwedd at graffu trawsbleidiol drwy gyfranogiad aelodau Pwyllgorau Pwnc lle bydd Gweinidogion yn cymryd rhan yn y broses ddewis, gan warchod felly yn erbynffaeth wleidyddol. Yr ydym eisoes yn gweithredu fel hyn, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am frwdfrydedd ac ymroddiad Aelodau a gymerodd ran yn y broses benodi hyd yma. Yn ail, mae'n darparu ar gyfer proses lawer cryfach o reciwtio a defnyddio aseswyr annibynnol, y mae eu rôl graffu yn allweddol. Bydd y broses ar gyfer eu penodi i'n rhestr aseswyr—er enghraifft, drwy hysbysebu agored, meini prawf a chyfweliadau—cyn gryfed ag ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus eraill. Ymgymern ag ymarfer reciwtio mawr yn yr hydref. Wedi eu penodi, rhaid i'r aseswyr newydd gael hyfforddiant cyflwyno, yn unol â chod y comisiynydd, a chymryd rhan mewn digwyddiad hyfforddi blynnyddol, sy'n ofynnol gan y Cynulliad. Yn drydydd, cynigwn y dylid cynnig adborth fel mater o drefn i ymgeiswyr am benodiadau cyhoeddus sy'n aflwyddiannus yn y cam didoli neu mewn cyfweliad. Mae angen inni ymateb yn gadarnhaol i rai sy'n dangos diddordeb a doniau newydd, ac annog y rhai sydd efallai'n aflwyddiannus ar eu cais cyntaf.

Mae a wnelo hyn oll â chael trefn benodiadau cyhoeddus sy'n gosod y safonau o ran tegwch a thryloywder y mae'r Llywodraeth yn dymuno'u gweld, ac mae am i Gymru arwain y ffordd yn hyn o beth. Nid y cod yw diwedd y stori. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo hefyd i sicrhau bod penodiadau'n fwy cynrychioliadol o'r cymunedau a

wasanaethant.

3:20 p.m.

Members of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity have been engaged in considering the 'Mainstreaming Equality in Public Appointments' action plan, which we will present to Plenary in the autumn. I thank Committee members for the attention given to this and for their continued commitment. I hope that all Members will encourage appropriate individuals, particularly individuals from groups that are currently under-represented, to put themselves forward for public appointments, including as independent assessors.

I now turn to the amendments. We will not support Jocelyn Davies's amendment 1. This is a Government motion and the Government seeks endorsement of its actions. The public appointment system seeks and deserves our full endorsement. We will support Jonathan Morgan's amendment 2. This important issue is fully addressed in the 'Mainstreaming Equality in Public Appointments' action plan, which has received cross-party support.

I trust that the Assembly will join me in approving this code of practice and in recommending that it be formally issued in the autumn.

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ym mhwynt 2, dileu 'cymeradwyo' a rhoi 'nodi' yn ei le.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at egwyddorion pwysig, a dywedodd ei fod am inni gymeradwyo'r cod hwn. Yr wyf yn siomedig bod y cod yn uniaith Saesneg. Dyma'r ail dro i hyn ddigwydd o fewn byr amser. Nid yw hynny'n adlewyrchu'r cyfle cyfartal y cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog ato. Mae'n weddus mai nodi yn hytrach na chymeradwyo'r cod y dylem, oherwydd bod peth ffordd i fynd.

Mae'n dda gweld bod y cod yn cydnabod datganoli, ac mae'n galonogol bod cod y

Maeaelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfartal wedi bod wrthi'n ystyried cynllun gweithredu 'Gwneud Cydraddoldeb yn Rhan o'r Brif Ffrwd wrth wneud Penodiadau Cyhoeddus', a gyflwynir gennym i'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn yr hydref. Diolchaf iaelodau'r Pwyllgor am y sylw a roddwyd i hyn ac am eu hymrwymiad parhaus. Gobeithiaf y bydd pob Aelod yn annog unigolion priodol, yn enwedig o grwpiau sydd heb eu cynrychioli'n ddigonol ar hyn o bryd, i gyflwyno'u hunain ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys fel aseswyr annibynnol.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau. Ni chefnogwn welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Cynnig gan y Llywodraeth yw hwn ac mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio cymeradwyaeth i'w gweithredoedd. Mae'r drefn benodiadau cyhoeddus yn ceisio ac yn haeddu ein cymeradwyaeth lawn. Cefnogwn welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Rhoddir sylw llawn i'r mater pwysig hwn yn y cynllun gweithredu 'Gwneud Cydraddoldeb yn Rhan o'r Brif Ffrwd wrth wneud Penodiadau Cyhoeddus', a gafodd gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol.

Hyderaf yr ymuna'r Cynulliad â mi i gymeradwyo'r cod ymarfer hwn ac argymhell ei gyhoeddi'n ffurfiol yn yr hydref.

**Gareth Jones:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. In point 2, replace 'endorses' with 'notes'.

The Minister referred to important principles, and said that he wants us to endorse this code. I am disappointed that the code is only available in English. This is the second time, within a short space of time, that this has happened. That is not in keeping with the equality of opportunity to which the Minister referred. It is appropriate that we note rather than endorse this code, as there is still some way to go.

It is good to see that the code recognises devolution, and it is encouraging that the

comisiynydd wedi ei addasu i ystyried anghenion Cymru. Gobeithiaf fod yr egwyddor hon yn ymestyn yn ôl i swyddfa'r comisiynydd.

Gwnaf rai pwyntiau i egluro pam nad allwn gymeradwyo'r cod. Mae rhai cwestiynau yn codi. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai'r cod yn cynnwys rhestr o'r cyrff cyhoeddus y mae'n berthnasol iddynt. Dylai hefyd gynnwys diffiniad manwl o gorff cyhoeddus. A yw Estyn, er enghraifft, yn gorff cyhoeddus?

Mae'r rhannau o'r cod sy'n cyfeirio at gyfartal yn peri gofid imi gan nad ydynt yn sôn am iaith. Nid oes cyfeiriad at y Gymraeg. Mae'n siŵr bod y Llywodraeth yn cytuno bod trawsdoriad ieithyddol yn ein cyrff cyhoeddus yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at gynrychiolaeth deg. Mae pennod 6 yn rhestru'r ystadegau a gaiff eu casglu o'r broses benodi. Nid oes sôn am gasglu ystadegau am drawsdoriad ieithyddol y cyrff. Mae'n bwysig y cydnabyddir yr iaith yn y cod, gan fod pwynt 5.3 yn datgan na all y comisiynydd ymchwilio i gwynion oni bai eu bod yn torri amodau'r cod ymarfer. Gan nad oes sôn am y Gymraeg, nid ellir ymchwilio cwynion yn ymwneud â hi felly.

Mae pwynt 2.10 yn trafod datgan buddiant. Mae'r seiri rhyddion—i'm cyfeillion ar y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad—yn cael sylw arbennig yma. Ys gwn i pam? Cânt eu cynnwys fel enghraifft. Cytunwn â'r egwyddor y dylid datgan materion a allai arwain at wrthdaro buddiannau, ond ni welaf reswm dros wahaniaethu rhwng y seiri rhyddion a mudiadau eraill, yn enwedig yn sgîl trafodaeth a phenderfyniad y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad.

Hoffwn gael cadarnhad gan y Gweinidog ar bwynt 2.12 ar dryloywder y system benodi. Sonnir am bwysigrwydd cofnodi popeth a chael y dogfennau'n barod ar gyfer archwiliad. A fydd gan y cyhoedd fynediad at y wybodaeth hon, yn ogystal â'r archwiliwyr? Mae pennod 4 yn trafod archwiliadau Swyddfa'r Comisiynydd dros Benodiadau Cyhoeddus. A fydd yr adroddiadau hyn ar gael i'r cyhoedd?

commissioner's code has been amended to take account of Wales's needs. I hope that this principle extends back to the commissioner's office.

I will make a few points to explain why we cannot endorse the code. Some questions arise. It would be useful if the code were to contain a list of the public bodies to which it applies. It should also contain a detailed definition of a public body. Is Estyn a public body, for example?

The sections of the code that refer to equality of opportunity are a cause for concern, as they do not refer to language. There is no reference to the Welsh language. The Government probably agrees that a linguistic cross-section on our public bodies makes a significant contribution to equitable representation. Chapter 6 lists the statistics that will be collated from the appointment process. There is no mention of collating statistics about the linguistic cross-section of these bodies. It is important that the language is acknowledged in the code, as point 5.3 states that the commissioner cannot investigate complaints unless they breach the code of practice. As the Welsh language is not mentioned, complaints relating to it cannot therefore be investigated.

Point 2.10 refers to declarations of interests. The freemasons—for my colleagues on the Committee on Standards of Conduct—are given a special mention here. I wonder why? They are included as an example. We agree with the principle that matters that could lead to a conflict of interest should be declared, but I do not see any reason for singling out the freemasons, particularly in view of the Committee on Standards of Conduct's discussion and decision.

I would like confirmation from the Minister on point 2.12 on the transparency of the appointment system. The importance of documenting everything and having the documents readily available for audit is mentioned. Will the public have access to this information as well as the auditors? Chapter 4 refers to the audits conducted by the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments. Will these reports be available to the public?

Croesawn y ffaith bod y ddogfen yn argymhell na ddylai un person fod yn aelod o fwy nag un corff cyhoeddus—mae hynny'n gwneud synnwyr. Mae'r ffaith bod yr un bobl yn aelodau o fwy nag un corff yn canoli pŵer yn nwyo nifer fach o bobl, a allai arwain at wrthdaro buddiannau.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog hefyd am gadarnhad ar oblygiadau'r ddogfen hon ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth. A yw'n flaenoriaeth o hyd i'r Llywodraeth gwtogi ar nifer y cyrff cyhoeddus sydd yn bodoli yng Nghymru?

I ba raddau mae'r hyfforddiant ar gyfer y penodiadau hyn—ac mae hyn yn ymwneud â gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan—yn ymgorffori egwyddorion sylfaenol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Mae'r cod yn monitro penodiadau unigol—gwelwn hynny—ond pa ddarpariaeth sydd i arfarnu'r darlun ehangach o benodiadau Cymru gyfan, ac i ba raddau y maent yn drawsdoriad cynrychiadol derbyniol?

Gobeithiaf y bydd gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies yn cael ei dderbyn. Yr ydym yn nodi yn hytrach na chymeradwyo'r cod hwn. Cefnogwn hefyd, am resymau amlwg, welliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, ond gofynnwn i'r Gweinidog sicrhau bod pawb sydd yn ymwneud â'r penodiadau hyn yn deall egwyddorion sylfaenol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a bod yr egwyddorion hynny yn cael eu hymgorffori a'u monitro yn y broses benodi.

**David Melding:** I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add point 3:

*3. recognises the need to recruit people from all sections of society to serve on public bodies.*

I begin by acknowledging the progress that has been made since 1997 in the way in which we make public appointments. This has accelerated under the Assembly since 1999. It is appropriate that these matters are discussed in a relatively non-partisan way because we need to appoint the best candidates to positions of public responsibility. That is in the interests of everyone in the Chamber and the people

We welcome the recommendation that no one person should serve on more than one public body—that makes sense. The fact that the same people serve on several bodies centralises power in the hands of a small number of people and could lead to conflicts of interest.

I also ask the Minister for confirmation on the implications of this document for Government policy. Is it still a Government priority to cut back on the number of public bodies in Wales?

To what extent does the training for these appointments—and this relates to amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan—embody the underlying principles of the National Assembly? The code monitors individual appointments—we can see that—but what provision is there for evaluating the wider picture of all-Wales appointments and the extent to which they provide an acceptable representative cross-section?

I hope that amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies will be carried. We note rather than endorse this code. We also, for obvious reasons, support amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, but ask the Minister to ensure that everyone involved in these appointments understands the underlying principles of the National Assembly, and that those principles are embodied and monitored in the appointment process.

**David Melding:** Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu pwnt 3:

*3. yn cydnabod yr angen i recriwtio pobl o bob rhan o gymdeithas i wasanaethu ar gyrrf cyhoeddus.*

Dechreuaf drwy gydnabod y symud ymlaen a wnaed ers 1997 yn y modd y gwnawn benodiadau cyhoeddus. Mae hyn wedi cyflymu dan y Cynulliad ers 1999. Mae'n briodol trafod y materion hyn mewn ffordd gymharol amhleidiol oherwydd mae angen penodi'r ymgeiswyr gorau i swyddi o gyfrifoldeb cyhoeddus. Mae hynny er budd pawb yn y Siambra'r bobl a wasanaethwn yng Nghymru. Mae angen symud ymlaen

whom we serve in Wales. Further progress is needed on some issues, but it is important to say that there has been positive progress to date.

It is important that people who reflect their communities apply for public appointments. We know that the number of black and ethnic minority candidates is far too low, and we need to encourage more candidates from those communities to apply for public appointments. We must implement active measures and ensure that encouragement and training are given, and that, perhaps, an approved list of candidates deemed fit for public appointment is drawn up, even if they have not secured a position. There are many measures that we can take and it is appropriate that we think of a positive strategy when considering such codes of practice.

The Committee on Equality of Opportunity has examined the issue of the number of Welsh speakers appointed to public bodies, particularly health authorities and NHS trusts, and we found disturbing evidence that Welsh speakers do not currently serve in the numbers that we would expect. Thirty-five per cent of health organisations in Wales have no Welsh speakers at all, which is shocking, and a further 20 per cent are below what you would expect on a population rate basis. Therefore, only 45 per cent of public bodies in the health sector are above the basic all-Wales population rate of Welsh speakers. To give a concrete example, Pembrokeshire and Derwen NHS Trust, which serves a predominantly Welsh-speaking population, has no Welsh-speaking board members. That is clearly deficient and it is scandalous that that situation can be allowed to persist.

3:30 p.m.

We must have statistical evidence so that we can monitor such situations. I know that the Minister will be as surprised as I was to learn about those facts and will want to rectify them. However, it is important that we keep an eye on the situation; the only way we can do that is to have effective information. It has taken about two years for us to get this information on the number of Welsh speakers

ymhellach ar rai materion, ond mae'n bwysig dweud y bu symud ymlaen cadarnhaol hyd yn hyn.

Mae'n bwysig cael pobl sy'n adlewyrchu'u cymunedau i ymgeisio am benodiadau cyhoeddus. Gwyddom fod nifer yr ymgeiswyr o leiafrifoedd ethnig a du yn llawer rhy isel, ac mae angen annog mwy o ymgeiswyr o'r cymunedau hynny i ymgeisio am benodiadau cyhoeddus. Rhaid rhoi mesurau gweithredol ar waith a sicrhau y rhoddir anogaeth a hyfforddiant, ac, efallai, y llunnir rhestr gymeradwy o ymgeiswyr y barnwyd eu bod yn addas ar gyfer swyddi cyhoeddus, hyd yn oed os na chawsant swydd. Mae llawer o gamau y gallwn eu cymryd ac mae'n briodol inni feddwl am strategaeth positif wrth ystyried codau ymarfer o'r fath.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfartal wedi edrych ar nifer y Cymry Cymraeg a benodir i gyrff cyhoeddus, yn enwedig awdurdodau iechyd ac ymddiriedolaethau GIG, a chawsom dystiolaeth anhapus nad yw siaradwyr Cymraeg ar hyn o bryd yn gwasanaethu yn y niferoedd a ddisgwyliem. Mae 35 y cant o sefydliadau iechyd yng Nghymru heb siaradwyr Cymraeg o gwbl, sy'n ddifrifol, ac mae 20 y cant arall yn is na'r hyn a ddisgwylid ar sail y boblogaeth. Felly, dim ond 45 y cant o gyrff yn y sector iechyd sydd uwchlaw'r gyfradd sylfaenol o siaradwyr Cymraeg ym mhoblogaeth Cymru gyfan. A rhoi engraifft ymarferol, nid oes gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Benfro a Derwen, sy'n gwasanaethu poblogaeth Gymraeg yn bennaf, ddim aelodau Cymraeg eu hiaith ar ei bwrdd. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn ddiffygol ac mae'n warthus y gellir caniatáu i'r sefyllfa honno barhau.

Rhaid inni gael dystiolaeth ystadegol i'n galluogi i fonitro sefyllfaoedd o'r fath. Gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn synnu gymaint ag a wneuthum i o ganfod y ffeithiau hynny ac y bydd eisiau eu cywiro. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig cadw llygad ar y sefyllfa; yr unig ffordd y gallwn wneud hynny yw cael gwybodaeth effeithiol. Cymerodd ryw ddwy flynedd inni gael y wybodaeth hon am nifer y

serving on public bodies in the health sector. It has been a long struggle, but we eventually got it. The information shows that there is a deficiency.

The level of remuneration needs to be mentioned when we talk about the code. Many of the posts that we seek to encourage people to apply for are not well remunerated, although they may require a commitment of three or four days a week from people who become, for example, chairs of large NHS hospitals. If the remuneration offered is between £18,000 and £22,000 for what is really a full-time job—with a time commitment of four days, which is often more in reality—we will have a restricted field of candidates. We already have evidence that some of the shortlists for these important public appointments are not as strong as we would like. I urge the Minister to consider this. It has been considered in the past but I do not think that the nettle has yet been grasped. It needs to be, because we will face difficulties if we do not sort this out.

I note that many ad hoc bodies are being created under the Assembly's ambit. They are usually called task and finish groups but they also masquerade under a series of alternative names. We should remember that these bodies can give advice to the Executive but they are not subject to the usual procedures for public appointments because they are not, technically, public bodies. We need to be concerned if these ad hoc bodies give direct advice to the Executive, and we need to consider whom they represent and on what basis they give advice.

Finally, it should be the norm that all public agencies and organisations hold their board meetings in public. That needs to be included in all the subordinate legislation that determines how they can act and in any guidance given to those organisations. There is no such guarantee regarding the new local health boards and that is disappointing—their meetings should be held in public.

**Peter Law:** On that note, I am pleased to speak in this debate because it was my colleague, Ron Davies, who, when he was Secretary of State for Wales, issued the

siaradwyr Cymraeg sy'n gwasanaethu ar gyrrf cyhoeddus yn y sector iechyd. Bu'n ymdrech hir, ond fe'i cawsom yn y diwedd. Mae'r wybodaeth yn dangos bod diffyg.

Mae angen ystyried lefel y tâl pan siaradwn am y cod. Ni thelir yn dda am lawer o'r swyddi yr ydym yn ceisio annog pobl i ymgeisio amdanyst, er y gallant alw am ymrwymiad tridiau neu bedwar diwrnod yr wythnos gan bobl a aiff, er enghraifft, yn gadeiryddion ysbytai GIG mawr. Os mai rhwng £18,000 a £22,000 yw'r tâl a gynigir am swydd sydd mewn gwirionedd yn un amser llawn—gydag ymrwymiad amser o bedwar diwrnod, sydd yn aml yn fwy mewn gwirionedd—maes cyfyngedig o ymgeiswyr a gawn ni. Eisoes mae gennym dystiolaeth nad yw rhai o'r rhestri byrion ar gyfer y penodiadau cyhoeddus pwysig hyn cyn gryfed ag yr hoffem. Anogaf y Gweinidog i ystyried hyn. Fe'i hystyriwyd yn y gorffennol ond nid wyf yn meddwl bod y ddanhadlen wedi'i gwasgu eto. Mae angen gwneud, oherwydd byddwn yn wynebu trafferthion os na roddwn drefn ar hyn.

Sylwaf fod llawer o gyrrf ad hoc yn cael eu creu dan gwmpas y Cynulliad. Fel arfer fe'u gelwir yn grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen ond maent hefyd yn ymrithio dan gyfres o enwau eraill. Dylem gofio y gall y cyrff hyn rhoi cyngor i'r Weithrediaeth ond nad ydynt yn gaeth wrth y gweithdrefnau arferol ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus am nad ydynt, yn dechnegol, yn gyrrf cyhoeddus. Mae angen inni bryderu os rhydd y cyrff ad hoc hyn gyngor uniongyrchol i'r Weithrediaeth, ac mae angen inni ystyried pwy maent yn ei gynrychioli ac ar ba sail y rhoddant gyngor.

Yn olaf, dylai fod yn arferol i bob asiantaeth a chorff cyhoeddus gynnal eu cyfarfodydd bwrdd yn gyhoeddus. Mae angen cynnwys hynny ym mhob is-ddeddfwriaeth sy'n pennu sut y gallant weithredu ac mewn unrhyw ganllawiau a roddir i'r cyrff hynny. Nid oes gwarant o'r fath ar y byrddau iechyd lleol newydd ac mae hynny'n destun siom—dylai eu cyfarfodydd fod yn gyhoeddus.

**Peter Law:** Ar y nodyn hwnnw, yr wyf yn falch o siarad yn y ddadl hon oherwydd fy nghyd-Aelod Ron Davies a gyhoeddodd, pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, y

notice that all health trust meetings should be open to the public. That came from the Labour Government elected in 1997. I agree with what David Melding said. That needs to continue. We need openness and accountability in all public bodies. If we are supposed to honour those values in the Assembly, we should ask nothing less of the bodies that answer to the National Assembly.

I welcome the code of practice, as I always do, because anything that opens such bodies to the public must be commended. However, I feel that there is also some window dressing, because there is much disillusionment and scepticism among the public, particularly among those who might aspire to serve on a public body and who might have tried and found that they got nowhere. I regret that, because there is still a deficit in the representation of women, black and ethnic minorities, disabled people and Welsh speakers. We must act—not just pay lip service to the issue. I am not convinced about the system of assessors, but I welcome the fact that they are now appointed by the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments, because it is an independent body. However, we must also be able to scrutinise the assessors. They may award a certificate to say that they think that the procedure was appropriate, but we must also realise that we must face up to the traditional problem of the dead hand of the civil service in the background, next to the Minister, and the damn-with-faint-praise approach that you sometimes get from some under-secretary who might not think that a certain person would fit in. I could be talking about myself—but I am sure that I am being oversensitive.

We need to appoint people who are prepared to stand up and speak out for communities and say what they feel is right. We want a radical approach and people who will give of their time and commit themselves to their communities. I do not see the need for a lower and higher tier. That suggests that a person is less committed if they are in the lower tier. I cannot understand that: it is ridiculous. Whether or not a person is paid £20,000 or more a year, he or she must reach a certain standard when working for the

dylai pob cyfarfod ymddiriedolaeth iechyd fod yn agored i'r cyhoedd. Daeth hynny oddi wrth y Llywodraeth Lafur a etholwyd yn 1997. Cytunaf a'r hyn a ddywedodd David Melding. Mae angen i hynny barhau. Mae angen i'n cyrff cyhoeddus i gyd fod yn agored ac yn atebol. Os ydym i fod i anrhyydeddu'r gwerthoedd hynny yn y Cynulliad, ni ddylem ofyn dim llai gan y cyrff sy'n atebol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Croesawaf y cod ymarfer, fel bob amser, oherwydd rhaid cymeradwyo unrhyw beth sy'n agor cyrff o'r fath i'r cyhoedd. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf fod yno ychydig o addurno ffenestr, oherwydd mae cryn ddadrithiad ac amheuaeth ymysg y cyhoedd, yn enwedig y rheini a allai ddeisyfu gwasanaethu ar gorff cyhoeddus ac sydd efallai wedi ceisio a heb gyrraedd unman. Mae hynny'n peri gofid imi, oherwydd mae diffyg yn parhau yng nghynrychiolaeth menywod, lleiafrifoedd du ac ethnig, pobl anabl a siaradwyr Cymraeg. Rhaid inni weithredu—nid siarad yn unig am y mater. Nid wyf wedi fy narbwyllo yng hylch y system aseswyr, ond croesawaf yffaith y caint eu penodi erbyn hyn gan Swyddfa'r Comisiynydd Penodiadau Cyhoeddus, oherwydd mae'n gorff annibynnol. Serch hynny, mae angen i ni allu craffu ar yr aseswyr. Efallai y cylwynant dystysgrif i ddweud eu bod o'r farn fod y drefn yn briodol, ond rhaid i ninnau sylweddoli bod yn rhaid inni wynebu problem draddodiadol llaw farw'r gwasanaeth sifil yn y cefndir, nesaf at y Gweinidog, a'r dull glasganmoliaethus a geir weithiau gan ryw is-ysgrifennydd sy'n meddwl efallai na fyddai person arbennig yn ffittio i mewn. Gallwn fod yn sôn amdanaf fi fy hun—ond mae'n siŵr fy mod yn bod yn orsensitif.

Mae angen penodi pobl sy'n barod i sefyll a siarad dros gymunedau a dweud yr hyn y maent yn ei gredu sy'n iawn. Mae eisiau ymagwedd radicalaidd a phobl a wnaiff roi o'u hamser ac ymrwymo i'w cymunedau. Ni welaf fod angen haen is ac uwch. Mae hynny'n awgrymu fod gan rywun lai o ymrwymiad os yw yn yr haen is. Ni allaf ddeall hynny: mae'n hurt. P'rwn ai bod rhywun ar dâl o £20,000 neu fwy y flwyddyn ai peidio, rhaid iddo neu iddi gyrraedd safon benodol wrth weithio i'r sector cyhoeddus a

public sector and serving the community. The commitment will be the same regardless of the salary. It is insulting to regard those who are not paid but work voluntarily in public life as being in the lower tier, which, I understand, is suggested in this document. That does not make sense.

People should be drawn from all walks of life. We have not achieved that to date. Why are we not holding recruitment and information meetings in different areas and telling people to come along and learn about the experience of holding a public appointment? We have enough resources and an army of people working at the Assembly—some of us do not understand why we do not receive answers from Ministers given that we have an army of staff. We should use those staff to go out into the communities to encourage people to play a part in public life. When we last debated this issue, we discussed the idea of sending e-mails and using the local press and the red-tops to attract people. It sounded good, but how much has been achieved? How much have we done since the last debate? I think that this is the third debate on public appointments since the Assembly was established. Much more needs to be done.

Assembly Members also need to receive more information. Sadly, I am not given notice of appointments made unless I read it in the press. That is not good enough, as I have said before. Full lists of appointees for all Assembly positions should be sent to all Members within 48 hours of those appointments being made. I think that that is courteous and shows accountability. I have previously asked for this to be set up, but it has not happened yet. You only learn of appointments if a newspaper picks up on the story or someone tells you in the street. That is not good enough because we have a role to play on behalf of communities throughout Wales. I represent the people of Blaenau Gwent and I want to know who has been appointed to which posts.

An alphabetical list of public sector appointees must also be kept on computer. I am certain that that exists somewhere in the Government's records. However, it should be

gwasanaethu'r gymuned. Bydd yr ymrwymiad yr un fath beth bynnag fo'r tâl. Sarhad i rai sy'n gweithio'n wirfoddol mewn bywyd cyhoeddus heb dâl yw eu gosod yn yr haen is, sef yr hyn a awgrymir yn y ddogfen hon, yn ôl a ddeallaf. Nid yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr.

Dylid tynnu pobl o bob cefndir mewn bywyd. Nid ydym wedi cyflawni hynny eto. Pam nad ydym yn cynnal cyfarfodydd reciwtio a gwybodaeth mewn gwahanol ardaloedd ac yn dweud wrth bobl am ddod acw i gael gwybod am y profiad o ddal swydd gyhoeddus? Mae gennym ddigon o adnoddau a byddin o bobl yn gweithio yn y Cynulliad—nid yw rhai ohonom yn deall pam na dderbyniwn atebion oddi wrth Weinidogion gan fod byddin o staff gennym. Dylem ddefnyddio'r staff hynny i fynd allan i'r cymunedau i annog pobl i chwarae rhan mewn bywyd cyhoeddus. Pan drafodasom y mater hwn ddiwethaf, trafodasom y syniad o anfon e-byst a defnyddio'r wasg leol a'r papurau top coch i ddenu pobl. Yr oedd yn swnio'n dda, ond faint a gyflawnwyd? Beth yr ydym wedi'i wneud ers y ddadl ddiwethaf? Credaf mai dyma'r drydedd ddadl ar benodiadau cyhoeddus ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Mae angen gwneud llawer mwy.

Mae angen i Aelodau'r Cynulliad dderbyn mwy o wybodaeth hefyd. Yn anffodus, ni chaf fi wybod am benodiadau a wnaed oni ddarllenaf amdanynt yn y wasg. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da, fel y dywedais o'r blaen. Dylid anfon rhestr i llawn o benodiadau i bob swydd yn y Cynulliad at bob Aelod o fewn 48 awr i'r penodi. Credaf fod hynny'n gwrtais ac yn dangos atebolrwydd. Yr wyf wedi gofyn o'r blaen am sefydlu'r drefn hon, ond nid yw wedi digwydd eto. Dim ond os bydd papur newydd yn codi'r stori, neu os dywed rhywun wrthych yn y stryd, y cewch wybod am benodiadau. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da oherwydd mae gennym rôl i'w chwarae ar ran cymunedau ledled Cymru. Yr wyf fi'n cynrychioli pobl Blaenau Gwent ac mae arnaf eisiau gwybod pwysydd wedi'u penodi i ba swyddi.

Rhaid cadw rhestr yn nhrefn yr wyddor ar gyfrifiadur o benodiadau'r sector cyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn sicr fod hynny'n bodoli yn rhywle yng nghofnodion y Llywodraeth. Fodd

made public so that people can see how many bodies a person is a member of. That is reasonable. Sifting and shortlisting applications should be done by independent people, because civil servants have too much influence. In the same way, former civil servants should not be given positions on public bodies as a retirement package. Those who are good enough to apply for a position and who spend their time attending interviews should at least be sent a letter with the result of the interview, even if they are not successful. That is common courtesy.

**Phil Williams:** The transformation in how we appoint people to serve on public bodies is a positive feature of the National Assembly that is often underestimated. Long ago, when the Presiding Officer was president of Plaid Cymru, I chaired a working group to examine what functions an elected body in Wales might carry out. A theme of concern at that time was the growth in the number and power of unelected quangos. If I were to add a charge to the long list of indictments levelled at the Conservative Party during its 18 years in Government, it would be about the way in which it appointed members of quangos—that did as much harm to Wales as its misguided policies. Our working group collected lists of people chosen by Secretaries of State to sit on the boards and councils—

**David Melding:** I made somewhat elliptical references to this issue, but is it not the case that the Conservative Party just kept an old system and did not reform it? I agree that we should be held to account for that, but the last Conservative Government did not invent the system, it was just the way that matters were usually done.

3:40 p.m.

**Phil Williams:** At that time, the growth in the number of quangos, as well as their influence and power, was important. When we collected a list of quango members, it came as a dreadful shock, especially when we saw the names of people we knew. Of course, there were exceptions, and I should include Glyn in that.

bynag, dylai fod yn gyhoeddus fel y gall pobl weld sawl corff y mae rhywun yn aelod arnynt. Mae hynny'n rhesymol. Dylai pobl annibynnol fod yn gyfrifol am ddidoli ceisiadau a llunio rhestri byrion, oherwydd mae gan weision sifil ormod o ddylanwad. Yn yr un modd, ni ddylid rhoi lle ar gorff cyhoeddus i hen weision sifil fel pecyn ymddeol. Dylai'r rheini sy'n ddigon da i wneud cais am benodiad ac sy'n treulio'u hamser yn mynchyu cyfweliadau o leiaf dderbyn llythyr gyda chanlyniad y cyfweliad, hyd yn oed os na fuont yn llwyddiannus. Cwrteisi cyffredin yw hynny.

**Phil Williams:** Mae trawsnewidiad y modd y penodwn bobl i wasanaethu ar gyrff cyhoeddus yn nodwedd bositif o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gaiff ei danbrisio yn aml. Erstalwm, pan oedd y Llywydd yn llywydd Plaid Cymru, cadeiriais weithgor i archwilio pa swyddogaethau y gallai corff etholedig yng Nghymru eu cyflawni. Un achos pryder ar y pryd oedd y twf yn nifer a grym y cwangos anetholedig. Pe bawn yn ychwanegu cyhuddiad at y rhestr hir o gyhuddiadau a wnaed yn erbyn y Blaid Geidwadol yn ystod ei 18 mlynedd mewn Llywodraeth, byddai'n ymwneud â'r modd y penododd aelodau cwangos—gwnaeth hynny gymaint o niwed i Gymru â'i pholisiau ffôl. Casglodd ein gweithgor restri o bobl a ddewiswyd gan Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol i eistedd ar fyrddau a chynghorau—

**David Melding:** Cyfeiriais yn eliptig braidd at y mater hwn, ond onid yw'n wir mai dim ond cadw hen system, heb ei diwygio, a wnaeth y Blaid Geidwadol? Cytunaf y dylid ein dal i gyfrif am hynny, ond nid y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf a ddyfeisiodd y system, ond dyna'n symbl y ffordd yr arferid gwneud pethau.

**Phil Williams:** Ar y pryd, yr oedd y twf yn nifer y cwangos, yn ogystal â'u dylanwad a'u grym, yn bwysig. Pan gasglasom restr o aelodau cwangos, cawsom sioc ofnadwy, yn enwedig pan welsom enwau pobl yr oeddym yn eu hadnabod. Wrth gwrs, yr oedd eithriadau, a dylwn gynnwys Glyn yn hynny.

**Ron Davies:** Phil, will you reflect on the fact that no cloud is so black as to not have a silver lining? The quangos were stuffed, by and large, with Tory placemen by John Redwood, who was the greatest recruiting sergeant we ever had in the campaign for the National Assembly for Wales.

**Phil Williams:** I agree. I sometimes think that we should have statues made of Mrs Thatcher and John Redwood to honour them as architects of devolution. [Laughter.] That was mainly what changed my mind from not voting 'yes' in 1979 to voting 'yes' with enthusiasm in 1997.

A rewarding part of my work in the Assembly has been to serve, as a representative of the Economic Development Committee, on the advisory panel for appointments to the Wales Tourist Board, the Welsh Development Agency and the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board. There are always a large number of highly-qualified candidates, and seven or more people are involved in sifting the applications and interviewing shortlisted candidates. That is a huge improvement on having one Secretary of State make the appointment at a Tory garden fête.

The cup is half full, yet half empty. One question that our working group asked long ago was, 'What is the best balance between people elected to positions of influence and answerable at an election, and those appointed?' Over the years, the number of elected positions had steadily decreased, especially with the decline in numbers of people on local authorities. At the same time, the number of Government-appointed positions has steadily increased. The establishment of the Assembly and the role of elected Members in making appointments has shifted the balance back a little toward democracy, but the underlying drift is still there. Does the Minister have a record of how many public appointments the Assembly makes, compared with the number made by the last Secretary of State for Wales before the Assembly was established?

How many appointments are made using the full and progressive procedure of involving a

**Ron Davies:** Phil, a wnewch chi fyfyrion ar y ffaith nad oes yr un cwmwl mor ddu fel nad oes ganddo ymwl arian. Llenwyd y cwangos, i raddau helaeth, â swyddwyr Toriaidd gan John Redwood, sef y sarifiant reciwtio gorau a gawsom erioed yn yr ymgrych dros Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

**Phil Williams:** Yr wyf yn cytuno. Weithiau byddaf yn meddwl y dylem gomisiynu cerfluniau o Mrs Thatcher a John Redwood i'w hanrhayeddu fel penseiri datganoli. [Chwerthin.] Dyna'n bennaf beth newidiodd fy meddwl i o beidio â phleidleisio 'ie' yn 1979 i bleidleisio 'ie' gyda brwd frydedd yn 1997.

Rhan bleserus o'm gwaith yn y Cynulliad fu gwasanaethu, fel cynrychiolydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, ar y panel cyngori ar benodiadau i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Ymgynghorol Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru. Ceir nifer fawr o ymgeiswyr â chymwysterau da bob tro, a bydd saith neu ragor wrthi'n didoli'r ceisiadau ac yn cyfweld yr ymgeiswyr a roddwyd ar y rhestr fer. Mae hynny'n welliant enfawr dros gael un Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gwneud y penodiad mewn garddwest Doriaidd.

Mae'r cwpan yn hanner llawn, ond eto'n hanner gwag. Un cwestiwn a ofynnodd ein gweithgor amser maith yn ôl oedd, 'Beth yw'r cydbwysedd gorau rhwng pobl a etholir i safleoedd o ddylanwad ac sy'n atebol mewn etholiad, a rhai a benodir?' Dros y blynnyddoedd, mae nifer y safleoedd etholedig wedi lleihau'n raddol, yn enwedig gyda'r lleihad yn niferoedd pobl ar awdurdodau lleol. Ar yr un pryd, mae nifer y safleoedd penodedig gan y Llywodraeth wedi cynyddu'n raddol. Mae sefydlu'r Cynulliad a'r rôl Aelodau etholedig wrth wneud penodiadau wedi troi'r fantol yn ôl fymryn tuag at ddemocratiaeth, ond mae'r duedd waelodol yn dal yno. A oes gan y Gweinidog gofnod o sawl penodiad cyhoeddus a wna'r Cynulliad, o gymharu â'r nifer a wnaed gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol diwethaf Cymru cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad?

Sawl penodiad a wneir gan ddefnyddio'r drefn lawn a blaengar o sefydlu panel gydag

panel with independent assessors and cross-party representation from the Assembly? There seem to be some odd discrepancies: the Economic Development Committee is represented on panels appointing all members of the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board, but other Committees only appear to be represented when a chair is appointed. If that is based solely on the level of remuneration—and my impression is that it might be—that may not be appropriate. Some bodies that do not give remuneration to appointees still have tremendous national influence and importance.

Which procedure is followed in the appointment of the members of our 80 taskforces, or task and finish groups? They also have an important role and should be subject to the same standards as those set for other public appointments. How is the Committee that advises the Minister on information technology appointed? That has always puzzled and concerned me.

It is real progress that definite steps are being taken to encourage various minorities to apply for public positions. I know that a record is kept on application forms, but is there any overall monitoring of the number of applicants from groups such as disabled persons and ethnic minorities, and how do the number of such applicants compare with the number appointed? I welcome all the improvements, but there is a long way to go.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this motion and the revised code of practice for public appointments. It is important that the highest standards are maintained in public life, and public appointments must be seen to be made on merit.

The Assembly's code of practice is based on the code of the Commissioner for Public Appointments, a role created on the recommendation of the Nolan committee, instituted by John Major in 1994. The Nolan committee commented that there is much public concern about appointments to quangos, and the widespread belief is that such appointments are not always made on merit.

aseswyr annibynnol a chynrychiolaeth trawsbleidiol o'r Cynulliad? Mae'n ymddangos bod ambell anghysonder rhyfedd: cynrychiolir y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar baneli i benodi holl aelodau Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, ond mae'n ymddangos na chynrychiolir y Pwyllgorau eraill ond pan benodir cadeirydd. Os yw hynny'n seiliedig ar lefel y tâl yn unig—a'r argraff a gaf fi yw effallai ei fod—hwyrach nad yw hynny'n briodol. Mae rhai cyrff nad ydynt yn rhoi tâl i bobl a benodir iddynt yn dal i fod â dylanwad a phwysigrwydd cenedlaethol aruthrol.

Pa drefn a ddilynir wrth benodi aelodau ein 80 o dasgluoedd, neu grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen? Mae ganddynt hwythau rôl bwysig a dylent fod yn gaeth i'r un safonau a'r rheini a bennwyd ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus eraill. Sut y penodir y Pwyllgor sy'n cynghori'r Gweinidog ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth? Mae hynny wastad wedi peri penbleth a phryder imi.

Gwir gynnydd yw bod camau pendant yn cael eu cymryd i annog amryfal leiafrifoedd i ymgeisio am swyddi cyhoeddus. Gwn y cedwir cofnod ar ffurflenai cais, ond a oes unrhyw fonitro cyffredinol o nifer yr ymgeiswyr o grwpiau fel pobl anabl a lleiafrifoedd ethnig, a sut y mae'r nifer o ymgeiswyr o'r fath yn cymharu â'r nifer a benodir? Croesawaf y gwelliannau i gyd, ond mae ffordd bell i fynd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r cynnig hwn a'r cod ymarfer diwygiedig ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus. Mae'n bwysig cadw'r safonau uchaf mewn bywyd cyhoeddus, a rhaid i benodiadau cyhoeddus gael eu gwneud ar deilyngdod, a rhaid i hynny fod yn weladwy.

Mae cod ymarfer y Cynulliad yn seiliedig ar god y Comisiynydd Penodiadau Cyhoeddus, rôl a grëwyd ar argymhelliaid pwylgor Nolan, a sefydlwyd gan John Major yn 1994. Nododd pwylgor Nolan fod llawer o bryder cyhoeddus ynghylch penodiadau i gwangos, ac mai'r gred gyffredinol yw na wneir y penodiadau hynny bob amser ar sail teilyngdod.

It is also important to ensure that all regions of Wales are represented, including north Wales. I noted recently that one of the flood management committees was without north Wales representation. I urge the Minister to put that right.

The seven principles underlying the Assembly's code of practice should ensure that public appointments are made fairly and equitably. Appointments should be made on merit in an open and accountable fashion. It is vital that public appointments are open to all, no matter what their class, creed or colour. Everyone should have an equal opportunity. Public appointments to quangos were not made on merit in the past, and many accusations of sleaze were made against the Government of the time. There was a perception that the same old people were always appointed—it is best described as 'jobs for the boys'. The public perception has been that who you know is more important than whether you are the best person for the job.

Wales is a diverse country, blessed with a wealth of talent and ability, which we have not tapped into effectively in the past. I disagree with the tiers and the differing remuneration mentioned by others. We must not be complacent and we must continue to improve. Holding public office and representing our communities is a great honour and privilege, and repaying our communities must be encouraged. The best way to do that is to maintain the highest possible standards of probity, which this code of practice should go some way to doing.

**Alun Cairns:** I welcome the motion and the code of practice. More importantly, I will reflect on the principles on which the code of practice has been drafted. In his opening remarks, the Minister talked about openness, transparency and accountability—the three most important principles in this debate. I will also reflect on some of Phil Williams's comments and Ron Davies's intervention about the 18 years of Conservative Government. I accept David Melding's point that we continued with a system that already existed. If the Conservative Government of that period should accept the criticisms made

Mae'n bwysig sicrhau hefyd fod cynrychiolaeth i holl ranbarthau Cymru, gan gynnwys y Gogledd. Sylwais yn ddiweddar fod un o'r pwylgorau rheoli llifogydd heb gynrychiolaeth o'r Gogledd. Anogaf y Gweinidog i gywiros hynny.

Dylai'r saith egwyddor waelodol i god ymarfer y Cynulliad sicrhau y gwneir penodiadau cyhoeddus yn deg a chyflawn. Dylid penodi ar sail teilyngdod mewn modd agored ac atebol. Mae'n hollbwysig fod penodiadau cyhoeddus yn agored i bawb, ni waeth beth fo'u dosbarth, eu cred na'u lliw. Dylai pawb gael cyfle cyfartal. Ni wneid penodiadau cyhoeddus i gwangos ar sail teilyngdod yn y gorffennol, a gwnaethpwyd sawl cyhuddiad o lygred yn erbyn Llywodraeth y dydd. Yr oedd canfyddiad mai'r un hen bobl a gâi eu penodi o hyd—y ffordd orau i'w ddisgrifio yw 'swyddi i'r hogiau'. Y canfyddiad cyhoeddus oedd fod pwy yr ydych yn ei adnabod yn bwysicach na ph'un ai chi yw'r person gorau ar gyfer y swydd.

Mae Cymru'n wlad sy'n llawn amrywiaeth, wedi'i bendithio â chyfoeth o ddawn a gallu, nad ydym wedi ei ddefnyddio'n effeithiol yn y gorffennol. Anghytunaf â'r haenau ac â'r gwahaniaethau tâl a grybwyllywd gan eraill. Rhaid inni beidio â llaesu dwylo a rhaid inni ddal i wella. Braint ac anrhydedd o'r mwyaf yw dal swydd gyhoeddus a chynrychioli ein cymunedau, a rhaid annog talu'r pwyth i'n cymunedau. Y ffordd orau o wneud hynny yw drwy gynnal y safonau gonestrwydd uchaf posibl, rhywbeth y dylai'r cod ymarfer hwn fynd ffordd tuag at ei wneud.

**Alun Cairns:** Croesawaf y cynnig a'r cod ymarfer. Yn bwysicach, myfyriaf ar yr egwyddorion y drafftowyd y cod ymarfer arnynt. Yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, siaradodd y Gweinidog am fod yn agored, yn dryloyw ac yn atebol—tair egwyddor bwysicaf y ddadl hon. Myfyriaf hefyd ar rai o sylwadau Phil Williams ac ymyriad Ron Davies ynglŷn â'r 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Geidwadol. Derbyniad bwynt David Melding ein bod wedi parhau â system a oedd yn bodoli eisoes. Os dylai'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol o'r cyfnod hwnnw dderbyn y feirniadaeth a gafodd ar fater penodiadau cyhoeddus a

of it in terms of public appointments in that it continued the procedure established by previous Governments, then it must also take credit for establishing the Nolan committee and the Nolan principles, which led to today's code of practice in relation to public appointments. In acknowledging the points made by Phil Williams and Ron Davies, I hope that they accept John Major's contribution to developing that and correcting that wrong.

**David Davies:** Do you agree that we should also take responsibility for appointing many Labour members, such as Peter Law, to quangos across Wales?

**Alun Cairns:** Peter Law has earned himself the name of 'quango man'; some of our policies were perhaps not implemented to full effect because there were so many Labour members on those bodies who are trying to scupper our chances of re-election. However, that is in the past and for another debate.

The Welsh Assembly Government claims to be one of the most open in western Europe. Openness, transparency and accountability have already been mentioned. The Government claims to demonstrate that by publishing Cabinet minutes and by the gender balance in the Cabinet. However, Phil Williams highlighted task and finish groups. When I first tabled a question on this issue, 77 task and finish groups were in place. Weeks later, there are more than 80 task and finish groups. I remember asking Andrew Davies in one of his first Economic Development Committee meetings as Minister for Economic Development, whether the task and finish group that concluded in the Assembly investment grants had adhered to the Nolan principles. Andrew Davies said that he assumed so. His official saved him by saying that task and finish groups did not need to adhere to those principles because their members are appointed. I tabled questions to discover how conflicts of interest were managed. The answer, with regard to all task and finish groups, was that it was not known whether conflicts of interest were taken into consideration. The average gender balance on those 80 or so task and finish groups is two

hithau wedi parhau â'r drefn a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraethau blaenorol, yna rhaid iddi hefyd gymryd clod am sefydlu pwyllgor Nolan ac egwyddorion Nolan, a arweiniodd at god ymarfer heddiw ar benodiadau cyhoeddus. Wrth gydnabod y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan Phil Williams a Ron Davies, gobeithiaf y derbyniant hwythau gyfraniad John Major at ddatblygu hynny a chywiro'r camwri hwnnw.

**David Davies:** A gytunwch y dylem hefyd gymryd cyfrifoldeb am benodi llawer o aelodau Llafur, fel Peter Law, i gwangos ar draws Cymru?

**Alun Cairns:** Mae Peter Law wedi ennill yr enw 'quango man' iddo'i hun; efallai na chafodd rhai o'n polisiau ni eu gweithredu i'w llawn effaith oherwydd fod cymaint o aelodau Llafur ar y cyrff hynny a oedd yn ceisio difetha ein siawns o gael ein hailethol. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny yn y gorffennol ac yn destun dadl arall.

Honna Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei bod ymysg y llywodraethau mwyaf agored yng ngorllewin Ewrop. Soniwyd eisoes am fod yn agored, yn dryloyw ac yn atebol. Hawlia'r Llywodraeth ei bod yn dangos hynny drwy gyhoeddi cofnodion y Cabinet a thrwy'r cydbwysedd rhwng y ddau ryw yn y Cabinet. Fodd bynnag, tynnodd Phil Williams ein sylw at grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen. Pan gyflwynais gwestiwn ar y mater hwn gyntaf, yr oedd 77 o grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen wedi'u sefydlu. Wythnosau'n ddiweddarach, mae mwy nag 80 o grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen. Cofiaf ofyn i Andrew Davies yn un o'i gyfarfodydd cyntaf o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd fel Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, a oedd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen a gytunodd ar grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad wedi glynu at egwyddorion Nolan. Dywedodd Andrew Davies ei fod yn tybio ei fod. Achubwyd ef gan ei swyddog a ddywedodd nad oedd angen i grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen llyn u at yr egwyddorion hynny oherwydd fod eu haelodau yn benodedig. Cyflwynais gwestiynau i ddarganfod sut yr ymdrinnid â gwrthdrawiadau buddiannau. Yr ateb, ar gyfer pob grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, oedd nad oedd yn hysbys a gymerid gwrthdrawiadau

men to one woman. Some groups have 15 members, 14 of whom are men, to cite the worst examples.

buddiannau i ystyriaeth. Ar gyfartaledd, ceir cydbwysedd o ddau ddyn i un ferch ar y tua 80 o grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen. Mae gan rai grwpiau 15 aelod a 14 ohonynt yn ddynion, i ddyfynnu'r enghreifftiau gwaethaf.

3:50 p.m.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome your interest in this issue. Can we now look forward to your party showing a new-found enthusiasm for increasing the number of female candidates in next year's Assembly elections?

**Alun Cairns:** Christine misses the important point. This Government claims the credit for gender balance among its membership and in the Cabinet. However, when it comes to appointing to key advisory bodies, it rides roughshod over all those rules and flies in the face of its principles of openness, transparency and accountability. You cannot claim credit for ensuring gender balance unless you are prepared to accept the responsibility for the make-up of the task and finish groups. I suspect that the Minister will say that responsibility for the accountability and transparency of task and finish groups lies with Committees. However, half the time, Committees do not know whether a task and finish group is in place.

The Committees' forward work programmes are in place. Will the Minister make a commitment that all Ministers will supply their Subject Committees with progress reports on task and finish groups, from their establishment to their conclusion, so that the democratically elected Subject Committees can have a democratic influence over them? In the example from the Economic Development Committee that I highlighted, the report came to the Committee after the policy had been implemented. What sort of acceptance was that of the Subject Committees' policy-making role?

**Lorraine Barrett:** As Peter Law said, we have discussed this issue on several occasions. The Committee on Equality of Opportunity seems to have been discussing this issue since the Assembly was established. I welcome the revised code, and

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf eich diddordeb yn y mater hwn. A gawn ni edrych ymlaen yn awr at frwdfrydedd newydd yn eich plaid tuag at gynyddu nifer yr ymgeiswyr benywaidd yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad y flwyddyn nesaf?

**Alun Cairns:** Mae Christine yn methu'r pwyt pwysig. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn hawlio'r clod am gydbwysedd rhwng y rhywiau ymhlið ei haelodau ac yn y Cabinet. Fodd bynnag, yn achos penodi i gyrrff cynghori allweddol, mae'n sathru'r rheolau hynny i gyd dan draed ac yn mynd yn gwbl groes i'w hegwyddorion agored, tryloyw ac atebol. Ni allwch hawlio clod am sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng y rhywiau oni bai eich bod yn barod i dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb am gyfansoddiad y grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen. Yr wyf yn amau y dywed y Gweinidog mai cyfrifoldeb Pwyllgorau yw sicrhau bod grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen yn atebol ac yn dryloyw. Fodd bynnag, hanner yr amser, nid yw Pwyllgorau'n gwybod a oes grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen wedi'i sefydlu.

Mae blaenragleni gwaith y Pwyllgorau wedi'u trefnu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo y bydd pob Gweinidog yn cyflwyno adroddiadau rheolaidd i'w Pwyllgorau Pwnc ar hynt grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen, o'u dechreuad i'w diwedd, fel y gall y Pwyllgorau Pwnc etholedig democraidd gael dylanwad democraidd drostynt? Yn yr enghraifft a amlygais o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, daeth yr adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor ar ôl i'r polisi gael ei weithredu. Pa fath o dderbyniad oedd hynny o rôl lunio polisi'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Fel y dywedodd Peter Law, yr ydym wedi trafod y mater hwn ar sawl achlysur. Mae'n ymddangos bod y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn trafod y mater hwn byth ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Croesawaf y cod diwygiedig, a gobeithiaf y bydd yn

I hope that it will drive the issue forward and start to change how we make appointments to public bodies. We need a diverse group of assessors to help us interview candidates, but we also need a diverse group of candidates to apply for the posts. I support the Conservatives' amendment 2. Like other Members, I have raised this issue consistently in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. Until we reach out to all communities in Wales to let people know what contribution they can make to public bodies, we will never get away from the 'usual suspects'. We must do more than advertise in *The Western Mail* if we want to reach out to all sections of society. We must get the message over to community groups, as we have discussed in Committee. Perhaps we can use groups such as parent-teacher associations, the lesbian, gay and bisexual forum in Wales, the various black and ethnic minorities support groups and the many women support groups to begin with. As Gareth Jones mentioned, it is important that we offer training to anyone who is remotely interested in serving on public bodies, to give people the confidence to apply.

**Glyn Davies:** I have only just decided to contribute to this debate. I probably have more experience of the system under the previous Government than other Members, as I was a leading quango figure for many years. I thank Phil Williams; I think that he intended to make a generous comment about me, but Ron Davies interfered and spoilt it, so Phil did not get much chance to be complimentary. I welcome the recent trend. As chair of a quango, I discussed this issue with other quango chairs, and the generally held view was that we wanted to move in this direction. The arrangements at the time were a continuation of the previous system and, looking back, we did not move quickly enough to make our views known. The present system is far healthier and looks much better. I share Alun Cairns's view that we should extend this to cover task and finish groups. I am not saying this in my defence, but even when appointments were made with little apparent consultation, efforts were made to ensure that people had a connection with the local community.

gyrru'r mater ymlaen ac yn dechrau newid y modd y gwnawn benodiadau i gyrrf cyhoeddus. Mae arnom angen grŵp amrywiol o aseswyr i'n helpu i gyfweld ymgeiswyr, ond mae arnom angen grŵp amrywiol o ymgeiswyr hefyd i geisio am y swyddi. Cefnogaeth welliant 2 gan y Ceidwadwyr. Fel Aelodau eraill, yr wyf finnau wedi codi'r mater hwn yn gyson yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Nes inni ymgynraedd allan i bob cymuned yng Nghymru i adael i bobl wybod pa gyfraniad y gallant ei wneud i gyrrf cyhoeddus, ni wnawn fyth symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth yr 'un hen wynebau'. Rhaid inni wneud mwy na hysbysebu yn *The Western Mail* os ydym am ymgynraedd allan i bob rhan o gymdeithas. Rhaid inni gyfleo'r neges i grwpiau cymunedol, fel a drafodwyd gennym yn y Pwyllgor. I ddechrau, efallai y gallwn ddefnyddio grwpiau fel cymdeithasau rhieni-athrawon, y fforwm lesbiaid, hoywon a deurywiol yng Nghymru, yr amryfal grwpiau cefnogi lleiafrifoedd du ac ethnig a'r nifer fawr o grwpiau cefnogi menywod. Fel y soniodd Gareth Jones, mae'n bwysig inni gynnig hyfforddiant i unrhyw un sydd â'r diddordeb lleiaf mewn gwasanaethu ar gyrrf cyhoeddus, er mwyn rhoi'r hyder i bobl ymgeisio.

**Glyn Davies:** Dim ond newydd benderfynu cyfrannu at y ddadl hon yr wyf fi. Mae'n debyg bod gennyf fwy o brofiad o'r system dan y Llywodraeth flaenorol nag Aelodau eraill, gan y bûm yn ffigwr blaenllaw ar gwangos am flynyddoedd lawer. Diolchaf i Phil Williams; yr wyf yn meddwl y bwriadodd wneud sylw hael amdanaf, ond torrodd Ron Davies ar draws a'i ddifetha, felly ni chafodd Phil lawer o gyfleo'r fod yn ganmoliaethus. Croesawaf y duedd ddiweddar. Fel cadeirydd cwango, trafodais y mater hwn gyda chadeiryddion cwangos eraill, a'r farn gyffredinol oedd fod arnom eisiau symud i'r cyfeiriad hwn. Yr oedd y trefniadau ar y pryd yn barhad o'r system flaenorol ac, o edrych yn ôl, ni wnaethom symud yn ddigon cyflym i ddangos ein barn. Mae'r system bresennol yn llawer iachach ac yn edrych yn llawer gwell. Rhannaf farn Alun Cairns y dylem ymestyn hyn i gynnwys grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen. Nid wyf yn dweud hyn er mwyn amddiffyn fy hun, ond, hyd yn oed pan wneid penodiadau heb fawr o ymgynghori ymddangosiadol, fe wneid

ymdrehion i sicrhau bod gan bobl gysylltiad â'r gymuned leol.

I will make a personal point: for the period that I served as a quango chair and a member of the WDA and the WTB, I was always nominated by local government. People did not realise that, as the posts were not advertised. I think there were five or seven members of the Development Board for Rural Wales who had to be drawn from a list of local government nominees. I always insisted on being one of those nominees. I would not have accepted a position had I not been. My other point is that when I was appointed I had a reputation as being an independently minded councillor. It may seem strange to Members now when they hear the purity of my political views but I do not think that anyone would have realised that I was a supporter or member of a political party because I was committed to being a local independent councillor. I might have been, but that is a private matter. I thank Phil for his generous comments about me.

Gwnaf bwynt personol: am y cyfnod y gwasanaethais i fel cadeirydd cwango ac aelod o Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, fe'm henwebwyd bob tro gan lywodraeth leol. Nid oedd pobl yn sylweddoli hynny, gan na châi'r swyddi eu hysbysebu. Yr wyf yn meddwl bod pump neu saith o aelodau Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig yr oedd yn rhaid tynnu eu henwau o restr o bobl a enwebwyd gan lywodraeth leol. Byddwn i bob amser yn mynnu cael bod yn un o'r rheini a enwebwyd. Ni fuaswn wedi derbyn swydd fel arall. Fy mhwyt arall yw bod gennyl enw, adeg fy mhenodi, am fod yn gynghorydd â barn annibynnol. Efllai y bydd hynny'n swnio'n rhyfedd i Aelodau'n awr pan glywant burdeb fy syniadau gwleidyddol ond nid wyf yn meddwl y buasai neb wedi sylweddoli fy mod yn gefnogwr nac yn aelod o blaid wleidyddol oherwydd yr oeddwn yn ymroddedig i fod yn gynghorydd lleol annibynnol. Efllai fy mod, ond mater preifat yw hynny. Diolchaf i Phil am ei sylwadau caredig amdanaf.

**The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones):** I thank all Members for their contributions to this important debate.

Dechreuaaf â sylwadau Gareth ar y cod: bydd y fersiwn terfynol yn ddwyieithog. Bydd yr adroddiad terfynol yn cynnwys rhestr o'r cyrff cyhoeddus a ddaw o dan y cod hwn. Mae'n rhaid inni hefyd ystyried y sefyllfa o ran y seiri rhyddion. Gwyddom fod hynny'n dod o dan Reolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad. Soniodd Gareth hefyd am Estyn: corff o arolygwyr ydyw, nid corff cyhoeddus fel y cyfryw. Serch hynny, byddwn am sicrhau bod y rhestr o gyrrff cyhoeddus yn weddol gynhwysfawr.

Regarding David Melding's speech, the monitoring of Welsh speakers and other minority groups will take place within the mainstreaming agenda that we have adopted. Therefore, there will be additional monitoring.

Phil Williams raised important and detailed matters that will require further research. I invite him to write to me and the information

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones):** Diolchaf i'r holl Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau i'r ddadl bwysig hon.

I will start with Gareth's comments on the code: the final version will be bilingual. The final report will include a list of the public bodies to which this code applies. We must also consider the situation as regards freemasons. We know that that is covered by the Assembly's Standing Orders. Gareth also mentioned Estyn: it is an inspectorate, not a public body as such. Nevertheless, we will want to ensure that the list of public bodies is reasonably comprehensive.

Ynglŷn ag anerchiad David Melding, bydd monitro siaradwyr Cymraeg a grwpiau lleiafrifol eraill yn digwydd o fewn yr agenda brif-ffrydio yr ydym wedi'i mabwysiadu. Felly, ceir monitro ychwanegol.

Cododd Phil Williams faterion pwysig a manwl a fydd yn galw am ymchwil bellach. Fe'i gwahoddaf i ysgrifennu ataf a darperir y

will be provided.

Many speakers made the point that there was a perception—often a correct one, as Peter Law said—which may still exist in Wales, that appointments to public bodies was a closed affair. We know that that was true in the 1980s. It was often said that the best way to secure a position of power as a Conservative in Wales in the 1980s was to lose an election. A significant quango job would then be offered to the losing candidate and a position of power would be secured.

**Alun Cairns:** Are you suggesting that Peter Law stood for the Conservative Party and that that is why he was appointed to all those quangos?

**Carwyn Jones:** Peter was one of the few individuals who was appointed on merit, as opposed to those who were appointed because of their talent for losing elections and antagonising the electorate. The situation has now changed, for which we must all be thankful. The suggestion was made that it was wonderful that the Nolan committee was established. It is true that the public appointments system is much fairer and more open than it was, but the Nolan committee was forced on the Conservative Government at the time, following scandals such as the cash-for-questions affair. Therefore, the Government put in place a system whereby appointments would be made more public. That is to be welcomed, but the reality is that it was not done of its own free will—it was forced on the Government.

The message must go out to the Welsh people that it is no longer a matter of who you know, but of how good you are. The new code attempts to put that into action. We must send out the message that we want a large number of applications from people with diverse talents, and from diverse backgrounds. We have not had that in the past in Wales. There is a large pool of talent that has been historically unable to offer public service to the people of Wales because of our previous appointments system.

4:00 p.m.

wybodaeth.

Gwnaeth sawl siaradwr y pwyt fod canfyddiad—un a oedd yn aml yn gywir, fel y dywedodd Peter Law—sydd efallai'n dal i fodoli yng Nghymru, fod penodiadau i gyrrf cyhoeddus yn fater caeëdig. Gwyddom fod hynny'n wir yn y 1980au. Dywedwyd yn aml mai'r ffordd orau i gael safle o rym fel Ceidwadwr yng Nghymru yn y 1980au oedd colli etholiad. Wedyn cynigid swydd o sylwedd ar gwango i'r ymgeisydd aflwyddiannus a byddai'n sicrhau safle o rym.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn awgrymu y safodd Peter Law dros y Blaid Geidwadol ac mai dyna pam y'i penodwyd i'r holl gwangos hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr oedd Peter yn un o'r ychydig unigolion a benodwyd ar sail teilyngdod, mewn cyferbyniad â'r rheini a benodwyd oherwydd eu dawn o golli etholiadau a chodi gwrychyn yr etholwyr. Mae'r sefyllfa wedi newid erbyn hyn, a rhaid inni i gyd ddiolch am hynny. Gwnaethpwyd yr awgrym fod sefydlu pwylgor Nolan yn beth da. Mae'r system o wneud penodiadau cyhoeddus yn llawer tecach a mwy agored nag y bu, ond gorfodwyd pwylgor Nolan ar y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ar y pryd, yn dilyn sgandalau fel helynt cynnig tâl am ofyn cwestiynau. Felly, sefydlodd y Ceidwadwyr system a fyddai'n gwneud penodiadau'n fwy cyhoeddus. Mae hynny i'w groesawu, ond y gwir yw nad o'i hewyllys ei hun y gwnaeth hynny—fe'i gorfodwyd ar y Llywodraeth.

Rhaid anfon y neges allan i bobl Cymru nad mater o bwy yr ydych yn ei adnabod ydyw mwyach, ond pa mor dda yr ydych. Mae'r cod newydd yn ymgais i roi hynny ar waith. Rhaid inni anfon y neges allan fod arnom eisiau nifer fawr o geisiadau gan bobl â doniau amrywiol, ac o gefndiroedd amrywiol. Ni chawsom hynny yn y gorffennol yng Nghymru. Mae cronfa fawr o dalent sydd yn hanesyddol wedi methu cynnig gwasanaeth cyhoeddus i bobl Cymru oherwydd ein system benodiadau flaenorol.

There is an important difference between task and finish groups and Assembly sponsored public bodies. The latter are standing bodies that do not terminate after a specific date, whereas task and finish groups are set up to consider specific situations. For example, a task and finish group was established to produce and advise on the document 'Farming for the Future'. Its members gave of their time for free. The whole point of that group was to bring together representatives of as many sectors in the agri-food chain as possible in order to achieve as wide a consensus as possible. That goal was achieved, which is the purpose of a task and finish group.

Much has been made of the fact that this is an open system of Government. There is no doubt in my mind that, in the whole of western Europe, there are few other administrations that can claim to be as open as the Assembly. Alun Cairns made a fair point that while there is a welcome gender balance in the Cabinet and an almost perfect one in terms of Assembly Members, work remains to be done to ensure a gender balance in other areas. However, if the system of government here were not open, Alun Cairns would not have known that. The fact that he is able to acquire that information, as he is perfectly entitled to, illustrates that the system of government in Wales is as open as it can be at present. Of course, it is not so open that it could not be improved upon.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to the Minister for his helpful comments. I was sorry that it took more than four months to get that information from the First Minister, but that is another issue. I got an answer in the end, for which I am grateful.

Task and finish groups have a major influence on Government policy, their meetings are closed, the agenda is not made available to the public and the minutes are not published for scrutiny. Do you agree that it is the administration's responsibility to bring any recommendations that influence policy before Assembly Subject Committees so that Members can provide input before

Mae gwahaniaeth pwysig rhwng grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen a chyrrf cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mae'r olaf yn gyrrf sefydlog na ddeuant i ben wedi dyddiad penodol, tra caiff grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen eu sefydlu i ystyried sefyllfaoedd penodol. Er enghraifft, sefydlwyd grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i lunio a chynggori ar y ddogfen 'Ffermio ar gyfer y Dyfodol'. Rhoddodd ei aelodau eu hamser yn rhad ac am ddim. Holl bwynt y grŵp hwnnw oedd dod ynghyd â chynrychiolwyr cymaint o sectorau yn y gadwyn fwyd-amaeth â phosibl er mwyn sicrhau consensws mor eang â phosibl. Cyflawnwyd y nod hwnnw, a dyna ddiben grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen.

Gwnaed llawer o'r ffaith bod hon yn system Lywodraeth agored. Nid oes amheuaeth yn fy meddwl i nad prin, yn y cyfan o orllewin Ewrop, yw'r gweinyddiaethau eraill a all honni bod mor agored â'r Cynulliad. Gwnaeth Alun Cairns bwynt teg, er bod cydbwysedd sydd i'w groesawu rhwng y ddau ryw yn y Cabinet a chydbwysedd sydd bron yn berffaith o ran Aelodau'r Cynulliad, mae gwaith i'w wneud o hyd i sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng y rhywiau mewn meysydd eraill. Fodd bynnag, pe na bai'r system lywodraeth yma'n agored, ni fuasai Alun Cairns wedi gwybod hynny. Mae'r ffaith ei fod yn gallu cael y wybodaeth honno, fel y mae ganddo berffaith hawl i'w chael, yn dangos bod y system lywodraeth yng Nghymru mor agored ag y gall fod ar hyn o bryd. Wrth gwrs, nid yw mor agored fel na ellid gwella arni.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ei sylwadau buddiol. Yr oedd yn flin gennyf imi orfod aros dros bedwar mis i gael y wybodaeth honno gan y Prif Weinidog, ond mater arall yw hynny. Cefais ateb yn y diweddf, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny.

Caiff grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen ddylanwad mawr ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth, mae eu cyfarfodydd yn gaeedig, nid yw'r agenda ar gael i'r cyhoedd ac ni chyhoeddir y cofnodiion i'w harchwilio. A gytunwch mai cyfrifoldeb y weinyddiaeth yw dod ag unrhyw argymhellion sy'n dylanwadu ar bolisi gerbron Pwyllgorau Pwnc y Cynulliad fel y gall Aelodau roi mewnbwn cyn y

they are implemented?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes, where possible. However, there may be cases when that is not possible. The purpose of a task and finish group is to advise the Minister, who is responsible to the Subject Committee and the Assembly. For example, on the farming for the future group, the draft report was twice brought before the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development for its input and observations. It was then published. There is scrutiny in that regard.

**Alun Cairns:** Therefore, do you condemn the instances where task and finish group reports have been implemented before the Subject Committees have had any input into them?

**Carwyn Jones:** You heard what I said. Where possible, draft reports should be presented to Subject Committees. There are occasions when, for good reason, that may not be possible. Without being given specific examples and their backgrounds, it is difficult for me to comment. I can only comment on what I know of through my work on my previous portfolio.

Task and finish groups fulfil an important role of involving people in the democracy of Wales today. In the past, there were no such task and finish groups. Government bodies have never had the same breadth of advice or level of involvement. That is not a party political point. I emphasise to the people of Wales that this is an open place of government and an open administration, where people's views are treasured, valued and have weight.

gweithredir arnynt?

**Carwyn Jones:** Cytunaf, lle bo modd. Fodd bynnag, gall fod achosion pan nad yw hynny'n bosibl. Pwrpas grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yw cyngori'r Gweinidog, sy'n gyfrifol i'r Pwyllgor Pwnc a'r Cynulliad. Er enghraift, ar y grŵp ffermio ar gyfer y dyfodol, daethpwyd â'r adroddiad drafst gerbron y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ddwywaith ar gyfer mewnbwn a sylwadau. Fe'i cyhoeddwyd yn dilyn hynny. Mae cyfle i archwilio yn yr ystyr hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Felly, a ydych yn condemnio'r achosion lle gweithredwyd ar adroddiadau grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen cyn i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc gael unrhyw fewnbwn iddynt?

**Carwyn Jones:** Clywsoch beth a ddywedais. Lle bo modd, dylid cyflwyno adroddiadau drafst i Bwyllgorau Pwnc. Y mae achlysuron pryd na fydd hynny efallai yn bosibl, am reswm da. Heb gael engrifftiau penodol a'r cefndir iddynt, mae'n anodd i mi roi sylw. Ni allaf ond rhoi sylwadau ar yr hyn a wn i drwy fy ngwaith ar fy mhortffolio blaenorol.

Mae grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen yn cyflawni rôl bwysig o gynnwys pobl yn nemocratioeth Cymru heddiw. Yn y gorffennol, nid oedd grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen o'r fath yn bod. Nid yw cyrff Llywodraeth erioed wedi cael yr un ehangder cyngor na'r un lefel o gyfranogiad. Nid pwyt gwleidyddol bleidiol yw hynny. Pwysleisiaf i bobl Cymru mai man lle ceir llywodraeth agored a gweinyddiaeth agored yw hwn, lle mae barn pobl yn cael ei thrysori, ei gwerthfawrogi a'i chyfrif yn bwysig.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.  
Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 25.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane

Hancock, Brian	Davies, Andrew
Jarman, Pauline	Davies, Ron
Jones, Elin	Edwards, Richard
Jones, Gareth	German, Michael
Jones, Helen Mary	Gibbons, Brian
Jones, Ieuan Wyn	Gregory, Janice
Lloyd, David	Griffiths, John
Melding, David	Gwyther, Christine
Morgan, Jonathan	Hart, Edwina
Rogers, Peter	Jones, Ann
Ryder, Janet	Jones, Carwyn
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Law, Peter
Thomas, Owen John	Lloyd, Val
Wigley, Dafydd	Middlehurst, Tom
Williams, Phil	Morgan, Rhodri
	Pugh, Alun
	Thomas, Gwenda
	Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0 .*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cynog, Dafis
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Ron
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri

Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbynwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Amended motion:

*the National Assembly*

*1. approves the revised 'Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies' which was e-mailed to Members on 18 June 2002.*

*2. endorses the proposed issuing of the code by the First Minister in September 2002.*

*3. recognises the need to recruit people from all sections of society to serve on public bodies.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. yn cymeradwyo'r fersiwn ddiwygiedig o'r 'Cod Ymarfer ar Benodiadau'r Gweinidogion i Gyrff Cyhoeddus' a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at yr Aelodau ar 18 Mehefin 2002.*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bwriad Prif Weinidog Cymru i gyhoeddi'r cod ym mis Medi 2002.*

*3. yn cydnabod yr angen i recriwtio pobl o bob rhan o gymdeithas i wasanaethu ar gyrrf cyhoeddus.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amended motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0 .*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cynog, Dafis  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Law, Peter  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)  
Minority Party Debate (Conservative Party)**

**Dirywiad Economaidd yng Nghefn Gwlad Cymru  
Economic Decline in Rural Wales**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Peter Rogers:** I propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales condemns the failure of the Government to improve the economic wellbeing of rural Wales, and calls on the Government to bring forward policies to reverse the decline. (NDM1091)*

I take great pleasure in proposing this motion today. It follows on from my short debate last Thursday on closing care homes, particularly in rural areas, and the loss of jobs and other serious consequences that that entails.

Last Friday, I received a call from a distressed schoolteacher who has 20 years of experience and who is worried that her job is hanging in the balance because of falling school rolls. In north Wales, nearly 50 jobs will be lost by the summer holidays. The schoolteacher said that she was desperately

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Peter Rogers:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn condemnio methiant y Llywodraeth i wella'r sefyllfa economaidd yng nghefn gwlad Cymru, ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i gyflwyno polisiau i wrth-droi'r dirywiad economaidd. (NDM1091)*

Pleser mawr i mi yw cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn heddiw. Mae'n dilyn oddi ar fy nadol fer ddydd Iau diwethaf ar gau cartrefi gofal, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a'r colli swyddi a'r canlyniadau difrifol eraill a ddaw yn sgil hynny.

Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, cefais alwad ffôn gan athrawes bryderus a chanddi 20 mlynedd o brofiad sydd yn poeni fod ei swydd yn y fantol oherwydd cwmp yn niferoedd disgyblion ysgol. Yn y Gogledd, collir bron 50 o swyddi erbyn gwyliau'r haf. Dywedodd yr athrawes ei bod yn poeni'n arw am ei

worried about her job and felt vulnerable because she teaches children at key stage 2. After 20 years in the profession, the saving for school governors for not paying her salary would do wonders for her school's budget. She told me that the school's intake in September would drop further, by 24 pupils. She has two children who are hoping to go to university, one this year and the other in two years' time. She explained the desperate situation she would find herself in were she to lose her job at such an important stage of her children's lives and education. I contacted a director of education in north Wales who told me that this year's job losses in rural schools could be just the tip of the iceberg. 'Education, education, education': whose words were those?

Do you know what fewer teachers in rural schools would mean? It would mean bigger classes and a deterioration in teaching standards. The fact that there are now fewer children living in rural areas has nothing to do with the birds and the bees, but has to do with the fact that there are no jobs, no future and that therefore there is outward migration of young people. Let us welcome Scottish Power's decision to close its electrical shops; it will support post offices as people will have to pay their bills and buy electricity tokens there. Let us see commitment from the Assembly in support of rural areas. Let us remember the new countryside adage: 'if you want to get on, get out'. Let us also remember that the most important industry in rural Wales is agriculture. All of rural Wales is under threat unless we recognise that a successful agricultural industry is essential to a vibrant countryside. Let us not forget the stark figure of 60,000 job losses since 1998.

We need food as sure as night follows day. UK farmers must compete for supermarket orders with overseas produce, which is produced under fewer constraints as regards animal welfare, hygiene, environmental regulations and traceability. Rather than talk about free trade, the Government must fight for fair trade to ensure that farmers are given a fair deal. We must not enforce European rules faster than Germany, Italy, Ireland or France do. Let us do what they do and let

swydd a'i bod yn teimlo'n fregus am ei bod yn dysgu plant yng nghyfnod allweddol 2. Wedi 20 mlynedd yn y proffesiwn, byddai'r arbediad i lywodraethwyr yr ysgol o beidio â thalu ei chyflog o fudd mawr i gyllideb ei hysgol. Dywedodd wrthyf y byddai'r nifer a ddeuai i mewn i'r ysgol ym Medi yn cwympo ymhellach, cwmp o 24 disgybl. Mae hi'n fam i ddau o blant sy'n gobeithio mynd i'r brifysgol, un eleni a'r llall ymhen dwy flynedd. Eglurodd y sefyllfa enbyd y cai ei hun ynnddi pe collai ei swydd ar adeg mor bwysig ym mywydau ac addysg ei phlant. Cysylltais â chyfarwyddwr addysg yn y Gogledd a ddywedodd wrthyf mai'r dechrau yn unig yw'r colledion swyddi eleni mewn ysgolion gwledig. 'Education, education, education': geiriau pwy oedd y rheini?

A wyddoch chi beth y byddai llai o athrawon mewn ysgolion gwledig yn ei olygu? Byddai'n golygu dosbarthiadau mwy a dirywiad mewn safonau dysgu. Nid oes gan y ffaith bod llai o blant bellach yn byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig ddim i'w wneud ag atgenhedlu, ond mae i wneud â'r ffaith nad oes dim swyddi, dim dyfodol a bod pobl ifanc felly'n symud i ffwrdd. Gadewch inni groesawu penderfyniad Scottish Power i gau ei siopau trydanol; bydd yn cefnogi swyddfeydd post gan y bydd raid i bobl dalu eu biliau a phrynu tocynnau trydan yn y fan honno. Gadewch inni weld ymrwymiad gan y Cynulliad i gefnogi ardaloedd gwledig. Cofiw ddywediat newydd cefn gwlad: 'os ydych am ddod ymlaen, gadewch'. Cofiw hefyd mai'r diwydiant pwysicaf yn y Gymru wledig yw amaethyddiaeth. Mae'r cyfan o'r Gymru wledig dan fygythiad os na wnawn gydnabod bod diwydiant amaethyddol llwyddiannus yn hanfodol i gefn gwlad byw. Nac anghofiwn y ffigur moel o 60,000 o swyddi a gollwyd ers 1998.

Mae angen bwyd arnom, cyn sicred â bod nos yn dilyn dydd. Rhaid i ffermwyr y DU gystadlu am archebion archfarchnadodd â chynnyrch tramor, a gynhyrchir dan lai o reolau o ran lles anifeiliaid, hylendid, rheoliadau amgylcheddol a'r gallu i olrhain. Yn hytrach na siarad am fasnach rydd, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ymladd dros fasnach deg i sicrhau y caiff ffermwyr fargen deg. Rhaid inni beidio â gorfodi rheolau Ewropeidd yn gyflymach nag y gwna'r Almaen, yr Eidal,

some of these rules and regulations gather dust on the shelf. Why do we have to keep on regulating? Since 1997, more than 15,000 regulations on agriculture have been introduced. That is 3,000 per year, 250 per month and 58 per week. The command and control mentality that originates with the common agricultural policy and finds its expression in the mountain of Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs directives and decrees does untold damage to the industry.

4:10 p.m.

**Ron Davies:** You make a powerful argument about the regulations that emanate from the European Union. However, the period to which you refer was cursed by a series of incidents, not least the problems of BSE. Do you accept that during that period many of the directives to which you referred were necessary to deal with the impact of BSE on human and animal health?

**Peter Rogers:** I agree that foot and mouth disease and other diseases must be controlled. However, we must remember that we are going back to 1997. I gave a perfect example in Plenary today about what will be done to poultry farmers across the country without a thought of the consequences. You, Ron, will understand that by annihilating the poultry industry by this one foul swoop this country will be left with an extra 2 million tonnes of grain or more, which are currently consumed by that industry.

**Ron Davies:** Do you accept that the Government that you supported throughout the 1970s and 1980s was determined to follow the path of deregulation, and that that failed to protect the public sector and led to a succession of diseases, such as BSE? Is it not the case that those chickens have come home to roost?

**Peter Rogers:** If we consider BSE, we can see how much it has cost us and the ongoing damage to the industry caused by some commentators and the rules. The latest rule, on removing spinal cords from lambs, was imposed by France last week. We must draw a line under this and question our understanding of BSE.

Iwerddon a Ffrainc. Gwnawn yr un fath â hwy a gadael i rai o'r rheolau hyn hel llwch ar y silff. Pam mae'n rhaid inni reoleiddio o hyd? Ers 1998, cyflwynwyd mwy na 15,000 o reoliadau ar amaethyddiaeth. Dyna 3,000 y flwyddyn, 250 y mis a 58 yr wythnos. Mae'r meddylfryd gorchymyn a rheoli sydd â'i wreiddiau yn y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin ac y gwelir ei fynegiant yn y mynydd o gyfarwyddebau a gorchymynion gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn gwneud niwed difesur i'r diwydiant.

**Ron Davies:** Gwnewch ddadl rymus ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau sy'n deillio o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, melltithiwyd y cyfnod yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato gan gyfres o ddigwyddiadau, nid yn lleiaf broblemau BSE. A ydych yn derbyn bod llawer o'r cyfarwyddebau y cyfeiriasoch atynt yn angenrheidiol yn y cyfnod hwnnw i ddelio ag effaith BSE ar iechyd dynol ac anifeiliaid?

**Peter Rogers:** Cytunaf fod yn rhaid rheoli clwy'r traed a'r genau a chlefydau eraill. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cofio ein bod yn mynd yn ôl i 1997. Rhoddais enghraifft berffaith yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw o'r hyn a wneir i ffermwyr dofedor ledled y wlad heb feddwl am y canlyniadau. Byddwch chi, Ron, yn deall y bydd diddymu'r diwydiant dofedor mewn un ergyd greulon yn gadael y wlad hon gyda 2 filiwn tunnell ychwanegol neu fwy o rawn, a ddefnyddir ar hyn o bryd gan y diwydiant hwnnw.

**Ron Davies:** A dderbyniwch fod y Llywodraeth yr oeddech chi'n ei chefnogi drwy gydol y 1970au a'r 1980au yn benderfynol o ddilyn llwybr dadreoleiddio, a bod hynny wedi methu â gwarchod y sector cyhoeddus gan arwain at gyfres o glefydau fel BSE? Onid yw'n wir fod y cywion hynny wedi dod adref i glwydo?

**Peter Rogers:** Os ystyriwn BSE, gallwn weld faint y mae wedi ei gostio i ni a'r niwed parhaus i'r diwydiant a achoswyd gan rai sylwebwyr a'r rheolau. Gosodwyd y rheol ddiweddaraf, ynglŷn â thynnu'r madruddyn o wlyn, gan Ffrainc yr wythnos diwethaf. Rhaid inni dynnu llinell dan hyn a chwestiynu ein dealltwriaeth o BSE.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Do you agree that, if regulations had been in place to safeguard animal feed when BSE was introduced into this country, we could have avoided that whole episode?

**Peter Rogers:** We have just had a disaster with the foot and mouth disease outbreak. We have not taken any precautions since then for the future. We should be considering how to save the countryside's economy and introduce plans to get a viable farming industry going again.

The industry requires a period of calm and consistency after years of falling incomes. Latest figures show that incomes have declined by about 77 per cent. We must ensure that we can control an outbreak of any of these virulent diseases that cause so much trouble. We must save the family farm. We must not have more upheaval and change. Mike German, who is the third Minister responsible for agriculture in as many years—and a Liberal Democrat—is not in any position to offer expertise or experience. Foot and mouth disease wreaked havoc across the country and brought misery and desperation to businesses, many of which were unconnected with agriculture. The bungling incompetence of the former Minister for Rural Affairs, Carwyn Jones, was mainly responsible for that. My area saw the greatest overkill of animals per confirmed foot and mouth disease case in the modern world. I could bring tears to your eyes with accounts of the misery for which the Minister was responsible. Now this same Minister has the audacity to table motions congratulating himself. Does he not know shame?

Europe's response to the foot and mouth disease outbreak was spot on. An immediate movement ban was enforced. Had the Government acted in the same way, north Wales would have escaped the disease. We are now subject to a 20-day movement ban—an illogical regulation that is destroying the industry. Should foot and mouth disease strike again, the new 20-day rule would play no part in preventing the virus from reaching north Wales in exactly the same way as it did

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A gytunwch, pe buasai rheoliadau yn eu lle i ddiogelu porthiant anifeiliaid pan gyflwynwyd BSE i'r wlad hon, y gallasem fod wedi osgoi'r holl beth?

**Peter Rogers:** Yr ydym newydd gael trychineb gyda chlwy'r traed a'r genau. Nid ydym wedi cymryd unrhyw ragofalon ers hynny ar gyfer y dyfodol. Dylem fod yn ystyried sut i achub economi cefn gwlad a chyflwyno cynlluniau i roi diwydiant ffermio hyfyw ar ei draed eto.

Mae ar y diwydiant angen cyfnod o lonydd a chysondeb ar ôl blynyddoedd o gwympr mewn incwm. Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf ostyngiad o ryw 77 y cant yn incwm ffermwyr. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gallwn reoli unrhyw un o'r clefydau heintus hyn sy'n achosi cymaint o helynt. Rhaid inni achub y fferm deuluol. Rhaid inni beidio â chael mwy o chwalfa a newid. Nid yw Mike German, y trydydd Gweinidog cyfrifol am amaethyddiaeth mewn cynifer o flynyddoedd—a Democrat Rhyddfrydol—mewn unrhyw sefyllfa i gynnig arbenigedd na phrofiad. Creodd clwy'r traed a'r genau lanastr ar draws y wlad gan beri digalondid ac anobaith i fusnesau, llawer ohonynt heb gysylltiad ag amaethyddiaeth. Anallu bwngleraidd y cyn Weinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, Carwyn Jones, oedd yn bennaf gyfrifol am hynny. Yn fy ardal i gwelwyd y gorladdfa mwyaf o anifeiliaid yn y byd modern am bob achos o glwy'r traed a'r genau a gadarnhawyd. Gallwn dynnu dagrau i'ch llygaid gyda hanesion am y tralod yr oedd y Gweinidog yn gyfrifol amdano. Yn awr mae gan yr un Gweinidog hwn yr hyfdra i gyflwyno cynigion yn ei longyfarch ei hun. Onid oes ganddo gywilydd?

Yr oedd ymateb Ewrop i haint clwy'r traed a'r genau yn llygad ei le. Gorfodwyd gwaharddiad ar symud anifeiliaid yn ddi-oed. Pe bai'r Llywodraeth wedi gweithredu yn yr un modd, buasai gogledd Cymru wedi osgoi'r clwy. Yn awr mae gwaharddiad symud 20 diwrnod arnom—rheoliad afresymegol sy'n dinistrio'r diwydiant. Pe bai clwy'r traed a'r genau yn taro eto, ni fyddai'r rheol 20 diwrnod newydd yn gwneud dim i atal y feirws rhag cyrraedd gogledd Cymru yn yr un

last year. Yet, a 20-day rule is in place, which is stifling the industry and the livestock auctions in particular, and is again giving the supermarkets a mandate to control prices. We need to challenge the 20-day rule in order to prevent the disease from entering the country again and to prevent further damage to the economy; not only are auctions discriminated against, but the whole industry is suffering.

**Cynog Dafis rose—**

**Peter Rogers:** I will not give way, Cynog.

What we need and what the industry has been screaming for over the last six or seven years, following the devastation of swine fever and now foot and mouth disease, is controls at ports and docks such as those enforced by every other food producing country to protect their industry. Containers need to be well marked and we need signs for travellers to deposit meat products. We need sniffer dogs, and publicity to make people aware of how illegally imported meat can damage our industry.

There has been enough idle talk in the Assembly about training sniffer dogs and people to provide protection. We are over three years into devolution and there is still no sign of protection for the industry. We have damaged the auction system, which is a vital marketing tool; these companies must not be victimised. Their vital role must be appreciated and supported. They must not be the scapegoat for a Government that got it wrong.

Young farmers have a special place in this Government's plans, or so I thought. Why is there no sheep quota available for new entrants and why are there rules and bureaucracy that prevent applications for suckler cow quota? What have we done for new entrants? Training in agriculture for young people is almost non-existent.

Why do we not take a lead from the French Government? It has taken the bull by the horns and has awarded generous, non-

modd yn union ag y gwnaeth y llynedd. Er hynny, mae rheol 20 diwrnod wedi'i gosod, sy'n tagu'r diwydiant a'r ocsynau da byw yn enwedig, ac sydd eto yn rhoi mandad i'r archfarchnadoedd reoli prisiau. Mae angen inni herio'r rheol 20 diwrnod er mwyn atal y clwy rhag dod i mewn i'r wlad eto ac i atal niwed pellach i'r economi; nid yn unig y gwahaniaethir yn erbyn ocsynau, ond mae'r diwydiant cyfan yn dioddef.

**Cynog Dafis a gododd—**

**Peter Rogers:** Nid wyf am ildio, Cynog.

Yr hyn sydd arnom ei angen, a'r hyn y bu'r diwydiant yn sgrechian amdanu dros y chwech neu saith blynedd diwethaf, yn dilyn dinistr clefyd y moch ac yn awr clwy'r traed a'r genau, yw mesurau rheoli mewn porthladdoedd a dociau fel y rheini a weithredir gan bob gwlaid arall sy'n cynhyrchu bwyd er mwyn gwarchod eu diwydiant. Mae angen i gynwysyddion fod wedi'u marcio'n glir ac mae angen arwyddion i drafaelwyr waredu cynhyrchion cig. Mae angen cŵn synhwyro, a chyhoeddusrwydd i sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o sut y gall cig a fewnforir yn anghyreithlon niweidio ein diwydiant.

Bu digon o siarad gwag yn y Cynulliad am hyfforddi cŵn synhwyro a phobl i ddarparu gwarchodaeth. Yr ydym dros dair blynedd i mewn i ddatganoli ac nid oes byth unrhyw arwydd o warchodaeth i'r diwydiant. Yr ydym wedi niweidio'r system ocsiwn, sy'n arf marchnata allweddol; rhaid peiddio ag erlid y cwmnïau hyn. Rhaid gwerthfawrogi a chefnogi eu rôl hanfodol. Rhaid iddynt beidio â bod yn fwch dihangol i Lywodraeth a gymerodd gam gwag.

Mae gan ffermwyr ifanc le arbennig yng nghynlluniau'r Llywodraeth hon, neu felly y tybiwn i. Pam nad oes cwota defaid ar gael i ffermwyr newydd a pham fod rheolau a biwrocratiaeth sy'n atal ceisiadau am gwota buchod magu? Beth yr ydym ni wedi'i wneud dros ffermwyr newydd? Prin fod unrhyw hyfforddiant amaethyddiaeth i bobl ifanc.

Pam na chymerwn ein harwain gan Lywodraeth Ffrainc? Mae wedi plymio iddi ac wedi rhoi grantiau hael o hyd at £14,000

repayable grants of up to £14,000 to entice young British farmers to France. There is state-subsidised borrowing of up to £72,000 at 2 per cent interest. [Interruption.] You will be interested in this, Cynog; I will have a chat with you after the session.

Additionally, there is a state-subsidised advance for farm improvements—[Interruption.]

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** rose—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Peter Rogers is not giving way.

**Peter Rogers:** I am not being arrogant by not giving way; my time is running out.

There is a state-subsidised advance for farm improvements of £74,000. France thinks that it is important to encourage young farmers, who are considered to be the future for rural areas, and it gives them every assistance. France wants many people to farm a reasonable and viable amount of land rather than to have a few privileged farmers working an enormous amount of it. That is how it encourages a rural economy and ensures that homes are lived in and schools, shops and post offices remain open.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete all after ‘*The National Assembly for Wales*’ and insert:

*commends the Welsh Assembly Government for its policies and actions which are helping farmers to adapt and rural businesses to develop and flourish, and which aim to regenerate rural communities well into the future.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod effaith polisiau Llywodraeth y DU wrth danseilio economi cefn gwlad*

heb fod gofyn am ad-daliad i ddenu ffermwyr ifainc o Brydain i Ffrainc. Gellir benthyca hyd at £72,000 dan nawdd y wladwriaeth ar log o 2 y cant. [Torri ar draws.] Bydd gennych chi ddiddordeb yn hyn, Cynog; caf sgwrs â chi wedi'r cyfarfod.

Yn ogystal, ceir blaendal dan nawdd y wladwriaeth tuag at wella ffermydd—[Torri ar draws.]

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** a gododd—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw Peter Rogers yn ildio.

**Peter Rogers:** Nid bod yn haerllug ydwyt wrth beidio ag ildio; mae fy amser yn mynd yn brin.

Ceir blaendal o £74,000 dan nawdd y wladwriaeth tuag at wella ffermydd. Mae Ffrainc yn meddwl ei bod yn bwysig annog ffermwyr ifainc, yr ystyrir mai hwy yw'r dyfodol i ardaloedd gwledig, ac mae'n rhoi pob cymorth iddynt. Mae ar Ffrainc eisiau i lawer o bobl ffermio darn rhesymol ac ymarferol o dir yn hytrach na chael ychydig o ffermwyr breintiedig yn gweithio darnau anferthol ohono. Dyna sut y mae'n hybu'r economi wledig ac yn sicrhau bod cartrefi'n cael pobl i fyw ynddynt a bod ysgolion, siopau a swyddfeydd post yn aros ar agar.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu popeth ar ôl ‘*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*’ ac ychwanegu:

*yn cymeradwyo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ei pholisiau a'r camau y mae'n eu cymryd i helpu ffermwyr i addasu ac i helpu busnesau gwledig i ddatblygu a ffynnu, ac sy'n anelu at adfywio cymunedau gwledig ymhell i'r dyfodol.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: add at the end of the motion:

*recognises the impact of UK Government policies in undermining the economy of rural*

*Cymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn ymrwymo i gyflwyno targedau rhanbarthol i hyrwyddo twf economaidd.*

Gwrandewais yn astud ar yr hyn yr oedd gan Peter Rogers i'w gynnig—gweledigaeth y Blaid Geidwadol ynghylch cefn gwlad a'r economi wledig. Ac eithrio'r dadreoleiddio, ni chynigiodd unrhyw beth. Soniodd am syniad annelwig ynghylch cŵn a fyddai'n arogl rhyw bethau rhyfeddol a drwy hynny'n gwednewid yr economi wledig.

4:20 p.m.

Os ydym yn mynd i godi dadl o'r fath, dylem osod awgrymiadau gerbron y Cynulliad. Un peth yw lladd ar y Llywodraeth bresennol, a chytunaf fod ei pholisiau yn y Cynulliad a San Steffan wedi bod yn niweidiol i gefn gwlad. Fodd bynnag, nid oes pwynt ymosod ar y Llywodraeth dro ar ôl tro, heb gynnig mesurau. Heriaf Peter ar hyn. Dadreoleiddio oedd ei unig awgrym ac ni fydd yn datrys problemau amaethyddiaeth. Dylem fanteisio ar yffaith bod gennym ddiwydiant sydd wedi'i reoleiddio i'r fath raddau y gallwn ddatgan yn bendant bod cynnrych Cymru o'r safon uchaf bosibl. Rhaid inni farchnata cynnrych Cymru ar y sail ei fod yn lân ac yn wyrdd. Dylid cael premiwm ariannol arno a fyddai'n sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn cael yr hyn y maent yn ei haeddu am gynnrych o'r fath safon. Nid oes pwynt lladd ar Ewrop a bod yn negyddol.

Mae posibiliadau ar gyfer y diwydiant. Os lladdwn ar y diwydiant yn barhaus, a dweud ei fod mewn argyfwng, nid oes gobaith i amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru—yr ydym yn ei ded frydu i farwolaeth. Cystal inni gladdu'r diwydiant; dyna'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud wrth ddweud drwy'r amser nad oes gobaith. Mae amaethwyr yng Nghymru heddiw sydd yn gweld gobaith, er gwaethaf y sefyllfa anodd. Yr ydym i gyd wedi siarad ag amaethwyr, ac mae'n brofiad torcalonnus ar hyn o bryd. Maent yn ymwybodol o'r problemau, ond maent eisiau sicrhau y gallant gystadlu oherwydd safon eu cynnrych.

*Wales.*

I propose amendment 3. Add at the end of the motion:

*commits to introducing regional targets to promote economic growth.*

I listened carefully to what Peter Rogers had to offer—the Conservative Party's vision regarding rural areas and the rural economy. With the exception of deregulation, he did not propose anything. He mentioned a vague idea about dogs that would sniff some incredible things and thus transform the rural economy.

If we are to propose such debates, we should place recommendations before the Assembly. It is one thing to attack the current Government, and I agree that its policies in the Assembly and in Westminster have been detrimental to rural areas. However, there is no point in attacking the Government time after time, without proposing any measures. I challenge Peter on this. Deregulation was his only suggestion and it will not solve the problems of agriculture. We should take advantage of the fact that we have an industry that is regulated to such an extent that we can state unequivocally that Welsh produce is of the highest possible quality. We must market Welsh produce as clean and green. There should be a financial premium on it to ensure that farmers receive what they deserve for such quality produce. There is no point in attacking Europe and being negative.

There are possibilities for the industry. If we talk down the industry constantly, and say that it is in crisis, there is no hope for agriculture in Wales—we are condemning it to death. We might as well bury the industry; that is what we are doing by constantly saying that the situation is hopeless. There are farmers in Wales today who see hope, despite the difficult situation. We have all spoken to farmers, and it is a heartbreakingly experience at the moment. They are aware of the problems, but they want to ensure that they can compete because of the quality of their produce.

Dylem gofio hefyd fod yr economi wledig yn ehangach nag amaethyddiaeth, er y byddwn yn dadlau o hyd mai amaethyddiaeth yw asgwrn cefn yr economi wledig yng Nghymru. Dywedwyd yn y gorffennol nad yw amaethyddiaeth yn cynnig llawer o ran cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen na gwneud mewnbwn sylweddol i'r economi. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig o ganolbarth Cymru, mae 30 y cant o swyddi—a thros 30 y cant o swyddi mewn mannau gwledig o dde-orllewin Cymru—yn ddibynnol ar amaethyddiaeth mewn rhyw ffordd. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ogledd-orllewin Cymru. Felly, mae amaethyddiaeth yn eithriadol o bwysig.

O ran y gwelliannau, mae polisiau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf wedi bod yn ddifaol i gefn gwlad. Collir gwasanaethau o gefn gwlad, wrth iddynt gael eu canoli, ac, wedi colli'r gwasanaethau hanfodol hynny, mae'n gynyddol anodd i bobl aros yn y cymunedau hynny. Gwelwn, felly, ddirwasgiad, gyda phobl yn symud gyda'r swyddi i drefi a dinasoedd, ac yn gadael cefn gwlad. Yn sgil hyn, collir cyfraniad pwysig i economi cefn gwlad.

Byddem yn dadlau fod polisiau cyllido Llywodraeth Geidwadol y gorffennol a'r Llywodraeth Lafur bresennol wedi bod yn ddifaol i gefn gwlad, ond nid oes dim byd wedi effeithio ar y diwydiant amaethyddiaeth gymaint â gwerth y bunt. Mewn perthynas â'r sector llath, a nifer o sectorau eraill, byddai ymuno â'r ewro, neu gael gwared ar y gwahaniaeth rhwng y bunt gref—er nad yw mor gryf ag y bu—a'r ewro, sydd yn gymharol wan, yn gwneud, efallai, y gwahaniaeth mwyaf i amaethyddiaeth.

Mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod y problemau gyda pholisiau'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'n rhaid inni gael targedau rhanbarthol. Yr ydym wedi pwysleisio hyn dro ar ôl tro—ni fyddaf yn trafod hyn ymhellach gan fod y Dirprwy Lywydd am imi gloi—ond os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â chynllunio ar gyfer yr economi wledig, mae angen targedau rhanbarthol.

Gwrthodwn welliant 1. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod gwall teipio, ac y dylai ddarllen

We should also remember that the rural economy is wider than agriculture, although we would still argue that agriculture is the backbone of the rural economy in Wales. It has been said in the past that agriculture does not contribute much in terms of gross domestic product per head or make a significant contribution to the economy. In the rural areas of mid Wales, 30 per cent of jobs—and over 30 per cent of jobs in rural parts of south-west Wales—depend in some way on agriculture. The same is true of north-west Wales. Therefore, agriculture is exceptionally important.

On the amendments, the United Kingdom Government's policies over recent years have been detrimental to rural areas. Services are being lost from the countryside and centralised, and, once those essential services have been lost, it is increasingly difficult for people to stay in those communities. As a result these areas enter a depression, with people moving with the jobs to the towns and cities, and leaving the countryside. As a result an important contribution to the rural economy is lost.

We would argue that the funding policies of the past Conservative Government and the present Labour Government have been destructive in rural areas, but nothing has affected the agriculture industry as much as the value of the pound. With regard to the dairy sector, and many other sectors, joining the euro, or removing the difference between the strong pound—although it is not as strong as it has been—and the comparatively weak euro, would perhaps make the biggest difference to agriculture.

We must acknowledge the problems with the policies of the United Kingdom. We must have regional targets. We have emphasised this time after time—I will not discuss it further because the Deputy Presiding Officer wants me to wind up—but if we are serious about planning for the rural economy, we need regional targets.

We will reject amendment 1. I thought that there was a typing error, and that it should

‘ac sy’n anelu at adfywio cymunedau gwledig ymhell yn y dyfodol’ yn hytrach nag ‘ymhell i’r dyfodol’, gan fy mod yn credu mai hyn yw nod polisiau’r Llywodraeth.

**Nick Bourne:** I agree with some of the previous speaker’s comments on rural services, and this debate is about rural services, not just agriculture. I will concentrate on a few aspects of rural services, and then talk about agriculture. On rural services, the Lib Dem and Labour Government has neglected spending on education and health in rural areas. We have seen the impact of that on small schools in rural Wales, which is often associated with a threat to the Welsh language as well. Currently, there are two appeals on the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning’s desk from small schools in Pembrokeshire—Moylegrove and Dinas Cross. Many other small schools are threatened, not least in Breconshire—in Trecastle and Libanus. Had we had a uniform small schools policy to protect these small schools, there would be less threat to rural areas.

However, this is not just limited to education. The same is true of health. For some time we have not spent enough on health in rural areas. Rurality is not properly taken into account in relation to rural healthcare. This is nowhere more true than in the ambulance service, which is under serious threat throughout mid and west Wales. In parts of mid Wales no ambulance is available if one is called away to a serious accident on one side of Ceredigion or Powys, which leads to problems elsewhere. Therefore, this is a cross-cutting issue, and is not just related to agriculture. I agree that some problems are outside the Assembly’s immediate control, such as the provision of British Telecom telephone boxes. Pressure from us all would perhaps help to ensure that BT telephone boxes, which are under threat throughout rural areas, are protected.

Turning to agriculture, there is concern that lessons do not seem to have been learnt since the foot and mouth disease outbreak. Part of the reason for that is that a public inquiry was

read ‘and which aims to regenerate rural communities in the distant future’ rather than ‘far into the future’, because I believe that that is the aim of the Government’s policies.

**Nick Bourne:** Cytunaf â rhai o sylwadau’r siaradwr blaenorol am wasanaethau gwledig, a dadl yw hon am wasanaethau gwledig, nid amaethyddiaeth yn unig. Canolbwytiaf ar ychydig o agweddau ar wasanaethau gwledig, wedyn siaradaf am amaethyddiaeth. Ar wasanaethau gwledig, mae Llywodraeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur wedi esgeuluso gwariant ar addysg ac iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Gwelsom effaith hynny ar ysgolion bach yn y Gymru wledig, sydd yn aml yn gysylltiedig â bygythiad i’r iaith Gymraeg hefyd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae dwy apêl ar ddesg y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gan ysgolion bach yn Sir Benfro—Trewyddel a Dinas. Mae llawer o ysgolion bach eraill dan fygythiad, nid yn lleiaf yn Sir Frycheiniog—yn Nhre castell a Libanus. Pe buasai gennym bolisi unffurf ar ysgolion bychain i warchod yr ysgolion hyn, byddai llai o fygythiad i ardaloedd gwledig.

Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn wedi’i gyfyngu i addysg yn unig. Mae’r un peth yn wir am iechyd. Ers tro nid ydym wedi gwario digon ar iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ni chymerir gwledigrwydd i gyfrif yn iawn yng nghyswllt gofal iechyd yng nghefn gwlad. Nid oes unman lle mae hyn yn fwy gwir nag yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, sydd dan fygythiad difrifol drwy’r Canolbarth a’r Gorllewin. Mewn rhannau o’r Canolbarth nid oes ambiwlans ar gael os bydd un wedi’i alw i ddamwain ddifrifol ar un ochr i Geredigion neu Bowys, sy’n arwain at broblemau mewn mannau eraill. Felly, mae hyn yn fater trawsbynciol, ac nid yn gysylltiedig ag amaethyddiaeth yn unig. Cytunaf fod rhai problemau y tu allan i reolaeth uniongyrchol y Cynulliad, fel darpariaeth cabanau ffôn Telecom Prydain. Byddai pwysau gennym ni i gyd efallai’n helpu i sicrhau y gwarchodir blychau ffôn BT, sydd dan fygythiad mewn ardaloedd gwledig ym mhobman.

A throi at amaethyddiaeth, nid ymddengys y dysgwyd gwersi ers clwy’r traed a’r genau, sy’n destun pryder. Rhan o’r rheswm am hynny yw na chynhalwyd ymchwiliad

not held, which was wrong. It was wrong, during the outbreak, to demand the closure of footpaths throughout the country and to use pyres to dispose of carcasses, and it was wrong not to vaccinate. Surely, this admission of wrongdoing demands a full public inquiry. I do not often agree with the Liberal Democrat spokesman on agriculture, but those are Mick Bates's words, and I could not agree more. It was disappointing, therefore, that he voted against a public inquiry when it came before the National Assembly for Wales.

**Mick Bates:** We did not have power here to hold a full public inquiry, as you well know, so I stand by my words. On small schools, what has your party done to implement a policy to save small schools and to consider how rural schools can survive? Absolutely nothing.

**Nick Bourne:** The right time to intervene on that issue would have been when I was discussing it. I will return to that. On your comments on foot and mouth disease, I am glad that you have underlined the fact that there should be a public inquiry. It is strange that we did not have the power here, but a vote was taken on it and you voted against it. That is disappointing. You will no doubt have a word with your friend, the Deputy First Minister and 'Minister for Interplanetary Travel and Agriculture' on that issue.

**Mick Bates:** Will you reflect on how the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee Chair, Glyn Davies, voted on the same issue? He did not vote in favour of an inquiry either.

**Nick Bourne:** Having indicated previously—

**Glyn Davies:** I was so incensed by Mick's remarks that I only allowed Nick Bourne two words before intervening. Mick Bates knows perfectly well, because he is a Committee Chair himself, that there is a protocol on how Chairs vote. If he has not learnt that, he is not fit to be a Chair.

**Nick Bourne:** That is the point that I was

cyhoeddus, a oedd yn gamgymeriad. Camgymeriad, yn ystod yr haint, oedd mynnu cau llwybrau ar draws y wlad a defnyddio coelcerthi i waredu'r cyrff, a chamgymeriad oedd peidio â brechu. Siawns nad yw'r cyfaddefiad hwn o gamgymeriadau'n mynnu ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn. Nid yn aml y cytunaf â llefarydd y Democratioaid Rhyddfrydol ar amaethyddiaeth, ond geiriau Mick Bates yw'r rheini, ac ni allwn gytuno mwy. Siomedig, felly, oedd iddo bleidleisio yn erbyn ymchwiliad cyhoeddus pan ddaeth hynny gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

**Mick Bates:** Nid oedd gennym y grym yma i gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, felly daliaf at yr hyn a ddywedais. Ar ysgolion bach, beth a wnaeth eich plaid chi i weithredu polisi i achub ysgolion bach ac i ystyried sut y gall ysgolion gwledig fyw? Dim o gwbl.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr amser iawn i ymyrryd ar y mater hwnnw fuasai pan oeddwn yn ei draffod. Deuaf yn ôl at hynny. O ran eich sylwadau ar glwy'r traed a'r genau, yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi tanlinellu'r ffaith y dylid cael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Mae'n od nad oedd y grym gennym yma, ond cymerwyd pleidlais arno a phleidleisioch chi yn ei erbyn. Mae hynny'n siomedig. Mae'n siŵr y cewch air â'ch ffrind, Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r 'Gweinidog dros Deithio Rhyngblanedol ac Amaethyddiaeth' ar y mater hwnnw.

**Mick Bates:** A wnewch chi fyfyrion ar sut y pleidleisiodd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, Glyn Davies, ar yr un mater? Ni phleidleisiodd yntau o blaid ymchwiliad ychwaith.

**Nick Bourne:** Wedi nodi'n gynharach—

**Glyn Davies:** Fe'm cynddeiriogwyd gymaint gan sylwadau Mick nes imi ganiatâu dau air yn unig i Nick Bourne cyn torri ar draws. Gŵyr Mick Bates yn berffaith iawn, am ei fod yn Gadeirydd Pwyllgor ei hun, fod protocol ynghylch sut y mae Cadeiryddion yn pleidleisio. Os nad yw wedi dysgu hynny, nid yw'n addas i fod yn Gadeirydd.

**Nick Bourne:** Dyna'r pwynt yr oeddwn i ar

about to make, but Glyn made it much more graphically.

**Alun Cairns:** Mick Bates said that we did not have the powers to call for a public inquiry here. We also did not have the powers to give statutory powers to a children's commissioner, but a motion was carried in Plenary asking Westminster to act on our behalf. Why, then, did he not support a motion asking Westminster to hold a full public inquiry?

**Nick Bourne:** It is important that we exercise muscular devolution. If I could give the Liberal Democrats some advice, it is about time that they realised that. To return to the point about a full public inquiry, that would have demonstrated at least two points. First, we need proper controls at ports and points of entry to ensure that infected meat does not enter the country. Other countries, such as the United States of America and Australia, are successful in controlling imports. It would also have demonstrated that we need small, local abattoirs. Successive Governments have made a mistake in phasing out those abattoirs and not assisting in their retention, but last year, sadly, their budget was cut by the Lib Dem/Labour administration. Those are two massive errors. There are serious points here. We are proposing constructive policies to put them right, and we need a genuine, cross-cutting approach to consider all these matters that affect rural Wales.

fin ei wneud, ond fe'i gwnaethpwyd yn llawer mwy di-flewyn ar dafod gan Glyn.

**Alun Cairns:** Dywedodd Mick Bates nad oedd y grym gennym i alw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yma. Nid oedd gennym y grym ychwaith i roi pwerau statudol i gomisiynydd plant, ond fe basiwyd cynnig mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn gofyn i San Steffan weithredu ar ein rhan. Pam, felly, na chefnogodd gynnig yn gofyn i San Steffan gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ymarfer datganoli cyhyrog. Pe cawn roi cyngor i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mae'n hen bryd iddynt sylweddoli hynny. I ddychwelyd at y pwynt am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn, buasai hynny wedi dangos o leiaf ddau beth. Yn gyntaf, mae angen mesurau rheoli priodol mewn porthladdoedd a phwyntiau mynediad i sicrhau na ddaw cig heintiedig i mewn i'r wlad. Mae gwledydd eraill, fel Unol Daleithiau America ac Awstralia, yn llwyddo i reoli mewnforion. Buasai wedi dangos hefyd fod arnom angen lladd-dai bach, lleol. Mae Llywodraeth ar ôl Llywodraeth wedi gwneud camgymeriad wrth adael i'r lladd-dai hyn ddiflannu'n raddol heb helpu i'w cadw, ond y llynedd, syswaeth, cwtogwyd eu cyllideb gan weinyddiaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/Llafur. Dyna ddau gamgymeriad enfawr. Y mae pwyntiau difrifol yma. Yr ydym yn cynnig polisiau adeiladol i'w cywiro, ac mae angen dull trawsbynciol, go iawn, i ystyried yr holl faterion hyn sy'n effeithio ar y Gymru wledig.

4:30 p.m.

**Mick Bates:** I declare an interest as a partner in a farming business. I am pleased to take part in this debate, because it concerns rural communities and their regeneration. There cannot be one Assembly Member who does not believe that we need to achieve measures to assist our rural communities in Wales. That is why I listened to Peter Rogers's remarks with great disappointment. However, I was pleased to hear some of Nick Bourne's remarks. He recognises that rural development is not solely about agriculture. There are so many cross-cutting issues that the Assembly must address to regenerate

**Mick Bates:** Datganaf fuddiant fel partner mewn busnes ffermio. Yr wyf yn falch o gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon, oherwydd mae a wnelo â chymunedau gwledig a'u hadfywiad. Ni all fod un Aelod o'r Cynulliad nad yw'n credu bod angen inni gymryd camau i gynorthwyo'n cymunedau gwledig yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y gwrandoewais ar sylwadau Peter Rogers â siom enfawr. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed rhai o sylwadau Nick Bourne. Mae ef yn sylweddoli nad amaethyddiaeth yw unig elfen datblygu gwledig. Mae cymaint o faterion trawsbynciol y mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad roi

communities that it would be impossible and poor planning to focus on one issue.

I felt a great sense of shame when listening to the opening speech of this debate. I was never accompanied by a member of the Welsh Conservative Party on the numerous occasions when I represented the farming industry and rural interests in pleading to stop cuts of 25 per cent in hill farmers' payments and to keep an advisory service that would assist agriculture to restructure. I could give many such examples of a party whose leader at the time denied the existence of society. Now the party seems to be on the road to Damascus. I rejoice that you have at long last seen the light, and now believe in the regeneration of rural communities.

**Peter Rogers:** You misrepresent what I said. I began by talking about schools and the danger of closing rural schools and the job losses involved. I mentioned care homes. I mentioned post offices, which are important, and Scottish Power's announcement today. I also mentioned village shops and village schools. I did not talk only about agriculture. However, we must stop the outward migration of young people, Mick.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for that clarification. I am sure that all 60 Assembly Members would agree with your last comment.

I would love to see clearer targets for rural areas. I have no doubt that we have already failed on certain issues in our three years of existence. I live in hope of hearing the Welsh Conservatives say that their party failed on BSE and that it was wrong to get rid of free school milk. Our pleadings on those issues fell on deaf ears. I want an apology from you for the weaknesses of your party's policies on BSE when it was in Government. I saw those weaknesses when I took evidence for the Government on having better regulations to ensure that no prions can get into the food chain. You talk about less regulation. We must put public health first. If getting rid of regulations means endangering public health, you are wrong to suggest it,

sylw iddynt i adfywio cymunedau nes mai amhosibl a chynllunio gwael fyddai canolbwytio ar un mater.

Teimlais gywilydd mawr wrth wrando ar araith agoriadol y ddadl hon. Nid ymunodd yr un aelod o Blaid Geidwadol Cymru â mi erioed ar yr achlysuron niferus pan gynrychiolais y diwydiant ffermio a buddiannau gwledig wrth bledio am atal toriadau o 25 y cant yn nhaliadau ffermwyr mynydd ac am gadw gwasanaeth cynghori a fyddai'n helpu amaethyddiaeth i ailstrwythuro. Gallwn roi sawl engraifft o'r fath o blaid yr oedd ei harweinydd ar y pryd yn gwadu fod y fath beth â chymdeithas yn bod. Yn awr mae'n ymddangos bod y blaid ar y ffordd i Ddamascus. Llawenhaf eich bod o'r diwedd wedi gweld y golau, a'ch bod bellach yn credu mewn adfywio cymunedau gwledig.

**Peter Rogers:** Yr ydych yn camliwio'r hyn a ddywedais. Dechreuais drwy siarad am ysgolion a'r perygl o gau ysgolion gwledig a'r colledion swyddi a ddeilliai o hynny. Soniais am gartrefi gofal. Soniais am swyddfeydd post, sy'n bwysig, a chyhoeddiad Scottish Power heddiw. Soniais hefyd am siopau pentref ac ysgolion pentref. Nid am amaethyddiaeth yn unig y siaradais. Beth bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni atal all-lifiad pobl ifanc, Mick.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch am yr eglurhad hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob un o'r 60 Aelod Cynulliad yn cytuno â'ch sylw diwethaf.

Byddwn i wrth fy modd yn gweld targedau cliriach ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig. Nid oes gennyl unrhyw amheuaeth ein bod eisoes wedi methu ar rai materion yn ein tair blynedd o fodolaeth. Yr wyf yn byw mewn gobaith o glywed Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n dweud y methodd eu plaid ar BSE ac mai camgymeriad oedd dileu llaeth ysgol. Syrthio ar glustiau byddar a wnaeth ein galwadau ar y materion hynny. Mae arnaf eisiau ymddiheuriad gennych am wendidau polisiau eich plaid ar BSE pan oedd mewn Llywodraeth. Gwelais y gwendidau hynny pan gymerais dystiolaeth dros y Llywodraeth ar gael gwell rheoliadau i sicrhau na all unrhyw brionau fynd i mewn i'r gadwyn fwyd. Yr ydych chi'n siarad am lai o

Peter.

reoleiddio. Rhaid inni roi iechyd y cyhoedd yn gyntaf. Os yw cael gwared ar reoliadau yn golygu peryglu iechyd y cyhoedd, yr ydych ar fai yn awgrymu hynny, Peter.

**Alun Cairns:** You mention BSE, which would have been a difficult issue for any Government to face. However, do you acknowledge that a full public inquiry was held and that lessons were learnt from that? Will you underline again that you support a full public inquiry on foot and mouth disease and that you call on the Westminster Government to hold one?

**Mick Bates:** I have already done that, as you know. To broaden the issues of clear, rural targets, we need to agree about some matters. Action must be taken to ensure that young people have an opportunity to stay in rural communities.

Prosperity is key to this debate. How do we achieve that? First, we need clear targets. I welcome the cross-cutting, rural regeneration group in the Cabinet, which will consider clear targets for our rural areas. Let us hope that part of that is securing sufficient funding for a biomass strategy, and considering how we can get local products—food and all other products—procured by the public sector. There are still challenges for us to meet. I want to ensure that this Government moves forward in the right way to achieve that greater prosperity. After all, the partnership Government has already put an extra £46 million into agri-environment schemes. We have increased Tir Gofal by £40 million a year. We have also ensured that there is a small and rural schools policy, and we have made £10 million available to help local education authorities readjust and restructure in order to see what they can do to retain schools.

During this relatively short time as a partnership Government we have made a positive contribution to rural development, but there are further challenges that we must meet. Together, if we could throw away all this hot air and rhetoric, and finally agree that out there—[Laughter.] Of all the people here I am entitled to say that, because I have listened to so much of it from my colleagues

**Alun Cairns:** Soniwch am BSE, a fuasai'n anodd i unrhyw Lywodraeth ei wynebu. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cydnabod y cynhaliwyd ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn ac y dysgwyd gwersi ganddo? A wnewch chi danlinellu eto eich bod o blaid ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn i glwy'r traed a'r genau ac y galwch ar Lywodraeth San Steffan i gynnal un?

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi gwneud hynny, fel y gwyddoch. I ehangu ar faterion targedau gwledig clir, mae angen inni gytuno ar rai materion. Rhaid gweithredu i sicrhau y caiff pobl ifanc gyfle i aros mewn cymunedau gwledig.

Mae ffyniant yn allweddol i'r ddadl hon. Sut mae sicrhau hynny? Yn gyntaf, mae angen targedau clir. Croesawaf y grŵp adfywio gwledig trawsbynciol yn y Cabinet, a fydd yn ystyried targedau clir i'n hardaloedd gwledig. Gadewch inni obeithio mai rhan o hynny yw sicrhau cyllid digonol ar gyfer strategaeth bio-mäs, ac ystyried sut y gallwn gael y sector cyhoeddus i brynu cynhyrchiion lleol—bwyd a phob cynyrrch arall. Mae sawl her i ni o hyd. Mae arnaf eisiau sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth hon yn symud ymlaen yn y ffordd iawn i gyflawni'r ffyniant mwy hwnnw. Wedi'r cyfan, mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth eisoes wedi rhoi £46 miliwn ychwanegol i mewn i gynlluniau amath-amgylcheddol. Yr ydym wedi ychwanegu £40 miliwn y flwyddyn i Tir Gofal. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau hefyd fod gennym bolisi ysgolion bach a gwledig, ac wedi darparu £10 miliwn i helpu awdurdodau addysg lleol i ailymaddasu ac ailstrwythuro er mwyn gweld beth y gallant ei wneud i gadw ysgolion.

Yn ystod y cyfnod cymharol fyr hwn fel Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yr ydym wedi gwneud cyfraniad cadarnhaol i ddatblygu gwledig, ond mae sawl her bellach yn ein hwynebu. Gyda'n gilydd, pe gallem daflu i ffwrdd yr holl falu awyr a rhethreg yma, a chytuno o'r diwedd fod—[Chwerthin.] O'r holl bobl sydd yma fi sydd â'r hawl i ddweud hynny, oherwydd imi wrando ar gymaint

to my right. Together we can meet the vision of the people of rural Wales. If we produce policies that they respect and that bring prosperity, we can regenerate our rural communities. I reject this motion, which suggests that nothing has been done and that Government policies are a failure.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We must stick to one hour for minority party debates, so I appeal for short speeches where possible, because I fear that not everybody who wants to speak will be able to do so.

**William Graham:** I will comment on two specific issues and ask the Minister to reply on them. The first is on nitrate-vulnerable zones. These are relatively minor areas in Wales, but for those people who are affected by them, they are particularly serious. This affects several farms, particularly those in the former Gwent area. Unfortunately, a serious Government mistake has resulted in it signing the EU nitrates directive, which applies to all watercourses, and not only to those watercourses supplying drinking water. These proposals will hit poultry, pig—although finding pig farms in Wales is difficult—and dairy farms the hardest. In areas where watercourses have a nitrate level of 50 mg per litre, grants of 40 per cent are available to improve facilities. Sadly this is said to be scientifically flawed. You will appreciate that this means that each individual farmer must find a balance. In difficult economic times in rural areas this is not the way forward.

I will also focus on bovine tuberculosis. It is imperative that action is taken immediately to defeat the advancing incidents of this disease. In Wales there are currently 214 cattle herds under TB restrictions—47 of these are in the former Gwent area. A series of scientific studies over the last 20 years has linked outbreaks of TB in cattle with the presence of infected badgers. This requires the disease to be tackled on two fronts—in cattle and in badgers—with the aim of gaining a healthy livestock and a healthy wildlife population. During our visit to Bangor for the Queen's Golden Jubilee thanksgiving service, we took the opportunity to meet Bob Parry of the

ohono gan fy nghyd-Aelodau ar y dde imi. Gyda'n gilydd gallwn gyflawni gweledigaeth pobl cefn gwlad Cymru. Os lluniwn bolisiâu y gallant eu parchu ac a ddaw â ffyniant, gallwn adfywio'n cymunedau gwledig. Gwrthodaf y cynnig hwn, sy'n awgrymu nad oes dim wedi'i wneud a bod polisiâu'r Llywodraeth yn fethiant.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Rhaid inni gadw at un awr ar gyfer dadleuon plaid leiafrifol, felly apelias am areithiau byr lle bo modd, oherwydd, mae gennyl ofn, na fydd pawb sy'n dymuno siarad yn cael gwneud hynny.

**William Graham:** Rhoddaf sylw ar ddau fater penodol a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ateb iddynt. Y cyntaf yw parthau sy'n agored i nitradau. Ardaloedd cymharol fach yng Nghymru yw'r rhain, ond i'r bobl y maent yn effeithio arnynt, maent yn arbennig o ddifrifol. Mae hyn yn effeithio ar nifer o ffermydd, yn enwedig yn ardal yr hen Went. Yn anffodus, mewn camgymeriad difrifol gan y Llywodraeth, llofnodwyd cyfarwyddeb nitradau'r UE, sy'n berthnasol i bob cwrs dŵr, ac nid dim ond y cyrsiau dŵr hynny sy'n cyflenwi dŵr yfed. Bydd y cynigion hyn yn taro ffermydd ieir, moch—er ei bod yn anodd dod o hyd i ffermydd moch yng Nghymru—a llaeth galetaf. Mewn ardaloedd lle mae gan gyrsiau dŵr lefel nitradau o 50 mg y litr, mae grantiau 40 y cant ar gael i wella cyfleusterau. Yn anffodus dywedir bod hyn yn wyddonol wallus. Sylweddolwch fod hyn yn golygu bod yn rhaid i bob ffermwyr unigol ganfod y gweddill. Ar adeg economaidd anodd mewn ardaloedd gwledig nid dyma'r ffodd ymlaen.

Canolbwytiaf hefyd ar y diciâu ymhliith gwartheg. Rhaid gweithredu ar fyrdar i drechu lledaeniad yr afiechyd hwn. Yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd mae 214 gyrr o wartheg dan gyfyngiadau'r diciâu—47 ohonynt yn ardal yr hen Went. Mae cyfres o astudiaethau gwyddonol dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf wedi cysylltu'r diciâu mewn gwartheg â phresenoldeb moch daear heintiedig. Golyga hyn fod angen taclo'r clefyd ar ddua dalcen—mewn gwartheg ac mewn moch daear—gyda'r nod o sicrhau iechyd da byw a bywyd gwylt. Yn ystod ein hymweliad â Bangor ar gyfer gwasanaeth diolchgarwch Jiwbilâ Aur y Frenhines,

Farmers' Union of Wales, who impressed on us this particular problem. He said that the TB virus survives in the soil for four months in sufficient numbers to provide an effective dose and that farmers can change their husbandry methods to keep cattle off this land for four months but if there are TB infected badgers on the farm it nullifies all that husbandry work. He also said that there is no point in culling infected cattle and ignoring infected badgers and that the FUW wants a healthy livestock and badger population.

Will the Minister respond specifically to those points?

4:40 p.m.

**Cynog Dafis:** Yr ydym wedi clywed am broblemau ein cymunedau gwledig bron hyd at syrffed. Yr wyf yn gresynu, yn wyneb hynny, at welliant hunanfodlon Carwyn Jones; mae'n awgrymu i mi fod y Llywodraeth yn gwrthod wynebu'r realiti. Yr wyf hefyd yn gresynu at wacter cyfraniad dau siaradwr cyntaf y Toraid; nid ydynt wedi cynnig dim ond rhethreg negyddol. Os bu rhai o drigolion ardaloedd gwledig Cymru yn gwrando ar y ddadl hon gan ddisgwyl rhywfaint o oleuni, rhaid eu bod yn ddifrifol siomedig.

Dau sector sydd dan bwysau yw'r diwydiant llaeth a'r diwydiant dillad. Mae ffermwyr llaeth yn cynhyrchu ar golled ar hyn o bryd. Mae nifer o fusnesau, hufenfeydd yn enwedig, yn dibynnu ar y diwydiant hwnnw.

**Nick Bourne:** I have just worked out that I was the Welsh Conservatives' second speaker. What did you regard to be negative in the call for more money to be spent on the reintroduction of small abattoirs? What is wrong with calling for proper controls to stop infected meat being brought into the country or with saying that we need a consistent small schools policy across Wales to protect small schools? I do not see anything negative in that. I said that, in relation to small abattoirs, part of the blame lies with the previous Conservative Government.

cymerasom y cyfle i gyfarfod â Bob Parry o Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru, a bwysleisiodd y broblem arbennig hon inni. Dywedodd fod firws y diciâu yn aros yn y pridd am bedwar mis mewn niferoedd digonol i ddarparu dos effeithiol ac y gall ffermwyr newid eu dulliau hwsmonaeth i gadw gwartheg oddi ar y tir hwn am bedwar mis ond os oes moch daear wedi'u heintio â'r diciâu ar y fferm mae'r holl hwsmonaeth honno'n ddiwerth. Dywedodd hefyd nad oes pwyt lladd gwartheg heintiedig ac anwybyddu moch daear heintiedig a bod Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru eisiau sicrhau da byw iach a moch daear iach.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymateb yn benodol i'r pwyntiau hynny?

**Cynog Dafis:** We have heard about the problems facing rural communities almost ad nauseam. I deplore, therefore, Carwyn Jones's self-satisfied amendment; it suggests to me that the Government is refusing to face reality. I also deplore the vacuous contributions of the Tories' first two speakers; they offered nothing but negative rhetoric. If members of the rural population have been listening to this debate expecting to be enlightened, they must be sorely disappointed.

The dairy and clothing industries are two sectors that are under pressure. Dairy farmers are producing at a loss at present. Several businesses, creameries in particular, are dependant upon this industry.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf newydd sylweddoli mai fi oedd ail siaradwr Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Beth oedd mor negyddol yn eich golwg chi yn yr alwad am wario rhagor o arian i ailgyflwyno lladd-dai bach? Beth sydd o'i le mewn gofyn am fesurau rheoli priodol i atal cig heintiedig rhag dod i mewn i'r wlad neu mewn dweud bod arnom angen polisi cyson ar ysgolion bach ledled Cymru i warchod yr ysgolion hynny? Ni welaf ddim byd negyddol yn hynny. Dywedais, yng nghyswllt y lladd-dai bach, fod rhan o'r bai ar y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol.

**Cynog Dafis:** Ni chlywais unrhyw beth gwreiddiol na newydd. Ni fu Nick ond yn ailadrodd yr hen ystrydebau, a chlywais lai fyth gan Peter Rogers.

Mae dwy ffatri ddillad yn Aberteifi ac Abergwaun yn cyflogi rhwng 500 a 600 o bobl. Nid wyf am godi dychryn na chreu diflastod, ond nid wyf yn optimistaidd am ddyfodol y gweithfeydd hynny. Byddai eu colli yn ergyd ofnadwy i'r ardaloedd y gwasanaethant. Serch hynny, yr wyf am fod yn gadarnhaol. Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, cefais fy nhywys o gylch nifer o fusnesau blaengar a llwyddiannus iawn yn ardal y Trallwng yn Sir Drefaldwyn. Mae rhai ohonynt wedi trefnu arddangosfa ar gyfer 4 Gorffennaf o'r enw 'Pigs Fly', a gefnogir gan y cyngor tref. Pwrpas yr arddangosfa fydd dangos sut i lwyddo yng Nghymru wledig, gyda'r bwriad o greu hinsawdd o hyder. Mae cysylltiadau electronig yn allweddol yn hyn o beth.

Un o'r busnesau yr ymwelais â hwy oedd Mid Wales Machinery Ring Cyf, sy'n dangos sut y mae cynyddu gweithgarwch economaidd drwy gydweithredu a chyfnewis gwasanaethau ac adnoddau. Ymwelais hefyd â Welshpool Printing Group Cyf, sef cwmni argraffu llwyddiannus sy'n cyflogi tua 80 o bobl yn y Trallwng. Yna, ymwelais â thri o gwmniau bach y mae eu gwaith yn seiliedig ar y we fyd-eang ac e-bost, sef Invest E Cyf, Insight Research a Rural Resources; gallwn enwi mwy. Mae'r cwmniau hyn, sydd yn cyflogi degau o bobl, yn dadansoddi ac yn gwerthu gwybodaeth a chyngor ar y we. Pam y mae'r tri chwmni bach hyn wedi'u lleoli yng nghefn gwlad? Bu iddynt ddweud wrthyf mai'r rhesymau dros hynny yw'r amgylchedd, ansawdd bywyd a'r chwyldro electronig yn arbennig. Yr oeddent hefyd yn pwysleisio'r angen am gysylltiadau band llydan, gan ddweud nad yw'r ddarpariaeth yn ddigonol ar hyn o bryd.

Mae'r cwmniau hyn am weld Cymru wledig yn cael ei datblygu a'i marchnata fel lleoliad perffaith i'r math hwn o weithgarwch. Credant fod gennym lawer i'w gynnig, ac mae swyddi trefol fel hyn ar gynnydd. Mae gwers inni yma: er bod amaethyddiaeth yn parhau'n allweddol, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn, y realiti ar y gorau yw na fydd sectorau

**Cynog Dafis:** I did not hear anything new or original. Nick Bourne repeated the same old clichés, and I heard even less from Peter Rogers.

Two clothing factories in Cardigan and Fishguard employ between 500 and 600 people. I do not want to heighten fears or cause distress, but I am not optimistic about the future of these factories. Their loss would be a huge blow to the areas they serve. However, I want to be more positive. Last Friday, I toured several innovative and successful businesses in the Welshpool area of Montgomeryshire. Some of these businesses have arranged an exhibition called 'Pigs Fly', which is sponsored by the town council and will be held on 4 July. The exhibition intends to show people how to succeed in rural Wales, therefore creating a confident climate. Electronic links are vital in this regard.

One of the businesses I visited was Mid Wales Machinery Ring Ltd, which provides information on how to increase economic activity through co-operation and by sharing services and resources. I also visited Welshpool Printing Group Ltd., a successful printing company employing some 80 people. I then visited three smaller companies whose work is based on the worldwide web and e-mail, namely Invest E Ltd, Insight Research and Rural Resources; I could name others. These companies, which employ tens of people, analyse and sell information and advice on the web. Why are these three small companies located in rural areas? They told me that the reason for their location is a combination of the environment, quality of life and, in particular, the electronic revolution. They also stressed the need for broadband connections, as the current provision is inadequate.

These companies want to see rural Wales developed and marketed as the perfect location for their kind of activity. They believe that we have much to offer, and this type of urban employment is on the increase. There is a lesson to be learnt here: even though agriculture continues to be a vital industry, as Rhodri Glyn said, the reality at

y mae eu gwaith yn seiliedig ar y tir, megis coedwigaeth ac ati, hyd yn oed o ychwanegu twristiaeth, yn ddigon i gynnal cymdeithas economaidd hyfyw yn ein hardaloedd gwledig. Rhaid denu a chreu swyddi trefol yn yr ardaloedd hyn, neu o fewn cyrraedd iddynt. Golyga hynny greu a sefydlu rhanbarthau sy'n cynnwys cyfuniad o wlad a thref fel fframwaith i ddatblygiad, gyda phobl yn symud o un lle i'r llall er mwyn dod o hyd i'r swyddi a'r ffordd o fyw y dymunant. Mae targedu rhanbarthol yn allweddol i hynny.

Rhaid inni gynnig ansawdd bywyd i bobl ifanc sy'n cyfuno'r gorau o wlad a thref. Mae'r amgylchiadau delfrydol i wneud hynny yng Nghymru, ac mae'r potensial yn fawr. Ond mae hyn yn golygu buddsoddi mewn cysylltiadau band llydan, ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd, amgylchedd adeiledig sy'n gyfleus a deniadol, ac addysg a hyfforddiant.

Dyna lle y mae'r marc cwestiwn mawr, gan fod yn rhaid i Gymru a'r Cynulliad geisio llwyddo gydag adnoddau ariannol annigonol. Dylem fod yn derbyn, drwy fformiwla Barnett, £800 miliwn ychwanegol y flwyddyn o gyllid craidd. O ran cronfeydd Ewropeaidd, nid ydym yn derbyn ychwanegedd o hyd; nid yw'r Trysorlys yn darparu cyllid cyfatebol. Mae'r cyllid Ewropeaidd ar gyfer Tir Gofal a chynlluniau tebyg yn dibennu yn y Trysorlys, nid gyda ffermwyr, sy'n golygu bod y cynlluniau yn gyfyngedig. Mae angen newid sylfaenol yn agwedd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag argyfwng ardaloedd gwledig a rhyddhau eu potensial.

Byddech yn disgwyl i bob Cymro a Chymraes gwerth eu halen gytuno â hynny ac i bwys o'n barhaus am newid. Yn anffodus, nid felly y mae. Hyd nes bod Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn cefnogi galwadau o'r fath, ni allwn ddweud ei bod yn cynrychioli lles Cymru; nid yw'n ffit i lywodraethu Cymru.

**Alun Cairns:** I do not claim to know a vast amount about agriculture. In an effort to improve my knowledge base, I spent one day on a farm. It was an invaluable day in terms of appreciating the commitment—

best is that land-based sectors, such as forestry and so on, even with the inclusion of tourism, will not be sufficient to maintain an economically viable society in rural areas. We must attract and create urban jobs in these areas, or within reach of them. This means creating and establishing regions that combine urban and rural elements as a framework for development, which will allow people to move from one place to another to find the jobs and lifestyle to which they aspire. Regional targeting is vital in that regard.

We must offer young people a lifestyle that combines the best of urban and rural life. Wales offers an ideal environment for this, and there is great potential. However, it means investing in broadband connections, in roads and railways, in a convenient and attractive built environment, and in education and training.

This is where there is a big question mark, because Wales and the Assembly must try to succeed with inadequate financial resources. We should receive, through the Barnett formula, an additional £800 million a year in core funding. In terms of European funds, we still do not receive additionality; the Treasury does not provide match funding. European funding for Tir Gofal and similar schemes ends up in the Treasury, not with farmers, which means that these schemes are limited. A fundamental change in the attitude of the United Kingdom Government is needed if we are to get to grips with the crisis in rural areas and release their potential.

You would expect every Welshman and Welshwoman worth their salt to agree with these sentiments and to lobby continually for change. Unfortunately, that is not the case. Until the Assembly's Labour Government supports calls of this kind, we cannot say that it represents the welfare of Wales; it is not fit to govern Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** Nid wyf yn honni gwybod llawer iawn am amaethyddiaeth. Mewn ymdrech i wella fy ngwybodaeth sylfaenol, treuliais un diwrnod ar fferm. Yr oedd yn ddiwrnod hynod o werthfawr o safbwyt gwerthfawrogi ymrwymiad—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you take an intervention?

**Alun Cairns:** No, absolutely not.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I just wanted clarification of the type of farm that you visited. Was it a sheep farm?

**Alun Cairns:** It was a sheep farm in Brian Gibbons's and my constituency. I visited the farm during the lambing season, and I learned an awful lot about that. I had—quite obviously from the evidence presented since then—no previous experience of handling sheep, and I learned much about the best ways of dealing with them.

The purpose of highlighting this is to reflect on farmers' commitment to their stock. Without doubt, their commitment and selflessness in caring for their stock is remarkable. I used the word 'selflessness', as there is no doubt about the personal sacrifices that they make to look after their stock. People comment on the quality of animal rearing in this country, but all that farmers want is the right to produce meat and food under the same terms and regulations as the rest of Europe. Better still would be if Europe produced under the same terms and regulations as the UK.

No mention has yet been made of France's ban on British beef. British farmers do not have the right to export beef to France, yet food imported to the UK does not conform to our stringent safety regulations, and the 20-day standstill period harnesses farmers' ability to trade freely. As Peter Rogers said, that is all that farmers are asking for, rather than for financial assistance through grants. France still has the beef ban and imported food does not conform to our quality standards. Is this what the Prime Minister meant when he said that he wanted to play a leading role in Europe?

**John Griffiths:** Today, the usual pattern of a minority party debate has emerged. The Labour-led Assembly Government takes forward policies to promote the Welsh economy, and to ensure constructive and

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnewch chi gymryd ymyriad?

**Alun Cairns:** Na wnaf, yn bendant.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dim ond eisiau eglurhad yr oeddwn o ba fath o fferm a welsoch. Ai fferm ddefaid ydoedd?

**Alun Cairns:** Fferm ddefaid ydoedd yn etholaeth Brian Gibbons a mi. Ymwelais â'r fferm yn ystod y tymor wyna, a dysgais beth wmbredd am hynny. Nid oedd gennyf—yn gwbl amlwg o'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd ers hynny—ddim profiad blaenorol o drin defaid, a dysgais lawer am y ffyrdd gorau o ddelio â hwy.

Pwrpas amlygu hyn yw meddwl am ymrwymiad ffermwyr i'w stoc. Heb os, mae eu hymroddiad a'u hanhunoldeb wrth ofalu am eu stoc yn hynod. Defnyddiaf y gair 'anhunanol', gan nad oes amheuaeth am yr aberth personol a wnânt i edrych ar ôl eu stoc. Bydd pobl yn sôn am safon magu anifeiliaid yn y wlad hon, ond y cwbl sydd ar ffermwyr ei eisiau yw'r hawl i gynhyrchu cig a bwyd dan yr un telerau a rheoliadau â gweddill Ewrop. Gwell fyth fyddai pe bai Ewrop yn cynhyrchu dan yr un telerau a rheoliadau â'r DU.

Ni fu sôn eto am waharddiad Ffrainc ar gig eidion o Brydain. Nid oes gan ffermwyr Prydain yr hawl i allforio cig eidion i Ffrainc, eto nid yw bwyd a fewnforir i'r DU yn cydymffurfio â'n rheoliadau diogelwch llym ni, ac mae'r cyfnod sefyll 20 diwrnod yn ffrwyno gallu ffermwyr i fasnachu'n rhydd. Fel y dywedodd Peter Rogers, dyna'r cyfan y mae ffermwyr yn gofyn amdano, yn hytrach na chymorth ariannol drwy grantiau. Mae Ffrainc yn dal i wahardd ein cig eidion ac nid yw bwyd a fewnforir yn cydymffurfio â'n safonau ansawdd. Ai dyma a olygodd Prif Weinidog y DU pan ddywedodd fod arno eisiau chwarae rhan arweiniol yn Ewrop?

**John Griffiths:** Heddiw, mae patrwm arferol dadl plaid leiafrifol wedi dod i'r wyneb. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dan arweiniad Llafur yn dwyn ymlaen bolisiâu i hybu economi Cymru, ac i sicrhau arallgyfeirio a

progressive diversification and development. However, the opposition parties constantly have the sterile view of condemning and criticising without offering an alternative, positive way forward. That is the constant background to this sort of debate.

**Brian Gibbons:** A classic example was Nick Bourne's accusation that nothing has been done for the ambulance service in rural Wales. In fact, five rapid response vehicles and many ambulances have been supplied in the last three years. One million pounds of development funding has been given and a considerable amount of activity is taking place to improve the ambulance service in rural Wales. Nick Bourne obviously does not know anything about it.

4:50 p.m.

**John Griffiths:** Yes, Brian—

**Nick Bourne:** I did not say that nothing had been done; I said that more should be done. If he wants an example of the need for more action, only three ambulances in Ceredigion, from Aberystwyth, Lampeter and Cardigan, operate on a 24-basis. That is insufficient to serve the needs of rural Wales. That is clear when a patient recently had to be taken in the back of a patrol car to the hospital because no ambulances were available. That situation is undesirable. What should the police do in such circumstances? Something is being done, but it is not enough. You should listen more carefully.

**John Griffiths:** Nick's comments are misconceived. Brian has adequately described the situation.

We should capitalise and build on Wales's image as being a green and pleasant land. Much of what the Government is doing is achieving that. When a topical, controversial issue comes to light that either detracts from or supports the image that we want to achieve, we can then identify those who are assisting the standards that we want in Wales and those who are not. The current debate on hunting with hounds is an example. When an issue such as that is discussed, we can see the dividing line. If we want to promote Wales as

datblygu adeiladol a blaengar. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gwrrbleidiau o hyd yn collfarnu a beirniadu'n ddiffrwyth heb gynnig ffordd arall, gadarnhaol, ymlaen. Dyna'r cefndir cyson i'r math hwn o ddadl.

**Brian Gibbons:** Enghraift glasurol oedd cyhuddiad Nick Bourne nad oes dim wedi'i wneud dros y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y Gymru wledig. Mewn gwirionedd, cyflenwyd pum cerbyd ymateb cyflym a sawl ambiwlans yn y tair blynedd diwethaf. Rhoddyd miliwn o bunnoedd o arian datblygu ac mae cryn dipyn o weithgaredd yn digwydd i wella'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng nghefn gwlad Cymru. Yn amlwg nid yw Nick Bourne yn gwybod dim amdano.

**John Griffiths:** Ie, Brian—

**Nick Bourne:** Ni ddywedais nad oedd dim wedi'i wneud; dywedais y dylid gwneud mwy. Os oes arno eisiau enghraift o'r angen am fwy o weithredu, dim ond tri ambiwlans yng Ngheredigion, o Aberystwyth, Llanbedr Pont Steffan ac Aberteifi, sy'n rhedeg 24 awr y dydd. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon i wasanaethu anghenion y Gymru wledig. Mae hynny'n amlwg pan fu raid cludo claf yn ddiweddar yng nghefn car heddlu i'r ysbyty am nad oedd ambiwlans ar gael. Mae'r sefyllfa honno'n anfoddaol. Beth ddylai'r heddlu ei wneud mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath? Mae rhywbeth yn cael ei wneud, ond nid yw'n ddigon. Dylech wrando'n fwy astud.

**John Griffiths:** Mae sylwadau Nick yn gyfeiliornus. Mae Brian wedi disgrifio'r sefyllfa'n ddigonol.

Dylem fanteisio a datblygu delwedd Cymru fel gwlad werdd a hyfryd. Mae llawer o'r hyn a wna'r Llywodraeth yn cyflawni hynny. Pan ddaw pwnc llosg, amserol i'r amlwg sydd un ai'n tynnu oddi wrth neu'n ategu'r ddelwedd yr ydym eisiau ei sicrhau, yna gallwn weld pwy sy'n cynorthwyo'r safonau y mae arnom eu heisiau yng Nghymru a phwy sydd ddim. Mae'r ddadl gyfredol ar hela â chŵn yn enghraift. Pan drafodir mater fel hwnnw, gallwn weld y llinell rannu. Os ydym am hyrwyddo Cymru fel gwlad flaengar, caredig

a progressive, animal-friendly, environmentally-friendly land, we must get rid of the barbarism and immorality involved in recreational hunting. That is important for those who want to promote Wales as having a diversified economy and an environmentally friendly tourism industry; we want Wales to be the sort of country that people want to visit and view as progressive. However, when we discuss issues that count on the ground, we see who is in favour of a progressive, environmentally-friendly Wales with good animal welfare standards, and those who are not.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** Today's debate has probably shed more heat than light on what needs to be done in rural Wales. A great deal of negativity has been expressed and I agree with Rhodri Glyn Thomas that that is not the way to regenerate rural Wales. I will address Peter Rogers's initial remarks. It is bizarre that he thinks that slackening regulations is the right way to proceed when that would only—

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Michael German:** I will give way towards the end of my contribution; I want to make progress. I have a great deal to say about the policies that this Government is putting in place.

Now is not the time to destabilise consumer confidence in our food. I wonder why Peter wants to remove these first vestiges of recovery in confidence. He should think more carefully about that.

I will address the issue of outward migration in a moment. On William Graham's two specific points, I will write to him about the nitrate vulnerable zones, but, as he knows, we have responsibility for the treatment of bovine TB but no resources. Some Members of the Conservative group favour more power for the National Assembly and I hope that they will therefore support the pressure that we are bringing to bear for resources, staff and capability to achieve more in this area.

i anifeiliaid, caredig i'r amgylchedd, rhaid inni gael gwared â'r barbariaeth a'r anfoesoldeb sydd ynghlwm wrth hela am hwyl. Mae hynny'n bwysig i'r rhai sydd eisiau hyrwyddo Cymru fel gwlad ag economi amrywiol a diwydiant twristiaeth sy'n helpu'r amgylchedd; mae arnom eisiau i Gymru fod y math o wlad y mae pobl eisiau ymweld â hi ac yn ei hystyried yn wlad flaengar. Fodd bynnag, pan drafodwn faterion sy'n bwysig ar lawr gwlad, gwelwn pwy sydd o blaid Cymru flaengar, amgylchedd-garedig gyda safonau da o ran lles anifeiliaid, a phwy sydd yn erbyn.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Mae'n debyg bod dadl heddiw wedi bwrw mwy o wres na goleuni ar yr hyn sydd angen ei wneud yn y Gymru wledig. Mynegwyd llawer iawn o negyddiaeth a chytunaf â Rhodri Glyn Thomas nad dyna'r ffordd i adfywio cefn gwlad Cymru. Cyfeiriaf at sylwadau agoriadol Peter Rogers. Mae'n rhyfedd iawn ei fod yn meddwl mai llacio rheoliadau yw'r ffordd gywir i symud ymlaen pan na fyddai hynny ond yn—

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Michael German:** Ildiaf tua diwedd fy nghyfraniad; mae arnof eisiau symud ymlaen. Mae gennyr lawer i'w ddweud am y polisiau y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn eu sefydlu.

Nid dyma'r amser i siglo hyder y cwsmer yn ein bwyd. Tybed pam y mae Peter eisiau dileu'r arwyddion cyntaf hyn o adfer hyder. Dylai feddwl yn fwya gofalus am hynny.

Cyfeiriaf at fater allfudo mewn munud. Ar ddau bwynt penodol William Graham, ysgrifennaf ato ar y parthau sy'n agored i nitradau, ond, fel y gwyr, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb am drin diciâu gwartheg ond dim adnoddau. Mae rhai Aelodau o'r grŵp Ceidwadol o blaid mwy o rym i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gobeithiaf felly y cefnogant y pwysau yr ydym yn eu rhoi am adnoddau, staff a gallu i gyflawni mwy yn y maes hwn.

I turn to some of the key issues relating to farming, agriculture and the rural economy. Progress is being made through 'Farming for the Future', the Assembly Government's distinct and coherent vision for the future direction of farming. I am also pleased that the Conservative group approved the progress being made on implementing the rural development plan. By voting for that, they are showing that they are not always negative. I think that they will also support the steps we are taking to move the industry in the direction set out in the plan. The more farming families can generate a better income, the more family farms in Wales can survive. Of the 50 actions in that Assembly programme, over 90 per cent have been completed or are progressing well.

The second way in which the Government has addressed this issue is through Farming Connect, which helps farming families rethink their approach to farming businesses. That has been well received, as Members know. Demand is high, and I am considering how to streamline the processes in future so that we can bring additional services on board, ensuring that future applications are dealt with swiftly and that more of the available grants are taken up.

The Wales agri-food strategy currently covers the dairy, lamb, beef and organic sectors. Action plans are being developed for other sectors, including horticulture and woodland development and biomass, and will be published in the near future. We have already heard of the processing and marketing grant scheme this afternoon, which has supported over 20 projects to date, with awards of about £6.9 million.

Tir Gofal, with its extended budget, has been praised across Europe. It plays a significant part in reaching our target of 25 per cent of Wales's agricultural land being under agri-environmental agreement by 2003. Demand is growing fast, and we have committed extra money towards that in the budget programmes for this year and 2003-04.

Trof at rai o'r materion allweddol yn ymwneud â ffermio, amaethyddiaeth a'r economi wledig. Mae pethau'n symud ymlaen drwy 'Ffermio ar gyfer y Dyfodol', gweledigaeth eglur a chydlynol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer cyfeiriad ffermio i'r dyfodol. Yr wyf yn falch hefyd fod y grŵp Ceidwadol wedi cymeradwyo'r hyn a gyflawnwyd i weithredu'r cynllun datblygu gwledig. Wrth bleidleisio dros hynny, maent yn dangos nad ydynt bob amser yn negyddol. Yr wyf yn meddwl y cefnogant hefyd y camau yr ydym yn eu cymryd i symud y diwydiant i'r cyfeiriad a ddisgrifir yn y cynllun. Po fwyaf o deuluoedd ffermio a all gynhyrchu gwell incwm, mwyaf o ffermydd teulu yng Nghymru a all fyw. O'r 50 cam gweithredu yn y rhaglen honno gan y Cynulliad, mae dros 90 y cant wedi'u cwblhau neu'n mynd rhagddynt yn dda.

Yr ail ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi delio â'r mater hwn yw drwy Cyswllt Ffermio, sy'n helpu teuluoedd ffermio i aifeddwel am eu hagwedd at fusnesau ffermio. Cafodd hwnnw dderbyniad da, fel y gŵyr Aelodau. Mae'r galw'n uchel, ac yr wyf yn ystyried sut i wneud y prosesau'n fwy effeithlon yn y dyfodol fel y gallwn gyflwyno gwasanaethau newydd, i sicrhau y rhoddir sylw cyflym i geisiadau yn y dyfodol a bod mwy o bobl yn cael y grantiau sydd ar gael.

Mae strategaeth bwyd-amaeth Cymru ar hyn o bryd yn cynnwys y sectorau llaeth, cig oen, eidion ac organig. Mae cynlluniau gweithredu ar y gweill ar gyfer sectorau eraill, yn cynnwys garddwriaeth a datblygu coetiroedd a bio-mâs, ac fe'u cyhoeddir yn y dyfodol agos. Clywsom eisoes am y cynllun grantiau prosesu a marchnata y prynhawn yma, sydd wedi cefnogi dros 20 o brosiectau hyd yma, gan ddosbarthu oddeutu £6.9 miliwn.

Cafodd Tir Gofal, gyda'i gyllideb estynedig, ganmoliaeth ar draws Ewrop. Mae'n chwarae rhan arwyddocaol tuag at gyrraedd ein targed o sicrhau bod 25 y cant o dir amaethyddol Cymru dan gytundeb amgylcheddol erbyn 2003. Mae'r galw'n cynyddu'n gyflym, ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo arian ychwanegol tuag at hynny yn rhagleni'r gyllideb ar gyfer eleni a 2003-04.

The organic farming scheme, the rural recovery plan and so on show that the Assembly Government places the rural economy and agriculture at the heart of its thinking. Rural stress issues were a key element of the rural recovery plan. I pay tribute to those who have been working closely with rural communities over this difficult time, providing people with support and succour. That multi-agency partnership has brought together statutory, voluntary and community organisations and farming bodies in developing plans.

One positive key issue raised was assisting new entrants into farming. The best way to do that is by having a viable, innovative industry. We will report later this year to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee on the steps that we will take towards achieving that. Consultation is currently ongoing on quota liberalisation and there are extra resources for organic farming.

**Peter Rogers** *rose—*

**Michael German:** I will take interventions towards the end of my speech, and I will take them in the order in which I have seen Members rising. There is significant new work on the LEADER+ programme to help rural communities develop themselves. I saw the exciting initial work of the LEADER programme in Powys last week.

Many Members have mentioned access to rural services and rural businesses. That is crucial to the future of the rural economy. It is accepted that access to services improves the quality of rural life. The Government is committed to action to support sustainable rural retail services. As part of the partnership agreement, the Wales Co-operative Centre has recently completed its study for the Assembly Government on the needs of this sector. I will bring proposals to the Assembly shortly.

I also recognise that post offices play a vital role in Welsh community life. They often act as the focal point in communities. The post office network faces challenges, and we are

Mae'r cynllun ffermio organig, y cynllun adfer cefn gwlad ac ati'n dangos bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi'r economi wledig ac amaethyddiaeth wrth galon ei syniadaeth. Yr oedd straen yng nghefn gwlad yn elfen allweddol o'r cynllun adfer cefn gwlad. Talaf deyrnged i'r rhai a fu'n gweithio'n agos gyda chymunedau gwledig dros y cyfnod anodd hwn, gan roi cefnogaeth a chysur i bobl. Daeth y bartneriaeth aml-asiantaeth honno â chyrff statudol, gwirfoddol a chymunedol a chyrff ffermwyr ynghyd i ddatblygu cynlluniau.

Un mater allweddol cadarnhaol a godwyd oedd helpu ffermwyr newydd. Y ffordd orau o wneud hynny yw cael diwydiant hyfyw, arloesol. Cyflwynwn adroddiad yn ddiweddarach eleni i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ar y camau a gymerwn tuag at sicrhau hynny. Mae ymgynghori'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd ar ryddhau cwotâu ac mae adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer ffermio organig.

**Peter Rogers** *a gododd—*

**Mike German:** Cymeraf ymyriadau tua diwedd fy arraith, ac fe'u cymeraf yn y drefn y gwelais Aelodau'n codi. Mae gwaith newydd arwyddocaol yn digwydd ar raglen LEADER+ i helpu cymunedau gwledig i ddatblygu'u hunain. Gwelais waith cychwynnol cyffrous y rhaglen LEADER+ ym Mhowys yr wythnos diwethaf.

Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi crybwyllyniediad at wasanaethau gwledig a busnesau gwledig. Mae hynny'n allweddol i ddyfodol yr economi wledig. Derbynir bod mynediad at wasanaethau'n gwella ansawdd bywyd cefn gwlad. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i weithredu i gefnogi gwasanaethau manwerthu gwledig cynaliadwy. Fel rhan o'r cytundeb partneriaeth, mae Canolfan Gydweithredol Cymru wedi cwblhau ei hastudiaeth i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ddiweddar ar anghenion y sector hwn. Deuaf â chynigion i'r Cynulliad maes o law.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod hefyd fod swyddfeydd post yn chwarae rhan allweddol ym mywyd cymunedau Cymru. Dyma ganolbwyt y gymuned yn aml. Mae rhwydwaith swyddfa'r

keen to find ways of linking post offices with credit unions and community shops to serve disadvantaged communities.

We must manage the structural changes taking place in agriculture, Rhodri Glyn. The emphasis must be on diversifying the economic base by providing alternative quality job opportunities in a wide range of sectors. The WDA's activities in rural areas encompass all mainstream programmes, including property development, business support, inward investment and community regeneration. We will continue to work closely with the agency and with the Wales Tourist Board to ensure that businesses in rural areas receive the support that they need.

Peter mentioned the outward migration of young people. It is for that purpose that the contract for the age-balanced communities study was awarded to Newidiem, working in partnership with the University of Wales, Cardiff and Menter a Busnes. It will take a cross-cutting approach to identifying the issues that cause young people to leave rural communities and act as barriers to their returning.

5:00 p.m.

When that report is completed in the autumn, it will include an action plan detailing the measures needed to tackle the key issues that have been identified. That is why the new Cabinet sub-committee, whose membership the Cabinet confirmed yesterday, will take on board this necessary work of co-ordinating rural regeneration. It will undertake to deal with the issues that have been raised this afternoon in a positive manner.

**Peter Rogers:** On young entrants into agriculture, one of the problems that we have is that there is no quota available for them this year. There is a tremendous problem getting suckler cow quotas for these young people. Do you not agree that those quotas are essential for any young person to start a business?

post yn wynebu sawl her, ac yr ydym yn awyddus i ddod o hyd i ffyrdd o gysylltu swyddfeydd post ag undebau credyd a siopau cymunedol i wasanaethu cymunedau difreintiedig.

Rhaid inni reoli'r newidiadau strwythurol sy'n digwydd mewn amaethyddiaeth, Rhodri Glyn. Rhaid i'r pwyslais fod ar arallgyfeirio'r sylfaen economaidd drwy ddarparu cyfleoedd swyddi amgen safonol mewn amrediad eang o sectorau. Mae gweithgareddau Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn cwmpasu pob rhaglen yn y brif ffrwd, gan gynnwys datblygu eiddo, cefnogi busnes, mewnfuddsoddi ac adfywio cymunedau. Byddwn yn parhau i weithio'n agos gyda'r awdurdod datblygu a chyda'r bwrdd croeso i sicrhau bod busnesau mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn cael y gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt.

Soniodd Peter am allfudiad pobl ifanc. Dyna pam y rhoddwyd y contract ar gyfer yr astudiaeth ar gydbwysedd oedran cymunedau i Newidiem, yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â Phrifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd, a Menter a Busnes. Bydd yn arddel ymagwedd drawsbynciol er mwyn nodi'r materion sy'n achosi i bobl ifanc adael cymunedau gwledig ac yn eu rhwystro rhag dychwelyd.

Pan gwblheir yr adroddiad hwnnw yn yr hydref, bydd yn cynnwys cynllun gweithredu'n rhoi manylion y mesurau sydd eu hangen i ddelio â'r materion allweddol a nodwyd. Dyna pam y bydd is-bwylgor newydd y Cabinet, y cadarnhaodd y Cabinet ei aelodaeth ddoe, yn ymgymryd â'r gwaith angenrheidiol hwn o gydlynu adfywiad cefn gwlad. Bydd yn ymgymryd i ddelio â'r materion a godwyd y prynhawn yma mewn modd cadarnhaol.

**Peter Rogers:** Ynglŷn â phobl ifanc yn dod i mewn i amaethyddiaeth, un o'r problemau sydd gennym yw nad oes cwota ar gael iddynt eleni. Mae problem aruthrol cael cwotâu buchod magu i'r bobl ifanc hyn. Oni chytunwch fod y cwotâu hynny'n hanfodol i unrhyw berson ifanc gychwyn busnes?

**Michael German:** Consultation on that is currently underway. One of the issues in that consultation process is giving young entrants first priority to call on the quota released through the national reserve.

Finally, I will talk about rural partnership. The rural partnership for Wales has brought together a wide range of views and experience on rural issues. I will review how it works to ensure that it meets the needs of the new Cabinet sub-committee. I look forward to working closely with all our partners, taking this work forward and implementing a strategy for rural Wales as a whole, which will complement 'Farming for the Future' and provide a blueprint for an economically, socially and environmentally viable future for our rural communities. In supporting the Government's amendment and rejecting the motion and the other amendments, we must recognise how much good there is in rural Wales—the land, the sense of community, the enterprise and the spirit. We must play to these strengths and play up the successes of these strengths.

**Glyn Davies:** I declare an interest, as my wife and I are partners in a farming business. There has been much disagreement in the Chamber today, but there is no disagreement about the problems that face rural Wales and the degree of uncertainty that exists in much of rural Wales at present. We are all greatly concerned, which is why the Conservative group proposed this motion today. Peter Rogers outlined many of the problems facing agriculture in his speech. There are serious problems. Thousands of jobs are lost every year. I am sure that all of us, no matter what our backgrounds, will sympathise hugely with the uncertainty and worry caused by job losses on such a scale. Incomes are low and they are likely to be lower next year because we have all seen the collapse in the dairy price, which will mean a lower average income. That deprives local communities of the spending power that reasonable incomes

**Michael German:** Mae hynny'n destun ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd. Un o'r materion yn y broses ymgynghori honno yw rhoi'r flaenoriaeth gyntaf i ffermwyr newydd ifanc alw ar y cwota a ryddheir drwy'r gronfa genedlaethol.

Yn olaf, soniaf am bartneriaeth wledig. Mae partneriaeth wledig Cymru wedi dwyn ynghyd amrediad eang o farn a phrofiad ar faterion cefn gwlad. Byddaf yn adolygu'r ffordd y mae'n gweithio er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn ateb anghenion yr is-bwyllgor Cabinet newydd. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio'n agos gyda'n partneriaid i gyd, gan gario'r gwaith hwn ymlaen a gweithredu strategaeth i'r Gymru wledig yn ei chyfarwydd, a fydd yn gymar i 'Ffermio ar gyfer y Dyfodol' ac yn rhoi glasbrint ar gyfer dyfodol economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol hyfyw i'n cymunedau gwledig. Wrth gefnogi gwelliant y Llywodraeth a gwrthod y cynnig a'r gwellianau eraill, rhaid inni gydnabod gymaint o dda sydd yng nghefn gwlad Cymru—y tir, yr ymdeimlad o gymuned, y fenter a'r ysbryd. Rhaid inni chwarae i'r cryfderau hyn a chyhoeddi llwyddiannau'r cryfderau hyn.

**Glyn Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant, gan fod fy ngwraig a mi'n bartneriaid mewn busnes ffermio. Bu llawer o anghytuno yn y Siambra heddiw, ond nid oes dim anghytuno ynglŷn â'r problemau sy'n wynebu cefn gwlad Cymru a'r ansicrywydd sy'n bodoli mewn llawer o'r Gymru wledig ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym i gyd yn pryderu'n fawr a dyna pam y cyflwynodd y grŵp Ceidwadol y cynnig hwn heddiw. Amlinelloedd Peter Rogers lawer o'r problemau sy'n wynebu amaethyddiaeth yn ei arai. Mae problemau difrifol. Collir miloedd o swyddi bob blwyddyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pob un ohonom, ni waeth beth fo'n cefndir, yn cydymdeimlo'n aruthrol â'r ansicrywydd a'r boen a achosir gan golledion swyddi ar raddfa mor fawr. Mae incwm ffermydd yn isel ac yn debyg o fod yn is y flwyddyn nesaf oherwydd yr ydym i gyd wedi gweld y cwmp ym mhrisiau llaeth, a fydd yn golygu cyfartaledd incwm is. Mae

deliver. These are all huge problems.

Members have not touched on tourism today. However, it could have been mentioned because of the devastating effect of foot and mouth disease on tourism last year, and on rural Wales. It did not affect the coastal paths of Wales in the same way, so whenever one considers averages, the impact on rural Wales is understated. The same is true of manufacturing industry, which has suffered for a long time largely as a result of the weakness of the euro. Manufacturing—the third leg of the rural economy—has also been suffering. I do not suggest that all the ills of rural Wales are the responsibility of the Liberal Democrat/Labour Government—they are not. However, every government must accept democratic responsibility for things that go wrong and we must deal with how governments respond.

There were references earlier to the impact of BSE during the last Conservative Government. It was a massive problem and we still do not know how it began. There have been various suggestions, and people have pointed to changes in the regulations. That has not been proved. It is like saying that foot and mouth disease last year was a result of meat imports. People say that with great certainty, but we do not know. Nick Bourne made the point that there was no public inquiry. That was scandalous. The sum of £8 billion was spent and we still do not know where it came from. I have never seen a better case for a full public inquiry. Without that, it is difficult to move forward. The Prime Minister's fear of a public inquiry demonstrated unbelievable weakness. That was awful.

There are disagreements in the Committee—and most members of the Committee are present in the Chamber—but I, as Chair, have been surprised at the scale of agreement. We all agree, for example, that the future of agriculture depends on the success of Tir Gofal. We all recognise the inevitability of agri-environment schemes playing a part in the future, which is crucial to the

hynny'n amddifadu cymunedau lleol o'r grym gwario a geir gydag incwm rhesymol. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn broblemau aruthrol.

Ni chrybwyllywyd twristiaeth heddiw. Fodd bynnag, gallesid ei chrybwyl oherwydd effaith ddifaol clwy'r traed a'r genau ar dwristiaeth y llynedd, ac ar gefn gwlaid Cymru. Nid effeithiodd ar lwybrau arfordirol Cymru yr un fath, felly pryd bynnag yr ystyrir cyfartaleddau, ni phwysleisir ddigon yr effaith ar gefn gwlaid Cymru. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y diwydiant cynhyrchu, a ddioddefod dros gyfnod hir i raddau helaeth oherwydd gwendid yr ewro. Mae cynhyrchu—trydedd gainc yr economi wledig—wedi dioddef hefyd. Nid wyf yn awgrymu mai cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/Llafur yw holl helbulon cefn gwlaid Cymru—nid yw hynny'n wir. Serch hynny, rhaid i bob llywodraeth dderbyn cyfrifoldeb democraidd am bethau sy'n mynd o chwith a rhaid i ni ddelio â'r modd y mae llywodraethau'n ymateb.

Cyfeiriwyd yn gynharach at effaith BSE yn oes y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf. Yr oedd yn broblem aruthrol ac ni wyddom hyd heddiw sut y dechreuodd. Bu ambell awgrym, ac mae pobl wedi pwyntio at newidiadau yn y rheoliadau. Nid yw hynny wedi'i brofi. Mae fel dweud mai mewnforion cig oedd achos clwy'r traed a'r genau y llynedd. Dywed pobl hynny gyda sicrwydd mawr, ond ni wyddom. Gwnaeth Nick Bourne y pwynt na chynhaliwyd ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Yr oedd hynny'n warthus. Gwariwyd swm o £8 biliwn ac ni wyddom eto o ble y daeth. Ni welais erioed achos gwell dros ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn. Heb hynny, mae'n anodd symud ymlaen. Dangosodd ofn y Prif Weinidog o ymchwiliad cyhoeddus wendid anhygoel. Yr oedd hynny'n ofnadwy.

Ceir anghytuno yn y Pwyllgor—ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o aelodau'r Pwyllgor yma yn y Siambr—ond cefais i, fel Cadeirydd, fy synnu gan faint o cytuno, er enghraifft, fod dyfodol amaethyddiaeth yn dibynnu ar lwyddiant Tir Gofal. Yr ydym i gyd yn sylweddoli ei bod yn anochel y bydd cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol yn chwarae

Committee's work. Diversification is a key part of the Committee's recommendations and work. All my life I have been involved in trying to diversify the rural economy. I was hugely upset when the Development Board for Rural Wales, which was specifically aimed at diversification, was abolished. It seemed a dreadfully backward step and I still think that that was a mistake. That close-knit approach on a broad-brush scale across the rural economy is still needed.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. It is time to wind up.

**Glyn Davies:** I reiterate Cynog's point that a focus on rural development is important. I do not agree with regional targets, but we must have a focus on rural development.

We have a new Minister. We wish him well in his new post. We have a number of issues that we want addressed but, above all, we must have a vision for rural Wales. Perhaps key to that is to develop an understanding between rural Wales and the people who live in urban Wales. That gap has grown and, more than anything else, I hope that the centre of your vision, Minister, is that we narrow that gap.

**Kirsty Williams:** I declare an interest in the agriculture industry.

**Peter Rogers:** I also declare an interest.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 18.  
Amendment 1: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 18.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

- Barrett, Lorraine
- Bates, Mick
- Black, Peter
- Butler, Rosemary
- Burnham, Eleanor
- Chapman, Christine
- Davidson, Jane
- Davies, Andrew
- Davies, Ron
- Edwards, Richard
- Essex, Sue
- Evans, Delyth
- German, Michael

rhan yn y dyfodol, sy'n hollbwysig i waith y Pwyllgor. Mae arallgyfeirio'n rhan allweddol o argymhellion a gwaith y Pwyllgor. Trwy fy mywyd yr wyf wedi ymwneud â cheisio arallgyfeirio economi cefn gwlad. Cefais siom enfawr pan ddiddymwyd Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig, a anelai'n benodol at arallgyfeirio. Ymddangosai fel cam ofnadwy tuag yn ôl ac yr wyf yn dal i feddwl mai cam gwag ydoedd. Mae angen o hyd am yr agwedd agos-atoch-chi honno ar raddfa brwsh llydan ar draws yr economi wledig.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n amser dirwyn i ben.

**Glyn Davies:** Ategaf bwynt Cynog fod canolbwytio ar ddatblygu gwledig yn bwysig. Ni chytunaf â thargedau rhanbarthol, ond rhaid inni gael ffocws ar ddatblygu gwledig.

Mae gennym Weinidog newydd. Dymunwn yn dda iddo yn ei swydd newydd. Mae gennym nifer o faterion sydd angen sylw ond, yn bennaf oll, rhaid inni gael gweledigaeth ar gyfer cefn gwlad Cymru. Efallai mai'r allwedd i hynny yw datblygu dealtwriaeth rhwng y Gymru wledig a'r bobl sy'n byw yn y trefi. Mae'r bwlcw hwnnw wedi tyfu ac, yn fwy na dim byd arall, gobeithiaf mai canolbwyt eich gweledigaeth, Weinidog, yw ein bod yn culhau'r bwlcw hwnnw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Datganaf fuddiant yn y diwydiant amaethyddol.

**Peter Rogers:** Datganaf finnau fuddiant.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

- Bourne, Nick
- Cairns, Alun
- Dafis, Cynog
- Davies, Glyn
- Graham, William
- Hancock, Brian
- Jarman, Pauline
- Jones, Gareth
- Jones, Elin
- Jones, Ieuan Wyn
- Lloyd, David
- Melding, David
- Morgan, Jonathan

Gibbons, Brian	Rogers, Peter
Gregory, Janice	Ryder, Janet
Griffiths, John	Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Gwyther, Christine	Williams, Phil
Halford, Alison	Wigley, Dafydd
Hart, Edwina	
Jones, Ann	
Jones, Carwyn	
Law, Peter	
Lloyd, Val	
Middlehurst, Tom	
Morgan, Rhodri	
Pugh, Alun	
Thomas, Gwenda	
Williams, Kirsty	

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.*

*Amendment 2: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Geraint  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Dafis, Cynog  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 12, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 3: For 12, Abstain 7, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor

Jones, Elin	Butler, Rosemary
Jones, Gareth	Chapman, Christine
Jones, Ieuan Wyn	Davidson, Jane
Lloyd, David	Davies, Andrew
Ryder, Janet	Davies, Ron
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Edwards, Richard
Wigley, Dafydd	Essex, Sue
Williams, Phil	Evans, Delyth
	German, Michael
	Gibbons, Brian
	Gregory, Janice
	Griffiths, John
	Gwyther, Christine
	Halford, Alison
	Hart, Edwina
	Jones, Ann
	Jones, Carwyn
	Law, Peter
	Lloyd, Val
	Middlehurst, Tom
	Morgan, Rhodri
	Pugh, Alun
	Thomas, Gwenda
	Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Amended motion:

*The National Assembly for Wales commends the Welsh Assembly Government for its policies and actions which are helping farmers to adapt and rural businesses to develop and flourish, and which aim to regenerate rural communities well into the future.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ei pholisiâu a'r camau y mae'n eu cymryd i helpu ffermwyr i addasu ac i helpu busnesau gwledig i ddatblygu a ffynnu, ac sy'n anelu at adfywio cymunedau gwledig ymhell i'r dyfodol.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.  
Amended motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline

Davies, Ron	Jones, Gareth
Edwards, Richard	Jones, Elin
Essex, Sue	Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Evans, Delyth	Lloyd, David
German, Michael	Melding, David
Gibbons, Brian	Morgan, Jonathan
Gregory, Janice	Rogers, Peter
Griffiths, John	Ryder, Janet
Gwyther, Christine	Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Halford, Alison	Williams, Phil
Hart, Edwina	Wigley, Dafydd
Jones, Ann	
Jones, Carwyn	
Law, Peter	
Lloyd, Val	
Middlehurst, Tom	
Morgan, Rhodri	
Pugh, Alun	
Thomas, Gwenda	
Williams, Kirsty	

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.08 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.08 p.m.*