



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 26 Chwefror 2002**

**Tuesday 26 February 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |   |
|----|---|
| 3  | Datganiad gan y Llywydd<br><i>Statement by the Presiding Officer</i>  |
| 3  | Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru<br><i>Questions to the First Minister</i>  |
| 22 | Cwestiwn Brys: Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful<br><i>Urgent Question: Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council</i>   |
| 27 | Datganiad ar Newidiadau i'r Cabinet<br><i>Statement on Changes to the Cabinet</i>   |
| 34 | Datganiad ar Fentrau Iaith a'r Cynllun Teuluoedd<br><i>Statement on Mentrau Iaith and the Families Project</i>  |
| 45 | Datganiad Busnes<br><i>Business Statement</i>   |
| 46 | Pwyntiau o Drefn<br><i>Points of Order</i>  |
| 48 | Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion<br><i>Composite Motion: Approval of Orders</i>  |
| 50 | Cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 5)<br>(Cymru) 2002<br><i>Approval of the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No.5)<br/>(Wales) 2002</i>      |
| 53 | Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar Ymchwiliad<br>Nantygwyddon<br><i>The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's Report on the Investigation<br/>into Nantygwyddon</i> |
| 86 | Cynnig Trefniadol<br><i>Procedural Motion</i>   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Byddwch wedi sylwi bod gwe'r Siambr wedi'i huwchraddio, a'i bod yn awr yn ymateb yn gyflymach. Edrychaf ymlaen at allu eich e-bostio'n gyflymach. Diolchaf am y gwelliant hwn yn safon ein technoleg gwybodaeth. Mae'n golygu bod y Cynulliad yn dal i fod ymhlith y cyrff mwyaf blaengar yn y byd o ran technoleg gwybodaeth.

**The Presiding Officer:** You will have noticed that the Chamberweb has been upgraded, and that it now responds more quickly. I look forward to being able to e-mail you more quickly. I am grateful for this improvement in the standard of our information technology. It means that the Assembly is still among the most innovative bodies in the world in terms of information technology.

Estynnaf groeso ffurfiol a chynnes i'r ddirprwyaeth o Deyrnas Lesotho a'i senedd, ar ei hymweliad swyddogol â ni heddiw. [Cymeradwyaeth.]

I formally and warmly welcome the delegation from the Kingdom of Lesotho and its parliament, on its official visit today. [Applause.]

### **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister**

#### **Sicrhau Pwerau ar gyfer Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru Securing Powers for the National Assembly for Wales**

**C1 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch sicrhau mwy o bwerau i'r Cynulliad? (OAQ15830)

**Q1 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** What discussions has the First Minister recently had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding securing more powers for the Assembly? (OAQ15830)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Dyma'r math o bwnc sy'n codi'n gyson yn fy nghyfarfodydd rheolaidd â Paul Murphy, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru.

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** This kind of issue is discussed frequently in my regular meetings with Paul Murphy, the Secretary of State for Wales.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A gawsoch drafodaethau â Paul Murphy yn ddiweddar i sicrhau mwy o gyfrifoldeb i'r Cynulliad dros drafndiaeth? Mae gan Stephen Byers ormod ar ei blât i boeni am drafndiaeth a rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Gwyddom am rwystredigaeth Sue Essex wrth ateb cwestiynau drwy iddi orfod dweud mai mewn manau eraill y mae'r cyfrifoldeb. Onid yw'n amser yn awr, yng nghanol helbulon Stephen Byers, ichi ofyn am fwy o bwerau dros reilffyrdd yng Nghymru?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Have you had discussions with Paul Murphy recently with a view to ensuring that the Assembly has more responsibility over transport? Stephen Byers has too much on his plate to be concerned with transport and railways in Wales. We know of Sue Essex's frustration in answering questions by having to say that the responsibility lies in another place. Is now not the time, amid Stephen Byers's troubles, for you to ask for more powers over railways in Wales?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n rhaid inni

**The First Minister:** We must act on the

weithredu ar sail egwyddor yr hyn sy'n gwneud synnwyr, yn hytrach na cheisio manteisio mewn ffordd a fyddai'n cael ei disgrifio'n fanteisgar hyd yn oed gan eich grŵp chi eich hun. Yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn gyson ers 1964, dan y Torïaid a'r Blaid Lafur, yw bod pwerau eithaf sylweddol yn cael eu trosglwyddo bob pum mlynedd o Lundain i Gymru—i'r Swyddfa Gymreig dan yr hen system ac i'r Cynulliad yn sgîl datganoli. Ni ddaeth y broses i ben yn sgîl sefydlu'r Cynulliad.

**Peter Law:** Given the disappointment of our colleague Peter Black, the Liberal Democrat Deputy Minister, with today's reshuffle announcement, do you think that it is appropriate to consult the Secretary of State on appointing a poet laureate for Wales, bearing in mind the recent exposé in *The Western Mail*? Do you agree that the corridors of the Assembly will reverberate for years to come with the words of 'Where are you now Kate Adie' or 'To a young woman'—which I could not quote before the watershed?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That supplementary does not arise from the question.

**David Davies:** One in four people voted for the Assembly, and they did so on the basis that it would have no more powers than the previous Welsh Office. When anti-Assembly campaigners like myself warned that it might be used as a stepping stone to create a parliament in Wales, we were vilified. Do you agree with me that it would be morally reprehensible to ignore the wishes of the Welsh people by pushing for greater powers? The Conservatives did not want the Assembly, but we accepted it; is it not time for Plaid Cymru to do the same?

**The First Minister:** Do not overuse the statistic that one in four people voted for the Assembly, because slightly fewer people voted against it, which is why we are here today, including yourself. You should take notice of that.

The devolution process and the transfer of

principle of what makes sense, rather than trying to gain an advantage in a way that would be described as opportunistic even by your own group. What has happened consistently since 1964, under the Tories and Labour, is that relatively significant powers have been transferred every five years from London to Wales—to the Welsh Office under the old system and post-devolution to the Assembly. The process did not end with the establishment of the Assembly.

**Peter Law:** O ystyried siom ein cyd-Aelod Peter Black, Dirprwy Weinidog y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gyda chyhoeddiad heddiw ynghylch yr ad-drefnu, a gredwch ei bod yn briodol ymgynghori â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar benodi bardd llawryfog i Gymru, o ystyried y datgeliad diweddar yn *The Western Mail*? A gytunwch y bydd y geiriau 'Where are you now Kate Adie' neu 'To a young woman'—na allwn eu dyfynnu mor gynnar yn y dydd—yn atseinio o amgylch coridorau'r Cynulliad am flynyddoedd?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r cwestiwn atodol hwnnw'n codi o'r cwestiwn.

**David Davies:** Pleidleisiodd un person o bob pedwar o blaid y Cynulliad, a gwnaethant hynny ar y sail na fyddai ganddo fwy o bwerau na'r Swyddfa Gymreig flaenorol. Pan rybuddiodd pobl, fel minnau, a oedd yn ymgyrchu erbyn y Cynulliad, y gellid ei ddefnyddio fel cam i greu senedd yng Nghymru, fe'n difriwyd. A gytunwch â mi y byddai'n bechod moesol anwybyddu dymuniadau pobl Cymru drwy ymdrechu i gael mwy o bwerau? Nid oedd y Ceidwadwyr eisiau'r Cynulliad, ond fe'i derbyniwyd gennym; onid yw'n amser i Blaid Cymru wneud yr un peth?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Peidiwch â gor-ddefnyddio'r ystadegyn sy'n dweud y bu i un person o bob pedwar bleidleisio o blaid y Cynulliad, oherwydd pleidleisiodd ychydig yn llai na hynny o bobl yn ei erbyn, a dyna pam yr ydym ni, gan gynnwys chi eich hun, yma heddiw. Dylech gofio hynny.

Digwyddodd y broses ddatganoli a

functions took place when the Tories were in power and I do not remember you getting up and saying that responsibility for higher education, the arts or for training and careers should not be transferred. Most of that took place when the Tories were in power because of the length of time that they were unfortunately in power. However, that did not stop them transferring functions from Westminster and Whitehall to Cardiff. You cannot honestly believe that the process would come to a halt when devolution took place and when the Assembly was set up.

throsoglwyddo swyddogaethau pan oedd y Toriaid mewn grym ac ni chofiaf ichi godi ar ei ch traed a dweud na ddylid trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros addysg uwch, y celfyddydau neu dros hyfforddiant a gyrfaoedd. Digwyddodd y rhan fwyaf o hynny pan oedd y Toriaid mewn grym oherwydd hyd y cyfnod anffodus y buont mewn grym. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaeth hynny eu hatal rhag trosglwyddo swyddogaethau o San Steffan a Whitehall i Gaerdydd. Ni allwch gredu o ddifrif y byddai'r broses yn dod i ben yn sgîl datganoli a phan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad.

### **Ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd European Union Enlargement**

**Q2 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Government, the European Commission and other regions within Europe to ensure Wales's interests are protected after EU enlargement? (OAQ15840)

**The First Minister:** I am pleased that the first two questions for the opening of the batting this afternoon were from the leaders of the two Assembly opposition parties.

If the 10 applicant countries, which will enlarge the EU, had been within Europe's boundaries in 1998, when the decision was made to grant Objective 1 status to two thirds of Wales, it is a mathematical fact that the Objective 1 area in Wales would have been non-existent or microscopically small. The European Commission's cohesion fund report suggests that if enlargement takes place over the next few years, as most people expect, the current Objective 1 areas that would be mathematically disadvantaged by that process, will be protected after 2006-10 in, as yet, unspecified ways. However, a follow-on scheme would be provided to protect their interests.

**Nick Bourne:** Thank you for that constructive response. Will you enlarge on the fact that post 2006, because of all the applicant countries that will qualify for regional assistance—with the exception of the Czech Republic, Bratislava and Cyprus—it is unlikely that Wales will? Cornwall is the

**C2 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU, y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a rhanbarthau eraill yn Ewrop i sicrhau bod buddiannau Cymru'n cael eu diogelu ar ôl ehangu'r UE? (OAQ15840)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn falch bod y ddau gwestiwn cyntaf i agor y sesiwn y prynhawn yma gan arweinwyr dwy wrthblaid y Cynulliad.

Pe byddai'r 10 gwlad sy'n gwneud cais, a fydd yn ehangu'r UE, wedi bod o fewn ffiniau Ewrop yn 1998, pan wnaed y penderfyniad i roi statws Amcan 1 i ddwy ran o dair o Gymru, mae'n ffaith fathemategol na fyddai'r ardal Amcan 1 yng Nghymru yn bodoli, neu byddai'n fach iawn. Awgryma adroddiad cronfa cydlyniant y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, os, fel y disgwylia'r rhan fwyaf o bobl, y digwydd yr ehangu dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, y caiff yr ardaloedd Amcan 1 presennol a fyddai o dan anfantais yn fathemategol o ganlyniad i'r broses honno, eu diogelu ar ôl 2006-10, mewn ffyrdd nas nodwyd eto. Fodd bynnag, darperir cynllun dilyniant i ddiogelu eu buddiannau.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch am yr ateb adeiladol hwnnw. A wnewch chi ymhelaethu ar y ffaith y bydd, oherwydd nifer y gwledydd sy'n gwneud cais ac a fydd yn gymwys i dderbyn cymorth rhanbarthol—ac eithrio'r Weriniaeth Tsiec, Bratislava a Cyprus—yn annhebygol y bydd Cymru'n gymwys ar ôl 2006. Cernyw

only area in the UK that will qualify. What are you doing to press Wales's case post-2006, particularly given that Germany is trying to repatriate regional assistance, which will lead to it assisting its steel and coal communities, which could be prejudicial to Wales?

**The First Minister:** Two things could happen after 2006-07. One relates to the straight mathematical effect of lowering the average gross domestic product per head by bringing in the additional 12 countries, including Romania and Bulgaria. That will have an even bigger effect because the GDP of those two countries is so low. If an area like Wales did not improve and was only excluded from Objective 1 by the change in the average by bringing in those enlargement countries, it would be protected. If Wales's GDP relative to today's EU were to improve, clearly you would not expect to receive as much Objective 1 assistance after 2006-07.

The EU is now concentrating on devising a protective mechanism for those countries that drop out of Objective 1, not because of relative improvements in their economies, but because the incoming 10 or 12 countries will lower the average GDP and the 75 per cent line, which will mean that those areas that were previously below the 75 per cent line, for purely mathematical reasons, will then be above it. There are other issues relating to repatriation. For example, the German view includes repatriating all regional assistance, but the Spanish view is to guarantee that structural funds will still be available regardless of enlargement. The British view lies somewhere between the German and Spanish views. It has yet to be consolidated between Her Majesty's Treasury, the devolved administrations, the Department of Trade and Industry and the Foreign and Commonwealth Office.

**Kirsty Williams:** As well as protecting Welsh interests, do you agree that EU enlargement presents opportunities for Wales to form partnerships with new regions? What actions are you taking to establish such partnerships and opportunities?

yw'r unig ardal yn y DU a fydd yn gymwys. Beth a wnewch i hybu achos Cymru ar ôl 2006, yn enwedig o ystyried bod yr Almaen yn ceisio dychwelyd cymorth rhanbarthol i awdurdod y wlad, fydd yn golygu y bydd yn cynorthwyo ei chymunedau dur a glo, a allai fod yn andwyol i Gymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gallai dau beth ddigwydd ar ôl 2006-07. Mae un yn ymwneud ag effaith fathemategol uniongyrchol gostwng cyfartaledd y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth fesul person drwy gynnwys y 12 gwlad ychwanegol, yn cynnwys Romania a Bwlgaria. Caiff hynny effaith hyd yn oed yn fwy gan fod CMC y ddwy wlad honno mor isel. Os na welwyd gwelliant mewn ardal fel Cymru a'i bod ond wedi'i heithrio o Amcan 1 oherwydd y newid mewn cyfartaledd o ganlyniad i gynnwys y gwledydd ehangol hynny, byddai'n cael ei diogelu. Os byddai CMC Cymru mewn perthynas ag UE heddiw yn gwella, mae'n amlwg na fyddech yn disgwyl derbyn cymaint o gymorth Amcan 1 ar ôl 2006-07.

Mae'r UE bellach yn canolbwyntio ar lunio dull amddiffyn ar gyfer y gwledydd hynny sy'n gadael Amcan 1, nid oherwydd gwelliannau cymharol yn eu heconomïau, ond oherwydd y bydd y 10 neu 12 o wledydd sy'n ymuno yn peri i gyfartaledd y CMC a'r llinell 75 y cant ostwng fel y bydd yr ardaloedd hynny a fu o dan y llinell 75 y cant yn flaenorol, am resymau mathemategol yn unig, wedyn uwchben y llinell. Mae materion eraill sy'n ymwneud â dychwelyd pwerau i awdurdodau gwledydd. Er enghraifft, mae'r Almaen o'r farn y dylid dychwelyd pob cymorth rhanbarthol i awdurdodau gwledydd, ond mae Sbaen o'r farn y dylid sicrhau y bydd cronfeydd strwythurol ar gael o hyd er gwaethaf ehangu'r Undeb. Mae barn Prydain rywle rhwng barn yr Almaen a Sbaen. Nid yw hyn wedi'i gadarnhau eto gan Drysorlys Ei Mawrhydi, y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig, yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn ogystal â diogelu buddiannau Cymru, a gytunwch fod ehangu'r UE yn cynnig cyfleoedd i Gymru lunio partneriaethau gyda rhanbarthau newydd? Pa gamau a gymerwch i sefydlu partneriaethau a chyfleoedd o'r fath?

**The First Minister:** This is a topical issue for the Assembly because at the last meeting of the Committee on European and External Affairs, as we have renamed it, we discussed shortlisting regions where the applicant country was big enough to have regions and those applicant member states that were the same size or even smaller than Wales, as to which we should twin with. We will then bring that before the full Assembly, after the Committee has come to a decision. I hope to be able to present that to the Assembly in the next month.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hwn yn fater amserol i'r Cynulliad oherwydd yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol, fel yr ydym wedi'i ail-enwi, trafodwyd llunio rhestr fer o ranbarthau lle yr oedd y wlad sy'n gwneud cais yn ddigon mawr i gael rhanbarthau, a'r aelod-wladwriaethau hynny oedd yn gwneud cais oedd yr un maint â Chymru, neu hyd yn oed yn llai na Chymru, y dylem efeillio â hwy. Byddwn wedyn yn cyflwyno hynny gerbron y Cynulliad llawn, ar ôl i'r Pwyllgor wneud penderfyniad. Gobeithiaf gyflwyno hynny i'r Cynulliad yn ystod y mis nesaf.

2:10 p.m.

### Cyfarfodydd Llawn Plenary Sessions

**Q3 Richard Edwards:** As part of the Government's aim of bringing government closer to the people of Wales, does the First Minister recommend any plans to hold a programme of Assembly Plenary sessions in other parts of the country? (OAQ15843)

**C3 Richard Edwards:** Fel rhan o nod y Llywodraeth i ddod â'r llywodraeth yn agosach at bobl Cymru, a yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yn argymhell unrhyw gynlluniau i gynnal rhaglen o Gyfarfodydd Llawn y Cynulliad mewn rhannau eraill o'r wlad? (OAQ15843)

First Minister, I point out that I am not the leader of an opposition party.

Prif Weinidog, nodaf nad wyf yn arweinydd unrhyw wrthblaid.

**The First Minister:** The location of Plenary sessions is not a matter for me or the Cabinet. It is a matter for the Presiding Office. However, the Cabinet proposes, after its next awayday, which will be held in north Wales in a few months' time, to hold an open session in public in north Wales. We hope to be able to announce further details shortly.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid yw lleoliad Cyfarfodydd Llawn yn fater i mi na'r Cabinet. Mater i Swyddfa'r Llywydd ydyw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Cabinet yn cynnig, ar ôl ei ddiwrnod hyfforddiant nesaf, a gynhelir yn y Gogledd mewn ychydig fisoedd, cynnal sesiwn agored yn gyhoeddus yn y Gogledd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn gyhoeddi manylion pellach yn fuan.

**Richard Edwards:** You will know that those representing the more peripheral areas in the West and the North must often combat the perception, which is not always fair or accurate, that the Assembly is Cardiff-centric. Therefore I have been anxious to ensure that the Committee that I chair ventures outside this place to all parts of Wales. Do you accept that, despite the logistical problems, holding Plenary sessions at least twice a year, for example, in the North and the West, would be a public demonstration of the Assembly's

**Richard Edwards:** Gwyddoch fod yn rhaid i'r rhai hynny sy'n cynrychioli'r ardaloedd mwy ymylol yn y Gorllewin a'r Gogledd yn aml frwydro yn erbyn yr amgyffrediad, nad yw bob amser yn deg neu'n gywir, bod y Cynulliad wedi'i ganoli yng Nghaerdydd. Felly bûm yn awyddus i sicrhau bod y Pwyllgor yr wyf yn ei gadeirio yn mentro allan o'r lle hwn i bob rhan o Gymru. A dderbyniwch, er y problemau logistaidd, y byddai cynnal Cyfarfodydd Llawn o leiaf ddwywaith y flwyddyn, er enghraifft, yn y Gogledd a'r Gorllewin, yn arwydd cyhoeddus

commitment to the people of every part of Wales?

**The First Minister:** I note the excellent records of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee and the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, which have met outside Cardiff on many occasions. That is excellent. The Committee Chairs can simply decide to do that, with the agreement of the Committee. It is a slightly different matter with Plenary sessions. The Committee Chairs could perhaps meet, through the panel of Chairs, and write to the Presiding Office on that issue, because it is not a matter for me. I hope that the Cabinet can take forward the excellent record of the open-mic sessions, as they are called, of the Regional Committees and do the same, initially as a pilot experiment in north Wales in a few months' time. If that goes well, we could also try it in other parts of Wales.

**Jocelyn Davies:** You say that it is not a matter for you, but you were a member of the Assembly review of procedure group. Did the group receive any representations on holding Plenaries outside Cardiff, and did the group consider them?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of whether it did or not.

**Alun Cairns:** I am sure that the First Minister will recall the White Paper 'A Voice for Wales' that was published before the devolution referendum. That committed the Assembly to establishing a north Wales base for such purposes. What progress has been made on that?

**The First Minister:** I certainly remember that the Government of Wales Act 1998 contains a commitment to a regional committee for north Wales. The Welsh Assembly Government has offices in north Wales. I am not sure what development one could make to have what you describe as a base in north Wales. We hope to make announcements soon about creating further centres of Assembly administration, bringing jobs to areas which are at some distance from Cardiff, in the Valleys, and so on. Edwina

o ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i bobl o bob rhan o Gymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nodaf record rhagorol Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, sydd wedi cwrdd y tu allan i Gaerdydd ar sawl achlysur. Mae hynny'n ardderchog. Gall Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau benderfynu gwneud hynny, gyda chytundeb y Pwyllgor. Mae'r Cyfarfodydd Llawn ychydig yn wahanol. Efallai y gallai Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau gwrdd, drwy banel y Cadeiryddion, ac ysgrifennu at Swyddfa'r Llywydd ynglŷn â'r mater hwnnw, oherwydd nid yw'n fater i mi. Gobeithio y gall y Cabinet ddilyn record ardderchog sesiynau cwestiynau agored, fel y'u gelwir, y Pwyllgorau Rhanbarth a gwneud yr un peth, fel arbrawf peilot i ddechrau yn y Gogledd ymhen rhai misoedd. Os bydd hynny'n llwyddiant, gallem hefyd roi cynnig arni mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Dywedwch nad yw hwn yn fater i chi, ond yr oeddech yn aelod o grŵp adolygu gweithdrefn y Cynulliad. A dderbyniodd y grŵp unrhyw sylwadau ar gynnal Cyfarfodydd Llawn y tu allan i Gaerdydd, ac a ystyriwyd y rhain gan y grŵp?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol a wnaeth hynny ai peidio.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Prif Weinidog Cymru'n cofio'r Papur Gwyn 'Llais dros Gymru' a gyhoeddwyd cyn y refferendwm ar ddatganoli. Yr oedd hynny'n ymrwymo'r Cynulliad i sefydlu canolfan yn y Gogledd at ddibenion o'r fath. Pa gynnydd a wnaed ar hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn sicr yn cofio bod Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i gael pwyllgor rhanbarth ar gyfer y Gogledd. Mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru swyddfeydd yn y Gogledd. Nid wyf yn siŵr pa ddatblygiadau y gellid eu gwneud i gael yr hyn a ddisgrifiwch fel canolfan yn y Gogledd. Gobeithiwn wneud cyhoeddiadau'n fuan ynghylch creu rhagor o ganolfannau gweinyddu'r Cynulliad, gan greu swyddi mewn ardaloedd sydd ychydig bellter o



Hart will make a statement on that issue before long.

Gaerdydd, yn y Cymoedd, ac ati. Bydd Edwina Hart yn gwneud datganiad ar y mater hwnnw cyn hir.

### **Hyrwyddo Cynnyrch o Gymru Promotion of Products made in Wales**

**Q4 Janice Gregory:** What consideration has been given to the promotion of Welsh-made products in retail outlets in Wales, such as supermarkets? (OAQ15845)

**C4 Janice Gregory:** Pa ystyriaeth sydd wedi'i rhoi i hyrwyddo cynnyrch o Gymru mewn siopau manwerthu, megis archfarchnadoedd, yng Nghymru? (OAQ15845)

**The First Minister:** The Welsh Development Agency's food directorate and the agri-food partnership are working continuously on this, via the agri-food strategy. They are actively pursuing opportunities with all supermarkets in Wales to promote and encourage the supply of locally produced products. I will not name any supermarkets; I believe that all the four major supermarket groups are involved, to different degrees, with different levels of success, in different projects. Sometimes that involves fresh produce, meat and milk, and sometimes frozen or prepared products from excellent Welsh farms. We must all remember that if we can promote a clean, green, healthy, traditional or organic food reputation for Wales, it increases the sales of food and drink produced in Wales. That is a good way of promoting farm diversification. However, above all, it is good for the health of the people who eat or drink excellent, healthy Welsh produce bought from their local supermarkets.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae cyfarwyddiaeth fwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r bartneriaeth bwyd-amaeth yn gweithio'n barhaus ar hyn, drwy'r strategaeth bwyd-amaeth. Maent wrthi'n chwilio am gyfleoedd gyda holl archfarchnadoedd Cymru i'w hannog i gyflenwi a hyrwyddo cynnyrch a wnaed yn lleol. Ni enwaf unrhyw archfarchnadoedd; credaf fod y pedair prif grŵp o archfarchnadoedd yn cymryd rhan, i raddau gwahanol, gyda lefelau gwahanol o lwyddiant, mewn prosiectau gwahanol. Weithiau mae hynny'n cynnwys cynnyrch ffres, cig a llaeth, ac weithiau cynnyrch wedi'u rhewi neu eu paratoi o ffermydd ardderchog yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni gofio, os gallwn sicrhau enw da i Gymru fel gwlad sy'n cynhyrchu bwyd glân, gwyrdd, iachus, traddodiadol neu organig, y bydd hynny'n cynyddu gwerthiant bwyd a diod a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n ffordd dda o hyrwyddo arallgyfeirio ymysg ffermwyr. Fodd bynnag, yn anad dim, mae'n fuddiol i iechyd y bobl sy'n bwyta neu'n yfed cynnyrch Cymreig iachus, ardderchog a brynwyd yn eu harchfarchnadoedd lleol.

**Janice Gregory:** We are all aware that our food products are well marketed in Wales. I pay tribute to the Welsh Development Agency and everyone involved in that work.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol y caiff bwyd Cymru ei farchnata'n dda. Talaf deyrnged i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a phawb sy'n cymryd rhan yn y gwaith hwnnw.

My constituents can shop in well-known supermarkets, both large and small, and can buy bathroom products and facial tissue. However, they are unaware that they are buying products made up the road in the Georgia Pacific paper mill in Llangynwyd. Can we consider the procedures used in Ireland? Till receipts—such as I have here—and shelf labelling show shoppers which of their purchases were made in Ireland. For

Gall fy etholwyr siopa mewn archfarchnadoedd adnabyddus, yn fach a mawr, a gallant brynu deunydd ymolchi a hancesi papur. Fodd bynnag, nid ydynt yn ymwybodol eu bod yn prynu cynnyrch a wnaed yn lleol ym melin bapur Georgia Pacific yn Llangynwyd. A allwn ystyried y gweithdrefnau a ddefnyddir yn Iwerddon? Mae derbynebaw til—fel sydd gennyf yma— a labeli ar silffoedd yn dangos i siopwyr pa

example, toilet tissue made in Ireland would have a shamrock on its packaging. Perhaps we could have a dragon, or similar logo. It is vital, because if Welsh shoppers were given the opportunity to buy Welsh products, if they knew that a product was made in Wales and was comparative in price to other products, they would buy the Welsh-made products. I encourage you, First Minister, to consider this matter more seriously.

**The First Minister:** I was thinking mostly of food and drink, rather than non-consumable products. My understanding is that you cannot label things as British—nor as Irish, in principle—as European law does not permit product labels to name the member state of origin. However, there is no such restriction on labelling countries of origin that are beneath member-state level, such as Wales. Many manufacturers are confused by these labelling laws. They can be construed as anti-competitive, and the European Court of Justice often construes them as such. You cannot label a product as ‘made in the UK’, but you can label it as ‘made in Wales’.

**William Graham:** Tesco promoted British products in its European stores by using *label rouge*. Do you not think that this is an ideal mechanism of promoting Welsh products around Europe?

**The First Minister:** Yes. There is a medium-term strategy here to raise the profile of Welsh-made agricultural produce. It applies particularly to food and drink—when exporting it or encouraging local consumers to buy it—for two different reasons. In Wales, people are encouraged to eat local produce because it is much fresher. It will have more of the vitamins that it had when it fell off the tree or grew in the ground if it has not gone halfway around the world in a transport chain. Abroad, the issue is slightly different because that cannot be claimed. However, if it is produced to high husbandry standards, sometimes organic or using traditional methods, there is a niche market to move into. Then, there is no need to try to compete with America, Argentina and

gynnyrch a wnaed yn Iwerddon. Er enghraifft, byddai gan bapur tŷ bach a wnaed yn Iwerddon feillionen ar ei bapur pacio. Efallai y gallem ddefnyddio draig, neu logo tebyg. Mae'n hanfodol oherwydd, pe bai siopwyr Cymru'n cael y cyfle i brynu cynnyrch o Gymru, gan wybod bod cynnyrch wedi'i wneud yng Nghymru ac y gellid cymharu ei bris â chynnyrch arall, byddent yn prynu'r cynnyrch a wnaed yng Nghymru. Fe'ch anogaf, Brif Weinidog, i roi ystyriaeth mwy difrifol i'r mater hwn.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl yn bennaf am fwyd a diod, yn hytrach na chynnyrch anfwytadwy. Yr wyf ar ddeall na allwch nodi ar labeli bod pethau'n Brydeinig—nac yn Wyddelig, o ran egwyddor—gan nad yw cyfraith Ewrop yn caniatáu i labeli enwi'r aelod-wladwriaethau y tarddodd y cynnyrch ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, nid oes cyfyngiad o'r fath ar enwi gwledydd nad oes ganddynt statws aelod-wladwriaeth, fel Cymru, ar labeli. Mae'r gyfraith labelu yn drysu llawer o gynhyrchwyr. Gellid ystyried ei bod yn wrthgystadleuol, ac mae Llys Cyfiawnder Ewrop yn ei dehongli fel hynny'n aml. Ni allwch labelu cynnyrch â 'gwnaed yn y DU', ond gallwch ei labelu â 'gwnaed yng Nghymru'.

**William Graham:** Hyrwyddodd Tesco gynnyrch Prydeinig yn ei siopau Ewropeaidd drwy ddefnyddio *label rouge*. Oni chredwch fod hwn yn ddull delfrydol o hyrwyddo cynnyrch Cymreig yn Ewrop?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ydw. Mae gennym strategaeth tymor canolig i godi proffil cynnyrch amaethyddol a wnaed yng Nghymru. Mae'n ymwneud yn benodol â bwyd a diod—wrth ei allforio neu wrth annog defnyddwyr lleol i'w brynu—am ddau reswm gwahanol. Yng Nghymru, anogir pobl i fwyta cynnyrch lleol oherwydd ei fod yn llawer mwy ffres. Bydd ganddo fwy o'r fitaminau yr oedd ganddo pan ddisgynnodd oddi ar y goeden neu pan dyfodd yn y ddaear os na chaiff ei ddwyn hanner ffordd o amgylch y byd mewn cadwyn drafnidiaeth. Dramor, mae'r mater ychydig yn wahanol oherwydd na ellir honni hynny. Fodd bynnag, os bydd safonau hwsmonaeth y cynhyrchu yn dda, drwy ddefnyddio dulliau organig neu draddodiadol, mae bwch yn y farchnad i'w

Canada for prairie agriculture and agri-business produce. You are filling a niche with produce of a specific taste. If we can get into that market, it will be the right way forward for the Welsh farming industry.

lenwi. Yna, ni fydd angen ceisio cystadlu ag America, yr Ariannin a Chanada ar gyfer cynnyrch amaethyddiaeth y paith a busnes-amaeth. Yr ydych yn llenwi bwlch gyda chynnyrch sydd â chynulleidfa benodol. Os gallwn fynd i'r farchnad honno, dyna'r ffordd gywir ymlaen i'r diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru.

### **Proffil Rhyngwladol International Profile**

**Q5 Jonathan Morgan:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the effect of the Government of Wales in raising our international profile? (OAQ15842)

**C5 Jonathan Morgan:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar yr effaith y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei gael ar godi ein proffil rhyngwladol? (OAQ15842)

**The First Minister:** As our patron saint's day falls during this week, this question is particularly timely, Jonathan. I have been most active on this front recently. Two weeks ago, I was in Dublin Castle with Taoiseach Bertie Ahern promoting Welsh-Irish trade links. Over 500 businesspeople and business support services staff were present, mainly from Ireland, but some 100 were from Wales. Tomorrow, I will visit Brussels for its early St David's Day celebration, and then on Friday, Saturday and Sunday, I will visit New York for its Welsh celebrations.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gan bod diwrnod ein nawddsant yr wythnos hon, mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn arbennig o amserol, Jonathan. Bwm yn weithgar iawn yn hyn o beth yn ddiweddar. Bythefnos yn ôl yr oeddwn yng Nghastell Dilyn gyda Taoiseach Bertie Ahern yn hyrwyddo cysylltiadau masnachol rhwng Cymru ac Iwerddon. Yr oedd dros 500 o bobl fusnes a staff gwasanaethau cymorth busnes yn bresennol, yn bennaf o Iwerddon, ond yr oedd tua 100 o Gymru. Yfory, byddaf yn ymweld â Brwsel ar gyfer ei dathliadau Dydd Gŵyl Dewi cynnar, ac yna ddydd Gwener, dydd Sadwrn a dydd Sul, byddaf yn ymweld ag Efrog Newydd ar gyfer ei dathliadau Cymreig.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Do you agree that one of the ways that we have been successful in raising our international profile is by your Cabinet Ministers attending Council of Ministers meetings in Brussels? Do you share my concern that now that the Minister for Rural Affairs has been elevated to the dizzy heights of the Business Committee, he may have less time to represent Welsh farmers in Brussels?

**Jonathan Morgan:** A gytunwch mai un o'r ffyrdd y buom yn llwyddiannus wrth godi ein proffil rhyngwladol yw bod Gweinidogion eich Cabinet wedi mynychu cyfarfodydd Cyngor y Gweinidogion ym Mrwsel? A rannwch fy mhryder na fydd gan y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, gan ei fod bellach wedi'i ddyrchafu i'r Pwyllgor Busnes, gymaint o amser i gynrychioli ffermwyr Cymru ym Mrwsel?

**The First Minister:** No. That is merely a matter of organising our timetable. I anticipate that we can arrange for an Assembly presence in Brussels at all the appropriate Council of Ministers meetings concerning agriculture.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Na. Mater o drefnu ein hamserlen yn unig yw hynny. Rhagwelaif y gallwn drefnu i gael cynrychiolydd o'r Cynulliad ym Mrwsel ym mhob un o gyfarfodydd perthnasol Cyngor y Gweinidogion ar amaethyddiaeth.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that raising the international profile of Wales has been a major success of the Assembly to date? Our

**John Griffiths:** A gytunwch y bu'r gwaith o godi proffil rhyngwladol Cymru yn un o brif llwyddiannau'r Cynulliad hyd yma? Mae ein

friends from Lesotho are here today, perhaps building on Dolen Cymru's links, established in 1985. The Assembly is playing a role in furthering those links. The British-Irish Inter-parliamentary Body is meeting next month and there are countless examples of the Assembly's success in terms of raising its international profile.

2:20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I am glad that you asked your question in that way, John. It is not a matter of the more international links we have the better, nor is it about all international links being good and that we should therefore organise all the conferences and twinning links that we can. The issue is not about that. Links must be strategically planned. The Wales-Lesotho link was developed 16 or 17 years ago by the Reverend Bob Morgan and Elaine Morgan in Ely—no relations of mine, I must add. The link was developed originally in the church and Christian community throughout Wales and has been an outstanding success for good reasons. A strategy of twinning Wales with Lesotho was pursued. I am pleased to see that link bearing fruit today with the delegation's visit. There are other areas also, if you have the right strategy, in which even a small country such as Wales can make a significant impact across the world.

**Dafydd Wigley:** A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn na wnaeth y modd y bu iddo ef a'i ragflaenydd ymdrin â'r cynllun i adeiladu siambr newydd i'r Cynulliad lawer i godi proffil Cymru yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf? A wnaiff ddatgan yn ddiamwys, felly, yn sgîl y datblygiadau diweddar, ei fod am weld prosiect yr adeilad newydd yn symud ymlaen yn ddi-oed, ei fod yn rhoi cefnogaeth lawn i Edwina Hart i'r perwyl hwnnw, a'i fod yn benderfynol y bydd yr adeilad yn symbol o ymrwymiad ei Lywodraeth i greu Cymru newydd sydd yn hyderus, yn flaengar ac allblyg?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Derbyniaf gynnwys y cwestiwn, ar wahân i'r frawddeg agoriadol negyddol. Yr ydym oll, cyn belled ag yr wyf

ffrindiau o Lesotho yma heddiw, efallai yn adeiladu ar gysylltiadau Dolen Cymru, a sefydlwyd yn 1985. Mae'r Cynulliad yn chwarae rôl wrth ddatblygu'r cysylltiadau hynny. Mae Corff Rhyng-seneddol Prydain-Iwerddon yn cwrdd fis nesaf a cheir enghreifftiau di-rif o lwyddiannau'r Cynulliad o ran codi ei broffil rhyngwladol.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn falch ichi ofyn eich cwestiwn fel y gwnaethoch, John. Nid mater o po fwyaf o gysylltiadau rhyngwladol sydd gennym gorau oll mohono, ac nid yw'n ymwneud â sicrhau bod pob cyswllt rhyngwladol yn dda ac y dylem felly drefnu cymaint o gynadleddau a chysylltiadau gefeillio ag y gallwn. Nid yw'r mater yn ymwneud â hynny. Rhaid cynllunio cysylltiadau yn strategol. Datblygwyd y cysylltiad rhwng Cymru a Lesotho 16 neu 17 mlynedd yn ôl gan y Parchedig Bob Morgan ac Elaine Morgan yn Nhreflai—nad ydynt yn berthnasau i mi, gyda llaw. Datblygwyd y cyswllt yn wreiddiol yng nghymuned eglwysig a Christnogol Cymru a bu'n llwyddiant ysgubol am resymau da. Aethpwyd ar drywydd strategaeth i efeillio Cymru â Lesotho. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y cyswllt hwnnw'n dwyn ffrwyth heddiw gydag ymweliad y cynrychiolwyr. Mae meysydd eraill hefyd, os oes gennych y strategaeth gywir, lle y gall hyd yn oed gwlad fach fel Cymru gael effaith arwyddocaol ledled y byd.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Does the First Minister accept that his and his predecessor's handling of the plan to build a new Assembly chamber has done little to enhance Wales's profile over the past two years? As a result of recent developments, will he therefore state unequivocally that he wishes to see the new building project progressing without delay, that he will give Edwina Hart every support to this end, and that he is determined that the building will be a symbol of his Government's commitment to creating a new, confident, progressive and outward-looking Wales?

**The First Minister:** I accept the thrust of the question, apart from the negative opening sentence. As far as I am aware, we are all in

yn ymwybodol, o blaid gweld yr adeilad newydd yn symud yn ei flaen yn ystod yr haf a'r gaeaf eleni—ond am y grŵp Toriaidd, yn swyddogol o leiaf. Yr ydym hefyd yn disgwyl gweld contractwyr yn symud yn ôl i'r safle drws nesaf i'r adeilad hwn cyn y Nadolig. Cefnogaf brosiect yr adeilad ac Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y prosiect, am y modd y deliodd â baich anodd ar adegau, a'r ffactorau negyddol, sef yr hyn a ddigwyddodd wedi'r ffræe gyda'r Richard Rogers Partnership a ddiweddodd gyda'r broses gyflafareddu ofynnol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r problemau a gafwyd yn golygu nad ydym yn cefnogi'r camau sydd ger ein bron yn awr gant y cant, sef, erbyn diwedd y gwanwyn, penodi'r rheolwyr prosiect a fydd yn dewis y contractwyr fel rhan o'r broses dendro. Gobeithiaf weld y contractwyr yn symud i'r safle cyn y Nadolig ac yn dechrau codi'r adeilad.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 6 (OAQ15834) has been withdrawn.

favour of seeing the new building progressing during this summer and winter—apart from the Tory group, officially at least. We also expect to see contractors moving back to the site adjacent to this building before Christmas. I support the building project and Edwina Hart, the Minister responsible for the project, for the way in which she dealt with a difficult burden at times, and the negative factors, namely what happened following the disagreement with the Richard Rogers Partnership which ended with the required arbitration process. However, the problems experienced do not mean that we do not wholeheartedly support the steps now before us, namely, by the end of the spring, the appointment of project managers who will then choose the contractors as part of the tendering process. I hope to see the contractors moving onto the site before Christmas and the building work commencing.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 6 (OAQ15834) yn ôl.

#### **Ymweld â Dyffryn Clwyd Vale of Clwyd Visit**

**Q7 Ann Jones:** In his role as policy co-ordinator for north Wales, what plans does the First Minister have to visit the Vale of Clwyd to highlight the delivery of Welsh Assembly Government policy in north Wales? (OAQ15836)

**The First Minister:** I have no current plans to visit the Vale of Clwyd. You will remember my visit to Rhyl four or five months ago to open the mediation centre, which is an excellent initiative in the station complex. I visit north Wales regularly. I have three visits planned shortly, namely to the North Wales Regional Committee, and to open various facilities. I have undertaken two visits since the new year and undertook seven or eight official engagements during those visits.

**Ann Jones:** Will you confirm that the Assembly is committed to expanding credit unions across Wales? Do you agree that the growth of credit unions offers financial and

**C7 Ann Jones:** Yn ei rôl fel cydlynnydd polisïau ar gyfer Gogledd Cymru, pa gynlluniau sydd gan Prif Weinidog Cymru i ymweld â Dyffryn Clwyd er mwyn tynnu sylw at y modd y caiff polisïau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru eu rhoi ar waith yn y Gogledd? (OAQ15836)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw gynlluniau i ymweld â Dyffryn Clwyd ar hyn o bryd. Byddwch yn cofio fy ymweliad â'r Rhyl bedwar neu bum mis yn ôl i agor y ganolfan gyfryngu, sy'n fenter ardderchog yng nghanolfan yr orsaf. Ymwelaf â'r Gogledd yn rheolaidd. Yr wyf wedi cynllunio tri ymweliad yn fuan, i Bwyllgor Rhanbarthol y Gogledd, ac i agor cyfleusterau amrywiol. Yr wyf wedi ymweld ddwywaith ers y flwyddyn newydd ac ymgymerais â saith neu wyth o ymrwymadau swyddogol yn ystod yr ymweliadau hynny.

**Ann Jones:** A wnewch chi gadarnhau bod y Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i ehangu undebau credyd ledled Cymru? A gytunwch fod twf yr undebau credyd yn cynnig sefydlogrwydd

economic stability to our communities? I declare an interest as a member of the Clwyd Coast Credit Union. Will you consider visiting members at the union's new permanent home in Rhyl's town centre, made possible by your Government's financial package to promote credit unions and by Objective 1 funding?

**The First Minister:** I agree with all your points. Credit unions are at the heart of the Communities First empowerment strategy that tries to engender, from the inside and from the bottom up, self-improvement strategies for Wales's poorest communities, of which west-central Rhyl is among the poorest two or three, according to all available figures. I hope that a credit union will, as part of a wider strategy, help to regenerate the community of west-central Rhyl, and that that can then act as an example to other parts of Wales with similar social problems, of a community lifting itself by its own bootstraps—which is what credit unions are all about—as part of the Communities First scheme. I always remember the words of John Hume when asked what he regarded as the greatest achievement of his political career; he said that it was setting up the Derry Credit Union, because it now controls £40 million.

**Janet Ryder:** Those policies are aimed at creating social inclusion, and through that, providing equal access to services. Many people in north Wales, including the Vale of Clwyd, feel that they are excluded and do not have equal access to the provision of certain health treatments. It is a postcode lottery, especially with regard to infertility treatment. Will you take up this issue on their behalf to ensure that people in north Wales are not discriminated against, and that they have access to all services, including infertility treatment?

**The First Minister:** Infertility treatment is the one area of the health service that has always been, and probably always will be, a postcode lottery—not just in north Wales, but everywhere. The reason is that infertility treatment is not generally regarded as being at the fundamental core of the health service, as it does not concern the treatment of ill

ariannol ac economaidd i'n cymunedau? Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Undeb Credyd Arfordir Clwyd. A ystyriwch ymweld ag aelodau yng nghartref parhaol newydd yr undeb yng nghanol tref y Rhyl, a wnaed yn bosibl gan becyn ariannol eich Llywodraeth i hyrwyddo undebau credyd a chan arian Amcan 1?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf â'ch holl sylwadau. Mae undebau credyd wrth wraidd strategaeth ymrymuso Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf sy'n ceisio ysgogi, o'r tu fewn ac o'r bôn i'r brig, strategaethau hunan-welliant i gymunedau tlotaf Cymru, y mae gorllewin canol y Rhyl ymysg y ddwy neu dair tlotaf, yn ôl yr holl ffigurau sydd ar gael. Gobeithio y bydd undeb credyd, fel rhan o strategaeth ehangach, yn helpu i adfywio cymuned gorllewin canol y Rhyl, ac y gall hynny wedyn weithredu fel esiampl i rannau eraill o Gymru gyda phroblemau cymdeithasol tebyg, o gymuned sy'n codi ei hun gerfydd ei gareiau esgidiau ei hun—sef nod undebau credyd—fel rhan o'r cynllun Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Byddaf bob amser yn cofio geiriau John Hume pan ofynnwyd iddo beth a dybiai oedd cyflawniad mwyaf ei yrfa wleidyddol; dywedodd mai sefydlu Undeb Credyd Derry oedd hynny, gan ei fod bellach yn rheoli £40 miliwn.

**Janet Ryder:** Nod y polisiau hynny yw creu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, a thrwy hynny, darparu mynediad cyfartal i wasanaethau. Mae llawer o bobl yn y Gogledd, yn cynnwys Dyffryn Clwyd, yn teimlo eu bod wedi'u hallgáu ac nad oes ganddynt fynediad cyfartal i ddarpariaeth triniaethau iechyd penodol. Loteri cod post sydd ar waith, yn enwedig o ran triniaeth anffrwythlondeb. A wnewch chi ymdrin â'r mater hwn ar eu rhan er mwyn sicrhau na wahaniaethir yn erbyn pobl yn y Gogledd, ac y cânt fynediad i'r holl wasanaethau, yn cynnwys triniaeth anffrwythlondeb?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae triniaeth anffrwythlondeb yn faes o'r gwasanaeth iechyd a fu bob amser, ac a fydd bob amser mae'n debyg, yn loteri cod post—nid dim ond yn y Gogledd, ond ym mhob man. Y rheswm dros hyn yw nad ystyrir yn gyffredinol bod triniaeth anffrwythlondeb yn un o wasanaethau craidd y gwasanaeth

health. Treatment for illness is a right, but infertility treatment, for some reason—I am not endorsing this, I am simply stating a fact—has always been regarded as an extra that is sometimes provided, but sometimes is not provided. We may all regret this, probably none of us endorse it, but it is a fact that has bedevilled the health service for the last 30 years since infertility treatment became available.

**Tom Middlehurst:** In your capacity as the Minister with responsibility for north Wales, do you recognise that the decision to refuse the planning application to extend the Deeside industrial park in Shotwick has been received with shock and dismay? Given that we now have a huge hole in the local, and indeed the regional, economic development strategy, which has significant implications for the national economic development strategy, will you agree to meet urgently with the leading members of Flintshire County Council, to assess the impact of this decision, and to explore every possibility in an effort to find a way forward?

**The First Minister:** I am happy to meet a deputation from Flintshire, including you, Tom, if you wish, to discuss the availability of strategic sites for economic development in north-east Wales, following the Shotwick decision. This is an independent decision taken on planning grounds, and there is no appeal system against it, except on judicial matters. No-one is criticising the process by which the Planning Decision Committee reached its decision, but as you say, it leaves a hole, and we must now consider what other sites may be available to enable Flintshire's economy to remain healthy and to enable the county to contribute to the achievement of the national economic development strategy.

iechyd, gan nad yw'n ymwneud â thrin afiechyd. Mae gan bobl hawl i gael triniaeth ar gyfer salwch, ond ystyriwyd erioed am ryw reswm bod triniaeth anffrwythlondeb—nid wyf yn cymeradwyo hyn, dim ond yn nodi ffaith—yn driniaeth ychwanegol a ddarperir weithiau, ond na chaiff ei darparu ar adegau eraill. Mae'n bosibl bod pob un ohonom yn anghytuno â hyn, fwy na thebyg nad oes yr un ohonom yn ei gymeradwyo, ond mae'n ffaith sydd wedi plagio'r gwasanaeth iechyd am y 30 blynedd diwethaf ers cyflwyno triniaeth anffrwythlondeb.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Yn eich capasiti fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros y Gogledd, a gydnabyddwch fod y penderfyniad i wrthod y cais cynllunio i ehangu parc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy yn Shotwick wedi peri syfrdan a siom? O ystyried bod gennym bellach fwch anferth yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd leol ac yn wir, rhanbarthol, sydd â goblygiadau helaeth ar gyfer y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, a gytunwch i gwrdd ar frys â phrif aelodau Cyngor Sir y Fflint, i asesu effaith y penderfyniad hwn, ac i archwilio pob posibilrwydd mewn ymdrech i ganfod ffordd ymlaen?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i gwrdd â dirprwyaeth o Sir y Fflint, yn eich cynnwys chi, Tom, os dymunwch, i drafod argaeledd safleoedd strategol ar gyfer datblygu economaidd yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain, yn dilyn penderfyniad Shotwick. Mae hwn yn benderfyniad annibynnol a gymerwyd ar sail cynllunio, ac nid oes unrhyw system apelio yn ei erbyn, ac eithrio materion barnwrol. Nid oes unrhyw un yn beirniadu'r broses y defnyddiodd y Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio i wneud ei benderfyniad, ond fel y dywedwch, mae'n gadael bwlch, a rhaid inni ystyried yn awr pa safleoedd eraill a allai fod ar gael i alluogi economi Sir y Fflint i barhau i ffynnu ac i alluogi'r sir i gyfrannu at gyflawni'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol.

### Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Public Services

**C8 Gareth Jones:** Pa asesiad a wnaed o effaith polisiâu'r Cynulliad o safbwynt

**Q8 Gareth Jones:** What assessment has been made of the effect of Assembly policy in

gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? (OAQ15827)

improving public services in Wales? (OAQ15827)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Enghreifftiau hysbys o'r gwelliannau sydd ar y gweill yng ngwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru, a fydd yn weithredol o 1 Ebrill yw, darparu gwasanaethau yn rhad ac am ddim i'r henoed a'r anabl, rhewi taliadau presgripsiwn, a darparu chwe wythnos o ofal cartref yn rhad ac am ddim yn dilyn triniaeth yn yr ysbyty. Enghraifft arall yw grantiau dysgu y Cynulliad a gyflwynir erbyn dechrau'r flwyddyn academiaidd nesaf, fel y cyhoeddodd Jane Davidson cyn y toriad.

**First Minister:** The provision of free services for the elderly and disabled, the freezing of prescription charges, and six weeks of free home care following hospital treatment, all of which will be effective from 1 April onwards, are just some examples of imminent improvements to public service in Wales. Another example is the introduction, by the start of the next academic year, of the Assembly learning grants, as announced by Jane Davidson before the recess.

2:30 p.m.

**Gareth Jones:** Mewn cyfarfod gydag arbenigwyr yn Ysbyty Gwynedd ddoe clywais fod cynllun busnes sefydlu ysgol feddygol y Gogledd wedi ei gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad rai misoedd yn ôl. Hyd yma, ni dderbyniwyd unrhyw ateb na chydabyddiaeth. Mae rheolwyr y prosiect yn digalonni. A wnewch sicrhau'r arbenigwyr proffesiynol hyn—ac eraill sydd wedi buddsoddi cymaint o'u hamser a'u hadnoddau prin yn y fenter hollbwysig hon—fod dyfodol i ysgol feddygol y Gogledd, a'ch bod yn ei chefnogi ac am weld ei sefydlu? Byddai ansawdd gofal cleifion a'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gwella o ganlyniad i gyfleusterau hyfforddiant a recriwtio ysgol o'r fath.

**Gareth Jones:** In a meeting with specialists in Ysbyty Gwynedd yesterday, I was told that the business plan to establish the north Wales school of medicine was presented to the Assembly some months ago. To date, no reply or acknowledgement has been received. The project's managers are losing heart. Will you assure these professional specialists—and others who have invested so much of their time and their scarce resources in this crucial venture—that the north Wales school of medicine has a future, and that you support it and wish to see it established? Patient care and the health service would improve as a result of the school's training and recruitment facilities.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Hyd y gwn i, ni fu unrhyw newid i'n cynlluniau. Y cam cyntaf oedd sefydlu'r ysgol feddygol gyntaf y tu allan i Gaerdydd yn Abertawe a gostiodd £9 miliwn. Y mae'r prosiect hwnnw ar y gweill. Y prosiect nesaf fydd yr ysgol feddygol yn y Gogledd ym Mangor a fydd yn cynnwys rhai o ysbytai mawr yr ardal. Ni wn am unrhyw ohirio, ond os oes, edrychaf i'r mater a bydd naill ai Jane Hutt neu fi yn ysgrifennu atoch.

**The First Minister:** As far as I am aware, our plans have not changed. The first step was to establish the first school of medicine outside Cardiff in Swansea, which cost £9 million. That project is ongoing. The next project will be the north Wales school of medicine in Bangor, which will include some of the area's major hospitals. I am not aware of any postponement, but if there is, I will look into the matter and either Jane Hutt or myself will write to you.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Given the partnership Government's commitment to improving public services through increased public investment, will you make further representations to the UK Government to change the public sector borrowing rules to enable local councils and the Assembly to

**Eleanor Burnham:** O ystyried ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy gynyddu buddsoddiad cyhoeddus, a wnewch sylwadau pellach i Lywodraeth y DU i newid rheolau benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus i alluogi cynghorau lleol a'r Cynulliad i fenthyca er



borrow in order to invest in our future?

**The First Minister:** This is a finance matter for Edwina Hart. I will ensure that she replies to you.

**Nick Bourne:** Public transport and public roads are important public services. Given Stephen Byers's recent difficulties, will you comment on the current proposals for charging for using roads? What impact will it have on Wales, and what representations will the Assembly make if the proposals are implemented?

**The First Minister:** We have neither ruled out nor ruled in the issue of congestion charging. It is a matter of how big or historic the city is. You will be aware of systems in cities such as Oxford, Cambridge, Norwich, Bath—any city where there are important conservation or tourism interests or narrow semi-medieval street patterns. London wants to use the latest technology to read the number plates of cars using video cameras so that motorists can be charged—or fined if they fail to pay the charge. We have no proposals to bring in such a scheme.

**Nick Bourne:** Do you accept that the consequence of road charging of the type that is under discussion—not just for city centres, which I accept is a different matter and has worked successfully in Cambridge—will be to channel traffic from major roads onto side roads, which will cause congestion in towns and villages? Will you ensure that any consultation will take account of representations against these proposals in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I have read calculations by David Begg, Chair of the UK Commission for Integrated Transport, that state that on a zero sum gain if you take the quantum of tax without increasing it but rather re-jig it, Welsh drivers would be better off. Our roads are less congested therefore most drivers would pay less net tax. Drivers who use congested motorways and city centres would pay more tax out of the same quantum. I will not commit myself to ruling it out, when the

mwyn buddsoddi yn ein dyfodol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mater ariannol yw hwn i Edwina Hart. Byddaf yn sicrhau ei bod yn ymateb i chi.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae trafndiaeth gyhoeddus a ffyrdd cyhoeddus yn wasanaethau cyhoeddus pwysig. O ystyried anawsterau diweddar Stephen Byers, a wnewch sylwadau ar y cynigion presennol ar gyfer codi tâl am ddefnyddio ffyrdd? Pa effaith a gaiff hyn ar Gymru, a pha sylwadau a wnaiff y Cynulliad os rhoddir y cynigion hyn ar waith?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid ydym wedi gwrthod nac wedi derbyn y mater o godi tâl am ddefnyddio ffyrdd lle ceir tagfeydd. Mae'n ymwneud â maint neu hanes y ddinas. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o systemau mewn dinasoedd fel Rhydychen, Caergrawnt, Norwich, Caerfaddon—unrhyw ddinas lle ceir buddiannau cadwraeth neu dwristiaeth pwysig neu batrymau strydoedd lled-ganoloesol cul. Mae Llundain am ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf i ddarllen rhifau cofrestru ceir gan ddefnyddio camerâu fideo fel y gellid codi tâl ar fodurwyr—neu godi dirwy arnynt os na fyddant yn talu'r tâl. Nid oes gennym unrhyw fwriad i gyflwyno cynllun o'r fath.

**Nick Bourne:** A dderbyniwch mai canlyniad codi tâl ar ffyrdd o'r math sydd dan sylw—nad yw ar gyfer canol dinasoedd yn unig, a derbyniaf fod hynny'n fater gwahanol ac sydd wedi gweithio'n llwyddiannus yng Nghaergrawnt—fydd sianelu traffig oddi ar briffyrdd i ffyrdd llai, a fydd yn peri tagfeydd mewn trefi a phentrefi? A sicrhewch y bydd unrhyw ymgynghoriad yn ystyried sylwadau a wneir yn erbyn y cynigion hyn yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Darllenais gyfrifiadau gan David Begg, Cadeirydd Comisiwn Trafnidiaeth Integredig y DU, sy'n nodi ar gynnydd o sero os byddwch yn ystyried maint y dreth heb ei chynyddu ond yn hytrach yn ei hailwampio, byddai gyrwyr Cymru yn well eu byd. Mae llai o dagfeydd ar ein ffyrdd felly byddai'r rhan fwyaf o yrwyr yn talu llai o dreth net. Byddai gyrwyr sy'n defnyddio traffyrdd a chanol dinasoedd â thagfeydd yn talu mwy o dreth o'r un

expert advice is that Welsh drivers would be better off. You would not want to do that either, Nick.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Un o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus pwysicaf yw'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Yn etholiad 2003, bydd yn rhaid ichi wynebu etholwyr Cymru i egluro pam nad ydych wedi cyflawni rhai o'r addewidion clir a wnaethoch yn eich maniffesto yn 1999. Rhof enghreifftiau ichi. Bu ichi ddweud yn y maniffesto hwnnw na fyddai neb yn aros am apwyntiad allanol mewn ysbyty yn fwy na chwe mis. Y mae'r rhestr aros honno wedi dyblu ers 1999. Bu ichi ddweud hefyd na fydd neb yn disgwyl mwy na 18 mis am driniaeth mewn ysbyty, ond mae'r rhestr o bobl sy'n aros wedi treblu i 68,000. Pa esgus sydd gennych i bobl Cymru am y ffaith eich bod wedi methu mor drychinebus yn y maes hwn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Tybiais fod y rhan fwyaf ohonom, gan gynnwys Plaid Cymru, yn gorfod wynebu etholwyr ym mis Mai 2003, ond efallai fod gennych gyhoeddiad arall mewn golwg. O ran y cyfrifoldeb am osod targedau ar ddechrau tymor pedair blynedd y Cynulliad, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth a fu'n ddigon ffodus i gael y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw wynebu etholwyr ar ddiwedd y tymor hwnnw. Ambell dro, ni fydd pob targed yn cael ei gyflawni ac, am resymau ymarferol, newidir rhai o'r targedau. Yr ydym wedi newid rhai o'r targedau iechyd ac wedi gosod targedau eraill yn ymwneud â thriniaethau canser er enghraifft. Disgwylwn gyrraedd y targedau a osodwyd gan Jane Hutt fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb amdanynt.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Rhodri, ond nid yw hynny'n ddigon da. Addewid, nid targed, oedd yr hyn a gafwyd yn eich maniffesto, a hwnnw'n addewid clir a chwbl ddiamwys. Dywed eich maniffesto ar gyfer 1999 hefyd y byddai deintyddion y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ar gael i bawb yng Nghymru a oedd yn dymuno cael eu trin gan ddeintydd o'r fath, a hynny cyn diwedd tymor cyntaf y Cynulliad. Ni wireddwyd hynny. A wnewch edrych ar eich addewidion, a rhoi gwell eglurhad o'r rheswm pam nad ydych wedi llwyddo i'w cyflawni? Pan fyddwch yn wynebu etholwyr ac yn ceisio eu

cwantwm. Nid ymrwymaf fy hun i'w wrthod, pan fo'r cyngor arbenigol yn datgan y byddai gyrywyr Cymru'n well eu byd. Ni fyddech chi am wneud hynny chwaith, Nick.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The health service is one of the most important public services. In the 2003 election, you will have to face the Welsh electorate and explain why you have not delivered on some of the pledges you made in your 1999 manifesto. I will give you examples. You said in that manifesto that no-one would have to wait more than six months for a hospital out-patient appointment. That waiting list has doubled since 1999. You also said that no-one would wait more than 18 months for hospital treatment, but the list of those waiting has trebled to 68,000. What excuse will you give the people of Wales for your spectacular failure in this area?

**The First Minister:** I thought that most of us, including Plaid Cymru, would have to face the electorate in May 2003, but perhaps you have a different announcement in mind. In terms of the responsibility for setting targets at the beginning of a four-year Assembly term, the Government fortunate enough to be given that responsibility will have to face the electorate at the end of that term. On occasion, not all targets will be met, and others, for practical reasons, will be changed. We have changed some health targets and set other targets for cancer treatment for example. We expect to meet the targets set by Jane Hutt as the Minister responsible for them.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sorry, Rhodri, but that is not good enough. Your manifesto contained a pledge, not a target, and a clear and unequivocal pledge at that. Your 1999 manifesto also stated that, before the end of the Assembly's first term, anyone that wished to be treated by an NHS dentist in Wales would have access to such a dentist. That has not been achieved. Will you look at your pledges and give a better explanation as to why they have not been kept? When you face the electorate and try to answer its questions about your pledges, what excuse will you have for your failure?

hateb wrth iddynt ofyn cwestiynau am eich addewidion, pa esgus fydd gennych am eich methiant?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gan fod 15 mis tan etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad, nid yw'n synhwyrol siarad fel pe baem ar ganol ymgyrch etholiadol. Os yw ysbytai a gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol eraill y gwasanaeth iechyd yn parhau i drin mwy o gleifion, mae pobl yn derbyn ein bod yn bwrw ymlaen gyda'n rhaglen o fuddsoddi mwy o arian yn y GIG. Dyna'r hyn a wnawn. Mae rhai targedau yn cymryd yn hwy nag yr oeddwn yn ei ddisgwyl i'w cyflawni, gan ei bod yn cymryd amser i hyfforddi mwy o nyrsus a meddygon. Dyna pam y mae 50 y cant yn fwy o feddygon yn cael eu hyfforddi, o'i gymharu â phan ddaethom i rym. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r meddygon hynny ar gael i'r gwasanaeth iechyd ar hyn o bryd.

**The First Minister:** As there are still 15 months before the next Assembly elections, it does not make any sense to start to talk as though we were in the middle of an election campaign. As long as our hospitals and other NHS primary care services continue to treat more patients, people accept that we are forging ahead with our programme of further investment in the NHS. That is what we are doing. Achieving some targets has taken longer than I had expected, because it is taking time to train more nurses and doctors. That is why 50 per cent more doctors are now being trained, as compared with when we came to office. However, those doctors are not yet available to the health service.

### **Codi Proffil Cymru yn Rhyngwladol Raising the International Profile of Wales**

**C9 Owen John Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch codi proffil Cymru yn rhyngwladol? (OAQ15837)

**Q9 Owen John Thomas:** What discussions has the First Minister had recently with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding raising the profile of Wales internationally? (OAQ15837)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ac yr ydym yn trafod materion sy'n ymwneud â sut i godi proffil Cymru yn rhyngwladol.

**The First Minister:** I meet the Secretary of State for Wales regularly and we discuss issues regarding how to raise the profile of Wales internationally.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae dwy flynedd ers i'r Cynulliad dderbyn y cynnig i wneud dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl genedlaethol. Ni wn pa drafodaethau a fu rhyngoch a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar y pwnc hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y byddwch, wrth ymweld ag Efrog Newydd yr wythnos nesaf, yn esbonio wrth bobl pam nad yw 1 Mawrth yn ŵyl gyhoeddus yng Nghymru, er ein penderfyniad fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

**Owen John Thomas:** Two years have passed since the motion to make St David's day a national holiday was carried in the Assembly. I do not know what discussions you have had with the Secretary of State on this subject. I hope that, when you visit New York next week, you will explain to people why 1 March is not a public holiday in Wales, despite our resolution as a National Assembly.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn mynd i Efrog Newydd ddiwedd yr wythnos hon i ddatlu 1 Mawrth yng nghwmni cymuned Cymry alltud Gogledd America. Byddwn yn trafod sut i godi proffil Cymru yn gyson, mewn byd cystadleuol iawn, a sut i hyrwyddo pwysigrwydd dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn debyg i bwysigrwydd Gŵyl San Padrig i Wyddelod

**The First Minister:** I am going to New York at the end of this week to celebrate 1 March with the expatriot community of North America. I will discuss means of continually raising Wales's profile, in what is a very competitive world, and how to promote the importance of St David's day so that it compares with the importance of St Patrick's

alltud. Mae hwn yn fynydd y mae'n rhaid inni ei ddringo. Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld pa mor uchel bydd yn rhaid inni ddringo er mwyn codi ein proffil i gyfateb â phroffil Gŵyl San Padrig.

**Owen John Thomas:** A yw San Steffan yn gwranddo?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi gofyn un cwestiwn atodol eisoes. Gwerthfawrogwn pe na bai Aelodau yn gweiddi cwestiynau atodol ychwanegol ar draws y Siambr.

day to Irish expatriots. This is a mountain that we must climb. It will be interesting to see how high we will have to climb in order to raise our profile to the same heights as the profile of St Patrick's day.

**Owen John Thomas:** Is Westminster listening?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have already asked one supplementary question. I would appreciate it if Members did not shout additional supplementary questions across the Chamber.

### **Hyrwyddo Delwedd Cymru Promoting the Image of Wales**

**Q10 Janet Ryder:** What progress has the First Minister made in promoting the image of Wales recently? (OAQ15828)

**The First Minister:** I mentioned earlier that I recently visited Dublin Castle on a Welsh-Irish trade and business partnership mission, which coincided with the launch of INTERREG III, following the great success of INTERREG I and INTERREG II. This has additional juicy prospects for the Welsh side of the INTERREG III relationship between Wales and Ireland because, until now, grants have been available in eastern Ireland at a higher level than in the western half of Wales. Now that we have Objective 1, and that the eastern half of Ireland has lost Objective 1, the grants are available at a much higher level on the west Wales side. I am hopeful that that Welsh-Irish relationship will develop and bring greater prosperity to the western half of Wales, including the western half of north Wales.

2:40 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** The image of Wales needs to be promoted not only externally, but also within Wales itself. In some areas, there is still a great deal of work to be done to prove to some people that belonging to Wales is worthwhile. The Assembly has a role to play in that, especially in north-east Wales. In light of that, do you believe that your Cabinet's decision to refuse permission for

**C10 Janet Ryder:** Pa gamau a gymerwyd yn ddiweddar gennych chi, fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, i hyrwyddo delwedd Cymru? (OAQ15828)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Soniais yn gynharach i mi ymweld â Chastell Dulyn yn ddiweddar ar genhadaeth partneriaeth masnach a busnes rhwng Cymru ac Iwerddon, a oedd yn cyd-fynd â lansio INTERREG III, yn dilyn llwyddiant mawr INTERREG I ac INTERREG II. Mae hyn yn rhoi gobaith cyffrous ychwanegol i ochr Cymru o'r berthynas INTERREG III rhwng Cymru ac Iwerddon oherwydd, tan yn awr, bu grantiau ar gael yn nwyrain Iwerddon ar lefel uwch nag yn hanner gorllewinol Cymru. Yn awr bod Amcan 1 gennym, a bod hanner dwyreiniol Iwerddon wedi colli Amcan 1, mae'r grantiau ar gael ar lefel llawer uwch ar ochr orllewinol Cymru. Yr wyf yn obeithiol y bydd y berthynas rhwng Cymru ac Iwerddon yn datblygu ac yn dod â ffyniant gwell i hanner gorllewinol Cymru, yn cynnwys hanner gorllewinol y Gogledd.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae angen hyrwyddo delwedd Cymru nid yn unig yn allanol, ond hefyd o fewn Cymru ei hun. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd i brofi i rai pobl bod perthyn i Gymru yn werth chweil. Mae gan y Cynulliad rôl yn hynny, yn enwedig yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain. O ystyried hynny, a gredwch fod penderfyniad eich Cabinet i wrthod caniatâd ar gyfer

the extension of the industrial estate in Deeside has affected that image in any way?

**The First Minister:** Janet, were you listening earlier? It has nothing to do with the Cabinet. Sue Essex chairs the meeting, but I thought that all Assembly Members understood the procedure of having a cross-party Committee which is chaired by a member of the Cabinet, but with a majority of ordinary AMs from all parties taking the final decision. Are you telling me that you do not understand that, or do you just enjoy blaming the Cabinet for everything? It is absurd, Janet. You must educate yourself, if, after almost three years as a representative, you still do not understand the system.

**William Graham:** Will you outline how you seek to co-ordinate the promotion of Wales within the overall promotion of the United Kingdom in order to increase the number of people who include Wales in their visits to the UK?

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for that question, particularly in the context of the British Tourist Authority's £40 million promotion programme. We are trying to ensure that American tourists, for example, do not avoid the UK altogether. They have not been coming to Britain since 11 September because they see London as a substitute for New York and fear that central London will be hit by a terrorist attack. That is not a reason why they should not come to the UK. They do not want to go to London, and they have traditionally considered that city to be the gateway to the UK. The BTA promotion is intended to ensure that they take advantage of the possibilities of a non-London visit to the UK. Eighty per cent of the population and 99 per cent of the land area of the UK is not in London. Therefore, they can be free of this fear of another 11 September occurring while they are on holiday in the UK.

ehangu'r ystâd ddiwydiannol yng Nglannau Dyfrdwy wedi effeithio ar y ddelwedd honno mewn unrhyw ffordd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Janet, a oeddech chi'n gwranddo yn gynharach? Nid oes gan hyn unrhyw beth i'w wneud â'r Cabinet. Sue Essex sy'n cadeirio'r cyfarfod, ond tybiwn fod pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn deall y weithdrefn o gael Pwyllgor trawsbleidiol wedi'i gadeirio gan aelod o'r Cabinet, ond gyda mwyafrif o Aelodau arferol o bob plaid yn gwneud y penderfyniad terfynol. A ydych yn dweud wrthyf nad ydych yn deall hynny, neu a ydych chi'n mwynhau beio'r Cabinet am bopeth? Mae'n hurt, Janet. Rhaid i chi addysgu eich hun, os, ar ôl bron i dair blynedd fel cynrychiolydd, nad ydych yn deall y system o hyd.

**William Graham:** A amlinellwch sut yr ydych yn ceisio cydlynu'r gwaith o hyrwyddo Cymru fel rhan o'r gwaith cyffredinol o hyrwyddo'r Deyrnas Unedig er mwyn cynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n cynnwys Cymru yn eu hymweliadau â'r DU?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn hwnnw, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun rhaglen hyrwyddo £40 miliwn yr Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydeinig. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau nad yw twristiaid o America, er enghraifft, yn osgoi'r DU yn gyfan gwbl. Ni fuont yn dod i Brydain ers 11 Medi gan eu bod yn gweld Llundain fel efelychiad o Efrog Newydd ac yn ofni y bydd terfysgwyr yn ymosod ar ganol Llundain. Nid yw hynny'n reswm iddynt beidio â dod i'r DU. Nid ydynt am fynd i Lundain, ac ystyriwyd y ddinas honno yn borth i'r DU yn y gorffennol. Bwriad ymgyrch hyrwyddo'r BTA yw sicrhau eu bod yn manteisio ar bosibiliadau ymweld â'r DU heb fynd i Lundain. Mae wyth deg y cant o'r boblogaeth a 99 y cant o arwynebedd tir y DU y tu allan i Lundain. Felly, ni ddylent ofni y bydd digwyddiadau 11 Medi yn digwydd eto tra byddant ar wyliau yn y DU.

## Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

### Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council

**The Presiding Officer:** I have accepted an urgent question to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, and I will call Janet Ryder, Huw Lewis and William Graham. However, before I do so, I draw the Assembly's attention to the sub-judiciary rule contained in Standing Order No. 7.13. I understand that the Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council has commenced legal proceedings in the administrative court of the High Court. In an effort to resolve this matter, the case will be heard shortly. The commencement of legal proceedings means that before allowing this question and answer session to proceed, I must be satisfied on the four points in Standing Order No. 7.13. I am satisfied with the first three points. In relation to the fourth requirement, I must be satisfied that comments in debate must not

'create a real and substantial risk of prejudice to the proceedings of a court or tribunal'.

I understand that the legal proceedings involve consideration by a judge of the administrative court as to the legality of actions taken last year on behalf of the council. I do not believe that asking this particular urgent question will prejudice the legal proceedings. However, I ask that no reference be made to the merits of the case before the court during the question and answer session.

**Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on any talks she has had with Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council about its current position? (EAQ16185)

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I have not had any talks with Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council about its current position. The council inadvertently failed to comply with the procedural requirements laid down in primary legislation, and the Assembly does not have

**Y Llywydd:** Derbyniais gwestiwn brys i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Cymunedau, a byddaf yn galw Janet Ryder, Huw Lewis a William Graham. Fodd bynnag, cyn i mi wneud hynny, tynnaf sylw'r Cynulliad at y rheol is-farnwrol yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.13. Deallaf fod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful wedi dechrau gweithrediadau cyfreithiol yn llys gweinyddol yr Uchel Lys. Mewn ymdrech i ddatrys y mater, gwrandewir ar yr achos yn fuan. Mae dechrau'r gweithrediadau cyfreithiol yn golygu bod yn rhaid i mi, cyn caniatáu i'r sesiwn holi ac ateb hwn barhau, gael fy modloni ar bedwar pwynt yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.13. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y tri phwynt cyntaf. Mewn perthynas â'r pedwerydd pwynt, rhaid imi gael fy modloni na fydd sylwadau mewn dadleuon

'yn creu perygl real a sylweddol o niwed i achos llys neu driwlnlys'.

Deallaf fod achosion cyfreithiol yn golygu ystyriaeth gan farnwr yn y llys gweinyddol ynglŷn â chyfreithlonrwydd achosion a ddygwyd ar ran y cyngor y llynedd. Nid wyf yn credu y bydd gofyn y cwestiwn brys arbennig hwn yn rhagfarnu'r achos cyfreithiol. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i chi beidio â gwneud cyfeiriad at rinweddau yr achos sydd gerbron y llys yn ystod y sesiwn holi ac ateb.

**Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw drafodaethau a gafodd â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful ynglŷn â'i sefyllfa bresennol? (EAQ16185)

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Cymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful am ei sefyllfa gyfredol. Drwy amryfusedd, methodd y cyngor â chydymffurfio â gofyniad gweithdrefnol a gyflwynwyd mewn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol, ac nid oes grym gan

the power to change the resulting position. My officials have met with the chief executive of the council to explain that and to explore how he will ensure that local authority services continue to be delivered pending the outcome of any application to the High Court.

**Janet Ryder:** These are unusual circumstances, where a whole council has been disqualified. There have been a number of incidents where individual councillors have failed to sign declarations. Indeed, at a meeting of Ruthin Town Council last night, it was discovered that a councillor had not signed by the deadline. The guidance given by your office was unequivocal: there was no leeway, allowance, or right of appeal. That councillor was disqualified. In Merthyr Tydfil, a whole council has failed, for whatever reason, to sign the declaration. I would assume that the same rule applies to that council as applied to the Ruthin town councillor. That leaves many questions unanswered. Do you know how many councillors have failed to sign their declarations and are now disqualified? Could you report on that to next week's Local Government and Housing Committee meeting?

With regard to Merthyr Tydfil—and I hope I am not overstepping any boundaries—will you tell us who is running Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council now? What guidance and support has your office given to that authority and what is the status of decisions taken prior to this? I understand that, until the misdemeanour comes to light, those decisions hold firm. What guidance have you given to the officials who are now, presumably, running the council, and are they the same officials who—if we believe the press—are partially responsible for this situation? The press has said that the situation arose as a result of a mistake by officials. However, no such situation is purely the result of an official's mistake. Councils rely heavily on officials to prepare papers and administer the authority, but officials do that on behalf of elected members. Ultimately, the buck must stop at the door of elected members. Questions should now be asked about the role of the leader and the cabinet in Merthyr Tydfil in this. Was it not their

y Cynulliad i newid y sefyllfa. Cyfarfu fy swyddogion â phrif weithredwr y cyngor i esbonio hynny ac i ymchwilio i'r modd y bydd ef yn sicrhau bod gwasanaethau awdurdod lleol yn parhau i gael eu cyflwyno hyd nes y ceir canlyniad unrhyw gais i'r Uchel Lys.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae'r rhain yn amgylchiadau anghyffredin, lle mae cyngor cyfan wedi ei anghymwyso. Bu llawer o ddigwyddiadau lle bu i gynghorwyr unigol fethu lofnodi datganiadau. Yn wir, mewn cyfarfod o Gyngor Tref Rhuthun neithiwr darganfuwyd fod un cynghorwr heb lofnodi erbyn y dyddiad terfyn. Mae'r canllawiau a roddwyd gan eich swyddfa yn ddiamwys: nid oes ystwythder, goddefiad, na hawl i apelio. Anghymhwyswyd y cynghorwr hwnnw. Ym Merthyr Tydfil, methodd cyngor cyfan, am ba reswm bynnag, lofnodi'r datganiad. Tybiwn fod yr un rheol yn gymwys i'r cyngor hwnnw a oedd yn gymwys i gynghorwr tref Rhuthun. Gedy hynny lawer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb. A wyddoch faint o gynghorwyr a fethodd lofnodi eu datganiadau ac sydd yn awr wedi'u hanghymwyso? A allech roi adroddiad ar hynny i gyfarfod Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yr wythnos nesaf?

O ran Merthyr Tydfil—a gobeithiaf nad wyf yn mynd dros unrhyw ffiniau—a wnewch chi ddweud wrthym pwy sy'n gweinyddu Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful ar hyn o bryd? Pa ganllawiau a chefnogaeth a roddodd eich swyddfa i'r awdurdod hwnnw a beth yw statws penderfyniadau a gymerwyd cyn hyn? Hyd nes y daw'r camgymeriad yn glir, deallaf fod y penderfyniadau hynny yn dal yn gadarn. Pa ganllawiau a roesoch i'r swyddogion sydd yn awr, mae'n debyg, yn rhedeg y cyngor, ac ai hwy yw'r un swyddogion—os credwn y wasg—a oedd yn rhannol gyfrifol am y sefyllfa hon? Dywedodd y wasg fod y sefyllfa wedi codi o ganlyniad i gamgymeriad gan swyddogion. Fodd bynnag, nid yw unrhyw sefyllfa o'r fath yn ganlyniad camgymeriad gan swyddogion yn unig. Bydd cynghorau yn dibynnu llawer ar swyddogion i baratoi papurau a gweinyddu'r awdurdod, ond gwna'r swyddogion hynny ar ran aelodau etholedig. Yn y pen draw, mae'r cyfrifoldeb yn disgyn ar yr aelodau etholedig. Rhaid i gwestiynau

responsibility to ensure that papers went to the council on time?

We want to know what is happening in Merthyr Tydfil now, who is running the authority and on whose orders. If an election is held—and I do not see how it can be avoided—it will be your responsibility, Minister, to appoint the returning officer. Will that officer be appointed from within the authority?

**Edwina Hart:** I will respond to those questions as far I can, bearing in mind that this matter has now gone before a judge in the High Court. This is a matter of primary legislation. The law of the land governs these arrangements. My officials wrote to the monitoring officers of all principal authorities and clerks of town and community councils on 14 September, 2 October and 20 December. Each time, it was made clear that each elected member had to undertake to be bound by the code within two months of its adoption by council members. In light of the situation in Merthyr Tydfil, I have made inquiries via my officials regarding the situation in Wales. We do not believe that any other principal council is in the same situation. We are less certain of the position of community councils. Some community councillors have refused to sign the code and have ceased to be councillors. I have no reports of an administrative error similar to that in Merthyr Tydfil.

The requirement that members had to sign the declaration within two months of adopting the new code was made perfectly clear in various ways apart from the officials' letters. Given the wide publicity on this issue, I am certain that matters will be adhered to across the board. On the wider issues involved, and what will happen in terms of council tax, budgets, services, and so on, council officials will ensure that council business continues until a new council is in place to make decisions. The Assembly can only intervene if there is a breakdown in services, and we have not identified any such breakdown at present. However, I will continue to monitor the situation.

gael eu gofyn yn awr am rôl yr arweinydd a'r cabinet ym Merthyr Tudful yn hyn. Onid eu cyfrifoldeb hwy oedd sicrhau bod papurau yn mynd i'r cyngor mewn pryd?

Yr ydym am gael gwybod beth sy'n digwydd ym Merthyr Tudful yn awr, pwy sy'n rhedeg yr awdurdod ac ar orchymyn pwy. Os caiff etholiad ei gynnal—ac ni allaf weld sut y gellir ei osgoi—eich cyfrifoldeb chi, Weinidog, fydd penodi swyddog etholiad. A fydd y swyddog hwnnw yn cael ei ethol o'r goeidd yr awdurdod?

**Edwina Hart:** Ymatebaf gymaint ag y gallaf i'r cwestiynau hynny, gan gofio bod y mater yn awr wedi mynd gerbron barnwr yn yr Uchel Lys. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Mae cyfraith gwlad yn rheoli'r trefniadau hyn. Ysgrifennodd fy swyddogion at swyddogion monitro holl brif awdurdodau a chlercod cyngorau tref a chymuned ar 14 Medi, 2 Hydref a 20 Rhagfyr. Bob tro, eglurwyd bod pob aelod etholedig i ymrwymo i dderbyn y côd o fewn dau fis i'w fabwysiadu gan aelodau'r cyngor. Yng ngoleuni'r sefyllfa ym Merthyr Tudful, gwneuthum ymholiadau drwy fy swyddogion ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Nid ydym yn credu bod unrhyw brif gyngor arall yn yr un sefyllfa. Yr ydym yn llai sicr am sefyllfa cyngorau cymuned. Mae rhai cyngorwyr cymuned wedi gwrthod llofnodi'r côd ac felly wedi peidio â bod yn gynghorwyr. Nid oes gennyf adroddiadau am gamgymeriad gweinyddol tebyg i'r un ym Merthyr Tudful.

Eglurwyd y gofyniad bod yn rhaid i aelodau lofnodi'r datganiad o fewn dau fis i fabwysiadu'r côd newydd yn berffaith glir mewn amryw o ffyrdd ar wahân i lythrau gan y swyddogion. O gofio'r cyhoeddusrwydd eang ar y mater hwn, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd pawb yn cadw at y materion. Ar y materion ehangach sy'n ymhlyg yn hyn, a beth a ddigwydd o ran y dreth gyngor, cyllidebau, gwasanaethau, ac yn y blaen, bydd swyddogion cyngor yn sicrhau bod gwaith y cyngor yn parhau hyd nes y bydd cyngor newydd yn ei le i wneud penderfyniadau. Dim ond os bydd y gwasanaethau'n methu y gall y Cynulliad ymyrryd, ac ni nodwyd unrhyw fethiant o'r fath gennym ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag,



byddaf yn parhau i fonitro'r sefyllfa.

**Huw Lewis:** I know that you will agree, Edwina, that the purpose of politicians is to look after and represent people and communities. Janet seems to have forgotten that, given her comments. The people of Merthyr Tydfil should be our primary concern. Effectively, a tier of government looking after the people of Merthyr Tydfil has been removed. That concerns me and should concern us as an Assembly, because, given that that local authority has effectively been dissolved, we are the next closest in line in representing those people. We have a special duty to ensure that people in Merthyr Tydfil are not penalised for the mistakes that others may have made. I hope that you will agree that we must, as an Assembly, explore all possible avenues to ensure that services are delivered and that spending decisions that are pending and which may be non-controversial—such as those connected to Objective 1—are not interrupted. If they are interrupted so close to the new financial year, many community groups and the communities that they serve could suffer through no fault of their own. The people of Merthyr Tydfil matter in this situation, not mudslinging about who is responsible for what, or whether procedures should be tightened—we can look into that later. What matters now is that we look after the people of Merthyr Tydfil.

2:50 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I agree. My responsibility is to look at services and, if they break down, what I can undertake to do. In light of your comments, I will discuss further with my solicitors, lawyers and officials what issues arise. However, I hope that matters proceeding in another place will enable the situation to be resolved.

**William Graham:** Minister, I am sure that you will have had the same questions as I have had from councillors and community councillors across Wales, from all parties, expressing great misgivings about the Local Government Act 2000 and its code of conduct. With few exceptions, all councillors

**Huw Lewis:** Gwn y byddwch yn cytuno, Edwina, mai diben gwleidyddion yw gofalu am bobl a chymunedau a'u cynrychioli. Ymddengys fod Janet, o gofio'i sylwadau, wedi anghofio hynny. Dylem fod yn pryderu'n bennaf am bobl Merthyr Tudful. I bob pwrpas mae haen o lywodraeth a ofalai am bobl Merthyr Tudful wedi ei diddymu. Mae hynny'n fy ngofidio a dylai fod yn bryder inni fel Cynulliad oherwydd, o dderbyn bod yr awdurdod wedi ei ddiddymu, ni yw'r haen nesaf sy'n cynrychioli'r bobl hynny. Mae dyletswydd arbennig arnom i sicrhau na fydd pobl ym Merthyr Tudful yn cael eu cosbi am gamgymeriadau a wnaed efallai gan eraill. Gobeithiaf y cytunwch fod yn rhaid inni fel Cynulliad ymchwilio i bob llwybr posibl i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'n cael eu cyflwyno ac nad amharir ar benderfyniadau gwario sydd ar fin cael eu gwneud ac nad ydynt o bosibl yn ddadleuol—megis y rhai sy'n gysylltiedig ag Amcan 1. Os amharir arnynt mor agos at y flwyddyn ariannol newydd, byddai llawer o grwpiau cymunedol a'r cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu yn dioddef heb fod unrhyw fai arnynt hwy eu hunain. Mae pobl Merthyr Tudful yn cyfrif yn y sefyllfa hon, nid taflu baw ynglŷn â phwy sy'n gyfrifol am beth, neu a ddylid tynhau gweithdrefnau—gallwn edrych ar hynny yn ddiweddarach. Beth sy'n bwysig yn awr yw ein bod yn gofalu am bobl Merthyr Tudful.

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf. Fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw edrych ar wasanaethau ac, os ydynt yn methu, ar beth y gallaf ei wneud. Yng ngoleuni eich sylwadau, byddaf yn trafod unrhyw faterion fydd yn codi ymhellach gyda'm cyfreithwyr, bargyfreithwyr a swyddogion. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd materion sy'n mynd rhagddynt mewn man arall yn galluogi i'r sefyllfa gael ei datrys.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi cael yr un cwestiynau ac a gefais innau gan gynghorwyr a chynghorwyr cynghorau cymuned ar draws Cymru, gan bob plaid, yn mynegi amheuan dybryd am Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 2002 a'i chôd ymddygiad. Gyda rhai eithriadau, llofnododd

and community councillors throughout the country signed on the advice of their monitoring officers. Merthyr Tydfil is an example of a council that ignored all the comments made publicly. As councillors we were warned repeatedly that we had to sign by a particular date—in the case of Newport it was 8 February—or we would not be councillors. It states that clearly in the Act. Now there are no councillors in Merthyr Tydfil.

We should not subscribe to a culture of blame. We should say that this is a matter of self-reliance. Each member in Merthyr Tydfil had to sign that piece of paper; each member failed to do so in accordance with the law and is therefore not a councillor. To simply make assumptions is not good enough. Someone who wants to represent others must be absolutely correct. In this case, they were not. A Labour Government brought in these measures and the section in the Act is clear. I ask you to urge officers in Merthyr Tydfil to hold an election. I know that democracy comes at a price, but that is exactly what should happen.

**Edwina Hart:** I do not have the powers to urge anybody to do anything in this case. In the first instance, action to deal with this matter lies with the local authority. I understand that there is the possibility of making an application to the High Court. On the issue of everybody being warned, it is true that the monitoring officers of all principal councils and clerks to community councils were advised about the issues in various correspondence. The onus was on them to make the necessary advice available. You indicated that officials in Newport council constantly reminded members to do what was right and ensured that they signed the necessary forms. I cannot comment on what exactly has happened in Merthyr Tydfil; it would be improper of me to do so at this juncture. However, I assure the National Assembly that appropriate action has now been taken within the local authority and that I will take appropriate action in terms of ensuring services for the people of Merthyr Tydfil, should that prove necessary.

yr holl gynghorwyr a chynghorwyr cymuned ar draws y wlad ar gyngor eu swyddogion monitro. Mae Merthyr Tudful yn enghraifft o gyngor a anwybyddodd yr holl sylwadau a wnaed yn gyhoeddus. Fel cynghorwyr fe'n rhybuddiwyd droeon bod yn rhaid i ni lofnodi erbyn dyddiad arbennig—yn achos Casnewydd y dyddiad oedd 8 Chwefror—neu ni fyddem yn gynghorwyr. Datgenir hyn yn glir yn y Ddeddf. Yn awr nid oes dim cynghorwyr ym Merthyr Tudful.

Ni ddylem goleddu diwylliant beio. Dylem ddweud mai mater o hunan ddibyniaeth yw hyn. Yr oedd yn rhaid i bob aelod ym Merthyr Tydfil lofnodi'r darn papur hwnnw; methodd pob aelod â gwneud hynny yn unol â'r gyfraith ac, o ganlyniad, nid yw'n gynghorydd. Nid yw cymryd pethau'n ganiataol yn ddigon da. Rhaid i unrhyw un sy'n dymuno cynrychioli eraill fod yn hollol gywir. Yn yr achos hwn, nid oeddent. Llywodraeth Lafur a gyflwynodd y mesurau hyn ac mae'r adran o'r Ddeddf yn glir. Gofynnaf i chi annog swyddogion ym Merthyr Tydfil i gynnal etholiad. Gwn fod i ddemocratiaeth ei phris, ond dyna'n union a ddylai ddigwydd.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oes gennyf bwerau i annog unrhyw un i wneud unrhyw beth yn yr achos hwn. Yn y lle cyntaf, mae'r gweithredu i ddelio â'r mater hwn yn nwylo'r awdurdod lleol. Deallaf fod posibilrwydd o wneud cais i'r Uchel Lys. O ran rhybuddio pawb, mae'n wir bod swyddogion monitro yr holl brif gynghorau a chlercod y cynghorau cymuned wedi eu hysbysu ynglŷn â'r materion mewn gwahanol lythyrau. Eu cyfrifoldeb hwy oedd sicrhau bod y cyngor angenrheidiol ar gael. Nodwyd gennyh fod swyddogion Cyngor Casnewydd wedi atgoffa aelodau yn gyson i wneud yr hyn a oedd yn gywir a sicrhau eu bod yn lofnodi'r ffurflenni angenrheidiol. Ni allaf wneud sylw ar beth yn hollol a ddigwyddodd ym Merthyr Tudful; ni fyddai'n briodol imi wneud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, gallaf sicrhau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod gweithredu priodol wedi digwydd o fewn yr awdurdod lleol ac y byddaf yn cymryd y camau priodol o ran sicrhau gwasanaethau i bobl Merthyr Tudful, os bydd angen gwneud hynny.

## **Datganiad ar Newidiadau i'r Cabinet** **Statement on Changes to the Cabinet**

**The First Minister:** As required under Standing Order No. 2.4, I announce two changes to my Cabinet. Andrew Davies becomes Minister for Economic Development, including e-commerce and information and communications technology. Carwyn Jones becomes Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business. These changes take effect immediately.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** That must be one of the shortest statements made in the Assembly. I have a few questions arising from it, particularly on the position of the former Minister for Economic Development, Mike German, and the post of Deputy First Minister. Does your commitment to two Cabinet posts for the Liberal Democrats as part of the partnership agreement still hold firm? When do you expect to be able to appoint a second Liberal Democrat to your Cabinet in accordance with that commitment?

My second question is that, if a Cabinet post is being held open for Mike German while we await the result of the inquiry into the allegations against him, what does that mean for Andrew Davies as the new Minister for Economic Development? Can you give a categorical assurance that Andrew Davies's appointment is permanent? All those with whom he deals—the agencies, the Welsh Development Agency, the Confederation of British Industry and so on—must be confident that his position is permanent. Or is he just keeping that Cabinet seat warm for Mike German?

Who is responsible for this tweak, as you call it? Are you responsible, or is this just a matter of trying to keep your coalition partners happy? If you are telling us that you are tweaking your Cabinet just in order to keep a job open for Mike German, is it not true that your political imperative is to keep the coalition going rather than the good governance of Wales?

**The First Minister:** I also read this word

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yn ôl yr angen o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, cyhoeddaf ddau newid i'm Cabinet. Andrew Davies fydd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, gan gynnwys e-fasnach a thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Carwyn Jones fydd y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad. Daw'r newidiadau hyn i rym ar unwaith.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Dyna mae'n siŵr yw un o'r datganiadau byrraf a wnaed yn y Cynulliad. Mae gennyf rai cwestiynau sy'n deillio ohono, yn enwedig ar sefyllfa Mike German y cyn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, a swydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. A yw eich ymrwymiad i roi dwy swydd Cabinet i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fel rhan o'r cytundeb partneriaeth yn parhau o hyd? Pa bryd y disgwyliwch allu penodi ail Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol i'ch Cabinet yn unol â'r ymrwymiad hwnnw?

Fy ail gwestiwn yw hyn, os oes swydd yn y Cabinet yn cael ei chadw ar gyfer Mike German tra'n bod yn disgwyl canlyniad yr ymchwiliad i'r cyhuddiadau yn ei erbyn, beth a olyga hynny i Andrew Davies fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd newydd? A allwch roi sicrwydd pendant bod penodiad Andrew Davies yn barhaol? Mae angen i bawb y bydd yn delio â hwy—yr asiantaethau, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Cyd-ffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain ac yn y blaen—fod yn hyderus bod ei swydd yn barhaol. Neu a ydyw'n cadw'r sedd yn y Cabinet yn gynnes i Mike German?

Pwy sy'n gyfrifol am y lled-newid hwn i'r Cabinet fel y'i gelwir gennyh? Ai chi sy'n gyfrifol, neu ai mater o geisio cadw'ch partneriaid yn y glymblaid yn hapus yw hyn? Os dweud wrthym yr ydych eich bod yn gwneud lled-newid yn eich Cabinet er mwyn cadw swydd ar agor i Mike German, onid yw'n wir fod rheidrwydd gwleidyddol arnoch i sicrhau parhad y glymblaid yn hytrach na llywodraethu Cymru yn dda?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Darllenais hefyd y

'tweak', which you are attributing to me; it is a good word, but it is not mine. If you read it in *The Western Mail*, say so; do not say that you heard it from me. However, it is not a bad word, as this is not a large reshuffle. I am happy to accept that word, but it is not mine and should not be attributed to me.

You asked about the partnership agreement. It remains in force. The circumstances which have prevented it being implemented on a seven plus two basis since July still pertain. However, I cannot answer the second part of your question, with regard to when that will come to an end. That is out of my hands, and that is all I can say on the matter. You knew that before you asked the question, Ieuan. There is no question of Andrew Davies filling the post on a caretaker basis. I do not know where that rumour came from, but it is the second time that I have heard it today. I wish that people would not start rumours. That is not in the statement today nor in the press statement.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you for your statement, which shows your commitment to the principles of natural justice and to the partnership Government. Do you agree that the partnership Government has delivered ideas, focus and stability for this institution and for the people of Wales?

**The First Minister:** I agree with that. The issue of natural justice is important—it is in force now as it was in July—and the issue of delivering for the people of Wales is of enormous importance. As I said earlier to Gareth Jones, having a majority Government has allowed us to deliver on matters such as student grants, public transport and freezing prescription charges. Many policies have been introduced, such as free school milk for under-sevens and the abolition of tests at key stage 1, and many others will be introduced on 1 April. Long may that continue.

**Nick Bourne:** I will take you back to your comments reaffirming the principle of natural justice. Having a reshuffle in which all posts are permanent does not seem consistent with holding a post open for the leader of the

gair hwn, 'lled-newid' a briodolwch i mi; mae'n air da ond nid fi a'i piau. Os mai yn *The Western Mail* y'i gwelsoch, dywedwch hynny; peidiwch â dweud mai gennyf fi y'i clywsoch. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n air gwael, oherwydd nid yw hyn yn ad-drefnu mawr. Yr wyf yn ddigon bodlon derbyn y gair, ond nid fi a'i piau ac ni ddylech ei briodoli imi.

Gofynasoch i mi am y cytundeb partneriaeth. Mae'n parhau mewn grym. Mae'r amgylchiadau sydd wedi ei rwystro rhag cael ei weithredu ar sail saith a dau ers Gorffennaf yn berthnasol o hyd. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf ateb ail ran eich cwestiwn, ynglŷn â pha bryd y bydd hynny'n dod i ben. Nid oes gennyf reolaeth ar hynny a dyna'i gyd y gallaf ei ddweud ar y mater. Yr oeddech yn gwybod hynny Ieuan cyn i chi ofyn y cwestiwn. Nid llenwi'r swydd dros dro y bydd Andrew Davies ar unrhyw gyfrif. Ni wn o ble y daeth y si honno, ond dyma'r ail waith imi ei chlywed heddiw. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe na bai pobl yn dechrau sion. Nid yw hyn yn y datganiad heddiw nac yn y datganiad i'r wasg.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i chi am eich datganiad, sydd yn dangos eich ymrwymiad i egwyddorion cyfiawnder naturiol ac i'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. A gytunwch fod y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi cyflwyno syniadau, ffocws a sefydlogrwydd i'r sefydliad hwn ac i bobl Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf â hynny. Mae mater cyfiawnder naturiol yn bwysig—mae'n bod yn awr fel ag yr oedd ym mis Gorffennaf—ac mae mater cyflwyno ar gyfer pobl Cymru o bwys anferthol. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach wrth Gareth Jones, caniaatodd Llywodraeth fwyafrif i ni gyflwyno ar faterion megis grantiau myfyrwyr, trafndiaeth gyhoeddus a rhewi taliadau presgripsiwn. Cyflwynwyd llawer o bolisiau megis llaeth am ddim i blant o dan saith oed a dileu profion yng nghyfnod allweddol 1, a chaiff llawer o rai eraill eu cyflwyno ar 1 Ebrill. Hir y parhaed hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf am ddychwelyd at eich sylwadau yn ailategu egwyddor cyfiawnder naturiol. Nid yw adrefnu lle mae'r swyddi i gyd yn barhaol yn ymddangos yn gyson â chadw swydd ar agor i arweinydd grŵp

Welsh Liberal Democrat group, your erstwhile partner in Government. You cannot have it both ways. Either one of these posts is temporary pending the outcome of the investigation, or they are all permanent. If the latter, that means that the former Deputy First Minister has stepped aside. Many of us think that that would be the honourable thing for him to do, and it may be what has happened.

**Peter Black:** Why?

**Nick Bourne:** I will tell you why: it is because the good governance of Wales is more important than the Lib/Lab alliance. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will not allow interventions from a sedentary position when Members are asking questions.

**Nick Bourne:** It is not that I found Peter Black's intervention unhelpful, but it is for the First Minister to tell us whether this is natural justice and he is holding a post open, or whether all these posts are permanent. A reshuffle is an opportunity to bring in fresh blood; that has not happened. We still have people doing two jobs. We now have two-jobs Jones rather than two-jobs Morgan. It is a step in the right direction, but it does not seem to me to have grasped the opportunity that a reshuffle offers to cast some people out and to bring new ones in. There is still one fewer member than could be in the Cabinet, so perhaps a post is being held open for the former Deputy First Minister. If so, which one is it? The people of Wales are entitled to know.

3:00 p.m.

**The First Minister:** You are wrong, because the purpose of today's announcement—as required under Standing Order No. 2.4—is to give information about the Cabinet changes that I have made, not to feed or create speculation about Cabinet changes that I have not made. Your question does not seem to me to be legitimate. On the details of the Cabinet changes I have made—you referred to an opportunity to bring in new blood—they are a standard method of career development in which back-of-house and front-of-house jobs

Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, eich partner blaenorol mewn Llywodraeth. Ni allwch ei chael hi'r ddwy ffordd. Naill ai mae un o'r swyddi hyn dros dro tra disgwyliwn ganlyniad yr ymchwiliad, neu maent i gyd yn barhaol. Os mai'r olaf sy'n wir, golyga fod y cyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi camu o'r neilltu. Mae llawer ohonom o'r farn mai dyna fyddai'r peth anrhydeddus iddo'i wneud, ac efallai mai dyna sydd wedi digwydd.

**Peter Black:** Pam?

**Nick Bourne:** Dywedaf wrthyhch pam: mae llywodraethu Cymru'n dda yn bwysicach na'r cytundeb rhwng y Rhyddfrydwyr a Llafur. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chaniatâf ymyriadau gan rywun ar ei eistedd pan fydd Aelodau yn gofyn cwestiynau.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid fy mod yn gweld ymyriad Peter Black yn anefnyddiol, ond cyfrifoldeb y Prif Weinidog yw dweud wrthym a yw hyn yn gyfiawnder naturiol a'i fod yn cadw swydd ar agor, neu a yw'r holl swyddi hyn yn barhaol. Mae ad-drefnu yn gyfle i gyflwyno gwaed newydd; ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Mae gennym bobl yn gwneud dwy swydd o hyd. Yn awr mae gennym Jones dwy-swydd yn hytrach na Morgan dwy-swydd. Mae'n gam i'r cyfeiriad iawn ond nid yw'n ymddangos i mi y daliwyd ar y cyfle y mae ad-drefnu'n ei gynnig, i daflu rhai pobl allan a chyflwyno pobl newydd. Mae un Aelod yn llai yn y Cabinet nag a allai fod o hyd, felly efallai fod swydd yn cael ei chadw ar gyfer y cyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Os felly, pa un ydyw? Mae hawl gan bobl Cymru wybod.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydych yn anghywir, oherwydd diben cyhoeddiad heddiw—fel sy'n ofynnol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4—yw rhoi gwybodaeth am y newidiadau a wneuthum yn y Cabinet, nid i fwydo na chreu dyfalu am newidiadau i'r Cabinet na wneuthum. Nid yw'ch cwestiwn yn fy nhyb i yn un cyfreithlon. Ar fanylion newidiadau'r Cabinet a wneuthum—cyfeiriasoch at gyfle i gyflwyno gwaed newydd—maent yn ddull arferol mewn datblygu gyrfa lley caiff swyddi blaen a

are rotated. It is good for someone who has held a front-of-house job for almost two years, such as Carwyn, to experience a back-of-house job dealing with the machinery of how the Assembly works. Likewise, it is good for Andrew, who has held a back-of-house job for three years as the Minister for Assembly Business, to have a portfolio and a Subject Committee to deal with. That offers major advantages in terms of career and political development for Carwyn and Andrew, and the Assembly will benefit from that in later years.

You asked what might happen in future; we will have to wait. You cross bridges when you come to them, not before. The purpose of making a statement under this Standing Order is not to start speculation, but to give information so that Assembly Members know to whom to table questions and which Minister will turn up to take the ministerial hot seat at Subject Committees. It is also so that the public and Assembly staff know which Minister is responsible for which subject. That is the purpose of Standing Order No. 2.4, as I understand it, and that is the purpose of my statement today.

**Phil Williams:** In Wales, over the past year, industrial production fell by 5.5 per cent, the number of registered businesses fell from 94 per cent of the UK level to 90 per cent, the employment rate fell by 0.6 per cent, although it rose in the rest of the UK, and the gap in average wages for those who work increased by 1.9 per cent. Do you agree that these figures, taken together, represent the failure of your Government to meet its target of reducing the gross domestic product per capita gap between Wales and the rest of the UK? What changes in economic strategy will you recommend to the new Minister for Economic Development so that he avoids his predecessors' failure to meet the targets adopted by the Assembly?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure what that had to do with Standing Order No 2.4. It is the usual Phil Williams funeral service oration on the Welsh economy—that we should all give up, go home, and stop trying

chefn y tŷ eu cyfnewid. Mae'n dda i rywun fel Carwyn, sydd wedi dal swydd blaen-y-tŷ am bron i ddwy flynedd, gael profiad o swydd cefn-y-tŷ yn ymwneud â'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad yn gweithio. Yn yr un modd mae'n dda i Andrew, sydd wedi dal swydd cefn-y-tŷ am dair blynedd fel y Trefnydd i gael portffolio a Phwyllgor Pwnc i ymhél ag ef. Rhydd hyn fanteision mawr o ran datblygiad gyrfaol a gwleidyddol i Carwyn ac Andrew, a bydd y Cynulliad yn elwa ar hynny mewn blynyddoedd i ddod.

Gofynasoch beth allai ddigwydd yn y dyfodol; bydd rhaid inni aros. Yr ydych yn croesi pontydd pan ddewch atynt, nid cyn hynny. Diben gwneud datganiad o dan y Rheol Sefydlog hon yw nid rhoi cychwyn ar ddyfalu ond rhoi gwybodaeth fel bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gwybod at bwy i gyflwyno cwestiynau a pha Weinidog fydd yn dod i sedd boeth y Gweinidog mewn Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Hefyd fe'i gwnaed fel bod y cyhoedd a staff y Cynulliad yn gwybod pa Weinidog sy'n gyfrifol am ba bwnc. Dyna ddiben Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, fel yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall, a dyna bwrpas fy natganiad heddiw.

**Phil Williams:** Yng Nghymru, dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, bu gostyngiad o 5.5 y cant o ran cynhyrchu diwydiannol, bu gostyngiad yn y busnesau cofrestredig o 94 y cant o lefel y DU i 90 y cant, gostyngodd y gyfradd gyflogaeth 0.6 y cant, er iddi godi yng ngweddill y DU a chynyddodd y bwlch mewn cyflogau ar gyfartaledd i'r rhai sy'n gweithio 1.9 y cant. A gytunwch fod y ffigurau hyn, o'u cymryd gyda'i gilydd, yn cynrychioli methiant eich Llywodraeth i gyrraedd ei tharged o leihau bwlch cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU? Pa newidiadau yn y strategaeth economaidd y byddwch yn eu hargymhell i'r Gweinidog newydd dros Ddatblygu Economaidd fel ei fod yn osgoi methiant ei ragflaenwyr i gyrraedd targedau a fabwysiadwyd gan y Cynulliad?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn siŵr beth sydd a wnelo hynny â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4. Dyma bregeth angladdol arferol Phil Williams ar economi Cymru—y dylem oll ildio, mynd adref, a pheidio â cheisio

to improve conditions in the Welsh economy. If you considered what has actually happened, you would see that unemployment in Wales is at a 26 and a half year low. It is now below 48,000. It was last at that level in June 1975. If you were giving any kind of balanced picture of the Welsh economy, I would expect you to refer to how low unemployment currently is. Today, unlike in 1975 and in any other period of low unemployment, it is not combined with rampant inflation; it is combined with the lowest mortgage rates for 40 years. That has enabled spending power to be sustained, and that is why Welsh economic conditions are relatively healthy. I cannot understand why you give a one-sided view of the Welsh economy and talk of failure in how Westminster and the Assembly have run the economy.

**Alun Cairns:** I congratulate the Cabinet members who have moved to new posts. However, is the First Minister's treatment of the Assembly in this reshuffle not almost farcical? Will he clarify the issue relating to the economic development portfolio? Is the new Minister for Economic Development permanent or not? If not, what priority does that give to economic development? If not, what is Mike German's status? If he now sees the benefit of having a full-time Minister for Economic Development, why did he not see it eight months ago? The title of one of Peter Black's poems is 'Where are you now Kate Adie?'. Should we now be asking, 'Where are you, Mike German?'. What is the status of the acting Deputy First Minister? Is the Welsh solution to Welsh problems—which devolution was supposed to bring—to move two-jobs Morgan to two-jobs Jones and even two-jobs Davies, if Andrew Davies maintains his e-business portfolio, which was such an important role that he focused almost all of his attention on it? Is not the reality that you are putting personal interest ahead of the good governance of Wales? No mention was made in your statement about the responsibility for policy presentation, which, we understand from the press, has been handed over to Carwyn Jones. Jack Cunningham was once famously labelled the Minister for Radio 4's *Today* programme. Is

gwella amgylchiadau economi Cymru. Os ystyriwch beth a ddigwyddodd mewn gwirionedd, byddech yn gweld fod diweithdra yng Nghymru ar ei lefel isaf ers 26 a hanner o flynyddoedd. Mae yn awr o dan 48,000. Yr oedd ar y lefel honno ddiwethaf ym mis Mehefin 1975. Pe baech yn rhoi unrhyw fath o ddarlun cytbwys o economi Cymru, byddwn yn disgwyl i chi gyfeirio at ba mor isel yw diweithdra ar hyn o bryd. Heddiw, yn wahanol i 1975 ac mewn unrhyw gyfnod arall o ddiweithdra isel, nid yw wedi ei chlymu wrth chwyddiant rhemp; fe'i cyfunir â'r cyfraddau llog isaf ar forgeisi ers 40 mlynedd. Galluogodd hynny i'r gallu i wario gael ei gynnal a dyna paham y mae amgylchiadau economaidd Cymru yn gymharol iach. Nid allaf ddeall pam y rhowch ddarlun mor unochrog o economi Cymru gan siarad am fethiant y modd y mae San Steffan a'r Cynulliad wedi rhedeg yr economi.

**Alun Cairns:** Llongyfarchaf Aelodau'r Cabinet sydd wedi symud i swyddi newydd. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'r ffordd y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi trin y Cynulliad yn yr addrefnu hwn bron yn chwerthinllyd? A wnaiff egluro'r mater sy'n ymwneud â'r portffolio datblygu economaidd? A yw'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd newydd yn barhaol neu beidio? Os nad ydyw, pa flaenoriaeth a rydd hynny i ddatblygu economaidd? Os nad ydyw, beth yw statws Mike German? Os yw yn awr yn gweld y budd o gael Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd llawn amser, pam na welodd ef hynny wyth mis yn ôl? Teitl un o gerddi Peter Black yw 'Where are you now Kate Adie?'. A ddylem fod yn gofyn yn awr, 'Where are you, Mike German?'. Beth yw statws y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gweithredol? Ai ateb Cymru i broblemau Cymru—yr oedd datganoli i fod i'w roi—yw symud Morgan dwy-swydd i Jones dwy-swydd a hyd yn oed Davies dwy-swydd, os bydd Andrew Davies yn cadw'i bortffolio e-fusnes, a oedd yn rôl mor bwysig fel ei fod bron yn canolbwyntio'n llwyr arni? Onid y gwir yw eich bod yn rhoi eich budd personol o flaen llywodraeth dda Cymru? Ni wnaed unrhyw gyfeiriad yn eich datganiad am y cyfrifoldeb dros gyflwyno polisi, sydd fel y deallwn gan y wasg, wedi ei drosglwyddo i Carwyn Jones. Labelwyd Jack Cunningham

Carwyn Jones now the Minister for BBC's *Dragon's Eye*?

**The First Minister:** You actually asked a factual question at the end of that rant, Alun. I am glad of that because you are right to draw our attention to the issue of handling the media. I said in the press statement, which I issued jointly with Jenny Randerson today, that Carwyn will deal with handling the media. In relation to your other point—I do not know how many times I must state it: you are obviously not a listening member of the opposition, as we, I hope, are a listening Government—Andrew Davies's position is not a caretaker one. I have said that before, and I have now said it again. Someone has tried to spread that rumour. I do not know why and I do not know where it has come from, but it is wrong.

You mentioned the issue of two jobs. Every member of the Cabinet has more than one job. Even setting aside the responsibilities for cross-cutting issues such as sustainable development, equality of opportunity, and social exclusion, no member of the Cabinet has only one job. You have this idea that my having my role and my former economic development role, or Carwyn having his agriculture and Assembly business roles, is notable, unique and therefore worthy of the incredibly funny remark made for the second time this afternoon about two-jobs Morgan and two-jobs Jones. Alun, you must try harder. If you looked at the Cabinet and its responsibilities, you would find that all its members have two or three jobs.

**Gareth Jones:** Ai chi, felly, sy'n dal â'r cyfrifoldeb am y Gogledd? Os felly, rhaid dweud wrthyich, er bod cymaint o sôn am *The Western Mail* yn y Siambr hon, ychydig o ddarllen sydd ar y papur hwnnw yn y Gogledd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny; rhyw 1,000 o gopïau a werthir yn y Gogledd hyd y gwn i. Ni wn a yw hynny'n beth iach ai peidio ond mae'n ffaith. Mae angen inni ystyried sut yr ydym yn ymdrin

yn gofiadwy unwaith yn Weinidog dros raglen *Today* Radio 4. Ai Carwyn Jones yn awr yw'r Gweinidog dros *Dragon's Eye* y BBC?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ar ddiwedd y baldordd hwnnw, Alun, gofynasoch gwestiwn ffeithiol. Yr wyf yn falch o hynny oherwydd yr ydych yn iawn i dynnu'n sylw at fater trin y cyfryngau. Dywedais yn y datganiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddais ar y cyd â Jenny Randerson heddiw, y byddai Carwyn Jones yn delio â thrin y cyfryngau. Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt arall—ni wn sawl gwaith y mae'n rhaid imi ei ddatgan: mae'n amlwg nad ydych yn un o'r aelodau sy'n gwrando ymhlith y gwrthbleidiau, fel yr ydym ni, gobeithio, yn Llywodraeth sy'n gwrando—nid swydd gofalwr yw un Andrew Davies. Dywedais hynny o'r blaen ac yr wyf wedi ei ddweud eto. Mae rhywun wedi ceisio lledaenu'r si honno. Ni wn pam ac ni wn o ble y daeth, ond mae'n anghywir.

Bu i chi sôn am fater dwy swydd. Mae gan bob Aelod o'r Cabinet fwy nag un swydd. Hyd yn oed os rhoddir cyfrifoldebau dros faterion trawsbynciol megis datblygiad cynaliadwy, cyfleoedd cyfartal, ac allgáu cymdeithasol o'r neilltu nid oes gan unrhyw Aelod o'r Cabinet un swydd yn unig. Mae'r syniad yn eich pen bod y ffaith fod gennyf i fy rôl a'm cyn-rôl datblygu economaidd, neu fod gan Carwyn ei rôl amaethyddiaeth a'i rôl fel Trefnydd, yn beth nodedig, unigryw ac felly yn teilyngu'r sylw anhygoel o ddoniol a wnaed am yr eildro'r prynhawn yma am Morgan dwy-swydd a Jones dwy-swydd. Alun bydd yn rhaid i chi ymdrechu'n galetach. Pe baech yn edrych ar y Cabinet a'i gyfrifoldebau, byddech yn gweld bod gan bob un o'i aelodau ddwy neu dair swydd.

**Gareth Jones:** Do you, therefore, still have responsibility for north Wales? If so, I must tell you that, although much mention is made of *The Western Mail* in this Chamber, it is little read in north Wales.

**The First Minister:** I accept that. To the best of my knowledge, about 1,000 copies are sold in north Wales. I do not know whether that is a healthy state of affairs or not, but it is a fact. We need to consider how we deal with



â'r cyfryngau a'r ffaith bod rhai agweddau ar y cyfryngau yn cael mwy o sylw nag eraill yn y Siambr hon gan gywiro materion yn union fel yr ydych newydd wneud. Cadarnhaf na fydd newidiadau eraill yng nghyfrifoldebau Gweinidogion a bod fy nghyfrifoldeb am y Gogledd felly yn union fel yr oedd o'r blaen.

**Peter Rogers:** Is it not the case that being the Minister for Assembly Business must be somewhat of a political granny-annexe for Carwyn Jones, given that he was widely tipped for the economic development post? Have you not now created a part-time Minister for Rural Affairs just to keep the Liberal Democrats happy? Do you not understand that the countryside is in crisis following foot and mouth disease and that it needs the attention of a full-time Minister? Does not the failure to recognise farming needs at this critical time show your complete lack of understanding and respect for rural Wales? Is this not a pig-in-a-poke reshuffle for two-job Jones?

**The First Minister:** Here we go again. You are obviously not a listener either. You have been given your sheet of paper and you have to read out what is written on it, regardless of what has gone before, Peter. I did not read any of those widely tipped comments. I do not know whether they were in the paper that Gareth Jones does not like, or perhaps in the other paper that he approves of slightly more. However, I did not read them and so I do not know to what you refer. I can only repeat that no member of the Cabinet has only one job.

**Rod Richards:** I congratulate the First Minister on the appointment of Andrew Davies as Minister for Economic Development, because he certainly cannot do any worse than his predecessors. In considering his reshuffle, was the First Minister playing with a full deck? Did he consider everyone fully? Did he consider Peter Black, Mick Bates and other talented Members on his backbenches such as Ron Davies? Were all these people considered fairly?

**The First Minister:** Rod, I have said it before and I will say it again: the purpose of a statement being made under Standing Order

the media and remedy the fact that some parts of the media receive more attention than others in this Chamber, as you have just done. I confirm that there will be no other changes to Ministers' responsibilities and that my responsibility for north Wales is therefore exactly as before.

**Peter Rogers:** Onid y gwir yw bod swydd y Trefnydd i ryw raddau yn ychwanegiad gwleidyddol i Carwyn Jones, o gofio iddo gael ei enwi'n fynych fel y ffefryn ar gyfer y swydd datblygu economaidd? Onid ydych yn awr wedi creu Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig rhan amser yn unig er mwyn cadw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn hapus? Oni ddeallwch fod y wlad mewn argyfwng yn dilyn clwy'r traed a'r genau a bod angen sylw Gweinidog llawn amser arni? Onid yw'r methiant i gydnabod anghenion ffermio ar yr adeg dyngedfennol hon yn dangos eich diffyg dealltwriaeth llwyr a'ch diffyg parch at y Gymru wledig? Onid adrefnu cath mewn cwd yw hyn i Jones dwy-swydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyna ni eto. Mae'n amlwg nad ydych yn gwrandao ychwaith. Cawsoch eich dalen o bapur a rhaid ichi ddarllen beth sydd arni Peter, waeth beth a ddigwyddodd o'r blaen. Ni ddarllenais y sylwadau hynny yn ffafrio Carwyn. Ni wn a oeddent yn y papur nad yw Gareth Jones yn hoff ohono neu efallai mewn papurau eraill sydd yn apelio ato ychydig yn fwy. Fodd bynnag, ni ddarllenais i hwy ac nid wyf yn gwybod felly at beth y cyfeiriwch. Ni allaf ond ailadrodd nad un swydd yn unig sydd gan aelodau'r Cabinet.

**Rod Richards:** Llongyfarchaf y Prif Weinidog ar benodi Andrew Davies yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, oherwydd yn sicr ni all wneud yn waeth na'i ragflaenwyr. Wrth ystyried ei ad-drefnu a oedd gan y Prif Weinidog becyn llawn o gardiau? A roddodd ystyriaeth lwyr i bawb? A ystyriodd Peter Black, Mick Bates ac Aelodau dawnus eraill ar ei feinciau cefn megis Ron Davies? A gafodd y bobl hyn ystyriaeth deg?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Rod, fe'i dywedais yn barod ac fe'i dywedaf eto: diben datganiad a roddir o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 yw nid

No. 2.4 is not for Members to indulge in speculation about Cabinet changes that have not been made, but to give information about the Cabinet changes that have been made. This is not a press conference in which people speculate about the reasons for actions, it is a statement to give information so that the public, Assembly staff, and Assembly Members know to whom to address their Assembly questions or letters, and with whom they will enjoy themselves in the Subject Committees.

3:10 p.m.

### **Datganiad ar Fentrau Iaith a'r Cynllun Teuluoedd Statement on the Mentrau Iaith and the Families Project**

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I am grateful for the opportunity to make this statement about the work of mentrau iaith.

Mae gwaith y mentrau iaith yn bwysig i ddyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg.

If the Welsh language is to flourish as a living language in Wales, it is not only a matter of increasing the number of people who are able to speak Welsh fluently. A living language cannot survive in the long term unless it is used in all aspects of life. Many more children are learning to speak Welsh fluently as a result of formal schooling. Many people have learnt Welsh and are continuing to do so because they need that skill in their professional lives. These developments are welcome, but on their own, they will not secure the language for future generations. It should not be compartmentalised. There must also be social contexts in which people are able to speak Welsh. In that respect, we must develop a robust strategy to promote the use of Welsh within communities. The present pattern of the use of Welsh within communities is complex. There is a varied picture, which depends not so much on numbers, but on the number of Welsh speakers within any area.

Several of the most important initiatives that

rhoi cyfle i Aelodau fwynhau dyfalu ynglŷn â'r newidiadau na wnaed i'r Cabinet, ond i roi gwybodaeth am newidiadau a wnaed i'r Cabinet. Nid cyfarfod i'r wasg yw hwn lle mae pobl yn dyfalu am y rhesymau dros weithrediadau, datganiad ydyw i roi gwybodaeth fel bod y cyhoedd, staff y Cynulliad ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gwybod at bwy i gyfeirio eu cwestiynau neu lythyron a chyda phwy y gallant fwynhau eu hunain yn y Pwyllgorau Pwnc.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i wneud y datganiad hwn ynghylch gwaith y mentrau iaith.

The work of the mentrau iaith is important to the future of the Welsh language.

Os yw'r iaith Gymraeg i ffynnu fel iaith fyw yng Nghymru, nid mater yn unig ydyw o gynyddu'r nifer o bobl sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn rhugl. Ni all iaith fyw oroesi yn yr hirdymor oni bai y caiff ei defnyddio ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd. Mae llawer mwy o blant yn dysgu siarad Cymraeg yn rhugl o ganlyniad i addysg ffurfiol. Mae llawer wedi dysgu Cymraeg ac yn parhau i wneud hynny oherwydd bod angen y medr hwnnw arnynt yn eu bywyd proffesiynol. Croesewir y datblygiadau hyn, ond ni fyddant ynddynt eu hunain yn diogelu'r iaith ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Ni ddylid ei hystyried ar wahân. Rhaid i gyd-destunau cymdeithasol fodoli hefyd lle mae pobl yn gallu siarad Cymraeg. Yn hynny o beth, rhaid inni ddatblygu strategaeth gadarn er mwyn hybu defnyddio'r Gymraeg o fewn cymunedau. Mae'r patrwm presennol o ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg o fewn cymunedau yn gymhleth. Ceir darlun amrywiol, sy'n dibynnu nid gymaint ar niferoedd, ond ar nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg o fewn unrhyw ardal.

Ymysg y mentrau pwysicaf a ddatblygwyd

were established in the last 10 to 12 years in terms of promoting the use of the Welsh language within communities across Wales, are the mentrau iaith schemes. These are community-based language initiatives, which undertake the work of promoting bilingualism within communities. Last year was the tenth anniversary of the first menter iaith—Menter Cwm Gwendraeth. It was initially established following the Urdd Eisteddfod's visit to the area in 1989. It highlighted the opportunities for young people to celebrate Welsh culture and acted as a catalyst, providing a focal point for local volunteers to use the language in a wider context. It brought individuals together to work towards a common aim, creating and strengthening vital community spirit and recognising that such spirit should be sustained and nurtured for the future. The people of the Gwendraeth Valley established a language initiative. Its aim was to promote social and cultural activities through the medium of Welsh—the natural and living language of the area. Menter Iaith Cwm Gwendraeth rose from the grass roots, where local people saw a need and set about fulfilling it in terms of promoting Welsh within their communities. Soon, other people in communities in Wales saw that the initiative that was established in the Gwendraeth Valley was not only interesting but also successful. The demand for mentrau iaith grew at a dramatic rate. There are now 23 mentrau iaith in Wales. The vast majority of these are based on local authority areas. As a result the mentrau are able to work in partnership with local authorities to promote the Welsh language.

The majority of the mentrau have been established during the last five years, with the most recent being established in Swansea and Wrexham during the last six months. The other 22 have taken on board the fundamental principles developed by Menter Cwm Gwendraeth, namely, community participation. Each menter, within each county, must work within the structure most suited to local needs. The mentrau are organisations that nurture and support, and do not impose. The mentrau can help to guide local people towards opportunities that exist within communities to make the most of their language skills. On the other hand, if the

yn ystod y 10 neu 12 mlynedd diwethaf o ran hybu defnyddio'r Gymraeg ar draws cymunedau yng Nghymru, yw'r cynlluniau mentrau iaith. Mentrau iaith sy'n seiliedig yn y gymuned yw'r rhain, sy'n ymgymryd â'r gwaith o hybu dwyieithrwydd o fewn cymunedau. Y llynedd oedd degfed pen blwydd y fenter iaith gyntaf—Menter Cwm Gwendraeth. Fe'i sefydlwyd yn wreiddiol yn dilyn ymweliad Eisteddfod yr Urdd â'r ardal yn 1989. Amlygodd gyfleoedd i bobl ifanc ddatlu diwylliant Cymreig a gweithredodd fel catalydd, gan roi canolbwynt ar gyfer gwirfoddolwyr lleol i ddefnyddio'r iaith mewn cyd-destun ehangach. Daeth ag unigolion at ei gilydd er mwyn gweithio tuag at nod gyffredin, sef creu a chryfhau ysbryd gymunedol hanfodol a chydabod y dylid cynnal a meithrin ysbryd o'r fath ar gyfer y dyfodol. Sefydlodd pobl Cwm Gwendraeth fenter iaith. Ei nod oedd hybu gweithgareddau cymdeithasol a diwylliannol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg—iaith naturiol fyw yr ardal. Cododd Menter Iaith Cwm Gwendraeth o lawr gwlad, lle gwelodd pobl leol bod angen ac aethant ati i'w ddiwallu o ran hybu Cymraeg o fewn eu cymunedau. Yn fuan, gwelodd pobl eraill mewn cymunedau yng Nghymru bod y fenter a sefydlwyd yng Nghwm Gwendraeth nid yn unig yn ddiddorol ond yn llwyddiannus hefyd. Tyfodd y galw am fentrau iaith yn ddramatig. Bellach mae 23 o fentrau iaith yng Nghymru. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r rhain yn seiliedig ar ardaloedd awdurdod lleol. O ganlyniad, gall y mentrau weithio mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol i hybu'r Gymraeg.

Sefydlwyd y rhan fwyaf o'r mentrau yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf, a sefydlwyd y rhai diweddaraf yn Abertawe a Wrecsam yn ystod y chwe mis diwethaf. Mae'r 22 arall wedi ystyried yr egwyddorion sylfaenol a ddatblygwyd gan Fenter Cwm Gwendraeth, sef cyfranogiad y gymuned. Rhaid i bob menter, o fewn pob sir, weithio o fewn strwythur sy'n gweddu orau i anghenion lleol. Mae'r mentrau yn fudiadau sy'n meithrin a chefnogi yn hytrach na gorfodi. Gall y mentrau helpu i arwain pobl leol at gyfleoedd sy'n bodoli o fewn cymunedau i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar eu sgiliau ieithyddol. Ar y llaw arall, os bydd y mentrau yn nodi bwch

mentrau identify a gap in bilingual provision within their own community, they are well placed to facilitate the development of the provision either through their own initiative or in partnership with others. A good example of partnership working is in Cardiff, where Menter Caerdydd and the Urdd have been successful in securing funding to appoint a youth officer to work with secondary school pupils and provide social opportunities for them through the medium of Welsh.

During 2000, the Welsh Language Board commissioned an independent review of the work of the mentrau iaith. When Iaith Cyf. reported on its findings at the beginning of 2001, it was able to indicate much good practice in the mentrau. The report also suggested that the mentrau were insufficiently supported. Both the Assembly and the Welsh Language Board has responded to this report. In 1999-2000, the mentrau received just under £300,000 from Assembly resources. In this financial year, the figure is almost £662,000. Since the production of the report, the Welsh Language Board has been working with the mentrau to deal with those recommendations that were judged to be feasible to implement. The network of mentrau iaith is now better supported, with a dedicated member of staff at the language board. The Assembly has recently been able to give a further boost to good practice in the mentrau. Mentrau iaith in north Wales developed a welcome pack, which is distributed through, amongst other bodies, estate agencies. These packs help people to understand the area into which they are moving, offer information on local amenities and opportunities to become involved in the community. The Finance Minister and I agreed that this good practice should be extended and an additional £10,000 has been allocated to the Welsh Language Board to enable it to develop a website for the purpose.

Another essential aspect of promoting the Welsh language at both a personal and social level is the emphasis we are now placing on language transfer. Transferring a language to the next generation is a sign of respect for that language and a mark of its importance to you. One of the major problems facing

o ran darpariaeth ddwyieithog o fewn eu cymunedau, maent mewn sefyllfa dda i hwyluso'r broses o ddatblygu'r ddarpariaeth naill ai drwy gyfrwng eu menter eu hunain neu mewn partneriaeth ag eraill. Ceir enghraifft dda o weithio mewn partneriaeth yng Nghaerdydd, lle bu Menter Caerdydd a'r Urdd yn llwyddiannus o ran sicrhau arian i benodi swyddog ieuenctid i weithio gyda disgyblion ysgolion uwchradd a darparu cyfleoedd cymdeithasol iddynt drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Yn ystod 2000, comisiynodd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg adolygiad annibynnol o waith y mentrau iaith. Pan gyflwynodd Iaith Cyf. adroddiad ar ei ganfyddiadau ar ddechrau 2001, yr oedd yn gallu dangos sawl enghraifft o arferion da o fewn y mentrau. Awgrymodd yr adroddiad hefyd nad oedd y mentrau yn cael digon o gymorth ariannol. Ymatebodd y Cynulliad a Bwrdd yr Iaith i'r adroddiad hwn. Yn 1999-2000, derbyniodd y mentrau ychydig llai na £300,000 gan adnoddau'r Cynulliad. Mae'r ffigur bron yn £662,000 yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Ers cynhyrchu'r adroddiad, bu Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn gweithio gyda'r mentrau er mwyn ymdrin â'r argymhellion hynny y credid eu bod yn ymarferol i'w cyflwyno. Bellach caiff rhwydwaith y mentrau iaith eu cefnogi'n well, gydag aelod o staff penodedig ym mwrdd yr iaith. Yn ddiweddar yr oedd y Cynulliad yn gallu rhoi hwb pellach i arfer da yn y mentrau. Datblygodd y mentrau iaith yn y Gogledd becyn croeso, a ddsberthir gan gwmnïau gwerthu tai, ymysg eraill. Mae'r pecynnau hyn yn helpu pobl i ddeall yr ardal y maent yn symud iddi, gan gynnig gwybodaeth ar amwynderau lleol a chyfleoedd i ddod yn rhan o'r gymuned. Cytunodd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a minnau y dylid ymestyn yr arfer da hwn, a dyrannwyd £10,000 ychwanegol i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg er mwyn ei alluogi i ddatblygu gwefan i'r diben hwn.

Agwedd hanfodol arall ar hybu'r iaith Gymraeg ar lefel bersonol a chymdeithasol yw'r pwyslais yr ydym bellach yn ei roi ar drosglwyddo iaith. Mae trosglwyddo iaith i'r genhedlaeth nesaf yn arwydd o barch tuag at yr iaith honno ac o ba mor bwysig ydyw i chi. Un o'r problemau mawr sy'n wynebu

minority languages throughout the world is that parents do not pass them on to their children. This is a challenge. For around four years, the Welsh Language Board has been distributing leaflets on the benefits of bilingualism in the Bounty packs, which are distributed to the 31,000 mothers who give birth in Wales every year. In 1999-2000, the board ran a pilot project in Carmarthenshire, in collaboration with midwives, health visitors and Menter Iaith Myrddin. The board developed materials to assist professionals to discuss language choice in the home with new parents. The project was evaluated and judged to have the desired effect. It was extended to Denbighshire and Conwy the following year. In this and the two subsequent financial years, the Assembly has committed around £500,000 to extend this pilot throughout Wales. I can confidently call it a groundbreaking scheme because, as yet, no similar scheme is running elsewhere in Europe. The eyes of other minority language communities are on us, and they are ready to learn from our experiences. There is now a network of nine field officers and a development officer working with midwives and health visitors sharing information on the advantages and means of raising children bilingually. This takes the language into the domain at the heart of community life: the home. It reinforces the work that the mentrau do and they are therefore important partners in the project. It is too early to talk about the results of this project throughout Wales. However, if it is successful, it could become an international model.

The Assembly has consistently pledged our support to community initiatives such as the mentrau iaith and the families project. The future of the language depends on its survival in communities. It is significant that the Welsh word for Welshman is Cymro, which means someone from the same community. We must build on this feeling of community to build a bilingual Wales. Diolch yn fawr.

**Owen John Thomas:** Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog ar y datganiad hwn. Mae'n gyfraniad mawr at y datblygiadau yr ydym yn gobeithio eu gweld yn ystod y flwyddyn hon

ieithoedd lleiafrifol ar draws y byd yw'r ffaith nad yw rhieni yn eu trosglwyddo i'w plant. Mae hyn yn her. Ers tua pedair blynedd, bu Bwrdd yr Iaith yn dosbarthu taflenni ynghylch manteision dwyieithrwydd yn y pecynnau cymorth a ddosbarthir i'r 31,000 o famau sy'n rhoi genedigaeth yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. Yn 1999-2000, cynhaliodd y bwrdd brosiect peilot yn Sir Gaerfyrddin, ar y cyd â bydwagedd, ymwelwyr iechyd a Menter Iaith Myrddin. Datblygodd y bwrdd ddeunyddiau i gynorthwyo gweithwyr proffesiynol i drafod dewis iaith yn y cartref gyda rhieni newydd. Gwerthuswyd y prosiect a barnwyd ei fod yn cael yr effaith a ddymunwyd. Fe'i hymestynnwyd i Sir Ddinbych a Chonwy yn ystod y flwyddyn ganlynol. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon a'r ddwy sydd i ddod, ymrwymodd y Cynulliad tua £500,000 i ymestyn y cynllun peilot hwn i bob rhan o Gymru. Gallaf yn hyderus ei alw yn gynllun sy'n torri tir newydd, gan nad oes, hyd yma, gynllun tebyg yn unman arall yn Ewrop. Mae cymunedau ieithoedd lleiafrifol eraill yn ein gwyllo, ac maent yn barod i ddysgu o'n profiadau. Bellach ceir rhwydwaith o naw swyddog maes sy'n gweithio â bydwagedd ac ymwelwyr iechyd er mwyn rhannu gwybodaeth am fanteision dwyieithrwydd a ffyrdd o fagu plant yn ddwyieithog. Mae hyn yn cyflwyno'r iaith i galon bywyd cymunedol: y cartref. Mae'n atgyfnerthu gwaith y mentrau ac maent felly yn bartneriaid pwysig yn y prosiect. Mae'n rhy fuan sôn am ganlyniadau'r prosiect hwn ar hyd a lled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, os yw'n llwyddiannus, gall ddod yn fodel rhyngwladol.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi addo yn gyson ein cefnogaeth i fentrau cymunedol megis y mentrau iaith a'r prosiect teuluoedd. Mae dyfodol yr iaith yn dibynnu ar ei goroesiad mewn cymunedau. Mae'n arwyddocaol mai'r gair Cymraeg am ddyn o Gymru yw Cymro, sy'n golygu rhywun o'r un gymuned. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar y teimlad hwn o gymuned er mwyn adeiladu Cymru ddwyieithog. Diolch yn fawr.

**Owen John Thomas:** I congratulate the Minister on this statement. It is a great contribution toward the developments that we hope to see for the Welsh language during

dros y Gymraeg. Bu ichi daro'r hoelen ar ei phen pan ddywedasoch ar ddechrau eich datganiad mai cynyddu nifer y Cymry Cymraeg, a chynyddu eu cyfleoedd i ddefnyddio'r iaith, yw'r ddau hanfod sylfaenol bwysig yng ngoroesiad yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae pwysigrwydd y mentrau iaith yn ganolog i hyn. Mae sicrhau y caiff pobl ifanc—sydd, efallai, mewn rhai ardaloedd erbyn hyn, yn y lleiafrif—y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r iaith yn gymdeithasol yn bwysig.

3:20 p.m.

Bu ichi gyfeirio at Eisteddfod yr Urdd Cwm Gwendraeth yn 1989, a theimlad y bobl a ddaeth at ei gilydd i'w threfnu, fod yn rhaid cadw momentwm y bywyd cymunedol Cymraeg hwn. Yn sgîl y trafodaethau dilynol, ffurfiwyd menter iaith gyntaf Cymru yn 1992, yng Nghwm Gwendraeth.

Mae hyn yn fy atgoffa o'r bobl a ddaeth at ei gilydd yn yr un ffordd i godi arian i gynnal yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yng Nghasnewydd, lle mae 2,000, neu efallai 2,500 o bobl, yn gallu siarad Cymraeg. Yn sgîl hynny, sefydlwyd yr ysgol Gymraeg gyntaf yng Nghasnewydd, ac erbyn hyn mae ganddi 400 o blant mewn adeilad braf, newydd sbon. Bythefnos yn ôl, agorwyd ysgol Gymraeg yn Sudbrook, sydd filltir i'r dwyrain o dwnnel yr Hafren. Wrth deithio drwy'r twnnel o Loegr i Gymru, yr ydych yn mynd o dan yr ysgol Gymraeg cyn cyrraedd tir Cymru ar ochr orllewinol y twnnel.

Edrychaf ymlaen, felly, at y dydd pan fydd y Cynulliad yn penderfynu rhoi arian i sicrhau menter iaith ar gyfer Casnewydd, Mynwy, a Thor-faen, oherwydd bod eisiau rhywbeth felly yn yr ardaloedd hynny—yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai David Davies ac Aelodau eraill yn cytuno â hynny. Mae 22 menter iaith yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld y trydydd ar hugain. Mae'n bwysig bod y mentrau hyn yn canolbwyntio ar faterion megis chwaraeon, adloniant, a gweithgareddau eraill, ac yn rhoi cyfle i bobl fwynhau'r iaith gyda'i gilydd. Gwnânt waith pwysig, ac y maent yn cyfoethogi bywyd cymdeithasol a diwylliannol, a thrwy hynny, yn ychwanegu at fywyd yr iaith yn yr ardal.

this year. You hit the nail on the head when you said at the start of your statement that increasing the number of Welsh speakers, and increasing their opportunities to use the language, are the two most fundamentally important contributory factors to the survival of the Welsh language. The importance of the mentrau iaith is central to this. Ensuring that young people—who, in some areas, may by now be in the minority—have the opportunity to use the language socially is important.

You referred to the Urdd Eisteddfod held in the Gwendraeth Valley in 1989, and the organisers' desire to ensure that the momentum generated by this event be maintained within their communities. As a result of the ensuing discussions, Wales's first menter iaith was formed in 1992, in the Gwendraeth Valley.

This reminds me of the people who came together in the same way to raise money to hold the National Eisteddfod in Newport, where 2,000, or perhaps 2,500, people speak Welsh. That resulted in the establishment of the first Welsh-medium school in Newport, which today has 400 children in a pristine new building. A fortnight ago, a Welsh school was opened in Sudbrook, which is a mile to the east of the Severn tunnel. In travelling through the tunnel from England to Wales, you pass underneath the Welsh school, before reaching Welsh soil at the western end of the tunnel.

Therefore, I look forward to the day when the Assembly decides to provide funding to establish a menter iaith in Newport, Monmouth, and Torfaen, because this type of organisation is needed in these areas—I am sure that David Davies and other Members agree with that. There are currently 22 mentrau iaith in Wales, and I look forward to seeing the twenty-third. It is important that these mentrau concentrate on matters such as sport, entertainment and other activities, and give people the opportunity to enjoy the language together. They do important work, and enrich social and cultural life, and in so doing, add to the vitality of the language in the area.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y cynllun wedi'i ehangu, ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn lansio cynllun y teuluoedd. Mae hynny'n bwysig gan mai'r teulu a'r aelwyd, yn ogystal â'r system addysg, fydd yn sicrhau cynnydd yn nifer y Cymry Cymraeg. Fel y dywedwch, mewn rhai teuluoedd, dim ond un rhiant sy'n siarad yr iaith ac nid yw'r iaith yn cael ei throsglwyddo. Mae'r cynllun teuluoedd a'r pecynnau *Bounty* yr oeddech yn sôn amdanynt, yn bwysig, yr wyf yn eu croesawu, ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich datganiad heddiw.

**Jenny Randerson:** You have pinpointed several key issues. First, the importance of providing opportunities to use the language, not just in school and at work, but in our social lives and in the home. There are real issues about the need to encourage young people—teenagers in particular—to use Welsh in their social life. There is a tendency for them to adopt English.

On the issue of transference within the family, research has shown that if both parents are Welsh speakers, the chances of the language being handed on to the child are 92 per cent—one wonders about the other 8 per cent; but 92 per cent is high. However, if only one parent speaks Welsh, the chances fall to less than 50 per cent. There are ways in which the only Welsh-speaking parent in a family can be encouraged and helped to pass on the language in a way that is acceptable to the family as a whole. That requires skill and information, which is what the Bounty packs are designed to provide.

**John Griffiths:** I echo Owen John Thomas's remarks on the situation in Newport. Given that less Welsh is spoken there, I am sure that you would appreciate that, in many ways, there is a greater need for support to ensure that pupils who speak Welsh have the opportunity to use the language in the community. Will you say something about the greater support that Newport and similar areas need and what will be done about that?

**Jenny Randerson:** I share your concern and

I am pleased that this scheme has been extended, and I am pleased to hear that you are launching the families project. This is important because it is the family and the home, as well as the education system, that will ensure an increase in the number of Welsh speakers. As you say, in some families, only one parent speaks the language, and it is not passed on. The families project and the Bounty packs that you mentioned are important. I welcome them, and I am pleased to hear your statement today.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr ydych wedi tynnu sylw at nifer o faterion allweddol. Yn gyntaf, pwysigrwydd rhoi cyfleoedd i ddefnyddio'r iaith, nid yn unig yn yr ysgol ac yn y gwaith, ond yn ein bwydau cymdeithasol ac yn y cartref. Ceir materion gwirioneddol ynghylch yr angen i annog pobl ifanc—sydd yn eu harddegau yn benodol—i ddefnyddio Cymraeg yn eu bywyd cymdeithasol. Mae tuedd iddynt siarad Saesneg.

O ran y mater o drosglwyddo iaith o fewn y teulu, dangosodd ymchwil fod 92 y cant o siawns y trosglwyddir yr iaith i'r plentyn os yw'r ddau riant yn siarad Cymraeg—tybed am yr 8 y cant arall; ond mae 92 y cant yn ganran uchel. Fodd bynnag, os mai dim ond un rhiant sy'n siarad Cymraeg, mae llai na 50 y cant o siawns. Mae ffyrdd o annog a helpu'r unig riant sy'n siarad Cymraeg i drosglwyddo'r iaith mewn modd sy'n dderbyniol i'r teulu cyfan. Mae hynny'n gofyn am fedr a gwybodaeth, sef nod y pecynnau *Bounty*.

**John Griffiths:** Ategaf sylwadau Owen John Thomas ar y sefyllfa yng Nghasnewydd. O ystyried y caiff llai o Gymraeg ei siarad yno, yr wyf yn sicr y byddech yn cydnabod bod angen mwy o gymorth, mewn sawl ffordd, i sicrhau y caiff disgyblion sy'n siarad Cymraeg y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r iaith yn y gymuned. A ddywedwch rywbeth am y gymorth ychwanegol sydd ei angen ar Gasnewydd ac ardaloedd tebyg a'r hyn a gaiff ei wneud am hynny?

**Jenny Randerson:** Rhannaf eich pryder a

I have been considering for some time how we can ensure that mentrau iaith are established in those areas of Wales that they do not currently cover. Essentially, those areas include the former Gwent and the Vale of Glamorgan, where there are gaps. The best way to achieve this is by undertaking work in those areas to stimulate and enhance the demand; to make people aware that this facility could be available. I am sure that by working with the parents of those children through the Welsh-medium schools, there would be the sufficient demand to establish a menter iaith.

The pledge to increase funding in the budget next year will provide the opportunity to ensure that the whole of Wales is covered by mentrau iaith. It is an interesting experiment and a fascinating concept that has taken off in the past 10 years. They are developing well.

**Jonathan Morgan:** In the absence of Glyn Davies, I welcome this statement on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives. I am unsure as to why it is being made, as it does not announce anything; it is more of a progress report. However, it is useful information for which we are grateful.

We congratulate the work of the mentrau iaith throughout Wales on advancing the Welsh language and ensuring that there are opportunities for people and families to learn the language. I am also aware of the positive impact that Menter Caerdydd has had in the capital and the great strides that we have seen throughout Cardiff to ensure that more and more people have opportunities to learn the language. We welcome the increase in financial support; if we are to turn our words into action, resources need to be made available. Therefore, we are pleased that resources are available to support these projects.

You mentioned problems facing minority languages throughout the world because parents do not pass them on to their children. In Cardiff, I find that Welsh-medium primary schools succeed because the majority of children educated in them come from homes where there are only English-speaking parents. In one Welsh-medium primary

bûm yn ystyried ers peth amser sut y gallwn sicrhau y caiff mentrau iaith eu sefydlu yn yr ardaloedd hynny o Gymru nad ydynt yn eu cwmpasu ar hyn o bryd. Yn ei hanfod, mae'r ardaloedd hynny yn cynnwys yr hen Went a Bro Morgannwg, lle ceir bylchau. Y ffordd orau o gyflawni hyn yw cynnal gwaith yn yr ardaloedd hynny er mwyn ysgogi a chynyddu'r galw; er mwyn gwneud pobl yn ymwybodol y gallai'r cyfleuster hwn fod ar gael. Drwy weithio â rhieni'r plant hynny drwy'r ysgolion Cymraeg, yr wyf yn sicr y byddai digon o alw am sefydlu menter iaith.

Bydd yr addewid i roi mwy o arian yn y gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf yn gyfle i sicrhau bod mentrau iaith ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae'n arbrawf diddorol ac yn gysyniad cyfareddol sydd wedi ennill ei blwyf dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Maent yn datblygu'n dda.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn absenoldeb Glyn Davies, croesawaf y datganiad hwn ar ran Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Nid wyf yn sicr pam y'i gwneir, gan nad yw'n cyhoeddi unrhyw beth; mae'n debycach i adroddiad cynnydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wybodaeth ddefnyddiol ac yr ydym yn falch o'i chael.

Llongyfarchwn waith y mentrau iaith ar hyd a lled Cymru ar hybu'r Gymraeg a sicrhau bod cyfleoedd i bobl a theuluoedd ddysgu'r iaith. Yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r effaith gadarnhaol a gafodd Menter Caerdydd yn y brifddinas a'r camau breision a welwyd gennym yng Nghaerdydd i sicrhau bod mwy a mwy o bobl yn cael cyfle i ddysgu'r iaith. Croesawn y cynnydd mewn cymorth ariannol; os ydym am wireddu ein geiriau, bydd angen rhyddhau adnoddau. Felly, yr ydym yn falch bod adnoddau ar gael i gefnogi'r prosiectau hyn.

Bu ichi sôn am y problemau y mae ieithoedd lleiafrifol yn eu hwynebu ar draws y byd am nad yw rhieni yn eu trosglwyddo i'w plant. Yng Nghaerdydd, yr wyf yn canfod bod ysgolion cynradd Cymraeg yn llwyddo am fod y rhan fwyaf o'r plant a addysgir ynddynt yn dod o gartrefi lle mae'r rhieni yn siarad Saesneg yn unig. Mewn un ysgol gynradd



school in Whitchurch, in my constituency, 75 per cent of the children have non-Welsh-speaking parents. If it were up to Welsh-speaking parents, Welsh-medium primary schools would not survive. It is terrific that so many parents who are not Welsh-speaking choose to have their children educated through the medium of Welsh because they recognise its significant educational value.

My only question relates to the current Welsh-language review. How does this work fit into that review and how will this policy develop as a result of the review's findings?

**Jenny Randerson:** To clarify, it seemed to be an appropriate time to provide a progress report following the Iaith Cyf. report on which there has been considerable progress over the last year in terms of developing the mentrau, their structure and giving them support. They are small organisations, often with only one employee at the beginning of his or her career, therefore there is a need for support. That mutual support has developed. There is also the fact that we announced the extra £10,000 for the website before last week's recess. I was also prompted to give this statement by the figures announced by the BBC a few weeks ago. You should not read too much into a survey of 1,000 people, and the gloss put on the figures was confusing and slightly depressing. However, it did point to the problem of language transference and use within the family. It is worthwhile to assure Assembly Members that work is being done on this issue.

3:30 p.m.

You mentioned parents of children at Welsh-medium schools. More work needs to be done on how to help parents who do not speak Welsh, to learn the language; language transference in reverse, if you wish. There is an opportunity to work on that issue. The work of the mentrau iaith fits closely with the Committee's review of the language. Representatives from the mentrau iaith presented a long and detailed report of their recommendations to the Committee a few

Gymraeg yn yr Eglwys Newydd, yn fy etholaeth i, mae gan 75 y cant o'r plant rieni nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg. Pe baem yn ddibynnol ar rieni sy'n siarad Cymraeg, ni fyddai ysgolion cynradd Cymraeg yn goroesi. Mae'n wych bod cymaint o rieni nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg yn dewis addysgu eu plant drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg gan eu bod yn sylweddoli gwerth addysgiadol arwyddocaol hynny.

Mae'r unig gwestiwn sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â'r adolygiad o'r iaith Gymraeg. Sut mae'r gwaith hwn yn cyd-fynd â'r adolygiad hwnnw a sut bydd y polisi hwn yn datblygu o ganlyniad i ganfyddiadau'r arolwg?

**Jenny Randerson:** I egluro, ymddengys ei bod yn amser priodol i roi adroddiad cynnydd yn dilyn adroddiad Iaith Cyf. y gwnaed cryn gynydd arno yn ystod y flwyddyn diwethaf o ran datblygu'r mentrau, eu strwythur a rhoi cefnogaeth iddynt. Mudiadau bach ydynt, yn aml gyda dim ond un gweithiwr sydd ar ddechrau ei yrfa, felly mae angen cefnogaeth. Datblygodd y gefnogaeth honno ar y ddwy ochr. Cofiw'n hefyd am y ffaith inni gyhoeddi £10,000 ychwanegol ar gyfer y wefan cyn toriad yr wythnos diwethaf. Fe'm hysgogwyd hefyd i roi'r datganiad hwn gan y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd gan y BBC ychydig wythnosau'n ôl. Ni ddylech roi gormod o bwys ar arolwg o 1,000 o bobl, ac yr oedd sut y cafodd y ffigurau eu dehongli yn ddryslyd ac yn rhoi darlun ychydig yn ddigalon. Fodd bynnag, tynnodd sylw at y broblem o drosglwyddo iaith a'i defnydd o fewn y teulu. Mae'n werth sicrhau Aelodau'r Cynulliad bod gwaith yn cael ei wneud ynghylch y mater hwn.

Bu ichi sôn am rieni plant mewn ysgolion Cymraeg. Mae angen gwneud mwy o waith ar sut i helpu rhieni nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg i ddysgu'r iaith; trosglwyddo iaith am yn ôl, fel petai. Mae cyfle i weithio ar y mater hwnnw. Mae gwaith y mentrau iaith yn cyd-fynd yn agos ag arolwg y Pwyllgor o'r iaith. Cyflwynodd cynrychiolwyr y mentrau iaith adroddiad hir a manwl o'u hargymhellion i'r Pwyllgor ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, a fydd yn cael eu trafod a'u

weeks ago, which will be taken on board and considered in detail. The recommendations are diverse and some are extremely interesting. We need to take the mentrau iaith's experience on board. The Committee's review is close to considering its conclusions. The position of the language within the family, home and community seems to be a mainstream element in those conclusions.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Hoffwn eich llongyfarch a chroesawn y dataganiad, yn enwedig y pecyn croeso ar gyfer y Gogledd. A gytunwch y dylai'r mentrau iaith a Menter a Busnes gydweithio fwy?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yes, I agree. The work of Menter a Busnes is also interesting and groundbreaking. The Committee has heard from Menter a Busnes and from the WDA, which has several schemes aimed, at least in part, at assisting businesses to work through the medium of Welsh. One of the key issues may be to consider co-ordinating activities and to increase knowledge about them. In your region, Eleanor, Menter Môn does tremendous work with small local businesses. I said in my statement that Menter Môn works mainly with big businesses, but it also does a great deal with small businesses. For example, it would try to get a butcher, if he spoke Welsh, to understand that using Welsh would be positive for his business and would attract more regular customers. Menter Môn provides that basic knowledge and understanding and assists with the translation of signs, instructions, menus, and packs for businesses.

**Cynog Dafis:** Diolchaf i chi, Weinidog, am y datganiad pwysig hwn. Mae'n werthfawr eich bod wedi rhoi cymaint o bwyslais ar drosglwyddo iaith rhwng y cenedlaethau. Y jargon yn Saesneg yw *intergenerational transference*. A gytunwch mai prawf litmws ar gyfer Cymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog fyddai bod y trosglwyddiad hwnnw yn digwydd fel peth normal, yn rhywbeth y disgwyliad iddo ddigwydd o hyd a bod yr amgylchiadau wedi eu creu ar gyfer y trosglwyddiad hwnnw? A gytunwch hefyd fod darpariaeth gofal ac addysg cyn-ysgol yn bwysig a bod modd cynnal, helpu a

hystyried yn fanwl. Mae'r argymhellion yn amrywiol ac mae rhai yn ddiddorol iawn. Mae angen inni gynnwys profiad y mentrau iaith yn ein hystyriaethau. Mae arolwg y Pwyllgor ar fin ystyried ei gasgliadau. Ymddengys bod safle'r iaith o fewn y teulu, y cartref a'r gymuned yn elfen brif-ffrwd yn y casgliadau hynny.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I congratulate you and welcome your statement, in particular the welcome pack for north Wales. Do you agree that the mentrau iaith and Menter a Busnes should co-operate more?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf. Mae gwaith Menter a Busnes hefyd yn ddiddorol ac yn torri tir newydd. Clywodd y Pwyllgor dystiolaeth gan Fenter a Busnes a'r WDA, sydd â sawl cynllun wedi eu hanelu, yn rhannol o leiaf, at gynorthwyo busnesau i weithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Efallai mai un o'r prif faterion fydd ystyried cydlynu gweithgareddau a chynyddu gwybodaeth amdanynt. Yn eich rhanbarth chi, Eleanor, mae Menter Môn yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol gyda busnesau bach lleol. Dywedais yn fy natganiad bod Menter Môn yn gweithio'n bennaf â busnesau mawr, ond mae hefyd yn gwneud llawer â busnesau bach. Er enghraifft, byddai'n ceisio darbwyllo cigydd, sy'n siarad Cymraeg, y byddai defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn rhywbeth cadarnhaol i'w fusnes ac yn denu mwy o gwsmeriaid rheolaidd. Mae Menter Môn yn darparu'r wybodaeth a'r ddealltwriaeth sylfaenol ac yn cynorthwyo â'r gwaith o gyfieithu arwyddion, cyfarwyddiadau, bwydlenni, a pheynnau ar gyfer busnesau.

**Cynog Dafis:** I thank you, Minister, for this important statement. Your emphasis on transferring language between generations or, to use the jargon, intergenerational transference, is worthwhile. Do you agree that the litmus test for a truly bilingual Wales would be that such transference would occur routinely and as a matter of course and that the conditions for such transference would have been created? Do you also agree that pre-school care and education is important and that it would be possible to support, help and advise parents on language transference to children by working with pre-school

chyngori rhieni o ran trosglwyddo iaith i'r plant drwy gydweithredu gyda'r ddarpariaeth gyn-ysgol mewn ysgolion meithrin, grwpiau chwarae a gweithgarwch ymysg gwarchodwyr plant, a ddylai hefyd helpu a chymryd rhan yn y broses?

**Jenny Randerson:** I will take your last point first. On pre-school education, all research shows that young children learn languages much quicker than older people. Therefore, the earlier you start, the better. It also has the advantage that non-Welsh speaking parents would find it much easier to cope with the language at that simple level and to build up from it, rather than when their child goes to primary school.

The availability of all types of care in the language of your choice is an important basic right, to which we all adhere. However, I would not like to forget the problems that exist. There are many problems with the availability of sufficient care for the elderly in the home setting and in community homes. As a result, it is difficult to say that we could move to that position in the short term. However, we should adhere to the principle.

On transference within the family and between generations, the key issue is that it is dependent on opportunities to use the language. The more opportunities you have to use the language, the more it becomes the normal language of the home and the community.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â'r Gweinidog oherwydd, fel dysgwr, gwn pa mor bwysig yw cael y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r iaith mewn sefyllfa gymdeithasol. Nid yw'n bosibl meistroli iaith mewn dosbarthiadau. Dim ond ar y strydoedd ac mewn cymunedau y gellir gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf lawer mwy o gyfle yn awr i ymarfer yr iaith yn y grŵp Ceidwadol, gan fod mwyafrif aelodau'r grŵp naill ai'n siarad neu'n dysgu'r iaith. Edrychaf ymlaen at y diwrnod pan y gall ymwelwyr â'r Siambreddweud 'draw fan yna y mae Plaid Cymru yn eistedd, ac yn y fan yma y mae plaid y Cymry'n eistedd'.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will avoid the

providers in nursery schools, play groups and childminders, who should also help and take part in the process?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ymdriniaf â'ch pwynt olaf yn gyntaf. O ran addysg cyn-ysgol, dengys pob ymchwil bod plant ifanc yn dysgu ieithoedd yn llawer cynt na phobl hŷn. Felly, gorau po gyntaf y bydd plant yn dechrau dysgu. Mae hefyd yn fantais o ran bod rhieni nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg yn ei chael yn llawer haws i ymdopi â'r iaith ar y lefel syml honno ac i ddatblygu o'r man hwnnw, yn hytrach nag o pan fydd eu plentyn yn mynd i ysgol gynradd.

Mae argaeledd pob math o ofal yn eich dewis iaith yn hawl sylfaenol bwysig, yr ydym i gyd yn glynu ati. Fodd bynnag, ni hoffwn anghofio bod problemau'n bodoli. Ceir nifer o broblemau ynghylch argaeledd gofal digonol ar gyfer yr henoed yn eu cartrefi ac mewn cartrefi cymunedol. O ganlyniad, mae'n anodd dweud y byddem yn gallu symud i'r sefyllfa honno yn y byrdymor. Fodd bynnag, dylem lynu at yr egwyddor.

O ran trosglwyddo o fewn y teulu a rhwng cenedlaethau, y prif fater yw bod hynny'n dibynnu ar gyfleoedd i ddefnyddio'r iaith. Y mwyaf o gyfleoedd sydd gennych i ddefnyddio'r iaith, y mwyaf y daw yn iaith arferol y cartref a'r gymuned.

**David Davies:** I agree with the Minister because, as a learner, I know how important it is to have the opportunity to use the language in a social context. It is not possible to master a language in classes. That can only be done on the streets and in communities. However, I now have much more opportunity to practice the language in the Conservative group, because the majority of the group members either speak the language or are learning it. I look forward to the day when visitors to the Chamber can say, 'the Party of Wales sits over there, and the party of Welsh speakers sits over here'.

**Jenny Randerson:** Byddaf yn osgoi'r

internecine warfare between Plaid Cymru and the Conservatives over the number of Welsh learners. The number of Assembly Members who have taken up the challenge of learning Welsh is astonishing. I believe that about a third of Assembly Members are currently learning Welsh. If you take into account the fact that many of the remaining AMs already speak the language, it can be said that the majority of Assembly Members are actively engaged with the language in some way. I am sure that there will be many more learners here, because the facilities that are offered here for learning the language are extremely good. It is a pattern for the type of flexibility that is needed when employers offer this opportunity, because different people have different learning styles; mine is a slow one.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymunaf â gweddill yr Aelodau i groesawu'r datganiad hwn a'r gydnabyddiaeth o waith pwysig ac arloesol y mentrau iaith. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at nifer o faterion pwysig, megis y pecynnau croeso, sy'n golygu bod pobl sy'n symud i fyw i Gymru yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa newydd y maent ynddi. Mae trosglwyddiad iaith a'r cynllun peilot yn sir Gaerfyrddin yn eithriadol o bwysig. Mae'n bwysig hefyd fod y mentrau iaith yn rhoi cyfle i bobl ddefnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg mewn cyddestun cyndeithasol.

Fodd bynnag, er mor dda yw'r gwasanaeth a gyflawnir gan y mentrau iaith ar hyn o bryd, a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y gallem greu strwythur a fyddai'n galluogi iddynt weithredu'n fwy effeithiol? Pe baem yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem y soniodd John Griffiths amdani—sef yr angen i gael mentrau iaith ym mhob rhan o Gymru—a phe baem yn cydlynu'r gwasanaeth drwy Gymru fel y cynigir gwasanaeth cyson gan fentrau iaith ac y rhennir arferion da rhwng y mentrau iaith gan greu gwasanaeth mwy cyfartal a chyson drwy Gymru, gallai'r mentrau iaith gyflawni hyd yn oed mwy nag y gwnant ar hyn o bryd a gwneud hyd yn oed mwy o wahaniaeth i sefyllfa'r Gymraeg. Nid beirniadaeth mo hynny. Yr wyf yn edmygydd mawr o'r mentrau iaith, ond gallai'r Cynulliad eu cynorthwyo i fod hyd yn oed yn fwy effeithiol yn y dyfodol.

3:40 p.m.

gystadleuaeth frwd rhwng Plaid Cymru a'r Ceidwadwyr ynghylch nifer y dysgwyr Cymraeg. Mae nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad a ymgwymerodd â'r her o ddysgu Cymraeg yn syfrdanol. Credaf bod tua traean o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn dysgu Cymraeg ar hyn o bryd. Os ystyriwch y ffaith bod nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn siarad yr iaith eisoes, gellir dweud bod y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud yn weithredol â'r iaith mewn rhyw ffordd. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd nifer gynyddol o ddysgwyr yma, gan fod y cyfleusterau a gynigir yma i ddysgu'r iaith yn arbennig o dda. Mae'n batrwm ar gyfer y math o hyblygrwydd sydd ei angen pan fo cyflogwyr yn cynnig y cyfle hwn, gan fod arddull dysgu gwahanol gan bobl; un araf yw fy un i.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I join the other Members in welcoming this statement and its acknowledgement of the important and innovative work of the mentrau iaith. The Minister referred to many important issues, such as the welcome packs, which mean that people who move into Wales are aware of the new situation in which they find themselves. The language transference pilot scheme in Carmarthenshire is exceedingly important. It is also important that mentrau iaith give people the opportunity to use the Welsh language in a social context.

However, although the mentrau iaith currently offer a very good service, does the Minister agree that we could create a structure that would allow them to operate more effectively? If we tackled the problem which John Griffiths mentioned—namely, the need to have mentrau iaith in all parts of Wales—and if we co-ordinated the service throughout Wales so that mentrau iaith offer a consistent service and that good practice is disseminated between the mentrau iaith, thus creating a more equal and consistent service throughout Wales, the mentrau iaith could achieve even more than they do at present and make an even greater difference to the Welsh language's situation. That is not a criticism. I am a great admirer of the mentrau iaith, but the Assembly could assist them in becoming even more effective in future.

**Jenny Randerson:** It is important to clarify that there are two types of packs. One is the Bounty packs for new mothers, and the other is a welcome pack for newcomers to a Welsh speaking area. In terms of mentrau iaith, I agree that they should extend to the whole of Wales and that is what I hope to see. However, as you know, the emphasis is on local demand as you said in the second part of your contribution. The Iaith Cyf. report talked about the need for more co-ordination and more consistency. I agree with that, but it must be done in a way that does not stifle the fact that the mentrau iaith exist in response to local needs. For example, Menter Iaith Caerdydd provides appropriately different opportunities from those provided by the mentrau—there are more than one—in Carmarthenshire.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n bwysig egluro bod dau fath o becyn. Un ohonynt yw'r pecynnau cymorth ar gyfer mamau newydd, a'r llall yw'r pecyn croeso ar gyfer newydd ddyfodiad i ardal lle siaredir Cymraeg. O ran y mentrau iaith, cytunaf y dylid eu hystyn i gwmpasu Cymru gyfan, a dyna'r hyn y gobeithiaf ei weld. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddoch, mae'r pwyslais ar alw lleol fel y dywedasoch yn ail ran eich cyfraniad. Soniodd adroddiad Iaith Cyf. am yr angen am ragor o gydlynw a mwy o gysondeb. Cytunaf â hynny, ond rhaid ei wneud mewn modd na fydd yn diystyru'r ffaith bod y mentrau iaith yn bodoli er mwyn ymateb i angen lleol. Er enghraifft, mae Menter Iaith Caerdydd yn darparu cyfleoedd priodol sy'n wahanol i'r rhai a ddarperir gan y mentrau—mae mwy nag un—yn Sir Gaerfyrddin.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones):** Business for the next three weeks, which was agreed by the Business Committee this morning, is as shown on the Chamberweb. Members will also wish to be aware that, following this morning's Business Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined, under Standing Order No. 22.5 that the following six orders need not be referred to a Subject Committee for consideration: the Local Authorities (Executive Arrangements) (Discharge of Functions) (Wales) Regulations 2002; the Local Authorities (Executive Arrangements) (Modification of Enactments and Further Provisions) (Wales) Order 2002; the Local Authorities Executive (Modification of Enactments and Other Provisions) (Wales) Order 2002; the Local Authorities (Alternative Arrangements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002; the Local Authorities (Executive Arrangements) (Functions and Responsibilities) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002; the Local Authorities (Capital Finance) (Rate of Discount for 2002-03) (Wales) Regulations 2002. A copy of this week's Business Statement will be posted to the intranet and the internet.

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a'r Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf, y cytunwyd arno gan y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, fel a ddangosir ar We'r Siambr. Bydd yr Aelodau hefyd am fod yn ymwybodol, yn dilyn Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, bod y Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5 nad oes angen cyfeirio'r chwe gorchymyn canlynol at Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried: Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth) (cyflawni Swyddogaethau) (Cymru) 2002; Gorchymyn Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth) (Addasu Deddfiadau a Darpariaethau Pellach) (Cymru) 2002; Gorchymyn Awdurdodau Lleol (Addasu Deddfiadau a Darpariaethau Eraill) (Cymru) 2002; Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau Amgen) (Diwygio) Cymru 2002, Rheoliadau Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth Awdurdodau Lleol (Swyddogaethau a Chyfrifoldebau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002; Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyllid Cyfalaf) (Cyfradd y Disgownt ar gyfer 2002/2003) (Cymru) 2002. Bydd copi o Ddatganiad Busnes yr wythnos hon yn cael ei gyhoeddi ar y fewnrwyd a'r rhyngrwyd

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any comments on the business statement?

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw gwestiynau ar y datganiad busnes?

**Jonathan Morgan:** I welcome the new Minister for Assembly Business and congratulate the retiring Minister for Assembly Business. In the Business Committee this morning, our colleague Jocelyn Davies requested that the Government of Wales should table a debate on the new Assembly Chamber so that Members can raise many unanswered questions that still exist in relation to the adjudication and the level of information that is being provided to the Assembly. I support that request and ask the Government of Wales to table a debate as soon as possible.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Croesawaf y Trefnydd newydd a llongyfarchaf y Trefnydd sy'n ymddeol. Yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, gwnaeth ein cyd-Aelod Jocelyn Davies gais y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru gyflwyno dadl ar Siambr newydd y Cynulliad fel y gall Aelodau godi cwestiynau nas atebwyd o hyd o ran y dyfarniad a lefel y wybodaeth a ddarperir i'r Cynulliad. Cefnogaf y cais a gofynnaf i Lywodraeth Cymru gyflwyno dadl cyn gynted â phosibl.

**Carwyn Jones:** That matter can be discussed at length in the next Business Committee meeting.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gellir cynnal trafodaeth hir am y mater hwnnw yn y Pwyllgor Busnes nesaf.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. I raised this point of order some 10 days ago. It relates to Assembly communications and specifically to a communication and the release of the adjudication report on Friday 15 February, which was finally released at 7 p.m. shortly before the computer system was expected to be shut down for the weekend. It was up and running again on Saturday, contrary to what anybody expected. While it may be within the letter of complying with communications to Members, the timing was most inconvenient for Members. I relied on getting my communication from the BBC—some 34 pages of fax paper. It is an unsatisfactory way to proceed. Hard copies could easily have been given to Assembly Members. As has been indicated, many questions arise from that adjudication report, and Members should be entitled to ask them of the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities. We had a misleading summary of the adjudication report, more or less indicating that we had lost on a technicality. We now know—on page 9—that the

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Codais y pwynt hwn o drefn 10 diwrnod yn ôl. Mae'n ymwneud â dulliau cyfathrebu'r Cynulliad ac yn benodol â datganiad a rhyddhau'r adroddiad dyfarnu ar ddydd Gwener 15 Chwefror, a gyhoeddwyd yn y diwedd am 7 p.m. ychydig cyn yr oedd disgwyl i'r system gyfrifiadurol gau i lawr am y penwythnos. Yr oedd yn gweithio eto ddydd Sadwrn, yn groes i'r hyn a ddisgwyliai pawb. Er ei fod yn cydymffurfio o bosibl â'r broses o gyfathrebu â'r Aelodau, yr oedd yr amseru yn hynod anghyfleus ar gyfer yr Aelodau. Dibynnais ar y BBC i gael copi o'r ddogfen – tua 34 tudalen o bapur ffacs. Mae'n ffordd anfodddhaol o fynd ati. Gellid bod wedi darparu copïau caled i Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn hawdd. Fel y nodwyd, mae nifer o gwestiynau yn deillio o'r adroddiad dyfarnu hwnnw, a dylai bod hawl gan yr Aelodau i holi'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau amdanynt. Cawsom grynodedb camarweiniol o'r adroddiad dyfarniad, a oedd fwy neu lai'n dweud wrthym ein bod wedi colli ar bwynt

adjudicator was satisfied that the Richard Rogers Partnership had acted professionally, and was not in breach of contract. Questions need answering, and there is the matter of the timing of the document's release.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be plenty of opportunity to ask questions of all Ministers on any matters relating to the activity of the Executive, including the new building. My concern is the free flow of information to Members at all times. I accept the point that wherever possible—unless there are difficult circumstances—relevant material should be e-mailed to Members within our working hours. I appreciate that that may not always be possible. There is, of course, a particular problem at weekends, especially when important development work is being carried out on our IT system, as we have seen today. Ministers will have heard what has been said, and my office will certainly consider any aspects relating to this matter, where we might be able to extend the notice given to Members of any communication, toward the end of a working day.

**Richard Edwards:** Point of order. As Chair of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, I raise this point of order under Standing Order No. 35, in relation to comments made earlier by Janet Ryder about a recent meeting of the Planning Decision Committee. You will know, Llywydd, that Planning Decision Committees draw their membership from the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee on a rota and a cross-party basis. It is an absolute requirement that party politics play no part in its deliberations. The committees are sometimes chaired by myself, sometimes by the Minister, and sometimes by other members of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee. I emphasise that they have nothing to do with the Assembly Government, and are entirely independent of it. I would be grateful if all Assembly Members took the trouble to acquaint themselves with this Standing Order.

technegol. Gwyddom bellach—ar dudalen 9—bod y dyfarnwr yn fodlon bod Partneriaeth Richard Rogers wedi ymddwyn yn broffesiynol, ac nad oedd wedi torri amodau'r contract. Mae angen ateb cwestiynau, a cheir hefyd y mater o amseru rhyddhau'r ddogfen.

**Y Llywydd:** Bydd digon o gyfle i ofyn cwestiynau i bob Gweinidog ynghylch unrhyw fater sy'n ymwneud â gweithgarwch y Weithrediaeth, gan gynnwys yr adeilad newydd. Fy mhryder i yw'r llif rhwydd o wybodaeth i'r Aelodau ar bob achlysur. Derbyniaf y pwynt y dylid anfon negeseuon e-bost yn cynnwys deunydd perthnasol i'r Aelodau o fewn ein horiau gwaith—lle bynnag y bo modd. Sylweddolaf nad yw hynny'n bosibl bob amser. Wrth gwrs, ceir problem arbennig ar benwythnosau, yn enwedig pan gynhelir gwaith datblygu pwysig ar ein system TG, fel y gwelsom heddiw. Bydd Gweinidogion wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedwyd, a bydd fy swyddfa yn sicr yn ystyried unrhyw agwedd sy'n ymwneud â'r mater hwn, lle gallem ymestyn y rhybudd a roddir i Aelodau ynghylch unrhyw wybodaeth, tua ar ddiwedd y diwrnod gwaith.

**Richard Edwards:** Pwynt o drefn. Fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, codaf y pwynt hwn o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 35, ynghylch sylwadau a wnaed yn gynharach gan Janet Ryder ynghylch cyfarfod diweddar o'r Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio. Fel y gwyddoch, Lywydd, mae'r Pwyllgorau Penderfyniadau Cynllunio yn tynnu eu haelodaeth o Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar sail rota ac ar sail drawsbleidiol. Mae'n ofyniad hanfodol nad yw gwleidyddiaeth bleidiol yn chwarae unrhyw ran yn ei drafodaethau. Weithiau caiff y pwyllgorau eu cadeirio gennyf i, weithiau gan y Gweinidog, a thro arall gan aelodau eraill o Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth. Pwysleisiaf nad oes ganddynt unrhyw beth i'w wneud â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac maent yn hollol annibynnol arno. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai pob Aelod Cynulliad yn mynd i'r drafferth o ymglyfarwyddo â'r Rheol Sefydlog hon.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful for that point of order, as someone who has taken an interest in planning matters over many years of representing a national park. Our planning system in the National Assembly for Wales is a unique structure, and I do not know whether it will stand the test of time. These are quasi-judicial activities, conducted on behalf of the Assembly by Members elected for that purpose; they continue the previous tradition of ministerial planning decisions. As you rightly say, Planning Decision Committee members are elected under Standing Order No. 35. I remind Members that under Standing Order No. 35.14, Planning Decision Committee meetings are private meetings. They are held in private and Members are under an obligation to observe the confidentiality of any discussion of the Committee, and any documents considered, with the exception of the decision letter. If Members were to seek to raise issues relating to the internal activities of these Committees, such attempts would be out of order.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y pwynt hwnnw o drefn, fel un a gymerodd ddi-ddordeb mewn materion cynllunio ers nifer o flynyddoedd o gynrychioli parc cenedlaethol. Mae ein system gynllunio yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn system unigryw, ac ni wn a fydd yn dal prawf amser. Gweithgareddau lled-farnwrol yw'r rhain, wedi eu cynnal ar ran y Cynulliad gan Aelodau etholedig at y diben hwnnw; maent yn parhau'r traddodiad blaenorol o benderfyniadau cynllunio gan weinidogion. Fel y dywedwch yn gywir, etholir aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 35. Atgoffaf Aelodau mai cyfarfodydd preifat yw rhai'r Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 35.14. Cânt eu cynnal yn breifat ac mae'n ofynnol i Aelodau gadw cyfrinachedd unrhyw drafodaeth gan y Pwyllgor, ac unrhyw ddogfennau a ystyrir, ag eithrio'r llythyr penderfyniad. Pe byddai Aelodau yn ceisio codi materion sy'n ymwneud â gweithgareddau mewnol y Pwyllgorau hyn, ni fyddai ymdrechion o'r fath mewn trefn.

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiad fod

**The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, yn cymeradwyo:*

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25, approves:*

*1. Rheoliadau Cynigion Trefniadaeth Ysgol gan Gyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Ionawr 2002; ac*

*1. the School Organisation Proposals by the National Council for Education and Training for Wales Regulations 2002 laid in the Table Office on 29 January 2002; and*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cynigion Trefniadaeth Ysgol gan Gyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Chwefror 2002;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the School Organisation Proposals by the National Council for Education and Training for Wales Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 12 February 2002;*



2. *Rheoliadau Grantiau Safonau Addysg (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Ionawr 2002; ac* 2. *the Education Standards Grants (Wales) Regulations 2002 laid in the Table Office on 29 January 2002; and*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau Safonau Addysg (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Chwefror 2002. (NDM965)* *considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Education Standards Grants (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 12 February 2002. (NDM965)*

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig  
(Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2002  
The Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 5)  
(Wales) 2002**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under section 88(b) of the Local Government Finance Act 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 5) (Wales) 2002 which was laid in the Table Office on 18 February 2002. (NDM966)*

During the detailed review of the calculations of the standard spending assessment undertaken in 2000-01, in preparation for the 2001-02 settlement, it became apparent that the consultants had used incorrect ward data. That resulted in adjustments to the SSAs of four authorities: Bridgend, Denbighshire, the Vale of Glamorgan, and Wrexham. Bridgend and Wrexham received increases, while changes to Denbighshire and the Vale of Glamorgan resulted in a reduction. For Denbighshire, this means a reduction in the SSA for 2001-02 of £232,441, and a reduction of £247,688 for 2002-03. For the Vale of Glamorgan, the correction results in a reduction in the SSA for 2001-02 of some £44,000, and for 2002-03 of some £47,000.

3:50 p.m.

The purpose of the report was not to punish authorities in any way. The corrections made in the report were in respect of errors, and were not made to reduce the SSA. I made it clear at all stages of the local government settlement process that I would consider representations from authorities about any concerns over the impact of the settlement, and such representations have been made. Although this was not an Assembly error, it was genuine, and it resulted in financial loss

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan adran 88B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Chwefror 2002. (NDM966)*

Yn ystod adolygiad manwl o'r cyfrifiadau o'r asesiad gwariant safonol a gynhaliwyd yn 2000-01, mewn paratoad ar gyfer setliad 2001-02, daeth yn amlwg bod yr ymgynghorwyr wedi defnyddio data wardiau anghywir. Arweiniodd hynny at addasu asesiadau gwariant safonol pedwar o awdurdodau: Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Sir Ddinbych, Bro Morgannwg a Wrecsam. Cafodd Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr a Wrecsam ragor o arian, tra'r arweiniodd newidiadau i Sir Ddinbych a Bro Morgannwg at ostyngiad. Ar gyfer Sir Ddinbych, golyga hyn ostyngiad o £232,441 yn yr asesiad gwariant safonol ar gyfer 2001-02, a gostyngiad o £247,688 ar gyfer 2002-03. Ar gyfer Bro Morgannwg, mae'r cywiriad yn arwain at ostyngiad yn yr asesiad gwariant safonol o tua £44,000 ar gyfer 2001-02, a thua £47,000 ar gyfer 2002-03.

Nid diben yr adroddiad oedd cosbi awdurdodau mewn unrhyw ffordd. Gwnaed y cywiriadau yn yr adroddiad o ganlyniad i gamgymeriadau, ac nid er mwyn gostwng yr asesiad gwariant safonol. Gwneuthum yn eglur yn ystod pob cam o'r broses setliad llywodraeth leol y byddwn yn ystyried sylwadau gan awdurdodau ynghylch unrhyw bryderon am effaith y setliad, a gwnaethpwyd sylwadau o'r fath. Er nad camgymeriad y Cynulliad oedd hwn, yr oedd yn un

to those authorities. For this year, it represents a substantial reduction for Denbighshire council and it has had to make plans on that basis. Therefore, I agreed to make a special grant payment on this occasion. The purpose of the grant is to nullify the reduction in the SSA so that the authorities affected do not suffer a negative impact as a result of the adjustments.

Approval of this grant payment will show that the Assembly is prepared to listen to and work with its partners in Welsh local government, to our mutual benefit. I ask you to approve the grant.

**Janet Ryder:** I declare an interest as a member of Ruthin town council. Plaid Cymru will support this grant. There are winners and losers in any adjustment of the settlement but, in this case, it was due to the use of incorrect data. When the formula was being developed, much was made of the fact that the ward data was unavailable. Work on collecting and refining that data is continuing. Unfortunately, because data was unavailable at that time, some subjective decisions were taken. It was meant to be a mathematical formula, which was applied subjectively in the end. Is the Minister satisfied with how data is being collected? Is she also satisfied that eventually the standard spending assessment will be made according to a formula based on sound statistics?

**Ann Jones:** I thank the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities for this special grant report, which will be of great benefit to all the residents of Denbighshire. They are turning the corner after a disastrous start. To have faced this through no fault of their own would have put them back at least twelve months. I pay particular tribute to how Edwina has handled the matter, and how she has listened to the representations of Karen Sinclair and myself, for which we are grateful.

**William Graham:** We recognise that the Minister has once again made a prudent decision, based on the fact that incorrect ward

gwirioneddol, ac arweiniodd at golled ariannol i'r awdurdodau hynny. Ar gyfer eleni, mae'n golygu gostyngiad sylweddol ar gyfer Cyngor Sir Dinbych a bu'n rhaid iddo wneud cynlluniau ar y sail honno. Felly, cytunais i wneud taliad grant arbennig y tro hwn. Diben y grant yw dileu'r gostyngiad yn yr asesiad gwariant safonol fel nad yw awdurdodau yr effeithwyd arnynt yn dioddef effaith negyddol o ganlyniad i'r addasiadau.

Bydd cymeradwyo'r taliad grant hwn yn dangos bod y Cynulliad yn barod i wrando a gweithio gyda'i bartneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru er budd y naill a'r llall. Gofynnaf ichi gymeradwyo'r grant.

**Janet Ryder:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o gyngor tref Rhuthun. Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r grant hwn. Bydd rhai ar eu hennill a rhai ar eu colled mewn unrhyw addasiad o setliad, ond, yn yr achos hwn, fe'i hachoswyd oherwydd defnyddiwyd data anghywir. Pan oedd y fformwla yn cael ei datblygu, gwnaed llawer o'r ffaith nad oedd data wardiau ar gael. Mae'r gwaith o gasglu a mireinio'r data hwnnw yn parhau. Yn anffodus, gan nad oedd data ar gael ar y pryd, gwnaethpwyd rhai penderfyniadau goddrychol. Y bwriad oedd llunio fformiwla fathamategol a gafodd ei gymhwyso mewn modd goddrychol ar y diwedd. A yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon â'r modd y caiff data ei gasglu? A yw hi hefyd yn fodlon y bydd yr asesiad gwariant safonol yn cael ei wneud yn y pen draw yn ôl fformiwla sy'n seiliedig ar ystadegau cadarn?

**Ann Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau am yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn, a fydd o gryn fantais i holl drigolion Sir Ddinbych. Maent yn troi'r gornel ar ôl cychwyn trychinebus. Byddai wynebu hyn, heb fod unrhyw fai arnynt eu hunain, wedi eu rhoi o leiaf ddeuddeg mis ar ei hôl hi. Talaf deyrnged arbennig i'r modd y mae Edwina wedi ymdrin â'r mater hwn, a'r modd y gwrandawodd ar sylwadau Karen Sinclair a minnau, ac yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iddi am hynny.

**William Graham:** Yr ydym yn cydnabod fod y Gweinidog unwaith eto wedi gwneud penderfyniad doeth, yn seiliedig ar y ffaith

data was originally collected. This should be welcomed by the people of Denbighshire and the Vale of Glamorgan, and we support the measure.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I also warmly welcome this change of heart as a sensible way to redress the imbalance caused by erroneous figures. Such errors are unfortunately inevitable in government, and the Assembly should pass such basic corrective measures easily. My constituents in Denbighshire will particularly welcome the additional £232,000 provided in this grant. They will be most concerned to hear that, due to miscalculation, they stood to lose almost £250,000. I hope and expect that other Assembly Members, wherever their constituencies, will join me in supporting this grant, and ensuring that the people of Denbighshire and the Vale of Glamorgan get their fair share of the money due to them.

**Edwina Hart:** In response to Janet Ryder, this measure is concerned with adjustments following the identification of errors in the data used for the local government settlement. Population dispersion indicators are now amended to reflect the boundary change that took place in April 1997, which affected the four authorities. That is how this error occurred. Therefore, it deals specifically with technical issues that I felt were anomalous because local authorities would suffer. It is important that we make this decision today.

There are wider issues concerning the formula, which will be subject to discussion at the partnership council and the consultative forum on finance.

bod data wardiau anghywir wedi ei gasglu'n wreiddiol. Dylid croesawu hyn gan bobl Sir Ddinbych a Bro Morgannwg, a chefnogwn y mesur.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf innau hefyd yn croesawu'n gynnes y newid meddwl hwn fel ffordd synhwyrol o unioni'r cam a achoswyd gan y ffigurau anghywir. Yn anffodus, mae camgymeriadau o'r fath yn anochel mewn llywodraeth, a dylai'r Cynulliad bleidleisio o blaid mesurau unioni sylfaenol o'r fath heb drafferth. Bydd fy etholwyr yn Sir Ddinbych yn croesawu'n arbennig y £232,000 ychwanegol a ddarparwyd yn y grant hwn. Bydd yn achosi pryder arbennig iddynt glywed eu bod bron â cholli £250,000, o ganlyniad i gamgyfrifo. Gobeithiaf, a disgwyliaf, y bydd yr Aelodau Cynulliad eraill, beth bynnag fo'u hetholaethau, yn ymuno â mi o ran cefnogi'r grant hwn, a sicrhau bod pobl Sir Ddinbych a Bro Morgannwg yn derbyn y cyfran teg o arian sy'n ddyledus iddynt.

**Edwina Hart:** Mewn ymateb i Janet Ryder, mae'r mesur hwn yn ymwneud ag addasiadau ar ôl i gamgymeriadau yn y data a ddefnyddiwyd ar gyfer y setliad llywodraeth leol gael eu nodi. Erbyn hyn diwygiwyd dangosyddion gwasgariad poblogaeth er mwyn adlewyrchu'r newid i ffiniau a ddigwyddodd ym mis Ebrill 1997, a effeithiodd ar y pedwar awdurdod. Felly, mae'n ymdrin yn benodol â materion technegol y teimlais eu bod yn anghyson gan y byddai'r awdurdodau lleol yn dioddef. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwneud y penderfyniad hwn heddiw.

Mae materion ehangach sy'n ymwneud â'r fformiwla, a gaiff eu trafod yn y cyngor partneriaeth a'r fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid.

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary

Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.55 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.55 p.m.*

**Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar Ymchwiliad  
 Nantgwyddon  
 The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's Report on the  
 Investigation into Nantgwyddon**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** Before this debate commences, I must make a ruling under Standing Order No. 7.13, which deals with the application of the sub judice rule to this debate. I understand that legal proceedings have been instituted by several residents in the vicinity of the tip against the company that managed the site during part of the period to which the

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Cyn i'r ddadl hon ddechrau, rhaid imi wneud dyfarniad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.13, sy'n ymdrin â defnyddio rheol *sub judice* yn y ddadl hon. Deallaf fod sawl un o'r trigolion sy'n byw ger y domen wedi dechrau dwyn achos llys yn erbyn y cwmni a reolai'r safle am ran o'r cyfnod y mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn ei drafod. Gan fod achos llys

Committee's report relates. The commencement of legal proceedings means that before allowing this debate to proceed I must be satisfied on the four points listed under Standing Order No. 7.13. I am satisfied on the first three of those points. The fourth requirement, that I must be satisfied that comments in the debate would not pose a real and substantial risk to any legal proceedings, is more difficult. Before the Committee discussed the matter, views were invited from representatives of the parties to the proceedings. Having considered those representations, the Chair of the Committee was satisfied that no real or substantial risk of prejudice to any of the legal proceedings would arise from a general discussion of the report. That position has not changed and I am therefore satisfied on the fourth point. Nevertheless, I ask Members to refrain from referring to the residents' legal action. Along with the Chair of the Committee, I am satisfied that other legal proceedings brought some years ago by a company against several individuals have now ended and are therefore not an obstacle to this debate proceeding. I call on the Chair of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee to propose the motion.

**Richard Edwards:** I propose that

*the National Assembly expresses its gratitude to the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee for undertaking the investigation into the Nantygwyddon landfill site, notes the recommendations of the Committee contained in the report laid in the Table Office on 18 February, and calls on the relevant authorities to implement the Committee's recommendations. (NDM967)*

Our report makes recommendations that are specific to Nantygwyddon, but also draws general lessons for the future of waste management in Wales. We have also commented on the need to address health concerns associated with waste disposal facilities. Members will recall that Plenary resolved to cause an independent investigation into the Nantygwyddon landfill site, looking at health, environmental and planning issues. That followed concerns expressed by residents about odours, fumes

wedi'i gychwyn, cyn imi ganiatáu i'r ddadl hon fynd rhagddi, rhaid imi fodloni fy hun ar y pedwar pwynt a restrwyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.13. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y tri phwynt cyntaf. Mae'r pedwerydd gofyniad, sef bod yn rhaid imi fodloni fy hun na fyddai sylwadau yn y ddadl yn creu perygl real a sylweddol o niwed i unrhyw achos llys, yn anos. Cyn i'r Pwyllgor drafod y mater, gwahoddiwyd cynrychiolwyr y carfannau sy'n rhan o'r achos i fynegi barn. Ar ôl ystyried y sylwadau hynny, yr oedd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn fodlon nad oedd perygl real na sylweddol o niwed i achos llys pe bai'r adroddiad yn cael ei drafod mewn trafodaeth gyffredinol. Nid yw'r sefyllfa honno wedi newid ac felly yr wyf yn fodlon ar y pedwerydd pwynt. Eto i gyd, gofynnaf i'r Aelodau ymatal rhag cyfeirio at achos llys y trigolion. Ynghyd â Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor, yr wyf yn fodlon bod achos llys arall a ddygwyd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl gan gwmni yn erbyn sawl unigolyn bellach wedi dod i ben ac felly nad yw'n ein rhwystro rhag cynnal y ddadl hon. Galwaf ar Gadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth i gynnig y cynnig.

**Richard Edwards:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn mynegi ei werthfawrogiad wrth Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth am gynnal yr ymchwiliad i safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon, yn nodi argymhellion y Pwyllgor yn yr adroddiad a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Chwefror, ac yn galw ar yr awdurdodau perthnasol i weithredu argymhellion y Pwyllgor. (NDM967)*

Mae ein hadroddiad yn gwneud argymhellion sy'n benodol i Nantygwyddon, ond sydd hefyd yn cynnig gwersi cyffredinol ar gyfer rheoli gwastraff yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru. Gwnaethom sylwadau hefyd ar yr angen i fynd i'r afael â phryderon am iechyd sy'n gysylltiedig â chyfleusterau gwaredu gwastraff. Bydd yr Aelodau yn cofio i'r Cyfarfod Llawn benderfynu cychwyn ymchwiliad annibynnol i safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon, a fyddai'n ystyried materion iechyd, yr amgylchedd a chynllunio. Gwnaed

and other emissions from the landfill site, which they believe adversely affect the amenity of their community, their health and that of their unborn children. Our report sets out the process we undertook and outlines our deliberations on the independent investigator's report in the light of responses to it. We accepted the investigator's recommendations in full and have grouped them into those that are site specific and those that call for more general action.

We have made five recommendations that call for specific action at Nantygwyddon. The first is that there should be an end to household waste disposal there. The investigator clarified that he recommends an end to the disposal of household, biodegradable and putrescible waste and not an end to the disposal of inert, inorganic commercial and industrial waste at Nantygwyddon. He also confirmed that that recommendation should be implemented as soon as possible. We note that disposal of household waste at Nantygwyddon ceased in December 2001, following the presentation of the independent investigator's report to us. We welcome the progress made by Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council in introducing recycling schemes in the area and strongly support the involvement of local residents in the process.

The second recommendation is that the phase 1 area should be swiftly completed and the Assembly should commission an authoritative stability study of Nantygwyddon. We consider that there are legitimate concerns that need to be addressed once and for all by an independent, authoritative study. The third recommendation is that a landfill gas management system be devised, implemented, monitored and regularly reviewed, that leachate be treated on site before discharge, and that water collection and management be maintained. We stress the need for monitoring information to be fully transparent and accessible to the public in real time.

4:00 p.m.

hynny yn sgîl y pryderon a fynegwyd gan drigolion ynglŷn ag aroglau, mygdarthau a gollyngiadau eraill o'r safle tirlenwi sydd, yn eu barn hwy, yn effeithio'n andwyol ar fwynder eu cymuned, eu hiechyd ac iechyd plant nas ganwyd. Mae ein hadroddiad yn disgrifio'r broses a ddilynwyd gennym ac yn amlinellu ein trafodaethau ar adroddiad yr ymchwilydd annibynnol yng ngoleuni'r ymatebion iddo. Derbyniwyd argymhellion yr ymchwilydd gennym yn lawn gan eu trefnu'n rhai sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â'r safle a'r rhai sy'n galw am weithredu mwy cyffredinol.

Gwnaethom bump o argymhellion sy'n galw am weithredu penodol yn Nantygwyddon. Y cyntaf yw y dylid rhoi'r gorau i waredu gwastraff cartref yno. Eglurodd yr ymchwilydd ei fod yn argymhell y dylid rhoi'r gorau i waredu gwastraff cartref pydradwy ac nid gwastraff masnachol a diwydiannol sy'n anadweithiol ac yn anorganig yn Nantygwyddon. Cadarnhaodd hefyd y dylid gweithredu'r argymhelliad hwnnw mor fuan â phosibl. Nodwn fod gwaredu gwastraff cartref yn Nantygwyddon wedi dod i ben ym mis Rhagfyr 2001, ar ôl i adroddiad yr ymchwilydd annibynnol gael ei gyflwyno inni. Croesawn y cynnydd a wnaed gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf wrth gyflwyno cynlluniau ailgylchu yn yr ardal a chefnogwn yn frwd y rhan a chwaraeodd trigolion lleol yn y broses.

Yr ail argymhelliad yw y dylid gorffen yr ardal cam 1 yn ddiymdroi ac y dylai'r Cynulliad gomisiynu astudiaeth awdurdodol o sefydlogrwydd Nantygwyddon. Yn ein barn ni, mae pryderon dilys y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy unwaith ac am byth drwy astudiaeth annibynnol, awdurdodol. Y trydydd argymhelliad yw y dylid llunio system reoli nwyon mewn safleoedd tirlenwi, a'i gweithredu, ei monitro a'i hadolygu'n rheolaidd, y dylid trin trwytholch ar y safle cyn ei ryddhau, ac y dylai'r gwaith o gasglu a rheoli dŵr barhau. Pwysleisiwn fod angen i'r wybodaeth fonitro fod yn gwbl dryloyw ac ar gael i'r cyhoedd ar pryd.

The fourth recommendation is that specific health studies be commissioned at Nantygwyddon, as suggested by the investigator. That will help to ensure that residents living near Nantygwyddon will at last have authoritative information, of a kind that commands their confidence, relating to their health concerns.

We also suggest that current studies be developed in order to address concerns in the Nantygwyddon area. It is crucial that local residents are involved in drawing up the terms of reference for the studies and are involved during all the research stages. It is also important that Bro Taf Health Authority, or the proposed local health board successor, forms part of the partnership so that those conducting the studies can access the necessary health data, inform local public health protection and have the confidence of health professionals as well as local residents.

The fifth recommendation is that, when the financial information about the trading and contractual affairs of Rhondda Waste Disposal Ltd becomes available to Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council, it should be subjected to the closest scrutiny. If evidence of wrongdoing emerges, that should be pursued with vigour.

Many of the recommendations relating to Nantygwyddon have wider significance for the whole of Wales. However, we have also made more general recommendations. Recommendation 6 is that the National Assembly issue mandatory guidance to the Environment Agency Wales to require all the openness and transparency that is permitted by current legislation. It also recommends that the Assembly press the UK Government to espouse freedom of environmental information and to remove commercial confidentiality as a barrier to public accountability. We suggest that the UK Government be called upon to drop that provision from the Environmental Protection Act 1990 and, in the meantime, that all local authorities in Wales should ensure the publication of all relevant information, whether commercially sensitive or not,

Y pedwerydd argymhelliad yw y dylid comisiynu astudiaethau iechyd penodol yn Nantygwyddon, fel yr awgrymodd yr ymchwilydd. Bydd hynny yn helpu i sicrhau y caiff trigolion sy'n byw ger Nantygwyddon wybodaeth awdurdodol ynglŷn â'u pryderon iechyd o'r diwedd, sef y math o wybodaeth y gallent ymddiried ynddi.

Awgrymwn hefyd y dylid datblygu'r astudiaethau presennol er mwyn mynd i'r afael â phryderon yn ardal Nantygwyddon. Mae'n hollbwysig y caiff trigolion eu cynnwys yn y broses o lunio cylch gorchwyl yr astudiaethau, ac ym mhob cam o'r ymchwil. Mae'n bwysig hefyd fod Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf, neu'r bwrdd iechyd lleol arfaethedig a fydd yn ei olynu, yn rhan o'r bartneriaeth fel y bo modd i'r rhai sy'n cynnal yr astudiaethau ddefnyddio'r data iechyd angenrheidiol, llywio diogelwch iechyd y cyhoedd yn lleol ac ennyn hyder y gweithwyr proffesiynol iechyd yn ogystal â'r trigolion lleol.

Y pumed argymhelliad yw y dylid craffu mor fanwl â phosibl ar y wybodaeth ariannol ynglŷn â materion masnach a materion cytundebol Rhondda Waste Disposal Ltd pan fydd ar gael i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Os gwelir bod y cwmni wedi camymddwyn, dylid mynd ar drywydd hynny o ddiffrif.

Mae i lawer o'r argymhellion sy'n ymwneud â Nantygwyddon arwyddocâd ehangach i Gymru gyfan. Fodd bynnag, gwnaethom argymhellion mwy cyffredinol hefyd. Argymhelliad 6 yw y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol roi canllawiau gorfodol i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i fod mor agored a thryloyw â phosibl o dan y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol. Argymhella hefyd y dylai'r Cynulliad bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i gefnogi rhyddid gwybodaeth amgylcheddol ac i gael gwared â chyfrinachedd masnachol fel rhwystr i atebolrwydd cyhoeddus. Awgrymwn y dylid galw ar Lywodraeth y DU i ddileu'r ddarpariaeth hon o Ddeddf Diogelwch Amgylcheddol 1990 ac, yn y cyfamser, y dylai pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru sicrhau ei fod yn cyhoeddi'r holl wybodaeth berthnasol sy'n ymwneud â



relating to the affairs of their waste disposal companies.

The Environment Agency should ensure that its decision-making processes are open and transparent to the maximum extent permitted by law, rather than that required by law, which is a potentially significant difference. We suggest that it draw up a code of practice on openness and transparency to supplement its customer charter, which should be based on the Assembly's Code of Practice on Public Access to Information.

We invite the agency to consider ways of working in partnership with local communities when considering issues of local concern. While we agree that the agency should continue to work with industry to maintain and improve environmental standards, it should be, and should be seen to be, above all, the people's champion.

The seventh recommendation is that the National Assembly should consider how formal impact assessments can be best used in Wales to properly consider the implications of plans, programmes and projects concerning waste disposal and consider how it may best secure the principle of producer responsibility for waste minimisation, re-use and recycling in Wales.

We suggest that the Welsh Assembly Government works with community groups, local authorities and other public bodies to develop means of better using formal impact assessments to consider the impact of waste disposal projects on local communities. Producer responsibility for waste minimisation, re-use and recycling is key to delivering the waste strategy. Waste reduction is vital, as is developing greener methods of waste disposal.

The eighth recommendation is that the Assembly consider how communities may seek independent research and health risk appraisal to allay their fears and respond to inactivity or failure by the regulatory bodies. Residents near Nantygwyddon have fought

materion eu cwmnïau gwaredu gwastraff, p'un a yw'n fasnachol-sensitif ai peidio,

Dylai Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd sicrhau bod ei phrosesau gwneud penderfyniadau mor agored a thryloyw â phosibl o dan gyfraith gwlad, yn hytrach na bod mor agored a thryloyw ag sy'n ofynnol yn ôl y gyfraith, a allai fod yn ddau beth gwahanol iawn. Awgrymwn y dylai lunio cod ymarfer ar fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw i ategu ei siarter i gwsmeriaid. Dylid seilio'r cod hwnnw ar God Ymarfer y Cynulliad ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd weld Gwybodaeth.

Gwahoddwn yr asiantaeth i ystyried ffyrdd o weithio mewn partneriaeth â chymunedau lleol pan fo'n ystyried materion sy'n achosi pryder yn lleol. Er y cytunwn y dylai'r asiantaeth barhau i weithio gyda diwydiant i gynnal a gwella safonau amgylcheddol, amddiffynydd y bobl ddylai fod yn anad dim, a dylai gael ei weld felly.

Y seithfed argymhelliad yw y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ystyried y ffordd orau o ddefnyddio asesiadau effaith ffurfiol yng Nghymru er mwyn ystyried goblygiadau cynlluniau, rhaglenni a phrosiectau sy'n ymwneud â gwaredu gwastraff yn briodol ac er mwyn ystyried y ffordd orau o sicrhau'r egwyddor o gyfrifoldeb y cynhyrchydd dros leihau gwastraff i'r eithaf, ei aildefnyddio a'i ailgylchu yng Nghymru.

Awgrymwn y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithio gyda grwpiau cymunedol, awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff cyhoeddus lleol i ddatblygu ffordd o ddefnyddio asesiadau effaith ffurfiol yn well er mwyn ystyried effaith prosiectau gwaredu gwastraff ar gymunedau lleol. Mae cyfrifoldeb y cynhyrchydd dros leihau gwastraff i'r eithaf, ei aildefnyddio a'i ailgylchu yn allweddol i gyflwyno'r strategaeth wastraff. Mae lleihau gwastraff yn hollbwysig, yn ogystal â datblygu dulliau mwy gwyrdd o waredu gwastraff.

Yr wythfed argymhelliad yw y dylai'r Cynulliad ystyried ym mha fodd y gallai cymunedau ofyn am ymchwil annibynnol a gwerthusiadau o risgiau i iechyd er mwyn lleddfu eu hofnau ac ymateb i achosion o anweithgaredd neu fethiant ar ran y cyrrff

an active campaign to have their concerns about the health effects of the site recognised and investigated by public authorities. We consider that local communities should have machinery to formally request that independent research be commissioned when public authorities do not have the resources, or are unwilling, to do so on their behalf.

We also endorse the following recommendations, which have an applicability wider than to waste management. Recommendation 9 is that the Assembly should support the principle of public accountability for the public pound and consider and improve accountability for securing files when the abolition of a public authority is proposed. It should also review the European Union grant criteria, audit and the prospect of repayment if a grant-aided asset is transferred with no benefit to public finance.

Recommendation 10 is that the National Assembly consider the human rights implications of the use of legal sanctions by public or quasi-public bodies to restrain the activities of officers of organisations who organise protests against those bodies.

Finally, I wish to acknowledge the contributions of those who have taken part in this investigation, particularly the independent investigator, David Purchon, local residents and the public authorities. Without their commitment to the process, the investigation would not have been a success.

I also thank RCT County Borough Council for providing premises for the investigation hearings and the resource centre free of charge. I would also like to thank Committee members, our legal adviser, Keith Bush, and the secretariat—Siwan, Vaughan, Juliette and Daniel—for supporting the investigation thoroughly and professionally. I commend the Committee's report to Plenary and invite Members to call on the relevant authorities to implement our recommendations.

rheoleiddio. Mae trigolion ger Nantygwyddon wedi mynd ati i ymgyrchu er mwyn sicrhau bod awdurdodau cyhoeddus yn cydnabod ac yn ymchwilio i'w pryderon ynglŷn ag effaith y safle ar iechyd. Yn ein barn ni, dylai fod modd i gymunedau lleol ofyn yn ffurfiol i ymchwil annibynnol gael ei chomisiynu pan na fo adnoddau gan yr awdurdodau cyhoeddus, neu pan na fyddant yn fodlon gwneud hynny ar eu rhan.

Cefnogwn hefyd yr argymhellion canlynol, sy'n berthnasol i fwy na rheoli gwastraff yn unig. Argymhelliad 9 yw y dylai'r Cynulliad gefnogi egwyddor atebolrwydd cyhoeddus dros bwrs y wlad ac ystyried a gwella atebolrwydd o ran sicrhau ffeiliau pan fo cynnig i ddiddymu awdurdod cyhoeddus. Dylai hefyd adolygu meini prawf yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer rhoi grantiau, dulliau archwilio a pha mor debygol ydyw y caiff grant ei ad-dalu os trosglwyddir ased â chymorth grant heb fudd i gyllid cyhoeddus.

Argymhelliad 10 yw y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ystyried y goblygiadau hawliau dynol pan fo cyrff cyhoeddus neu led gyhoeddus yn atal gweithgareddau swyddogion sefydliadau sy'n trefnu gwrthdystiadau yn erbyn y cyrff hynny drwy gamau cyfreithiol.

Yn olaf, hoffwn gydnabod cyfraniadau'r bobl hynny a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad hwn, yn enwedig yr ymchwilydd annibynnol, David Purchon, trigolion lleol a'r awdurdodau cyhoeddus. Heb eu hymrwymiad hwy i'r broses, ni fyddai'r ymchwiliad wedi bod yn llwyddiant.

Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf am ddarparu adeilad ar gyfer gwrandawiaidau'r ymchwiliad a'r ganolfan adnoddau am ddim. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i aelodau'r Pwyllgor, ein hymgyngorydd cyfreithiol, Keith Bush, a'r ysgrifenyddiaeth—Siwan, Vaughan, Juliette a Daniel—am roi cymorth trylwyr a phroffesiynol i'r ymchwiliad. Cymeradwyaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor i'r Cyfarfod Llawn a gwahoddaf yr Aelodau i alw ar yr awdurdodau perthnasol i roi ein hargymhellion ar waith.

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I welcome the Committee's report on its investigation into the Nantygwyddon landfill site. The investigation, which was a first for the Assembly, was undertaken in order to respond to the needs of local communities in the Rhondda and to make use of the Assembly's ability to act in an open and focused way. The local community welcomed that approach and I hope that it feels that the investigation has addressed the issues that gave rise to many genuine concerns. However, the investigation could not have happened without the Committee's support. I thank Committee members for their diligence, all those who gave evidence and information, and the investigator and his support team. To echo Richard's words, I particularly thank the Committee clerk and her team, who have done an excellent job. Last, but not least, I thank Richard Edwards for his total commitment to ensuring a fair process. His personal integrity has been at the foundation of the investigation and he has set a high standard.

I remind Members of the context of the investigation. The Plenary resolution of 4 July 2000 resolved that the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, liaising with myself as Minister for Environment, should conduct an investigation into the Nantygwyddon landfill site, investigating the health, environmental and planning issues relevant to the exercise of the National Assembly's functions. In September 2000, the Committee adopted detailed terms of reference for the investigation.

The local community has been waiting a long time for this report. I owe it to them and to Members to make an early response on the Welsh Assembly Government's behalf. I have discussed the report with Jane Hutt, Minister for Health and Social Services, and Ruth Hall, Chief Medical Officer for Wales, and my response covers their interests.

In its recommendations, the Committee report gives priority to taking action to start to address identified concerns. As a Committee member and a Minister, I make it clear that I want to ensure that the purpose and spirit of the Committee's

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Croesawaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar ei ymchwiliad i safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon. Cynhaliwyd yr ymchwiliad, a oedd yn ddatblygiad newydd i'r Cynulliad, er mwyn ymateb i anghenion cymunedau lleol yn y Rhondda ac arfer gallu'r Cynulliad i weithredu mewn ffordd agored â ffocws. Croesawyd yr ymagwedd honno gan y gymuned leol a gobeithiaf ei bod yn teimlo bod yr ymchwiliad wedi ymdrin â'r materion a fu'n achos llawer o bryderon dilys. Fodd bynnag, ni ellid bod wedi cynnal yr ymchwiliad heb gefnogaeth y Pwyllgor. Hoffwn ddiolch i aelodau'r Pwyllgor am eu diwydrwydd, i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth a gwybodaeth, ac i'r ymchwilydd a'i dîm cynorthwyol. Ac ategu geiriau Richard, hoffwn ddiolch yn arbennig i glerc y Pwyllgor a'i thîm, a wnaeth waith ardderchog. Ac yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i Richard Edwards am ei ymrwymiad llwyr i sicrhau proses deg. Bu ei uniondeb personol yn sylfaen i'r ymchwiliad ac mae wedi gosod safon uchel.

Hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau o gyd-destun yr ymchwiliad. Penderfyniad y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 4 Gorffennaf 2000 oedd y dylai Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, gan gydweithio â mi fel y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, gynnal ymchwiliad i safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon, ac ymchwilio i'r materion iechyd, amgylcheddol a chynllunio sy'n berthnasol i'r swyddogaethau a arddelir gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ym mis Medi 2000, mabwysiadodd y Pwyllgor gyloch gorchwyl manwl ar gyfer yr ymchwiliad.

Bu'r gymuned leol yn disgwyl yn hir am yr adroddiad hwn. Mae dyletswydd arnaf iddynt hwy ac i'r Aelodau ymateb yn gynnar ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Trafodais yr adroddiad â Jane Hutt, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a Ruth Hall, Prif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru, ac mae fy ymateb yn cwmpasu eu diddordebau hwy.

Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor, yn ei argymhellion, yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i gymryd camau i ddechrau ymdrin â'r pryderon a nodwyd. A minnau'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor ac yn Weiniidog, egluraf fy mod am sicrhau y caiff amcan ac ysbryd argymhellion y

recommendations are taken forward as effectively as possible, based on evidence and following a thorough and detailed consideration of the relevant issues. That is vital if we are to move forward, to improve waste management in Wales, and to regain the public's confidence. The health recommendations are an example of that. The report addresses the evidence of adverse health effects in the population around the site. Health complaints have played an important part in the site's history and its public acceptability.

Mr Purchon's report correctly confirms what we have been aware of, namely that there is no clear scientific evidence that landfills cause ill health. The report commissioned by Mr Purchon from the Institute for Environment and Health at Leicester could find no health risks of concern on the basis of a literature search. However, we are not complacent. The Small Area Health Statistics Unit has undertaken the most extensive study anywhere into the health of populations around landfill sites. The study covered the whole of the UK, including the Nantygwyddon site. The SAHSU study was partly initiated as a result of earlier studies carried out at Nantygwyddon, which were also inconclusive. More research has probably been undertaken around Nantygwyddon than at any other landfill site in the UK.

Further work needs to be undertaken to address genuine concerns, not just at Nantygwyddon, but in relation to landfill sites in general. We must bear in mind that there is no risk-free way of managing waste. As David Purchon's report states, authorities face an insurmountable barrier when seeking to resolve concerns and fears because it is impossible to establish that any human situation is without some risk to the health of individuals or of the population.

**Gareth Jones** *rose*—

**Sue Essex:** I will not give way. I wish to

Pwyllgor eu datblygu mor effeithiol â phosibl, yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth ac ar ôl rhoi ystyriaeth drwyadl a manwl i'r materion perthnasol. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig er mwyn inni symud ymlaen, i wella'r ffordd y caiff gwastraff ei reoli yng Nghymru, ac i adfer hyder y cyhoedd. Mae'r argymhellion ynglŷn ag iechyd yn enghraifft o hynny. Mae'r adroddiad yn trafod y dystiolaeth o effeithiau andwyol ar iechyd yn y boblogaeth o amgylch y safle. Mae cwynion yn ymwneud ag iechyd wedi chwarae rhan bwysig yn hanes y safle a'i dderbynioldeb i'r cyhoedd.

Mae adroddiad Mr Purchon yn cadarnhau'r hyn yr hyn yr ydym wedi bod yn ymwybodol ohono a hynny'n briodol, sef nad oes dim dystiolaeth wyddonol bendant bod safleoedd tirlenwi yn achosi salwch. Nid oedd adroddiad Sefydliad yr Amgylchedd ac Iechyd yng Nghaerlŷr, a gomisiynwyd gan Mr Purchon, yn gallu canfod unrhyw risgiau i iechyd a oedd yn achosi pryder ar sail ymchwil i ddeunydd ysgrifenedig. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn hunanfodlon. Mae'r Uned Ystadegau Iechyd Ardaloedd Bychain wedi cynnal yr astudiaeth fwyaf erioed o iechyd pobl sy'n byw ger safleoedd tirlenwi. Cwmpasodd yr astudiaeth y DU gyfan, gan gynnwys safle Nantygwyddon. Dechreuwyd astudiaeth yr uned yn rhannol o ganlyniad i astudiaethau cynharach a wnaed yn Nantygwyddon, nad oeddent wedi dod i gasgliadau pendant ychwaith. Cynhaliwyd mwy o ymchwil yn ardal Nantygwyddon nag mewn unrhyw safle tirlenwi arall yn y DU yn ôl pob tebyg.

Mae angen gwneud rhagor o waith i ymdrin â phryderon gwirioneddol, nid yn unig yn Nantygwyddon, ond o ran safleoedd tirlenwi yn gyffredinol. Rhaid inni gofio nad oes yr un ffordd o reoli gwastraff sy'n gwbl rydd o risg. Fel y noda adroddiad David Purchon, mae awdurdodau yn wynebu rhwystr anorchfygol pan fyddant yn ceisio tawelu meddyliau pobl gan ei bod yn amhosibl canfod bod unrhyw sefyllfa i bobl heb rywfaint o risg i iechyd unigolion neu'r boblogaeth.

**Gareth Jones** *a gododd*—

**Sue Essex:** Nid ildiaf. Hoffwn orffen yr hyn

finish what I have to say. I am sure that you will have a chance to say your piece.

The chief medical officer will consider the recommendations for further studies. She will convene a panel of experts to consider what further research should be undertaken in light of the report's recommendations. This issue exemplifies the need to use the Committee's report, the investigator's report to the Committee, and supporting evidence presented to the Committee, as a basis for considering further action across the range of identified issues.

4:10 p.m.

I recognise local people's genuine feelings about how the site has intruded upon their health and their lives, adversely affecting their sense of wellbeing. All public authorities must learn from this case. Attention should always be paid to local feelings on matters that affect people's everyday lives. I have already responded in terms of providing additional funding for the Environment Agency in Wales to enable it to undertake additional monitoring of important waste management facilities.

With reference to the Environment Agency in particular, I recognise that it inherited a particularly difficult situation in 1996, when it took responsibility for regulating the site. However, like us all, it has lessons to learn, particularly about how it communicates and engages with local communities on matters of genuine environmental concern.

In terms of taking the Committee's report forward, on behalf of the Assembly Government, I shall formally advise the relevant agencies and authorities of the Committee report's recommendations. Recommendation 1 and part of recommendation 2 cover matters relating to the site and are for the local authority to consider. I will take forward the second part of recommendation 2 on further tests to establish the stability of the site, identified in the Purchon report as being the responsibility of the National Assembly for Wales.

yr wyf am ei ddweud. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cewch gyfle i ddweud eich dweud.

Bydd y prif swyddog meddygol yn ystyried yr argymhellion am astudiaethau pellach. Bydd yn cynnull panel o arbenigwyr a fydd yn ystyried pa ymchwil bellach y dylid ei chynnal yng ngoleuni argymhellion yr adroddiad. Mae'r mater hwn yn enghraifft dda o'r angen i ddefnyddio adroddiad y Pwyllgor, adroddiad yr ymchwilydd i'r Pwyllgor, a'r dystiolaeth ategol a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor, yn sail i ystyried camau pellach i'w cymryd ynglŷn â'r holl faterion a nodwyd.

Cydnabyddaf deimladau diffuant pobl leol ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae'r safle wedi amharu ar eu hiechyd a'u bywydau, gan darfu ar eu lles. Rhaid i bob awdurdod cyhoeddus ddysgu o'r achos hwn. Dylid bob amser dalu sylw i deimladau pobl leol ar faterion sy'n effeithio ar eu bywydau bob dydd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ymateb o ran rhoi arian ychwanegol i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yng Nghymru i'w galluogi i wneud gwaith monitro ychwanegol ar gyfleusterau rheoli gwastraff o bwys.

Wrth sôn am Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn benodol, cydnabyddaf iddi etifeddu sefyllfa anodd iawn yn 1996, pan ymgwymerodd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros reoleiddio'r safle. Fodd bynnag, fel pob un ohonom, mae ganddi wersi i'w dysgu, yn enwedig ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae'n cyfathrebu â chymunedau lleol ac yn eu cynnwys ar faterion o bryder amgylcheddol gwirioneddol.

O ran gweithredu ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor, ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, byddaf yn hysbysu'r asiantaethau a'r awdurdodau perthnasol am argymhellion adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn ffurfiol. Mae argymhelliad 1 a rhan o argymhelliad 2 yn cwmpasu materion sy'n ymwneud â'r safle y dylai'r awdurdod lleol eu hystyried. Byddaf yn gweithredu ar ail ran argymhelliad 2 ynglŷn â phroffion pellach i ganfod pa mor sefydlog yw'r safle, y nododd adroddiad Purchon mai cyfrifoldeb Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru oeddent.

Recommendations 6, 7, 8, 9 and 10 are also for action by the Welsh Assembly Government. By their nature, they require further detailed analysis and consideration before we can formulate specific actions to address the issues that they cover.

As well as looking back, the Nantygwyddon investigation also looks to the future. Members will be aware of our draft waste strategy. It represents a substantial change in approach from how we have dealt with waste in Wales in the past. The strategy gives priority to waste minimisation and recycling as a means to manage waste while moving away from landfill. A challenging target for local authorities to recycle or compost 40 per cent of municipal waste by 2010 is proposed. That statement is not an empty gesture. We are committed to supporting our local government colleagues in making these changes. We are providing financial support to local government to meet these targets. For the Rhondda Cynon Taff authority, this support is just over £5 million over four years. In finalising our waste strategy, and in future policy development, we will ensure that lessons identified for improving waste management in Wales are taken into account.

The problems at Nantygwyddon arose in a different climate from that which prevails today. We now have the National Assembly and its Government. We have the Wales waste forum to represent the views of a wide range of stakeholders concerned with waste management. We have consulted upon, and will shortly publish in final form—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please wind up.

**Sue Essex:** I am coming to the end.

We have consulted upon, and will shortly publish in final form, a new waste strategy for Wales, which will adopt an entirely different approach to waste management from that which existed at Nantygwyddon.

Mae argymhellion 6, 7, 8, 9 a 10 hefyd i'w gweithredu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. O ran eu natur, maent yn gofyn am ragor o ddadansoddiad ac ystyriaeth fanwl cyn inni allu cynllunio'r camau penodol i'w cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r materion y maent yn eu cwmpasu.

Yn ogystal ag edrych yn ôl, mae ymchwiliad Nantygwyddon hefyd yn edrych i'r dyfodol. Bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol o'n strategaeth wastraff ddrafft. Mae'n newid sylweddol o'r ffordd yr oeddem yn mynd ati i ymdrin â gwastraff yng Nghymru yn y gorffennol. Mae'r strategaeth yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i leihau gwastraff i'r eithaf ac ailgylchu fel ffordd o reoli gwastraff gan symud o dirlenwi. Cynigir targed ymestynnol i awdurdodau lleol ailgylchu neu gompostio 40 y cant o wastraff a gesglir ganddynt erbyn 2010. Nid geiriau gwag mo'r datganiad hwnnw. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i gefnogi ein cyd-aelodau mewn llywodraeth leol i wneud y newidiadau hyn. Rhown gymorth ariannol i lywodraeth leol i gyrraedd y targedau hyn. Yn achos awdurdod Rhondda Cynon Taf, caiff ychydig dros £5 miliwn dros bedair blynedd. Wrth roi ein strategaeth wastraff ar ei gwedd derfynol, ac wrth ddatblygu polisiau yn y dyfodol byddwn yn sicrhau yr ystyrir y gwersi a nodwyd ar gyfer gwella'r ffordd yr ymdrinir â gwastraff yng Nghymru.

Cododd y problemau yn Nantygwyddon pan oedd hinsawdd wahanol i'r hyn sy'n bodoli heddiw. Bellach mae gennym Gynulliad Cenedlaethol a'i Lywodraeth. Mae gennym fforwm gwastraff Cymru sy'n cynrychioli barn ystod eang o randdeiliaid sy'n pryderu am y ffordd y caiff gwastraff ei reoli. Yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ar strategaeth wastraff newydd i Gymru, a byddwn yn ei chyhoeddi ar ei gwedd derfynol yn fuan—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dylech ddirwyn eich sylwadau i ben.

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn tynnu at y terfyn.

Yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ar strategaeth wastraff newydd i Gymru, a byddwn yn ei chyhoeddi ar ei gwedd derfynol yn fuan. Bydd gan y strategaeth ymagwedd hollol wahanol tuag at reoli gwastraff i'r hyn a

fodolai yn Nantygwyddon.

Once again, I thank everyone involved in this innovative and groundbreaking investigation. I intend to report to report back to the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee before the summer recess to outline the progress made in taking this work forward and to provide more detailed information on the issues identified for action by the Assembly Government. In this process, we have set an example of a government that will listen and learn to make Wales a better place for future generations. The final testament to the Assembly's investigation into Nantygwyddon will be the urgently needed improvements it will bring to waste management practices in Wales. The Committee and the local communities of the Rhondda will have made an important contribution to that new way ahead.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I commend the Committee's report to the National Assembly and urge all Members to support the motion. I came to this process as a sceptic. I was not convinced that an investigation that, as I saw it at the time, relied basically on goodwill and had no powers to compel the parties involved to give evidence, would be able to deliver. The Committee and Assembly knew that this was an experimental process. I believe that it has worked well. It is a pleasure, for once, to be proved wrong. The investigator is to be congratulated on his systematic and thorough approach, for the trust that he engendered in deeply distrustful local residents and for his incisive report and clear conclusions. I also commend Richard Edwards's approach to chairing this process. He has handled a difficult and delicate process in an exemplary manner and has played a key part in engaging the local community. I am grateful to him, as to all fellow Committee members, and to those who contributed to this process by giving evidence or by participating in other ways.

This report vindicates the community's concern about how the site was managed and run. It also justifies much of its anger about how its concerns were addressed, or not addressed, by the agencies responsible. I commend all of the report's

Unwaith eto, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad arloesol hwn. Bwriadaf gyflwyno adroddiad arall i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth cyn toriad yr haf er mwyn amlinellu'r cynnydd a wnaed wrth fynd â'r gwaith hwn yn ei flaen a rhoi gwybodaeth fanylach ar y materion y nodwyd y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad weithredu arnynt. Yn y broses hon, rhoesom esiampl o lywodraeth sy'n gwrandao ac yn dysgu er mwyn gwneud Cymru yn lle gwell i'r cenedlaethau a ddaw. Prawf terfynol ymchwiliad y Cynulliad i Nantygwyddon fydd y gwelliannau i arferion rheoli gwastraff yng Nghymru sydd eu hangen yn ddybryd a ddaw yn ei sgîl. Bydd y Pwyllgor a'r cymunedau lleol yn y Rhondda wedi gwneud cyfraniad pwysig i'r ffordd newydd ymlaen.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cymeradwyaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac apelïaf ar bob Aelod i gefnogi'r cynnig. Bûm yn drwgdybio'r broses hon ar y dechrau. Nid oeddwn yn argyhoeddedig y byddai ymchwiliad, fel y gwelais hi ar y pryd, a oedd yn dibynnu ar ewyllys da yn y bôn ac nad oedd ganddo unrhyw bwerau i orfodi'r partiön dan sylw i roi tystiolaeth, yn gallu gwneud gwahaniaeth. Gwyddai'r Pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad mai arbrawf oedd y broses hon. Credaf iddi weithio'n dda. Mae'n bleser, am unwaith, gael fy mhrofi'n anghywir. Rhaid llongyfarch yr ymchwilydd ar ei ymagwedd systematig a thrylwyr, am y ffaith iddo ennill ymddiriedaeth trigolion lleol a oedd yn ddrwgdybus iawn ac am ei adroddiad pendant a'i gasgliadau clir. Hoffwn hefyd longyfarch Richard Edwards am y ffordd y cadeiriai'r broses hon. Trafododd broses anodd a sensitif mewn modd gwych a chwaraeodd ran allweddol wrth gysylltu â'r cymunedau leol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddo, a'i holl gyd-Aelodau ar y Pwyllgor, ac i'r bobl hynny a gyfrannodd at y broses drwy roi tystiolaeth neu drwy gymryd rhan mewn ffyrdd eraill.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cyfiawnhau pryder y gymuned ynglŷn â'r ffordd y cafodd y safle ei reoli a'i gynnal. Mae'n cyfiawnhau i raddau helaeth hefyd ddicter y gymuned ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â'i phryderon, neu nad ymdriniwyd â'i

recommendations to the Assembly, and I welcome the Minister's commitment today to action and to report back to the Committee, which will be useful.

I will draw attention to some of the lessons for the future that are particularly significant. Members will be aware—it has already been mentioned—of the set of recommendations concerning openness and transparency in public decision making. It is imperative that these are acted upon, but we are aware that it will not be straightforward or simple. The element of recommendation 6 on mandatory guidance for the Environment Agency for example, would, we understand, fall within the National Assembly Government's remit and could be implemented at once. However, the issues in that recommendation concerning limiting commercial confidentiality will require primary legislation, therefore it is imperative that the whole Assembly presses the UK Government for that.

The recommendations in relation to health must also be implemented as a matter of urgency. I welcome the Minister's approach to that. Specific health studies, on a smaller scale, of the population affected by Nantygwyddon tip must be commissioned.

**Gareth Jones:** O ran yr argymhellion cyffredinol, pa gyngor y byddech yn ei roi, wedi'r holl dystiolaeth a gafwyd, i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Casnewydd wrth iddynt fwrw ymlaen â chynlluniau i adeiladu ysgolion ar safleoedd heintiedig o'r fath?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'n hollbwysig inni ddysgu gwersi ehangach, nid dim ond gwersi sy'n berthnasol i Nantygwyddon. Mae'r ymchwilydd wedi nodi pryder ynglŷn â'r safleoedd y bu ichi gyfeirio atynt, a gwnaeth Comisiynydd Plant Cymru hynny hefyd. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr awdurdodau lleol yn cymryd sylw o'u sylwadau. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig.

The recommendations on health relating to the Nantygwyddon tip must be addressed,

phryderon, gan yr asiantaethau â chyfrifoldeb. Cefnogaf bob argymhelliad yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad, a chroesawaf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog heddiw i weithredu ac i roi adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor, a fydd yn ddefnyddiol.

Tynnaf eich sylw at rai o'r gwersi ar gyfer y dyfodol sy'n arbennig o bwysig. Bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol—crybwyllwyd hyn eisoes—am yr argymhellion a wnaed ynglŷn â bod yn agored ac yn dryloyw wrth wneud penderfyniadau cyhoeddus. Mae'n hanfodol inni weithredu ar y rhain, ond gwyddom na fydd hynny'n rhwydd nac yn syml. Byddai'r elfen o argymhelliad 6 sy'n ymwneud â chanllawiau gorfodol i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd er enghraifft, yn rhan o gylch gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, fe ddeallwn, a gellid ei rhoi ar waith ar unwaith. Fodd bynnag, bydd y materion yn yr argymhelliad hwnnw sy'n ymwneud â chyfyngu ar gyfrinachedd masnachol yn gofyn am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol, felly mae'n hanfodol bod y Cynulliad cyfan yn pwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU am hynny.

Rhaid gweithredu'r argymhellion sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd fel mater o frys hefyd. Croesawaf ymagwedd y Gweinidog tuag at hynny. Rhaid comisiynu astudiaethau iechyd penodol, ar raddfa lai, o'r boblogaeth y mae tomen Nantygwyddon yn effeithio arni.

**Gareth Jones:** In terms of the general recommendations, what advice would you give, in light of all the evidence gathered, to Conwy County Borough Council and Newport County Borough Council as they proceed with plans to build schools on similar contaminated sites?

**Helen Mary Jones:** It is vital that we learn lessons across-the-board, not just lessons relevant to Nantygwyddon. The investigator noted concerns about the sites to which you referred, as did the Children's Commissioner for Wales. I hope that the local authorities will take note of their comments. That is important.

Rhaid ymdrin â'r argymhellion ar iechyd mewn cysylltiad â thomen Nantygwyddon, a



and we welcome the willingness of the Chief Medical Officer for Wales and the Minister to take an imaginative and positive approach to these complex issues. Health impact statements have been raised before in the Assembly as part of discussions on 'Planning Policy Wales'. We have yet to receive a definitive response from the administration as to what it intends to do in this regard. I hope, and I am sure, that the Minister and the Government will accept that this report greatly reinforces the need to consider how we can use such impact statements.

The site-specific recommendations are already beginning to be implemented, and Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council is to be congratulated on its prompt action in response to the investigator's report, as has already been mentioned. It is also to be congratulated on its forward-looking long-term plans for dealing with waste in the borough. However, responding in full to all the recommendations will place a huge additional burden on the authority's resources. It must be helped with that. Sums in the region of £7 million in capital and £1.5 million in additional revenue have been mentioned. It cannot be right that the council tax payers of Rhondda Cynon Taff, some of whom have had to pay the environmental and health costs of living with the tip, be left to meet the full cost of rectifying a situation that is not of their making. I press the Government of Wales to support the authority with additional funding, as it has already, in fairness, supported the Environment Agency. That is the only just way to proceed.

There are general lessons to be learned about living with landfill. We have all learned from this investigation that, in the long term, large-scale landfill is not an appropriate way to deal with waste. Other communities are living with the aftermath of landfill sites, as the Minister said, and we hope that the lessons of this inquiry can be applied to those communities. In fighting—

4:20 p.m.

chroesawn baroddrwydd Prif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru a'r Gweinidog i fabwysiadu ymagwedd greadigol a chadarnhaol tuag at y materion cymhleth hyn. Codwyd datganiadau effaith iechyd o'r blaen yn y Cynulliad fel rhan o'r trafodaethau ar 'Bolisi Cynllunio Cymru'. Nid ydym wedi cael ymateb terfynol eto gan y weinyddiaeth ynglŷn â'i bwriadau o ran hyn. Gobeithiaf, ac yr wyf yn siŵr, y bydd y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn bod yr adroddiad hwn yn atgyfnerthu i raddau helaeth yr angen i ystyried sut y gallwn ddefnyddio datganiadau effaith o'r fath.

Mae'r argymhellion sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â'r safle eisoes yn cael eu rhoi ar waith, a rhaid llongyfarch Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf am weithredu'n ddiymdroi mewn ymateb i adroddiad yr ymchwilydd, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes. Dylid hefyd ei longyfarch ar ei gynlluniau hirdymor blaengar ar gyfer ymdrin â gwastraff yn y fwrdeistref. Fodd bynnag, bydd ymateb yn llawn i'r holl argymhellion yn rhoi baich mawr ychwanegol ar adnoddau'r awdurdod. Rhaid ei helpu gyda hynny. Crybwyllwyd symiau megis £7 miliwn o arian cyfalaf a £1.5 miliwn o arian refeniw ychwanegol. Nid yw'n iawn mai talwyr treth gyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf, y mae rhai ohonynt wedi gorfod talu'r pris am fyw ger y domen o ran eu hamgylchedd a'u hiechyd, fydd yn rhaid talu'r costau llawn am unioni sefyllfa nad ydynt yn gyfrifol amdani. Pwysaf ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gefnogi'r awdurdod drwy roi rhagor o arian iddo, gan ei fod yntau eisoes wedi rhoi cymorth i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, a bod yn deg. Dyna'r unig ffordd deg o fynd ymlaen.

Mae gwersi cyffredinol i'w dysgu ynglŷn â byw gyda safleoedd tirlenwi. Mae pob un ohonom wedi dysgu o'r ymchwiliad hwn nad yw safleoedd tirlenwi mawr, yn yr hirdymor, yn ffordd addas o ymdrin â gwastraff. Mae cymunedau yn byw gyda chanlyniadau safleoedd tirlenwi, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, a gobeithiwn y gellir ymestyn gwersi'r ymchwiliad hwn i'r cymunedau hynny. Wrth frwydro—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You should wind up now.

**Helen Mary Jones:** By fighting for their communities, the Nantygwyddon protestors have highlighted the dangers of our current waste disposal practices. They have done the whole of Wales a great service and their efforts are vindicated today. Now, all of us must ensure that this report is acted upon. The protestors deserve no less than that.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Let us stick to a time limit of five minutes.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats welcome this report. I joined the Committee just before the investigator presented his report. The people who have had to suffer living with this landfill site have done themselves proud. The mobilisation of the community, in terms of organising themselves to research an issue—about which they all cared and campaigned in order to close the landfill site—is an inspiration to us all. We must go the final mile to close the site completely. The true heroes are the people in the community, and I urge the Assembly to echo those sentiments.

The effect that landfill sites have on the environment and public health is grave, and though I am not attempting to make any party-political gain from the suffering of these people, privatisation must have been the root cause of much of the landfill problem. In a climate where making profit is the sole aim, it is not surprising that corners must have been cut. Privatisation of public services will not be discussed in detail today, but I contend that public support for such projects is ambivalent at best, and the Assembly should bear that in mind when the issue of part privatisation emerges in the future.

One principle that hindered the community's ability to find out about its environment was that of commercial confidentiality. That should not have been used as a barrier to public accountability. People have the right to know about their environment. Peaceful protest is one of the founding principles of a democratic state. Finally, I urge the

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dylech ddirwyn i ben yn awr.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Drwy frwydro dros eu cymunedau, mae protestwyr Nantygwyddon wedi amlygu peryglon ein harferion gwaredu gwastraff presennol. Maent wedi gwneud cymwynas fawr â Chymru gyfan a heddiw cyfiawnheir eu hymdrechion. Bellach, rhaid i bob un ohonom sicrhau y gweithredir ar yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'r protestwyr yn haeddu hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gadewch inni gadw at y terfyn amser o bum munud.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn. Ymunais â'r Pwyllgor ychydig cyn i'r ymchwilydd gyflwyno ei adroddiad. Dylai'r bobl a fu'n gorfod byw ger y safle tirlenwi hwn fod yn falch. Mae'r ffordd y daeth y gymuned ynghyd, o ran trefnu eu hunain, i ymchwilio i fater—yr oedd pob un ohonynt yn pryderu ac yn ymgyrchu yn ei gylch er mwyn cau'r safle tirlenwi hwn—yn ysbrydoliaeth inni oll. Rhaid inni gau pen y mwdwl a chau'r safle yn gyfan gwbl. Y gwir arwyr yw'r bobl yn y gymuned, ac apelïaf ar y Cynulliad i ategu'r sylwadau hynny.

Mae'r effaith a gaiff safleoedd tirlenwi ar yr amgylchedd ac iechyd y cyhoedd yn un ddifrifol, ac er nad wyf yn ceisio cael unrhyw fantais bleidiol drwy ddiodeffaint y bobl hyn, rhaid mai preifateiddio oedd wrth wraidd sawl agwedd ar broblem y safle tirlenwi. Mewn hinsawdd lle mai gwneud elw yw'r unig nod, nid oes ryfedd bod yn rhaid torri corneli. Ni chaiff preifateiddio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ei drafod yn fanwl heddiw, ond haeraf fod cefnogaeth y cyhoedd i broseictau o'r fath yn ansicr ar y gorau, a dylai'r Cynulliad gofio hynny pan ddaw mater rhan-breifateiddio i'r amlwg yn y dyfodol.

Un egwyddor a rwystrodd y gymuned rhag cael gwybodaeth am ei hamgylchedd oedd cyfrinachedd masnachol. Ni ddylid bod wedi defnyddio hynny fel rhwystr i atebolrwydd cyhoeddus. Mae gan bobl yr hawl i fynnu gwybodaeth am eu hamgylchedd. Mae gwrthdystio'n heddychlon yn un o egwyddorion sylfaenol gwladwriaeth

Assembly to reach a cross-party consensus on this and to endorse the Committee's findings. I also ask the Assembly to applaud the tireless efforts of the people living near the Nantygwyddon site to bring the truth to light and for coming together to safeguard their environment and health. Had there not been a democratic body, such as the Assembly, in Wales, their demands would probably have fallen on deaf ears. This episode demonstrates clearly what can happen in a democratic vacuum. Let us show the difference that a full democratic body, such as the Assembly, working according to the principle and practice of openness and accountability can achieve for those whom it represents.

**David Davies:** I also welcome the publication of this report and its recommendations. I hope that it will soon bring an end to the problems that have blighted Nantygwyddon. The independent investigation was a laborious process and everyone involved worked hard. It has set a useful precedent for the future, but is not a process that should be undertaken lightly. Given what has been going on in the Rhondda, there is no doubt that it was right for the investigation to go ahead. Like Helen Mary, I consider it to have been successful, despite the fact that it is always a pleasure to prove Helen Mary wrong. I will not start debating this matter in case angry relatives on both sides send e-mails around.

If anyone deserves praise for this sorry shambles, it is not Committee members, but the residents of Nantygwyddon whose sheer determination to highlight the appalling mismanagement of that site finally led to this conclusion. It quickly became obvious to everyone involved that something had gone horribly wrong at Nantygwyddon. As the facts began to emerge, it was easy to see why local people were so angry. The report indicates that the people living in that area were not just the victims of gross incompetence, but that something far worse was going on. There was an odour coming out of Nantygwyddon that did not emanate from the tip, but from the county hall. That is

ddemocrataidd. Yn olaf, apeliaf ar y Cynulliad i sicrhau cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar hyn ac i gymeradwyo canfyddiadau'r Pwyllgor. Gofynnaf hefyd i'r Cynulliad ganmol ymdrechion diflino'r bobl sy'n byw ger safle Nantygwyddon am ddatgelu'r gwirionedd ac am ddod ynghyd i ddiogelu eu hamgylchedd a'u hiechyd. Heb gorff democrataidd, megis y Cynulliad, yng Nghymru, mae'n annhebygol y byddai eu gofynion wedi cael gwrandauiad. Dengys yr achos hwn yn glir yr hyn a all ddigwydd lle na fo democratiaeth ar waith. Gadewch inni ddangos y gwahaniaeth y gall corff democrataidd llawn, megis y Cynulliad, yn gweithio yn ôl yr egwyddor a'r arfer o fod yn agored ac yn atebol, ei gyflawni i'r rhai y mae'n eu cynrychioli.

**David Davies:** Croesawaf innau hefyd y ffaith bod yr adroddiad hwn a'i argymhellion wedi'u cyhoeddi. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn datrys yn fuan y problemau sydd wedi difwyno Nantygwyddon. Bu'r ymchwiliad annibynnol yn broses lafurus a gweithiodd pawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig â hi yn ddiwyd. Gosododd gysail ddefnyddiol ar gyfer y dyfodol, ond nid yw'n broses y dylid ymgymryd â hi heb feddwl. O gofio'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y Rhondda, nid oes amheuaeth ei bod yn briodol bod yr ymchwiliad wedi mynd yn ei flaen. Fel Helen Mary, credaf iddo fod yn llwyddiannus, er gwaethaf y ffaith ei bod bob amser yn bleser profi Helen Mary yn anghywir. Ni ddechreuaf drafod y mater hwn rhag ofn i berthnasau dig ar y ddwy ochr anfon negeseuon e-bost.

Os oes unrhyw un yn haeddu clod yn sgîl y cawdel truenus hwn, nid aelodau'r Cynulliad ydyw, ond trigolion Nantygwyddon a fu'n gyfrifol am y canlyniad hwn drwy eu penderfyniad di-syfl i amlygu'r ffordd warthus yr oedd y safle yn cael ei gamreoli. Daeth yn amlwg yn fuan i bawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r broses fod rhywbeth mawr wedi mynd o'i le yn Nantygwyddon. Wrth i'r ffeithiau ddod i'r golwg, yr oedd yn hawdd gweld pam bod pobl leol wedi'u digio cymaint. Noda'r adroddiad fod y bobl sy'n byw yn yr ardal honno nid yn unig wedi dioddef oherwydd blerwch llwyr, ond bod rhywbeth llawer gwaeth yn digwydd. Yr oedd aroglau yn dod o Nantygwyddon nad

all I can say without incurring your wrath. I suggest that anyone who doubts that considers the report to see how bluntly the independent investigator puts it. Many incriminating documents relating to the financing and construction of this site have been mislaid. I use the term 'mislaid' in its loosest sense.

It is because of this that the people of the Rhondda have the right to expect that the recommendations made by the independent investigator are implemented as quickly as possible. In a nutshell, that tip does not just need to be made safe; it should also be seen to be safe, so that residents can sleep at night without worrying what effect the site will have on their and their children's health.

It is possible that, by speedily implementing the recommendations, some good may come out of this sorry mess. Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council is now taking a positive view of recycling and composting. I hope that that will encourage other authorities to do likewise. The suggestion that realtime monitoring information on the site be placed on the internet is innovative. In Vienna, I saw information about emissions from a waste treatment centre being publicly displayed on a monitor outside the site so that members of the public could see it. Placing the information on the internet and making it that much more accessible is an excellent idea and takes us a step further towards the openness that we all want.

There are lessons to be learnt about how we deal with waste disposal. Not least, we must consider responsibly the vast quantities of waste that we produce every year and which must go somewhere. That is one of the root causes of what happened in Nantygwyddon. It is not good enough for opposition parties to criticise the Government about waste disposal strategies unless we can find workable alternatives—and they must be workable, not pie-in-the-sky, science fiction alternatives that cannot be implemented. Likewise, the Government has a duty to consider innovative alternatives to landfill and incineration, even if it means funding

oedd yn dod o gyfeiriad y domen ond o neuadd y sir. Dyna'r cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud heb dramgwyddo. Awgrymaf y dylai unrhyw un sy'n amau hynny ystyried yr adroddiad i weld pa mor blaen oedd yr ymchwilydd annibynnol wrth fynegi hynny. Collwyd llawer o'r dogfennau dammiol yn ymwneud â'r ffordd y cafodd y safle hwn ei ariannu a'i adeiladu. Defnyddiaf y term 'colli' yn yr ystyr mwyaf llac.

O'r herwydd mae gan bobl y Rhondda yr hawl i ddisgwyl y caiff yr argymhellion a wnaed gan yr ymchwilydd annibynnol eu gweithredu cyn gynted â phosibl. Yn fyr, mae angen nid yn unig sicrhau bod y domen yn ddiogel; dylai hefyd gael ei gweld ei bod yn ddiogel, fel y gall y trigolion gysgu'n esmwyth heb orfod poeni am effaith y safle ar eu hiechyd ac iechyd eu plant.

Mae'n bosibl, drwy weithredu'r argymhellion yn ddiymdroi, y bydd rhywfaint o ddaioni yn dod o'r cawdel hwn. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf bellach yn edrych ar ailgylchu a chompostio mewn modd cadarnhaol. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n annog awdurdodau eraill i wneud yr un peth. Mae'r awgrym y dylid gosod gwybodaeth fonitro ar yr union amser ar y rhyngwyd yn arloesol. Yn Fienna, gwelais wybodaeth am ollyngiadau o ganolfan trin gwastraff yn cael ei arddangos ar fonitor y tu allan i'r safle er mwyn i aelodau o'r cyhoedd allu ei gweld. Mae'r syniad o roi gwybodaeth ar y rhyngwyd a sicrhau ei bod yn llawer haws i'w gweld yn un ardderchog ac yn gam ymlaen tuag at yr ymddygiad agored y mae pob un ohonom am ei weld.

Mae gwersi i'w dysgu ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ymdriniwn â gwaredu gwastraff. Ar y lleiaf, rhaid inni ystyried mewn ffordd gyfrifol y meintiau enfawr o wastraff a gynhyrchwn bob blwyddyn ac y mae'n rhaid ei waredu rywle. Dyna un o'r rhesymau sylfaenol dros yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn Nantygwyddon. Nid yw'n ddigon da i'r gwrthbleidiau feirniadu'r Llywodraeth am strategaethau gwaredu gwastraff oni bai ein bod yn gallu dod o hyd i ddulliau amgen, ymarferol—a rhaid iddynt fod yn ymarferol, ac nid rhyw ddulliau amgen annichonadwy ffugiol na ellir eu gweithredu. Yn yr un modd, mae dyletswydd ar y Llywodraeth i ystyried

research and pilot projects. Recycling and composting may answer some of our problems. Pyrolysis, which involves the gasification of waste to create energy without emissions, is another technology that we should explore. The Minister said, quite rightly, that nothing we do in terms of waste disposal will be risk-free. However, everyone involved in the waste disposal process has a duty to behave responsibly.

I take umbrage with the comments of the Liberal Democrat spokesperson. It was not a privatised company that caused this problem; it was a company set up by a Labour council and run by Labour councillors. That is the problem. Had you been involved at the beginning of the investigation, you would have known that. We are still looking for answers to the question as to why that landfill site was placed where it was.

**Brian Gibbons:** Is it not true that that company was set up under the Conservative orders of the day—as an arm's length company, specifically under your party's legislation?

**David Davies:** The Conservative Government's intention at the time was to take such operations away from the local councils which had been mismanaging sites in the Valleys for decades. We all know where the fault lies. You should ask your colleagues in those Labour-run councils to produce the missing documents that would tell us why the site was placed there in the first place. How did that site qualify for European Union funding as some kind of tourist initiative? Those questions need to be answered, and it is the Labour councillors in that area who have the answers. We will not get the answers to any of those questions today, because Brian's colleagues have buried the information. Instead, we must resolve to end the problems that the Nantygwyddon landfill site causes to the residents of the Rhondda, who have suffered for too long.

dulliau amgen arloesol yn lle'r safleoedd tirlenwi a'r llosgyddion, hyd yn oed os yw hynny yn golygu ariannu ymchwil a phrosiectau peilot. Mae'n bosibl y bydd ailgylchu a chompostio yn datrys rhai o'n problemau. Mae pyrolysis, sy'n golygu nwyeddio gwastraff i greu ynni heb ollyngiadau, yn fath arall o dechnoleg y dylem ei hystyried. Dywedodd y Gweinidog, a hynny'n gwbl deg, na fydd dim byd a wnawn o ran gwaredu gwastraff heb risg. Fodd bynnag, mae dyletswydd ar bawb sy'n ymwneud â'r broses o waredu gwastraff i ymddwyn yn gyfrifol.

Mae sylwadau llfarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi peri tramgwydd imi. Nid cwmni wedi'i breifateiddio a achosodd y broblem hon; cwmni wedi'i sefydlu gan gyngor Llafur ac wedi'i redeg gan gynghorwyr Llafur ydoedd. Dyna'r broblem. Pe baech wedi bod yn rhan o'r ymchwiliad o'r dechrau, byddech wedi gwybod hynny. Yr ydym yn dal i chwilio am atebion i'r cwestiwn pam y lleolwyd y safle tirlenwi hwnnw ar y safle hwnnw.

**Brian Gibbons:** Onid yw'n wir i'r cwmni hwnnw gael ei sefydlu o dan drefn y Ceidwadwyr ar y pryd—fel cwmni hyd braich o dan ddeddfwriaeth eich plaid?

**David Davies:** Bwriad y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ar y pryd oedd mynd â gweithrediadau o'r fath o ddwylo cynghorau lleol a oedd wedi bod yn camreoli safleoedd yn y Cymoedd ers blynnyddoedd. Gwyddom oll pwy sydd ar fai. Dylech ofyn i'ch cyd-aelodau yn y cynghorau hynny a fu o dan arweiniad Llafur gyflwyno'r dogfennau sydd ar goll, a fyddai'n dweud wrthym pam y lleolwyd y safle yno yn y lle cyntaf. Sut y bu'r safle hwnnw yn gymwys i gael arian yr Undeb Ewropeaidd fel rhyw fath o fenter twristiaeth? Mae angen atebion i'r cwestiynau hynny, a'r cynghorwyr Llafur yn yr ardal honno a all roi'r atebion hynny. Ni chawn atebion i unrhyw un o'r cwestiynau hynny heddiw, am fod cyd-aelodau Brian wedi celu'r wybodaeth. Yn hytrach, rhaid inni benderfynu datrys y problemau y mae safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon yn eu hachosi i drigolion y Rhondda, sydd wedi dioddef ers llawer gormod o amser.

Yfory, bydd yn rhaid inni edrych i'r dyfodol a darganfod modd o ddelio â'r sbwriel cyn y gwnawn ormod o ddifrod i'n gwlad.

**Tom Middlehurst:** That typical rant by David Davies does a great disservice to the wonderful people in the Valleys who are members of Rhondda Against Nantygwyddon Tip. It is terrible to introduce a political element to this debate.

**David Davies:** I did not introduce the political element. The Liberal Democrat Member introduced the political element; I was merely putting her right. I had not planned to make those comments; I made them because I wanted to make it clear that it was not a privatised company that was at fault. A properly privatised company would have done a much better job than the Labour councillors of Rhondda Cynon Taff.

**Tom Middlehurst:** That is another typical response from David Davies. Such input into the discussion detracts from the importance of this report. The important fact is that the report's findings and recommendations reflect well on the Assembly. I pay full tribute to the Minister, Sue Essex, who had the foresight and the conviction to initiate the investigation, in spite of the call for a public inquiry—and I am pleased that Helen Mary has been generous enough to acknowledge that the process was successful. I also commend Richard Edwards as Chair. He inspired confidence in the procedure and, slowly but surely, masses of people who attended the investigation were reassured as the process developed. The issues about which they were rightly concerned were given proper consideration through this investigation.

4:30 p.m.

It is also worth saying that David Purchon, who was extremely robust and resolute in his investigation, used his considerable experience and expertise in dealing with a range of issues—engineering, health and environmental consequences—as best he could. He also inspired great confidence in the process.

Tomorrow, we will have to look to the future and find a way to deal with waste before we cause too much damage to our country.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Mae rhefru nodweddiadol David Davies yn gwneud anghymwynas fawr â'r bobl wych yn y Cymoedd sy'n aelodau o Rhondda Against Nantygwyddon Tip. Mae'n beth ofnadwy cyflwyno elfen wleidyddol i'r ddadl hon.

**David Davies:** Nid myfi a gyflwynodd yr elfen wleidyddol. Fe'i cyflwynwyd gan y Democrat Rhyddfrydol; dim ond ei chywiro yr oeddwn i. Nid oeddwn yn bwriadu gwneud sylwadau o'r fath; fe'u gwneuthum am fy mod yn dymuno egluro nad cwmni wedi'i breifateiddio oedd ar fai. Byddai cwmni wedi'i breifateiddio'n gywir wedi gwneud gwaith llawer gwell na chynghorwyr Llafur Rhondda Cynon Taf.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Dyna ymateb nodweddiadol arall gan David Davies. Mae cyfraniadau o'r fath i'r drafodaeth yn tynnu sylw oddi wrth bwysigrwydd yr adroddiad hwn. Y ffaith bwysig yw bod canfyddiadau ac argymhellion yr adroddiad yn glod i'r Cynulliad. Talaf bob teyrnged i'r Gweinidog, Sue Essex, a oedd yn meddu ar y weledigaeth a'r argyhoeddiad i gychwyn yr ymchwiliad, er gwaethaf y galwadau am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus—ac mae'n dda gennyf nodi bod Helen Mary wedi bod yn ddigon hael i gydnabod bod y broses wedi bod yn llwyddiant. Cymeradwyaf hefyd Richard Edwards fel Cadeirydd. Enynnodd ffydd yn y broses ac, o dipyn i beth, tawelwyd meddyliau'r llu o bobl a fynychodd yr ymchwiliad wrth i'r broses ddatblygu. Ystyriwyd y materion a oedd yn achos pryder dilys iddynt mewn modd priodol drwy'r ymchwiliad hwn.

Mae'n werth nodi hefyd bod David Purchon, a oedd yn gadarn ac yn benderfynol dros ben yn ei ymchwiliad, wedi defnyddio ei brofiad a'i arbenigedd helaeth wrth ymdrin ag ystod o faterion—peirianeg, iechyd a goblygiadau amgylcheddol—hyd eithaf ei allu. Enynnodd hyder mawr yn y broses hefyd.

I am disappointed that some agencies, although not all, were defensive in their responses to the investigation. They can learn much from this process. They can learn that they have a duty to promote awareness and understanding of the issues surrounding waste disposal. I look forward to them embracing the recommendations in the best interests of the public whom they serve.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

On 4 July 2000 in this Chamber I called for a public inquiry into the Nantygwyddon landfill site. I listed the concerns that had been voiced about the tip: about how the site was established; its construction; its technical and financial management; the performance of the regulatory authorities, and the varied and serious concerns of the residents in its vicinity.

We did not get the full public inquiry that we asked for but we did have had an independent investigation. We knew that an investigation would have its limitations. In particular, it could not subpoena witnesses to give evidence, which is acknowledged in the report. Although the contributions of members of Rhondda Against Nantygwyddon Tip, and the full co-operation of the current Rhondda Cynon Taff council are noted with thanks, there were bodies such as Rhondda Waste Disposal Ltd, whose directors failed to appear in person to give evidence, and whose administrator was notably less than forthcoming with information. Such bodies hampered the report and limited its scope. I do not want to make a political point, but it was regrettable that only one Labour councillor from the former local authority belatedly came forward to give evidence. It is also highly regrettable that a considerable amount of technical evidence concerning the tip disappeared from the council's offices before the present administration came into office.

Nevertheless, the report is a major breakthrough in Nantygwyddon's history. It is a vindication of years of dedicated campaigning. I take this opportunity to add

Yr wyf yn siomedig bod rhai asiantaethau, er nad pob un, yn amddiffynnol yn eu hymatebion i'r ymchwiliad. Gallant ddysgu llawer o'r broses hon. Gallant ddysgu bod dyletswydd arnynt i hybu ymwybyddiaeth a dealltwriaeth o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â gwaredu gwastraff. Edrychaf ymlaen at eu gweld yn croesawu'r argymhellion er budd y cyhoedd y maent yn ei wasanaethu.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council.

Ar 4 Gorffennaf 2000 yn y Siambr hon, gelwais am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon. Rhestrais y pryderon a fynegwyd ynglŷn â'r domen: sut y sefydlwyd y safle; sut y'i hadeiladwyd; sut y cafodd ei reoli'n dechnegol ac yn ariannol; perfformiad yr awdurdodau rheoleiddio, a phryderon amrywiol a difrifol y trigolion yn y cyffiniau.

Ni chawsom yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn yn ôl ein cais ond cawsom ymchwiliad annibynnol. Gwyddem y byddai i'r ymchwiliad gyfyngiadau. Yn arbennig, ni allai wysio tystion i roi tystiolaeth, rhywbeth a gydnabyddir yn yr adroddiad. Er bod cyfraniadau aelodau Rhondda Against Nantygwyddon Tip, a chydweithrediad llawn cyngor presennol Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi'u nodi gyda diolch, cafwyd rhai cyrff megis cwmni Rhondda Waste Disposal Cyf, na ddaeth ei gyfarwyddwyr gerbron i roi tystiolaeth eu hunain, ac roedd ei weinyddwr yn amharod iawn i roi gwybodaeth. Mae cyrff o'r fath wedi llesteirio'r adroddiad ac wedi cyfyngu ar ei gwmpas. Nid wyf am wneud pwynt gwleidyddol, ond mae'n drueni mai dim ond un cynghorydd Llafur o'r awdurdod lleol blaenorol a ddaeth ymlaen i roi tystiolaeth, er yn hwyr. Mae'n drueni mawr hefyd bod cryn dipyn o'r dystiolaeth dechnegol ynglŷn â'r domen wedi diflannu o swyddfeydd y cyngor cyn i'r weinyddiaeth bresennol ddod i rym.

Eto i gyd, mae'r adroddiad yn ddatblygiad pwysig yn hanes Nantygwyddon. Mae'n gyfiawnhad o'r blynyddoedd o ymgyrchu ymroddedig. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn

my thanks to all those involved in the campaign, to the members of RANT and, in particular, to those whose campaigning resulted in them being served with High Court writs. Some people have paid a high price.

David Purchon has confirmed many of our fears; I shall give examples of the tip's management. He highlights the site's basic unsuitability and the fact that, in its construction, there was no guarantee on the liner, which was not suitable for industrial waste. He highlights the fact that the waste was supposed to be deposited in individual cells, yet was dumped in one great mass. He exposed the scandal that calcium sulphate filter cake was accepted, despite the problems experienced when it had been dumped elsewhere. Although concerns were raised by local councillors, that dumping continued for another 19 months. As a consequence, the Valley will be polluted by hydrogen sulphide for 1,000 years. Therefore, the recommendation on the remediation of the site is of the utmost importance, and must be carried out using the best and most modern technology. Cost should not be a factor.

David Purchon has taken residents' health concerns seriously. The latest standard mortality rate statistics for the Bro Taf Health Authority show that the Ystrad and Gelli ward has the worst health in all of north Bro Taf—that is, Rhondda Cynon Taff and Merthyr Tydfil. That cannot be explained away by poverty; it does not feature in the top 100 most deprived wards. We have all heard the moving accounts of babies born with congenital malformations. Those are the real concerns of my constituents, and the National Assembly has a duty to address those concerns. It is imperative that comprehensive health studies are commissioned as a matter of urgency. We need to know the facts and we need to learn lessons.

What is the future of Nantygwyddon? That is the main question of the people of the Rhondda. They want to see—and deserve to get—action. We have heard from Helen Mary Jones exactly what Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council has done. It

i ddiolch hefyd i bawb a fu'n rhan o'r ymgyrch, i aelodau RANT ac, yn arbennig, y bobl a wysiwyd gan yr Uchel Lys o ganlyniad i'w hymgyrchu. Mae rhai pobl wedi talu'n hallt.

Cadarnhaodd David Purchon lawer o'n hofnau; rhoddaf enghreifftiau o'r ffordd y rheolwyd y domen. Mae'n nodi anaddasrwydd sylfaenol y safle a'r ffaith nad oedd unrhyw warrant ar y leinin, nad oedd yn addas ar gyfer gwastraff diwydiannol pan adeiladwyd y safle. Mae'n nodi'r ffaith bod y gwastraff i fod i gael ei roi mewn celloedd unigol, ond y'i gwaredwyd yn un llwyth mawr. Amlygodd y sgandal ynglŷn â'r penderfyniad i dderbyn talpiau hidlo calsiwm sylffad, er gwaethaf y problemau a gafwyd pan y'i defnyddiwyd mewn mannau eraill. Er i gynghorwyr lleol godi pryderon, parheid i waredu sbwriel am 19 mis arall. O ganlyniad, caiff y Cwm ei lygru gan hydrogen sylffad am 1,000 o flynyddoedd. Felly, mae'r argymhelliad ar gyfer adfer y safle yn hollbwysig, rhaid ei weithredu gan ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg orau, fwyaf cyfoes. Ni ddylai cost fod yn ffactor.

Mae David Purchon wedi cymryd pryderon iechyd trigolion o ddifrif. Dengys yr ystadegau diweddaraf ar gyfraddau marwoldeb safonol gan Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf mai ward Ystrad a'r Gelli sydd â'r afiechyd mwyaf ar draws gogledd Bro Taf—hynny yw Rhondda Cynon Taf a Merthyr Tudful. Ni ellir egluro hynny drwy dlodi yn unig; nid ymddengys yn y 100 o wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig. Mae pob un ohonom wedi gwrando ar hanesion dirdynnol am fabanod yn cael eu geni â namau cynhwynol. Dyna bryderon gwirioneddol fy etholwyr, ac mae dyletswydd ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hynny. Mae'n hanfodol bod astudiaethau iechyd cynhwysfawr yn cael eu comisiynu fel mater o frys. Mae angen inni wybod y ffeithiau ac mae angen inni ddysgu gwersi.

Beth yw dyfodol Nantygwyddon? Dyna'r cwestiwn pwysicaf i bobl y Rhondda. Maent am weld gweithredu—ac maent yn haeddu hynny. Clywsom gan Helen Mary Jones beth yn union y mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi'i wneud. Mae wedi



has stopped accepting household waste, and has a successful kerbside recycling strategy. I am pleased to announce that, as far as the Plaid Cymru ruling group on Rhondda Cynon Taff council is concerned, serious consideration will be given to the complete closure of the Nantygwyddon landfill site, when it meets on 6 March to discuss the issue. However, our plans can only be realised with the backing of the National Assembly.

How the National Assembly reacts to the Purchon report will be of utmost importance to the people of the Rhondda. We have proved that we can listen to people; we must now prove that we can act. We must ensure that the report's recommendations are implemented.

I finish by stressing that the victims must not pay again. The council tax payers of Rhondda Cynon Taff should not have to fund the clearing up of the mess of Nantygwyddon. They have already paid dearly with worry—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must wind up now.

**Geraint Davies:**—with the devaluation of their properties, and with the most priceless gift of all—their health. Please accept the report.

**Val Lloyd:** My comments are on recommendations 6, 7, 8 and 10, namely the more general recommendations, which have wider implications than the site-specific recommendations. As we have heard, site-specific recommendations are of major importance to local residents, but the more general recommendations have significant potential to improve the conduct of waste management throughout Wales.

My constituents have followed the Nantygwyddon investigation with far more than a passing interest. Some of the barriers to public information and accountability seen at Nantygwyddon struck a chord with the campaigners and residents concerned about the waste recovery and recycling plant at Crymlyn Burrows. The lack of speed with which information has reached the public

rhoi'r gorau i dderbyn gwastraff cartref, ac mae ganddo strategaeth ailgylchu o ymyl y palmant sy'n llwyddiant. Mae'n dda gennyf nodi, o ran grŵp Plaid Cymru sy'n rheoli cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf, y bydd yn rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i gau safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon yn gyfan gwbl, pan fydd yn cyfarfod ar 6 Mawrth i drafod y mater. Fodd bynnag, dim ond drwy gefnogaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol y gellir gwireddu ein cynlluniau.

Bydd y ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymateb i adroddiad Purchon yn hollbwysig i bobl y Rhondda. Yr ydym wedi dangos ein bod yn gallu gwrandao ar bobl; rhaid inni ddangos yn awr ein bod yn gallu gweithredu. Rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff argymhellion yr adroddiad eu rhoi ar waith.

Gorffennaf drwy bwysleisio na ddylai'r rhai sydd wedi dioddef orfod talu'r pris unwaith eto. Ni ddylai talwyr treth gyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf orfod talu am unioni Nantygwyddon. Maent eisoes wedi talu'n hallt drwy eu pryder—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr.

**Geraint Davies:**—drwy'r ffaith bod eu heiddo wedi ei ddibrisio, a thrwy'r rhodd fwyaf amhrisiadwy—eu hiechyd. Gofynnaf i chi dderbyn yr adroddiad.

**Val Lloyd:** Gwnaf sylwadau ar argymhellion 6, 7, 8 a 10, sef yr argymhellion mwy cyffredinol, sydd â goblygiadau ehangach na'r argymhellion sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â'r safle. Fel y clywsom, mae'r argymhellion sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â'r safle o bwys mawr i drigolion lleol, ond mae i'r argymhellion mwy cyffredinol bosibiliadau mawr i wella'r ffordd y caiff gwastraff ei reoli ar draws Cymru.

Mae fy etholwyr wedi dilyn ymchwiliad Nantygwyddon â chryn ddiddordeb. Mae rhai o'r rhwystrau i wybodaeth ac atebolrwydd cyhoeddus yn taro tant gyda'r ymgyrchwyr a'r trigolion sy'n pryderu am y gwaith adfer ac ailgylchu gwastraff yn Nhywyn Crymlyn. Un o themâu'r ymgyrch yw pa mor araf y rhyddhawyd gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd. Do, cyhoeddwyd gwybodaeth, ond yr oedd yr

domain has been a theme of the campaign. Yes, information was posted, but the time lag for this and answers to questions was unacceptable. If recommendation 6 of the report had been the norm, the allegations of misinformation, the uncertainty, and the doubt fuelled by lack of prompt and timely information from agencies, would not have spread unchecked.

People need to know the facts. However, in current scientific knowledge sometimes the facts conflict, or—more accurately—the interpretation of the facts conflict. Recommendation 7, on how formal impact assessments can best be used in Wales to properly consider the implications of waste management projects, is welcome.

There is a general misconception that experts agree. Experts may be experts, but they are still human. Although they work from the basis of knowledge and integrity, they must evaluate known scientific facts, and arrive at decisions based on their evaluation of those facts and their resultant assumptions. Recommendation 8, allowing for independent research and health risk appraisals, is therefore a bonus.

4:40 p.m.

The presumption must be that public and quasi-public bodies are there to work in the public interest. Recommendation 10 codifies that presumption into established practice.

What are the general recommendations saying? To me, the message for campaigners and official bodies is to respect each other's roles, to ensure openness and transparency on both sides and to work in partnership. That will ensure that communities get the information and service they need and deserve, and will be a lasting legacy of this definitive investigative report.

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council.

oedi cyn gwneud hynny a chyn ateb cwestiynau yn annerbyniol. Pe bai'r hyn y mae argymhelliad 6 yn ei argymhell wedi bod yn arferol, ni fyddai'r honiadau o wybodaeth anghywir, ansicrwydd a'r amheuan a godwyd am nad yw asiantaethau wedi rhoi gwybodaeth yn brydlon ac yn amserol wedi lledu mor eang.

Mae angen i bobl wybod y ffeithiau. Fodd bynnag, weithiau mewn gwybodaeth wyddonol gyfredol mae'r ffeithiau yn groes i'w gilydd neu—yn fwy cywir—mae dehongliadau o'r ffeithiau yn groes i'w gilydd. Mae argymhelliad 7, ynglŷn â'r ffordd orau o ddefnyddio asesiadau effaith ffurfiol yng Nghymru i ystyried goblygiadau prosiectau rheoli gwastraff yn briodol, i'w groesawu.

Mae camdybiaeth gyffredinol bod arbenigwyr yn cytuno. Arbenigwyr yw arbenigwyr, ond maent yn ddynol hefyd. Er eu bod yn gweithio ar sail gwybodaeth ac uniondeb, rhaid inni werthuso ffeithiau gwyddonol hysbys, a dod i benderfyniadau yn seiliedig ar eu gwerthusiad o'r ffeithiau hynny a'u tybiaethau dilynol. Felly mae argymhelliad 8, sy'n caniatáu ymchwil annibynnol a gwerthusiadau o risgiau i iechyd yn fonws.

Rhaid mai'r dybiaeth yw bod cyrff cyhoeddus a lled-gyhoeddus yn bodoli i weithio er budd y cyhoedd. Mae argymhelliad 10 yn troi'r dybiaeth honno yn god o arfer sefydledig.

Beth ddywed yr argymhellion cyffredinol? I mi, y neges i ymgyrchwyr a chyrff swyddogol yw y dylent barchu rôl ei gilydd, i sicrhau bod y naill ochr a'r llall yn agored ac yn dryloyw ac y dylent weithio mewn partneriaeth. Bydd hynny yn sicrhau y caiff cymunedau y wybodaeth a'r gwasanaeth y mae eu hangen arnynt ac y maent yn eu haeddu, a dyna fydd etifeddiaeth dragwyddol yr adroddiad ymchwiliol awdurdodol hwn.

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

I thank the Chair and members of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee for undertaking the Nantygwyddon investigation, which resulted in the recommendations before Members today.

As someone who, along with Geraint Davies AM, Jill Evans MEP and Rhondda Against Nantygwyddon Tip—whose members I stood alongside when they were taken to court by Rhondda Waste Disposal Ltd—and others in the community of Rhondda, has been involved in attempting to resolve the Nantygwyddon issue for longer than most of us would care to remember, I strongly welcome today's endorsement of the Purchon report by the National Assembly. Rhondda Cynon Taff council will look closely at today's debate and will, hopefully, make decisions next week on the future of the Nantygwyddon site.

To pick up on the Minister's points in relation to the draft national waste strategy, Assembly Members may know that, since 1999, Rhondda Cynon Taff has been getting on with the job of tackling waste disposal. It has introduced a radical new waste strategy entitled 'Respecting Waste', which includes the final closure of Nantygwyddon. This radical, innovative and fully costed waste action plan embraces the extensive use of recycling, composting and other waste minimisation initiatives, and recognises how significant waste disposal choices can be for local communities, especially Valley communities such as those in Rhondda Cynon Taff. 'Respecting Waste' aims to raise awareness of the need to change attitudes to how we dispose of waste; to introduce waste reduction and re-use initiatives, full-scale kerbside recycling, which, as Geraint indicated, is already underway and has proved successful, with encouraging responses from residents; to establish a new materials recycling facility, more civic amenity sites and more community recycling facilities; and to foster partnerships with community recycling organisations. The strategy will result in less landfill in general, less landfill at the Bryn Pica site in Cynon Valley and, most crucially, the closure and remediation of Nantygwyddon.

Hoffwn ddiolch i Gadeirydd ac aelodau Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Trafnidiaeth am gynnal ymchwiliad Nantygwyddon, sydd wedi arwain at yr argymhellion sydd gerbron yr Aelodau heddiw.

Fel rhywun, sydd, ynghyd â Geraint Davies AC, Jill Evans ASE a mudiad Rhondda Against Nantygwyddon Tip—y sefais wrth ymyl ei aelodau wrth iddynt gael eu dwyn i'r llys gan Rhondda Waste Disposal Ltd—ac eraill yng nghymuned y Rhondda, sydd wedi bod yn rhan o'r ymgais i ddatrys problem Nantygwyddon am fwy o amser nag y caredd gyfaddef, croesawaf y ffaith bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cymeradwyo adroddiad Purchon heddiw. Bydd cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf yn ystyried dadl heddiw yn fanwl a bydd, gobeithio, yn gwneud penderfyniad yr wythnos nesaf ar ddyfodol safle Nantygwyddon.

Gan ddychwelyd at bwyntiau'r Gweinidog am y strategaeth wastraff genedlaethol ddrafft, efallai y gwyr Aelodau'r Cynulliad fod Rhondda Cynon Taf, ers 1999, wedi bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o ymdrin â gwaredu gwastraff. Cyflwynodd strategaeth wastraff newydd radical o'r enw 'Agweddau ar Ailgylchu', sy'n cynnwys y bwriad i gau Nantygwyddon yn gyfan gwbl. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu radical, arloesol hwn, sydd wedi'i gostio'n llawn, yn cynnwys defnydd helaeth o ailgylchu, compostio a mentrau eraill i leihau gwastraff i'r eithaf, ac yn cydnabod pam mor bwysig y gall dewis o ddulliau gwaredu fod i gymunedau lleol, yn arbennig yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd megis y rhai yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Nod 'Agweddau ar Ailgylchu' yw codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r angen i newid ein hymagwedd tuag at waredu gwastraff; cyflwyno mentrau lleihau gwastraff ac aildefnyddio gwastraff, ailgylchu o ymyl y palmant ar raddfa lawn, sydd, fel y nododd Geraint, eisoes ar waith ac a fu'n llwyddiannus, gydag ymatebion calonogol gan drigolion; sefydlu cyfleuster ailgylchu deunyddiau newydd, mwy o safleoedd amwynderau'r cyngor a mwy o gyfleusterau ailgylchu cymunedol; a meithrin partneriaethau gyda sefydliadau ailgylchu yn y gymuned. Bydd y strategaeth yn arwain at lai o waredu mewn safleoedd tirlenwi yn

gyffredinol, llai o waredu yn safle tirlenwi Bryn Pica yng Nghwm Cynon ac, yn bwysicach fyth, cau ac adfer safle Nantygwyddon.

The speed of Nantygwyddon's closure hinges on the availability of scarce resources. The authority's waste strategy estimates, however, that final closure will be achieved within an 18-month target period. Obviously, as I have explained in letters that were e-mailed to the First Minister and the Minister for Environment on 20 February, closure could be speeded up considerably if financial support were forthcoming from the National Assembly. In that respect, I fully support Geraint Davies's call for Ministers to make additional funding available to tackle the main recommendations of the report before us today. I firmly believe that local residents—the victims of this scandal—should not have to carry the entire financial burden that has resulted from, as I have described it before, an unholy mess that has been left by others. It would be morally wrong for the Assembly to allow the significant cost of closure and remediation to fall squarely on the shoulders of some of the poorest council tax payers in Wales.

**Huw Lewis:** The effects of this report are far-reaching and, for every community that faces the daily effects of landfill, it raises hopes and questions. There are short-term effects that must be addressed. For people in my constituency, the effect of the publication of this report was almost instant. The people of Dowlais, in my constituency, were the first to face the not-so-good consequences of this report. The decision of the leadership of Rhondda Cynon Taff council following this report to pass the parcel and dump its waste at Trecatti—which is 250 yards from the high street of the Dowlais community—was deliberately taken as a political decision, because the council was scared of losing votes in its own backyard. It was as simple as that.

**Phil Williams:** Do you accept that there is a strong case for extending the investigation into Nantygwyddon into a similar investigation in Trecatti, and will you support

Bydd pa mor gyflym y caiff safle Nantygwyddon ei gau yn dibynnu ar argaeledd adnoddau prin. Fodd bynnag mae strategaeth wastraff yr awdurdod yn rhagweld y caiff y safle ei gau'n derfynol o fewn cyfnod targed o 18 mis. Yn amlwg, fel yr eglurais mewn llythyrau a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ar 20 Chwefror, gellid cau'r safle yn llawer cynt pe bai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn rhoi cymorth ariannol. O ran hynny, cefnogaf Geraint Davies i'r carn wrth iddo alw ar y Gweinidogion i roi arian ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael â phrif argymhellion yr adroddiad sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Credaf yn daer nad y trigolion lleol—y rhai sydd wedi dioddef yn sgîl y sgandal hwn—a ddylai orfod ysgwyddo'r baich ariannol cyfan, o ganlyniad i'r hyn sydd, fel y disgrifiais o'r blaen, yn draed moch llwyr a adawyd gan eraill. Byddai'n anghywir yn foisol i'r Cynulliad adael i rai o dalwyr y dreth gyngor tlotaf yng Nghymru ysgwyddo'r gost sylweddol o gau ac adfer y safle.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae effeithiau'r adroddiad hwn yn bellgyrhaeddol, ac i bob cymuned sy'n wynebu effeithiau beunyddiol safleoedd tirlenwi, mae'n codi gobeithion a chwestiynau. Ceir effeithiau byrdymor y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hwy. I'r bobl yn fy etholaeth i, effeithwyd arnynt ar unwaith bron ar ôl cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn. Pobl Dowlais, yn fy etholaeth i, oedd y cyntaf i wynebu canlyniadau anffodus yr adroddiad hwn. Yr oedd penderfyniad arweinyddiaeth cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf yn dilyn yr adroddiad hwn i drosglwyddo'r baich a chael gwared ar ei wastraff yn Nhrecati—sy'n 250 llath o stryd fawr Dowlais—wedi'i wneud yn fwriadol fel penderfyniad gwleidyddol, am fod ofn ar y cyngor golli pleidleisiau yn ei filltir sgwâr ei hun. Yr oedd mor syml â hynny.

**Phil Williams:** A dderbyniwech fod dadl gref dros ymestyn ymchwiliad Nantygwyddon i ymchwiliad tebyg yn Nhrecati, ac a wnewch chi ein cefnogi wrth inni alw am ymchwiliad

our call for such an investigation?

**Huw Lewis:** I will come to that, but I will reserve my own judgment on calls for an investigation. Phil is a representative of the party whose advice, had we followed it, would have meant that we would still be engaged in year one or year two of a three or four-year public inquiry, at which we would have thrown millions of pounds of public money, and we would still be dumping household waste at Nantygwyddon. That was the advice of the political giants on my left. I did not take it then and I do not intend to take it now. I congratulate the Minister on standing up against that kind of opportunistic, saloon bar politics, which is all that Plaid Cymru has brought to this debate.

**David Davies:** Does you accept that, had we had a full public inquiry, it might have been possible to access some of the documents that your political colleagues seem to have mislaid in vast quantities?

**Huw Lewis:** I will leave the paper trail to David and turn to the future, because that is what matters to my constituents. I hope that the long-term effects and consequences for my constituents of this report will be much more positive than the short-term problem that we faced because of the leadership of Plaid Cymru.

The Environment Agency, in particular, has a great responsibility to closely consider this report. The operating licences for landfill sites such as Trecatti must be revisited. That must include working towards ending the dumping of domestic waste at landfill sites such as Trecatti. With immediate effect, the monitoring of that site—what is being dumped there and the effects on local residents—must be stepped up. The recent report in *The Lancet* alone should be cause for further investigation.

As has been mentioned, for many communities facing a landfill problem, this is as much about access to information as it is about investigating the effects and workings of the site. When considering this report in greater detail, I hope that the Minister will

o'r fath?

**Huw Lewis:** Deuaf at hynny yn y man, ond byddaf yn gohirio dod i benderfyniad ar unrhyw alwadau am ymchwiliad. Mae Phil yn un o gynrychiolwyr plaid y mae ei chynghor, pe baem wedi ei dderbyn, wedi golygu y byddem yn dal wrthi ym mlwyddyn un neu flwyddyn dau o ymchwiliad tair neu bedair blynedd, y byddem wedi gwario miliynau o bunnau o arian cyhoeddus arno, a byddem wedi bod yn parhau i waredu gwastraff cartref yn Nantygwyddon. Dyna gynghor y cewri gwleidyddol ar fy ochr chwith. Ni dderbyniais hynny ar y pryd ac ni fwriadaf ei dderbyn yn awr. Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog am wrthsefyll y math o wleidyddia amrwd, oportiwnistaidd, sef y cyfan y mae Plaid Cymru wedi ei gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon.

**David Davies:** A dderbyniwch y gellid bod wedi darllen o bosibl rai o'r dogfennau lu y mae eich cyd-aelodau wedi eu colli yn ôl pob golwg, pe baem wedi cynnal ymchwiliad llawn?

**Huw Lewis:** Gadawaf yr helfa bapur i David a throi i'r dyfodol, am mai hynny sydd o bwys i'm hetholwyr i. Gobeithiaf y bydd effeithiau a chanlyniadau hirdymor yr adroddiad hwn i'm hetholwyr yn llawer mwy cadarnhaol na'r broblem fyrdymor yr ydym wedi ei hwynebu oherwydd arweiniad Plaid Cymru.

Mae ar Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, yn enwedig, gyfrifoldeb mawr i ystyried yr adroddiad hwn yn ofalus. Rhaid edrych eto ar y trwyddedau gweithredu ar gyfer safleoedd tirlenwi fel Trecati. Rhaid i hynny gynnwys gweithio i roi'r gorau i waredu gwastraff cartref mewn safleoedd tirlenwi fel Trecati. O hyn ymlaen, rhaid gwneud mwy o waith monitro ar y safle hwnnw—pa ddeunydd y'i gwaredir yno a'r effeithiau ar drigolion lleol. Dylai'r adroddiad diweddar yn *The Lancet* fod yn rheswm ynddo'i hun dros ymchwiliad pellach.

Fel y crybwyllwyd, ar gyfer llawer o gymunedau sy'n wynebu problem o ran tirlenwi, mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r cyfle i gael gwybodaeth cymaint ag y mae'n ymwneud ag ymchwilio i effeithiau'r safle a'r ffordd y mae'n gweithredu. Wrth iddi

give thought to two important changes which she could make to give new confidence to communities such as mine: first, as has been mentioned, the introduction of new rights of access to more information about sites such as Nantygwyddon and Trecatti for the communities; secondly, the introduction of good neighbour agreements between the companies and local residents, with the Environment Agency as arbiter, acting on behalf of the public's interests—as its role should be—giving rights of inspection and consultation.

**Pauline Jarman:** Huw mentioned good neighbour agreements. When Trecatti closed last year, Merthyr Tydfil's waste was tipped at Bryn Pica in the Cynon Valley and, presently, Powys's waste is being tipped at the same site. Why are you so against Rhondda Cynon Taff?

**Huw Lewis:** I sometimes get confused about the potential conflict of interests when such comments are made. Your spokesperson on this issue has admitted openly in the Chamber that Plaid Cymru was wrong on this issue from the beginning—she had the honesty to do that—and it continues to be wrong.

**Helen Mary Jones** *rose—*

**Huw Lewis:** I do not have time to give way this time; I have been generous.

**Helen Mary Jones:** That is not what I said.

**Huw Lewis:** It is what you said; I heard it myself.

I hope that the Minister will note that it can do no harm to seriously consider good neighbour agreements. People in my constituency are not convinced by some of the Environment Agency's assurances; to be convinced, they need to see investment and reforms being made. This is an opportunity for the Minister to ask for much more from the waste operating companies and from the Environment Agency. However, ultimately, the only assurance that my constituents will accept is the end to the dumping of organic

ystyried yr adroddiad hwn yn fanylach, gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried dau newid pwysig y gallai eu gwneud i aillennyn hyder cymunedau megis fy nghymuned i: yn gyntaf, fel y crybwyllwyd, cyflwyno hawliau newydd i'r cymunedau gael mwy o wybodaeth am safleoedd megis Nantygwyddon a Threcati; yn ail, cyflwyno cytundebau cymydog da rhwng y cwmnïau a'r trigolion lleol, gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd fel cymrodeddwr, yn gweithredu ar ran budd y cyhoedd—fel y dylai ei rôl fod—yn rhoi hawliau i arolygu ac ymgynghori.

**Pauline Jarman:** Soniodd Huw am gytundebau cymydog da. Pan gaewyd Trecati y llynedd, gwaredwyd gwastraff Merthyr Tydfil ym Bryn Pica yng Nghwm Cynon ac, ar hyn o bryd, gwaredir gwastraff Powys yn yr un safle. Pam eich bod gymaint yn erbyn Rhondda Cynon Taf?

**Huw Lewis:** Weithiau yr wyf yn drysu ynglŷn â'r gwrthdaro buddiannau posibl pan gaiff sylwadau o'r fath eu gwneud. Mae'ch llefarydd ar y mater hwn wedi cyfaddef yn agored yn y Siambr bod Plaid Cymru wedi bod yn anghywir ar y mater hwn o'r dechrau—yr oedd yn ddigon gonest i wneud hynny—ac mae'n parhau i fod yn anghywir.

**Helen Mary Jones** *a gododd—*

**Huw Lewis:** Nid oes gennyf amser i ildio y tro hwn; bûm yn hael.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Nid dyna'r hyn a ddywedais.

**Huw Lewis:** Dyna a ddywedasoeh; clywais hynny fy hun.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn nodi na all wneud drwg pe bai'n ystyried cytundebau cymydog da o ddifrif. Nid yw pobl yn fy etholaeth i wedi'u hargyhoeddi gan sicrwydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ar rai pethau; er mwyn iddynt fod yn argyhoeddedig mae angen iddynt weld y buddsoddiad a'r diwygiadau yn cael eu gwneud. Dyma gyfle i'r Gweinidog ofyn am lawer mwy gan y cwmnïau gweithredu gwastraff a chan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, yr unig sicrwydd a dderbynia fy

household waste. I call for the long-term closure of the site at Trecatti and other such sites.

4:50 p.m.

This report and the whole issue of landfill sites puts our commitment to greater environmental justice under the spotlight. We must break the connection between deprivation and pollution, because that connection is real. We must demonstrate our commitment to delivering social justice for communities that face the greatest poverty and pollution.

**Christine Chapman:** I pay tribute to the Committee's report and to the able Chair, Richard Edwards. It is a detailed and comprehensive report. I am sure that the people of the Rhondda will welcome the openness and rigour of this investigation and the speed at which it came to its conclusions, which was greater than any public inquiry could hope to achieve.

As a former member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council and as someone who has family in the Rhondda—I was brought up there—I am aware of the strength of feeling on this issue. Many lessons have been learnt from this investigation; not least the fact that it highlights the urgent need for recycling and better waste management. I welcome the fact that the Assembly has committed £40 million to make this happen. This is a huge challenge for all of us in Wales. We must achieve a cultural change. Recycling is not as easy as we think because we must change hearts and minds. However, I am pleased with the Assembly's lead on this matter. The report has been a model of openness and transparency; it will go down as one of the milestones of this new body. The report has helped to gain the local community's confidence.

I understand that the recommendation that there should be an end to household waste disposal at Nantygwyddon will have an impact on the neighbouring Cynon Valley, which is, as you know, part of my constituency. Waste may have to be transferred to Bryn Pica and I have contacted Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough

etholwyr yw diwedd ar waredu gwastraff cartref organig. Galwaf i safle Trecati a safleoedd o'i fath gael ei gau yn yr hirdymor.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn a holl fater safleoedd tirlenwi yn tynnu sylw at ein hymrwymiad i fwy o gyfiawnder amgylcheddol. Rhaid inni dorri'r cysylltiad rhwng amddifadedd a llygredd, gan fod cysylltiad gwirioneddol rhwng y ddau. Rhaid inni ddangos ein hymrwymiad i roi cyfiawnder cymdeithasol i'r cymunedau sy'n wynebu'r tlodi a'r llygredd mwyaf.

**Christine Chapman:** Talaf deyrnged i adroddiad y Pwyllgor a'r Cadeirydd medrus, Richard Edwards. Mae'n adroddiad manwl a chynhwysfawr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pobl y Rhondda yn croesawu natur agored a thrylwyr yr ymchwiliad hwn a pha mor gyflym y daeth i'w gasgliadau, a oedd yn gynt nag y gallai unrhyw ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ddisgwyl bod.

Fel cyn-aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf ac fel rhywun sydd â theulu yn y Rhondda—cefais fy magu yno—yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r teimladau cryf ar y mater hwn. Dysgwyd llawer o wersi o'r ymchwiliad hwn; yn bennaf y ffaith ei fod yn amlygu'r angen dybryd am ailgylchu gwastraff a'i reoli'n well. Croesawaf y ffaith bod y Cynulliad wedi neilltuo £40 miliwn i sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd. Mae hon yn her enfawr i bob un ohonom yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni gyflawni newid diwylliannol. Nid yw ailgylchu mor hawdd ag y credwn am fod yn rhaid inni newid meddylfryd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o nodi arweiniad y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn. Bu'r adroddiad yn esiampl o fod yn agored a thryloyw; caiff ei gofio fel un o gerrig milltir y corff newydd hwn. Mae'r adroddiad wedi helpu i ennyn hyder y gymuned leol.

Deallaf y bydd yr argymhelliad y dylid rhoi'r gorau i waredu gwastraff cartref yn Nantygwyddon yn effeithio ar Gwm Cynon, sy'n cyffinio â hi, sydd, fel y gwyddoch, yn rhan o'm hetholaeth i. Mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid trosglwyddo gwastraff i Fryn Pica a chysylltais â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf ynglŷn â hynny. Cefais

Council about that. I have received a response but I still have great difficulty in getting information. Possibly, Pauline Jarman, as the council's leader, could bear that in mind. The issues raised in this investigation will strike a chord with people who live in areas around landfill sites. I ask for the spirit of openness and engagement with communities, which Sue Essex mentioned and which has been much talked about during this investigation, to filter down to Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. I urge it, as a result of this investigation, to be just as open with the people of the Cynon Valley about any new developments at Bryn Pica. The Nantygwyddon report has set a high standard: Rhondda Cynon Taff must now follow suit.

**Brian Gibbons:** This report highlights that the solution to one person's problem often creates a problem for someone else, whether that be at Trecatti, which Huw Lewis has just mentioned, or the proposals for the Crymlyn Burrows incineration and waste recycling plant situation in my constituency. Until society manages to find a realistic, sustainable solution to the problem of waste management, every community across Wales must face these difficult problems. We must not make judgments based on prejudice or instinct, but on the best scientific evidence available, and the degree of certainty on which we can rely on that. I am often concerned about how people, for narrow and opportunistic political reasons, are content to sow alarm and distress among communities throughout Wales when scientific evidence does not exist to support their alarmist position. The report also represents a watershed in so far as several of its recommendations—

**Gareth Jones:** Sylwaf eich bod yn amheus, Brian, a chyfeiriwch at y dystiolaeth wyddonol. O ystyried y ffeithiau i gyd, a fydddech yn adeiladu ysgol ar safle heintiedig? Beth yw eich safiad ar hynny?

**Brian Gibbons:** Somebody made reference to *The Lancet* report. I do not know about a report in *The Lancet*, but there was certainly a report in the *British Medical Journal* three or four months ago which pointed out that around 80 per cent of the United Kingdom's

ateb ond parhaf i gael anhawster mawr cael gwybodaeth. Efallai y gallai Pauline Jarman, fel arweiniad y cyngor, gofio hynny. Bydd y materion a godwyd yn yr ymchwiliad hwn yn taro tant gyda phobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd o gwmpas safleoedd tirlenwi. Gofynnaf i'r ysbryd o fod yn agored a chysylltu â chymunedau, a grybwyllwyd gan Sue Essex ac y bu cryn sôn amdano yn ystod yr ymchwiliad hwn, ymdreiddio i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Apeliaf ar y cyngor, o ganlyniad i'r ymchwiliad hwn, i fod yr un mor agored gyda phobl Cwm Cynon ynglŷn ag unrhyw ddatblygiadau newydd ym Mhryn Pica. Mae adroddiad Nantygwyddon wedi gosod safon uchel: rhaid i Rhondda Cynon Taf ddilyn yr esiampl honno yn awr.

**Brian Gibbons:** Noda'r adroddiad hwn fod yr ateb i broblem un person yn aml yn creu problem i rywun arall, boed hynny yn Nhrecati, y mae Huw Lewis newydd gyfeirio ato, neu yn y cynigion i leoli llosgydd a gwaith ailgylchu gwastraff yn Nhywyn Crymlyn yn fy etholaeth i. Hyd nes y bydd cymdeithas yn llwyddo i ganfod ateb realistig, cynaliadwy i'r broblem o reoli gwastraff, rhaid i bob cymuned ledled Cymru wynebu'r problemau anodd hyn. Rhaid inni beidio â barnu ar sail rhagfarn neu reddf, ond ar y dystiolaeth wyddonol orau sydd ar gael, a faint o sicrwydd y gallwn ei roi ar hynny. Pryderaf yn aml ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae pobl, am resymau cul a gwleidyddol oportiwnistaidd, yn barod i ddychryn a chodi gofidiau ymhlith cymunedau ledled Cymru pan na fo tystiolaeth wyddonol ar gael sy'n cefnogi eu safbwynt brawychol. Mae'r adroddiad hwn hefyd yn drobwyt yn y ffaith fod sawl un o'i argymhellion—

**Gareth Jones:** I notice that you are unconvinced, Brian, and you refer to the scientific evidence. Considering all the facts, would you build a school on a contaminated site? What is your position on that?

**Brian Gibbons:** Cyfeiriodd rhywun at adroddiad yn *The Lancet*. Ni wn am adroddiad yn *The Lancet*, ond yn sicr yr oedd adroddiad yn y *British Medical Journal* dri neu bedwar mis yn ôl a nododd fod tua 80 y cant o boblogaeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn byw



population lives within two kilometres of a landfill site. It is difficult to see what major conclusions were drawn from that study. In particular, it made reference to the fact that, in the Nantygwyddon area, many of the congenital abnormalities reported actually preceded the opening—[*Interruption*]

The *British Medical Journal* report pointed out that that preceded the opening of the landfill site. In some other instances, that same report pointed out that—[*Interruption.*]

**David Melding:** Point of order.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I hope that your point of order is a good one.

**David Melding:** I can hear abuse being shouted from the public gallery at Dr Gibbons. That is most regrettable.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I did not hear anything, but the ushers seem to have the matter under control.

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the other points in this study that serves to complicate this factor is that, in a number of instances, conditions such as congenital abnormalities actually decreased in the areas surrounding landfill sites, even after they were opened. It is a confused picture and it is difficult to draw hard and fast conclusions from the evidence as presented to us at the moment. This is the problem with questions such as that asked by Gareth. There is no fast, simple solution to this. We must examine the best of the scientific evidence before us in coming to any particular conclusion.

Much time has gone so I will abbreviate one of the other points that I wanted to make. One of the most important recommendations—

**Geraint Davies** *rose*—

**Brian Gibbons:** Sorry, Geraint, I must finish. One of the most important recommendations in this report is on allowing the public to set the agenda of any particular inquiry being undertaken. We are committed

o fewn dau gilomedr i safle tirlenwi. Mae'n anodd gweld y prif gasgliadau y daethpwyd iddynt o'r astudiaeth honno. Yn arbennig, cyfeiriodd at y ffaith fod llawer o'r annormaleddau cynhwynol yn ardal Nantygwyddon, wedi eu cofnodi cyn agor y safle mewn gwirionedd—[*Torri ar draws*]

Nododd adroddiad y *British Medical Journal* fod hynny wedi digwydd cyn agor y safle tirlenwi. Mewn rhai achosion eraill, nododd yr un adroddiad hwnnw fod—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**David Melding:** Pwynt o drefn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gobeithiaf fod eich pwynt o drefn yn un da.

**David Melding:** Gallaf glywed pobl yn gweiddi ar Dr Gibbons o'r oriel gyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n anffodus iawn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni chlywais ddim byd, ond ymddengys fod y tywyswyr yn rheoli'r sefyllfa.

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o'r pwyntiau eraill yn yr astudiaeth hon sy'n cymhlethu'r ffactor hwn yw'r ffaith bod cyflyrau megis annormaleddau cynhwynol, mewn sawl achos, wedi gostwng mewn gwirionedd yn yr ardaloedd o amgylch safleoedd tirlenwi, hyd yn oed ar ôl iddynt agor. Mae'n ddarlun cymysg ac mae'n anodd dod i gasgliadau pendant o'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynir inni ar hyn o bryd. Dyna'r broblem gyda chwestiynau fel y cwestiwn a ofynnodd Gareth. Nid oes ateb rhwydd, syml i hyn. Rhaid inni archwilio'r dystiolaeth wyddonol orau sydd ger ein bron wrth ddod i unrhyw gasgliad penodol.

Mae llawer o amser wedi mynd heibio felly crynhoaf un o'r pwyntiau eraill yr oeddwn am eu gwneud. Un o'r argymhellion pwysicaf—

**Geraint Davies** *a gododd*—

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Geraint, rhaid imi orffen. Un o'r argymhellion pwysicaf yn yr adroddiad hwn yw'r argymhelliad ynglŷn â rhoi cyfle i'r cyhoedd osod yr agenda mewn unrhyw

to partnership government in the National Assembly and in Wales. That is important, and is the right way to proceed. However, partnership government often results in all the major agencies and organisations being partner to decisions taken before public concern is raised. Often, those organisations become part of the collective responsibility for these decisions. If the public or the communities that have concerns about these matters are unable to set the terms of reference for these investigations, they will not have confidence in the investigations undertaken on their behalf. This is an excellent, landmark report that will have major and positive implications for the way in which public governance is undertaken in Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor, ac un a fu'n gwranddo ar y dystiolaeth, canmolaf y Pwyllgor i gyd, ac yn enwedig Richard Edwards fel Cadeirydd a Sue Essex fel Gweinidog, am y modd yr ymdriniwyd â'r dystiolaeth a ddaeth i law. Yr oedd gennym, fel plaid, ein hamheuron ynglŷn â chynnal ymchwiliad i'r mater hwn oherwydd ein bod yn ymwybodol o'r cyfyngiadau. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi derbyn adroddiad cynhwysfawr, gyda nifer o argymhellion o bwys, nid yn unig i Nantygwyddon, ond i Gymru gyfan. Y peth pwysig yw ein bod, yn ystod y cyfnod gwranddo tystiolaeth, wedi llwyddo fel Pwyllgor i weithredu'n gynhwysol ac osgoi sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol—er bod temtasiwn, mae'n siŵr gennyf, i fwy nag un blaid wneud felly. Bu'n rhaid i'r Pwyllgor ganolbwyntio ar y dystiolaeth a sicrhau bod yr arddodiad hwn mor gynhwysafwr â phosibl a bod modd i'r Cynulliad symud ymlaen ag argymhellion yr adroddiad. Mawr obeithiaf mai dyna fydd yn digwydd.

5:00 p.m.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cofnodi'r ffaith i'r ymchwilydd, David Purchon, nodi'r cydweithrediad llawn a gafodd gan weinyddiaeth bresennol Rhondda Cynon Taf a'i fod wedi diolch iddi am ei chydweithrediad a'r gwaith pwysig a wnaeth yn catalogio'r holl dystiolaeth ar ei gyfer. Mae'n bwysig cofnodi'n glir, gan y gwnaed

ymchwiliad penodol a gynhelir. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i lywodraeth bartneriaeth yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n bwysig, a dyna'r ffordd iawn i weithredu. Fodd bynnag, mae llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn aml yn golygu bod pob un o'r prif asiantaethau a sefydliadau yn rhan o benderfyniadau a wneir cyn i'r cyhoedd gael mynegi pryderon. Yn aml, daw'r sefydliadau hynny yn rhan o'r cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd dros y penderfyniadau hyn. Os na all y cyhoedd neu'r cymunedau sydd â phryderon ynglŷn â'r materion hyn osod y cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr ymchwiliadau hyn, ni fyddant yn ymddiried yn yr ymchwiliadau a gynhelir ar eu rhan. Mae hwn yn adroddiad rhagorol, arloesol a fydd â goblygiadau pwysig a chadarnhaol i'r ffordd y mae rheolaeth gyhoeddus yn gweithredu yng Nghymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As a member of the Committee, and one who heard the evidence, I praise the Committee as a whole, particularly Richard Edwards as Chair and Sue Essex as Minister, for the manner in which the evidence that came before us was handled. We, as a party, had misgivings about conducting an investigation into this matter because we were aware of its limitations. However, we have received a comprehensive report, with a number of important recommendations, not just for Nantygwyddon, but for the whole of Wales. It is important that, during the evidence gathering period, we succeeded as a Committee in acting inclusively and avoided political point scoring—although there was a temptation, I am certain, for more than one party to attempt to do so. The Committee had to concentrate on the evidence and ensure that the report was as comprehensive as possible and that the Assembly could take the report's recommendations forward. I very much hope that that will happen.

It is important that we record the fact that the investigator, David Purchon, noted the full co-operation of the present administration in Rhondda Cynon Taff and that he has thanked it for its co-operation and important work in cataloguing all the evidence for him. It is also important to note clearly, since references have been made to this, that this problem was

cyfeiriadau at hyn, mai etifeddu'r broblem hon a wnaeth gweinyddiaeth bresennol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae'r cyngor presennol wedi llunio ymateb i anghenion Nantygwyddon, yn ogystal â chynllun arloesol er mwyn ailgylchu gwastraff. Byddai wedi bod yn well i rai pobl sydd wedi manteisio ar y cyfle i sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol ganolbwyntio ar y dystiolaeth a chydabod y gwaith pwysig y mae gweinyddiaeth bresennol Rhondda Cynon Taf yn ei wneud wrth ymateb i broblem nad oedd o'i gwneuthuriad ac a etifeddyd ganddi.

**Richard Edwards:** I thank all the contributors to this debate and, in particular, the Minister for her commitment to following the recommendations through, which is crucial. I thank Helen Mary Jones for her constructive approach to the work of the investigation and for her kind words. I am sure that it is the first and last time that I will hear you say that you were glad to be proved wrong on anything, Helen Mary. I take this opportunity, in view of the tenor of some of today's debate, to praise the constructive approach of all party groups on the Committee. That may not necessarily have been reflected in the debate today. Party politics has generally been set aside, with a strong commitment by all members to ensuring the success of the process. That even includes David Davies; I dare not say anything nasty about David, or I will receive an irate e-mail from his mother accusing me of being nasty to her boy.

I am not going to respond to party political points. I will say a few words about the process. It has been an innovative process, which has been guided by the principles of openness and transparency. All the evidence submitted has been available for public scrutiny and all our deliberations have taken place in public, including four Committee meetings in Rhondda. It has been a thorough investigation, which despite its scope, has reported back promptly. Despite initial scepticism, perhaps even hostility, its thoroughness and independence has been acknowledged by the local community. I am grateful for that. The focus of the investigation has been on learning lessons for the future, not only in the vicinity of the

inherited by the present administration in Rhondda Cynon Taff. The current council has not only responded to the needs of Nantygwyddon, but has also established an innovative scheme to recycle waste. Some of those who have taken the opportunity to score political points would have been better served by concentrating on the evidence and acknowledging the important work that the present administration in Rhondda Cynon Taff is doing in responding to this problem, which was not of its making and which it inherited.

**Richard Edwards:** Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a gyfrannodd i'r ddadl hon ac, yn arbennig, y Gweinidog am ei hymrwymiad i weithredu ar yr argymhellion, sy'n hollbwysig. Hoffwn ddiolch i Helen Mary Jones am ei hymagwedd adeiladol tuag at waith yr ymchwiliad a'i geiriau caredig. Yr wyf yn siŵr mai hwn fydd y tro cyntaf a'r tro olaf imi eich clywed yn dweud bod yn dda gennych gael eich profi'n anghywir ar unrhyw beth, Helen Mary. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn, o gofio naws rhannau o'r ddadl heddiw, i ganmol ymagwedd adeiladol pob un o grwpiau'r pleidiau ar y Pwyllgor. Efallai nad adlewyrchwyd hynny yn y ddadl heddiw. Ar y cyfan, rhoddwyd gwleidyddiaeth pleidiol o'r neilltu, gydag ymrwymiad cryf gan bob aelod i sicrhau llwyddiant y broses. Mae hynny hyd yn oed yn cynnwys David Davies; ni fentraf ddweud unrhyw beth cas am David, neu caf neges e-bost gan ei fam yn fy nghyhuddo o fod yn gas wrth ei mab.

Ni fwriadaf ymateb i'r pwyntiau pleidiol. Dywedaf ychydig o eiriau am y broses. Bu'n broses arloesol, yn dilyn yr egwyddorion o fod yn agored a thryloyw. Bu'r holl dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd ar gael i'r cyhoedd graffu arni a chynhaliwyd ein holl drafodaethau yn gyhoeddus, gan gynnwys pedwar cyfarfod Pwyllgor yn y Rhondda. Bu'n ymchwiliad trylwyr, sydd, er gwaethaf ei gwmpas, wedi cyflwyno adroddiad yn ddi-oed. Er gwaethaf y drwgdybio, a'r elyniaeth hyd yn oed ar y dechrau, cydnabu'r gymuned leol ei fod yn ymchwiliad trylwyr ac annibynnol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Bu pwyslais yr ymchwiliad ar ddysgu gwersi ar gyfer y dyfodol, nid yn unig yn ardal safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon, ond ar gyfer polisiau

Nantgwyddon landfill site, but for future waste management policy in general in Wales. We addressed issues of local concern that are of significance to the whole of Wales: waste management, its environmental impact and related concerns about public health. The big issue that emerges from the whole exercise and transcends the subject of waste management is the failure of communication between public bodies and agencies and the ordinary local people whom we are all meant to represent. There has been a failure of communication—

**Phil Williams:** In credit to the success of this report, what plans does the Committee have to recommend that as an immediate next step the lessons be applied to Trecatti, which has many similar problems?

**Richard Edwards:** The Committee has no immediate plans, Phil. I was talking about the lack of communication between public agencies and the ordinary people whom they represent. The extent of that failure was reflected in the perception, widely shared by many representatives of the relevant public bodies involved in this investigation, and privately aired to me, that the investigator himself was biased against them and biased in favour of the local community. Should not everyone working for public bodies and agencies be biased in favour of the people whom they represent? They should work for and with them; that is the crucial lesson. I humbly suggest that they could learn a great deal from the public communication skills of the independent investigator.

The entire investigation has been pioneering and conducted openly, transparently and inclusively. I humbly suggest that it has shown the Assembly working at its best. That needs flagging up in our media, which misses no opportunity to hammer our fledgling democracy. Now that the investigation is complete, I plan to review the process to identify lessons for any future investigation. I will be inviting the views of all those who have taken part in the investigation—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Will you give way to Gareth Jones?

rheoli gwastraff yn y dyfodol yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru. Ymdriniwyd â phryderon lleol gennym sydd o bwys i Gymru gyfan: rheoli gwastraff, ei effaith ar yr amgylchedd a phryderon cysylltiedig ynglŷn ag iechyd y cyhoedd. Y mater pwysig a ddaw i'r amlwg o'r ymarfer cyfan ac sy'n codi uwchlaw mater rheoli gwastraff yw'r diffyg cyfathrebu rhwng cyrff ac asiantaethau cyhoeddus a'r bobl leol gyffredin yr ydym oll i fod i'w cynrychioli. Bu diffyg cyfathrebu—

**Phil Williams:** Yn glod i lwyddiant yr adroddiad hwn, a oes unrhyw fwriad gan y Pwyllgor argymhell y dylid rhoi'r gwersi ar waith yn Nhrecati, sydd â llawer o broblemau tebyg, fel y cam nesaf?

**Richard Edwards:** Nid yw'n fwriad gan y Pwyllgor ar hyn o bryd, Phil. Sôn yr oeddwn am y diffyg cyfathrebu rhwng yr asiantaethau cyhoeddus a'r bobl gyffredin y maent yn eu cynrychioli. Adlewyrchwyd maint y methiant hwnnw yn y canfyddiad a oedd yn gyffredinol ymhlith llawer o gynrychiolwyr y cyrff cyhoeddus perthnasol a oedd yn rhan o'r ymchwiliad hwn, ac a fynegwyd ganddynt imi yn breifat, fod yr ymchwilydd ei hun â rhagfarn yn eu herbyn hwy ac o blaid y gymuned leol. Oni ddylai pawb sy'n gweithio i gyrff ac asiantaethau cyhoeddus fod o blaid y bobl y maent yn eu cynrychioli? Dylent weithio trostynt hwy a chyda hwy; dyna'r wers hollbwysig. Awgrymaf yn barchus y gallent ddysgu cryn dipyn o sgiliau cyfathrebu cyhoeddus yr ymchwilydd annibynnol.

Bu'r ymchwiliad cyfan yn arloesol. Fe'i cynhaliwyd mewn modd agored, tryloyw a chynhwysol. Awgrymaf yn barchus iddo ddangos y Cynulliad yn gweithio ar ei orau. Mae angen tynnu sylw'r cyfryngau at hynny, nad ydynt byth yn colli cyfle i ladd ar ein hegin-ddemocratiaeth. Gan fod yr ymchwiliad bellach ar ben, bwriadaf adolygu'r broses i nodi gwersi ar gyfer ymchwiliadau yn y dyfodol. Byddaf yn gwahodd y rhai a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad i roi eu barn—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A wnewch chi ildio i Gareth Jones?

**Richard Edwards:** No. Sorry, Gareth, I am finishing.

There will be a review of the investigation to learn lessons for possible future investigations. The precedent has now been set. I commend our recommendations to the Assembly on behalf of the Committee. We call on the Welsh Assembly Government to work with community groups and public authorities to implement our recommendations and apply the lessons of Nantygwyddon to future waste policy in Wales.

**Richard Edwards:** Na wnaif. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Gareth, yr wyf yn dirwyn i ben.

Bydd adolygiad o'r ymchwiliad er mwyn dysgu gwersi ar gyfer ymchwiliadau posibl yn y dyfodol. Gosodwyd y gynsail erbyn hyn. Cymeradwyaf ein hargymhellion i'r Cynulliad ar ran y Pwyllgor. Galwn ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithio gyda grwpiau cymunedol a'r asiantaethau cyhoeddus i weithredu ein hargymhellion ac i roi gwersi Nantygwyddon ar waith ar gyfer polisïau gwastraff yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru.

*Cynnig: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan

Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**Jocelyn Davies:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.10, postpones the minority party debate on the failure of the New Labour Governments in relation to the NHS.*

Given that time is short and bearing in mind comments made by Members across the Chamber in our recent debate on the Assembly Review of Procedure Committee's report on their reluctance to extend Plenary because of family commitments—unless we are dealing with urgent business—I propose this procedural motion to postpone the minority party debate scheduled for today, and ask the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business to reschedule it for next week.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 6.10 the Assembly must vote on this motion immediately. In order for it to be carried, no more than 10 Members may vote against it.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif. 6.10, yn gohirio'r ddadl plaid leiafrifol ar fethiant Llywodraethau Llafur Newydd mewn perthynas â'r GIG.*

O gofio bod amser yn brin ac o gofio sylwadau a wnaed gan yr Aelodau ar draws y Siambr yn ein dadl ddiweddar ar adroddiad Pwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad am eu hamharodrwydd i ymestyn y Cyfarfod Llawn oherwydd ymrwymadau teuluol—oni bai ein bod yn ymdrin â busnes brys—cynigiau y cynnig trefniadol hwn i ohirio'r ddadl plaid leiafrifol a drefnwyd ar gyfer heddiw, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad i'w haildrefnu ar gyfer yr wythnos nesaf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10 rhaid i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar y cynnig hwn ar unwaith. Er mwyn ei dderbyn, rhaid bod dim mwy na 10 o Aelodau yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog

Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.07 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.07 p.m.*