



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 29 Ionawr 2002**

**Tuesday 29 January 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |   |
|----|---|
| 3  | Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru<br><i>Questions to the First Minister</i>  |
| 22 | Datganiad ar Wasanaethau Canser yng Nghymru<br><i>Statement on Cancer Services in Wales</i>   |
| 30 | Datganiad Busnes<br><i>Business Statement</i>   |
| 32 | Pwyntiau o Drefn<br><i>Points of Order</i>  |
| 42 | Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales): Cymunedau Diogel<br><i>Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales): Safe Communities</i>         |
| 73 | Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru<br><i>Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): Social Services in Wales</i> |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambra. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister**

### **Cyfleoedd ar gyfer Pobl Ifanc Opportunities for Young People**

**Q1 Janet Davies:** In his role as policy developer and co-ordinator of cross-cutting issues, what is the First Minister doing to ensure that young people in Wales are being given the best opportunities to realise their potential in their own communities? (OAQ15255)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** The creation of the administration's unified support fund, Cymorth, was announced yesterday. It will tie together five of our children's programmes: Sure Start, the children and youth partnership fund, the national childcare strategy, the youth access initiative and the play grant. The new fund will be unique in the UK in its scope and breadth. It represents the Government's determination to simplify funding streams and to make processes easier for users to understand and to access. The new system will be streamlined and more effective in getting money to work for children and young people, whereas previous arrangements were complex and overlapped each other. The system will do this in a cross-cutting way and will enhance what the Assembly Government can do to help children and young people to realise their potential in their own communities.

**Janet Davies:** That was helpful, First Minister. What have you failed to do in Merthyr Tydfil? In the Chamber last week, the Assembly Member for Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney said that only 10 per cent of the area's young people go on to higher education.

**The First Minister:** In a league table of British universities and university-level institutions, Welsh universities and university-level institutions came out at the top of the heap, on a relative basis, in terms of encouraging and giving access to people

**C1 Janet Davies:** Yn rhinwedd ei gyfrifoldebau am ddatblygu polisi a chydlynus materion trawsbynciol, beth y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn cael y cyfleoedd gorau i gyflawni eu potensial yn eu cymunedau eu hunain? (OAQ15255)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Ddoe cyhoeddwyd ein bod yn creu Cymorth, sef cronfa gynnal unedig y weinyddiaeth. Bydd yn cyfuno pump o'n rhagleni plant: Cychwyn Cadarn, y gronfa bartneriaeth plant a ieuencid, y strategaeth gofal plant genedlaethol, y fenter mynediad i ieuencid a'r grant chwarae. Bydd y gronfa newydd yn unigryw yn y DU o ran ei chwmpas a'i lled. Cynrychiola benderfyniad y Llywodraeth i symleiddio ffrydiau cylrido ac i wneud y prosesau yn haws i ddefnyddwyr eu deall a'u cyrchu. Bydd y system newydd yn fwy syml ac yn fwy effeithiol wrth gael arian i weithio ar ran plant a phobl ifanc, lle yr oedd y trefniadau blaenorol yn gymhleth ac yn gorgyffwrdd â'i gilydd. Bydd y system yn gwneud hyn mewn modd trawsbynciol ac yn gwella'r hyn y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei wneud i helpu plant a phobl ifanc i wireddu eu potensial yn eu cymunedau.

**Janet Davies:** Yr oedd hynny o gymorth, Brif Weinidog. Beth ydych chi wedi methu â'i wneud ym Merthyr Tudful? Yn y Siambwr yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Ferthyr Tudful a Rhymni dim ond 10 y cant o bobl ifanc yr ardal sy'n mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mewn tabl cynghrair o brifysgolion a sefydliadau safon prifysgol Prydain, gosodwyd prifysgolion a sefydliadau safon prifysgol Cymru, o'u cymharu â'r lleill, ar frig y rhestr o ran annog a rhoi mynediad i bobl o ddosbarthiadau

from social classes four and five, namely the children of semi-skilled and unskilled manual workers, and children from communities where there is no higher education tradition. The record in Wales is much better than that in England, although there is a long way to go to even out access to higher education.

**Val Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a member of the City and County of Swansea Council.

I was delighted with your announcement yesterday of the investment for Swansea's Port Tawe Innovation Village. This major dockside regeneration scheme has links between business, the local authority and education institutions. As a result, what opportunities do you see arising locally which can then be spread to other communities across Wales?

**The First Minister:** The innovation village is a classic example of what we are trying to do in the field of economic development to provide high level jobs not previously available in Wales. People who had been through university, or another type of technical education, previously had to go out of Wales along the M4, A55 or M6 to larger centres where technical employment was available. I estimate that, before the Port Tawe Innovation Village was established, building on the huge success of the Technium 1 development in Swansea, many people had to go out of Wales to find jobs equivalent to their qualification. They will now find jobs in Swansea and elsewhere where the Technium 1 concept can be rolled out.

cymdeithasol pedwar a phump, sef plant gweithwyr llaw lled fedrus a'r rhai di-fedr, a phlant o gymunedau lle nad oes traddodiad o fynd ymlaen i addysg uwch. Mae'r record yng Nghymru yn llawer gwell na'r un yn Lloegr, er bod ffordd bell i fynd o hyd i wneud mynediad i addysg uwch yn fwy cyfartal.

**Val Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe.

Pleser oedd clywed eich cyhoeddiad ddoe am y buddsoddiad ym Mhentref Menter Porthladd Tawe yn Abertawe. Mae gan y cynllun adfywio pwysig hwn yn ardal y dociau gysylltiadau â busnes, yr awdurdod lleol a sefydliadau addysgol. O ganlyniad, pa gyfleoedd a welwch yn codi'n lleol y gellir eu hymestyn wedyn i gymunedau eraill ar draws Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r pentref menter yn enghraifft glasurol o'r hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud ym maes datblygu economaidd i ddarparu swyddi lefel uchel nad oedd ar gael cyn hyn yng Nghymru. Yn y gorffennol bu'n rhaid i bobl a fu mewn prifysgol, neu fath arall o addysg dechnegol, fynd allan o Gymru ar hyd yr M4, A55 neu'r M6 i ganolfannau mwy lle'r oedd cyflogaeth ar gael. Amcangyfrifaf, cyn sefydlu Pentref Menter Porthladd Tawe, gan adeiladu ar lwyddiant enfawr datblygiad Technium 1 yn Abertawe, y bu'n rhaid i lawer o bobl fynd allan o Gymru i chwilio am swyddi oedd yn cyfateb â'u cymhwyster. Byddant yn awr yn gallu cael swyddi yn Abertawe ac mewn mannau eraill lle gellir cyflwyno cysyniad Technium 1.

### Papur Gwyn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar Lywodraethu European Union's White Paper on Governance

**C2 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar ei gynlluniau i ymateb i Bapur Gwyn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar lywodraethu? (OAQ15250)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd Ieuan yn cofio fy mod wedi arwain dadl yn y Cynulliad ar lywodraethu yng nghyswllt Ewrop ar 17 Ionawr, gan iddo gymryd rhan yn y ddadl. Dyna'r tro cyntaf i'r Cynulliad drafod Papur

**Q2 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Will the First Minister make a statement on his plans to respond to the European Union's White Paper on governance? (OAQ15250)

**The First Minister:** Ieuan will recall that I led an Assembly debate on governance in the European context on 17 January, because he took part in the debate. That was the first Assembly debate on a European White Paper

Gwyn o Ewrop ac mae'n dangos pa mor bwysig yr wyf yn ystyried rôl lawn i'r Cynulliad mewn materion Ewropeaidd. Byddaf yn ymateb i'r Papur Gwyn ar ran y Llywodraeth cyn diwedd mis Mawrth, gan mai diwrnod olaf y mis hwnnw yw'r diwrnod olaf ar gyfer cymryd rhan yn y broses ymgynghori. Bydd hynny yn dilyn y fforwm ar faterion Ewropeaidd, fydd yn trafod thema llywodraethu, yn Llandudno ar 15 Chwefror.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fel y gwyddoch, yr oeddem yn croesawu'r ddadl ar y Papur Gwyn. Gwyddoch hefyd fod y Papur Gwyn yn cynnwys cynlluniau peilot, i'w hystyried yn nes ymlaen, er mwyn sefydlu cytundebau rhwng y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, Whitehall, a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar faterion datganoledig. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych ar hyn o bryd i gynnwys y Cynulliad yn y cynlluniau peilot hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes gennyllyniau hyd yn hyn gan nad oes gennym ddigon o fanylion gan Ewrop ynglŷn â'r hyn sydd ganddo mewn golwg o ran prosiectau tair ochr. O ganlyniad, nid ydym yn gwybod pa fath o gynlluniau peilot y mae'n gobeithio eu gweld a fyddai'n fuddiol i'r tair ochr, sef Prydain Fawr, Cymru a'r Cynulliad ac Ewrop. Pan fydd gennym fwy o fanylion fe ddof yn ôl gydag ateb mwy penodol.

2:10 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylem, er mwyn hybu busnesau bach, ymateb i'r Papur Gwyn Ewrop ar lywodraethu, gan ofyn am lleihau'r baich biwrocrataidd ar fusnesau bach?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae pawb yn derbyn bod eisiau lleihau'r baich llenwi ffurflenni. Os oes ffordd arall o gael y wybodaeth sydd ei hangen ar y Llywodraeth, ar lywodraeth leol ac ar lywodraeth ar y lefel Ewropeaidd, dylem ailystyried a oes angen y ffurflenni hynny. Yr wyf o blaid ceisio lleihau'r baich llenwi ffurflenni ar fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint.

**Jonathan Morgan:** This issue of European governance, in particular the White Paper, is all about how we influence the European

and it illustrates the importance that I attach to the Assembly playing a full role on European issues. I will respond to the White Paper on the Government's behalf before the end of March, as the last day of that month is the final day for taking part in the consultation process. That will follow the forum on European issues, which will discuss the theme of governance, in Llandudno on 15 February.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** As you know, we welcomed the debate on the White Paper. You will also know that pilot schemes, to be considered at a later date, are included in the White Paper, which would establish agreements between the European Commission, Whitehall and the National Assembly on devolved issues. What specific plans do you have at the moment to include the Assembly in those pilot schemes?

**The First Minister:** I have no plans thus far as we do not have enough details from Europe on what exactly it has in mind with regards to tripartite projects. As a result, we do not know what type of pilot schemes it hopes to see that would be of benefit to all three sides, namely Great Britain, Wales and the Assembly and Europe. When we have more details I will give a more specific answer.

**Eleanor Burnham:** In order to promote small businesses, do you agree that our response to the European White Paper on governance should include a request for a reduction in the bureaucratic burden on these businesses?

**The First Minister:** Everybody accepts that the burden of filling in forms needs to be reduced. If there is another way of obtaining the information needed by Government, local government and government at the European level, we should reconsider whether those forms are needed. I am in favour of trying to reduce the burden of filling in forms for small and medium-sized businesses.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae'r mater o lywodraethu Ewropeaidd, yn arbennig y Papur Gwyn, yn ymwneud yn llwyr â'r

level of decision-making and how we can maximise our input in Brussels. Is it not high time that the Assembly put an official from Wales on secondment to work in Brussels specifically on regional policy? There is an official there working on agricultural matters. The changes in regional policy and the proposed recommendations and debate over the next five or six years will have a huge impact on Wales. We should be there batting for Wales and pushing the Welsh angle.

**The First Minister:** You made an interesting point, Jonathan. It may be slightly premature, in that we know where we are until the end of 2006, but certainly the time will come over the next 18 months or so when we will need to return to this issue. I am grateful for your suggestion.

ffordd yr ydym yn dylanwadu ar wneud penderfyniadau ar y lefel Ewropeaidd a sut y gallwn ni gyfrannu i'r eithaf ym Mrwsel. Onid yw hi'n hen bryd i'r Cynulliad secondeio swyddog o Gymru i Frwsel i weithio ar bolisi rhanbarthol yn benodol? Mae swyddog yn gweithio yno ar faterion amaethyddol. Caiff y newidiadau mewn polisi rhanbarthol a'r argymhellion a'r ddadl arfaethedig dros y pum neu'r chwe blynedd nesaf effaith fawr iawn ar Gymru. Dylem fod yno'n gwthio buddiannau Cymru a'r ongl Gymreig.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaethoch bwynt didorol, Jonathan. Efallai ei bod braidd yn rhy gynnar, gan y gwyddom ble yr ydym arni tan ddiwedd 2006, ond yn sier daw'r amser dros tua'r 18 mis nesaf pan fydd angen i ni ddychwelyd at y mater hwn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich awgrym.

#### Aelodaeth o'r UE EU Membership

**Q3 Christine Gwyther:** Will the First Minister please make a statement on the benefits to Wales of European Union membership? (OAQ15267)

**The First Minister:** I will choose one statistic that demonstrates the impact. Until the formation of the original common market of six members in 1958, Great Britain used to get 40 per cent of all inward investment into Europe. Then, for the 15 years that we were outside the old common market, that share dropped to 15 per cent. When Britain joined the European community in 1973, the percentage shot back up to 40 per cent. You can see the damage caused to Britain during the first 15 years of the existence of the old common market by being on the outside.

**Christine Gwyther:** One of our big success stories is Objective 1. We still hear too much and too often about some local authorities' negative attitudes with regard to Objective 1. However, the structural funds are, as you often say, about people. Will you join me in congratulating the people of Pembrokeshire who have managed to hack their way through Pembrokeshire County Council's cynicism and pessimism to triumph under Objective 1, becoming the third best county in Wales?

**C3 Christine Gwyther:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y manteision i Gymru o fod yn aelod o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? (OAQ15267)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dewisaf un ystadegyn sy'n amlyu'r effaith. Hyd yr amser pan ffurfiwyd y farchnad gyffredin wreiddiol o chwe aelod yn 1958, arferai Prydain Fawr gael 40 y cant o'r holl fewnuddsoddi i Ewrop. Yna, am y 15 mlynedd yr oeddem y tu allan i'r hen farchnad gyffredin, disgynnodd y gyfran honno i 15 y cant. Pan ymunodd Prydain â'r gymuned Ewropeaidd yn 1973, llamodd y ganran yn ôl i 40 y cant. Gallwch weld y niwed a wnaed i Brydain yn ystod y 15 mlynedd cyntaf o fodolaeth yr hen farchnad gyffredin wrth fod oddi allan iddi.

**Christine Gwyther:** Un o'n llwyddiannau mawr yw Amcan 1. Clywn lawer gormod o hyd, ac yn rhy aml, am agweddau negyddol rhai awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn ag Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cronfeydd strwythurol, fel y dywedwch yn aml, yn ymwneud â phobl. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch pobl Sir Benfro sydd wedi llwyddo i frwydro'u ffordd drwy sinigiaeth a phesimistiaeth Cyngor Sir Penfro i fod yn fuddugoliaethus o dan Amcan 1, gan ddod yn drydedd sir orau Cymru?

**The First Minister:** There are interesting connotations to asking me to assent to that last proposition. I may not be able to enthusiastically endorse it like that. As regards congratulating the people of Pembrokeshire for doing what they have done, I commend them for their efforts. Objective 1 is viewed in the 2000-06 programme as being based on the bottom-up principle. What people were willing to put up with in the 1990s, in the sense of central Government or regional-level assemblies simply saying 'that is what you are having', is not the principle for the 2000-06 round. It sounds to me as if the people of Pembrokeshire took that message to heart, decided on their own priorities and have got them through the various local partnerships. I commend them for that.

**Phil Williams:** Do you agree that Wales would gain even greater benefits from European Union membership if we had direct access to the Court of Justice with regard to those cases that the UK Government would not take up. For example, we could challenge the continuing lack of full additionality for structural funds allocated to Wales, or the way in which the Barnett formula and the allocation of funds to the more deprived regions in the north of England fail to promote the EU aims of economic and social cohesion.

**The First Minister:** That is a paranoiac's paradise, leading to a lawyer's paradise. Harping on about what we would be able to do and about taking the British Government to court is pointless. All that would happen is 10 years of fighting in the courts, with not an extra penny at the end, but enormous legal bills on all sides. I am not interested in creating a lawyer's paradise in Wales.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae ystyriaethau diddorol mewn gofyn i mi gytuno i'r datganiad olaf hwnnw. Mae'n bosibl na allaf ei gefnogi'n frwdfrydig yn y ffordd hon. O ran llongyfarch pobl Sir Benfro am wneud yr hyn a wnaethont, fe'u canmolaf am eu hymdrehchion. Gwelir Amcan 1 yn rhaglen 2000-06 fel un wedi ei seilio ar egwyddor o'r bôn i'r brig. Nid yr hyn yr oedd pobl yn barod i'w ddioddef yn y 1990au, yn yr ystyr o Lywodraeth ganolog neu gynulliadau lefel rhanbarthol yn dweud yn syml 'dyna beth a gewch' yw'r egwyddor ar gyfer cylch 2000-06. Yr argraff a gaf yw bod pobl sir Benfro wedi cymryd y neges honno at eu calon, wedi penderfynu ar eu blaenoriaethau eu hunain ac wedi llwyddo i'w tywys drwy'r partneriaethau lleol amrywiol. Canmolaf hwy am hynny.

**Phil Williams:** A gytunwch y cai Cymru fanteision hyd yn oed yn fwy o fod yn aelod o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd pe bai gennym fynediad uniongyrchol i'r Llys Cyflawnder o ran yr achosion hynny na wnâi Llywodraeth y DU eu dilyn. Er enghraift, gallem herio diffyg parhaus ychwanegedd llawn ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol a ddyrennir i Gymru, neu'r ffordd y mae fformiwlâu Barnett a dyrannu arian i'r rhanbarthau mwy difreintiedig yng ngogledd Lloegr yn methu â hyrwyddo amcanion cydlyniad economaidd a chymdeithasol yr UE.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hynny'n baradwys i baranöig, yn arwain at baradwys i gyfreithwyr. Nid oes diben mewn rhyngu ymlaen ar yr hyn y gallem ei wneud ac am fynd â Llywodraeth Prydain i'r llys. Yr unig beth a ddigwyddai fyddai 10 mlynedd o ymladd yn y llysoedd, heb geiniog yn ychwanegol yn y diwedd, ond gyda biliau cyfreithiol anferth ar bob ochr. Nid oes gennyl ddiddordeb mewn creu paradwys i gyfreithwyr yng Nghymru.

### Rheolau'r Trysorlys Treasury Rules

**Q4 Jocelyn Davies:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Treasury on the effect of Treasury rules on National Assembly for Wales policy? (OAQ15263)

**C4 Jocelyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Thrysorlys y DU ynghylch effaith rheolau'r Trysorlys ar bolisi Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ15263)

**The First Minister:** I have not had direct discussions with the UK Treasury on this issue. However, as I have explained on other occasions, I meet the Secretary of State for Wales regularly and we discuss a range of issues affecting Wales, including financial issues, which cover public expenditure and the rules applied by Her Majesty's Treasury.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Do you agree that the present public sector borrowing requirement rules do not give councils in Wales the option to invest sufficient funds to tackle the backlog of housing repairs to their property, and that the Treasury has relaxed these rules for other sectors, for example air traffic control? Will you make representations to the UK Government so that our councils would have the option of tackling repairs themselves?

**The First Minister:** You will be aware that the number of exceptions outside aviation is small, and is possibly nil. I was aware of the Luton airport case, but not of the national air traffic control case. However I am sure that you are correct. Relaxation in relation to the borrowing rules appears to have been allowed in aviation, but I do not know of any other such examples.

You will remember that, due to the initiative taken by Edwina Hart, we led the way in getting some of the borrowing requirements cancelled last year. That resulted in considerable benefit to local authorities outside Wales, but it would not have happened if Edwina had not taken that initiative. Therefore, where we can ease the burden, we take the initiative and do so successfully. However, you cannot always draw parallels, for example, between Luton airport and the recycling of council housing receipts. That argument would not last five minutes in the Treasury.

**Peter Black:** In drawing up the terms of reference for the review of the Assembly's powers, will you consider allowing the commission to review the role of the Barnett

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni chefais drafodaethau uniongyrchol gyda Thrysurlys y DU ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, fel yr eglurais ar achlysuron eraill, byddaf yn cyfarfod Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn gyson a byddwn yn trafod amrediad o faterion sy'n effeithio ar Gymru, yn cynnwys materion ariannol, sy'n cwmpasu gwariant cyhoeddus a'r rheolau a ddilynir gan Drysorlys Ei Mawrhydi.

**Jocelyn Davies:** A gytunwch na rydd rheolau presennol gofyniad benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus y dewis i gynghorau yng Nghymru fuddsoddi arian digonol i fynd i'r afael â'r ôl-groniad o atgyweiriadau tai i'w heiddo, a bod y Trysorlys wedi ystwytho'r rheolau hyn i sectorau eraill, er enghraifft rheoli traffig awyr? A wnewch chi sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU fel bod ein cynggorau yn cael y dewis o fynd i'r afael ag atgyweiriadau eu hunain?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y nifer o eithriadau y tu allan i hedfan yn fach, ac yn ddim o bosibl. Yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol o achos maes awyr Luton, ond nid o achos rheoli traffig awyr yn genedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gywir. Mae'n ymddangos fod ystwythder o ran y rheolau benthyg wedi ei ganiatáu yn achos hedfan, ond ni wn am unrhyw enghreiffiau eraill.

Byddwch yn cofio, oherwydd y cam a gymerwyd gan Edwina Hart, ein bod wedi arwain y ffordd o ran cael peth o'r gofynion benthyca wedi ei ganslo y llynedd. O ganlyniad bu hyn o fudd sylweddol i awdurdodau lleol y tu allan i Gymru, ond ni fyddai wedi digwydd pe na fyddai Edwina wedi cymryd y cam cyntaf. Felly, lle y gallwn ni ysgafnhau'r baich, yr ydym yn achub y blaen ac yn gwneud hynny'n llwyddiannus. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch dynnu cymariaethau bob tro, er enghraifft, rhwng maes awyr Luton ac ailgylchu derbyniant tai cyngor. Ni fyddai'r ddadl honno yn dal dŵr am bum munud yn y Trysorlys.

**Peter Black:** Wrth lunio'r cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer adolygiad o bwerau'r Cynulliad, a wnewch chi ystyried caniatáu i'r comisiwn adolygu rôl fformiwla Barnett o ran cyflawni

formula in achieving the Assembly's ambitions for Wales?

**The First Minister:** The Barnett formula is always under review, in the sense that it is not written into hard and fast law. It is not included in the Government of Wales Act 1998, nor is there any wider definition of how resource transfer from the wealthier parts to the poorer parts of the UK shall be effected.

However, anybody who assumes that a review of the Barnett formula would mean that Wales would automatically be better off, needs to consider carefully the risks that we would be facing. I would feel much happier if the Barnett formula had been written into the Government of Wales Act 1998. We have always regarded the biggest danger as being the Conservatives getting back into power and suddenly deciding to scrap the Barnett formula and reducing our expenditure by 10 or 20 per cent. Nothing could prevent that. Recent remarks made by the occasional senior Tory politician—if there is such a thing—indicate that that danger exists. Therefore, I would have preferred for the Barnett formula to be guaranteed. If we can get something better, that is fine; but we could get something worse.

**Alun Cairns:** What discussions have you had with the UK Treasury about European regional policy and the successor plans to structural funding?

**The First Minister:** Do you mean the successor plans after 2006-07?

**Alun Cairns:** Yes.

**The First Minister:** The Treasury tends to have a different view from that of the Foreign and Commonwealth Office in these matters. That divide probably exists in every member state. Treasuries, particularly in net contributor countries, such as Great Britain and Germany, tend to favour repatriation of all regional policy and the winding-up of European structural funds. The foreign offices in every European country do not agree with that because it reduces the sense of participation in Europe for the less well-

dyheadau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer Cymru.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae fformiwla Barnett yn cael ei adolygu yn barhaus, yn yr ystyr nad yw wedi'i ysgrifennu i gyfraith. Nid yw wedi ei gynnwys yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, ac nid oes unrhyw ddiffiniad ehangach o'r modd y trosglwyddir adnoddau o rannau cyfoethocach o'r DU i'r rhannau tlotach.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid i unrhyw un sy'n rhagdybio y byddai adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett yn golygu y byddai Cymru yn awtomatig yn well ei byd ystyried yn ofalus y risgau y byddem yn eu hwynebu. Byddwn yn llawer hapusach fy meddwl pe bai fformiwla Barnett wedi cael ei ymgorffori yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Yr ydym bob amser wedi ystyried mai'r perygl mwyaf fyddai y Ceidwadwyr yn dod i rym eto ac yn penderfynu'n sydyn i ddileu fformiwla Barnett a lleihau ein gwariant 10 neu 20 y cant. Ni allai dim rwystro hynny. Mae sylwadau diweddar a wnaed gan ambell wleidydd Torïaidd hŷn—os oes y fath beth—yn dangos fod y perygl hwnnw yn bodoli. Felly, byddai wedi bod yn well gennyf pe bai fformiwla Barnett wedi ei warantu. Os gallwn gael rhywbeth gwell, mae hynny'n iawn; ond gallem gael rhywbeth gwaeth.

**Alun Cairns:** Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda Thrysurlys y DU ynglŷn â'r polisi rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd a'r cynlluniau dilynol i ariannu strwythurol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** A ydych yn golygu y cynlluniau dilynol ar ôl 2006-07?

**Alun Cairns:** Ydwyt.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Tuedda'r Trysorlys i gymryd agwedd wahanol i un y Swyddfa Dramor a'r Gymanwlad yn y materion hyn. Mae'r rhaniad hwnnw yn bodoli ym mhob un o'r aelod-wladwriaethau mae'n debyg. Mae trysorlysoedd, yn arbennig mewn gwledydd cyfranwyr net, megis Prydain Fawr a'r Almaen, yn tueddu i ffafrio dychwelyd pob polisi rhanbarthol i'r famwlad a dirwyn y cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd i ben. Nid yw swyddfeydd tramor pob gwlad Ewropeaidd yn cytuno â hynny oherwydd ei

off regions within member states. Such regions include east Germany, parts of north Germany, parts of western France, ourselves, Northern Ireland, the highlands and islands of Scotland and Merseyside. That divide is seen everywhere and will remain until 2006-07.

fod yn lleihau'r ymdeimlad o gyfranogiad yn Ewrop i'r rhanbarthau llai cyfoethog o fewn yr aelod wladwriaethau. Mae rhanbarthau o'r fath yn cynnwys dwyrain yr Almaen, rhannau o ogledd yr Almaen, rhannau o orllewin Ffrainc, ni ein hunain, Gogledd Iwerddon, ucheldiroedd ac ynysoedd yr Alban a Glannau Merswy. Gwelir y rhaniad hwnnw ym mhob man a bydd yn parhau hyd 2006-07.

### Penderfyniadau'r Cynulliad Assembly Resolutions

**C5 David Lloyd:** Sut mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn monitro'r modd y mae penderfyniadau'r Cynulliad yn cael eu rhoi ar waith? (OAQ15251)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cyhoeddwyd y trydydd adroddiad ar y mater hwn ddydd Gwener diwethaf, yn delio â'r cyfnod o Hydref i Dachwedd 2000. Bydd pobl yn gofyn pam y'i cyhoeddwyd dros flwyddyn ar ôl y cyfnod dan sylw, ond weithiau gall gymryd amser i benderfyniadau'r Cynulliad gael eu gweithredu.

2:20 p.m.

**David Lloyd:** Ymddengys fod pawb, gan eich cynnwys chi, Brif Weinidog, yn cytuno ar yr angen i drosglwyddo'r pwerau dros iechyd anifeiliaid i'r Cynulliad. Pryd y bydd hynny'n digwydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyna yw ein polisi. Mae Carwyn Jones wedi bod yn dadlau dros y polisi hwnnw mewn cyfarfodydd—ac o bosibl yn y cyfarfod ddoe—gyda Margaret Beckett a'r Gweinidogion sydd â'r un cyfrifoldebau yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Cefnogir y polisi nid yn unig gan holl bleidiau'r Cynulliad, ond hefyd—ac yn bwysicach, o bosibl—gan y diwydiant amaethyddol. Ni allaf bennu dyddiad gan fod y materion hyn yn golygu tipyn o ddadlau a manylu. Fodd bynnag, y peth pwysig yw y bydd yn digwydd ac ni fydd unrhyw anhawster, o ran egwyddor, yn ei rwystro.

**Alun Pugh:** Do you recall the resolution on smoking passed by the Assembly last year? Do you agree with the health and safety assessment that air-born tobacco smoke is a

**Q5 David Lloyd:** How does the First Minister monitor implementation of Assembly resolutions? (OAQ15251)

**The First Minister:** The third report on this matter was published last Friday, dealing with the period from October to November 2000. People will ask why it was published over a year after the period covered, but sometimes it takes time for Assembly resolutions to be implemented.

**David Lloyd:** It seems that everyone, including you First Minister, agrees on the need to transfer powers on animal health to the Assembly. When will that happen?

**The First Minister:** That is our policy. Carwyn Jones has been making a case for that policy in meetings—and possibly in yesterday's meeting—with Margaret Beckett and his counterparts in Scotland and Northern Ireland. Not only is there cross-party support for that policy in the Assembly, but—and possibly more importantly—the agriculture industry also supports it. I cannot set a date for this because such matters entail a great deal of discussion and examination. However, the important thing is that it will happen and, in principle, nothing should prevent it.

**Alun Pugh:** A gofiwch y cynnig ar ysmwyg a dderbyniwyd gan y Cynulliad y llynedd? A gytunwch â'r asesiad iechyd a diogelwch bod mwg tybaco a gludir yn yr awyr yn berygl

serious health hazard to non-smokers and that smoking is also the prime cause of health inequality in Wales? In that context, do you believe that the Assembly should seek powers to regulate smoking in public places in Wales?

**The First Minister:** Yes. I hope you will write to me on those matters. If they relate to health and safety, then they are matters for the Health and Safety Executive—which now reports to the Department of Trade and Industry, I believe, following the changeover after the election six months ago—as such matters are not devolved. If they relate to public health, rather than health and safety, we can take a strong view. If they are not matters that call for a pan-European ban, as in advertising in sports events and so on, I would be interested to see what steps could be taken to deal with them as soon as possible. No other single step would have a greater short, medium and long-term effect on public health than reducing the take-up of smoking by young people and in particular young girls of social classes four and five.

**Glyn Davies:** The national economic development strategy commits the Government of Wales to developing income and employment for young people in rural Wales and in sectors other than agriculture. What is your reaction to the threatened closure of Price and Orphin Ltd in Newtown, in the heart of rural Wales? It is a key engineering company with a commitment to good salaries and quality training. Will you personally intervene to try to avoid what will be a savage blow to the mid-Wales economy and to the morale of its inhabitants?

**The First Minister:** Yes, and I accept what you say about Price and Orphin Ltd. I also still tend to call it that although it has a new name and is sometimes referred to as Hampspon Industries plc, Newtown plant. The loss of 61 jobs in Newtown, given the size of its community and that of the middle Severn Valley, is equivalent to the loss of many hundreds of jobs in a bigger urban

difrifol o ran iechyd i rai nad ydynt yn ysmgyu ac mai ysmgyu hefyd yw prif achos anghyfartaledd iechyd yng Nghymru? Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a gredwch y dylai'r Cynulliad geisio pwerau i reoleiddio ysmgyu mewn mannau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Credaf hynny. Gobeithiaf y gwnewch ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â'r materion hynny. Os ydynt yn ymwneud â iechyd a diogelwch, maent yn faterion i'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch—sydd bellach yn atebol i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, mi gredaf, yn dilyn y newid wedi'r etholiad chwe mis yn ôl—gan nad yw materion o'r fath wedi'u datganoli. Os ydynt yn faterion iechyd cyhoeddus yn hytrach na iechyd a diogelwch, gallwn gymryd agwedd gadarn. Os nad ydynt yn faterion sy'n galw am waharddiad Ewrop gyfan, fel mewn hysbysebu mewn digwyddiadau chwaraeon ac yn y blaen, byddai diddordeb gennyf i weld pa gamau y gellid eu cymryd i ddelfio â hwy cyn gynted â phosibl. Ni fyddai un cam unigol arall yn cael mwy o effaith yn y tymor byr, canolig na'r tymor hir ar iechyd cyhoeddus na lleihau'r achosion o bobl ifanc yn dechrau ysmgyu ac yn arbennig merched ifanc o ddosbarthiadau cymdeithasol pedwar a phump.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol yn ymrwymo Llywodraeth Cymru i ddatblygu incwm a chyflogaeth ar gyfer pobl ifanc yng nghefn gwlad Cymru ac mewn sectorau heblaw amaethyddiaeth. Beth yw eich ymateb i'r bygythiad i gau cwmni Price and Orphin Ltd yn y Drenwydd yng nghanol cefn gwlad Cymru? Mae'n gwmni peirianneg allweddol sydd ag ymrwymiad i gyflogau da a hyfforddiant o safon. A wnewch chi ymyrryd yn bersonol i geisio atal yr hyn a fydd yn ergyd galed i economi'r canolbarth ac i ysbryd ei drigolion?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf, a derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedwch am gwmni Price and Orphin Ltd. Tueddaf innau hefyd ei alw'n hynny er bod ganddo enw newydd a chyfeirir ato weithiau fel Hampson Industries plc, ffatri'r Drenwydd. Mae colli 61 o swyddi yn y Drenwydd, o gofio maint y gymuned, a honno ynghanol dyffryn Afon Hafren, yn gyfystyr â cholli cannoedd o swyddi mewn

community. The company says that this has to do with cutbacks in aerospace industry demand caused by the 11 September catastrophe at the World Trade Center. However, if we can do anything to salvage all or some of those jobs, we will do that. They are just the kind of highly skilled jobs in aerospace engineering that rural Wales needs in order to diversify and get away from over-dependency on farming.

**Mick Bates:** Further to Glyn's point, do you have any plans to redress the general decline in the aerospace industry? Yesterday I visited the plant at Newtown and spoke to the workforce, and to Hampson's managing director and chief executive. They were concerned about the industry. We, as the Government of Wales, must put plans in place to ensure that we do not lose these highly skilled and well-paid jobs.

**The First Minister:** I agree. Sometimes you can take action. For example, we have worked hard with bigger plants such as the Airbus plant at Broughton, to help it overcome this dip, which will probably last for the whole of 2002-03 before getting back to normal in 2004. We were sorry that Ryanair ordered between 100 and 150 Boeing 737s, but that is normal for low cost airlines, as they are dependent on the 737. The action you take with the smaller companies that have been hit for six by 11 September is not so easy. We cannot invent orders for aircraft or make planes sell for money. Such planes would only be stored in the Mohave desert in Arizona because people have not recovered the habit of flying in the USA. We hope to see some recovery of the habit of flying on a mass scale in the United States of America during 2002, for the cancellations to stop, and, finally, for orders to pick up during 2003, and normality to return from 2004 onwards.

cymuned drefol fwy ei maint. Dywed y cwmni fod hyn yn ganlyniad toriadau yn y diwydiant aerofod a achoswyd gan y trychineb ar 11 Medi yng Nghanolfan Masnach y Byd. Fodd bynnag, os gallwn wneud unrhyw beth i achub rhai o'r swyddi, neu'r swyddi i gyd, gwnawn hynny. Dyma'r math o swyddi hyfedor mewn peirianneg aerofod y mae eu hangen ar Gymru wledig er mwyn arallgyfeirio ac osgoi gorddibyniaeth ar ffermio.

**Mick Bates:** Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt a wnaeth Glyn, a oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i unioni'r dirywiad cyffredinol yn y diwydiant aerofod? Ddoe ymwelais â'r gwaith yn y Drenwydd a siarad â'r gweithlu, a chyda rheolwr gyfarwyddwr a phrif weithredwr cwmni Hampson. Yr oeddent yn bryderus am y diwydiant. Rhaid inni, fel Llywodraeth Cymru, roi cynlluniau ar waith i sicrhau na chollwn y swyddi hyfedor hyn â chyflogau da.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf. Weithiau gallwch weithredu. Er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi gweithio'n galed gyda gweithfeydd mwy megis gwaith Airbus ym Mrychdyn, i'w helpu i oresgyn y dirywiad hwn, a fydd fwy na thebyg yn parhau gydol 2002-03, cyn adfer yn 2004. Yr oedd yn ddrwg gennym bod Ryanair wedi archebu rhwng 100 a 150 o awyrennau Boeing 737, ond mae hynny'n gyffredin ymysg cwmnïau awyrennau cost isel, gan eu bod yn ddibynnol ar y 737. Nid yw'r camau a gymerwch gyda'r cwmnïau llai yr effeithiwyd arnynt yn sylweddol gan 11 Medi mor rhwydd. Ni allwn greu archebion am awyrennau, na gwneud i awyrennau werthu am arian. Byddai awyrennau o'r fath ond yn cael eu storio y anialwch Mohave yn Arizona am nad yw pobl wedi ailadfer yr arfer o hedfan yn Unol Daleithiau'r America. Yr ydym yn gobeithio gweld yr arfer o hedfan yn cynyddu eto ar raddfa fawr yn UDA yn ystod 2002, er mwyn i'r archebion beidio â chael eu canslo, ac, yn y pen draw yn cynyddu yn ystod 2003, ac i'r sefyllfa arferol ddychwelyd o 2004 ymlaen.

### Cyflawniadau Llywodraeth Cymru Achievements of the Government of Wales

**C6 Owen John Thomas:** Beth yw prif gyflawniadau Llywodraeth Cymru hyd yn

**Q6 Owen John Thomas:** What are the main achievements of the Government of Wales to

hyn? (OAQ15265)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn gwerthfawr. Mae rhewi taliadau presgripsiwn ymhliith ein cyflawniadau pennaf. Yn ogystal, crewyd polisi o fynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac orielau cenedlaethol Cymru ac, o ganlyniad, cafwyd codiad o 90 y cant mewn ymwelwyr. Cawsom wared ar brofion i blant saith mlwydd oed yn ein hysgolion, ac yn fwy diweddar, cymerasom bleser yn ein hadroddiad ar gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol (RSA)—y cynllun dyfarnu grantiau i gwmniau ar draws Cymru. Yr ydym wedi cael blwyddyn eithriadol. Mae rhyw 130 o brosiectau wedi derbyn grant RSA yn ystod 2001, ac arweiniodd y £553 miliwn at 8,700 o swyddi ychwanegol, ac at ddiogelu 4,700 o swyddi.

**Owen John Thomas:** Anghofiodd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Paul Murphy, yn ddiweddar am yr angen i newid y rheolau yng Nghymru er mwyn caniatáu'r hawl diamod i etholwyr bleidleisio drwy'r post. Yn etholiad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol felly, collodd rhai o drigolion Dwyrain Abertawe y cyfle i bleidleisio drwy'r post. Onid yw hyn yn arwydd arall o ddifyg diddordeb Mr Murphy yn y Cynulliad, ac o ddifyg dylanwad WAG ar Lywodraeth San Steffan?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cofiw y cyd-destun yn dda. Yr oedd dryswch pan orffennodd Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad a'r cyfarfod llawn yn San Steffan ddiwrnod ar ôl marwolaeth drist Val Feld. Nid oedd amser seneddol cyn yr is-etholiad ym mis Medi—ac ni allwn fod wedi ei ohirio'n bellach—i gyflwyno'r Mesur newydd fel bod ein his-etholiadau yn dilyn yr un patrwn ag etholiadau San Steffan o ran yr hawl i bleidleisio drwy'r post. Gobeithiwn gywiros hyn cyn bo hir, ac yn sicr cyn bod is-etholiad arall yn y Cynulliad, a chyn yr etholiad ym Mai 2003.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** First Minister, I will refer to some of the current administration's negative achievements, particularly the nine consecutive rises in hospital waiting lists. Specifically, will you say something about the fact that despite a pledge to tackle the

date? (OAQ15265)

**The First Minister:** That is a valuable question. Freezing prescription charges is among our main achievements. We also introduced a policy of free admission to the national museums and galleries of Wales, which led to an increase of 90 per cent in admissions. We abolished tests for seven-year-olds in our schools, and more recently, we took pride in our report on regional selective assistance—the scheme awarding grants to companies across Wales. We have had a record year. Around 130 companies have received RSA grants during 2001, and the investment of £553 million has created an additional 8,700 jobs, and safeguarded 4,700 jobs.

**Owen John Thomas:** The Secretary of State for Wales, Paul Murphy, recently forgot about the need to change the rules in Wales to give electors the unconditional right to a postal vote. In the National Assembly election therefore, some residents of Swansea East were denied a postal vote. Is this not another indication of Mr Murphy's lack of interest in the Assembly, and of the WAG's lack of influence on the Westminster Government?

**The First Minister:** We remember the context well. There was confusion when the Assembly and the Westminster Parliament went into recess the day after the sad death of Val Feld. There was no parliamentary time before the by-election in September—and we could not have delayed it any further—to bring the new Bill forward so that our by-elections followed the same pattern on the right to a postal vote as elections to Westminster. We hope to remedy this soon, and certainly before any other National Assembly by-election is held, and before the election in May 2003.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Brif Weinidog, cyfeiriaf at rai o gyflawniadau negyddol cyfredol y weinyddiaeth, yn arbennig y naw cynnydd olynol yn rhestrau aros ysbytai. Yn benodol, a ddywedwch rywbeth ynglŷn â'r ffaith, er gwaetha'r addewid i fynd i'r afael â rhestr

cancer waiting list in Wales, there is still no idea of how many people are waiting for potentially life-saving treatments for cancer? The Prime Minister has promised that, if the problems in the NHS are not fixed by the next election, he should be kicked out of office. Will you make a similar pledge?

**The First Minister:** That was not quite the pledge he made, but we all understand the democratic imperatives in relation to public priorities, and I have no problem with that. The waiting list position has stabilised over the past few months, Nick, and I will write to you about waiting lists for cancer treatment.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for the promise of a letter about cancer treatment—it remains a serious problem. It is not the first time that I have raised it and not the first time that you have promised to write to me. On the cardiac situation, which is equally serious, many constituents, to whom I will not refer by name, are priority cases who are told month on month—this is a serious issue as I am sure the Deputy Minister for Health would agree—that they will receive this treatment only to find out that they have to wait a long time. I am sure that that applies to constituents throughout Wales. It is a serious matter and is it not time that the administration addressed this issue? Criticism has been received from nursing unions and patient groups. We keep hearing about delivery in the NHS, but it is not happening in relation to cardiac treatment. Will the First Minister please ensure that his administration makes this a priority?

2:30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** Yes. We are increasing the NHS throughput, but demand is rising faster than our ability to produce. Your point, which probably incorporates such matters as repeat cancellations as well as long waiting lists for cardiac surgery, is a major issue. I will deal with it in the same letter.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** First Minister, while

ares canser yng Nghymru, nad oes gennych syniad o hyd am faint o bobl sy'n aros am driniaethau canser a allai achub bywydau? Addawodd Prif Weinidog y DU, os na fydd problemau'r GIG wedi eu datrys erbyn yr etholiad nesaf, y dylai gael ei daflu allan o'i swydd. A wnewch chi roi addewid tebyg?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid dyna'n union oedd yr addewid a wnaeth, ond yr ydym i gyd yn deall y rheidrwydd democraidd o ran blaenoriaethau cyhoeddus, ac nid yw hynny'n anhawster i mi. Mae sefyllfa'r rhestrau aros wedi sefydlogi dros yr ychydig fis oedd diwethaf, Nick, a byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â'r rhestrau aros ar gyfer triniaethau canser.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr addewid y caf lythyr ynglŷn â thriniaeth canser—mae'n broblem ddifrifol. Nid dyma'r tro cyntaf i mi ei chodi ac nid dyma'r tro cyntaf ichi addo ysgrifennu ataf. O ran sefyllfa clefyd y galon, sydd yr un mor ddifrifol, mae llawer o etholwyr, na wnaf gyfeirio atynt wrth eu henwau, yn achosion blaenoriaeth, sy'n cael clywed fis ar ôl mis—mae hwn yn fater difrifol ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Iechyd yn cytuno—y byddant yn cael y driniaeth hon, ond y bydd yn rhaid iddynt aros am amser maith. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod hyn yn wir am etholwyr ledled Cymru. Mae'n fater difrifol ac onid yw hi'n amser i'r weinyddiaeth fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn? Derbyniwyd beirniadaeth gan undebau nysrio a grwpiau cleifion. Parhawn i glywed am gyflawniadau yn y GIG, ond nid yw'n digwydd mewn cysylltiad â thriniaethau'r galon. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog sicrhau y bydd hyn yn flaenoriaeth i'w weinyddiaeth?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf. Yr ydym yn cynyddu'r nifer o driniaethau yn y GIG, ond mae'r galw yn cynyddu'n gyflymach na'n gallu i gyflawni. Mae eich pwynt, sydd fwy na thebyg yn ymgorffori materion megis triniaethau a gaiff eu canslo yn aml ynghyd â rhestrau aros hir am driniaeth ar y galon, yn fater o bwys. Ymdriniaf â hynny yn yr un llythyr.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Brif Weinidog, wrth

talking about health, will you join me in congratulating Tony Blair, who has said that he is happy to see his Government fall if he has not made substantial improvements to the NHS in England by the next Westminster election? Will you give us the same assurance that your Government will see the same fate if the health service in Wales does not improve by 2003?

**The First Minister:** The Conservatives and Plaid Cymru should make their research teams co-ordinate their questions, or pay more attention to questions. I am unsure whether it is in order to answer the same question twice.

We all understand the democratic imperatives and the penalties to governments who set delivery targets and do not achieve them. It is difficult to stand before the electorate and say ‘That is what we promised and we have failed to deliver it’. I am sure that we will be able to say, ‘That is what we promised and we have delivered it’.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Your job on health has been made much more difficult by the Secretary of State for Health, Alan Milburn, telling the House of Commons last week that he is glad that he does not have responsibilities for Wales. Does he not realise that, under our constitutional settlement, Westminster still legislates as much on health in Wales as the National Assembly? Is he making a case for a full legislative parliament for us, so that we are fully responsible for health, or are you going to put him right?

**The First Minister:** That seems to have been House of Commons banter. Principles of constitutional law cannot be based on Houses of Parliament banter. That would not be right or proper. The point that was made is well understood, Ieuan. Issues such as nurses' pay are determined on an England and Wales basis, while Scotland is separate. Making the major jump toward separate nurses' pay and separate professions allied to medicine pay negotiations for Wales would involve many additional civil servants. Why employ them in Wales, when the Department of Health can

drafod iechyd, a ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Tony Blair, a ddywedodd ei fod yn hapus i weld ei Lywodraeth yn disgyn os na fydd wedi gwneud gwelliannau sylweddol i'r GIG yn Lloegr erbyn etholiadsu nesaf San Steffan? A wnewch chi roi inni'r un sicrwydd y bydd eich Llywodraeth chi yn dioddef yr un dynged os na fydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn gwella erbyn 2003?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dylai'r Ceidwadwyr a Phlaid Cymru beri i'w timau ymchwil gyd-drefnu eu cwestiynau, neu dalu mwy o sylw i gwestiynau. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hi mewn trefn i ateb yr un cwestiwn ddwywaith.

Yr ydym i gyd yn deall y rheidrwydd democraidd a'r cosbau a gaiff llywodraethau sy'n gosod targedau cyflawni ond yn methu â'u cyrraedd. Mae'n anodd sefyll o flaen yr etholwyr a dweud 'Dyna oedd ein haddewid ac yr ydym wedi methu â'i gyflawni'. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn gallu dweud, 'Dyna oedd ein haddewid ac yr ydym wedi ei gyflawni'.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cafodd eich gwaith ar iechyd ei wneud lawer yn waeth gan Alan Milburn, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Iechyd, wrth iddo ddweud wrth Dŷ'r Cyffredin yr wythnos diwethaf ei fod yn falch nad oes ganddo gyfrifoldeb dros Gymru. Onid yw'n sylweddoli, o dan ein setliad cyfansoddiadol, fod San Steffan yn parhau i ddeddfu cymaint ar iechyd yng Nghymru ag y gwna'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? A yw'n cyflwyno achos dros senedd ddeddfwriaethol lawn i ni, fel ein bod yn llwyr gyfrifol am iechyd, neu a ydych yn mynd i'w gywiros?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ymddengys mai cellwair Tŷ'r Cyffredin oedd hynny. Ni all egwyddorion cyfraith gyfansoddiadol gael eu seilio ar gellwair yn y Senedd. Ni fyddai hynny'n iawn nac yn briodol. Mae'r pwynt a wnaed yn glir, Ieuan. Caiff materion megis cyflogau nyrssy eu penderfynu ar sail Cymru a Lloegr, tra bod yr Alban ar wahân. Byddai gwneud y naid fawr tuag at negodiadau ar wahân ynglŷn â chyflogau nyrssy a chyflogau proffesiynau sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth yn arwain at gyflogi llawer o weision sifil ychwanegol. Pam y dylid eu cyflogi yng

deal with matters through a single England and Wales negotiation?

Nghymru, pan y gall yr Adran Iechyd ddelio â materion drwy un negodiad i Gymru a Lloegr.

### **Defnydd Gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad o Offerynnau Ysgrifenedig Assembly Administration's Use of Instruments in Writing**

**Q7 David Melding:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Assembly administration's use of instruments in writing? (OAQ15259)

**The First Minister:** Yes, David. You must have spent long hours in the Library researching this question. It is another lawyer's paradise question.

The term 'instrument in writing' is not subject to any single, comprehensive definition—that is not a good start. It is rather a term of art to cover any document in writing that the person or body making it intends will create or affect legal or equitable rights and liabilities. As such, it will apply to almost anything that the Welsh Assembly Government does that is intended to have legal effect. I hope that we can agree on that definition.

**C7 David Melding:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar ddefnydd gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad o offerynnau ysgrifenedig? (OAQ15259)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf, David. Rhaid eich bod wedi treulio oriau hir yn y Llyfrgell yn ymchwilio'r cwestiwn hwn. Mae hwn eto yn gwestiwn paradwys i gyfreithwyr.

Nid oes i'r term 'offeryn ysgrifenedig' un diffiniad unigol, cynhwysfawr—nid yw hynny'n ddechrau da. Yn hytrach mae'n derm i gwmpasu unrhyw ddogfen ysgrifenedig y mae'r person neu'r corff a'i gwna yn bwriadu iddi greu neu effeithio ar hawliau a chyfrifoldebau cyfreithiol neu ecwitiol. Yn hynny o beth, bydd yn berthnasol i bron unrhyw beth y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud gyda'r bwriad o gael effaith gyfreithiol. Gobeithiaf y gallwn gytuno ar y diffiniad hwnnw.

**David Melding:** Before you get too flippant, it is used in current health Bills before Parliament, so it is a matter of legitimate scrutiny. Your scorn is misguided.

**David Melding:** Cyn i chi fynd yn rhy dafotrydd, fe'i defnyddir mewn Mesurau iechyd cyfredol sydd gerbron y Senedd, felly mae'n fater cyfreithlon i'w archwilio. Mae eich dirmyg yn annoeth.

On 9 August 2001—the depth of the summer recess—the Minister for Health and Social Services issued an instrument in writing on the functions of local health groups. Under clause 6(1) of the NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Bill, currently proceeding through Parliament, the Minister would be able to issue instruments in writing on the exercise of functions of the proposed local health boards. Should such ministerial diktat be a thing of the past now that we have devolution?

Ar 9 Awst 2001—yng nghanol toriad yr haf—cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol offeryn ysgrifenedig ar swyddogaethau grwpiau iechyd lleol. O dan gymal 6(1) o Fesur Diwygio'r GIG a Phroffesiynau Gofal Iechyd, sydd yn mynd drwy'r Senedd ar hyn o bryd, byddai'r Gweinidog yn gallu cyhoeddi offerynnau ysgrifenedig ar arfer swyddogaethau y byrddau iechyd lleol arfaethedig. A ddylai gorchymyn gweinidogaethol o'r fath fod yn rhywbeth sy'n perthyn i'r gorffennol gan fod datganoli gennym bellach?

**The First Minister:** This will be done via secondary legislation. I understand that, in a previous answer to you, Jane Hutt cleared up

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwneir hyn drwy ddeddfwriaeth elilaidd. Deallaf fod Jane Hutt, mewn ateb blaenorol i chi, wedi ymdrin â'r

this matter and explained the reason for the different approach between clauses 6 and 22 of the NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Bill. Clause 6 inserts provisions into the existing National Health Service Act 1977, whereas clause 22 stays within that Bill. Therefore, separate provision needed to be made for each, to account for the fact that the provisions inserted into the National Health Service Act 1977 would not be governed by the general provision in clause 36(8) of the NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Bill. I hope that you are happy.

mater hwn ac wedi esbonio'r rheswm dros yr ymagwedd wahanol rhwng cymalau 6 a 22 o Fesur Diwygio'r GIG a Phroffesiynau Gofal Iechyd. Mae cymal 6 yn gosod darpariaethau yn Nedd Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol 1977, tra bod cymal 22 yn aros o fewn y Mesur hwnnw. Felly, yr oedd angen gwneud darpariaeth ar wahân ar gyfer y ddau er mwyn ystyried y ffaith na fyddai'r darpariaethau a osodwyd i mewn i Ddeddf Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol 1977 ddim yn cael eu rheoli gan y ddarpariaeth gyffredinol yng nghymal 36(8) o Fesur Diwygio'r GIG a Phroffesiynau Gofal Iechyd. Gobeithiaf eich bod yn hapus.

**David Melding:** I wanted an answer.

**David Melding:** Yr oeddwn am gael ateb.

### **Etholiadau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru National Assembly for Wales Elections**

**Q8 Nick Bourne:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales on ensuring maximum voter turnout in the next National Assembly elections? (OAQ15268)

**C8 Nick Bourne:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch sicrhau bod cymaint o bobl â phosibl yn pleidleisio yn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ15268)

**The First Minister:** We would all agree that top-notch candidates, representative of the area they hope to represent and able to defend and promote top-notch policies—as we will do on this side of the Chamber—are key to maximising voter turnout for our candidates. I am not sure what your line is on that. However, on the issue of the mechanical means by which you can make voting easier, everybody is now clear that it is only by universal access to postal voting that you can directly impact on the number of people who participate. This issue was raised earlier today and we hope that in a few months—that is, well in time for the May 2003 Assembly elections—we will be able to bring the Government of Wales Act 1998 provisions for postal voting into line with that for general elections.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddem i gyd yn cytuno mai ymgeiswyr o'r radd flaenaf, sy'n gynrychioliadol o'r ardal y dymunant ei chynrychioli ac yn meddu ar y gallu i amddiffyn a hyrwyddo polisiau o'r radd flaenaf—fel y gwnawn ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambra—yw'r allwedd i sicrhau bod cymaint o bobl â phosibl yn bwrw'u pleidlais dros ein hymgeiswyr. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw eich barn chi ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, ar fater defnyddio dulliau mecanysddol i wneud pleidleisio'n haws, mae pawb yn sylweddoli bellach mai drwy fynediad cyffredinol i bleidleisiau post yn unig y gallwch chi effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar y nifer o bobl sy'n cyfranogi yn hynny. Codwyd y mater hwn yn gynharach heddiw a gobeithiwn y gallwn o fewn yr ychydig fisoeedd nesaf—hynny yw, ymhell cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad ym mis Mai 2003—sicrhau ein bod yn gofalu bod darpariaethau Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 ar gyfer pleidleisio drwy'r post yn union debyg i'r rhai ar gyfer etholiadau cyffredinol.

**Nick Bourne:** I share your ambition for a high turnout, but I do not share your

**Nick Bourne:** Rhannaf eich dyhead i weld nifer uchel yn pleidleisio, ond nid wyf yn

complacency on the current position. A lot must be done to ensure a higher turnout than in recent by-elections and the last general election. Do you agree that your administration's performance will affect voter turnout? Now that we have this democratic forum here, why were we not able to discuss the Health Bill as it passed through Parliament? Worse still, why are we not able to discuss the Education Bill until it has become an Act? It might, in part, be the high-handedness of some in your administration, but will you try to rectify that so that we can debate these matters as they proceed through the House of Commons? In addition, the Cefn Croes windfarm—the largest windfarm ever in Wales—was not debated, despite several requests to do so and no requests from the First Minister for a national inquiry. Now that we have a national forum for these matters, why are we not debating them here?

**The First Minister:** All these matters are dealt with by secondary legislation at the Assembly, subsequent to and under the aegis of the primary legislation passed at Westminster. That was the premise on which you stood for election in 1999, Nick. As a professor of law, you should be the best qualified of the 60 Members to understand that principle. It is no good saying that we ought to have a quasi-primary legislative debate on a Westminster Bill in mid-passage when we will deal with those matters through secondary legislation in the perfectly proper manner. As regards Cefn Croes, that was the first windfarm larger than 50 MW proposed in Wales and was therefore the first that we did not deal with because it was the first to fall foul of the 50 MW rule. With a degree of moral support from the Department of Trade and Industry, we have agreed that it will seriously consider transferring future responsibility for over-50 MW windfarms or all electricity-generating projects to us. It may be some time before we can bring that about, but we are hopeful that we will. There is goodwill at the Department of Trade and Industry and goodwill and support across the board at the Assembly—as I understand it—for that transfer of functions.

rhannu eich hunanfodlonrwydd yn y sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd. Mae angen gwneud llawer i sicrhau bod mwy yn pleidleisio nag a wnaeth mewn isetholiadau diweddar a'r etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf. A gytunwch y bydd perfformiad eich gweinyddiaeth yn cael effaith ar y nifer fydd yn bwrw'u pleidlais? Gan fod gennym y fforwm democraidd hwn bellach, pam nad oeddem yn gallu trafod y Mesur Iechyd wrth iddo fynd drwy'r Senedd? Yn waeth byth, pam na allwn drafod y Mesur Addysg nes iddo ddod yn Ddeddf? Efallai'n rhannol mai agwedd drahaus rhai o aelodau eich gweinyddiaeth sy'n gyfrifol am hynny, ond a wnewch chi geisio unioni hyn er mwyn inni allu trafod y materion hyn wrth iddynt fynd drwy Dŷ'r Cyffredin? Yn ychwanegol at hyn, ni chafodd fferm wynt Cefn Croes—y fferm wynt fwyaf erioed yng Nghymru—ei thrafod, er gwaethaf sawl cais i wneud hynny, ac ni chafwyd cais am ymchwiliad cenedlaethol gan y Prif Weinidog. Gan fod gennym fforwm cenedlaethol ar gyfer y materion hyn, pam nad ydym yn eu trafod yma?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Delir â'r holl faterion hyn gan is-ddeddfwriaeth yn y Cynulliad, yn dilyn ac o dan adain y ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol a basiwyd yn San Steffan. Ar y sail honno y gwnaethoch chi, Nick, sefyll i gael eich ethol yn 1999. Fel athro yn y gyfraith, chi ddylai fod fwyaf cymwys o'r 60 Aelod i ddeall yr egwyddor honno. Nid yw'n ddigon da i ddweud y dylem gael trafodaeth ddeddfwriaethol led-sylfaenol ar Fesur pan fydd ar ei ffordd drwy San Steffan, gan y byddwn yn delio â'r materion hynny drwy is-ddeddfwriaeth yn y ffordd briodol gywir. O ran Cefn Croes, honno oedd y fferm wynt gyntaf yn fwy na 50 MW a gynigiwyd yng Nghymru a'r gyntaf felly inni beidio â delio â hi oherwydd ei bod y tu allan i'r rheol 50 MW. Gyda rhywfaint o gefnogaeth foesol gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, yr ydym wedi cytuno y bydd yn ystyried o ddifrif trosglwyddo inni gyfrifoldeb am ffermydd gwynt sydd dros 50 MW neu'r prosiectau cynhyrchu trydan i gyd yn y dyfodol. Efallai y cymer hynny beth amser, ond yr ydym yn gobeithio y bydd yn digwydd. Mae ewyllys da yn yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ac ewyllys da a chefnogaeth yn gyffredinol yn y Cynulliad—yn ôl a ddeallaf—i drosgwlyddio'r

swyddogaethau hynny.

**Cynog Dafis:** A gytuna'r Prif Weinidog y byddai llawer mwy o ddiddordeb a pharodrwydd i bleidleisio yn etholiad 2003 pe bai pobl yn pleidleisio ar gyfer senedd ddeddfwriaethol? Bydd y cwestiwn hwnnw yn rhwym o fod yn destun trafod yn ystod ymgyrch yr etholiad hwnnw. Ynghylch y comisiwn arfaethedig ar hawliau'r Cynulliad, pryd y mae'n rhagweld y byddai unrhyw argymhellion gan y comisiwn yn cael eu gweithredu?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Credaf imi ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw hanner dwsin o weithiau o'r blaen. Bydd argymhellion y comisiwn ar gael inni yn haf neu hydref 2004. Wedyn, os cytunwn i newid patrwm yr argymhellion hynny neu os y dymunwn wneud hynny, byddant yn cael eu trosglwyddo i'r Senedd a'r pleidiau a fydd yn ymgyrchu yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn yr etholiad nesaf, yn 2005 neu 2006, neu ba bryd bynnag y bydd hynny.

**Tom Middlehurst:** We all want to see increased voter turnout, First Minister. Do you agree that any electoral system that does not include direct accountability to the electorate is hardly likely to persuade people to vote? The many variations on the proportional representation theme are not the answer to voter apathy, in Assembly or any other elections.

**The First Minister:** There is a commission on proportional representation for local government. I hope to receive the commission's recommendations and I do not want to prejudice the outcome. However, your views are known and are trenchantly expressed. This is no doubt not the last time that we will hear them, Tom.

**Cynog Dafis:** Does the First Minister agree that there would be far more interest and a greater willingness to vote in the 2003 elections if people were voting for a legislative parliament? That question is bound to be a bone of contention during that election campaign. With regard to the proposed commission on the Assembly's rights, when does he expect to see any recommendations put forward by the commission being enacted?

**The First Minister:** I believe that I have answered that question half a dozen times previously. The commission's recommendations will be available to us in summer or autumn 2004. Then, if we agree or wish to change those recommendations, they will be transferred to Parliament and the parties that will be campaigning in the next election, whenever that will be, either in 2005 or 2006.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Mae pawb ohonom am weld rhagor o bobl yn bwrrw'u pleidlais, Brif Weinidog. A gytunwch nad oes fawr o obaith i unrhyw gyfundrefn etholiadol nad yw'n cynnwys atebolrwydd uniongyrchol i'r etholwyr berswadio pobl i fwrrw'u pleidlais? Nid yr amrywiadau lu ar thema cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yw'r ateb i ddiffyg diddordeb pleidleiswyr, yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad nac unrhyw etholiadau eraill.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae comisiwn ar gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol i lywodraeth leol. Gobeithiaf dderbyn argymhellion y comisiwn ac nid wyf am ddylanwadu ar y canlyniad. Fodd bynnag, mae eich syniadau yn hysbys ac wedi eu mynegi'n nerthol. Mae'n siŵr nad dyna'r tro diwethaf, Tom, inni gael eu clywed.

### Milwyr wrth Gefn Cymru Welsh Reserve Forces

**Q9 David Davies** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales about contingency plans for the call-up of Welsh reserve forces in place of regular forces posted to Afghanistan? (OAQ15264)

**C9 David Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch cynlluniau argyfwng i ymfyddino milwyr wrth gefn Cymru yn lle'r milwyr parhaol sydd wedi'u hanfon i Afghanistan?

(OAQ15264)

2:40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** We are only aware, so far, of the broad numbers of British troops, but not broken down into Welsh troops, that are already, or are likely to be, serving in Afghanistan over the next few months. The number is just over 1,000 now, and will be just under 2,000 before long while Britain remains the lead body within ISAF—the International Security Assistance Force—to help pacify Afghanistan, and assist the Karzai Government to bring normality back to that sad country. I do not know what the impact of those troops is on the overstretch issue for British troops elsewhere and the need for the compulsory call-up of reservists. Military intelligence territorial army people have been used to backfill those who have gone to Afghanistan, but we are not aware of any pressure to do that for non-intelligence troops so far.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Hyd yma, niferoedd y lluoedd Prydeinig yn unig y gwyddom amdanyst, nid y lluoedd o Gymru sydd eisoes yn y gwasanaeth yn Afghanistan, neu a fydd yn debygol o fod yno dros yr ychydig fisioedd nesaf. Mae'r nifer yn awr ychydig dros 1,000 a bydd ychydig o dan 2,000 cyn hir, wrth i Brydain barhau yn gorff blaen o fewn ISAF—y Llu Cymorth Diogelwch Rhyngladol—i helpu i ddwyn heddwch i Afghanistan, a chynorthwyo Llywodraeth Karzai i adfer normalrwydd i'r wlad drist honno. Ni wn beth yw effaith y lluoedd hynny ar fater y wasgfa ar luoedd Prydain mewn mannau eraill a'r angen i ymfyddino milwyr wrth gefn yn orfodol. Defnyddiwyd pobl cudd-wybodaeth filwrol y fyddin diriogaethol i adlenwi yn lle'r rhai a aeth i Afghanistan, ond nid ydym yn ymwybodol o unrhyw bwysau hyd yn hyn i wneud hynny ar gyfer lluoedd nad ydynt yn rhai cudd-wybodaeth.

**David Davies:** Thank you for that full answer. Do you agree, given the number of territorial army members in Wales, and those who have served within the last five years, that it behoves all Assembly Members to find out what they are doing in and around our constituencies? They have a huge impact not only on our defence but on the local economy. I am the Assembly's representative on the Reserve Forces and Cadets Association for Wales and if anyone wishes to take up visits, I would be more than happy to arrange them.

**David Davies:** Diolch am yr ateb llawn hwnnw. A gytunwch, o gofio nifer aelodau'r fyddin diriogaethol yng Nghymru, a'r rhai sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf, ei bod yn ddyletswydd ar holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad i fynnu gwybod beth y maent yn ei wneud o fewn ein hetholaethau. Cânt effaith enfawr nid ar ein hamddiffyn yn unig ond hefyd ar yr economi leol. Fi yw cynrychiolydd y Cynulliad ar Gymdeithas Lluoedd Wrth Gefn a Chadetiaid Cymru ac os carai unrhyw un fynd ar ymweliadau, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i'w trefnu.

**The First Minister:** Thank you for the spirit in which you asked that question, David. I have always had many friends in the territorial army—although I have never been a member myself—mostly because of sporting interests in common with people in territorial army units. It does a valuable job and, as it states in its current publicity, makes up a third of the total armed forces. There will always be tension at a time when it is being called up, because some employers will say 'we do not want to lose you'. However, it is protected under the Reserve Forces

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Diolch i chi, David, am yr ysbryd y gwnaethoch ofyn y cwestiwn. Bu gennyf lawer o ffrindiau ar hyd yr amser yn y fyddin diriogaethol—er na fûm yn aelod erioed fy hun—yn bennaf oherwydd diddordebau chwaraeon cyffredin gyda phobl o fewn unedau'r fyddin diriogaethol. Cyflawna waith da gwerthfawr, ac fel y dywed yn ei gyhoeddusrwydd cyfredol, mae'n draean o gyfanswm y lluoedd arfog. Bydd tensiwn o hyd ar adeg pan fydd yn cael ei galw i ymfyddino, oherwydd bydd rhai cyflogwyr yn dweud 'nid ydym am eich

(Safeguard of Employment) Act 1985, which means that members of the territorial army cannot be sacked for going off for three weeks, six months, or whatever. That is an important principle. You cannot run a territorial army except on that principle, but there will always be pinch points when it happens. There is a small number—some 60 I think—who are going, few of whom are from Wales probably.

colli'. Fodd bynnag, fe'i diogelir o dan Ddeddf Lluoedd Wrth Gefn (Diogelu Cyflogaeth) 1985, sy'n golygu na all aelodau o'r fyddin diriogaethol gael eu diswyddo am fynd i ffwrdd am dair wytynos, chwe mis, neu beth bynnag. Mae honno'n egwyddor bwysig. Ar yr egwyddor honno'n unig y gallwch redeg byddin diriogaethol, ond bydd rai anawsterau o hyd pan ddigwydd. Mae nifer fach yn mynd—rhyw 60 yr wyf yn credu—ychydig ohonynt mae'n debyg o Gymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Do you share my concern about the dramatic increase in reported racist attacks in Wales—we had some more figures yesterday—since the beginning of the war in Afghanistan? Could you update the Assembly on your Government's efforts to protect and reassure the Muslim community in Wales? Much is being done, but it might be helpful for us to know about it.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A rannwch fy mhryder ynglŷn â'r cynnydd dramatig yn yr ymosodiadau hiliol yr adroddir amdanynt yng Nghymru—cawsom rai ffigurau ychwanegol ddoe—ers dechrau'r rhyfel yn Afghanistan? A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad ar ymdrechion eich Llywodraeth i ddiogelu a thawelu meddwl y gymuned Fwslemaidd yng Nghymru? Mae llawer yn cael ei wneud, ond gallai fod o gymorth i ni wybod amdano.

**The First Minister:** I think that I heard the word 'attacks'. I cannot hear you too well because of your position in the Chamber, Helen Mary. You said 'attacks', did you?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Credaf i mi glywed y gair 'ymosodiadau'. Ni allaf eich clywed yn rhy dda, Helen Mary, oherwydd eich lleoliad yn y Siambr. Ai 'ymosodiadau' ddywedoch chi?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am referring to reported racist incidents, including violent attacks, that have been reported to the police.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cyfeiriaf at y digwyddiadau hiliol a gofnodwyd, gan gynnwys ymosodiadau treisgar, y rhoddwyd gwybod amdanynt i'r heddlu.

**The First Minister:** I am sorry about that—it is due to the physical layout of the Chamber. Superintendent Bob McCallister of the South Wales Police had a meeting with the Permanent Secretary on the state of community and race relations on 17 January. He reported that the situation appears to be improving, and that the statistics collected by the four Welsh police forces indicate a downward trend of such incidents being reported. However, officials will continue to keep in contact with the minority ethnic communities and the specialist units within the police forces that have community responsibility to monitor the situation.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyl am hynny—mae'n digwydd oherwydd cynllun ffisegol y Siambr. Cafodd yr Uwch Arolygydd Bob McCallister o Heddlu De Cymru gyfarfod gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol ar gyflwr cysylltiadau cymunedol a hiliol ar 17 Ionawr. Dywedodd fod y sefyllfa'n gwella yn ôl pob tebyg, a bod yr ystadegau a gasglwyd gan y pedwar heddlu yng Nghymru yn dangos tuedd tuag at i lawr o ran y digwyddiadau o'r fath a gofnodir. Fodd bynnag, bydd swyddogion yn parhau i gadw mewn cysylltiad â'r cymunedau ethnig lleiafrifol a'r unedau arbenigol o fewn yr heddluoedd sydd â chyfrifoldeb cymunedol i fonitro'r sefyllfa.

**Dogfen Strategol ‘Cynllun i Gymru 2001’  
‘Plan for Wales 2001’ Strategic Document**

**Q10 Pauline Jarman:** Will the First Minister make a statement on progress towards fulfilling commitments made in the ‘Plan for Wales 2001’ strategic document? (OAQ15256)

**The First Minister:** Excellent progress is being made. You will be aware, for instance, of the announcement about the package of transport investments that was made on January 22 by my colleague, the Minister for Environment. Her decision will add five new major infrastructure projects to the forward programme announced last January, and give support to four new innovative approaches to public transport provision. That will result in investment of around £130 million in addition to the £300 million effected by that announcement last January.

**Pauline Jarman:** Following last week’s Audit Committee report, are you able to make a statement on the commitment in ‘Plan for Wales 2001’ to increase staffing levels and the number of healthcare professionals in training?

**The First Minister:** I am not familiar with that audit report. You will have to write to me about its contents.

**C10 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y camau sydd wedi’u cymryd i gwrdd â'r addewidion a wnaethpwyd yn y ddogfen strategol ‘Cynllun i Gymru 2001’? (OAQ15256)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym yn gweld cynnydd ardderchog. Fe wyddoch, er enghraifft, am y cyhoeddiad ynglŷn â'r pecyn o fuddsoddiadau trafnidiaeth a wnaed ar 22 Ionawr gan fy nghyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd. Bydd ei phenderfyniad yn ychwanegu pum prosiect seilwaith mawr newydd i'r rhaglen at y dyfodol a gyhoeddwyd fis Ionawr diwethaf, a rhoddant gefnogaeth i bedair ymagwedd flaengar at ddarparu trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Bydd hynny'n arwain at fuddsoddiad o tua £130 miliwn yn ychwanegol at y £300 miliwn a roddwyd ar waith gan y cyhoeddiad hwnnw fis Ionawr diwethaf.

**Pauline Jarman:** Yn dilyn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio yr wythnos diwethaf, a allwch chi wneud datganiad ar yr ymrwymiad yn ‘Cynllun i Gymru 2001’ i gynyddu'r lefelau staffio a'r nifer o weithwyr proffesiynol sy'n derbyn hyfforddiant ym maes gofal iechyd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r adroddiad archwilio hwnnw. Bydd yn rhaid i chi ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â'i gynnwys.

**Datganiad ar Wasanaethau Canser yng Nghymru  
Statement on Cancer Services in Wales**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I was made aware recently, from press coverage and representations made by Assembly Members, that the Cancer Care Society was to close its operations in Wales. The society runs a transport and befriending service from its two bases in Merthyr Tydfil and Mountain Ash, and also operates drop-in centres in those towns. I was told at that point that some of its operations in England were also to close and that funding difficulties were to blame for all of this. As this followed close on the heels of

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Fe'm hysbyswyd yn ddiweddar, gan adroddiadau yn y wasg a sylwadau gan Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, fod y Gymdeithas Gofal Canser yn bwriadu dod â'i gweithrediadau yng Nghymru i ben. Mae'r gymdeithas yn rhedeg gwasanaeth trafnidiaeth a gwasanaeth cefnogi o'i dau safle ym Merthyr Tudful ac Aberpennar, a hefyd yn gweithredu canolfannau galw heibio yn y trefi hynny. Dywedwyd wrthyf bryd hynny bod rhai o'i gweithrediadau yn Lloegr hefyd yn mynd i

the problems surrounding the Children's Society, I was deeply concerned about a further example of an English-based charity withdrawing from Wales. I am aware that the services are highly valued in the areas they serve.

I arranged a meeting on 22 January with the Wales Council for Voluntary Action to discuss the situation. I asked it to convene urgently a meeting of all interested parties to see if a way could be found to save all or part of these services. That meeting took place in Merthyr Tydfil on 23 January, and involved the WCVA, local authorities, local health groups, a range of voluntary groups and Assembly officials. The chief executive of the Cancer Care Society and one of the trustees attended the first half of the meeting. The following points emerged: it is probable that the society will have to close all its operations, not just those in Wales; the Cancer Care Society is in no position to review its decision because of the overall financial problems, but it has offered its utmost co-operation to help with any locally based solution; and there is tremendous will among the statutory and voluntary sectors to produce a local solution, and a committee has been established to drive this forward.

The National Assembly cannot core fund such operations. However, in recognition of the vital nature of these services and to give time for a local solution to be found, I have agreed to provide one-off bridging funding to allow services to continue after the withdrawal of the Cancer Care Society on 28 February. This money will be provided against a rescue plan to be produced by the local rescue committee, which gives a reasonable prospect of a long-term solution to the problem. A further meeting will be held on 14 February to discuss this plan.

I am grateful to the WCVA for organising the local action, and I am grateful to all those services that met at such short notice to help with this. With this goodwill, I am hopeful

gau ac mai anawsterau ariannu oedd wrth wraidd hyn oll. Gan fod hyn yn dilyn yn fuan wedi problemau yn ymwneud â Chymdeithas y Plant, yr oeddwyn yn pryderu'n fawr am enghraift bellach o elusen a leolir yn Lloegr yn tynnu allan o Gymru. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y gwerthfawrogir y gwasanaethau yn fawr iawn yn yr ardaloedd y maent yn eu gwasanaethu.

Trefnais gyfarfod ar 22 Ionawr â Chyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru i drafod y sefyllfa. Gofynnais iddo alw ynghyd ar frys yr holl bartion â buddiant i weld a oedd modd dod o hyd i ffordd o achub y gwasanaethau hyn i gyd neu ran ohonynt. Cynhaliwyd y cyfarfod hwnnw ym Merthyr Tudful ar 23 Ionawr, ac yr oedd yn cynnwys Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, awdurdodau lleol, grwpiau iechyd lleol, amrywiaeth o grwpiau gwirfoddol a swyddogion y Cynulliad. Bu prif weithredwr y Gymdeithas Gofal Canser ac un o'r ymddiriedolwyr yn bresennol am hanner cyntaf y cyfarfod. Daeth y pwyntiau canlynol i'r amlwg: mae'n debygol y bydd yn rhaid i'r gymdeithas ddod â'i holl weithredoedd i ben, nid y rheini yng Nghymru yn unig; nid yw'r Gymdeithas Gofal Canser mewn sefyllfa i adolygu ei phenderfyniad oherwydd y problemau ariannol cyffredinol, ond mae wedi cynnig ei chydweithrediad mwyaf i helpu gydag unrhyw ateb lleol; ac mae ewyllys aruthrol ymysg y sectorau statudol a gwirfoddol i ddod o hyd i ateb lleol, a sefydlwyd pwylgor i yrru hyn ymlaen.

Ni all y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol roi arian craidd i weithrediadau o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, i gydnabod natur hanfodol y gwasanaethau hyn ac er mwyn rhoi amser i ddod o hyd i ateb lleol, cytunaf i ddarparu arian pontio unwaith ac am byth i alluogi'r gwasanaethau i barhau ar ôl i'r Gwasanaeth Gofal Canser dynnu allan ar 28 Chwefror. Darperir yr arian hwn mewn perthynas â chynllun adfer i'w gynhyrchu gan y pwylgor adfer lleol, sy'n rhoi cyfle rhesymol o gael ateb hirdymor i'r broblem. Cynhelir cyfarfod pellach ar 14 Chwefror i drafod y cynllun hwn.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Gyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru am drefnu'r camau lleol, ac i'r holl wasanaethau a gyfarfu ar gymaint o fyr rhybudd i gynorthwyo â hyn. Gyda'r

that we can save as many of the existing services as possible, though there can be no guarantees at this stage.

**David Lloyd:** I declare my usual interest as a general practitioner and county councillor.

As regards the Cancer Care Society, we are talking about vital services. This is an issue of great concern, locally and nationally. While welcoming Jane's statement, I would like to clarify two points: for how long will the one-off bridging funding be operational, and what services will be provided as part of the rescue plan?

**Jane Hutt:** As I have said, the bridging loan is to enable us to take the services forward from the end of February. How quickly we can get a package together is debatable at this time, but it will take us to the end of this financial year and we will then look at any gaps in terms of taking the rescue package forward.

**Christine Chapman:** Thank you for your statement today, Jane, and I also thank you for your written statement last Thursday detailing the meetings involving all interested parties, including the voluntary sector and the NHS, to try to keep the services operational in Wales. News that the Cancer Care Society is to close its base in my constituency has been devastating. The society has provided real support for cancer sufferers and their families.

I welcome your commitment to a rescue plan. However, will you reassure the people of Cynon Valley that, even if not in their present form, the core non-medical support services for cancer victims and their families will be retained? Many constituents affected by cancer have experienced support, for example, through the voluntary driver service, and the emotional support available at the centre. Transport is a real issue for my constituency; there is a low level of car ownership and poor public transport. Therefore the work of volunteer drivers has been invaluable. There is also a question mark about the availability of reflexology and

ewyllys da hwn, gobeithiaf y gallwn achub cymaint o'r gwasanaethau presennol â phosibl, er nad oes dim sicrwydd ar hyn o bryd.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fy muddiant arferol fel meddyg teulu a chyngphonydd sir.

O ran y Gymdeithas Gofal Canser, yr ydym yn sôn am wasanaethau hanfodol. Mae hwn yn fater o bryder mawr, yn lleol ac yn genedlaethol. Tra'n croesawu datganiad Jane, hoffwn gael eglurhad ar ddua bwynt: pa mor hir fydd yr ariannu pontio unwaith ac am byth ar gael, a pha wasanaethau a ddarperir fel rhan o'r cynllun adfer?

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y dywedais, mae'r benthyriad pontio er mwyn ein galluogi i barhau â'r gwasanaethau o ddiwedd mis Chwefror. Nid yw'n sicr ar hyn o bryd pa mor gyflym y gallwn lunio pecyn, ond bydd yn parhau tan ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon ac yna edrychwn ar unrhyw fylchau o ran datblygu'r pecyn adfer.

**Christine Chapman:** Diolch am eich datganiad heddiw, Jane, ac am eich datganiad ysgrifenedig ddydd Iau diwethaf a roddodd fanylion y cyfarfodydd yn ymwneud â phob parti â buddiant, yn cynnwys y sector gwirfoddol a'r GIG, i geisio cadw'r gwasanaethau yn weithredol yng Nghymru. Mae'r newyddion bod y Gymdeithas Gofal Canser yn mynd i gau ei chanolfan yn fy etholaeth wedi bod yn ergyd drom iawn. Mae'r gymdeithas wedi darparu cymorth gwirioneddol i ddioddefwyr canser a'u teuluoedd.

Croesawaf eich ymrwymiad i gynllun adfer. Fodd bynnag, a roddwch sicrwydd i bobl Cwm Cynon y bydd y gwasanaethau cymorth anfeddygol craidd ar gyfer y rhai sy'n dioddef o ganser a'u teuluoedd yn parhau, hyd yn oed os na fyddant yn dilyn y patrwm presennol? Mae nifer o etholwyr yr effeithir arnynt gan ganser wedi cael cymorth, er enghraifft drwy'r gwasanaeth gyrrwr gwirfoddol, a'r cymorth emosiynol ar gael yn y ganolfan. Mae trafnidiaeth yn fater o bwys i'm hetholaeth; mae nifer isel o bobl yn berchen ar gar ac mae trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus o safon isel. Felly bu gwaith y gyrrwr gwirfoddol yn amhrisiadwy. Mae ansicrwydd

aromatherapy services, which are important services for clients. Will you ensure that this is an ongoing issue, and assure the people of Cynon Valley that you will continue to seek out solutions and work with organisations, such as the WCVA and the NHS, to ensure that any transfer of services between organisations is as seamless as possible, and is undertaken with the least disruption to everyone involved?

2:50 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** You brought the Cancer Care Society's withdrawal to my attention immediately the news emerged, Christine. I opened the centre in Mountain Ash two years ago and that was well supported by local people in the Cynon Valley. You and Dai Lloyd have identified the services provided: the voluntary transport scheme which provides transport to, in particular, Velindre Hospital from the Valley communities for people who do not have their own private transport; the befriending and support services; and the complementary therapies that are provided at that centre. We are concerned about those services, and the local rescue committee is considering the whole package and the partnership approach to funding, which will be the long-term solution.

**David Melding:** I welcome the action you have taken. It is important to emphasise the vital nature of these support services in the overall quality of healthcare, and in this case, particularly of cancer care. The act of befriending patients and providing reliable transport can make the difference between a service that is satisfactory and a service that adds to the anxiety surrounding treatment. What action can we take, as far as the organisations of England and Wales are concerned, to emphasise that we are here to give advice if organisations experience difficulties in delivering services in Wales? It does not help if the matter is left until a late stage. If this problem had been indicated to us at an earlier stage, we could have already taken action to help the situation.

hefyd ynglŷn ag argaeledd gwasanaethau adweitheg ac aromatherapi, sy'n wasanaethau pwysig i gleientiaid. A sicrhewch fod hwn yn fater a fydd yn parhau i gael sylw ac a wnewch roi sicrwydd i bobl Cwm Cynon y byddwch yn parhau i chwilio am atebion a gweithio gyda sefydliadau, megis Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru a'r GIG, i sicrhau bod unrhyw broses o drosglwyddo gwasanaethau rhwng sefydliadau mor llyfn â phosibl, a bod hynny yn digwydd gan amharu cyn lleied â phosibl ar bawb sy'n rhan ohono?

**Jane Hutt:** Bu ichi dynny fy sylw at benderfyniad y Gymdeithas Gofal Canser i dynnu allan yn syth wedi ei gyhoeddi, Christine. Agorais y ganolfan yn Aberpennar ddwy flynedd yn ôl a chafodd honno ei chefnogi'n dda gan bobl leol yng Nghwm Cynon. Yr ydych chi a Dai Lloyd wedi nodi'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir: y cynllun trafnidiaeth gwirfoddol sy'n darparu trafnidiaeth, yn benodol, i Ysbyty Felindre o gymunedau'r Cwm ar gyfer pobl sydd heb eu trafnidiaeth breifat eu hunain; mae'r gwasanaeth cefnogi a chymorth; a'r therapiâu cyflenwol a ddarperir yn y ganolfan honno. Yr ydym yn pryderu am y gwasanaethau hynny, ac mae'r pwylgor adfer lleol yn ystyried y pecyn cyfan a'r ymagwedd bartneriaeth tuag at ariannu, sef yr ateb hirdymor.

**David Melding:** Croesawaf y camau yr ydych wedi eu cymryd. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio natur hanfodol y gwasanaethau cymorth hyn i ansawdd cyffredinol gofal iechyd, ac yn yr achos hwn, yn enwedig gofal canser. Gall y weithred o gefnogi cleifion a darparu trafnidiaeth ddibynadwy wneud gwahaniaeth rhwng gwasanaeth sy'n fodhaol a gwasanaeth sy'n ychwanegu at y pryder sy'n gysylltiedig â thriniaeth. Pa gamau y gallwn eu cymryd, o ran sefydliadau Cymru a Lloegr, i bwysleisio ein bod yma i roi cyngor os yw sefydliadau yn cael anawsterau wrth gyflwyno gwasanaethau yng Nghymru? Nid yw'n helpu os nad eir i'r afael â'r broblem tan yn hwyr. Pe bai'r broblem hon wedi ei nodi inni yn gynharach, gallem eisoes fod wedi cymryd camau i wella'r sefyllfa.

**Jane Hutt:** This goes back to the importance of our voluntary sector scheme. As you know, David, at the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council's last meeting, we discussed this issue and set up a working group of Assembly officials and key people in the voluntary sector in Wales, who have an interest in UK-based voluntary organisations, to examine ways in which we can safeguard the voluntary sector, and prepare and alert ourselves to any problems that may be on the horizon for voluntary sector bodies based in England and not devolved to Wales. I have also written to the Minister responsible for this matter to say that we are concerned about the relationships. We believe that several hundred UK-based organisations provide services in Wales. The Voluntary Sector Partnership Council is taking this matter forward vigorously, and we depend on Assembly Members as well as the voluntary sector to monitor this carefully. However, I pay tribute, not only to the WCVA, but also to the local voluntary action groups in Rhondda Cynon Taff and in Merthyr Tydfil who, supported by the National Assembly, have helped to steer these partnerships.

**Kirsty Williams:** I declare an interest as a vice-president of the Usk House Day Hospice, Brecon. You have indicated for how long you think the bridging funding will provide services in these areas. Will you give exact details of how much money you have made available for this, and what provision there may be for additional resources, should local action plans take longer to develop than anticipated? Do you agree that the Cancer Care Society's failure to continue to provide these services illustrates the fragility of many of the supportive services for cancer sufferers in Wales? Voluntary organisations throughout the principality provide services such as support, complementary therapies, specialist nursing, and respite, palliative and terminal care. This issue was recently highlighted by the report on cancer services in Wales by the Audit Commission and the Commission for Health Improvement. That report stated that the services are patchy and

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hyn yn mynd yn ôl at bwysigwydd ein cynllun sector gwirfoddol. Fel y gwyddoch, David, yng nghyfarfod olaf Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol, trafodwyd y mater hwn gennym a sefydlwyd gweithgor o swyddogion Cynulliad a phobl allweddol yn y sector gwirfoddol yng Nghymru, sydd â buddiant mewn mudiadau gwirfoddol sydd wedi'u lleoli yn y DU, i astudio ffyrdd o ddiogelu'r sector gwirfoddol, a pharatoi a chodi ein hymwybyddiaeth ynghylch unrhyw broblemau a all fod ar y gorwel i gyrrff y sector gwirfoddol sydd wedi'u lleoli yn Lloegr ond heb eu datganoli i Gymru. Yr wyf hefyd wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y mater hwn i ddweud ein bod yn pryderu am y cydberthnasau. Credwn fod rhai cannoedd o fudiadau sydd wedi'u lleoli yn y DU yn darparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Mae Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol yn gweithredu ar y mater hwn yn gadarn, ac yr ydym yn dibynnu ar Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ogystal â'r sector gwirfoddol i fonitro hyn yn drylwyr. Fodd bynnag, talaf deyrnged, nid yn unig i Gyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, ond hefyd i'r grwpiau gweithredu gwirfoddol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf ac ym Merthyr Tudful sydd, gyda chymorth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, wedi helpu llywio'r partneriaethau hyn.

**Kirsty Williams:** Datganaf fuddiant fel is-lywydd Hosbis Diwrnod Tŷ Brynbuga, Aberhonddu. Yr ydych wedi nodi am ba hyd y credwch y bydd yr ariannu pontio yn darparu gwasanaethau yn yr ardaloedd hyn. A roddwch union fanylion am faint o arian yr ydych wedi ei ryddhau ar gyfer hyn, a phaddarpariaeth allai fod ar gyfer adnoddau ychwanegol, pe bai'n cymryd mwy o amser i ddatblygu cynlluniau gweithredu lleol nag a ragwelir? A gytunwch fod methiant y Gymdeithas Gofal Canser i barhau i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hyn yn enghraifft o natur fregus nifer o'r gwasanaethau cymorth ar gyfer y rhai sy'n dioddef o ganser yng Nghymru? Mae mudiadau gwirfoddol ym mhob ran o Gymru yn darparu gwasanaethau megis cymorth, therapiâu cyflenwol, nyrsio arbenigol, a gofal seibiant, lliniarol a therfynol. Amlygwyd y mater hwn yn ddiweddar gan yr adroddiad ar wasanaethau cancer yng Nghymru gan y Comisiwn

funded on a less than secure basis. Do you agree that it is now time for the National Assembly to bring forward a comprehensive palliative and terminal care strategy to ensure that, throughout the principality, cancer sufferers have access to quality support services prior to, and following a diagnosis of cancer?

**Jane Hutt:** We are finalising the sum of money that we will be able to provide to support this bridging grant for the organisation until the end of the current financial year. I am happy to share that information with Members when it will be finalised within the next few days. It will be sufficient for the crucial weeks ahead.

We have waited for the palliative care strategy for some time. I was pleased to spend time yesterday with Professor Ilora Finlay, Baroness Finlay of Llandaff, who is championing these issues in the House of Lords as well as in Wales. With our officials she is finalising the palliative care strategy. I hope to bring it to Plenary within the next few weeks. It must cover many important issues and we must ensure that it embraces the partnership between the NHS and the voluntary sector.

**Pauline Jarman:** I have attended meetings in Mountain Ash with a group of volunteers. I am certain that the initiative, drive and commitment that it has shown will mean that at least part of this service can be salvaged. I would like you to thank everyone who has been involved in that process. The group has begun making applications for funding to other charities and it has approached the Cancer Care Society to request that it inherits the office equipment in Mountain Ash. The lease on the current office space runs until November, which the voluntary group would like to extend. It has started to reconfigure its voluntary sector bid to the local authority. I declare an interest as leader of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council.

A number of positive indicators show that the critical element of the service may be

Archwilio a'r Comisiwn Gwella Iechyd. Nododd yr adroddiad hwnnw fod gwasanaethau yn anghyson ac wedi'u hariannu ar sail ansicr. A gytunwch ei bod yn amser bellach i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyflwyno strategaeth gofal lliniarol a therfynol gynhwysfawr i sicrhau y gall y rhai sy'n dioddef o ganer, yng Nghymru, gael mynediad i wasanaethau cymorth o safon cyn, ac ar ôl, i ganer gael ei ganfod?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym wrthi'n penderfynu ar y swm terfynol y gallwn ei ddarparu i gynorthwyo'r grant pontio hwn ar gyfer y mudiad hyd at ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol. Yr wyf yn hapus i rannu'r wybodaeth honno gyda'r Aelodau ar ôl inni benderfynu ar y swm terfynol o fewn y diwrnodau nesaf. Bydd yn ddigonol ar gyfer yr wythnosau tyngedfennol i ddod.

Yr ydym wedi aros am y strategaeth gofal lliniarol ers amser. Yr oeddwn yn falch o dreulio amser ddoe gyda'r Athro Ilora Finlay, y Farwnes Finlay o Landaf, sy'n hybu'r materion hyn yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi yn ogystal ag yng Nghymru. Gyda'n swyddogion mae'n cwblhau'r strategaeth gofal lliniarol. Gobeithiaf gyflwyno hyn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn o fewn yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf. Rhaid iddi gwmpasu nifer o faterion pwysig a rhaid inni sicrhau ei bod yn cofleidio'r bartneriaeth rhwng y GIG a'r sector gwirfoddol.

**Pauline Jarman:** Yr wyf wedi mynychu cyfarfodydd gyda grŵp o wifoddolwyr yn Aberpennar. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y blaengaredd, y cymhelliant a'r ymrwymiad y mae wedi eu dangos yn golygu y gellid achub o leiaf rhan o'r gwasanaeth hwn. Hoffwn ichi ddiolch i bawb a fu'n rhan o'r broses honno. Mae'r grŵp wedi dechrau gwneud ceisiadau am arian i elusennau eraill ac mae wedi mynd at y Gymdeithas Gofal Canser i ofyn a fydd modd iddo etifeddu'r cyfarpar swyddfa yn Aberpennar. Mae'r brydles ar y swyddfa bresennol yn rhedeg tan fis Tachwedd, a hoffai'r grŵp gwirfoddol ymestyn hyn. Mae wedi dechrau ail-lunio ei gais fel grŵp gwirfoddol i'r awdurdod lleol. Datganaf fuddiant fel arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Mae nifer o arwyddion cadarnhaol yn awgrymu y gall elfen hanfodol y gwasanaeth

salvaged. The group is determined and committed, and its work is valued in the community. It is proactive in developing support and resources.

Your statement only refers to the situation in Merthyr Tydfil and Mountain Ash. You will be aware that the new opportunities fund awarded nearly £400,000 to the Cancer Care Society to develop its services in the Rhondda. Has this also been discussed?

**Jane Hutt:** You brought this matter to my attention. Like you, I am grateful to the local organisations' health voluntary service, the local community and the local authority who have together shown their commitment to this service. Over the years, people have raised money for this charity, and I have seen what that investment can do in terms of providing important services in the community. I thank everyone involved in Mountain Ash and Merthyr Tydfil. They have been supported by Interlink, the Rhondda Cynon Taff organisation, and Voluntary Action in Merthyr.

It is also important to recognise that the Cancer Care Society had obtained a grant for nearly £400,000 from the new opportunities fund for the Rhondda. I assure you that that has been considered as part of the rescue plan. The WCVA has approached the new opportunities fund to establish whether that funding could be considered as part of the rescue plan in relation to the possibility of other organisations taking that forward.

**Huw Lewis:** Jane, I thank you for today's statement and for responding so quickly and flexibly to the concerns that Assembly Members—including myself—have raised. As you said, this is not another Children's Society incident: it is not a case of services in Wales being cut to protect services elsewhere. That does not help cancer sufferers and their families in my constituency who depend heavily on this service. The transport service and the centres are essential to them.

Our response to this situation must build on

gael ei hachub. Mae'r grŵp yn benderfynol ac yn ymrwymedig, a gwerthfawrogir ei waith yn y gymuned. Mae'n rhagweithiol wrth ddatblygu cymorth ac adnoddau.

Mae eich datganiad yn cyfeirio at y sefyllfa ym Merthyr Tudful ac Aberpennar yn unig. Gwyddoch y bu i'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd roi bron £400,000 i'r Gymdeithas Gofal Canser i ddatblygu ei gwasanaethau yn y Rhondda. A drafodwyd hynny hefyd?

**Jane Hutt:** Bu ichi dynnu fy sylw at y mater hwn. Fel chi, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i wasanaeth iechyd gwirfoddol y mudiadau lleol, y gymuned leol a'r awdurdod lleol sydd, gyda'i gilydd, wedi dangos eu hymrwymiad i'r gwasanaeth hwn. Dros y blynnyddoedd, mae pobl wedi codi arian ar gyfer yr elusen hon, ac yr wyf wedi gweld yr hyn y gall y buddsoddiad hwnnw ei wneud o ran darparu gwasanaethau pwysig yn y gymuned. Diolchaf i bawb a gymerodd ran yn Aberpennar a Merthyr Tudful. Maent wedi eu cefnogi gan Interlink, y mudiad yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, a Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Merthyr.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig cydnabod bod y Gymdeithas Gofal Canser wedi cael grant o bron £400,000 o'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd ar gyfer y Rhondda. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi bod hynny wedi'i ystyried fel rhan o'r cynllun adfer. Mae Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru wedi cysylltu â'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd i ganfod a allai'r arian hwnnw gael ei ystyried fel rhan o'r cynllun adfer o ran galluogi mudiadau eraill i ddatblygu'r gwasanaethau hynny.

**Huw Lewis:** Jane, diolch ichi am ddatganiad heddiw ac am ymateb mor gyflym a hyblyg i bryderon y mae Aelodau o'r Cynulliad—gan gynnwys fy hun—wedi eu codi. Fel y dywedasoch, nid yw hwn yn ddigwyddiad arall fel un Cymdeithas y Plant: nid yw'n fater o wasanaethau'n cael eu torri i ddiogelu gwasanaethau eraill. Nid yw hynny'n helpu'r rhai sy'n dioddef o ganser a'u teuluoedd yn fy etholaeth sy'n dibynnu'n fawr ar y gwasanaeth hwn. Mae'r gwasanaeth trafnidiaeth a'r canolfannau yn hanfodol iddynt.

Rhaid i'n hymateb i'r sefyllfa hon adeiladu ar

the expertise and the services that are already in place—I know that you acknowledge this—and find long and short-term solutions. The Children's Society is a parallel issue in the sense that it questions how we respond to such situations and specifically the decisions taken by UK-wide charities and organisations. Therefore, to add my weight to earlier comments, can we look seriously at ways in which organisations can come to us before a situation deteriorates, so that we are in a position to protect services rather than trying to produce new ones as a result of a situation such as this?

3:00 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** You brought these concerns to my attention because the Cancer Care Society has provided services in Merthyr Tydfil for longer than it has in Cynon Valley. The society works closely with Prince Charles Hospital as well as other primary care providers. The North Glamorgan NHS Trust is engaged, as well as the local health group.

We must recognise that transport services, as Christine Chapman said, are not add-ons; they are essential and are about ensuring access to treatment, often in Velindre Hospital, which is the specialist hospital for cancer sufferers. We must ensure that our partnership working is seen as a core part of our services. You also spoke of protecting the voluntary sector, which provides key services. We need to be alerted to problems. In Wales, we are able to do so with our own voluntary sector. To follow up David Melding's point, we need to take forward vigorously our relationship with the UK voluntary sector. I assure you, on behalf of the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council, and as Minister for Health and Social Services—I am sure that the First Minister will also want to take this on board—that the vulnerability of voluntary organisations with UK headquarters, as well as our partnerships with the voluntary sector in Wales, is something that we must discuss with our UK Government colleagues. There are tremendous partnerships where the voluntary sector is alive, vibrant and supported in Wales by UK organisations. Many of which,

yr arbenigedd a'r gwasanaethau sydd eisoes ar waith—gwn eich bod yn cydnabod hyn—a dod o hyd i atebion hirdymor a byrdymor. Mae mater Cymdeithas y Plant yn debyg yn yr ystyr ei fod yn cwestiynu sut yr ymatebwn i sefyllfaoedd o'r fath ac, yn benodol, y penderfyniadau a wneir gan elusennau a mudiadau ledled y DU. Felly, i gefnogi sylwadau cynharach, a allwn edrych o ddifrif ar sut y gall mudiadau ddod atom cyn i'w sefyllfa waethyg, fel y gallwn ddiogelu gwasanaethau yn hytrach na cheisio llunio rhai newydd o ganlyniad i sefyllfa fel hon?

**Jane Hutt:** Bu ichi dynnu fy sylw at y pryderon hyn oherwydd i'r Gymdeithas Gofal Canser ddarparu gwasanaethau ym Merthyr Tudful am fwy o amser nag yng Nghwm Cynon. Mae'r gymdeithas yn gweithio'n agos ag Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl yn ogystal â darparwyr gofal sylfaenol eraill. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Morgannwg yn cymryd rhan, yn ogystal â'r grŵp iechyd lleol.

Rhaid inni gydnabod nad yw gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth, fel y dywedodd Christine Chapman, yn ychwanegiadau; maent yn hanfodol ac yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod cyfle gan bawb i gael triniaeth, yn aml yn Ysbyty Felindre, sef yr ysbyty arbenigol ar gyfer y rhai sy'n dioddef o ganser. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gwelir ein gweithio mewn partneriaeth fel rhan graidd o'n gwasanaethau. Bu ichi sôn hefyd am ddiogelu'r sector gwirfoddol, sy'n darparu gwasanaethau allweddol. Rhaid inni gael rhybudd o broblemau. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn gallu gwneud hynny gyda'n sector gwirfoddol ein hunain. I ddilyn pwnt David Melding, rhaid inni ddatblygu ein perthynas â sector gwirfoddol y DU yn egniol. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi, ar ran Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol, ac fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Prif Weinidog Cymru hefyd am ystyried hyn—bod natur fregus mudiadau gwirfoddol â phencadlys yn y DU, yn ogystal â'n partneriaethau â'r sector gwirfoddol yng Nghymru, yn rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni ei draffod gyda'n cyd-aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU. Mae partneriaethau gwych lle mae'r sector

such as the National Association of Citizens Advice Bureaux and the National Children's Homes, are members of our Partnership Council and we know that there is no threat to their services.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a pharmacist and a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council.

Further to the point raised by Pauline Jarman, there is a desperate need for cancer services and the £400,000 in Rhondda. It is particularly apt at this point in time because we lost a locally provided service just two months ago. Will you give an assurance that that money will be allocated to Rhondda in any future plans?

**Jane Hutt:** That money was allocated by the new opportunities fund, Geraint. Discussions are taking place with the fund to see whether the money can be secured for communities in Rhondda.

gwirfoddol yn fyw, yn egniol ac wedi ei gynnal yng Nghymru gan fudiadau'r DU. Mae nifer o'r rhain, megis Cymdeithas Genedlaethol Canolfannau Cyngori a Chartrefi Plant Cenedlaethol, yn aelodau o'n Cyngor Partneriaeth a gwyddom nad oes bygythiad i'w gwasanaethau.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel fferyllydd ac aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Ymhellach i'r pwynt a godwyd gan Pauline Jarman, mae angen difrifol am wasanaethau canser a'r £400,000 yn y Rhondda. Mae'n briodol iawn ar yr adeg hon oherwydd inni golli gwasanaeth a ddarperir yn lleol ddeufis yn unig yn ôl. A roddwch sicrwydd y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei ddyrannu i'r Rhondda mewn unrhyw gynlluniau yn y dyfodol?

**Jane Hutt:** Dyrannwyd yr arian hwnnw gan y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd, Geraint. Mae trafodaethau'n mynd rhagddynt â'r gronfa i weld a ellir diogelu'r arian ar gyfer cymunedau yn y Rhondda.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** Before I turn to business for the next three weeks, I wish to inform Members of changes to this week's business. On Thursday my colleague, Sue Essex, will make a statement on planning, and the First Minister will make a statement on Corus. As announced in the Business Committee this morning, I have not tabled a motion for the approval of the Education Development Plans (Wales) Regulations 2002; they have been withdrawn for the time being.

The Business Committee agreed at its meeting this morning that the business for the next three weeks is as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Members will also wish to be aware that, at this morning's meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined, under Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following three Orders need not be referred to a Subject Committee: the School Organisation Proposals by the National Council for Education and Training

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cyn imi droi at y busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf, hoffwn hysbysu'r Aelodau o newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Ddydd Iau, bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, Sue Essex, yn gwneud datganiad ar gynllunio, a gwnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar Corus. Fel y cyhoeddwyd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, nid wyf wedi cyflwyno cynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Datblygu Addysg (Cymru) 2002; maent wedi'u tynnu yn ôl am y tro.

Cytunodd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn ei gyfarfod y bore yma fod y busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel ag a ddangosir ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Yn ogystal, bydd Aelodau yn falch o wybod bod y Dirprwy Lywydd, yng nghyfarfod y bore yma, wedi penderfynu, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r tri Gorchymyn canlynol at Bwyllgor Pwnc: Rheoliadau Cynigion Trefniadaeth Ysgol gan Gyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a

for Wales Regulations 2002; the Service Subsidy Agreements (Tendering) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002; and the Education Standards Grants (Wales) Regulations 2002. I will arrange for the business statement to be posted to the intranet and internet.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments on the business statement?

**David Lloyd:** Following the Minister for Assembly Business's announcement last week of a debate, in Government time, on the future of postal services in Wales, when will this debate be held? I do not see it scheduled on the Chamberweb. The Minister will be aware that this issue is vital and, doubtless, he has received, as I have, numerous letters and representations on this matter. Therefore, when are we to have this debate? The Plaid Cymru group considers this to be a vital issue, and we look forward to an announcement in next week's business statement; otherwise, we will be minded to oppose it.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Can you indicate whether or not the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning would be willing to make a statement clarifying the Government of Wales's policy on faith-based schools? On 17 January, the Minister stated:

'We do not support faith-based schools'.

That may well be the case as a statement of intent of future policy developments, but it gives the impression that the Government of Wales does not currently support the faith-based schools that exist throughout Wales. Church schools, in particular, play a significant role in educating children. They make a significant contribution to life in Wales. Many people will be extremely concerned about the Minister's statement on this, and I have received numerous representations to that effect.

**Andrew Davies:** I have made a commitment to providing time for a debate on postal services in Wales. The First Minister has discussed this matter with the Wales Trades Union Congress and the trade unions

Hyfforddiant 2002; y Rheoliadau Cytundebau Cymhorthdal Gwasanaeth (Tendro) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002; a'r Rheoliadau Grantiau Safonau Addysg (Cymru) 2002. Trefnaf i'r datganiad busnes gael ei gyhoeddi ar y fewnrwyd a'r rhyngrwyd.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

**David Lloyd:** Yn dilyn cyhoeddiad y Trefnydd yr wythnos diwethaf am ddadl, yn amser y Llywodraeth, ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau post yng Nghymru, pryd y caiff y ddadl honno ei chynnal? Ni welaf ddyddiad ar we'r Siambwr. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod y mater hwn yn hanfodol ac yn ddiau mae wedi derbyn, fel minnau, lythyron a sylwadau niferus ar y mater hwn. Felly, pryd y cynhelir y ddadl hon? Ystyria Plaid Cymru fod hwn yn fater hanfodol, ac edrychwn ymlaen at gyhoeddiad yn natganiad busnes yr wythnos nesaf; fel arall byddwn yn ystyried ei wrthwynebu.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A allwch nodi a fydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn barod i wneud datganiad yn egluro polisi Llywodraeth Cymru ar ysgolion ffydd ai peidio? Ar 17 Ionawr, dywedodd y Gweinidog:

'Ni chefnogwn ysgolion ffydd'.

Efallai fod hynny yn wir fel datganiad bwriad o ran datblygiadau polisi yn y dyfodol, ond mae'n rhoi'r argraff nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru ar hyn o bryd yn cefnogi'r ysgolion ffydd sy'n bodoli ledled Cymru. Mae ysgolion eglwysig, yn arbennig, yn chwarae rhan sylweddol wrth addysgu plant. Maent yn gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i fywyd yng Nghymru. Bydd nifer o bobl yn pryderu'n fawr am ddatganiad y Gweinidog ar hyn, ac yr wyf wedi derbyn nifer o sylwadau i'r perwyl hwnnw.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf wedi gwneud ymrwymiad i neilltuo amser ar gyfer dadl ar wasanaethau post yng Nghymru. Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi trafod y mater â Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru a'r

involved. We are keen to debate it, and I will discuss with colleagues the best time to bring that forward. I hope to do so soon.

I will discuss faith-based schools with Jane Davidson and provide Jonathan with a written or oral answer on that.

## Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Point of order. I raise this in relation to a letter from the First Minister, for which I thank him—and I have given you prior notice of this point of order, Presiding Officer. It relates to the position of the administration and the ongoing investigation into the Welsh Joint Education Council and the former Deputy First Minister. In it, the First Minister confirms that he has not been in contact with the police directly or indirectly, nor has any member of his Cabinet. Given the Minister for Assembly Business's statement—and I accept that it was not a briefing in the sense that he sought to make a statement—that we are now in the home straight, information needs to be shared with the Assembly as to where we are on this issue. To be fair to the Westminster Government, it would not proceed for six months without a Deputy Prime Minister, Minister for Economic Development, or a Chancellor. Somebody else would have been appointed. We need clarity on this from the administration, the First Minister or Minister for Assembly Business as to where we are on this important issue, particularly when news is being fed to the media and not to Members.

**The Presiding Officer:** I did not hear the Minister for Assembly Business make a statement on this matter in Plenary, therefore, it is not a matter for me. Although I understand the leader of the Welsh Conservatives' interest in pursuing it, he will have to seek other means of doing so.

**David Davies:** Further to that point of order, there has been a great deal of speculation on this matter. Would it not be in order to call on the First Minister to make a statement as to whether or not the system of government is

undebau llafur cysylltiedig. Yr ydym yn awyddus i'w trafod, a byddaf yn trafod â'm cyd-Aelodau yr amser gorau i gyflwyno hynny. Gobeithiaf wneud hynny yn fuan.

Byddaf yn trafod ysgolion ffydd â Jane Davidson ac yn rhoi ateb ar hynny i Jonathan yn ysgrifenedig neu ar lafar.

## Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn mewn perthynas â llythyr gan Brif Weinidog Cymru, y diolchaf iddo amdano—a rhoddais rybudd ymlaen llaw i chi o'r pwynt o drefn hwn, Lywydd. Mae'n ymwneud â sefyllfa'r weinyddiaeth a'r ymchwiliad parhaus i Gydbwylgor Addysg Cymru a'r cyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Ynddo, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cadarnhau na fu ef, nac unrhyw aelod o'i Gabinet, mewn cysylltiad â'r heddlu yn uniongyrchol nac yn anuniongyrchol. O ystyried datganiad y Trefnydd—a derbyniaf nad oedd yn sesiwn friffio yn yr ystyr ei fod yn ceisio gwneud datganiad—ein bod bellach yn nesáu at y diwedd, mae angen rhannu gwybodaeth â'r Cynulliad o ran ein sefyllfa ar y mater hwn. I fod yn deg â Llywodraeth San Steffan, ni fyddai'n parhau am chwe mis heb Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, na Changhellor. Byddai rhywun arall wedi cael ei benodi. Mae angen eglurhad arnom gan y weinyddiaeth, y Prif Weinidog neu'r Trefnydd i wybod beth yw'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf o ran y mater pwysig hwn, yn enwedig pan fydd newyddion yn cael ei fwydo i'r cyfryngau ac nid i Aelodau.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni chlywais y Trefnydd yn gwneud datganiad ar y mater hwn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, felly, nid yw'n fater i mi. Er fy mod yn deall diddordeb arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru wrth fynd ar y trywydd hwn, bydd yn rhaid iddo ganfod ffyrdd eraill o wneud hynny.

**David Davies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, bu llawer o ddamcaniaethu ar y mater hwn. Oni fyddai mewn trefn i alw ar y Prif Weinidog i wneud datganiad o ran pa un a yw'r system llywodraethu yn well heb

better without a Minister for Economic Development, and if so, perhaps rule out this position for future use?

**The Presiding Officer:** It is not necessary for me to call on the First Minister. He can make a statement in Plenary at any time, if he so wishes. He does not seem to be doing so at the moment, so we can move on.

The leader of the Welsh Conservatives wants to make another point of order, which may be better than the last one.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This relates to the Record of Proceedings on the higher education debate last week. First, I would like to place on record my thanks to the staff of the Record of Proceedings for putting the matter right quickly. There was an omission of a considerable piece of my speech in which I thanked the validation unit and Huw Hughes for their work in raising £2 million for the University of Wales. It was a significant omission and I thank them for their speedy action to put it right. I would also like to ensure, through you, that other Members are aware that it is as well to check these issues because staff are only human. However, I am grateful that it was put right and that I can place my thanks on record and restate the point on the important work undertaken by the University of Wales.

3:10 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am sure that that ingenious way of putting this matter on the record twice, if I may say so, has been warmly appreciated by the Record of Proceedings.

I never cease to be amazed by the quality of the parliamentary reporting and other services that are a part of the Presiding Office. It was not easy to establish a department of such quality—certainly the same quality as the one I experienced in Westminster, and sometimes even better. I think that all of us who have served in Westminster would share that view. I know that the editor has apologised to you for the omission and that the matter has been put right in the Official Record that should be

Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, ac os felly, dileu'r swydd hon efallai rhag cael ei defnyddio yn y dyfodol?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes angen i mi alw ar y Prif Weinidog. Gall wneud datganiad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn unrhyw bryd, os bydd yn dymuno gwneud hynny. Nid ymddengys ei fod yn gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd, felly gallwn symud ymlaen.

Mae arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru am wneud pwyt arall o drefn, fydd yn well efallai na'r un diwethaf.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â Chofnod y Trafodion ar y drafodaeth ar addysg uwch yr wythnos diwethaf. I ddechrau, hoffwn gofnodi fy niolch i staff Cofnod y Trafodion am unioni'r mater yn gyflym. Hepgorwyd rhan sylweddol o'm haraith lle y diolchais i'r uned ddilysu ac i Huw Hughes am eu gwaith wrth godi £2 filiwn ar gyfer Brifysgol Cymru. Yr oedd yn hepgoriad sylweddol a diolchaf iddynt am weithredu mor gyflym i'w unioni. Hoffwn sicrhau hefyd, drwyddoch chi, bod yr Aelodau eraill yn ymwybodol ei bod yn well gwirio'r materion hyn gan nad oes neb yn berffaith. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ei fod wedi'i unioni ac y gallaf gofnodi fy niolch ac ailnodi'r pwynt ar y gwaith pwysig a wneir gan Brifysgol Cymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Cofnod y Trafodion yn werthfawrogol iawn o'r ffordd gelfydd hon o gofnodi'r mater hwn ddwywaith, os caf ddweud hynny.

Caf fy synnu o hyd gan ansawdd yr adroddiadau seneddol a'r gwasanaethau eraill sy'n rhan o Swyddfa'r Llywydd. Nid oedd yn hawdd sefydlu adran o'r fath ansawdd—yn bendant o'r un ansawdd â'r un a brofais yn San Steffan, ac weithiau hyd yn oed yn well. Credaf y byddai pawb ohonom sydd wedi gweithio yn San Steffan yn rhannu'r farn honno. Gwn fod y golygydd wedi ymddiheuro i chi am yr hepgoriad ac yr unionwyd y mater yn y Cofnod Swyddogol a ddylai fod ar gael ar y fewnrwyd a'r

available on the intranet and internet as we speak.

**Peter Black:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 7.1. It relates to an e-mail that I received from your office this morning informing me that I would not be called to speak in the debate on the police later this afternoon because of my responsibilities as a Deputy Minister in that regard. I understand that that follows a ruling by you that Deputy Ministers will not be called to speak in debates on their portfolios unless it is within Government time. I object to this ruling as I consider it to be unacceptable for the Presiding Office to seek to interfere in the choice by parties of who should speak on their behalf. It should not be up to the Presiding Office to determine the nature and extent of the collective responsibility assumed by Ministers and their Deputies. That is a matter for the First Minister.

I understand that the reasoning behind the ruling is to seek to limit the time that is available to the Government. However, the guidance lays down circumstances in which collective responsibility applies and when a Deputy Minister does and does not speak on behalf of the Government. The Presiding Office should not seek to anticipate the content of speeches by Members nor assume that Deputy Ministers will take a particular line on the many occasions that they are not privy to the brief that is available to Ministers. This ruling will exclude Deputy Ministers from making contributions to debates on subjects for which they have expertise. Furthermore, paragraph 2 of the Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber states that:

'the Presiding Officer will normally, in calling Members to speak, invite representatives of each political group to speak in turn and have regard to the balance of party representation in the Assembly.'

I would be interested to know how this ruling will allow that balance to be achieved. Finally, given that we have a coalition Government, the ruling will exclude a party spokesperson from speaking in a debate when a Cabinet member is from the other party.

rhyngrywyd wrth inni siarad.

**Peter Black:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.1. Mae'n ymwneud ag e-bost a dderbyniais gan eich swyddfa y bore yma yn fy hysbysu na fyddwn yn cael fy ngalw i siarad yn y drafodaeth ar yr heddlu yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma oherwydd fy nghyfrifoldebau fel Dirprwy Weinidog yn y maes hwnnw. Deallaf fod hynny'n dilyn dyfarniad gennych chi na elwir ar Ddirprwy Weinidogion i siarad mewn dadleuon ar eu portffolios oni bai ei fod o fewn amser y Llywodraeth. Gwrthwynebaf y dyfarniad hwnnw gan fy mod yn ystyried ei fod yn annerbyniol i'r Llywydd geisio ymyrryd â dewis pleidiau ynghylch pwy ddylai siarad ar eu rhan. Nid lle Swyddfa'r Llywydd yw penderfynu ar natur a chwmpas cyfrifoldeb cyfunol a gymerir gan Weinidogion a'u Dirprwyon. Mater i'r Prif Weinidog yw hynny.

Deallaf mai ceisio cyfyngu ar yr amser sydd ar gael i'r Llywodraeth sydd y tu ôl i'r dyfarniad hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r canllawiau yn nodi amgylchiadau penodol pan mae cyfrifoldeb cyfunol yn berthnasol ac yn nodi pryd mae Dirprwy Weinidog yn siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth a phryd nad yw'n gwneud hynny. Ni ddylai Swyddfa'r Llywydd ragweld cynnwys areithiau gan yr Aelodau na thybio y bydd Dirprwy Weinidogion yn cymryd safbwyt benodol ar yr achlysuron niferus pan nad ydynt yn cael gweld y briff sydd ar gael i Weinidogion. Ni fydd y dyfarniad hwn yn caniatáu i Ddirprwy Weinidogion gyfrannu at drafodaethau ar bynciau y mae ganddynt arbenigedd arnynt. At hynny, mae paragraff 2 o'r Protocol ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambrau yn nodi:

'fe fydd [y Llywydd] fel arfer, wrth alw'r Aelodau i siarad yn gwahodd cynrychiolwyr o bob grp gwleidyddol i siarad yn eu tro gan ystyried cydbwysedd cynrychiolaeth y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad.'

Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb i wybod sut y byddai'r dyfarniad hwn yn galluogi i'r cydbwysedd hwnnw gael ei gyflawni. I gloi, o ystyried bod gennym Lywodraeth glympiaid, bydd y dyfarniad yn gwahardd llefarydd plaid rhag siarad mewn dadl pan

That will severely limit the contribution from the relevant Deputy Minister's party. The ruling will particularly disadvantage the Liberal Democrats who, with only six Members, will find that their options to contribute to debates will be limited. It will also disadvantage Labour Deputy Ministers when Liberal Democrat Ministers are speaking. It will increase the workload of other members of my group and, taken together with the current guidelines on Deputy Ministers, will make it impossible for the Liberal Democrats to support or sustain a Deputy Minister within our group for long. In that respect, this ruling is unwarranted interference with the mechanics of the coalition and I ask you to reconsider it.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Before I call Members on this point of order, I make it clear that calling Members to speak in this Chamber is entirely a matter for me, and for the Deputy Presiding Officer when he is presiding. Clearly, I have regard to decisions made by the Assembly, to Assembly guidance and to our Standing Orders because the interpretation of Standing Orders is also a part of my responsibility. I receive advice from many quarters about whom I should call to speak, not least from Members who want to be called. I also receive advice from party groups about their proposed selection of speakers. That has happened during almost every debate here. It often falls to the Deputy Presiding Officer or myself to vary that selection or to indicate that we cannot call some Members. That happened to the Plaid Cymru group last week when it was not in the interest of the balance of an hour's debate for five members of that group to be called. I cite that example because it is the most recent. While I am Presiding Officer, I will continue to ensure that all Members, whatever their status, have the same opportunity to address the Assembly.

The question of calling Deputy Ministers, whether or not they have ministerial responsibility for an issue, arose from the matter of ensuring party balance in debates. It occurred to the Deputy Presiding Officer and myself—and we received representations on

fydd aelod o'r Cabinet o'r blaidd arall. Bydd hynny'n cyfyngu'n helaeth ar gyfraniad plaid y Dirprwy Weinidog perthnasol. Bydd y dyfarniad yn rhoi'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o dan anfantais arbennig, oherwydd, gyda dim ond chwech Aelod, bydd eu hopsiynau i gyfrannu at ddadleuon yn gyfyngedig. Bydd Dirprwy Weinidogion Llafur hefyd o dan anfantais pan fydd Gweinidogion y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn siarad. Bydd yn cynyddu baich gwaith aelodau eraill fy ngrŵp ac, o'i ystyried gyda'r canllawiau presennol ar Ddirprwy Weinidogion, bydd yn ei gwneud yn amhosibl i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol gefnogi neu gadw Dirprwy Weinidog yn ein grŵp am lawer o amser. Yn y cyswllt hwnnw, mae'r dyfarniad hwn yn ymyrryd yn ddireswm â mecanwaith y glymblaid a gofynnaf i chi ei ailystyried.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cyn imi alw ar yr Aelodau ar y pwynt hwn o drefn, hoffwn egluro mai fi a'r Dirprwy Lywydd, pan fydd yn llywyddu, sydd â'r hawl i alw Aelodau i siarad yn y Siambra hon, a neb arall. Yn amlwg, yr wyf yn ystyried penderfyniadau a wneir gan y Cynulliad, canllawiau'r Cynulliad a'n Rheolau Sefydlog gan fod dehongli Rheolau Sefydlog hefyd yn rhan o'm cyfrifoldeb. Derbyniaf gyngor o sawl cyfeiriad ynghylch pwy y dylwn alw i siarad, yn enwedig gan yr Aelodau sydd am i mi alw arnynt. Hefyd derbyniaf gyngor gan grwpiau plaid ynghylch eu dewis arfaethedig o siaradwyr. Mae hynny wedi digwydd yn ystod bron pob dadl yma. Yn aml, cyfrifoldeb y Dirprwy Lywydd neu minnau fydd amrywio'r dewis hwnnw neu nodi na allwn alw ar rai Aelodau. Digwyddodd hynny i grŵp Plaid Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf pan nad oedd er budd cydbwysedd dadl a oedd yn para awr i alw ar bum aelod o'r grŵp hwnnw. Cyfeiriad at yr enghraifft honno oherwydd mai dyma'r enghraifft fwyaf diweddar. Tra fy mod yn Llywydd, byddaf yn parhau i sicrhau bod pob Aelod, beth bynnag fo'u statws, yn cael yr un cyfle i annerch y Cynulliad.

Cododd y mater o alw ar Ddirprwy Weinidogion, pa un a oes ganddynt gyfrifoldeb gweinidogol dros fater ai peidio, o'r mater o sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng y pleidiau mewn dadleuon. Trawyd y Dirprwy Lywydd a minnau—a chyflwynodd sawl

this matter from several Members—that the Government was, in effect, having additional time during debates. I have the document on the collective responsibility of Deputy Ministers before me. It states clearly that, when Deputy Ministers speak on matters within the portfolio of the Minister or Ministers whom he or she supports, they should not comment publicly on matters of policy and decision-making, other than to reinforce or expand the Minister's or Cabinet's view. Therefore, it is incontrovertible and beyond reasonable doubt, that, if a Deputy Minister speaks on a topic that is related to his or her portfolio, that can only be, according to the Cabinet's guidance, to reinforce the Government's view.

**Delyth Evans:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, fy nealltwriaeth i o'r canllawiau ynglŷn â chyfrifoldebau Dirprwy Weinidogion yw nad ydym yn gweithredu fel Dirprwy Weinidogion ond pan fydd y Gweinidog yn gofyn inni wneud hynny. Mae'n glir i mi, felly, pan drafodwn bwnc lle mae'r Gweinidog yn cynrychioli'r Llywodraeth, nad wylf yn cyflawni swyddogaeth Dirprwy Weinidog ac yr wyf yn yr un sefyllfa ag unrhyw Aelod arall ar y meinciau cefn. Byddwn, felly, yn cyfrannu at y drafodaeth honno fel Aelod ar y meinciau cefn.

Nid wylf am ffraeo â Peter Black ynglŷn â phwy fyddai'n cael ei anfanteisio fwyaf dan y drefn y soniasoch amdani, ond fel Dirprwy Weinidog ar faterion gwledig, yr amgylchedd, yr iaith Gymraeg, celfyddyd a chwaraeon, byddai'n cyfyngu'n ddifrifol ar fy ngallu i gyfrannu mewn trafodaethau ar bynciau y mae gennyr ddiddordeb mawr ynddynt. Felly, byddwn yn difaru'n fawr pe bai hynny'n cael ei benderfynu.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae arnaf ofn bod hynny wedi'i benderfynu, ac yr ydych wedi derbyn gohebiaeth ar hyn. Yn naturiol, os oes materion etholaethol neu leol, sydd o bwys mawr i chi, neu unrhyw Aelod, fel Aelod etholaeth, mae'n deg ichi dynnu sylw at hynny wrth wneud cais i siarad. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, byddwn yn gweithredu fel yr hysbyswyd chi. Mae hynny'n gyson â'r ddogfen y cyfeiriad ati yn

Aelod sylwadau ar y mater hwn—bod y Llywodraeth, mewn gwirionedd, yn cael amser ychwanegol yn ystod dadleuon. Mae'r ddogfen ar gyfrifoldeb cyfunol Dirprwy Weinidogion o'm blaen. Noda'n glir, pan fydd Dirprwy Weinidogion yn siarad ar faterion o fewn portffolio'r Gweinidog neu'r Gweinidogion y mae ef neu hi yn eu cefnogi, na ddylent wneud sylwadau'n gyhoeddus ar faterion polisi a gwneud penderfyniadau, heblaw i atgyfnerthu neu ymhelaethu ar farn y Gweinidog neu'r Cabinet. Felly, mae'n ddi-ddadl ac y tu hwnt i unrhyw amheuaeth resymol, fod Dirprwy Weinidog, pan fydd yn siarad ar bwnc sy'n ymneud â'i portffolio, ond yn gallu, yn ôl canllawiau'r Cabinet, ategu barn y Llywodraeth.

**Delyth Evans:** Further to that point of order, my understanding of the guidelines on the responsibilities of Deputy Ministers is that we only act as Deputy Ministers when the Minister asks us to do so. It is clear to me, therefore, that when we are discussing an issue where the Minister is representing the Government, I am not carrying out my function as a Deputy Minister and I am in the same position as any other backbench Member. I would, therefore, be contributing to that debate as a backbencher.

I do not wish to fall out with Peter Black over who would suffer most under the system to which you referred, but as a Deputy Minister for rural affairs, the environment, the Welsh language, the arts and sport, it would seriously limit my ability to contribute to discussions on issues in which I have a great interest. Therefore, I would very much regret such a decision.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am afraid that it has already been decided, and you have received correspondence on this. Naturally, if there are constituency or local issues that are of great import to you, or any other Member, as a constituency Member, you would be entitled to draw attention to that in requesting to speak. However, as a rule, we will follow the guidelines issued to you. That is in accordance with the document to which I

flaenorol: ni allwch wneud sylw cyhoeddus heb fod hynny'n cadarnhau neu'n ehangu barn y Gweinidog neu'r Cabinet. Felly, mae'n glir imi, wrth dderbyn cyfrifoldeb Dirprwy Weinidog, eich bod yn derbyn cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd fel rhan o'r Llywodraeth. Dyna ran o'r pris y mae'n rhaid ei dalu am ddatblygiad Llywodraeth seneddol yn y Cynulliad. Nid wyf yn beirniadu hynny, ond dyna'r anhawster a gododd cyn gynted ag y ffurfiwyd Llywodraeth glynblaid.

Yr wyf innau a'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn ceisio rhoi sylw cyfartal i grwpiau gwleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, i ateb pwynt arall Peter Black, os yw grŵp gwleidyddol yn penderfynu ymuno â grŵp neu roi cefnogaeth i'r Llywodraeth, mae pris i'w dalu am hynny. Nid yw'n dderbyniol i'r Llywodraeth siarad ddwywaith, yn enwedig mewn dadl nad yw'n parhau ond am awr. Nid wyf yn awyddus i dreulio gormod o amser ar hyn oherwydd bod gennym ddwy ddadl plaid leiafrifol, y mae hyn yn berthnasol iddynt, wedyn.

3:20 p.m.

**Peter Law:** I was amazed to hear Peter Black's challenge of your ruling. I believe it is correct, because I have 30 years' experience of how these matters are dealt with in local government. It has come about, in my opinion, because of the loose status of Deputy Ministers. Issues arise daily. The solution is simple—although there will be sadness about it on the Liberal Democrat benches, because they have a difficulty—the answer lies with Peter Black. He only needs to resign and he will be free to say what he thinks.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ar y pwynt hwn, yr wyf am ategu'r hyn a ddywedodd Peter Law: yr ydym yn parchu'n fawr eich penderfyniad ar y mater hwn. Mae'n egluro yn llawer cliriach y berthynas rhwng y Dirprwy Weinidog a'r Llywodraeth. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr pe gallich gyfyngu ymhellach ar gyfraniadau Peter Black.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni wnaf sylw ar y pwynt olaf hwnnw.

referred earlier: you cannot make a public statement unless it confirms or elaborates on the opinion of the Minister or the Cabinet. Therefore, it is clear to me that, in accepting the responsibilities of a Deputy Minister, you also accept a collective responsibility as part of the Government. That is part of the price that must be paid for the development of parliamentary Government in the Assembly. I am not criticising that, but that was the difficulty that arose as soon as a coalition Government was formed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer and I try to give equal prominence to political groups. However, in answer to Peter Black's other point, if a political group decides to join or support the Government's group, there is a price to pay for that. Allowing the Government to speak twice, particularly in a debate that only lasts an hour, would be unacceptable. I do not want to spend too much time on this because we have two minority party debates, to which this is relevant, afterwards.

**Peter Law:** Fe'm synnwyd i glywed Peter Black yn herio eich dyfarniad. Credaf ei fod yn gywir gan fod gennyl 30 mlynedd o brofiad o'r modd y cyflawnir y materion hyn mewn llywodraeth leol. Yn fy marn i, digwyddodd hyn oherwydd statws llac Dirprwy Weinidogion. Mae materion yn codi bob dydd. Maer ateb yn syml—er y bydd tristwch ar y mater ar feinciau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gan fod ganddynt anhawster—Peter Black sydd biau'r ateb. Yr unig beth sydd angen iddo ei wneud yw diswyddo a bydd yn rhydd i ddweud ei farn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** On this point, I want to reiterate what Peter Law said: we have great respect for your ruling on this matter. It throws a much clearer light on the relationship between the Deputy Minister and the Government. The majority of the Members would greatly appreciate it if you could restrict Peter Black's contributions still further.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will not comment on that last point.

**David Davies:** If the position of Deputy Minister is a serious one, which we are meant to take seriously, a Deputy Minister should be called within Government time, and your ruling is correct. If, however, his position is merely a meaningless bauble, a worthless title handed out to members of the smallest and least popular party in Wales in an attempt to make them appear more important than they are, perhaps you ought to reconsider.

**Alison Halford:** I applaud any step that you take to ensure that backbenchers have at least some say. Under the new rule of the coalition, one of the Deputy Ministers had a great deal to say. However, clearly your advisors will have advised you not only about the Freedom of Information Act 2000, but also about the Human Rights Act 1998, which gives precedence to free speech. Presumably this will not infringe upon one's capacity to speak freely on any subject, whether one is a Deputy Minister or not. Apart from that, Presiding Officer, I commend your ruling.

**David Melding:** I thank you for your impeccably argued and clear ruling, which has helped the Assembly considerably this afternoon. The idea that Deputy Ministers can somehow fade in and out of existence on the subject of their portfolio is preposterous. If they are anything more than fictional, they are definitely Deputy Ministers. The analogous positions in Parliament would be the parliamentary private secretaries, who do not speak on Government matters relating to those affairs. This administration wanted Deputy Ministers. It entered into cross-party talks to get Deputy Ministers, without underpinning them appropriately in Standing Orders. The Government needs to show a level of co-operation because the great anomaly of the role of Deputy Ministers in Committees remains. If we do not have our rights protected in Plenary, when we are here to scrutinise the Executive, we will start to turn our attention to the status of Deputy Ministers in Committees also.

**Brian Gibbons:** Can you clarify, Presiding

**David Davies:** Os yw swydd Dirprwy Weinidog yn swydd ddifrifol, y dylem ei chymryd o ddifrif, dylid galw ar Ddirprwy Weinidog o fewn amser y Llywodraeth, ac mae eich dyfarniad yn gywir. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r swydd yn oferbeth diystyr a theitl diwerth a roddir i aelodau'r blaidd leiaf a lleiaf poblogaidd yng Nghymru er mwyn ceisio gwneud iddynt ymddangos yn bwysicach nag y maent, effalai y dylech ailystyried.

**Alison Halford:** Cymeradwyaf unrhyw gam a gymerwch i sicrhau bod y rhai ar y meinciau cefn yn cael lleisio eu barn rhywfaint o leiaf. O dan reolaeth newydd y glymblaidd, yr oedd gan un o'r Dirprwy Weinidogion llawer iawn i'w ddweud. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg y bydd eich ymgynghorwyr wedi eich hysbysu nid yn unig o Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, ond hefyd o Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol 1998, sy'n rhoi blaenoriaeth i ryddid barn. Yr wyf yn cymryd na fydd hyn yn amharu ar allu person i siarad yn rhydd ar unrhyw bwnc, pa un a yw yn Ddirprwy Weinidog ai peidio. Ar wahân i hynny, Lywydd, cymeradwyaf eich dyfarniad.

**David Melding:** Diolch am eich dyfarniad clir a ddadleuwyd yn berffaith, sydd wedi helpu'r Cynulliad yn fawr y prynhawn yma. Mae'r syniad y gall Dirprwy Weinidogion rywsut ymddangos a diflannu bob yn ail ar bwnc eu portffolio yn hurt. Os ydynt yn fwy na chymeriadau ffuglennol, maent yn bendant yn Ddirprwy Weinidogion. Y swyddi cyfatebol yn y Senedd fyddai ysgrifenyddion seneddol personol, nad ydynt yn siarad ar faterion Llywodraethol sy'n ymwneud â'r materion hynny. Y weinyddiaeth hon oedd am gael Dirprwy Weinidogion. Cymerodd ran mewn sgrysiau trawsbleidiol i gael Dirprwy Weinidogion, heb roi sail briodol iddynt mewn Rheolau Sefydlog. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth dangos lefel o gydweithrediad oherwydd erys anomaledd mawr o hyd o ran Dirprwy Weinidogion mewn Pwyllgorau. Os na ddiogelir ein hawliau mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn, pan yr ydym yma i graffu ar y Weithrediaeth, byddwn yn dechrau troi ein sylw at statws Dirprwy Weinidogion mewn Pwyllgorau hefyd.

**Brian Gibbons:** A allwch egluro, Lywydd,

Officer, what were the circumstances that gave rise to this ruling? I ask that because I contacted you about speaking in a health debate a few weeks ago and you agreed that I should participate. The Deputy Presiding Officer then came to a different conclusion within 24 hours. I cannot understand what sequence of events led to that change of heart. We need transparency to understand the mechanisms of these rulings.

**The Presiding Officer:** I assure you, Brian, that the Deputy Presiding Officer never has different views to mine on these matters. We consult regularly. We have observed the difficulty of managing one-hour debates especially, and ensuring a fair balance between party groups, the Government, Government Members and the rest of the Assembly. I assure you that this has been a matter of concern to us for months. We have finally taken this decision because of the pressure on time, a pressure of which I am now conscious, because we have two hour-long debates to follow. However, I will call the Minister to speak.

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I hope to raise some points of principle. I speak not only as a Minister, but also as my party's business manager. I am in some difficulty, because in the Business Committee this morning, this matter was raised by the Deputy Presiding Officer under 'any other business', to tell us that you were intending to do this. I argued that I would like time to discuss it with the First Minister, Cabinet colleagues and my Labour group, which I did. That was my understanding. I did not realise that the ruling would be made.

I do not take issue with your ruling, but I would like to raise the issue of process. I would have thought that this matter would also have been considered in the Assembly Review of Procedures Committee. As you know, it meets tomorrow, and the major item for discussion is the final document, which includes reference to the role of Deputy Ministers when they speak.

The fundamental issue is that Deputy Ministers are not intended to be members of

beth oedd yr amgylchiadau a arweiniodd at y dyfarniad hwn? Gofynnaf hynny oherwydd cysylltais â chi ynghylch siarad mewn dadl ar iechyd ychydig wythnosau'n ôl a chytunasoch y dylwn gymryd rhan. Yna daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i gasgliad gwahanol o fewn 24 awr. Ni allaf ddeall pa gadwyn o ddigwyddiadau a arweiniodd at y newid barn hwnnw. Mae angen tryloywder arnom i ddeall mecanwaith y dyfarniadau hyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Gallaf eich sicrhau, Brian, nad yw'r Dirprwy Lywydd erioed wedi arddel barn wahanol i mi ar y materion hyn. Yr ydym yn ymgynghori'n rheolaidd. Yr ydym wedi gweld anhawster rheoli'r dadleuon un awr, yn enwedig, a sicrhau cydbwysedd teg rhwng grwpiau'r pleidiau, y Llywodraeth, Aelodau'r Llywodraeth a gweddi y Cynulliad. Gallaf eich sicrhau y bu'r mater hwn yn bryder inni am fisoeedd. Daethom i'r penderfyniad hwn o'r diwedd oherwydd y pwysau ar amser, pwysau yr wyf yn ymwybodol ohono ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd bod gennym ddwy ddadl awr yr un wedi hyn. Fodd bynnag, galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Gobeithiaf godi rhai pwyntiau o ran egwyddor. Nid fel Gweinidog yn unig yr wyf yn siarad, ond hefyd fel rheolwr busnes fy mhlaid. Yr wyf mewn cyfyng-gyngor, oherwydd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, codwyd y mater hwn gan y Dirprwy Lywydd o dan 'unrhyw fater arall', i ddweud wrthym eich bod yn bwriadu gwneud hyn. Dadleuais y byddwn yn hoffi cael mwy o amser i'w drafod gyda'r Prif Weinidog, fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet a'm grŵp Llafur, a gwneuthum hynny. Dyna a ddeellais i. Ni sylweddolais y byddai'r dyfarniad yn cael ei wneud.

Nid wyf yn dymuno anghytuno â'ch dyfarniad, ond hoffwn godi'r mater o broses. Byddwn wedi credu y byddai'r mater hwn wedi ei ystyried hefyd ym Mhwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'n cyfarfod yfory, a'r briw eitem i'w thrafod yw'r ddogfen derfynol, sy'n cynnwys cyfeiriad at rôl y Dirprwy Weinidogion pan fyddant yn siarad.

Y mater sylfaenol yw na fwriedir i Ddirprwy Weinidogion fod yn aelodau o'r Cabinet, ni

the Cabinet, they receive no extra remuneration, and do not have powers delegated to them. This is the point that the Deputy Ministers in my party group make. Deputy Ministers existed before the coalition. They are there to carry out functions on behalf of the Minister, where appropriate. On all other occasions, we believe that they should have the rights of any other Assembly Member. This ruling could be construed as constraining their rights as individual Assembly Members to represent the rights of their constituents.

I accept your ruling, but I wanted us to reflect on it beforehand. I chose not to make representations to the Business Committee this morning because I understood that the ruling would not be made. I accept your ruling, but I take issue with the process and procedure with which it was made.

**The Presiding Officer:** You can and you may—as all Members may—make representations to me at any time. As I have indicated, this ruling has arisen from our concern about the fair allocation of time. I reiterate what I have said. There is nothing in this ruling that prevents any Assembly Member—Minister or otherwise—from seeking to make representations to me about the possibility of raising an issue. For example, in the past, I have called senior Ministers from the Cabinet to speak on constituency matters involving the steel industry. I hope to continue to do so. It is important that when Members wish to raise matters of constituency interest or specific concern—which are not within their portfolio and on which they could not comment publicly—according to the guidance that I have before me, they should make it known to the Deputy Presiding Officer or myself in good time. We can then ensure that we make time available for Ministers, as we would for all Members.

The leader of the Welsh Conservatives may speak, but his must be the last contribution, otherwise the Deputy will rule against me for allowing points of order to go on for too long.

**Nick Bourne:** I am glad to make the last contribution, Llywydd. First, we are greatly

chânt unrhyw dâl ychwanegol, ac ni ddirprwyir pwerau iddynt. Dyma'r pwynt y mae'r Dirprwy Weinidogion yng ngrŵp fy mhlaid yn ei wneud. Yr oedd Dirprwy Weinidogion yn bodoli cyn y glymbiaid. Maent yno i gyflawni swyddogaethau ar ran y Gweinidog, lle y bo'n briodol. Ar bob achlysur arall, credwn y dylent gael yr un hawliau ag unrhyw Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad. Gellid dehongli'r dyfarniad hwn fel un sy'n cyfyngu ar eu hawliau fel Aelodau unigol o'r Cynulliad i gynrychioli hawliau eu hetholwyr.

Derbyniaf eich dyfarniad, ond yr oeddwn am i ni fyfyrion arno ymlaen llaw. Dewisais beidio â chyflwyno sylwadau i'r Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma gan nad oeddwn yn disgwyl i'r dyfarniad gael ei wneud. Derbyniaf eich dyfarniad, ond anghytunaf â'r broses a'r weithdrefn a ddefnyddiwyd.

**Y Llywydd:** Gallwch ac fe gewch—fel pob Aelod—gyflwyno sylwadau i mi unrhyw bryd. Fel y nodais, cododd y dyfarniad hwn o'm pryder yng hylch dyrannu amser yn deg. Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais. Nid oes unrhyw beth yn y dyfarniad hwn sy'n atal unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad—boed yn Weinidog ai peidio—rhag ceisio cyflwyno sylwadau i mi yng hylch y posiblwydd o godi mater. Er enghraifft, yn y gorffennol, yr wyf wedi galw ar uwch Weinidogion o'r Cabinet i siarad ar faterion etholaethol yn ymwneud â'r diwydiant dur. Gobeithiaf barhau i wneud hynny. Mae'n bwysig pan fydd Aelodau'n dymuno codi materion o ddiddordeb neu bryder penodol i etholwyr—nad ydynt o fewn eu portffolio ac na allant gyflwyno sylwadau arnynt yn gyhoeddus—yn ôl y canllawiau sydd o'm blaen, dylent roi gwybod i'r Dirprwy Lywydd neu minnau mewn da bryd. Yna gallwn sicrhau bod amser ar gael i'r Gweinidogion, fel y byddai ar gael i bob Aelod.

Gall arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru siarad, ond hwnnw wedyn fydd y cyfraniad olaf, neu bydd y Dirprwy yn dyfarnu yn fy erbyn am ganiatáu i bwyntiau o drefn barhau am ormod o amser.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n bleser gennyf wneud y cyfraniad olaf, Lywydd. Yn gyntaf, yr ydym

relieved that the Minister for Assembly Business accepts your ruling. However, it is extraordinary for him to state that simply because this matter is in the Assembly review of procedure, there can be no decision pending that review. I remind him of the question of titles. We spent a great deal of time on that matter in the review, only to find that the discussion had been pre-empted by a decision by the First Minister, who is a member of the review team.

On the question of Deputy Ministers, it was the First Minister's view—and he rightly consulted with other party leaders—that he wanted Deputy Ministers. Since they are Deputy Ministers, they must have ministerial responsibility. That does not prevent them from speaking on the area for which they are Deputy Ministers. That can be done by agreement with the Minister. All it means is that it is out of Government time. That is entirely proper. That is the way that it is conducted in councils and in Westminster and, frankly, I am surprised that the administration cannot see that.

**The Presiding Officer:** I think that we have exercised this sufficiently.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pwynt o drefn. Gan gyfeirio at Gyfarfod Llawn ddydd Iau diwethaf, gohiriwyd dadl bwysig ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy oherwydd diffyg amser, yn ôl y Trefnydd. Eto, yn y datganiad busnes heddiw, nid oedd cyfeiriad at aildrefnu'r ddadl. Yr oedd yn ddadl i gymeradwyo adroddiad blynnyddol datblygu cynaliadwy—nid oedd yr adroddiad wedi'i ysgrifennu ar y pryd. A all y Trefnydd ddweud wrthym pryd fydd y ddadl hon yn digwydd?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw hwn yn bwynt o drefn imi. Mae'n cyfeirio at y datganiad busnes blaenorol, a dylech fod wedi'i godi y pryd hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ceisiais wneud hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Naddo. Fel y gwyddoch, un

yn falch iawn bod y Trefnydd yn derbyn eich dyfarniad. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anarferol iddo nodi bod y mater hwn, gan ei fod yn rhan o'r adolygiad o weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad, yn un na ellir gwneud penderfyniad arno gan ei fod yn dibynnu ar yr adolygiad hwnnw. Hoffwn ei atgoffa o fater teitlau. Treuliwyd llawer o amser ar y mater hwnnw yn yr adolygiad, dim ond i ganfod bod y drafodaeth wedi'i rhagflaenu gan benderfyniad gan y Prif Weinidog, sydd ynaelod o'r tîm adolygu.

Ar fater Dirprwy Weinidogion, barn y Prif Weinidog—ac fe ymgynghorodd yn gywir ag aelodau'r pleidiau eraill—oedd ei fod am gael Dirprwy Weinidogion. Gan eu bod yn Ddirprwy Weinidogion, rhaid iddynt gael cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol. Nid yw hynny'n eu hatal rhag siarad ar y maes y maent yn Ddirprwy Weinidogion ar ei gyfer. Gellir gwneud hynny drwy gytuno â'r Gweinidog. Y cyfan y mae'n ei olygu yw ei fod y tu allan i amser y Llywodraeth. Mae hynny'n hollo iawn. Dyna'r ffordd y caiff ei weithredu mewn cynghorau ac yn San Steffan ac, a dweud y gwir, yr wyf yn synnu na all y weinyddiaeth weld hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Credaf ein bod wedi trafod digon ar hyn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Point of order. In reference to last Thursday's Plenary session, an important debate on sustainable development was postponed, according to the Minister for Assembly Business, due to time constraints. Yet, in today's business statement, there was no reference to rescheduling the debate. It was a debate to approve the annual report on sustainable development—the report had not been written at the time. Can the Minister for Assembly Business tell us when this debate will take place?

**The Presiding Officer:** This is not a point of order for me. It refers to the previous business statement, and should have been raised at that time.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I tried to do that.

**The Presiding Officer:** No. As you know,

aelod yn unig o unrhyw grŵp all godi, ac awgrymaf yn y dyfodol eich bod yn siarad â llefarydd eich grŵp i sicrhau y gofynnir y cwestiwn.

**Andrew Davies:** I know that Rhodri Glyn has difficulty in hearing but sometimes I think he also has a difficulty in reading; it is in my business statement for Tuesday, 5 February.

only one member from each group may speak, and I suggest that in future you speak to your group's spokesperson to ensure that the question is asked.

**Andrew Davies:** Gwn fod Rhodri Glyn yn cael anhawster i glywed, ond weithiau credaf ei fod hefyd yn cael anhawster i ddarllen; mae yn fy natganiad busnes ar gyfer dydd Mawrth, 5 Chwefror.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.27 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.27 p.m.*

### Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)

#### Cymunedau Diogel Safe Communities

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Andrew Davies.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

1. *yn nodi bod creu cymunedau diogel yn un o amcanion allweddol 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001';*
  2. *yn pryderu yngylch canfyddiad y cyhoedd bod troseddu ar gynnydd mewn llawer o gymunedau;*
  3. *yn galw am adolygiad o effeithiolrwydd y strategaethau presennol i fynd i'r afael â throseddu; ac*
  4. *yn credu y dylai adolygiad o'r fath ystyried a fyddai'n briodol datganoli cyfrifoldeb dros yr heddlu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. (NDM938)*
- The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Andrew Davies.
- Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose that
- the National Assembly:*
1. *notes that the creation of safe communities is a key objective in 'Plan for Wales 2001';*
  2. *is concerned at the public perception that crime in many communities is on the increase;*
  3. *calls for a review of the effectiveness of current strategies in combating crime; and*
  4. *believes that such a review should consider the appropriateness of devolving responsibilities for the police to the National Assembly. (NDM938)*

Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i gynnig y ddadl hon ar greu cymunedau diogel. Mae'n ddadl bwysig, ac mae'n amserol o ystyried y ffaith bod trafodaeth ynglŷn â phwerau'r Cynulliad ac, yn fwyaf penodol, pwerau'r Cynulliad dros blismona.

Y mae pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn gwybod am achosion lle mae etholwyr yn dioddef yn

I am pleased to propose this debate on creating safe communities. This is an important debate, and is timely in light of the ongoing discussion on the Assembly's powers and, specifically, the Assembly's powers for policing.

Every Assembly Member knows of cases where constituents suffer as a result of crime.

sgîl torcyfraith. Mae'r achosion yn dod i'n sylw, naill ai drwy lythyr, neu mewn cymhorthfa, neu ar y ffôn, ac yr wyf yn sicr bod nifer yr achosion hynny wedi cynyddu dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf.

Beth bynnag fo'r ffigurau am droseddu yn gyffredinol, canfyddiad pobl yw eu bod yn aml yn teimlo'n ddiamddiffyn, ac yn poeni eu bod yn debyg o ddioddef oherwydd torcyfraith. Mae'r nifer o droseddau difrifol yn cynyddu o hyd, er bod lleihad yng nghyfanswm troseddau. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl naill ai yn ystyried nad oes gan yr heddlu yr adnoddau i ddelio â chymaint o achosion, neu'n teimlo nad oes digon o swyddogion yr heddlu i'w gweld yn cerdded ar y strydoedd—pwyt pŵysig—ac o ganlyniad, nid ystyrir yr heddlu yn ataliad i ddrwgweithredwyr.

Dengys y ffigurau reciwtio diweddaraf i heddluoedd Cymru nad oes cymaint o gynnydd yng Nghymru ag sydd yn Lloegr. Ar gyfartaledd, yn heddluoedd Lloegr, mae 205 o swyddogion newydd yn ymuno bob blwyddyn, tra mai'r ffigur diweddaraf ar gyfer Cymru yw 148. Cyfanswm y swyddogion newydd yng Nghymru, yn y flwyddyn y mae gennym y ffigurau diweddaraf ar ei chyfer, yw 591, tra, yn yr un cyfnod, yr oedd 319 wedi ymddeol.

Yn ychwanegol, mae llai o gwnstabliaid yng Nghymru ar gyfer pob 100,000 o'r boblogaeth, ac mae'n hawdd deall, o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, rhwystredigaeth rhai o'r prif gwnstabliaid pan wneir cwynion cyson ynglŷn â nifer y swyddogion sy'n cerdded y strydoedd, pan nad yw'r adnoddau ganddynt i sicrhau cynnydd yn y niferoedd.

3:30 p.m.

**Dafydd Wigley:** A gytunwch fod rhwystredigaeth arbennig mewn llawer o'n hardaloedd gwledig, oherwydd, yn aml, nid yw pobl yn gweld heddwlas am amser hir, a bod hyn yn tanlinellu'r angen i sicrhau ein bod yn cael mynediad llawn i gronfa arbennig y Swyddfa Gartref er mwyn cael y cynnydd mwyaf posibl yn nifer yr heddweision?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cytunaf â Dafydd,

The cases come to our attention, either by letter, in surgery, or on the telephone, and I am sure that those cases have increased in number over the past few years.

Whatever the crime overall figures indicate, people's perception is that they often feel vulnerable, and worry that they are likely to suffer as a result of crime. The number of serious crimes is still rising, even though there has been a drop in the total number of crimes committed. Most people either feel that the police do not have the resources to deal with so many cases, or feel that there are not enough police officers walking the beat—an important point—and as a result, the police are not seen to be a deterrent to crime.

The recent police recruitment figures show that increases in Wales have not kept pace with England. On average, 205 new officers join the English police forces each year, while the latest figure for Wales is 148. The number of new officers in Wales, in the year for which we have the most recent figures, is 591, while in the same period, 319 retired.

In addition, there are less constables in Wales for every 100,000 of the population. Under those circumstances, it is easy to understand the frustration felt by some chief constables faced with constant complaints made about the number of officers on the beat, as they do not have the resources to ensure an increase in numbers.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Do you agree that there is particular frustration in many of our rural areas, because frequently people do not see policemen for days on end, and that this underlines the need to ensure that we receive full access to the special Home Office fund in order to get the biggest possible increase in the number of police officers?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I agree with Dafydd,

oherwydd bod y nifer a reciwtir ar gyfer yr heddlu yng Nghymru gymaint yn llai nag yng ngweddill Prydain. Yr ydym hefyd yn ymwybodol bod galwadau ar yr heddlu yn fwy nag erioed o'r blaen, ac maent yn teimlo'n rhwystredig oherwydd y diffyg adnoddau.

Ar hyn o bryd, ariennir yr heddlu yng Nghymru drwy grant uniongyrchol o'r Swyddfa Gartref, a thrwy bresept a godir gan yr awdurdodau lleol. Un ffordd o sicrhau adnoddau ychwanegol fyddai ychwanegu at y presept. Fodd bynnag, byddai'r cyhoedd yn ystyried hyn fel treth gyngor ychwanegol, a fyddai, yn naturiol, yn amhoblogaidd. Y Cynulliad ar y llaw arall, sy'n gyfrifol am ariannu cynlluniau cymunedol, a'r Cynulliad hefyd sydd yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu economaidd. Heb os, byddai creu ffyniant economaidd a chyfleusterau cymunedol o safon uchel yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar lefelau troseddu mewn nifer o gymunedau. Ond os ydym am greu cymunedau diogel, byddai'n rhaid i Llywodraeth Cymru lunio strategaeth gynhwysfawr sy'n cynnwys cyfrifoldeb dros blismona ar y naill law a chynlluniau cymunedol ar y llaw arall. Heb amheuaeth, mae rhannu cyfrifoldebau rhwng y Swyddfa Gartref, y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol yn llesteirio'r gwaith. Dyna pam ein bod, yn y cynnig hwn, yn galw am adolygiad a fyddai'n ystyried priodoldeb datganoli cyfrifoldebau dros yr heddlu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yna, gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, beth bynnag fo'i lliw gwleidyddol, lunio strategaeth ar y cyd gyda'r heddlu a'r awdurdodau lleol, sy'n gyfrifol am yrru'r cynlluniau cymunedol yn eu blaen.

Many communities in Wales feel vulnerable as a result of criminal behaviour. Whatever the statistics say, people's experiences are the same all over Wales. All of us, as Assembly Members, are aware of those experiences through our advice surgeries and through letters and telephone calls that we receive from our constituents. Members of the public do not seem to be any less concerned about crime now than they were before 1997. In other words, whatever the political hue of the UK Government, the public's attitude to crime does not change. People simply do not believe that enough is currently being done to

because the number being recruited to police forces in Wales is so much lower than in the rest of Britain. We are also aware that the demands on the police are greater than they have ever been, and that officers feel frustrated by the lack of resources.

At present, police forces in Wales are funded directly from a Home Office grant, and through a precept raised by the local authorities. One way of ensuring additional resources would be to increase that precept. However, the public would view this as an additional council tax, and that would naturally be unpopular. The Assembly, on the other hand, is responsible for financing community plans, and is also responsible for economic development. Without doubt, creating economic prosperity and high quality community resources would directly affect the levels of crime in many communities. However, if we are to create safe communities, the Government of Wales would have to draw up a comprehensive strategy which includes responsibility for policing on the one hand and community schemes on the other. Without doubt, carving up the responsibilities between the Home Office, the Assembly and local authorities hinders the work. That is why we, in this motion, call for a review to consider the appropriateness of devolving responsibilities for policing to the National Assembly. The Assembly Government, whatever its political colour, could then form a strategy with the police and local authorities, which are responsible for driving community schemes forward.

Mae llawer o gymunedau Cymru yn teimlo'n ddiamddiffyn o ganlyniad i ymddygiad troseddol. Beth bynnag a ddywed yr ystadegau, caiff pobl yr un profiadau ledled Cymru. Mae pob ohonom, fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, yn ymwybodol o'r profiadau hynny drwy ein cyngorfeidd a thrwy lythyrau a galwadau ffôn gan ein hetholwyr. Ymddengys nad yw aelodau o'r cyhoedd yn llai pryderus ynglŷn â thorchyfraith yn awr nag yr oeddent cyn 1997. Hynny yw, pa blaid bynnag sy'n ffurio Llywodraeth y DU, nid yw agwedd y cyhoedd at dorcyfraith yn newid. Ni chred pobl fod digon yn cael ei

protect their communities from crime.

Some will no doubt argue that more effective policing and stronger sentences are the answers. Others will say that we need to improve the economy of those areas where crime figures are high, and to provide communities with better leisure and cultural facilities. Neither solution on its own will provide us with proper answers. That is why our motion calls for a twin-track approach. By transferring responsibility for policing to the National Assembly, we can begin to consider a coherent and holistic approach to these issues.

We need more police officers. The figures show that the increase in police officers in Wales is less than the UK average. There are fewer constables per 100,000 of the population in Wales than in the rest of the UK.

I have never believed that heavier sentences are the only effective deterrent to crime. What we need is appropriate sentencing. However, I believe that the prospect of being caught is an effective deterrent. That is why I fully support the argument that if more police officers are seen on the streets, people feel safer and we see a reduction in crime. Consequently, if responsibility for policing is devolved to the National Assembly, the Government of Wales, whatever its political colour, could set its own targets for police numbers and ensure that our police forces have the resources to increase presence on the streets. Alison Halford has told me that she broadly supports this initiative and I am grateful to her for that. I am also grateful to Lembit Öpik for telling us that the Liberal Democrats also support our proposals. He says that policing in Wales should be controlled by the Assembly. I am sure that Peter Law and other Members will be interested in the fact that Lembit Öpik said that now his party is back in power in Wales, it is better placed to shape the future of Welsh democracy.

**Peter Black:** I am grateful for Ieuan's words of praise for Lembit Öpik's initiative in

wneud ar hyn o bryd i ddiogelu eu cymunedau rhag torcyfraith.

Bydd rhai yn ddiamau yn dadlau mai plismona mwy effeithiol a dedfrydu llymach yw'r ateb. Bydd eraill yn dweud bod angen inni wella economi'r ardaloedd hynny lle mae ffigurau troseddau'n uchel, a rhoi gwell cyfleusterau hamdden a diwylliannol i gymunedau. Ni fydd y naill ateb na'r llall ar ei ben ei hun yn rhoi'r ateb iawn inni. Dyna pam mae ein cynnig yn galw am ymagwedd ddeuol. Drwy drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros blismona i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gallwn ddechrau ystyried ymagwedd gydlynol a chyfannol tuag at y materion hyn.

Mae angen rhagor o blismyr arnom. Dengys y ffigurau fod y cynnydd yn nifer y plismyr yng Nghymru yn llai na chyfartaedd y DU. Mae llai o gwnstabliaid fesul 100,000 o'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru nag sydd yng ngweddill y DU.

Ni chredais erioed mai dedfrydu llymach yw'r unig ffordd effeithiol o atal torcyfraith. Yr hyn sydd ei angen arnom yw dedfrydu addas. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y posibl rwydd o gael eich dal yn ffordd effeithiol o atal torcyfraith. Dyna pam y cefnogaif i'r carn y ddadl bod pobl yn teimlo'n fwy diogel a bod llai o dorcyfraith os oes mwy o blismyr i'w gweld ar y stryd. O ganlyniad, os datganolir y cyfrifoldeb dros blismona i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gallai Llywodraeth Cymru, beth bynnag fo'i lliw gwleidyddol, osod ei thargedau ei hun ar gyfer nifer y plismyr a sicrhau bod gan ein heddluoedd yr adnoddau i roi mwy o blismyr ar y stryd. Dywedodd Alison Halford wrthyf ei bod yn cefnogi'r fenter hon yn gyffredinol ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddi am hynny. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar hefyd i Lembit Öpik am ddweud wrthym bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hefyd yn cefnogi ein cynigion. Dywed mai'r Cynulliad a ddylai reoli plismona yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Peter Law ac Aelodau eraill yn falch o glywed bod Lembit Öpik wedi dweud bod ei blaidd ef, gan ei bod bellach yn ôl mewn grym yng Nghymru, mewn gwell sefyllfa i lunio dyfodol democratiaeth Cymru.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ganmoliaeth Ieuan i arweiniad Lembit Öpik

seeking to amend the Police Reform Bill to delegate the responsibility for the police to the National Assembly. This motion calls for a review, Ieuan, and yet the Assembly is setting up a commission to consider its own powers, which could encompass that review. How will your review be different to that, and why are you trying to seek an additional review to the one already planned?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The commission of which you are part will not be established for a few months. The First Minister has told us that nothing will be proposed by that commission until the summer or autumn of 2004, by which time he hopes that something will be included in the Labour manifesto for 2005. That means that nothing will happen in 2005. Our review is aimed at doing something now.

I have never believed that heavier sentences are the only deterrent to crime, we also need effective policing on our streets. There is also a role for CCTV in many of our communities, particularly in high streets and large car parks. Good lighting and CCTV in some of those car parks would be an useful crime deterrent. I understand the civil liberties argument in relation to CCTV cameras but, provided that they are used properly, they can make a valuable contribution to crime reduction. They also make people feel safer and provide greater security to shops and commercial premises.

Alongside effective policing, we need to take a searching look at the Government strategies aimed at regenerating and reconstructing communities. There is no doubt that poorer communities suffer worse crime rates than more prosperous communities, and that effective economic and social policies have an important role to play in crime reduction. If this Government was committed to spreading prosperity throughout Wales, made a determined effort to close the gap between rich and poor, and was dedicated to revitalising Valley and rural communities, it would make those communities feel much safer and crime levels would fall.

wrth gyflwyno gwelliant i Fesur Diwygio'r Heddlu i ddirprwyo'r cyfrifoldeb dros yr heddlu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn galw am adolygiad, Ieuan, ac eto mae'r Cynulliad yn sefydlu comisiwn i ystyried ei bwerau ei hun, a allai gwmpasu'r adolygiad hwnnw. Sut y bydd eich adolygiad yn wahanol i hynny, a pham eich bod yn ceisio gofyn am adolygiad ychwanegol i'r un a gynlluniwyd eisoes?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ni chaiff y comisiwn yr ydych yn rhan ohono ei sefydlu am ychydig fisoeedd eto. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog wrthym na fydd y comisiwn hwnnw yn cyflwyno unrhyw gynigion tan haf neu hydref 2004 ac erbyn hynny, mae'n gobeithio y caiff rhywbeth ei gynnwys ym manifesto Llafur ar gyfer 2005. Golyga hynny na fydd dim byd yn digwydd yn 2005. Mae ein hadolygiad wedi ei anelu at wneud rhywbeth yn awr.

Ni chredais erioed mai dedfrydau llymach yw'r unig ffordd o atal torcyfraith, mae angen plismona effeithiol ar ein strydoedd hefyd. Mae rôl hefyd i deledu cylch cyfyng mewn llawer o'n cymunedau, yn arbennig ar y stryd fawr ac mewn meysydd parcio mawr. Byddai goleuadau da a theledu cylch cyfyng yn rhai o'r meysydd parcio hynny yn ffordd ddefnyddiol o atal troseddau. Deallaf y ddadl ynglŷn â hawliau sifil mewn perthynas â chamerâu teledu cylch cyfyng, ond, ar yr amod y caint eu defnyddio'n briodol, gallant wneud cyfraniad gwerthfawr tuag at ostwng lefelau troseddu. Maent hefyd yn gwneud i bobl deimlo'n fwy diogel ac yn rhoi gwell diogelwch i siopau ac adeiladau masnachol.

Ochr yn ochr â phlismona effeithiol, mae angen inni archwilio strategaethau'r Llywodraeth sydd â'r nod o adfywio ac ail-greu cymunedau. Nid oes amheuaeth bod y cymunedau tlota yn dioddef cyfraddau troseddu gwaeth na'r cymunedau mwyaf llewyrchus, a bod gan bolisiau economaidd a chymdeithasol effeithiol rôl bwysig i'w chwarae wrth leihau torcyfraith. Pe bai'r Llywodraeth hon yn ymrwymedig i ledaenu ffyniant drwy Gymru gyfan, i wneud ymdrech bendant i gau'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd, ac yn ymroddedig i adfywio cymunedau yn y Cymoedd a chefn gwlad, byddai'n gwneud i'r cymunedau

hynny deimlo'n llawer mwy diogel a byddai lefelau troseddu yn gostwng.

We also need a coherent set of policies for improving the quality of life of those who live, for example, in our Valley and rural communities. We need better community facilities, giving local people access to good quality leisure and cultural activities. We need to take a holistic approach to these issues, rather than the disjointed initiative-driven approach at which this Government excels.

The Government's response to our debate displays complacency of the worst kind. We shall vote against its amendments. It wants to put everything off; it never wants to tackle anything now, tomorrow or next week. 'Sometime never' seems to be its motto. The new excuse for not doing anything is, as Peter Black told us, the independent commission. I predict that the First Minister's stock answer to any new initiative between now and 2003 will be the independent commission. He will tell us week after week, 'Wait until the independent commission has reported'. Everything will be stored. What will it do between now and 2003? Everyone else is calling for extra powers for the National Assembly. Yesterday, the National Farmers' Union of Wales called for extra powers for the Assembly, over and above agricultural powers. Alun Pugh and David Melding have also called for more powers. What is the First Minister's answer? 'Wait for the independent commission.' I understand—

Mae angen cyfres o bolisiau cydlynol ar gyfer gwella ansawdd bywyd pobl sy'n byw, er enghraift, yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd a chefn gwlaid. Mae angen gwell cyfleusterau cymunedol arnom, gan roi cyfre i bobl leol fanteisio ar weithgareddau hamdden a diwylliannol o safon. Mae angen inni fabwysiadu ymagwedd gyfannol tuag at y materion hyn, yn hytrach na'r ymagwedd ddarniog yn seiliedig ar fentrau unigol y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn rhagori arni.

Dengys ymateb y Llywodraeth i'n dadl hunanfodlonrwydd ar ei waethaf. Pleidleisiwn yn erbyn ei gwelliannau. Mae am ohirio popeth; nid yw byth am fynd i'r afael ag unrhyw beth heddiw, yfory na'r wythnos nesaf. Ymddengys mai 'rhywbryd fyf' yw ei harwyddair. Yr esgus newydd dros beidio â gwneud unrhyw beth, fel y dywedodd Peter Black wrthym, yw'r comisiwn annibynnol. Proffwydaf mai'r comisiwn annibynnol fydd ateb parod y Prif Weinidog i unrhyw fenter newydd rhwng nawr a 2003. Bydd yn dweud wrthym wythnos ar ôl wythnos, 'Arhoswch am adroddiad y comisiwn annibynnol'. Bydd popeth ar stop. Beth fydd yn ei wneud rhwng nawr a 2003? Mae pawb arall yn galw am bwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ddoe, galwodd Undeb Cenedlaethol Ffermwyr Cymru am bwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad, yn ychwanegol at bwerau ym maes amaethyddiaeth. Galwodd Alun Pugh a David Melding hefyd am ragor o bwerau. Beth yw ateb y Prif Weinidog? 'Arhoswch am adroddiad y comisiwn annibynnol.' Deallaf—

**David Melding:** I am grateful to the leader of the opposition, but time frames are important. I have said that, if the Assembly works within its current powers and is made a success, there would be a strong, logical case for some form of primary law-making power.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank David for clarifying his position, but that clarification may be slightly different from the words that he might have used in the past.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i arweinydd yr wrthblaid, ond mae terfynau amser yn bwysig. Dywedais y byddai dadl gref, resymegol dros ryw fath o bŵer i lunio deddfwriaeth sylfaenol os bydd y Cynulliad yn gweithio o fewn ei bwerau cyfredol ac yn llwyddiant.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf i David am egluro ei safbwyt, ond efallai bod yr eglurhad hwnnw ychydig yn wahanol i'r geiriau y byddai wedi eu defnyddio yn y gorffennol.

There has been discussion within the Cabinet on transferring policing powers to the National Assembly. It will be interesting to hear the results of those discussions. I hope that the Government will not say today that everything in the garden is rosy and that, if the opposition stopped criticising, it would be alright. That kind of attitude does not wash with the people of Wales any more. I ask the Government to adopt our approach—a sensible, pragmatic and holistic approach to a topic that worries many of our constituents. The do-nothing attitude of this Government is no longer an option.

3:40 p.m.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose the following amendments in the name of Andrew Davies. Amendment 1: in point 2, add at the end of the line, '*while crime itself is decreasing*'.

I propose amendment 2. In point 3, delete '*calls for a review of*' and replace with '*should review*'.

I propose amendment 3. In point 3, at the end of the line delete '*and*' and replace with

*when research and evaluation information currently being compiled becomes available;*

I propose amendment 4. Delete point 4 and replace with:

*4. looks forward to the conclusion of the forthcoming independent commission on the powers of the National Assembly, due to be set up by the Welsh Assembly Government, particularly in regard to the appropriateness of devolving any further responsibilities for the police to the National Assembly.*

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Yet again, we are debating a motion proposed by Plaid Cymru, which, if passed, would do little for the people of Wales. If it were passed, the Assembly would call for a review

Bu trafodaeth yn y Cabinet ynglŷn â throsglwyddo pwerau plismona i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Bydd yn ddiddorol clywed canlyniadau'r trafodaethau hynny. Gobeithiaf na fydd y Llywodraeth yn dweud heddiw bod pethau'n mynd yn dda ac y byddai popeth yn iawn pe bai'r wrthblaid yn rhoi'r gorau i'w beirniadu. Nid yw ymagwedd o'r fath yn dderbyniol i bobl Cymru bellach. Gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth fabwysiadu ein hymagwedd ni—ymagwedd synhwyrol, ymarferol a chyfannol tuag at bwnc sy'n achos pryder i lawer o'n hetholwyr. Ni fydd modd i'r Llywodraeth hon barhau â'i hagwedd 'gwneud dim'.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Andrew Davies. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 2 ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y llinell, '*wrth i drosedu ei hun ostwng*'.

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ym mhwynt 3, dileu '*yn galw am adolygiad o*' a rhoi '*o'r farn y dylai adolygu*' yn ei le.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ym mhwynt 3, ar ddiwedd y llinell dileu '*ac*' a rhoi'r geiriau canlynol yn ei le

*pan fydd gwybodaeth am ymchwil a gwerthuso sy'n cael ei chasglu ar hyn o bryd ar gael;*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Dileu pwynt 4 a rhoi'r geiriau canlynol yn ei le:

*4. yn edrych ymlaen at ddiwedd y comisiwn annibynnol sydd i ddod ar bwerau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac sydd i'w sefydlu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn enwedig o ran priodoldeb datganoli cyfrifoldebau pellach am yr heddlu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Unwaith eto, yr ydym yn trafod cynnig a gynigiwyd gan Blaid Cymru a fyddai'n cyflawni braidd dim dros bobl Cymru, pe bai'n cael ei dderbyn. Pe bai'n cael ei

of the effectiveness of current crime strategy. Furthermore, the Assembly would believe that such a review should consider the appropriateness of devolving responsibilities for the police to the Assembly. Is this as hard-hitting as Plaid Cymru can get? Is this the front line of attack from the so-called, self-styled official opposition? It would appear that Plaid Cymru's leadership has not started its body-building course yet. It is about time that they started pumping iron. This motion poses no threat to the partnership Government, and Plaid Cymru poses no opposition.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones** rose—

**Michael German:** I will give way in a moment.

There is nothing constructive here either. The party that condemns the partnership Government for lack of action and for discussing too many strategies and reviews has come up with—wait for it—another review. There are no ideas before us—not a single one for combating crime—from the so-called official opposition. That is because Plaid Cymru is incapable of mounting opposition. It also appears incapable of being constructive.

In the face of a motion that makes no case for opposition, and contains no ideas for alternative policy, what are we left with? Yet again, we have a Plaid Cymru motion calling for more powers for the Assembly—or in this case, nearly calling for them. It calls for us to consider them. Is it not time—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones** rose—

**Michael German:** I will give way in a moment, when I have got to the point where I want to give way to you. Be patient for a few moments longer. Is it not time that Plaid Cymru started to make the case for more powers, rather than its usual resort of sloganising?

The Welsh Liberal Democrat position is clear. Unequivocally—[Laughter.] Our

dderbyn, byddai'r Cynulliad yn galw am adolygiad o effeithiolrwydd y strategaeth bresennol ar droseddu. At hynny, credai'r Cynulliad y dylai adolygiad o'r fath ystyried priodoldeb datganoli cyfrifoldebau am yr heddlu i'r Cynulliad. Ai Plaid Cymru ar ei gwedd fwyaf ymosodgar yw hyn? Ai dyna'r prif ymosodiad gan yr wrthblaid swyddogol hunanhonedig? Ymddengys nad yw arweinwyr Plaid Cymru wedi dechrau ar eu cwrs adeiladu'r corff eto. Mae'n bryd iddynt ddechrau paratoi eu hunain. Nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn fygythiad o gwbl i'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, ac nid yw Plaid Cymru yn cynnig unrhyw sialens.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones** a gododd—

**Michael German:** Ildiaf yn y man.

Nid oes unrhyw beth adeiladol yma ychwaith. Mae'r blaids sy'n beirniadu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth am beidio â gweithredu ac am drafod gormod o strategaethau ac adolygiadau wedi cynnig—byddwch yn barod—adolygiad arall. Nid oes unrhyw syniadau ger ein bron—dim un syniad am sut i fynd i'r afael â throseddu—oddi wrth yr wrthblaid swyddogol honedig, a'r rheswm am hynny yw nad yw Plaid Cymru yn gallu cynnig her. Ymddengys hefyd nad yw'n gallu bod yn adeiladol.

Yn wyneb cynnig nad yw'n cynnig her, ac nad yw'n cynnwys unrhyw syniadau am bolisi amgen, beth sydd gennym ar ôl? Unwaith eto, mae gennym gynnig gan Blaid Cymru sy'n galw am ragor o bwerau i'r Cynulliad—neu yn yr achos hwn, bron â galw amdanynt. Mae'n galw arnom i'w hystyried. Onid yw'n bryd—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones** a gododd—

**Michael German:** Ildiaf yn y man, pan gyrhaeddaf y pwynt lle yr wyf am ildio ichi. Byddwch yn amyneddgar am ychydig eiliadau eto. Onid yw'n bryd i Blaid Cymru ddechrau cyflwyno'r ddadl dros ragor o bwerau, yn hytrach na'i harfer o droi at sloganau?

Mae safbwyt Democrataid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn glir. Yn ddiamwys—[Chwerthin.]

policy for the Assembly is that it should be given more powers for policing in Wales. Wales will then get the police service that it needs. We could invest in front-line policing and have more bobbies on the beat. Through our proposal in the House of Commons, we could better co-ordinate the crime prevention work of the Assembly and the police.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I was listening with great care to the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats. He says that he will vote against our motion and against the Government's amended motion. If he believes so strongly in what he says, why did he not amend our motion so that we could decide how to vote on his policy?

**Michael German:** We will support the Government's amended motion because it is a good deal stronger than the consideration and deliberation that you have proposed in your motion. We want real action and not consideration and review, which is what you are proposing.

The partnership Government's good work in deprived communities through Communities First, our work on tackling drug abuse, and the additional resources given to local authorities will be all the more effective if the police service falls within our powers. That is why Welsh Liberal Democrat MPs are tabling amendments to the Police Reform Bill at Westminster. If they are supported, policing will be devolved to the Assembly. I hope that Plaid Cymru MPs will have considered the issue, and will vote for those amendments. If not, Plaid will have another chance and more time to make the case for policing powers. The partnership agreement has afforded us the opportunity to make the case with the soon-to-be-established commission on Assembly powers. That commission will have greater authority and a wider remit than Plaid Cymru's proposed review of crime policy.

The challenge today is not Plaid Cymru's review of crime, it is whether Plaid is prepared to engage with the commission on Assembly powers. Will it commit to making a constructive case for more powers? Will it

Ein polisi i'r Cynulliad yw y dylid rhoi rhagor o bwerau iddo dros blismona yng Nghymru. Yna caiff Cymru y gwasanaeth heddlu sydd ei angen arni. Gallem fuddsoddi mewn plismona rheng-flaen, a sicrhau bod mwy o blismyn yn cerdded y strydoedd. Drwy ein cynnig yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, gallem gydlynu gwaith atal troseddu'r Cynulliad a'r heddlu yn well.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gwrandewais yn astud ar arweinydd Democrataid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Dywed y bydd yn pleidleisio yn erbyn ein cynnig ac yn erbyn y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio gan y Llywodraeth. Os cred mor daer yn yr hyn a ddywed, pam na chynigiodd welliant i'n cynnig fel y gallem benderfynu sut i bleidleisio ar ei bolisi?

**Michael German:** Cefnogwn y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio gan y Llywodraeth am ei fod yn gryfach o lawer na'ch cynnig chi i ystyried a thrafod y sefyllfa. Yr ydym am gael gweithredu gwirioneddol ac nid ystyried ac arolygu'r sefyllfa, sef yr hyn a gynigir gennych chi.

Bydd gwaith da'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth mewn cymunedau difreintiedig drwy Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, ein gwaith i fynd i'r afael â chamdefnyddio cyffuriau, a'r adnoddau ychwanegol a roddir i awdurdodau lleol yn fwy effeithiol byth pe bai gennym bwerau dros yr heddlu. Dyna pam mae ASau Democrataid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cyflwyno gwelliannau i Fesur Diwygio'r Heddlu yn San Steffan. Os cefnogir hwy, caiff plismona ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf y bydd ASau Plaid Cymru wedi ystyried y mater, ac yn pleidleisio dros y gwelliannau hynny. Os na fyddant, caiff Plaid gyfle arall a mwy o amser i gyflwyno'r achos dros bwerau plismona. Mae'r cytundeb partneriaeth wedi rhoi'r cyfle inni gyflwyno'r achos i'r comisiwn arfaethedig ar bwerau'r Cynulliad. Bydd gan y comisiwn hwnnw fwy o awdurdod a chylch gwaith ehangach na'r adolygiad o'r polisi ar droseddu a gynigir gan Blaid Cymru.

Nid yr adolygiad o dorcyfraith a gynigir gan Blaid Cymru yw'r her heddiw, ond a yw Plaid Cymru yn barod i gyfrannu at waith y comisiwn ar bwerau'r Cynulliad. A fydd yn ymrwymo i gyflwyno achos adeiladol o blaidd

stop sloganising and try to win the argument? If it will, we stand a chance of building a powerful coalition of Welsh Liberal Democrats, Labour members, Plaid Cymru and even the sensible-thinking Conservatives. Together, we could win the argument.

**Janet Davies:** I declare an interest as a member of Llanharri Community Council. I will refer to community councils in my speech.

We all see the distress caused by crime in our communities. We also see the fear created by the perception of crime. It is increasingly recognised that this cannot continue, and not before time has that recognition come. Representing many Valley areas is a matter of pride for me: seeing how crime has grown in those communities is a matter of sorrow. Valley communities are a great place to live. Changing them into communities seen by everybody as a great place to live is a big challenge.

Yesterday, in the Local Government Partnership Council meeting, we heard that it is still difficult to get agencies around a table talking to each other on crime reduction, and far more difficult to get them working in harmony. The National Assembly must take a lead to do that successfully, and it should be recognised that without the National Assembly, there would be no arena for political leadership. That is not to say that it exists at the moment.

I was interested in Mike German's speech, which seemed to be remarkable for its lack of content. I was surprised it had such little content because he should have an expert knowledge of this field.

3:50 p.m.

The police have a major role in combating crime, but they will not be successful without total commitment from the community. I saw some of the efforts that were involved in that kind of commitment in Blaengarw yesterday, where I was holding a surgery. However, for people to become committed and to work in their community, they must feel safe in their

cael rhagor o bwerau? A fydd yn rhoi'r gorau i sloganau a cheisio ennill y ddadl? Os felly, bydd gennym siawns dda o adeiladu clymbiaid bwerus o Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, aelodau Llafur, Plaid Cymru a hyd yn oed y Ceidwadwyr call. Gyda'n gilydd, gallem ennill y ddadl.

**Janet Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Cymuned Llanhari. Cyfeiriaf at gynghorau cymuned yn fy arraith.

Gwelwn oll y gofid a ddaw yn sgîl torcyfraith yn ein cymunedau. Gwelwn hefyd yr ofn oherwydd canfyddiad pobl o droseddau. Cydnabyddir fwyfwy na all hyn barhau, ac yr oedd yn hen bryd i hynny gael ei gydnabod. Mae cynrychioli llawer o ardaloedd y Cymoedd yn achos balchder imi: mae gweld sut y mae torcyfraith wedi cynyddu yn y cymunedau hynny yn achos tristwch. Mae cymunedau'r Cymoedd yn lle da i fyw. Mae eu trawsnewid yn gymunedau y mae pawb yn eu hystyried yn lle da i fyw ynddo yn her fawr.

Ddoe, yng nghyfarfod Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol, clywsom ei bod yn anodd o hyd darbwyllo asiantaethau i ddod ynglyd i siarad â'i gilydd am leihau torcyfraith, ac yn anos fyth eu darbwyllo i gydweithio. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol roi arweiniad i gyflawni hynny'n llwyddiannus, a dylid cydnabod na fyddai arena ar gyfer arweiniad gwleidyddol oni bai am y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Nid yw hynny'n gyfystyr â dweud ei fod yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd.

Yr oedd diddordeb gennyf glywed arraith Mike German a oedd yn hynod oherwydd ei diffyg sylwedd. Synnais fod cyn lleied o sylwedd ynddi oherwydd dylai fod yn arbenigwr ar y maes hwn.

Mae gan yr heddlu rôl bwysig wrth fynd i'r afael â thorcifraith, ond ni fyddant yn llwyddo heb ymrwymiad llwyr y gymuned. Gwelais rai o'r ymdrechion sy'n gysylltiedig ag ymrwymiad o'r fath ym Mlaengarw ddoe, lle y cynhelais gynghorfa. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn i bobl fod yn ymrwymedig a gweithio yn eu cymuned, rhaid iddynt deimlo'n

involvement, and all the agencies working to reduce crime must understand this fear. When you remember that a high level of crime is drug related and, therefore, committed by people for irrational reasons in an irrational manner, fear is difficult to allay. People see the need for local police presence based in their own community. There were arguments against bobbies on the beat, but the idea is becoming more acceptable. However, in South Wales West, local people are asked to pay for community police officers. The police are funded from the Home Office and this Assembly and from a direct precept on council tax. Not surprisingly, the community councils—the bodies that are often asked to fund a local office—object to that change, which has to be taken out of the community council precept. Some do so reluctantly because they feel that they are over a barrel, while others say no.

In my community of Llanharry, the council has had to pay £500 in rent this year for a local police office out of the £750 that was reserved for community grants. Next year, we are likely to have to put up the precept to pay for it. In other communities such as Ogmore Vale and, I think, Maesteg, they have said that this is inequitable and, understandably, refused to do it. However, the inequitability is that some pay while others have less police presence in their communities. Devolution should be increased and police responsibility should come to the Assembly. However, devolution of funding to the community councils without any power is perhaps one step too far.

**David Davies:** I am delighted that Plaid Cymru has chosen to bring forward this matter for discussion today. The rising levels of crime and the fear that it induces are matters to which politicians should be addressing themselves. On several occasions since being elected I have sat in the back of a police car for the duration of a Friday or Saturday night shift to find out first hand the problems—[Laughter.]

**Peter Law:** You should still be there.

**David Davies:** It is a serious matter because

ddiogel wrth gyfranogi, a rhaid i bob asiantaeth sy'n gweithio i leihau torcyfraith ddeall yr ofn hwnnw. Pan gofiwch fod nifer fawr o droseddau'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau ac, felly, yn cael eu cyflawni gan bobl am resymau hurt mewn modd afresymol, mae'n anodd tawelu ofnau. Mae pobl yn gweld bod angen presenoldeb heddlu lleol yn eu cymuned eu hunain. Bu dadleuon yn erbyn plismyn ar y strydoedd, ond mae'r syniad yn dod yn fwy derbyniol. Fodd bynnag, yn y de-orllewin, gofynnir i bobl leol dalu am blismyn cymuned. Ariennir yr heddlu drwy'r Swyddfa Gartref a'r Cynulliad hwn a thrwy brescept uniongyrchol ar y dreth gyngor. Yn amlwg, mae'r cynghorau cymuned—y cyrff y gofynnir iddynt ariannu swyddfa leol yn aml—yn gwrthwynebu'r newid hwnnw, y mae'n rhaid ei dynnu o brescept y cyngor cymuned. Gwna rhai hynny yn amharod am eu bod o'r farn nad oes dewis ganddynt, tra bod eraill yn gwrthod.

Yn fy nghymuned i, sef Llanhari, bu'n rhaid i'r cyngor dalu £500 mewn rhent eleni am y swyddfa heddlu leol o'r £750 a glustnodwyd ar gyfer grantiau cymuned. Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd yn rhaid inni gynyddu'r presept i dalu amdani yn fwy na thebyg. Mewn cymunedau eraill megis Dyffryn Ogwr, a Maesteg, fe gredaf, dywedasant fod hyn yn annheg ac, wrth reswm, maent wedi gwrthod ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, yr annhegwch yw bod rhai'n talu tra bod eraill â llai o bresenoldeb gan yr heddlu yn eu cymunedau. Dylid datganoli ymhellach a dylid trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros yr heddlu i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae datganoli arian i'r cynghorau cymuned heb unrhyw bŵer yn gam rhy bell o bosibl.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch fod Plaid Cymru wedi dewis cyflwyno'r mater hwn i'w draffod heddiw. Mae'r troseddu cynyddol a'r ofn a bair hynny yn faterion y dylai gwleidyddion eu hystyried. Sawl gwaith ers imi gael fy ethol, yr wyf wedi eistedd yng nghefn car heddlu yn ystod sifft nos Wener neu nos Sadwrn i weld drososf fy hun beth yw'r problemau—[Chwerthin.]

**Peter Law:** Dylech fod yno o hyd.

**David Davies:** Mae'n fater difrifol am ei bod

it is a way of finding out first hand the problems and dangers faced by police officers. I would recommend that those Assembly Members who find that funny should try it out for themselves. However, although Plaid Cymru has identified some of the problems—it has talked about more resources, more police officers on the beat, CCTV, which are all perfectly sensible solutions—it has still gone for the easy panacea of calling for more powers. It has failed to understand that changing the management of the police will not solve the problem. Levels of crime, particularly violent crime, are at an unacceptably high level. They are so—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Are you suggesting that changing the management of the police would not change levels of crime? Are you suggesting that policing does not have anything to do with levels of crime? Plaid Cymru believes in co-ordinating the community approaches, for which this Assembly is responsible, with policing. How the police service is managed is central to dealing with and deterring crime.

**David Davies:** Changing whether or not the police are answering to the Home Office in London or to the National Assembly in Cardiff will not make a great deal of difference to how much money goes into the police force or how many officers there are on the beat. Persistent criminality is a pattern of behaviour that usually begins at an early age, often before the child reaches teenage years. There may be several reasons for that. Some people have already drawn a link between crime and poverty, but it is more closely linked to the attitude of parents or as is usually the case, a parent. If the parent or parents take no interest in the child and do not impose a certain level of discipline, then that child will already be off to a bad start. The problem worsens in schools. Teachers have had their hands tied for years when it comes to maintaining order in the classroom. It is becoming harder to impose any disciplinary sanctions that will alter a child's pattern of behaviour. The liberal tendency spend a great deal of time fretting about the effect of harsh discipline on one child who may come from a broken home. However, they do not seem to realise that allowing an

yn ffordd o ganfod drosoch eich hun y problemau a'r peryglon a wyneba plismyn. Argymhellaf y dylai'r Aelodau Cynulliad hynny sy'n credu ei bod yn ddoniol roi cynnig arni. Fodd bynnag, er bod Plaid Cymru wedi nodi rhai o'r problemau—soniodd am ragor o adnoddau, rhagor o heddweision ar y strydoedd, teledu cylch cyfyng, sydd oll yn atebion cwbl synhwyrol—serch hynny mynnodd yr ateb hawdd sef galw am ragor o bwerau. Nid yw wedi deall na fydd newid y ffordd y caiff yr heddlu ei reoli yn datrys y broblem. Mae'r lefelau o droseddu, yn arbennig troseddau treisgar, yn annerbyniol o uchel. Maent mor—

**Helen Mary Jones:** A ydych yn awgrymu na fyddai newid y ffordd y caiff yr heddlu ei reoli yn newid lefelau o droseddu? A awgrymwch nad oes cyswllt rhwng plismona a lefelau o droseddu? Cred Plaid Cymru mewn cydgysylltu'r polisiau cymunedol, y mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn gyfrifol amdanynt, gyda phlismona. Mae'r ffordd y caiff yr heddlu ei reoli yn hanfodol i ymdrin â thorcyfraith a'i atal.

**David Davies:** Ni fydd newid pa un a yw'r heddlu yn atebol i'r Swyddfa Gartref yn Llundain ynteu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yng Nghaerdydd, yn gwneud llawer o wahaniaeth i faint o arian a roddir i'r heddlu neu faint o blismyn sydd ar y strydoedd. Mae troseddu cyson yn batrwm o ymddygiad sydd fel arfer yn dechrau pan fo plentyn yn ifanc, yn aml cyn i'r plentyn gyrraedd ei arddegau. Mae'n bosibl bod nifer o resymau dros hynny. Mae rhai pobl eisoes wedi gwneud cyswllt rhwng trosedd a thlodi, ond mae'n ymwneud yn fwy ag ymagwedd y rhieni neu fel arfer, y rhiant. Os nad yw'r rhiant neu'r rheini yn cymryd diddordeb yn y plentyn ac os nad ydynt yn ei ddisgyblu i ryw raddau, yna bydd y plentyn hwnnw wedi cael dechrau gwael yn barod. Bydd y broblem yn gwaethyg yn yr ysgol. Clymwyd dwylo'r athrawon ers blynnyddoedd o ran cadw trefn yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Mae'n dod yn anos cosbi plentyn mewn modd a fydd yn newid y ffordd y mae'n ymddwyn. Mae'r adain ryddfrydig yn treulio llawer o'u hamser yn poeni am yr effaith a gâi disgyblaeth lem ar un plentyn sy'n dod o gartref a chwalwyd o bosib. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys nad ydynt yn sylweddoli bod

unruly child to run wild means that in the short term, he—and it usually is a he—is free to abuse other children and leave them mentally, or in some case physically, scarred. That is the tale of day to day life in many state schools throughout the country.

gadael i blentyn afreolus dyfu'n wylt yn golygu bod pob rhyddid ganddo ef yn y byrdymor—ac ef ydyw fel arfer—i gam-drin plant eraill ac achosi creithiau meddyliol, neu mewn rhai achosion, greithiau corfforol. Dyna batrwm bywyd beunyddiol mewn llawer o ysgolion y wladwriaeth ledled y wlad.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** David, you might want to reconsider some of your statements, particularly the last reference you made to state schools. Are you suggesting that it is only children from state schools who commit crime? The facts do not back that up. More seriously, you referred to crime being directly linked to bad parenting. Perhaps when you are a parent you will reconsider that statement. Some excellent parents have had the misfortune of seeing their children, for various reasons, breaking the law. Those parents have been traumatised and suffered greatly because of that—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** David, efallai yr hoffech ailystyried rhai o'ch datganiadau, yn enwedig eich cyfeiriad olaf at ysgolion y wladwriaeth. A awgrymwch mai dim ond plant o ysgolion y wladwriaeth sy'n cyflawni troseddau? Nid yw'r ffeithiau yn ategu hynny. Ar nodyn mwy difrifol, cyfeiriasoch at gyswllt uniongyrchol rhwng torcyfraith a bod yn rhieni gwael. Pan fyddwch chi yn rhiant efallai y byddwch yn ailystyried y datganiad hwnnw. Mae rhai rhieni ardderchog wedi cael yr anffawd o weld eu plant, am amryw resymau, yn torri'r gyfraith. Dioddefodd y rhieni hynny drawma a gofid mawr o'r herwydd—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is supposed to be an intervention, not a speech.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymyriad nid arraith ddylai hyn fod.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you reconsider that particular statement? It was open and general, and a condemnation of many good parents in Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnewch ailystyried y datganiad hwnnw? Yr oedd yn benagored, yn cyffredinoli, ac yn feirniadaeth ar nifer fawr o rieni da yng Nghymru.

**David Davies:** I made the point about state schools because I went to one. I saw at first hand that a lack of discipline led to children being attacked by pupils who were not kept under control. The situation is not seen to the same extent in the independent sector. I cannot say that for certain, because I did not go to an independent school, but I am talking from my own experience. As far as parenting is concerned, I do not accept that I cannot talk about it because I am not a parent. Bad parenting is central to the argument and you do not have to be a parent to realise that.

**David Davies:** Gwneuthum y pwyt ynglŷn ag ysgolion y wladwriaeth am imi fynychu un. Gwelais fy hun fod diffyg disgynblaeth yn arwain at ymosodiadau ar blant gan ddisgyblion nad oeddent o dan reolaeth. Nid yw'r sefyllfa yn digwydd i'r un graddau yn y sector annibynnol. Ni allaf fod yn sicr ynglŷn â hynny, am na fynychais ysgol annibynnol, ond siarad yr wyf o'm profiad fy hun. O ran magu plant, ni dderbyniaf na allaf siarad am y pwnc am nad wyf yn rhiant. Mae bod yn rhieni gwael yn ganolog i'r ddadl ac nid oes rhaid ichi fod yn rhiant i sylweddoli hynny.

When laws are transgressed, it takes a long time before youths who are out of control end up in custody. By then, it is often too late to save them. Even when people are kept in custody, the system often hampers the effectiveness of youth homes. I spoke to someone recently who has worked for years

Pan dorir y gyfraith, mae'n cymryd amser hir cyn i ieuenciad sy'n afreolus fod yn y ddalfa. Mae'n rhy hwyr yn aml i'w harbed erbyn hynny. Hyd yn oed pan gaiff pobl eu cadw yn y ddalfa, yn aml mae'r system yn llesteirio effeithiolrwydd cartrefi ieuenciad. Siaradais â rhywun yn ddiweddar a fu'n

in a south Wales child centre—somewhere where people are sent before they go to borstal or prison—who said that one problem is that they have no sanction over people in that facility. Ten years ago, if people had a meal, they were expected to wash up. Now they just sit back, say they are not doing it and there is nothing that can be done about it. It may only be a small point, but it shows how little control we have over people.

We may believe that wrongdoers start out on the path of crime through no fault of their own. However, we do them no favours by going soft on them and making it easy to stay on that path. We should remember why so many children are brought up in homes where there is no sense of discipline. Most people would agree that bad parenting plays a part. Perhaps you, Rhodri, are slightly embarrassed to admit that over the last 40 years, successive Governments and other powerful institutions have undermined fundamental Christian values that have served us well for centuries. We have undermined the institution of the family and the church. We send out a message from the Assembly Government that it is perfectly alright for teenage girls to have several children, by different fathers, whom they will bring up by themselves, and we wonder why crime and criminality is on the increase—

gweithio am flynyddoedd mewn canolfan plant yn y de—lle yr anfonir pobl cyn iddynt fynd i ysgol borstal neu garchar. Dywedodd mai un broblem yw nad oes ganddynt unrhyw awdurdod dros y bobl yn y cyfleuster hwnnw. Ddeng mlynedd yn ôl, os cafodd pobl bryd o fwyd, yr oedd disgwyl iddynt olchi'r llestri. Erbyn hyn maent yn eistedd yn ôl, dweud nad ydynt yn mynd i wneud hynny ac nid oes dim byd y gellir ei wneud ynglŷn ag ef. Efallai mai pwyt Bach ydyw, ond dengys cyn lleied o reolaeth sydd gennym dros bobl.

Efallai y credwn fod y rhai sy'n tramgwyddo yn dechrau troseddu heb fod bai arnynt hwy. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn gwneud cymwynas â hwy drwy eu trin yn garedig a'i gwneud yn hawdd iddynt barhau i droseddu. Dylem gofio pam mae cymaint o blant yn cael eu magu mewn cartrefi heb ddisgyblaeth. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn cytuno bod cael rhieni gwael yn chwarae rhan. Efallai eich bod chi, Rhodri, yn teimlo rhywfaint o gywilydd i gyfaddef bod y naill Lywodraeth ar ôl y llall dros y 40 mlynedd diwethaf ynghyd â sefydliadau pwerus eraill wedi tanseilio gwerthoedd Cristnogol hanfodol sydd wedi ein gwasanaethu'n dda ers canrifoedd. Yr ydym wedi tanseilio sefydliad y teulu a'r eglwys. Anfonwn neges oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ei bod yn gwbl dderbyniol i ferched yn eu harddegau roi genedigaeth i sawl plentyn, â gwahanol dadau, y byddant yn eu magu eu hunain, a rhyfeddwon fod troseddu ac ymddygiad troseddol ar gynnydd—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is up.

**David Davies:** If we are serious about tackling crime and helping the victims of crime, let us get tough on the causes of crime. The issue of whether or not the police are answering to the National Assembly or to the Home Office does not cause crime. Crime begins with a child who is brought up in a home without love, educated in a school without discipline and treated leniently by the authorities who finally have to incarcerate him.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'ch amser ar ben.

**David Davies:** Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â mynd i'r afael â throseddu a helpu dioddefwyr trosedduau, gadewch inni fod yn llym gyda'r rhesymau dros droseddu. Nid yw'r mater pa un a yw'r heddlu yn atebol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ynteu'r Swyddfa Gartref yn arwain at droseddu. Mae troseddu yn dechrau gyda phlentyn a feir mewn cartref heb gariad, wedi'i addysgu mewn ysgol heb ddisgyblaeth ac wedi'i drin yn drugarog gan yr awdurdodau a fydd yn gorfod ei garcharu yn y pen draw.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon

Borough Council. I am disappointed in David's comments. He mentioned love but showed little compassion in his speech today.

Community safety has traditionally been viewed as the personal safety of individuals and their property. There are excellent schemes throughout Wales to provide these services to individuals. In Rhondda Cynon Taff, projects such as Protect and Safer Homes this Winter, have provided door locks, chains and security peep-holes that have undoubtedly improved the security of vulnerable people in their own homes. Community safety must be viewed on a wider basis than just personal safety. The safer communities we aim to create depend on policies that affect the community as a whole. A major cause of crime—perhaps the main one, David—is poverty. It is no coincidence that the fear of crime is most prominent in our poorest communities—

Taf. Yr wyf yn siomedig gyda sylwadau David. Soniodd am gariad, ond ni ddangosodd fawr o dosturi yn ei arraith heddiw.

Yn draddodiadol ystyriwyd diogelwch cymunedol fel diogelwch personol yr unigolyn a'i eiddo. Mae cynlluniau rhagorol ar waith ledled Cymru i ddarparu'r gwasanaethu hyn i unigolion. Yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, mae prosiectau megis Protect a Safer Homes this Winter, a ddarparodd gloeon, cadwyni a chipdyllau diogelwch ar gyfer drysau, yn ddiau wedi gwella diogelwch pobl ddiamddiffyn yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Rhaid ystyried diogelwch cymunedol o safbwyt ehangach na diogelwch personol yn unig. Mae'r cymunedau mwy diogel yr ydym yn anelu at eu creu yn dibynnu ar bolisiau sy'n effeithio ar y gymuned gyfan. Un o'r prif resymau dros droseddu—ac efallai y prif reswm, David—yw tlodi. Nid cyd-ddigwyddiad ydyw mai yn ein cymunedau tlotaf y mae ofn troseddau fwyaf amlwg—

4:00 p.m.

**David Davies:** Are you suggesting that simply because someone is poorer, he or she will become a criminal? I do not accept that at all.

**Geraint Davies:** Criminality has nothing to do with parents either. You are singling out single parents, but many of them do a tremendous job in bringing up their children and you are condemning them. This fear, to which we refer as the perception of crime in our motion, has intensified over the last two decades. The gap between the affluent and the deprived in our communities has widened. A consequence of the shift from manufacturing to service industries has been a steady drift of able populations away from old industrial areas in search of jobs, and away from deprived estates and urban neighbourhoods in search of better homes in safer suburbs. That exodus has increased the concentration of disadvantage and social exclusion in already deprived neighbourhoods. If we are to tackle the causes of crime in sustainably and systematically, we must introduce a package of measures that addresses the problems

**David Davies:** A awgrymwch y bydd rhywun yn dechrau troseddu dim ond am ei fod yn dlawd? Ni dderbyniaf hynny o gwbl.

**Geraint Davies:** Nid oes unrhyw gyswllt rhwng ymddygiad troseddol a rhieni ychwaith. Yr ydych yn cyfeirio at rieni sengl yn benodol, ond mae llawer ohonynt yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog wrth fagu eu plant ac yr ydych chi'n eu beirniadu. Mae'r ofn hwn, y cyfeiriwyd ato yn ein cynnig fel canfyddiad o droseddu, wedi dwysau yn ystod y ddau ddegawd diwethaf. Mae'r bwlch rhwng pobl gyfforddus eu byd a phobl ddifreintiedig yn ein cymunedau wedi mynd yn fwy. Un o ganlyniadau'r newid o weithgynhyrchu i ddiwydiannau gwasanaeth yw'r llif cyson o bobl fedrus o'r hen ardaloedd diwydiannol i chwilio am waith, ac o'r ystadau difreintiedig a'r ardaloedd trefol i chwilio am gartrefi gwell mewn maestrefi mwy diogel. Mae'r llif hwnnw wedi arwain at grynhoad o amddifadedd ac allgáu cymdeithasol o fewn cymdogaethau sydd eisoes yn ddifreintiedig. Er mwyn inni fynd i'r afael â'r rhesymau dros droseddu mewn

related to housing, education, employment and transport in our poorest communities. Solving crime in our most deprived communities is not just about locks and bolts, it is about community development that increases the capacity of the community itself to rise out of poverty. The Assembly Government must make more of an effort to listen to the concerns of our deprived communities. For example, how does it propose to rehabilitate convicted criminals back into the community? Will the Government provide training to job centre staff to help them address the re-employment problems faced by convicted criminals?

The greatest concern is drug abuse and its close relationship with crime. It has been estimated that 90 per cent of burglaries in the Valleys are drug-related. Tragically, when addicts wish to break away from their addiction, due to lack of resources, there is often a six-month, or longer, wait for a place on a detoxification programme. That is totally unsatisfactory. It is not surprising that the results of the detoxification programme are so disappointing. Therefore, the addict's life of crime continues to the detriment of the addict and the community.

Improving community safety is important—perhaps the most important factor in improving the quality of life in our communities. Much has been made of the impact that Communities First will have on our deprived communities. We need assurances from the Government that that funding will be used to examine ways of lifting people out of the cycle of crime by improving essential support structures in our most deprived communities.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I am pleased to have the opportunity to support, in particular, amendments 2 and 3. I will comment on the effectiveness of the current strategy in the Neath Port Talbot area, and I agree that the creation of safe communities is a key objective in the 'Plan for Wales'.

I am glad that the Assembly will be

modd cynaliadwy a systematig, rhaid inni gyflwyno pecyn o fesurau sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â thai, addysg, cyflogaeth a thrafnidiaeth yn ein cymunedau tloaf. Nid yw atal torcyfraith yn ein cymunedau difreintiedig yn ymwneud â gosod cloeon a byllt yn unig, mae'n ymwneud â datblygiad cymunedol sy'n gwella gallu'r gymuned ei hun i ddianc rhag tlodi. Rhaid i Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wneud mwy o ymdrech i wrando ar bryderon ein cymunedau difreintiedig. Er enghraifft, sut y mae'n bwriadu adsefydlu troseddwyr a gollfarnwyd yn ôl i'r gymuned? A fydd y Llywodraeth yn darparu hyfforddiant i staff y canolfannau gwaith i'w helpu i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau a wyneba troseddwyr a gollfarnwyd wrth chwilio am waith eto?

Y pryder mwyaf yw camddefnyddio cyffuriau a'i berthynas agos â throseddu. Amcangyfrifwyd bod 90 y cant o fwrgleriaethau yn y Cymoedd yn gysylltiedig â chyffuriau. Y trueni yw pan fo pobl sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau am ddod yn rhydd ohonynt, yn aml rhaid iddynt aros am chwe mis, neu fwy, am le ar raglen ddadwenwyno, oherwydd prinder adnoddau. Mae hynny'n gwbl anfoddhaol. Nid oes ryfedd bod canlyniadau'r rhaglen ddadwenwyno mor siomedig. Felly, mae ymddygiad troseddol yr unigolyn sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau yn parhau er drwg i'r unigolyn a'r gymuned.

Mae gwella diogelwch cymunedol yn bwysig—efallai'r ffactor pwysicaf i wella ansawdd bywyd yn ein cymunedau. Bu cryn sôn am effaith Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf ar ein cymunedau difreintiedig. Mae'n rhaid inni gael sicrwydd gan y Llywodraeth y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei ddefnyddio i ystyried sut y gellir rhyddhau pobl o gylch troseddu drwy wella strwythurau cynnal hanfodol yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i gefnogi gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn arbennig. Gwnaf sylwadau ar effeithiolrwydd y strategaeth bresennol yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot, a chytunaf fod creu cymunedau diogel yn amcan allweddol yn y 'Cynllun i Gymru'.

Yr wyf yn falch mai'r Cynulliad a fydd yn

responsible for crime prevention. As you are aware, one of the priorities outlined in 'Betterwales.com' is to help people, particularly those in disadvantaged areas, to develop confident communities that are non-threatening and free from crime. This initiative took a step forward in August 2000, when the police and Neath Port Talbot local authority set up a procedure, which will hopefully cut down on crime and anti-social behaviour in the county borough.

The Crime and Disorder Act 1998 gives the police and local authorities the lead on crime and disorder and there is a good relationship between these two agencies in Neath Port Talbot. The council's crime and disorder team is based in Port Talbot police station to facilitate the practical projects undertaken by both. Neath Port Talbot is the only area in Wales, to date, where police and council staff are based together full-time. The partnership has members from both the statutory and voluntary agencies. These members are closely involved. The group has a budget and community groups can apply for grants to initiate schemes for young people. Charitable groups may also apply for grants to support them in their work in addressing crime. Furthermore, the partnership's effectiveness can be highlighted in the matter of domestic violence. Last year, the domestic violence forum commissioned a research paper on the existing level of service to victims in Neath Port Talbot. The police, the crime and disorder policy development group, and the local health group jointly funded the work. The research's outcome led to a bid under the Communities First programme for victims of domestic violence in Neath Port Talbot. This was the only successful bid in Wales. The first meetings have been held with the service users and the appropriate agencies to improve the services offered.

The vehicle arson initiative is another good example of the effectiveness of partnership between the police, the fire service and the council. The group has an information

gyfrifol am atal troseddau. Fel y gwyddoch, un o'r blaenoriaethau a nodwyd yn 'Gwellcymru.com' yw helpu pobl, yn enwedig y rhai mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, i feithrin cymunedau hyderus, anfygythiol sy'n rhydd o dorcyfraith. Aeth y bwriad hwn gam ymlaen ym mis Awst 2000, pan sefydlodd yr heddlu ac awdurdod lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot weithdrefn, a fydd, gobeithio, yn lleihau torcyfraith ac ymddygiad gwrrh-gymdeithasol o fewn y fwrdeistref sirol.

Mae Deddf Troseddu ac Anhrefn 1998 yn rhoi'r arweiniad ar drosedd ac anhrefn yn nwyo'r heddlu ac awdurdodau lleol ac mae perthynas dda rhwng y ddwy asiantaeth hyn yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Lleolir tîm troseddu ac anhrefn y cyngor yng ngorsaf yr heddlu ym Mhort Talbot er mwyn hwyluso'r prosiectau ymarferol a wneir gan y dda. Castell-nedd Port Talbot yw'r unig ardal yng Nghymru, hyd yma, lle mae'r heddlu a staff y cyngor yn gweithio yn yr un lleoliad yn llawn amser. Mae'r bartneriaeth yn cynnwys aelodau o'r asiantaethau statudol a'r asiantaethau gwirfoddol. Mae'r aelodau yn cydweithio'n agos. Mae gan y grŵp gyllideb a gall grwpiau cymunedol wneud cais am grant i ddechrau cynlluniau ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Gall grwpiau elusennol wneud cais am grantiau hefyd i'w cefnogi yn eu gwaith o fynd i'r afael â throseddu. Ymhellach, gellir tanlinellu effeithiolrwydd y bartneriaeth drwy ei gwaith ym maes traïs yn y cartref. Y llynedd, comisiynodd y fforwm ar drais yn y cartref bapur ymchwil ar lefel bresennol y gwasanaeth a roddir i ddioddefwyr yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Ariannwyd y gwaith ar y cyd gan yr heddlu, y grŵp datblygu polisiau troseddu ac anhrefn, a'r grŵp iechyd lleol. O ganlyniad i'r ymchwil gwnaethpwyd cais o dan y rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf dros bobl sy'n dioddef traïs yn y cartref yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Hwn oedd yr unig gais llwyddiannus o'i fath yng Nghymru. Cynhaliwyd y cyfarfodydd cyntaf gyda defnyddwyr y gwasanaeth a'r asiantaethau priodol i wella'r gwasanaethau a gynigir.

Mae menter llosgi ceir yn fwriadol yn engraifft dda arall o effeithiolrwydd y bartneriaeth rhwng yr heddlu, y gwasanaeth Tân a'r cyngor. Mae protocol gan y grŵp ar

sharing protocol that allows it to exchange information quickly. That means that abandoned vehicles can be removed within 24 hours. However, it is regrettable that the fire service was not a statutory partner from the outset.

I warmly congratulate the crime prevention partnership in Neath Port Talbot and I am sure that there are other excellent examples of good practice throughout Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will call the Minister to respond at 4:15 p.m. Not every Member will be called to speak, unless the speeches are short. I shall certainly call on Plaid Cymru Members to speak but I have a long list from the other parties. I appeal for short speeches.

**Ann Jones:** For many of my constituents, like others, criminal and anti-social behaviour is a reality. That is not to say that our efforts to tackle crime are failing. I do not believe that they are. All the police forces are doing a good job. We have seen recorded crime fall over recent years, which must be attributable to the additional investment from the Home Office crime fighting fund for more police officers and the dedication of our police officers throughout the country.

Last year, police numbers in my own force area, north Wales, reached record levels. Last week, we saw the latest batch of recruits on the streets of north Wales. Sadly, those recruits did not include me, even after my insight into the work of local police on a night shift. Yes, David, I joined a police night shift, but I did not sit in their patrol car. I walked the streets with the police and I saw and heard what they put up with. Just before Christmas, complete with several layers of warm clothing, I patrolled the streets of Rhyl—and I want no comments about me being on the streets of Rhyl. I saw the range of situations that my local police face on a typical Saturday night. In a small area, Rhyl has the highest concentration of nightclubs in the UK and I saw how the police deal with that. Their new high-visibility policing—and not just the colour of their jackets that somebody accused me of being impressed with—along with new technology use, such

rannu gwybodaeth sy'n ei alluogi i gyfnewid gwybodaeth yn gyflym. Golyga hynny y gellir symud cerbydau sydd wedi'u gadael o fewn 24 awr. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anffodus nad oedd y gwasanaeth tân yn bartner statudol o'r dechrau.

Llongyfarchaf y bartneriaeth atal troseddau yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod enghreifftiau ardderchog eraill o arfer da ledled Cymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb am 4.15 p.m. Ni fyddaf yn galw ar bob Aelod i siarad, oni fydd yr areithiau'n fyr. Yn sicr galwaf ar Aelodau Plaid Cymru i siarad ond mae gennyl restr hir gan y pleidiau eraill. Apelias arnoch i siarad yn gryno.

**Ann Jones:** I lawer o'm hetholwyr, fel eraill, mae ymddygiad troseddol a gwrt-hymdeithasol yn realiti. Nid yw hynny yn golygu bod ein hymdrehion i fynd i'r afael â throseddu yn methu. Ni chredaf eu bod yn methu. Mae pob heddlu yn gwneud gwaith da. Mae nifer y troseddau a gofnodwyd wedi gostwng dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. Rhaid priodoli hynny i'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol drwy gronfa ymladd troseddu'r Swyddfa Gartref er mwyn cael mwy o blismyn ac i ymroddiad ein plismyn ar draws y wlad.

Yn fy ardal heddlu i, gogledd Cymru, cyflogwyd y nifer fwyaf erioed o blismyn y llynedd. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gwelsom y grŵp diweddaraf o blismyn newydd ar y strydoedd yn y gogledd. Yn anffodus, nid oeddwn yn eu plith, hyd yn oed ar ôl imi arsylwi ar waith yr heddlu lleol ar sifft nos. Do, David, ymunais â sifft nos yr heddlu, ond nid eisteddais yn eu car patrôl. Cerddais y strydoedd gyda'r heddlu a gwelais a chlywed yr hyn y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei oddef. Ychydig cyn y Nadolig, a minnau â sawl haen o ddillad cynnes amdanaf, cerddais y strydoedd yn y Rhyl—ac nid wyf am glywed unrhyw sylwadau amdanaf yn cerdded strydoedd y Rhyl. Gwelais amrywiaeth o sefyllfaoedd y mae'r heddlu lleol yn eu hwynebu ar nos Sadwrn arferol. Mewn ardal fach, mae gan y Rhyl y nifer fwyaf o glybiau nos yn y DU a gwelais sut y mae'r heddlu yn delio â hynny. Ymddengys fod y math newydd o blismona amlwg a fabwysiadwyd

as CCTV, seems to have an effect in Rhyl. I was also impressed by the partnership that they have struck with the door security staff at the clubs and with the communities.

**Alun Pugh rose—**

**Ann Jones:** I am sorry, Alun, I only have two minutes.

Building those kinds of partnerships works and it gives us an opportunity to make neighbourhoods safe. This is also about cracking down on the criminals and those minorities that cause such chaos in our communities. During that night shift in Rhyl, I saw, first hand, how the police must be ready to exercise a wide range of modern policing skills. These range from dealing with hard criminal acts down to providing information for those who have forgotten where they live after a good night out with their mates.

I will briefly mention David Blunkett's proposals to increase police presence on our streets with the enhanced roles for special constables and the community support officers. I know that it is too early to start judging that initiative, but there is a move to start plugging an important gap between the police and particular neighbourhoods. However, tackling crime is more than police numbers or community safety orders; as Gwenda pointed out, it is about partnership and projects. We must ensure that officers have the tools and support to do their jobs effectively. Above all, the police depend on the support and goodwill of the general public. Crime is everybody's problem. I hope that, with Assembly support, we can all—local councils, individuals, communities—continue to make progress, cut down on crime and the anti-social behaviour problems in our areas.

ganddynt—ac nid sôn am liw eu siacedi yn unig yr wyf er i rywun fy nghyhuidd o fod wedi mopi o arno—ynghyd â'r defnydd a wneir o dechnoleg newydd, megis teledu cylch cyfyng, wedi cael effaith yn y Rhyl. Crëwyd argraff arnaf hefyd gan y bartneriaeth rhwng yr heddlu a staff diogelu wrth y drysau mewn clybiau a chyda'r cymunedau.

**Alun Pugh a gododd—**

**Ann Jones:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Alun. Dim ond dwy funud sydd gennyf.

Mae meithrin partneriaethau o'r fath yn gweithio a rhydd gyfle inni sicrhau bod cymdogaethau yn ddiogel. Mae hyn hefyd yn cael gwared ar y troseddwyr a'r lleiafrifoedd sy'n achos cymaint o aflonyddwch yn ein cymunedau. Yn ystod y sifft nos honno yn y Rhyl, gwelais drosor fy hun sut y mae'n rhaid i'r heddlu fod yn barod i ymarfer ystod eang o sgiliau plismona modern. Mae'r rhain yn amrywio o ymdrin â gweithredoedd troseddol difrifol i roi gwybodaeth i'r rhai sydd wedi anghofio lle y maent yn byw ar ôl noson dda allan gyda'i ffrindiau.

Soniaf yn fyr am gynigion David Blunkett i gael mwy o bresenoldeb yr heddlu ar ein strydoedd drwy estyn rôl cwnstabliaid arbennig a'r swyddogion cynnal yn y gymuned. Gwn ei bod yn rhy gynnar i ddechrau barnu'r fenter honno, ond mae ymgais i ddechrau lleihau bwlch pwysig rhwng yr heddlu a chymdogaethau penodol. Fodd bynnag, mae mynd i'r afael â throseddu yn golygu mwy na chynyddu nifer yr heddlu neu orchmylion diogelwch cymunedol; fel y nododd Gwenda, mae'n ymwneud â phartneriaeth a phrosiectau. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gan blismyn yr offer a'r gefnogaeth i wneud eu gwaith yn effeithiol. Yn anad dim, mae'r heddlu'n dibynnau ar gymorth ac ewyllys da'r cyhoedd. Problem pawb yw torcyfraith. Gobeithiaf, gyda chefnogaeth y Cynulliad—y gallwn oll—cynghorau lleol, unigolion, cymunedau—barhau i wneud cynnydd, lleihau torcyfraith a phroblemau sy'n gysylltiedig ag ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol yn ein hardaloedd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will make a few brief remarks on youth crime. I do so because of my professional background, having spent several years working directly with communities to prevent offending behaviour and working directly with young offenders to divert them from offending. It is true to say, as Geraint and others have mentioned, that some serious offences are committed by young people, which are often drug related. However, the great bulk of what we refer to as youth crime today is not new behaviour or behaviour that caused fear in the past. It would have been seen as normal boisterousness in young people in communities where the adults, especially the older people, knew those young people well. It is the breakdown in our communities and the fact that people do not often know each other and that older people may not know the parents of young people causing low-level problems outside their houses that leads to such boisterousness being criminalised. Of course, if the young people then enter the criminal justice system, as David Davies advocates, it leads them to mix with other young people who have much more serious behaviour and leads to an escalation of the problem.

The fear of young people in our communities, the fear of groups of them sitting around on walls, as we all did when we were young—except, perhaps, if we attended posh private schools where no bullying goes on, if you believe David Davies—such normal behaviour causes fear when young people are not known to the older people—

**David Davies:** Will you give way?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am sorry, David, I have heard quite enough from you this afternoon, particularly your comments about lone parents—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**David Davies:** I never said ‘lone parent’.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order, David. I want to include all the speakers. Unless Members make short speeches, some

**Helen Mary Jones:** Gwnaf ychydig o sylwadau byr ar droseddu ymhliith ieuenciad. Gwnaf hynny yn sgil fy nghefnidir proffesiynol, ar ôl treulio nifer o flynyddoedd yn gweithio gyda chymunedau i atal ymddygiad troseddol a gweithio'n uniongyrchol gyda throseddwyr ifanc i'w darbwyllo i roi'r gorau i droseddu. Mae'n wir dweud, fel y crybwylodd Geraint ac eraill, y cyflawnir rhai troseddau difrifol gan bobl ifanc, sy'n aml yn gysylltiedig â chyffuriau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r hyn y cyfeiriwn ato fel troseddu ymhliith ieuenciad heddiw yn ymddygiad newydd nac ymddygiad a achosodd ofn yn y gorffennol. Fe'i hystyrid yn ymddygiad gwylt arferol ymhliith pobl ifanc mewn cymunedau lle mae'r oedolion, yn arbennig y bobl hŷn, yn adnabod y bobl ifanc hynny yn dda. Mae'r ffaith bod ein cymunedau'n chwalu, nad yw pobl yn aml yn adnabod ei gilydd ac nad yw pobl hŷn yn adnabod rhieni'r bobl ifanc sy'n achosi problemau lefel isel y tu allan i'w tai yn arwain at droi ymddygiad gwylt o'r fath yn dorcyfraith. Wrth gwrs, os bydd y bobl ifanc wedyn yn mynd i mewn i'r system cyflawnder troseddol, fel yr argymhellia David Davies, mae hynny yn golygu eu bod yn cymysgu â phobl ifanc eraill sydd ag ymddygiad llawer gwaeth a bod y broblem yn cynyddu.

Mae ofn pobl ifanc yn ein cymunedau, ofn grwpiau ohonynt yn eistedd ar furiau, fel y gwnaethom oll pan oeddem yn ifanc—oni bai inni fynychu ysgolion bonedd lle nad yw bwlio yn digwydd, os credwch David Davies—mae ymddygiad normal o'r fath yn achosi ofn pan nad yw'r bobl hŷn yn adnabod y bobl ifanc—

**David Davies:** A ildiwrch?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, David. Yr wyf wedi clywed hen ddigon gennych y prynhawn yma, yn enwedig eich sylwadau am rieni unigol—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**David Davies:** Ni ddywedais ‘rhiant unigol’.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn, David. Yr wyf am gynnwys yr holl siaradwyr. Oni wnaiff yr Aelodau areithiau byr, bydd rhai yn cael eu

will be disappointed.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I realise that we are short of time, Deputy Presiding Officer, so I will finish by saying that the solution is not to demonise and criminalise young people. Young people who commit serious offences must be confronted with their behaviour. However, the best way to deal with most young people is to include them in our communities and give them hope for the future.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you for being succinct.

**William Graham:** Chief police officers explain that many elderly people fear that they may become victims of crime while in reality that is not so. On the other hand, many young adults and teenagers have little fear that they may become victims of crime, though statistics unfortunately confirm that they are more likely to become the victims or perpetrators of crime. I take little comfort in the Home Secretary's claim that,

'we have a real success with burglary and car crime, but it was hard earned'.

I reflect on the comments of the chairman of the Police Federation that,

'soaring violent crime was partly due to the Government's emphasis away from beat policing. Whilst the service had made significant strides in reducing burglaries and vehicle crime'—

this was tainted

'by concentrating on Government-led performance indicators, [and] it could be argued that such targets have detracted attention away from traditional [policing]'.

I express my gratitude, on behalf of the majority of people living in south-east Wales, to all our police officers for their achievements and commitment to making our lives and neighbourhoods safe, secure and crime free. It is vital, if our police are to continue to achieve these levels of performance in crime reduction and increased

siomi.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Sylweddolaf ein bod yn brin o amser, Ddirprwy Lywydd, felly gorffennaf drwy ddweud nad cytreulio pobl ifanc a'u troi'n droseddwr yw'r ateb. Rhaid i bobl ifanc sy'n gyflawni troseddau difrifol wynebu canlyniadau eu hymddygiad. Fodd bynnag, y ffordd orau o ymdrin â'r rhan fwyaf o bobl ifanc yw eu cynnwys yn ein cymunedau a rhoi gobaith iddynt i'r dyfodol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch i chi am fod yn gryno.

**William Graham:** Mae prif swyddogion yr heddlu yn nodi bod llawer o'r henoed yn pryderu y gallent ddioddef trosedd er nad dyna'r achos mewn gwirionedd. Ar y llaw arall, mae llawer o bobl ifanc a phobl yn eu harddegau yn pryderu braidd dim y byddant yn dioddef trosedd er bod yr ystadegau yn anffodus yn cadarnhau mai hwy sydd fwyaf tebygol o ddioddef trosedd neu gyflawni trosedd. Nid yw honiad yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref fawr o gysur imi:

'cawsom lwyddiant gwirioneddol o ran lladrata a throseddau ceir, ond'

Ystyriaf sylwadau cadeirydd Ffederasiwn yr Heddlu, sef bod,

'lefelau cynyddol troseddau treisgar o ganlyniad, yn rhannol, i bwyslais gan y Llywodraeth ar heddlu ar y bît. Er bod y gwasanaeth wedi cymryd camau sylweddol wrth leihau lladrata a throseddau ceir'—

difethwyd hyn

'drwy ganolbwytio ar ddangosyddion perfformiad a sefydlwyd gan y Llywodraeth, [a] gellid dadlau bod targedau o'r fath wedi tynnu sylw oddi ar [blismona] traddodiadol'.

Hoffwn ddiolch, ar ran y rhan fwyaf o bobl sy'n byw yn y de-ddwyrain, i bob un o'n plismyn am yr hyn y maent wedi ei gyflawni a'u hymrwymiad i sicrhau bod ein bywydau a'n cymdogaethau yn ddiogel ac yn rhydd o drosedu. Mae'n hollbwysig, er mwyn i'n heddlu barhau i gyflawni'r lefelau perfformiad hyn wrth leihau troseddau a

detection and prosecutions, for additional funding to be made available for information and communications technology equipment, closed circuit television schemes and communities against drugs programmes. There should be no further amalgamation, without adequate consultation, for the public and police officers of other ranks. We firmly oppose any further extension of such powers to the National Assembly.

After 20 years as a lay-magistrate in Newport, I would remind you that most people are poor and few are criminals.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you too, William, for being succinct.

**Peter Law:** After David Davies's disgraceful, discriminatory comments today, you can just about underline that the only thing in common between the Tories and this debate is that they ought to be locked up, for the 18 years of devastation that they wreaked on people. If anyone has had problems and great hardship, just reflect on what you did to people in Wales and Britain in that period.

**David Davies:** Will you give way?

**Peter Law:** You should be ashamed of the fact that you humiliate defenceless—*[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. David, you have made your point several times. We must try to bring this debate to a close.

**Peter Law:** We will not forgive such humiliation. This is an excellent example of partnership working between the Government of Wales and the UK Labour Government. We are dealing with crime and disorder positively. In two and a half to three years you can see that recognition has come through the Home Office—from where we did not think we would see devolution, perhaps. However, a regional crime director has already been appointed. We have also seen that the Youth Justice Board is prepared to work with the Minister and Edwina Hart is doing an excellent job. We are working in

chynyddu canfod ac erlyn, bod arian ychwanegol ar gael ar gyfer offer technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, cynlluniau teledu cylch cyfyng a rhagleni cymunedau yn erbyn cyffuriau. Ni ddylid cael uno pellach, heb ymgynghori digonol, ar gyfer y cyhoedd a swyddogion heddlu ar raddfeydd eraill. Gwrthwynebwn yn llwyr unrhyw ymgais i ehangu pwerau o'r fath i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Ar ôl 20 mlynedd fel ynad hedwch lleyg, yng Nghasnewydd, hoffwn eich atgoffa bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn dlawd ac mai ychydig ohonynt sy'n droseddwyr.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch i chithau hefyd, William, am fod yn gryno.

**Peter Law:** Ar ôl sylwadau gwarthus, camwahaniaethol David Davies heddiw, gallwch ddweud mai'r unig beth sy'n gyffredin rhwng y Torriaid a'r ddadl hon yw y dylent fod dan glo, oherwydd y 18 mlynedd o ddrwg a wnaethant i bobl. Os oes unrhyw un wedi cael problemau ac wedi dioddef caledi mawr, meddyliwch am yr hyn a wnaethoch i bobl yng Nghymru ac ym Mhrydain yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

**David Davies:** A ildiwrch?

**Peter Law:** Dylai'r ffaith ichi fychanu pobl ddiamddiffyn godi cywilydd arnoch—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. David, gwnaethoch eich pwynt sawl gwaith. Rhaid inni geisio dirwyn y ddadl hon i ben.

**Peter Law:** Ni faddeuwn ichi am fychanu pobl yn y fath fodd. Mae hon yn enghraifft wych o Lywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth Lafur y DU yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth. Yr ydym yn ymdrin â throsedd ac anhrelin mewn modd cadarnhaol. Ar ôl rhyw ddwy flynedd a hanner i dair blynedd gallwch weld bod cydnabyddiaeth wedi dod o'r Swyddfa Gartref—o ba le na chredwyd y byddem yn gweld datganoli efallai. Fodd bynnag, erbyn hyn penodwyd cyfarwyddwr troseddu rhanbarthol. Gwelwyd hefyd bod y Bwrdd Cyflawnder Ieuencid yn barod i weithio gyda'r Gweinidog ac mae Edwina Hart yn

partnership, making a difference and seeing safer streets. That is important.

I know that time is short and I know that everybody wants to see more police. By the end of 2003 there will be 130,000 police in England and Wales. We have already seen an 8 per cent increase in police between 1997 and 2001. That shows a commitment and that we are working in the right way. The question of whether we take over the power for policing is a matter for the future. I believe that that would be the right thing to do. However, I also believe that the independent commission is the right way forward, to examine the issue step by step. The only party that can deliver is the Labour Party: Plaid Cymru cannot deliver that because it is a minority in the UK and Parliament.

It is important to remember that crime has fallen by 22 per cent between 1997 and 2001. Police numbers are increasing. We all want to do more for our communities but this Government, working with local government and the UK Government, is in partnership to ensure that our crime safety plans work on the ground. I am grateful for the work that the police do. They have a difficult job in the community. However, with all of us working together—because it is not just a police or Assembly problem—everybody has an opportunity to make a contribution, from all walks of life, to make our streets safer. We are doing it in the right way. The positive comments that need to be made today are the right way to ensure that we have safer communities in Wales in the future.

**John Griffiths:** We have heard appalling comments from David Davies today. It is instructive to note that, when his party was in government in Westminster in those recent 18 long years, there was an appalling crime record. I will cite one example of the crime statistics: overall recorded violent crime increased by 166 per cent between 1979 and 1997. That is the legacy of the Government that declared that there was no such thing as

gwneud gwaith ardderchog. Yr ydym yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth ac yn gweld strydoedd mwy diogel. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Gwn fod amser yn brin a gwn fod pawb am weld mwy o heddlu. Erbyn diwedd 2003 bydd 130,000 o blismyn yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Gwelsom gynnydd o 8 y cant yn nifer y plismyn rhwng 1997 a 2001 eisoes. Dengys hynny ymrwymiad a'n bod yn mynd ati yn y ffordd iawn. Mae'r cwestiwn a ddylem ymgymryd â'r pwerau dros blismona ai peidio yn fater i'r dyfodol. Credaf mai hynny fyddai'r peth iawn i'w wneud. Fodd bynnag, credaf hefyd mai'r comisiwn annibynnol yw'r ffordd briodol ymlaen, i ystyried y mater fesul cam. Yr unig blaidd a all gyflawni hyn yw'r Blaid Lafur: ni all Plaid Cymru gyflawni hyn am ei bod yn blaidd leiafrifol yn y DU a'r Senedd.

Mae'n bwysig cofio bod nifer y troseddau a gyflawnwyd wedi gostwng 22 y cant rhwng 1997 a 2001. Mae nifer y plismyn ar gynnydd. Yr ydym oll am wneud rhagor dros ein cymunedau ond mae'r Llywodraeth hon, gan weithio gyda llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth y DU, mewn partneriaeth i sicrhau bod ein cynlluniau diogelu rhag troseddau yn gweithio ar lawr gwlad. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y gwaith a wneir gan yr heddlu. Mae ganddynt waith anodd i'w wneud yn y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, wrth i bawb gydweithio—oherwydd nid problem yr heddlu na phroblem y Cynulliad yn unig ydyw—caiff pawb y cyfle i gyfrannu, o bob rhan o fywyd, i sicrhau bod ein strydoedd yn fwy diogel. Yr ydym yn mynd ati yn y ffordd gywir. Y sylwadau cadarnhaol y mae angen eu gwneud heddiw yw'r ffordd gywir o sicrhau y cawn gymunedau mwy diogel yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol.

**John Griffiths:** Clywsom sylwadau gwarthus gan David Davies heddiw. Mae'n ddefnyddiol nodi bod record ofnadwy o ran troseddau gan ei blaidd ef pan oedd mewn grym yn San Steffan yn ystod y 18 mlynedd hirfaith diweddar hynny. Dyfynnaf un enghraift o'r ystadegau ar droseddau: cynyddodd cyfanswm y troseddau treisgar a gofnodwyd 166 y cant rhwng 1979 a 1997. Dyna etifeddiaeth y Llywodraeth a

society, and that it was not interested in reducing unemployment or tackling deprivation. That was the result. We need much more light in this debate, rather than the heat that we normally get. Unfortunately, people seek simplistic, knee-jerk solutions in complex areas. Such solutions are not to be found. The real need is for support for the staff of our criminal justice system, who are carrying out much good work in the probation service, for example, in working with young people and steering them towards useful and productive lives. We do not need ritual condemnation from people like David Davies, which is ill-informed but which has too long informed this country's policies and has given us one of the highest prison populations in Europe. Those institutions are universities for crime. They worsen the situation. We must get away from that approach and think about these complex matters much more carefully. When we do that, we will have much more success in building safer communities.

gyhoeddodd nad oedd y fath beth â chymdeithas yn bodoli, ac nad oedd ganddi ddiddordeb mewn lleihau diweithdra na mynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd. Dyna oedd y canlyniad. Mae angen llawer mwy o oleuni yn y ddadl hon, yn hytrach na'r gwres a geir fel arfer. Yn anffodus, mae pobl yn chwilio am atebion gor-syml, difeddwl mewn meysydd cymhleth. Ni ellir dod o hyd i atebion o'r fath. Yr hyn sydd ei angen mewn gwirionedd yw inni gefnogi staff ein system cyflawnder troseddol, sy'n gwneud llawer o waith da yn y gwasanaeth prawf, er enghraifft, yn gweithio gyda phobl ifanc ac yn eu tywys tuag at fywydau defnyddiol a chynhyrchiol. Nid oes angen beirniadaeth ddefodol gan bobl megis David Davies, sydd yn feirniadaeth anwybodus ond sydd wedi bod yn sail i bolisiau'r wlad hon ers gormod o amser ac sydd wedi arwain at y ffaith bod gennym y nifer uchaf o garcharorion yn Ewrop. Mae'r sefydliadau hynny yn rhoi addysg i bobl ar ymddygiad troseddol. Maent yn gwaethygwr sefyllfa. Rhaid inni gefnu ar yr ymagwedd honno a meddwl am y materion cymhleth hyn yn llawer mwy gofalus. Pan wnawn hynny, cawn lawer mwy o lwyddiant wrth adeiladu cymunedau mwy diogel.

4:20 p.m.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** We must all reflect that law and order is a collective responsibility that must be tackled at a local and national level. It is central to what the National Assembly wants to do and what the people of Wales require us to do. We all acknowledge in today's debate that crime can ruin the fabric of society. The vulnerable are always the ones who are targeted. People must feel safe in their homes and safe to go out. Sadly, people do not feel secure. Even if the risk of harm is small, they still feel that it is real. The Assembly has a statutory responsibility under the Crime and Disorder Act 1998. For the first time, together with local authorities and other partners, we have implemented our responsibilities across each unitary authority area. The Crime Reduction Director for Wales and his team in the Assembly are pushing this agenda forward. In three years, since the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 was

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Rhaid inni oll sylweddoli bod cyfraith a threfn yn gydgyfrifoldeb y mae'n rhaid ei ysgwyddo ar lefel leol a chenedlaethol. Mae'n ganolog i'r hyn y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am ei wneud a'r hyn y mae pobl Cymru am inni ei wneud. Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod yn y ddadl heddiw y gall torcyfraith ddinistrio sylfaen ein cymdeithas. Pobl ddiamddiffyn yw'r rhai a dargedir bob amser. Rhaid i bobl deimlo'n ddiogel yn eu cartrefi ac yn ddiogel i adael y tŷ. Yn anffodus, nid yw pobl yn teimlo'n ddiogel. Hyd yn oed os yw'r risg o niwed yn fach, teimlant o hyd ei bod yn wirioneddol. Mae gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb statudol o dan Ddeddf Trosedd ac Anhreln 1998. Am y tro cyntaf, yr ydym wedi cyflawni ein cyfrifoldebau ar draws pob ardal awdurdod unedol, ar y cyd â'r awdurdodau lleol a phartneriaid eraill. Mae Cyfarwyddwr Cymru dros Ostwng Troseddau a'i dîm yn y Cynulliad yn datblygu'r agenda hon. Mewn

introduced, we have seen all the agencies and partnerships coming together to fight effectively against crime.

I regularly meet with the chief constables, the police authorities, probation officers and the voluntary sector as they all have something to contribute to these partnerships. Janet was quite right in her remarks about the discussion regarding the Partnership Council. We have worked hard in all areas of Wales to ensure that all partners actively engage in partnerships.

We must also face a few facts in this debate. For some time, the recorded crime statistics show crime falling. Wales has recorded a significant decrease in 2001 of 18.9 per cent in recorded offences. There has been a decrease of 6.7 per cent in significant offences of violence against the person, robbery, burglary and vehicle crime for the whole of Wales. Some indent is being made into crime figures but it is important that we recognise that we must continue the fight against crime. The partnerships, to which Gwenda and Ann alluded, are at the heart of dealing with this agenda.

I am also pleased to say that we have added to our capabilities for dealing with this issue in the National Assembly. We have employed two researchers with a background in criminology and social science. With the information available in the Assembly, and with these people working for us, it is essential that we gather even more information in order to target resources more appropriately, hence our amendment 2. This encourages the Assembly to review the information already being made available by the Home Office so that we can see how we can use this information successfully.

In terms of resources, we have been allocated over £12 million in the crime reduction programme for initiatives covering crime reduction in secondary schools, targeting

tair blynedd, ers cyflwyno Deddf Troedd ac Anrhefn 1998, yr ydym wedi gweld yr holl asiantaethau a phartneriaethau yn dod ynghyd i ymladd troeddau yn effeithiol.

Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â'r prif gwnstabliaid, awdurdodau'r heddlu, swyddogion prawf a'r sector gwirfoddol gan fod rhywbeth gan bob un ohonynt i'w gyfrannu i'r partneriaethau hyn. Yr oedd Janet yn llygad ei lle yn ei sylwadau am y drafodaeth ynglŷn â'r Cyngor Partneriaeth. Yr ydym wedi gweithio'n galed ym mhob rhan o Gymru i sicrhau bod yr holl bartneriaid yn cymryd rhan weithgar mewn partneriaethau.

Rhaid inni hefyd wynebu ychydig o ffeithiau yn y ddadl hon. Ers peth amser, dengys yr ystadegau ar droseddau a gofnodwyd fod nifer y troeddau a gyflawnwyd yn gostwng. Mae Cymru wedi cofnodi gostyngiad sylweddol yn 2001, sef 18.9 y cant yn nifer y troeddau a gofnodwyd. Bu gostyngiad o 6.7 y cant yn nifer y troeddau difrifol megis traïs yn erbyn unigolyn, lladrata, bwrgleriaeth a throseddau sy'n gysylltiedig â cherbydau ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Er y gwelir peth llwyddiant o ran lleihau nifer y troeddau a gyflawnwyd mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid inni barhau i ymladd yn erbyn torcyfraith. Mae'r partneriaethau, y cyfeiriad Gwenda ac Ann atynt, wrth wraidd yr agenda hon.

Mae'n bleser gennyf nodi hefyd ein bod wedi gwella ein gallu i ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr ydym wedi cyflogi dau ymchwilydd gyda chefndir ym maes troseddeg a gwyddor gymdeithasol. Gyda'r wybodaeth sydd ar gael yn y Cynulliad, a'r bobl hyn yn gweithio inni, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn casglu hyd yn oed mwy o wybodaeth er mwyn targedu adnoddau'n fwy priodol a dyna'r rheswm dros ein gwelliant 2. Mae'n annog y Cynulliad i adolygu'r wybodaeth sydd eisoes ar gael gan y Swyddfa Gartref er mwyn inni weld sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r wybodaeth hon yn llwyddiannus.

O ran adnoddau, dyrannwyd dros £12 miliwn inni yn y rhaglen lleihau troeddau ar gyfer mentrau sy'n cwmpasu lleihau troeddau mewn ysgolion uwchradd, targedu plismona,

policing, reducing burglaries, CCTV, neighbourhood warden projects and preventing domestic violence against women. We will also receive funding from the safer communities programmes, which will run from 1 April 2002. For example, £12 million has been allocated over three years for the Wales communities against drugs initiative. We have initiatives with small retailers in deprived areas as they are constantly worried about burglary. We want to encourage them to keep their premises open, so we must give them the necessary support.

In my final budget proposals in November 2001, we made provision for £3.2 million of the Assembly's resources for On Track and Safer Homes this Winter. On Thursday, I will launch the safer homes this winter initiative in Cwmbran, to which the Assembly is contributing £2 million this year. That will help protect homes that are constant targets of burglary and bogus callers. Much of this initiative focuses on making pensioners feel safe in their homes.

There is also £1.2 million from the Assembly's resources for On Track, a long-term initiative aimed at highlighting the risk of getting involved in crime. Raising these issues is an intrinsic part of the wider education agenda that we are adopting.

Some of our initiatives in Wales have been successful and will continue to be so. Many of us are keen to take on the responsibility for police in Wales. However, this needs to be considered in light of the conclusions of the forthcoming independent commission review on the National Assembly's powers. Therefore, we tabled amendment 4.

In Wales, we must understand that we must give confidence and self-esteem back to people who feel alienated by the criminal justice process. We must tackle all the underlying problems of health and education. The administration is uniquely placed and we have tackled those problems by taking a co-ordinated approach to crime. We must fight crime in the context of the wider social issue. It is not helpful when crime becomes a party

lleihau bwrgleriaeth, teledu cylch cyfyng, prosiectau wardeiniaid cymdogaeth ac atal trais yn y cartref yn erbyn merched. Byddwn hefyd yn cael arian gan y rhaglenni cymunedau mwy diogel, a fydd yn rhedeg o 1 Ebrill 2002. Er enghraifft, dyrannwyd £12 miliwn dros dair blynedd ar gyfer menter cymunedau Cymru yn erbyn cyffuriau. Mae gennym fentrau gyda busnesau bach mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig am eu bod yn pryderu drwy'r amser ynglŷn â bwrgleriaeth. Yr ydym am eu hannog i gadw eu busnesau ar agor, felly rhaid inni roi'r cymorth angenrheidiol iddynt.

Yn fy nghynigion terfynol ar gyfer y gyllideb ym mis Tachwedd 2001, darparwyd £3.2 miliwn o adnoddau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer On Track a Safer Homes this Winter. Ddydd Iau, byddaf yn lansio menter Safer Homes this Winter yng Nghwmbrân, y mae'r Cynulliad yn cyfrannu £2 filiwn ati eleni. Bydd hynny'n helpu wrth ddiogelu cartrefi a dargedir yn ddi-baid gan ladron a galwyr ffug. Mae llawer o'r fenter hon yn canolbwytio ar sicrhau bod pensiynwyr yn teimlo'n ddiogel yn eu cartrefi.

Darparwyd £1.2 miliwn o adnoddau'r Cynulliad hefyd ar gyfer On Track, sef menter hirdymor sydd â'r nod o amlygu'r risg o ymwneud â throseddu. Mae codi'r materion hyn yn rhan annatod o'r agenda addysg ehangach a fabwysiedir gennym.

Bu rhai o'n mentrau yng Nghymru yn llwyddiannus a byddant yn parhau i fod. Mae llawer ohonom yn awyddus i ymgymryd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros yr heddlu yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, bydd angen ystyried hyn yng ngoleuni casgliadau adolygiad arfaethedig y comisiwn annibynnol ar bwerau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Felly, cyflwynwyd gwelliant 4 gennym.

Yng Nghymru, rhaid inni ddeall bod angen inni roi hyder a hunan-barch yn ôl i'r bobl sy'n teimlo bod y broses cyfiawnder troseddol wedi cefnu arnynt. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r holl broblemau sylfaenol o ran iechyd ac addysg. Mae'r weinyddiaeth mewn sefyllfa unigryw i wneud hynny ac yr ydym wedi mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny drwy fabwysiadu ymagwedd gydgyslltiedig tuag at dorcyfraith. Rhaid inni ymladd

political football and when remarks are made towards certain groups and individuals. It is said that poor parents produce criminals. Nothing could be further from the truth in many ways when you consider some examples in our newspapers.

It is important that the Assembly has held this debate today. I am proud that the Government has been tackling poverty and deprivation as one of its priorities and, at the same time, crime and victimisation, which is an essential part of that.

**Janet Ryder:** Despite some of the controversial words spoken today and comments made by members of the Conservative group, there was a great deal of consensus on this motion. It is now a question of when we want things to start happening. Unfortunately, whether or not real crime is increasing, the fear of crime in our communities is, and a multi-agency approach is needed to tackle that. That involves all groups working together. Some will consider rebuilding communities physically and others will consider social rebuilding. As Gwenda mentioned, many strategies, initiatives and policies have been brought forward to tackle such issues involving different levels of Government. Responsibility for these initiatives is split between the Assembly, local authorities and Westminster. However, they require better co-ordination because they do not seem to be working on the ground—people still feel afraid.

Four of the major groups who work to build safer communities are already answerable to the Assembly: local government, health authorities, voluntary organisations and the Welsh Development Agency in terms of economic development. However, the police—one of the key players charged with developing that community safety—are not, which is why related powers need to be devolved to the Assembly so that they are accountable to us. The Minister already has some input into their budget. She can have an effect on the number of policemen that we see on the beat. If she chose to cap precepts,

torcyfraith yng nghyd-destun y broblem gymdeithasol ehangach. Nid yw o fudd pan ddaw torcyfraith yn gêm wleidyddol a phan wneir sylwadau am grwpiau neu unigolion penodol. Dywedir bod rhieni gwael yn magu troseddwyd. Y gwrthwyneb sy'n wir ar sawl cyfrif pan ystyriwch rai enghreiftiau yn ein papurau newydd.

Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad wedi cynnal y ddadl hon heddiw. Yr wyf yn ymfalchiō yn yffaith bod y Llywodraeth wedi bod yn mynd i'r afael â thodi ac amddifadedd fel un o'i blaenoriaethau ac, ar yr un pryd, torcyfraith a fictimeiddio pobl, sy'n rhan annatod o hynny.

**Janet Ryder:** Er gwaethaf rhai o'r geiriau dadleuol a lefarwyd heddiw a'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan aelodau o'r grŵp Ceidwadol, bu cryn dipyn o gytundeb ar y cynnig hwn. Y cwestiwn bellach yw pryd yr ydym am i bethau ddechrau digwydd. Yn anffodus, pa un a yw torcyfraith gwirioneddol ar gynnydd ai peidio, mae ofn troseddau ar gynnydd yn ein cymunedau, ac mae angen ymagwedd amlasiantaethol i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae hynny'n golygu bod pob grŵp yn cydweithio. Bydd rhai yn ystyried ailadeiladu isadeiledd cymunedau a bydd eraill yn ystyried ailadeiladu cymdeithasol. Fel y crybwylloedd Gwenda, cyflwynwyd llawer o strategaethau, mentrau a pholisiau i fynd i'r afael â materion o'r fath, gan gwmpasu gwahanol haenau o Lywodraeth. Rhennir y cyfrifoldeb dros y mentrau hyn rhwng y Cynulliad, awdurdodau lleol a San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, mae angen eu cydlynú'n well am nad ydynt yn ymddangos fel petaent yn gweithio ar lawr gwlad—mae ofn troseddau ar bobl o hyd.

Mae pedwar o'r prif grwpiau sy'n gweithio i adeiladu cymunedau mwy diogel eisoes yn atebol i'r Cynulliad: llywodraeth leol, awdurdodau iechyd, mudiadau gwirfoddol ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru o ran datblygu economaidd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r heddlu—un o'r sefydliadau allweddol sy'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu'r diogelwch cymunedol hwnnw—yn atebol inni, a dyna pam mae angen i'r pwerau perthnasol gael eu datganoli i'r Cynulliad er mwyn iddynt fod yn atebol inni. Mae gan y Gweinidog eisoes rywfaint o dylanwad ar gyllideb yr heddlu. Gall dylanwadu ar nifer y plismyn a welwn

as we might see in north Wales, and if the North Wales Police Authority was not allowed to raise its budget, the number of police officers would be reduced. We have some impact, but the police are not accountable to the Assembly, and they should be.

We must also consider how the Assembly deals with crime reduction because responsibility for that area is split. Initiatives come from so many different Ministers, representing health, education and local government. One Minister should be responsible for all of them, perhaps, working in conjunction with a crime reduction director.

On Members' comments, I am afraid that Mike German's were as hollow as he claimed those of other Members were. He is all talk and no action. He is prepared to make a loud noise, but wait for years for a commission to report in 2004 before any action is taken. Plaid Cymru wants that action to be taken now. David Davies talks about Christian principles being ignored. I always thought that Christian principles extended to people in most need, which includes people who commit crimes—no-one is excluded. As Gwenda said, many of the community strategies are working and Peter Law gave us a picture of how they are working. However, they need to be revised, simplified and addressed by one Minister with responsibility throughout the Assembly to ensure that this cross-cutting issue is driven forward and that the police authorities are answerable to the Assembly. That needs to happen now and not when a commission reports in 2004.

ar y strydoedd. Pe bai'n dewis capio preseptau, fel y gallai ddigwydd yn y Gogledd, a phe gwaherddid Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru rhag cynyddu ei gyllideb, byddai gostyngiad yn nifer y plismyn. Mae rhywfaint o ddylanwad gennym, ond nid yw'r heddlu yn atebol i'r Cynulliad, a dylent fod.

Rhaid inni ystyried hefyd sut y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymdrin â lleihau troseddau gan fod y cyfrifoldeb dros y maes hwnnw wedi'i rannu. Daw mentrau o gymaint o Weinidogion gwahanol, yn cynrychioli iechyd, addysg a llywodraeth leol. Dylai un Gweinidog fod yn gyfrifol amdanyst i gyd, efallai drwy weithio mewn cydweithrediad â chyfarwyddwr lleihau troseddu.

O ran sylwadau'r Aelodau, ofnaf fod sylwadau Mike German yr un mor wag ag yr honnodd i sylwadau Aelodau eraill fod. Mae'n well ganddo siarad na gweithredu. Mae'n barod i siarad yn groch, ond mae am aros am flynyddoedd i gomisiwn gyflwyno adroddiad yn 2004 cyn i unrhyw gamau gael eu cymryd. Mae Plaid Cymru am i gamau gael eu cymryd yn awr. Sonia David Davies fod egwyddorion Cristnogol yn cael eu hanwybyddu. Yr oeddwn bob amser yn credu bod egwyddorion Cristnogol yn ymestyn i'r bobl fwyaf anghenus, gan gynnwys pobl sy'n cyflawni troseddau—ni waherddir neb. Fel y dywedodd Gwenda, mae llawer o'r strategaethau cymunedol yn gweithio a rhoddodd Peter Law ddarlun inni o'r ffordd y maent yn gweithio. Fodd bynnag, mae angen eu diwygio, eu symleiddio ac iddynt dderbyn sylw un Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb ar draws y Cynulliad dros sicrhau bod y mater trawsbynciol hwn yn mynd yn ei flaen a bod awdurdodau'r heddlu yn atebol i'r Cynulliad. Mae angen i hynny ddigwydd yn awr ac nid pan fydd comisiwn yn cyflwyno adroddiad yn 2004.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22  
Amendment 1: For 32, Abstain 0, Against 22*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint

Butler, Rosemary	Davies, Glyn
Chapman, Christine	Davies, Janet
Davidson, Jane	Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Andrew	Graham, William
Davies, Ron	Hancock, Brian
Essex, Sue	Jarman, Pauline
Evans, Delyth	Jones, Elin
German, Michael	Jones, Gareth
Gibbons, Brian	Jones, Helen Mary
Gregory, Janice	Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Griffiths, John	Lloyd, David
Gwyther, Christine	Melding, David
Halford, Alison	Morgan, Jonathan
Hart, Edwina	Rogers, Peter
Hutt, Jane	Ryder, Janet
Jones, Ann	Thomas, Owen John
Jones, Carwyn	Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Lloyd, Val	Williams, Phil
Law, Peter	
Lewis, Huw	
Middlehurst, Tom	
Morgan, Rhodri	
Neagle, Lynne	
Pugh, Alun	
Randerson, Jenny	
Sinclair, Karen	
Thomas, Gwenda	
Williams, Kirsty	

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment carried*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22*

*Amendment 2: For 32, Abstain 0, Against 22*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment carried.*

4:30 p.m.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22*  
*Amendment 3: For 32, Abstain 0, Against 22*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22*  
*Amendment 4: For 32, Abstain 0, Against 22*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet

Davidson, Jane	Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Andrew	Graham, William
Davies, Ron	Hancock, Brian
Essex, Sue	Jarman, Pauline
Evans, Delyth	Jones, Elin
German, Michael	Jones, Gareth
Gibbons, Brian	Jones, Helen Mary
Gregory, Janice	Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Griffiths, John	Lloyd, David
Gwyther, Christine	Melding, David
Halford, Alison	Morgan, Jonathan
Hart, Edwin	Rogers, Peter
Hutt, Jane	Ryder, Janet
Jones, Ann	Thomas, Owen John
Jones, Carwyn	Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Lloyd, Val	Williams, Phil
Law, Peter	
Lewis, Huw	
Middlehurst, Tom	
Morgan, Rhodri	
Neagle, Lynne	
Pugh, Alun	
Randerson, Jenny	
Sinclair, Karen	
Thomas, Gwenda	
Williams, Kirsty	

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried*

Amended motion:

*the National Assembly:*

*1. notes that the creation of safe communities is a key objective in 'Plan for Wales 2001';*

*2. is concerned at the public perception that crime in many communities is on the increase while crime itself is decreasing;*

*3. should review the effectiveness of current strategies in combating crime when research and evaluation information currently being compiled becomes available; and*

*4. looks forward to the conclusion of the forthcoming independent commission on the powers of the National Assembly, due to be set up by the Welsh Assembly Government, particularly in regard to the appropriateness of devolving any further responsibilities for the police to the National Assembly.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. yn nodi bod creu cymunedau diogel yn un o amcanion allweddol 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001';*

*2. yn pryderu ynghylch canfyddiad y cyhoedd bod troseddu ar gynnydd mewn llawer o gymunedau wrth i droseddu ei hun ostwng;*

*3. o'r farn y dylai adolygu effeithiolrwydd y strategaethau presennol i fynd i'r afael â throseddu pan fydd gwybodaeth am ymchwil a gwerthuso sy'n cael ei chasglu ar hyn o bryd ar gael; ac*

*4. yn edrych ymlaen at ddiwedd y comisiwn annibynnol sydd i ddod ar bwerau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac sydd i'w sefydlu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn enwedig o ran priodoldeb datganoli cyfrifoldebau pellach am yr heddlu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22  
Amended motion: For 32, Abstain 0, Against 22*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried*

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol) Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

#### **Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru Social Services in Wales**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Andrew Davies, and amendments 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**David Melding:** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*1. acknowledges the growing pressures facing social services in Wales and notes with particular concern:*

*a. the accelerating decline in the number of residential and nursing home places in Wales;*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Andrew Davies, a gwelliannau 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 a 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**David Melding:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. yn cydnabod y pwysau cnyddol sydd ar y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru ac yn nodi â phryder arbennig:*

*a. y gestyngiad cnyddol yn nifer y lleoedd mewn cartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nyrsio yng Nghymru;*

- b. the inadequate level of the fees paid to residential and nursing homes in the independent sector compared to the level of funding given by local authorities to their own care homes;
- c. the high and increasing number of assessments that do not lead to the provision of community care services;
- d. the difficulties in recruiting and retaining staff in the social care sector, and especially in children's services;
- e. the decline in the numbers applying for social work qualifying training.

**2. The National Assembly recognises the need to:**

- a. raise the level of fees paid to residential and nursing homes in the independent sector;
- b. increase the proportion of assessments that lead to the provision of community care services;
- c. value and support the social care workforce in Wales;
- d. allocate sufficient funds to help facilitate higher standards and better quality in the social care sector. (NDM937)

I am pleased to propose this motion. Social services is, in our opinion, an important subject. The future and quality of social care needs to be at the centre of our attention, now and in the future. In the past, social care and its development have not been emphasised enough.

We must start on a sombre note, because the state of social services in Wales is a cause for concern. I do not make a political point—it is not meant to be partisan. This is the objective situation that faces us all and challenges us all. The joint reviews undertaken in Wales to date have ranged from poor to mediocre. None has been remotely good. That is the situation. The standard of social care must be improved. That is rather stark. I want to welcome some developments and give some

- b. lefel annigonol y ffioedd a delir i gartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nysrio yn y sector annibynnol o'i gymharu â lefel y cyllid y mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn ei roi i'w cartrefi gofal eu hunain;
- c. nifer gynyddol uchel yr asesiadau nad ydynt yn arwain at ddarparu gwasanaethau gofal yn y gymuned;
- d. anawsterau recriwtio a chadw staff yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol, ac yn arbennig mewn gwasanaethau plant;
- e. y gostyngiad yn nifer y bobl sy'n gwneud cais i hyfforddi i ennill cymhwyster gwaith cymdeithasol.

**2. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cydnabod bod angen:**

- a. codi lefel y ffioedd a delir i gartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nysrio yn y sector annibynnol;
- b. codi cyfran yr asesiadau sy'n arwain at ddarparu gwasanaethau gofal yn y gymuned;
- c. gwerthfawrogi a chefnogi'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru;
- d. dyrannu digon o arian i helpu i hwyluso safonau uwch a gwell ansawdd yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol. (NDM937)

Yr wyf yn falch o gael cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Mae gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn bwnc pwysig yn ein barn ni. Mae angen i ddyfodol ac ansawdd gofal cymdeithasol fod yn ganolog i'n sylw, yn awr ac yn y dyfodol. Yn y gorffennol, ni roddwyd digon o sylw i ofal cymdeithasol a'i ddatblygiad.

Rhaid inni ddechrau ar nodyn difrifol, am fod cyflwr y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn destun pryder. Nid wyf yn gwneud pwynt gwleidyddol—ni fwriadaf fod yn bleidgar. Dyma yw'r sefyllfa wirioneddol sy'n ein wynebu ac sy'n herio pob un ohonom. Mae'r adolygiadau ar y cyd a gynhaliwyd yng Nghymru hyd yma wedi amrywio o fod yn wael i fod yn weddol. Ni fu'r un ohonynt yn agos at fod yn dda. Dyna yw'r sefyllfa. Rhaid gwella safon gofal

praise at least to the administration and to the Labour Government nationally for the attention that has been paid in the last two or three years to the social care agenda, because there have been promising developments.

First, it is appropriate that we commit ourselves to higher standards. All political parties share that aim. When we state that aim, we must meet its consequences as far as practical policies are concerned. I also welcome the establishment of the Care Council for Wales and an independent inspection system that, for the first time, will put private and independent providers on the same footing as councils. They will all be inspected by the same body. That will create a level playing field and will lead to greater confidence in the outcomes of these inspection reports. That is good. However, we must accept that we are losing capacity in the residential and nursing home sector and that loss of capacity is accelerating. Fewer people are now supported by social care services. The statistic is remarkable—54 per cent of community care assessments do not lead to a community care service. Local authorities remain principally providers rather than commissioners of care services. This is an enduring conflict of interest, which often leads to mediocre care standards. The difficulties that we face in staff recruitment and retention are well known to you all.

I turn to the residential and nursing home sector. The amount of capacity that we are losing is worrying. At my last meeting with Bro Taf Health Authority, the number one issue on its list of priorities was the lack of capacity in the nursing home sector and its knock-on effect on the health service, and, in particular, the inability to discharge people in a timely fashion from hospital care. That means that it is a poor service for patients because they are left in hospitals, in large wards, when they could be in a more homely environment in a nursing home or, sometimes, even a residential home. It is also expensive. It costs something like three or four times the amount to care for someone in hospital as to provide the same care in a

cymdeithasol. Mae hynny braidd yn llwm. Hoffwn groesawu rhai datblygiadau a rhoi rhywfaint o glod o leiaf i'r weinyddiaeth a'r Blaid Lafur yn genedlaethol am y sylw a roddodd i'r agenda gofal cymdeithasol yn ystod y ddwy neu dair blynedd diwethaf, oherwydd bu datblygiadau addawol.

Yn gyntaf, mae'n briodol ein bod yn ymrwymo ein hunain i safonau uwch. Mae pob plaid wleidyddol yn rhannu'r nod hwnnw. Pan gyhoeddwn y nod hwnnw, rhaid inni wynebu ei ganlyniadau o ran polisiau ymarferol. Croesawaf hefyd sefydlu Cyngor Gofal Cymru a system arolygu annibynnol a fydd, am y tro cyntaf, yn rhoi darparwyr preifat ac annibynnol ar yr un lefel â chyngorau. Yr un corff fydd yn eu harolygu. Bydd hynny'n rhoi chwarae teg iddynt ac yn arwain at fwy o hyder yng nghanlyniadau'r adroddiadau arolygu hyn. Mae hynny'n beth da. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni dderbyn ein bod yn colli capaciti yn y sector cartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nyrsio ac mae'r golled honno o ran capaciti yn dwysáu. Caiff llai o bobl eu cefnogi gan wasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol erbyn hyn. Mae'r ystadegyn yn rhyfeddol—nid yw 54 y cant o asesiadau gofal cymunedol yn arwain at wasanaeth gofal cymunedol. Yr awdurdodau lleol yw'r prif ddarparwyr o hyd yn hytrach na bod yn gomisiynwyr gwasanaethau gofal. Mae hynny'n wrthdaro buddiannau parhaus sy'n aml yn arwain at safonau gofal diddrwg didda. Mae'r anawsterau a wynebwn wrth geisio reciwtio a chadw staff yn hysbys i bob un ohonoch.

Trof at y sector cartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nyrsio. Mae maint y capaciti yr ydym yn ei golli yn peri pryder. Yn fy nghyfarfod diwethaf ag Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf, y prif fater ar ei restr o flaenoriaethau oedd y diffyg capaciti yn y sector cartrefi nyrsio ac effaith ddilysol hynny ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac, yn arbennig, yr anallu i ryddhau pobl yn amserol o ofal ysbyty. Mae hynny'n golygu ei fod yn wasanaeth gwael i gleifion am eu bod yn cael eu gadael mewn ysbytai, mewn wardiau mawr, lle gallent fod mewn amgylchedd mwy cartrefol mewn cartref nyrsio neu, weithiau, hyd yn oed mewn cartref preswyl. Mae'n gostus hefyd. Mae'n costio bron i dair neu bedair gwaith yn fwy i ofalu am rywun mewn ysbyty nag y mae i

nursing home. It makes no economic sense, and it certainly does not make any sense in respect of the quality of care received by the patient.

The principal difficulty in the residential and nursing home sector is the level of fees that have been set. They have not been reviewed for nearly 10 years, and yet we have driven up standards—quite appropriately—and been more demanding in what we expect from this sector. We have also seen the introduction of the minimum wage, which has led to at least a slight improvement in the working terms and conditions of many in the workforce. That should be welcomed. However, these costs must be met, and they have not been met in respect of the level of fees given to the independent sector.

As well as reviewing the level of fees, we need a more subtle way of assessing need. We need an additional assessment tool beyond the average assessment that is carried out, so that specialist services can be provided for. If you consider care homes that specialise, say, in acquired brain injury and in caring for those people, who are often young, they can end up receiving care with many elderly people. That is quite inappropriate if that person is 25, 35, 45 years old, and needs nursing care. So we need a more sophisticated assessment for assessing people's needs.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You refer to the social care problems that exist in Wales. You seem to be saying that the problem is that the level of fees coming from local authorities to residential nursing homes is insufficient. There is also a problem in terms of linking up with the health service in terms of assessments. Why did the Conservative Governments of 1979-97 not think of all this when, in fact, they encouraged setting up nursing and residential homes in the private sector?

**David Melding:** There was not a lack of capacity in the early 1990s. I do not want to trade insults as to what has happened since then, but the average level of fees, the real costs that are met, are greater now, and the fee level as a result is not worth what it was in the early 1990s. This is what has caused

ddarparu'r un gofal mewn cartref nysrio. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr yn economaidd, ac yn sicr nid yw'n gwneud unrhyw synnwyr o ran ansawdd y gofal a dderbynir gan y claf.

Y prif anhawster yn y sector cartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nysrio yw lefel y ffioedd a bennwyd. Nid ydynt wedi cael eu harolygu ers bron i 10 mlynedd, ond eto i gyd, yr ydym wedi codi'r safonau—a hynny'n briodol—ac mae ein disgwyliadau o'r sector hwn wedi codi. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gweld cyflwyniad yr isafswm cyflog, sydd wedi arwain at welliant bach o leiaf yn nhelerau ac amodau llawer o'r gweithlu. Dylid croesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cwrdd â'r costau hyn, ac nid yw hynny wedi digwydd o ran lefel y ffioedd a roddir i'r sector annibynnol.

Yn ogystal ag arolygu lefel y ffioedd, mae angen ffordd graffach o asesu angen. Mae angen dull asesu ychwanegol arnom y tu hwnt i'r asesiad a gynhelir fel arfer, fel y gellir darparu ar gyfer gwasanaethau arbenigol. Os ystyriwch gartrefi gofal sy'n arbenigo, dyweder, ym maes anafiadau i'r ymennydd a gofalu am y bobl hynny, sy'n ifanc yn aml, gallant dderbyn gofal gyda llawer o bobl oedrannus. Mae hynny'n gwbl amhriodol os yw'r person hwnnw yn 25, 35 45 oed, a bod angen gofal nysrio arno. Felly mae angen asesiad mwy soffistigedig arnom er mwyn asesu anghenion pobl.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cyfeiriasoch at y problemau gofal cymdeithasol sy'n bodoli yng Nghymru. Ymddengys i mi eich bod yn dweud mai'r broblem yw nad yw lefel y ffioedd a delir gan awdurdodau lleol i gartrefi nysrio preswyl yn ddigonol. Ceir problem hefyd o ran cysylltu gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn nhermau asesiadau. Pam na wnaeth Llywodraethau Ceidwadol 1979-97 feddwl am hynny pan, yn wir, y gwnaeth annog sefydlu cartrefi nysrio a chartrefi preswyl yn y sector preifat?

**David Melding:** Nid oedd diffyg capaciti ar ddechrau'r 1990au. Nid wyf am gyfnewid cyhuddiadau am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ers hynny, ond mae lefel y ffioedd ar gyfartaledd, y costau gwirioneddol a delir, yn uwch yn awr, ac o ganlyniad i hynny nid yw gwerth lefel y ffi yr un peth ag yr oedd ar

the pressure in that sector. The independent sector, which ranges from private to not-for-profit organisations—and the not-for-profit sector is valuable—is innovative; it is a large employer and it is responsive to a particular need. We often talk about small providers, which may only own one home, or a not-for-profit organisation in a local area providing appropriate local care.

The lack of support that people receive from social services is worrying. The National Health Service and Community Care Act 1990 was designed to support people at home and maintain them in an independent lifestyle as long as possible. However, this principle is now being undermined as fewer care packages are delivered by social service authorities, and the number that they provide grows more and more intense. Fewer people receive a service, but that service is a more intense package. We are seeing a move away from care in the community to funding care at a much earlier stage than is optimum in residential homes or even in nursing homes. The principle of community care, therefore, is being insidiously undermined—not by intent, I grant that. That is the effect of not providing good preventative care and general support, before people need more intensive care to stay at home.

I will outline the facts. The majority of those assessed do not receive a service. That is pretty astonishing, because they would not be assessed unless there was a fair likelihood that they needed the service. There is a wide variation in the number of assessments completed by local authorities as expressed per 1,000 of population. It is interesting to note that some of the lowest numbers are by authorities that you would think have probably more acute need. Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council records one of the lowest numbers of assessments per 1,000, as does the County Borough Council of Merthyr Tydfil. There is a real worry here. Those social services authorities are recording less than half the Welsh average, and they are only about a quarter of the

ddechrau'r 1990au. Dyna achosodd y pwysau yn y sector hwnnw. Mae'r sector annibynnol, sy'n amrywio o sefydliadau preifat i rai nad ydynt am wneud elw—ac mae'r sector nad yw am wneud elw yn werthfawr—yn arloesol; mae'n cyflogi llawer o bobl ac mae'n ymateb i angen penodol. Yr ydym yn siarad yn aml am ddarparwyr bach, sydd ond yn berchen ar un cartref efallai, neu sefydliad nad yw am wneud elw mewn ardal leol sy'n darparu gofal lleol priodol.

Mae'r diffyg cymorth y mae pobl yn ei dderbyn gan y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn peri pryder. Cynlluniwyd Deddf y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol a Gofal Cymunedol 1990 i gefnogi pobl yn eu cartrefi a'u helpu i fyw'n annibynnol cyhyd â bo hynny'n bosibl. Fodd bynnag, mae'r egwyddor hon yn cael ei thanseilio am fod llai o becynnau gofal yn cael eu cyflwyno gan awdurdodau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac mae'r rhai y maent yn eu darparu yn dwysáu'n gynyddol. Mae llai o bobl yn derbyn gwasanaeth, ond mae'r gwasanaeth hwnnw yn becyn llawer dwysach. Gwelwn symudiad i ffwrdd o ofal yn y gymuned i broses o ariannu gofal yn llawer cynharach na'r hyn sy'n ffafriol mewn cartrefi preswyl neu mewn cartrefi nyrso hyd yn oed. Felly, mae egwyddor gofal cymunedol yn cael ei danseilio'n llechwraidd—nid yn fwriadol, derbyniaf hynny. Dyna yw effaith peidio â darparu gofal ataliol da a chymorth cyffredinol, cyn bod angen gofal dwysach ar bobl er mwyn aros gartref.

Amlinellaf y ffeithiau. Nid yw'r mwyafrif o bobl a asesir yn derbyn gwasanaeth. Mae hynny'n eithaf syfrdanol, am na fyddent wedi cael eu hasesu oni bai bod tebygolrwydd y byddai angen y gwasanaeth arnynt. Ceir amrywiaeth mawr yn nifer yr asesiadau a gwblheir gan awdurdodau lleol a fynegir fesul 1,000 o'r boblogaeth. Mae'n ddiddorol nodi mai'r awdurdodau hynny y byddech yn disgwyl gweld angen mwy aciwt ynddynt sydd â'r niferoedd isaf. Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf sy'n cofnodi un o'r nifer isaf o asesiadau fesul 1,000 o'r boblogaeth, fel Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful. Mae hynny'n peri pryder mawr. Mae'r awdurdodau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol hyn yn cofnodi llai na hanner y cyfartaledd yng Nghymru, a dim ond tua

number provided by the highest authority in terms of the number of assessments per 1,000. The number of people receiving home care has declined quite dramatically since 1997. Then, 36,750 people were supported at home. Today, the figure has dropped to 26,000—a drop of a quarter, which is worrying.

I turn to local authorities and their position as providers or commissioners. The Chief Social Services Inspector was quite right to point out the problem of local authorities concentrating on their role as providers instead of maintaining their quality of service by being commissioners. They need to be commissioners above all else. To date, 65 per cent of homecare services are provided by local authorities. They provide two thirds of the care themselves. They are not following the Chief Social Services Inspector's advice. The range is remarkable. The number of homecare hours provided by the independent sector goes from under 1 per cent in Gwynedd, to 70 per cent in Cardiff, to the highest in the Vale of Glamorgan with 81 per cent. We need to encourage the homecare sector and the range and quality of services that it can provide. The best way to do so in the immediate future is to encourage the independent sector.

4:40 p.m.

Staffing challenges are a real problem. We have difficulties in recruiting and retaining staff. The number of people training for social work is falling, which is worrying. We are not recruiting younger people to be social workers. The morale of the workforce is low and needs to be improved. As politicians, we have a responsibility to talk up the sector, and to recognise its professionalism and the challenge of its work—[*Interruption.*] Will the Minister please stop her private conversation with the First Minister, which has gone on for some time, and listen to this point?

There is a problem with the statistics gathered in Wales. The chief inspector has pointed this out, and I ask the Minister to

chwarter o'r hyn a ddarperir gan yr awdurdodau uchaf o ran nifer yr asesiadau fesul 1,000 o'r boblogaeth. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n derbyn gofal yn y cartref wedi gostwng yn eithaf sylwedol ers 1997. Bryd hynny, yr oedd 36,750 o bobl yn cael cymorth yn y cartref. Heddiw, mae'r ffigur wedi gostwng i 26,000—gostyngiad o chwarter, sy'n peri pryder.

Trof at awdurdodau lleol a'u sefyllfa fel darparwyr neu gomisiynwyr. Yr oedd yn iawn i Brif Arolygydd y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol amlygu'r broblem fod awdurdodau lleol yn canolbwytio ar eu rôl fel darparwyr yn hytrach na chynnal ansawdd gwasanaeth drwy fod yn gomisiynwyr. Mae angen iddynt fod yn gomisiynwyr yn anad dim. Hyd yma, darperir 65 y cant o wasanaethau gofal yn y cartref gan awdurdodau lleol. Hwy sy'n darparu dwy ran o dair o'r gofal eu hunain. Nid ydynt yn dilyn cyngor Prif Arolygydd y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'r ystod yn rhyfeddol. Mae nifer yr oriau o ofal yn y cartref a ddarperir gan y sector annibynnol yn amrywio o ychydig o dan 1 y cant yng Ngwynedd i 70 y cant yng Nghaerdydd, ac i'r uchaf ym Mro Morgannwg sydd â 81 y cant. Rhaid inni annog y sector gofal yn y cartref ac ystod ac ansawdd y gwasanaethau y mae'n gallu eu darparu. Y ffordd orau o wneud hyn yn y dyfodol agos yw annog y sector annibynnol.

Mae staffio yn broblem wirioneddol. Cawn anhawster recriwtio a chadw staff. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu hyfforddi ar gyfer gwaith cymdeithasol yn gostwng, sy'n peri pryder. Nid ydym yn recriwtio pobl ifanc i fod yn weithwyr cymdeithasol. Mae morâl y gweithlu'n isel ac mae angen ei wella. Fel gwleidyddion, mae cyfrifoldeb arnom i ysgogi'r sector, ac i gydnabod ei broffesiynoldeb a sialens ei waith—[*Tori ar draws.*] A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r gorau i'w sgwrs breifat gyda'r Prif Weinidog, sydd wedi mynd ymlaen am gryn amser, a gwrando ar y pwnt hwn?

Mae problem o ran yr ystadegau a gesglir yng Nghymru. Mae'r prif arolygydd wedi amlygu hynny, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnal

conduct a review of the quality of the social services statistics gathered in Wales. I hope that she can respond specifically to that point.

The social care sector employs over 70,000 people. It is a vital part of a modern economy. It is a professional and challenging sector, and those who choose it as a career should be commended. We need to maintain a high political priority in social care. That goes from us down to local authorities, which often provide or oversee direct services. We need to review the level of fees in the residential and nursing home sector. Will the Minister agree to a review?

In conclusion, amendment 1 is unacceptable as it deletes point 2 of our motion, which directly calls for an increase in fees. We will not support that amendment. As far as Plaid Cymru's amendments are concerned, we support amendments 3, 6, 7 and 8, because they add to our motion.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Andrew Davies. In point 1 delete all after '*services in Wales*' and replace with:

*and their importance in supporting vulnerable people. It recognises the important contribution of the independent care sector and therefore welcomes the action which the Assembly is taking, working in partnership with that sector, the voluntary sector, local government and others to:*

*a. promote higher quality and standards through national minimum standards, regulation and consistent, independent inspection through the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales;*

*b. support the development of the social care workforce in the light of the Chief Social Services Inspector's report;*

*c. develop revised statutory guidance on the commissioning of social care;*

*d. support measures to tackle delayed*

adolygiad o ansawdd yr ystadegau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a geslir yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y gall ymateb yn benodol i'r pwyt hnwnw.

Mae'r sector gofal cymdeithasol yn cyflogi dros 70,000 o bobl. Mae'n rhan hanfodol o economi fodern. Mae'n sector proffesiynol a heriol, a dylid cymeradwyo'r rhai hynny sy'n ei ddewis fel gyrrfa. Rhaid inni barhau i roi blaenoriaeth wleidyddol uchel i ofal cymdeithasol. Mae hynny'n ymestyn o'r Cynulliad i lawr i'r awdurdodau lleol, sy'n aml yn darparu neu'n goruchwyllo gwasanaethau uniongyrchol. Mae angen inni arolygu lefel y ffioedd yn y sector cartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nyrsio. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gytuno ar adolygiad?

I gloi, mae gwelliant 1 yn annerbyniol am ei fod yn dileu pwyt 2 ein cynnig, sy'n galw'n uniongyrchol am gynnydd mewn ffioedd. Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hnwnw. O ran gwelliannau Plaid Cymru, cefnogwn welliannau 3, 6, 7 ac 8, am eu bod yn ychwanegu at ein cynnig.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Andrew Davies. Ym mhwynt 1 dileu popeth ar ôl 'gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru' a'i ddisodli gan:

*a'u pwysigrwydd wrth gynnal pobl hyglwyf. Mae'n cydnabod cyfraniad pwysig y sector gofal annibynnol ac felly'n croesawu'r camau y mae'r Cynulliad yn eu cymryd, gan weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r sector hnwnw, y sector gwirfoddol, llywodraeth leol ac eraill er mwyn:*

*a. hybu ansawdd a safonau uwch drwy safonau lleiafol cenedlaethol, rheoleiddio ac archwilio cyson ac annibynnol drwy Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru;*

*b. cefnogi datblygiad y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yng ngoleuni adroddiad Prif Arolygydd y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol;*

*c. datblygu canllawiau statudol diwygiedig ar gomisiynu gofal cymdeithasol;*

*d. cefnogi mesurau i fynd i'r afael ag oedi*

*transfer of care and to provide greater stability to the care home sector through the provision of £5 million in 2001-02 and 2002-03; and*

*e. maintain a constructive and open dialogue about issues of joint concern through regular meetings between the Minister for Health and Social Services and representatives of the independent care sector.*

and delete all of point 2.

**David Lloyd:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ym mhwynt 1(b) dileu popeth ar ôl ‘sector annibynnol’.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ar ddiwedd pwynt 1, ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd:

*f. yr anghysondebau hawl i fudd-dâl rhwng preswylwyr y sector gofal annibynnol a'r sector gofal statudol;*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Dileu pwynt 2(a) a rhoi'r geiriau a ganlyn yn ei le:

*a. codi lefelau cyflog a safonau fel ei gilydd yn y sector gofal drwy Gymru drwy lefel y ffioedd a delir i gartrefi preswyl a nyrsio;*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Dileu pwynt 2(b) a rhoi'r geiriau a ganlyn yn ei le:

*b. gwasanaethau gofal cymunedol a gyllidir yn ddigonol drwy Gymru;*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ar ddiwedd pwynt 2 ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd:

*e. sicrhau bod y sector cartrefi gofal annibynnol yn rhan annatod o gynllunio strategol anghenion gofal lleol. Rhaid gwneud hyn mewn partneriaeth â'r awdurdodau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol statudol;*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ar ddiwedd pwynt 2 ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd:

*f. hybu pwysigrwydd y cartref gofal annibynnol, fel cymuned fusnes fach fridorol, sy'n hanfodol i economi Cymru;*

*wrth drosglwyddo gofal a darparu mwy o sefydlogrwydd i'r sector cartrefi gofal drwy ddarparu £5 miliwn yn 2001-02 a 2002-03; a*

*e. cynnal deialog adeiladol ac agored ynghylch materion o ddiddordeb cyffredin drwy gyfarfodydd rheolaidd rhwng y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a chynrychiolwyr y sector gofal annibynnol.*

a dileu'r cyfan o bwynt 2.

**David Lloyd:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. In point 1(b) delete all after ‘*independent sector*’.

I propose amendment 3. At the end of point 1 add a new sub-point:

*f. the anomalies of benefit entitlement between residents of the independent and statutory care sector;*

I propose amendment 4. Delete point 2(a) and replace with:

*a. raise both wage levels and standards in the care sector across Wales through the level of fees paid to residential and nursing homes;*

I propose amendment 5. Delete point 2(b) and replace with:

*b. adequately fund community care services across Wales;*

I propose amendment 6. At the end of point 2 add a new sub-point:

*e. ensure that the independent care home sector is integral to the strategic planning of local care needs. This must be done in partnership with the statutory health and social care authorities;*

I propose amendment 7. At the end of point 2 add a new sub-point:

*f. promote the importance of the independent care home, as an indigenous small business community, which is vital to the Welsh*

economy;

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ar ddiwedd pwynt 2 ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd:

*g. cynyddu recriwtio a graddfeydd cadw pobl yn eu swyddi yn y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol drwy Gymru.*

Datganaf fy muddiant arferol fel meddyg teulu a chyngorydd sir.

Fel meddyg, ymwelais â llawer o gartrefi preswyl. Yr ydym yn awr ar ganol argyfwng colli gwelyau. Mae sôn bod rhestrau aros yn cynyddu'n aruthrol. Mae'r sector gofal preswyl yn bwysig i'r ddadl honno, gan fod dros 20,000 o welyau yn y sector gofal preifat yng Nghymru o dan fygythiad.

With the closure of our long-stay hospitals in the 1980s, long-stay elderly care was privatised overnight, so Wales was—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Efallai y caf ateb mwy cynhwysfawr gennych nag a gefais gan David Melding. Yr oedd y problemau hynny yn bodoli o'r dechrau oherwydd y diffyg cydlynu rhwng cartrefi preswyl, cartrefi nyrsio preifat, yr awdurdodau lleol a oedd yn eu rhannol-ariannu, awdurdodau iechyd, a'r gwasanaeth iechyd a oedd yn gyfrifol am asesiadau. Pe gosodid y strwythur hwnnw yn glir o'r dechrau, yn ôl yn yr 1980au, ni fyddai rhai o'r problemau a wynebwn yn awr wedi datblygu. Byddem wedi trosglwyddo pobl o welyau mewn ysbytai i welyau llawer rhatach mewn cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio.

**David Lloyd:** Cytunaf. Yr oedd angen strwythur penodol.

However, we are left with the legacy of Conservative policy. On top of that, we have the impact of the minimum wage—welcome as it is—the impact of the new standards, and health and safety measures, which all add significantly to increasing costs for care home owners. That means that care homes are closing across Wales.

This must not seem an isolated and unimportant issue simply because it is social

I propose amendment 8. At the end of point 2 add a new sub-point:

*g. increase recruitment and retention rates in the social care workforce across Wales.*

I declare my usual interest as a general practitioner and a county councillor.

As a doctor, I have visited many residential homes. We are now in the middle of a beds crisis. There is talk of an alarming increase in waiting lists. The residential care sector is important to that debate, because over 20,000 beds are under threat in the private care sector in Wales.

Yn sgîl cau ein hysbytai arhosiad hir yn y 1980au, preifateiddiwyd gofal arhosiad hir i'r henoed dros nos, felly yr oedd Cymru—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Perhaps you will give a more comprehensive reply than that given by David Melding. Those problems existed from the outset because of the lack of co-ordination between residential homes, private nursing homes, the local authorities that part-funded them, health authorities, and the health service, which was responsible for assessments. If that structure had been firmly laid down from the beginning, back in the 1980s, some of the problems that we currently face would not have developed. We would have transferred people from hospital beds to far cheaper beds in residential and nursing homes.

**David Lloyd:** I agree. A specific structure was needed.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi etifeddu polisi'r Ceidwadwyr. Ar ben hynny, mae gennym effaith yr isafswm cyflog—er ein bod yn ei groesawu—effaith y safonau newydd, a mesurau iechyd a diogelwch, sy'n ychwanegu'n sylweddol at y gost gynyddol i berchenogion cartrefi gofal. Mae hynny'n golygu bod cartrefi gofal yn cau ar draws Cymru.

Ni ddylid ystyried hyn fel mater unigryw a dibwys am mai mater gofal cymdeithasol

care. That is the importance of holding today's debate. It is about waiting lists, delayed discharges, bedblocking, and the need for more beds with our increasingly elderly population. We need more care beds, not acute beds. We must consider the needs of an increasingly elderly population. We should plan now, as Rhodri Glyn Thomas stated. We need to reconsider independent living; domiciliary care arrangements in our communities; residential care, such as residential villages; free personal care, and pension levels for our elderly. The residential care sector is in crisis and, in some areas, it faces a meltdown. Urgent funding is required. Fee levels must be considered and new care standards must be resourced. We need a national review of care home fees.

We must enable people to live independent lives in the community and we must invest in domiciliary care services in those communities. We need to promote healthy recruitment and retention rates in the social care workforce across Wales. Severe staff shortages, low pay and lack of career structure mean low retention rates of social care staff. The National Assembly needs to consider the care sector as one sector in terms of planning.

To conclude, we need urgent action by the Minister to prevent further home closures. We need a national planning process for beds to confirm what is happening now and to ensure that local health authorities and the private care sector plan for the future need of care beds. We also need funding for our social services and to ensure care standards. We are reaping the harvest of past Conservative ravages and are therefore providing a core service to our elderly population at the mercy of market forces. However, this debate is not about the past. It is about now. Present inaction is worse than past ravages. Action is now required to address fees and funding, and the complexities of care standards. We must ensure dignity and justice for the vulnerable and elderly population of Wales.

ydyw. Dyna pam fod cynnal y ddadl hon heddiw yn bwysig. Mae'n golygu rhestrau aros, oedi cyn rhyddhau cleifion, blocio gwelyau a'r angen am fwy o welyau ar gyfer ein poblogaeth sy'n gynyddol oedrannus. Mae angen mwy o welyau gofal arnom, nid gwelyau aciwt. Rhaid inni ystyried anghenion poblogaeth gynyddol oedrannus. Dylem gynllunio yn awr, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Mae angen ailystyried byw'n annibynnol; trefniadau gofal yn y cartref yn ein cymunedau, gofal preswyl, fel pentrefi preswyl; gofal personol am ddim a lefelau pensiwn ar gyfer ein henoed. Mae'r sector gofal preswyl mewn argyfwng ac, mewn rhai ardaloedd, bydd yn chwalu'n llwyr. Mae angen arian ar frys. Rhaid ystyried lefelau ffioedd a rhaid darparu adnoddau ar gyfer safonau gofal newydd. Mae angen adolygiad cenedlaethol o ffioedd gofal cartref.

Rhaid inni alluogi pobl i fyw bywydau annibynnol yn y gymuned a rhaid inni fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau gofal yn y cartref yn y cymunedau hynny. Rhaid inni hyrwyddo cyfraddau reciwtio a chadw da yn y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol ar draws Cymru. Mae prinderau staff difrifol, cyflogau isel a diffyg strwythur gyrfa yn golygu cyfraddau cadw isel ymhlih staff gofal cymdeithasol. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ystyried y sector gofal fel un sector yn nhermau cynllunio.

I gloi, mae angen i'r Gweinidog weithredu ar frys i atal rhagor o gartrefi rhag cau. Mae angen proses gynllunio genedlaethol arnom ar gyfer gwelyau er mwyn cadarnhau'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn awr ac i sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau iechyd lleol a'r sector gofal preifat yn cynllunio ar gyfer angen yn y dyfodol am welyau gofal. Mae angen mwy o arian ar ein gwasanaethau cymdeithasol hefyd ac i sicrhau safonau gofal. Yr ydym yn medi cynhaef dinistr y Ceidwadwyr yn y gorffennol ac felly yn darparu gwasanaeth craidd i'n poblogaeth oedrannus sy'n agored i rymoedd y farchnad. Fodd bynnag, nid dadl am y gorffennol yw hon, ond dadl gyfoes. Mae diffyg gweithredu yn awr yn waeth na dinistr y gorffennol. Mae angen gweithredu yn awr i fynd i'r afael â ffioedd ac ariannu, a natur gymhleth safonau gofal. Rhaid inni sicrhau urddas a chyflawnder i boblogaeth ddiamddiffyn ac oedrannus Cymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I will focus on a series of events and unanswered questions relating to a constituency matter: the Hazelcroft Residential Home for the elderly in Cardiff, a home that has now been closed.

This home was subject to an inquiry initiated by Cardiff City and County Council; the inspection report was produced quite recently. However, the inquiry and the report, I believe, failed to unearth the full truth about events there. When I finish, I hope that Members will agree that a totally independent inquiry is now necessary into the events at the home.

The background is simple. The problems started more than two years ago when a small group of elderly residents were taken on a brief holiday to Porthcawl. About a month later, a photograph of a resident was found in the possession of a staff member at the home. You might say that that is not unusual, but the elderly lady in the photograph was naked. Making a speech of this nature and outlining this fact, which is recognised in official Cardiff county council documentation, sickens me. You will be aware that I have never made a speech on social care. However, this issue requires sufficient attention by the Assembly. I take no pleasure in stating these details to Plenary today. The discovery of the photograph was the start of a story of mismanagement and mistrust. Almost tribal hatred existed between the staff, and the law was broken as regards residents' medication. All these facts are contained in the recent report. The lack of clear management lines and the mistrust between the staff created three distinct factions in the home, each recording and monitoring each other's errors. The report also refers to procedural irregularities relating to the administration of medication, particularly temazepam. However, the report does not refer to the incident concerning the photograph. It is not clear whether the staff members responsible for the photograph were disciplined according to established procedures, whether the police were involved or whether they are still working in the social services sector. These serious questions about this incident appear to have been

**Jonathan Morgan:** Canolbwytiaf ar gyfres o ddigwyddiadau ac atebion nas atebwyd mewn cysylltiad â mater etholiadol: Cartref Preswyl Hazelcroft ar gyfer yr henoed yng Nghaerdydd, cartref sydd bellach wedi cau.

Bu'r cartref yn destun ymchwiliad a gynhaliwyd gan Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd; cynhyrchwyd adroddiad yr archwiliad yn gymharol ddiweddar. Fodd bynnag, credaf na lwyddodd yr ymchwiliad na'r adroddiad i ddatgelu'r gwirionedd am y digwyddiadau yno. Ar ôl imi orffen, gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn cytuno bod angen ymchwiliad cwbl annibynnol yn awr i'r digwyddiadau yn y cartref.

Mae'r cefndir yn symbl. Dechreuodd y problemau dros ddwy flynedd yn ôl pan aethpwyd â grŵp bychan o breswylwyr oedrannus ar wyliau byr i Borthcawl. Tua mis yn ddiweddarach, canfuwyd ffotograff o un o'r preswylwyr ym meddiant aelod o staff yn y cartref. Efallai y byddech yn dweud nad yw hynny'n beth anghyffredin, ond yr oedd y wraig oedrannus yn y ffotograff yn noeth. Mae gwneud arai o'r math hwn ac amlinellu'r ffaith hon, a gydnabyddir yn nogfennaeth swyddogaeth cyngor sir Caerdydd, yn ffiadd imi. Byddwch yn ymwybodol nad wyf wedi areithio ar ofal cymdeithasol o'r blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae angen cryn sylw ar y mater hwn gan y Cynulliad. Nid yw'n bleser gennyf ddatgelu'r manylion hyn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Canfod y ffotograff oedd man cychwyn stori'n llawn camreolaeth a drwgdybiaeth. Yr oedd casineb bron yn llwythol yn bodoli rhwng y staff, a thorrwyd y gyfraith o ran meddyginaeth y preswylwyr. Mae'r ffeithiau hyn i gyd i'w gweld yn yr adroddiad diweddar. Crëodd y diffyg llinellau rheoli clir a'r ddrwgdybiaeth rhwng y staff dair carfan amlwg yn y cartref, gyda phob un ohonynt yn cofnodi ac yn monitro camgymeriadau ei gilydd. Cyfeiria'r adroddiad hefyd at afreoleidd-dra gweithdrefnol o ran gweinyddu meddyginaeth, yn arbennig temazepam. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio at y digwyddiad yn ymwneud â'r ffotograff. Nid yw'n glir a gafodd yr aelodau hynny o staff a oedd yn gyfrifol am y ffotograff eu disgyblu yn unol â gweithdrefnau sefydledig, a alwyd yr heddlu

conveniently overlooked by Cardiff council.

neu a ydynt yn parhau i weithio yn y sector gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Ymddengys fod cyngor Caerdydd wedi anwybyddu'r cwestiynau difrifol am y digwyddiad hwn.

4:50 p.m.

Furthermore, a series of allegations have been made against most, if not all staff members, at the home. Many of the allegations have subsequently been dropped and many remain unsubstantiated. Only one staff member was sacked, a few were moved elsewhere, and the rest remain suspended. I have met with some of the staff, whose accounts of events at the home have astonished me. I have serious reservations about the manner in which this matter has been dealt with.

Yn ogystal, gwnaed cyfres o gyhuddiadau yn erbyn y rhan fwyaf o aelodau o staff y cartref, os nad pob un ohonynt. Mae llawer o'r cyhuddiadau wedi'u tynnu yn ôl ers hynny ac ni phrofwyd llawer ohonynt o hyd. Dim ond un aelod o staff a ddiswyddwyd, cafodd rhai eu symud i fannau eraill, ac mae'r gweddill wedi'u gwahardd o hyd. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â rhai aelodau o'r staff, ac mae eu hanesion am y digwyddiadau yn y cartref wedi fy syfrdanu. Mae gennyl amheuon difrifol ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â'r mater hwn.

There have also been serious questions about the role of senior officers within the authority in their handling of this problem. It is doubtful whether those officers correctly applied the procedures for dealing with staff members and whether council officers displayed favouritism towards any of the staff members during the investigation into the allegations. This appalling series of events has unfolded with the full knowledge of the chief executive, and I suspect, by implication, the Lord Mayor.

Codwyd cwestiynau difrifol hefyd ynglŷn â'r rôl uwch swyddogion o fewn yr awdurdod a'u ffordd o ddelio â'r broblem hon. Mae'n annhebygol bod y swyddogion hynny wedi defnyddio'r gweithdrefnau'n briodol ar gyfer delio ag aelodau o staff a pha un a ddangosodd swyddogion y cyngor ffafriaeth tuag at unrhyw aelodau o'r staff yn ystod yr ymchwiliad i mewn i'r cyhuddiadau. Mae'r gyfres erchyll hon o ddigwyddiadau wedi dod i'r amlwg gyda gwybodaeth lawn y prif weithredwr, ac fe gredaf, drwy oblygiad, Yr Arglwydd Faer.

I can only conclude that an independent investigation initiated by the Government of Wales is the only option—

Gallaf ond casglu mai ymchwiliad annibynnol wedi'i ysgogi gan Lywodraeth Cymru yw'r unig opsiwn—

**Owen John Thomas:** Did you know that the whistle-blower, the person who brought this to the authority's attention in the first place, was not treated well by the authority and was made to feel uncomfortable for a long time? Do you agree that the presence of five line managers in the home after these events had been reported made it more difficult to achieve success? No-one knew where the buck stopped or who should take responsibility for what went on there. The authority's part in this matter has been disgraceful. Two years went by before the report was published. The inquiry only started a short time ago. It reminds me—

**Owen John Thomas:** A wyddoch chi na chafodd y person a dynnodd sylw'r awdurdod at y mater hwn i ddechrau, ei drin yn dda iawn gan yr awdurdod ac y gwnaed iddo deimlo'n anghyfforddus am grym amser? A gytunwch fod presenoldeb pum rheolwr llinell yn y cartref ar ôl datgelu'r digwyddiadau hynny wedi'i gwneud hi'n anos i sicrhau llwyddiant? Ni wyddai neb pwy oedd yn bennaf cyfrifol neu pwy ddylai ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yno. Mae rhan yr awdurdod yn y mater hwn wedi bod yn warthus. Aeth dwy flynedd heibio cyn i'r adroddiad gael ei gyhoeddi. Dim ond yn ddiweddar y dechreuodd yr ymchwiliad. Mae'n fy

atgoffa—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. An intervention is not a speech.

**Owen John Thomas:** Do you agree, Jonathan, that the similarities between these events and those that took place in young people's homes some years ago—which took a decade or more to come out—makes you feel that we have not learnt much from that lesson? What happened to young people some years ago happens today in old people's homes and it is being kept quiet. There is great concern among the public—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Come on.

**Owen John Thomas:** The National Assembly needs to act swiftly to ensure that this will end quickly.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I agree with your sentiments. Unless this matter is dealt with swiftly through an independent investigation, we will never know whether similar management procedural mishaps have occurred elsewhere. I am not necessarily talking about the allegation that I have brought to light this afternoon, but about the other incidents that occurred at the home. We do not want to be in a situation whereby we later discover that many other elderly residential care homes had faced some of the same difficulties. With regards to those individuals, against whom allegations were made, I understand that there was more than one whistle-blower. I think that a number of individuals had discovered the photograph and were subsequently subject to allegations themselves. That indicates that this is a messy and complicated affair. I only hope that by presenting the matter to the Assembly this afternoon, we will progress to holding a full independent inquiry. That is the only option in order to establish who did what, when and how. Anything less will be seen as a neglect of duty by the Minister for Health and Social Services. If we are to prevent any such occurrences in future, my demand for an independent inquiry must be satisfied.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw ymyriad yn arraith.

**Owen John Thomas:** A gytunwch, Jonathan, fod y tebygrwydd rhwng y digwyddiadau hyn a'r rhai a ddigwyddodd mewn cartrefi pobl ifanc rai blynyddoedd yn ôl—digwyddiadau a gymerodd ddegawd neu fwy i'w datgelu—yn gwneud ichi deimlo nad ydym wedi dysgu llawer o'r wers honno? Mae'r hyn a ddigwyddodd i bobl ifanc rai blynyddoedd yn ôl yn digwydd heddiw mewn cartrefi hen bobl ac mae pobl yn cadw'n ddistaw am y peth. Mae pryder mawr ymhlið y cyhoedd—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dewch ymlaen.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol weithredu'n gyflym i sichrau canlyniad cyflym i hyn.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf o'r un farn â chi. Oni chaiff y mater hwn ei ddatrys yn gyflym drwy ymchwiliad annibynnol, ni chanfyddwn fyth pa un a yw tor-gweithdrefnau rheoli anffodus tebyg wedi digwydd mewn lleoedd eraill. Nid wyf o reidrwydd yn sôn am yr honiad a amlygais y prynhawn yma, ond y digwyddiadau eraill a ddigwyddodd yn y cartref. Nid ydym am fod mewn sefyllfa lle byddwn yn canfod yn nes ymlaen bod nifer o breswylwyr oedrannus cartrefi gofal eraill wedi wynebu'r un anawsterau. O ran yr unigolion hynny a gyhuddwyd, deallaf fod mwy nag un wedi tynnu sylw at y cam-drin. Credaf fod nifer o unigolion wedi canfod y ffotograff ac i honiadau gael eu gwneud yn eu herbyn hwy yn ddiweddarach. Mae hynny'n awgrymu bod hyn yn fater anhreftus a chymhleth. Fy ngobaith yw, drwy gyflwyno'r mater hwn i'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma, y byddwn yn symud ymlaen ac yn cynnal ymchwiliad annibynnol llawn. Dyna'r unig opsiwn er mwyn sefydlu pwy wnaeth beth, pryd a sut. Bydd unrhyw beth arall yn ymddangos fel esgeuluso dyletswydd ar ran y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Os ydym am atal unrhyw ddigwyddiadau o'r fath yn y dyfodol, rhaid bodloni fy nghais am ymchwiliad annibynnol.

**Kirsty Williams:** In the Health and Social Services Committee, we try to allocate equal time to health and social care. However, it is often difficult to ensure that social care is given the due attention that it deserves in and outside this Chamber. The media is often full of stories about what goes on in our hospitals. We spend much time discussing our doctors and nurses. However, we see few stories in the media about what is happening in social care. We must acknowledge David Melding's motion concerning the increasing difficulties and pressures facing our social services departments. That is a reality. David is right, this is not the time to discuss what happened under past administrations, it is far too important for that. I welcome his constructive approach in raising this subject this afternoon to look for solutions for what are real problems experienced by people in our communities. He is right to say that the increasing pressure is real.

I will focus particularly on services for the elderly and the issues of care-home funding by local authorities. Despite the growing use of special grants by the partnership Government—and we have a good record in increasing the levels of special grants given to social services departments in Wales—social service funding levels are primarily decided by local authorities and their officers. I am particularly concerned that social services typically form a lower proportion of total council expenditure in Wales than it does in England. That was reported by the joint review in Wales team in collaboration with the Audit Commission. We are spending less in Wales than they do in England. The report, 'Learning the Lessons', also states that, perhaps, those scarce resources are not being used in the best possible way in terms of value for money and, more importantly, in providing flexible services for service users.

Preventative care and rehabilitation have taken a back seat. A one-size-fits-all mentality pervades the system when the

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ceisiwn dreulio amser cyfartal ar iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anodd sicrhau yn aml y rhoddir y sylw y mae gofal cymdeithasol yn ei haeddu y tu mewn a thu allan i'r Siambr hon. Mae'r cyfryngau yn aml yn llawn hanesion am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn ein hysbytai. Treuliwn lawer o amser yn trafod ein meddygon a'n nyrssy. Fodd bynnag, nid oes llawer o hanesion yn y cyfryngau am yr hyn sy'n digwydd ym maes gofal cymdeithasol. Rhaid inni gydnabod cynnig David Melding ynglŷn â'r anawsterau a'r pwysau cynyddol y mae adrannau ein gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn eu hwynebu. Dyna yw'r sefyllfa. Mae'n gywir i David ddweud nad yw'n amser i drafod yr hyn a ddigwyddodd o dan weinyddiaethau yn y gorffennol, mae'n llawer rhy bwysig i hynny. Croesawaf ei ymagwedd adeiladol wrth godi'r pwnc hwn heddiw er mwyn chwilio am atebion i'r problemau gwirioneddol a brofir gan bobl yn ein cymunedau. Mae'n gywir iddo ddweud bod y pwysau cynyddol yn bwysau gwirioneddol.

Canolbwytiaf yn benodol ar wasanaethau i'r henoed a'r mater o ariannu cartrefi gofal gan awdurdodau lleol. Er gwaethaf y defnydd cynyddol a wneir o grantiau arbennig gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth—ac mae gennym enw da o ran codi lefelau'r grantiau arbennig a roddir gan adrannau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru—awdurdodau lleol a'u swyddogion sy'n penderfynu ar lefelau ariannu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn bennaf. Pryderaf yn arbennig fod y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn cael cyfran is o gyfanswm gwariant cyngorau yng Nghymru na'r hyn a welir yn Lloegr. Nodwyd hynny gan dim yr adolygiad ar y cyd yng Nghymru mewn cydweithrediad â'r Comisiwn Archwilio. Yr ydym yn gwario llai yng Nghymru na'r hyn a werir yn Lloegr. Mae'r adroddiad, 'Dysgu'r Gwersi' hefyd yn nodi nad yw'r adnoddau prin hynny efallai yn cael eu defnyddio yn y ffordd orau yn nhermau gwerth am arian ac, yn bwysicach, o ran darparu gwasanaethau hyblyg i ddefnyddwyr y gwasanaeth.

Mae gofal ataliol ac adsefydlu wedi ildio'r lle blaenaf i raddau. Mae meddylfryd bod un peth yn addas i bawb yn bodoli yn y system

opposite is the case. We must all work together to seek out examples of best practice, to find ways in which we can ensure that services are provided for individuals based on individual needs. That is difficult when—as David correctly points out—the statistics on which to base our policies are clearly inadequate, as we starkly found out during last week's Health and Social Services Committee. We do not have basic baseline figures on which to base strategies for the future because figures are collated and collected in different ways depending on the authority.

In terms of value for money, 'Learning the Lessons' showed that independent sector provision can cost less than the equivalent in-house services. Throughout the principality, I have not found an authority whose in-house residential care costs are the same as or less than the fees paid to people who receive care in the private residential sector. I am not saying that that is a bad thing. I am saying, and the report states, that we must ensure robust figures and evidence by which decisions to provide care in an in-house setting are made. This is not a question of driving resources down to the lowest common denominator. It is about ensuring that realistic fees are paid for care in whichever sector it is received. This is clearly not the case at present. Many reports and studies have recommended a weekly fee of between £420 and £490 as being a realistic price for care. That is not the reality for the independent care sector at present. The result is the huge closure of beds—some 800 in the first six months of 2001. Worse than home closures is, for the less scrupulous, a lowering of standards in those homes, which could lead to potentially disastrous situations for those residents who find themselves in that setting.

Choice in residential care is key, and commissioning services should reflect that. People should have a choice when faced with the prospect of entering a residential home, which for many is often an unwelcome situation. The ability to choose where they go could help lessen the blow of the loss of some element of independence. That is

pan fo'r gwrthwyneb yn wir. Rhaid inni gydweithio i ganfod yr enghreifftiau o arfer gorau, er mwyn inni ddod o hyd i ffyrdd o sicrhau y darperir gwasanaethau i unigolion ar sail anghenion unigol. Mae hynny'n anodd pan fo'r ystadegau—a nodwyd yn gywir gan David—y seilir ein polisiau arnynt yn amlwg yn annigonol, a gwnaethpwyd hynny'n gwbl eglur inni ystod cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf. Nid oes gennym ffigurau gwaelodlin sylfaenol ar gyfer seilio strategaethau'r dyfodol am fod ffigurau'n cael eu coladu a'u casglu mewn gwahanol ffyrdd yn dibynnu ar yr awdurdod.

Yn nhermau gwerth am arian, dangosodd 'Dysgu'r Gwersi' y gall darpariaeth y sector annibynnol gostio llai na darpariaeth gyfatebol yn y gwasanaethau mewnol. Drwy Gymru gyfan, nid wyf wedi dod o hyd i awdurdod y mae eu costau gofal preswyl mewnol yr un peth neu'n llai na'r ffioedd a delir i bobl sy'n derbyn gofal yn y sector preswyl preifat. Nid wyf yn dweud bod hynny'n beth drwg. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud, fel y nodir yn yr adroddiad, yw fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau ffigurau a thystiolaeth gadarn er mwyn gwneud penderfyniadau i ddarparu gofal mewn lleoliad mewnol. Nid mater o ostwng adnoddau i'r lefel isaf bosibl yw hyn. Mae'n fater o sicrhau y telir ffioedd realistig am ofal ym mha sector bynnag sy'n ei ddarparu. Mae'n amlwg nad hyn sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Mae llawer o adroddiadau ac astudiaethau wedi argymhell ffi wythnosol o rhwng £420 a £490 fel pris realistig am ofal. Nid dyna sy'n digwydd yn y sector gofal annibynnol ar hyn o bryd. Canlyniad hyn yw cau nifer aruthrol o welyau—tua 800 yn ystod chwe mis cyntaf 2001. Yr hyn sy'n waeth na chau cartrefi, i'r rhai llai egwyddorol, yw gostwng safonau yn y cartrefi hynny, a allai arwain at sefyllfaoedd argyfngus i'r preswylwyr hynny sy'n mynd i fyw mewn cartref o'r fath.

Mae cael dewis gofal preswyl yn holl bwysig, a dylai gwasanaethau comisiynu adlewyrchu hynny. Dylai pobl gael dewis pan fyddant yn wynebu gorfod symud i gartref preswyl, sy'n sefyllfa annifyr i lawer o bobl. Gallai dewis lle y byddant yn mynd helpu i leddfu'r boen o golli rhywfaint o annibyniaeth. Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig mewn ardaloedd

particularly important in rural areas where you might find people displaced from their communities and shifted to another part just to ensure that they fill a local bed. It will be a challenge to local authorities to change from the previous culture of services provision, and to embrace becoming the arranger and watchdog in a mixed economy of services.

5:00 p.m.

**Peter Rogers:** I will speak briefly about the impending crisis in my own area, Anglesey. Since coming to the Assembly, I have continually raised and sought recognition with both the First Minister and Jane for the problems we have in the care sector, in residential and nursing homes. Today, because of the Minister's failure to ensure a fair and adequate fees structure, homes have been forced into terminating their contracts with the council. This morning, registered letters were delivered to our council for two homes terminating their contracts to take effect from 31 March. That means that the council will lose 96 nursing beds, or 50 per cent of all nursing beds in this sector from 31 March. These two homes are purposely built, meeting every necessary requirement of the care standards. I can only guess the impact that this will have on any attempt to reduce bed blocking. Fees do not reflect the cost of providing care. It is as simple as that. Those with an untrained eye would be forgiven for thinking that you were deliberately delaying addressing the fees structure until you had fewer homes to deal with. For too long, the independent providers have been effectively subsidising a public service.

On the money that you are providing this winter, serious questions must be asked as to where it is going. On Anglesey, the social services department has used a proportion of that money to temporarily increase fees, but that has not resulted in any additional placements in homes. Perhaps the Minister can explain how that money has relieved bed blocking in the absence of additional placements. As Members have said, we need accurate comparative statistics on the relative costs between council-run homes and independent sector homes. The suspicion is

gwledig lle caiff pobl eu symud o bosibl o'u cymunedau i ardal arall er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn llenwi gwely lleol. Bydd yn her i awdurdodau lleol newid o'r diwylliant blaenorol o ddarparu gwasanaethau, ac i achub ar y cyfle o fod yn drefnwr ac yn gorff gwarchod mewn economi gymysg o wasanaethau.

**Peter Rogers:** Siaradaf yn fyr am yr argyfwng sy'n wynebu fy ardal fy hun, Ynys Môn. Ers dod i'r Cynulliad, yr wyf wedi codi'r problemau sydd gennym yn y sector gofal, mewn cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio gyda'r Prif Weinidog a chyda Jane ac wedi ceisio cael cydnabyddiaeth ohonynt. Heddiw, oherwydd methiant y Gweinidog i sicrhau strwythur ffioedd teg a phriodol, gorfodwyd cartrefi i derfynu eu contractau gyda'r cyngor. Y bore yma, dosbarthwyd llythyrau cofrestredig i'n cyngor ar gyfer dau gartref a oedd yn terfynu eu contractau a hynny'n dod i rym o 31 Mawrth. Mae hynny'n golygu y bydd y cyngor yn colli 96 o welyau nyrsio, neu 50 y cant o welyau nyrsio yn y sector hwn o 31 Mawrth. Adeiladwyd y cartrefi hyn yn benodol at y pwrrpas, gyda phob gofyniad angenrheidiol y safonau gofal yn cael eu bodloni. Gallaf ond dyfalu effaith hyn ar unrhyw ymdrech i leihau'r broblem o flocio gwelyau. Nid yw ffioedd yn adlewyrchu'r gost o ddarparu gofal. Mae mor syml â hynny. Gellir maddau i'r rhai anwybodus am feddwl eich bod yn oedi trafod y strwythur ffioedd yn fwriadol nes y bydd gennych lai o gartrefi i ddelio â hwy. Mae darparwyr annibynnol wedi bod yn sybsideiddio gwasanaeth cyhoeddus i bob diben ers gormod o amser.

O ran yr arian yr ydych yn ei ddarparu'r gaeaf hwn, rhaid gofyn cwestiynau difrifol ynglŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd. Ar Ynys Môn, mae'r adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi defnyddio cyfran o'r arian hwnnw i godi'r ffioedd dros dro, ond nid yw hynny wedi arwain at unrhyw leoliadau ychwanegol mewn cartrefi. Efallai y gall y Gweinidog esbonio sut mae'r arian hwnnw wedi lleddfu'r broblem o flocio gwelyau yn absenoldeb lleoliadau ychwanegol. Fel y dywedodd Aelodau, mae angen ystadegau cymharol cywir arnom ar y costau cymharol

that money is being wasted, or is inefficiently subsidising council homes. For example, the latest statistics indicate that on Anglesey, 95.5 per cent of all care for the elderly is provided in-house compared with only 76 per cent across the rest of Wales. The situation does not improve in the case of domiciliary care. On Anglesey, 99.6 per cent of domiciliary care is carried out in-house at double the fees paid to other care providers. Perhaps the Minister would like to explain how that is justified in terms of best value. The other serious problem that we face, particularly during holiday and Christmas time, is that for five weeks there is no way of bringing people out of hospital and into care because there is no system to track people who are away. A system must be set up where, for five weeks, the problem of bed blocking can be addressed.

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as leader of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. The tone of today's debate reminds me of the old argument—who closed the most pits: the Tories or Labour? The truth is that they all closed their fair share.

In the 1980s, I was a Mid-Glamorgan county councillor when there was a mushrooming of independent sector care homes in that area. Given that the Conservative Government was in power at that time, it was highly intent on dismantling local government and all the services that it provided. In time, that led to the closure of many residential homes in the local authority sector. Now we are reaping the effects of that. The cost of local authority homes—

**David Melding:** You may be able to reflect on your experience as the leader of a large county council. Do you believe that the Chief Inspector of Social Services is correct when he says that you should be concentrating on your commissioning role rather than your provider role? All we are hearing are references to 'provider'.

**Pauline Jarman:** The joint review that my

rhwng cartrefi sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan y cyngor a chartrefi'r sector annibynnol. Amheuir bod arian yn cael ei wastraffu, neu'n ei ddefnyddio fel cymhorthdal aneffeithiol i gartrefi'r cyngor. Er enghraift, dengys yr ystadegau diweddaraf am Ynys Môn, fod 95.5 y cant o'r holl ofal a ddarperir i'r henoed yn fewnol o'i gymharu â dim ond 76 y cant ar draws gweddill Cymru. Nid yw'r sefyllfa'n gwella yn achos gofal yn y cartref. Ar Ynys Môn, darperir 99.6 y cant o ofal cartref yn fewnol am ddwbl y ffioedd a delir i ddarparwyr gofal eraill. Efallai yr hoffai'r Gweinidog esbonio sut y gellir cyflawnhau hynny yn nhermau gwerth gorau. Y broblem ddifrifol arall sy'n ein hwynnebu, yn arbennig yn ystod adegau o wyliau a'r Nadolig yw, nad oes ffordd o ryddhau pobl o ysbytai ac i mewn i ofal am tua pum wythnos am nad oes unrhyw system ar gyfer cofnodi pobl sydd i ffwrdd. Rhaid sefydlu system lle gellir mynd i'r afael â'r broblem o flocio gwelyau, am bum wythnos.

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae naws dadl heddiw yn fy atgoffa o'r hen ddadl—pwy gaeodd mwy o'r pyllau glo: y Torïaid neu Lafur? Y gwirionedd yw bod y naill a'r llall wedi cau cyfran deg ohonynt.

Yn y 1980au, yr oeddwn yn gynghorydd yn sir Morgannwg Ganol pan fu cynnydd aruthrol yn nifer y cartrefi gofal sector annibynnol yn yr ardal honno. O ystyried bod Llywodraeth Geidwadol mewn grym ar y pryd, yr oedd yn benderfynol iawn o chwalu llywodraeth leol a'r holl wasanaethau a ddarparodd. Ymh'en amser, arweiniodd hynny at gau llawer o gartrefi preswyl yn y sector awdurdod lleol. Yn awr, yr ydym yn dioddef effeithiau hynny. Cost cartrefi awdurdod lleol—

**David Melding:** Efallai y gallwch adlewyrchu ar eich profiad fel arweinydd cyngor sir mawr. A gredwch fod Prif Arolygydd y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gywir pan ddywedodd y dylech fod yn canolbwytio ar eich rôl gomisiynu yn hytrach na'ch rôl fel darparwr? Y cyfan a glywn yw cyfeiriadau at 'ddarparwr'.

**Pauline Jarman:** Yr oedd yr adolygiad ar y

authority undertook was based on the services of the previous administration, as you will know, when it was described as having its head in the sand like an ostrich. I assure you that the current administration has satisfied the Audit Commission that it is on course to remedy those serious deficiencies from 1999 when the last review was undertaken.

The real issue is that all local authorities in Wales have a statutory duty, as Members know, to arrange and provide residential and nursing accommodation for those assessed as needing such provision. Since 1993, councils have been responsible for funding provision for new residents. That provision constitutes a mix of local authority homes, and residential and nursing homes run by independent providers. There is a serious growth, in Valley communities at least, in that sector. I appeal for local authority and independently run homes to have equal roles in providing these services for the elderly, sick and disabled.

Nationally, social services rates have not reflected the increases and the total cost of provision in the independent sector. The minimum wage and the working time directive have been widely quoted as having a significant effect on that cost. I welcomed the introduction of the working time directive and the minimum wage, albeit that I would like to see the latter increase from its present level. Let us not underestimate that difficulties in recruiting and retaining staff have much to do with the hourly rate and terms and conditions of service not being commensurate with staff responsibilities and duties. Staff must be properly remunerated and, under no circumstance, must ever again be exploited as they have been in the past.

Recent reports in *Community Care Press* indicate that providers in one local authority area will no longer accept new admissions.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you agree that one of the most serious problems with recruitment in the care homes sector is that, due to the fact that

cyd a gynhaliwyd gan fy awdurdod yn seiliedig ar wasanaethau'r weinyddiaeth flaenorol, fel y gwyddoch, pan ddywedwyd ei fod yn cuddio ei ben yn y tywod. Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau bod y weinyddiaeth bresennol wedi bodloni'r Comisiwn Archwilio ei fod ar y trywydd iawn i unioni'r gwendidau difrifol hynny ers 1999 pan gynhaliwyd yr adolygiad diwethaf.

Y mater pwysig yw bod gan bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru ddyletswydd statudol, fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, i drefnu a darparu llety preswyl a nysrio i'r rhai yr aseswyd bod angen darpariaeth o'r fath arnynt. Ers 1993, mae cyngorau wedi bod yn gyfrifol am ariannu'r ddarpariaeth i breswylwyr newydd. Mae'r ddarpariaeth honno yn cynnwys cymysgedd o gartrefi awdurdod lleol a chartrefi preswyl a nysrio wedi'u rhedeg gan ddarparwyr annibynnol. Ceir twf aruthrol, yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd o leiaf, yn y sector hwnnw. Galwaf am i gartrefi'r awdurdodau lleol a'r rhai annibynnol gael yr un swyddogaethau wrth ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hynny i'r henoed, y cleifion a'r anabl.

Yn genedlaethol, nid yw cyfraddau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi adlewyrchu'r cynydd a chyfanswm cost darpariaeth yn y sector annibynnol. Soniwyd yn helaeth bod yr isafswm cyflog a'r gyfarwyddeb amser gweithio wedi effeithio'n arwyddocaol ar y gost honno. Croesawais y penderfyniad i gyflwyno'r gyfarwyddeb amser gweithio a'r isafswm cyflog, er y byddwn wedi hoffi gweld yr isafswm cyflog yn cynyddu o'i lefel bresennol. Ni ddylem danbrisio'r cyswllt rhwng anawsterau reciwtio a chadw staff â'r ffaith nad yw'r tâl fesul awr a'r amodau a thelerau gwaith yn adlewyrchu cyfrifoldebau a dyletswyddau staff. Dylid talu cyflog priodol i staff ac ni ddylid fyth fanteisio arnynt, o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau, fel y gwnaed yn y gorffennol.

Mae adroddiadau diweddar yn *Community Care Press* yn dangos na fydd darparwyr un ardal awdurdod lleol yn derbyn derbyniadau newydd mwyach.

**Brian Gibbons:** A gytunwch mai un o'r problemau mwyaf difrifol sy'n gysylltiedig â reciwtio yn y sector cartrefi gofal yw,

the Labour Government has been so successful in reducing the levels of unemployment and increasing take-home pay, the care homes sector is no longer as attractive an employment proposition? Do you also agree that, until this issue is addressed, in terms of training, pay and so forth, we are not likely to solve the problems highlighted by Peter Rogers?

**Pauline Jarman:** I have never been an advocate of low pay in any sector. Many people who used to work in the care homes sector have been lost to the retail sector, where life is far more convenient, and there is less responsibility in filling supermarket shelves.

The net reduction of places throughout Wales has led to an increase in delayed transfers of care from hospital over the winter months. That is undoubtedly. There is no doubt also that the independent sector is under extreme pressure. Work needs to be undertaken to further strengthen the contractual arrangements with providers, not only to secure quality services for all residents, but also good working conditions for the people who work in local authority and independent care homes.

**William Graham:** The Minister has a much-vaunted mission statement in this matter, and the words ‘one sector, one workforce’ are always used. How does she explain, therefore, the difference between the published figures, which show that the average contribution to a independent residential care home is approximately £235, while it is perhaps as much as £550 for local authority homes? It is a small wonder that there are declining places.

Independent homes provide quality care and are committed to raising standards. Many of their staff train effectively through the National Vocational Qualification process. Recently in my area, three homes that have operated successfully and served the community well—one for over 22 years—were closed. Inadequate funding by the Assembly Executive led to their inability to continue to provide much-needed care. As

oherwydd y ffaith bod Llywodraeth Lafur wedi llwyddo cystal i leihau lefelau diweithdra a chynyddu cyflogau, nid yw'r sector cartrefi gofal yn cynnig cyflogaeth mor ddeniadol erbyn hyn? A gytunwch hefyd, nes y trafodir y mater hwn, yn nhermau hyfforddiant, cyflog ac ati, nid ydym yn debygol o ddatrys y problemau a amlygwyd gan Peter Rogers?

**Pauline Jarman:** Nid wyf erioed wedi cefnogi cyflog isel mewn unrhyw sector. Mae llawer o bobl a arferai weithio yn y sector cartrefi gofal wedi'u colli i'r sector manwerthu, lle mae bywyd yn llawer mwy cyfleus, ac mae ganddynt lawer llai o gyfrifoldebau wrth lenwi silffoedd archfarchnadoedd.

Mae'r gostyngiad net mewn lleoedd ledled Cymru wedi arwain at gynnydd yn yr oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal o ysbytai dros fisioedd y gaeaf. Nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Nid oes amheuaeth ychwaith bod y sector annibynnol o dan bwysau aruthrol. Mae angen gwneud gwaith i atgyfnerthu ymhellach y trefniadau contractio gyda darparwyr, nid yn unig er mwyn sicrhau gwasanaethau o safon i bob preswyliwr, ond hefyd amodau gwaith da i'r bobl sy'n gweithio mewn cartrefi awdurdodau lleol a gofal annibynnol.

**William Graham:** Ceir llawer o sôn am ddatganiad cenhadaeth y Gweinidog ar y mater hwn, a defnyddir y geiriau ‘un sector, un gweithlu’ bob tro. Sut mae'n esbonio, felly, y gwahaniaeth rhwng y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd, sy'n dangos mai tua £235, ar gyfartaledd, yw'r cyfraniad i gartref gofal preswyl annibynnol, tra'i fod cymaint â £550 efallai ar gyfer cartrefi awdurdodau lleol? Nid oes ryfedd bod gostyngiad yn nifer y lleoedd sydd ar gael.

Mae cartrefi annibynnol yn darparu gofal o safon ac yn ymrwymedig i godi safonau. Mae llawer o'u staff yn cael eu hyfforddi'n effeithiol drwy'r broses Cymhwyster Galwedigaethol Cenedlaethol. Yn ddiweddar yn fy ardal i, mae tri chartref sydd wedi gweithredu'n llwyddiannus ac wedi gwasanaethu'r gymuned yn dda—un ohonynt am dros 22 mlynedd—wedi cau. Oherwydd nad oedd Gweithrediaeth y Cynulliad wedi'u

Peter said, we are told that in south-east Wales there are approximately 2,000 cases of bedblocking, with people who would be better placed in residential care being retained in hospitals. This is impeding acute needs. Adequate funding on a fair and level playing field is now essential.

hariannu'n ddigonol, nid oeddent yn gallu parhau i ddarparu'r gofal y mae galw mawr amdano. Fel y dywedodd Peter, dywedir wrthym am ryw 2,000 o achosion o flocio gwelyau yn y De-ddwyrain, gan gadw pobl mewn ysbytai y byddai'n well eu lleoli mewn gofal preswyl. Dyma yw anghenion aciwt brys. Mae arian digonol wedi'i ddosbarthu'n deg yn hanfodol erbyn hyn.

5:10 p.m.

**Ann Jones:** I was surprised, but delighted, to see the topic put forward by the Conservatives for this debate. The current situation in the care sector—you are going to get a short history lesson here—is, of course, the product of a Conservative policy decision from 1981, Peter, to allow supplementary benefit payments to top up private care home fees. As a result, huge numbers of private nursing and care homes sprung up almost overnight across the country. Between 1981 and 1993, Conservative Governments spent £10 billion subsidising private care homes. How much of that money could have been invested in ensuring that the care in the community programme, which your Government introduced, became a reality and actually worked, rather than used to subsidise private care homes?

**David Davies rose—**

**Ann Jones:** I do not have time to take an intervention, David. You have ranted enough today.

It is important that care home places are available to those who need them, but more of the same will not do if we are to provide real choices and independence for older people. I get depressed when I listen to criticisms, almost wholly based on the decline in the number of care beds. If community care is working, there will of course be a decline in the number of care beds. I meet regularly with the independent private care sector in my constituency because I see it as a valuable partner in taking forward the social care agenda. I am pleased that, during the consultation on the minimum standards, most care home owners were

**Ann Jones:** Yr oeddwn wedi fy synnu, ond yn falch o weld bod y pwnc hwn wedi'i gyflwyno ar gyfer y ddadl hon gan y Ceidwadwyr. Mae'r sefyllfa bresennol yn y sector gofal—yr ydych am gael gwers hanes fer yn awr—wrth gwrs, yn ganlyniad i benderfyniad polisi'r Ceidwadwyr yn 1981, Peter, i ganiatáu taliadau budd-dal ategol i gael eu hychwanegu at ffioedd cartrefi gofal preifat. O ganlyniad, ymddangosodd nifer aruthrol o gartrefi nysrio preifat a chartrefi gofal dros nos bron ar draws y wlad. Rhwng 1981 a 1993, gwariodd Llywodraethau'r Ceidwadwyr £10 biliwn yn sybsideiddio cartrefi gofal preifat. Faint o'r arian hwnnw allai fod wedi'i fuddsoddi er mwyn sicrhau bod y rhaglen gofal yn y gymuned, a gyflwynwyd gan eich Llywodraeth chi, yn cael ei gwireddu ac yn llwyddo, yn hytrach na'i ddefnyddio i sybsideiddio cartrefi gofal preifat?

**David Davies a gododd—**

**Ann Jones:** Nid oes gennyd amser i dderbyn ymyriad, Daivd. Yr ydych wedi rhefro digon heddiw.

Mae'n bwysig bod lleoedd ar gael mewn cartrefi gofal i'r rhai sydd eu hangen, ond ni fydd mwy o'r un peth yn addas os ydym am ddarparu dewisiadau ac annibyniaeth gwirioneddol i bobl hŷn. Mae'n fy nigalon pan glywaf feirniadaethau, sy'n ymwneud yn gyfan gwbl bron â'r gostyngiad yn nifer y gwelyau gofal. Os yw gofal cymunedol yn gweithio, wrth gwrs y bydd gostyngiad yn nifer y gwelyau gofal. Yr wyf yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd â chynrychiolwyr y sector gofal preifat annibynnol yn fy etholaeth am fy mod yn ei weld yn bartner gwerthfawr yn y broses o ddatblygu'r agenda gofal cymdeithasol. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld, yn ystod yr

already implementing the standards being proposed. If there were concerns, they were about building regulations. The Assembly has listened and is responding to that concern by extending the period required to convert buildings to comply with the new standards.

One key difficulty lies in getting health and social services to work and plan together to provide care. Joint commissioning is effective in some places but, sadly, it is rhetoric in others. The Conservatives' motion makes a serious point with regard to the assessment process and the provision of community care services. I was encouraged by the figures contained in the annual report of the Chief Inspector of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales, which was published last week. It shows that 7 per cent more homecare hours were provided last year than the year before. It means that some 26,000 people in Wales now receive a more intensive level of care in their own homes. The key challenge is to move away from costly, outdated institutional care and to develop alternative models of care in the community.

The Labour Party's care agenda is to see increased development of intermediate care services, to provide rehabilitation, to support independence, to prevent people from going into hospital in the first place, and to help them back into their own homes after a spell in hospital. The extra investment in these services has already led to more beds and places and an increase in the number of people receiving the services.

To pick up on Pauline Jarman's comments, the Association for Residential Care said recently that,

'With some supermarkets offering £8 per hour to stock shelves overnight it is hard to attract staff to a complex and more stressful job for much less money. In some parts of the country the only people applying for vacancies are those that McDonald's and Tesco have already rejected'.

ymgyngioriad ar isafswm safonau, fod y rhan fwyaf o berchenogion cartrefi gofal eisoes yn gweithredu'r safonau a gynigir. Os oedd pryderon, yr oedd yn ymwneud â rheoliadau adeiladu. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi gwrando ac mae'n ymateb i'r pryder hwnnw drwy ymestyn y cyfnod gofynnol i addasu adeiladau i gydymffurfio â'r safonau newydd.

Un anhawster allweddol yw cael y gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol i gydweithio a chyd-gynllunio i ddarparu gofal. Mae cyd-gomisiynu'n effeithiol mewn rhai lleoedd ond, yn anffodus, mae'n rhethregol mewn lleoedd eraill. Mae cynnig y Ceidwadwyr yn gwneud pwynt difrifol am y broses asesu a darparu gofal cymunedol. Cefais fy nghalonogi gan y ffigurau yn adroddiad blynnyddol Prif Arolygydd Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'n dangos bod 7 y cant yn fwy o oriau gofal cartref wedi'u darparu y llynedd na'r flwyddyn flaenorol. Mae'n golygu bod tua 26,000 o bobl yng Nghymru'n derbyn lefel ddwysach o ofal yn eu cartrefi eu hunain erbyn hyn. Yr her allweddol yw symud i ffwrdd o ofal sefydliadol drud a hen ffasiwn ac i ddatblygu modelau gofal amgen yn y gymuned.

Agenda'r Blaid Lafur yw gweld datblygiad cynyddol mewn gwasanaethau gofal canolraddol, darparu gwasanaeth adsefydlu, cefnogi annibyniaeth, atal pobl rhag mynd i'r ysbyty i ddechrau cychwyn, a'u helpu i ddychwelyd i'w cartrefi eu hunain ar ôl cyfnod yn yr ysbyty. Mae'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol yn y gwasanaethau hyn eisoes wedi arwain at fwy o welyau a mwy o leoedd a chynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n derbyn y gwasanaethau.

A dychwelyd at sylwadau Pauline Jarman, dywedodd y Gymdeithas Gofal Preswyl yn ddiweddar,

'Gan fod rhai archfarchnadoedd yn cynnig £8 yr awr i staff i lenwi silffoedd dros nos, mae'n anodd denu pobl i swyddi cymhleth a fyddai'n rhoi mwy o straen arnynt am lawer llai o arian. Mewn rhai rhannau o'r wlad, yr unig bobl sy'n ymgeisio am swyddi yw'r rhai y mae McDonald's a Tesco eisoes wedi'u gwrrthod'.

My experience of care homes in my constituency does not suggest that they are staffed by those whom McDonald's rejected; far from it. I value the work carried out by care home staff in my constituency, and I want to work with them to take everyone forward so that they see that we can deliver on this care agenda.

I am glad that this debate is being held because it has given us an opportunity to discuss important issues. However, I do not need to take lessons on social services, or any other public service, from the Tories. Their leaders in London have made their attitude to public services quite clear over recent weeks.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I welcome this debate as it raises shared concerns about the social care sector. Amendment 1 in the name of Andrew Davies seeks to clarify accountabilities and policy developments in this key area. David, you focused particularly in your wide-ranging motion on the independent nursing and residential care sector, which plays a vital role in supporting vulnerable people, and accounts for 82 per cent of all care beds in Wales. As you know, we are monitoring closely the condition of this sector. The balance between demand and supply varies from area to area. However, it is fair to say that we are at a point of transition as the sector moves into a period of consolidation and of upgrading standards. Eighty two per cent of care beds are in the private sector, but 70 per cent of them are publicly funded. I recognise that fee levels are a great concern to the sector. I meet regularly with the sector and it is a matter for discussion.

The long-term objective must be to improve the quality of care services and to bring more stability to care providers, but as you know, local authorities have the legal responsibility for commissioning care. We do not have the powers to tell them how much they should pay or how they should spend their

Nid yw fy mhrofiad o gartrefi gofal yn fy etholaeth i yn awgrymu y caint eu staffio gan y rhai y mae McDonald's wedi'u gwrthod; i'r gwrthwyneb. Gwerthfawrogaf y gwaith a wneir gan staff cartrefi gofal yn fy etholaeth, ac yr wyf am weithio gyda hwy er mwyn i bawb symud ymlaen yn yr un cyfeiriad fel y gallant weld y gallwn gyflawni'r agenda ofal hon.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y ddadl hon yn cael ei chynnal am ei bod yn rhoi cyfle inni drafod materion pwysig. Fodd bynnag, nid oes arnaf angen gwensi am wasanaethau cymdeithasol, nac ar unrhyw wasanaeth cyhoeddus arall, gan y Torïaid. Mae eu harweinwyr yn Llundain wedi dangos eu hagwedd tuag at wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ddigon clir yn yr wythnosau diwethaf.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Croesawaf y ddadl hon am ei bod yn codi pryderon cyffredin am y sector gofal cymdeithasol. Mae gwelliant 1 yn enw Andrew Davies yn gofyn am eglurhad o rwymedigaethau a datblygiadau polisi yn y maes allweddol hwn. David, yr oeddech chi'n canolbwytio'n arbennig yn eich cynnig eang ei gwmpas ar y sector nrysio a gofal preswyl annibynnol, sy'n chwarae rhan allweddol o ran cefnogi pobl ddiameddifyn, ac yn cyfrif am 82 y cant o welyau gofal yng Nghymru. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym yn monitro cyflwr y sector hwn yn ofalus. Mae'r cydbwysedd rhwng y galw a'r cyflenwad yn amrywio o ardal i ardal. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud ein bod wedi cyrraedd pwynt o drawsnewid wrth i'r sector symud i gyfnod o atgyfnerthu ac uwchraddio safonau. Mae 82 y cant o welyau gofal yn y sector preifat, ond mae 70 y cant ohonynt wedi'u hariannu'n gyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod lefelau ffioedd yn peri pryder i'r sector. Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â'r sector ac mae'n fater i'w drafod.

Dylid sicrhau mai'r amcan hirdymor yw gwella ansawdd gwasanaethau gofal a chyflwyno mwy o sefydlogrwydd i ddarparwyr gofal, ond fel y gwyddoch, mae gan awdurdodau lleol gyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol dros gomisiynu gofal. Nid oes gennym y pwerau i ddweud wrthynt faint y dylent ei

unhypothecated budgets. All social services spending pressures are an issue for debate and will be considered in the Assembly's budget planning process. However, as you know, before Christmas I announced an extra £10 million in recurrent funding for local authorities over two years—which was widely welcomed—to recognise the pressures on the sector. As you know, that was also to assist in addressing delayed transfer of care from hospitals. The announcement of £5 million from the care home sector—who joined me and the Welsh Local Government Association when I made the announcement in a care home—was widely welcomed. We are monitoring spending in partnership with local government and the care sector and the Committee is also engaged in this.

I will respond to Jonathan's contribution because he drew the Assembly's attention to serious allegations. You have raised this issue before in the Assembly about a home that is now closed. I will seek advice about this home from the Social Services Inspectorate, as I have done over the past months, and I will also seek its advice on your request for me to consider this further. It would be appropriate to report back to the Health and Social Services Committee and to you as soon as possible. I am committed to doing that, Jonathan.

If we move on to the issue that David raised about how we take this forward in terms of the commissioning agenda. I intend to issue shortly revised statutory guidance to local authorities on their commissioning and contracting practices for care services. Local authorities have established a contract officers working group in this respect. Care Forum Wales, which I met last week, will also be engaged in those discussions. That commissioning and contracting statutory guidance will be important in developing our partnership approach to promote the good practice and consistent standards that we need in commissioning for providers. That will be a focus on good practice and partnership.

Peter, best value coupled with national standards and independent inspection and

dalu neu sut y dylent wario eu cyllidebau nad ydynt wedi'u pridiannu. Mae pwysau gwario ar bob adran y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn fater i'w drafod a'i ystyried ym mhroses cynllunio cyllideb y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddoch, cyhoeddais cyn y Nadolig £10 miliwn ychwanegol i arian rheolaidd awdurdodau lleol dros ddwy flynedd—a groesawyd yn helaeth—i gydnabod y pwysau ar y sector. Fel y gwyddoch, rhoddwyd hynny hefyd i fynd i'r afael ag oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal o ysbytai. Croesawyd yn eang y cyhoeddiad o £5 miliwn o'r sector gofal cartref, a ymunodd â mi a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru pan wneuthum y cyhoeddiad mewn cartref gofal. Yr ydym yn monitro gwariant ar y cyd â llywodraeth leol ac mae'r sector gofal a'r Pwyllgor hefyd yn chwarae rhan yn hyn.

Ymatebaf i gyfraniad Jonathan am ei fod wedi tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad i honiadau difrifol. Bu ichi godi'r mater hwn o'r blaen yn y Cynulliad am gartref sydd wedi cau erbyn hyn. Gofynnaf am gyngor yr Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y mater hwn, fel yr wyf wedi gwneud dros y misoedd diwethaf, a byddaf hefyd yn gofyn am ei gyngor ar eich cais imi ystyried y mater hwn ymhellach. Byddai'n briodol cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac i chi cyn gynted â phosibl. Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i wneud hynny, Jonathan.

Os symudwn ymlaen i'r mater a gododd David ynglŷn â sut y byddwn yn mynd â'r mater hwn ymlaen o ran yr agenda gomisiynu. Bwriadaf gyflwyno canllawiau statudol diwygiedig yn y man i'r awdurdodau lleol ar eu trefnau comisiynu a chontractio gwasanaethau gofal. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol wedi sefydlu gweithgor swyddogion contract ynglŷn â hyn. Bydd Fforwm Gofal Cymru, y cyfarfum ag ef yr wythnos diwethaf, hefyd yn cymryd rhan yn y trafodaethau hyn. Bydd y canllawiau statudol ar gomisiynu a chontractio yn bwysig wrth inni ddatblygu ein hymagwedd bartneriaethol i hyrwyddo'r arfer da a'r safonau cyson sydd eu hangen wrth gomisiynu darparwyr. Bydd hynny'n ffocws ar arfer da a phartneriaeth.

Peter, bydd gwerth gorau ynghyd â safonau cenedlaethol ac archwilio a choffrestru

registration through the care standards inspectorate will help to ensure that, for the first time, we should have a level playing field for statutory and independent providers. We need to see that take its course. On your point about assessment, David, that is a key building block for the effective planning and delivery of care. Following extensive consultation, I will be introducing a unified assessment and care management framework across health and social care from April—

**Kirsty Williams:** On assessment, many residential care providers talk about delays in assessment when the resident's needs shift from residency to nursing care. Will you go back to your colleagues in London and say that this problem with assessment could be overcome if we made personal care free, as well as nursing care, in the same way as Scotland?

**Jane Hutt:** As I said, I will introduce a unified assessment and care management framework, which will address many of the issues that have been discussed, and will be discussed later, about options for people to be able to return home or go into appropriate care settings. The strategy for older people, which Dr Brian Gibbons is steering and chairing, is considering care and long-term care, which we will debate in due course. I make the point to David, that because of this unified assessment and care management framework, we will be allowing for specialist assessment because it will be a multi-disciplinary health and social care assessment.

5:20 p.m.

There were important points in Jocelyn Davies's amendments, but they would fall if my amendment is carried. However, I acknowledge that you made some important points. I agree on the need to promote the independent care home sector as an indigenous small business community sector, for example, and recognise its contribution to the economy. Our continuing dialogue with the sector will also engage with the Welsh Development Agency and Education and Learning Wales.

I also agree that the sector's full involvement

annibynnol drwy'r arolygiaeth safonau gofal yn helpu i sicrhau, am y tro cyntaf, y bydd cyfle teg i ddarparwyr statudol ac annibynol. Mae angen inni weld hynny'n datblygu. Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt am asesu, David, mae hwnnw'n gonglfaen allweddol ar gyfer cynllunio a chyflwyno gofal yn effeithiol. Ar ôl ymgynghori'n helaeth, byddaf yn cyflwyno asesiad a fframwaith rheoli gofal unedig ar draws y meysydd iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol o fis Ebrill—

**Kirsty Williams:** O ran asesu, mae llawer o ddarparwyr gofal preswyl yn sôn am oedi cyn cael asesiad pan fo anghenion y preswylwr yn symud o ofal preswyl i ofal nrysio. A wnewch chi sôn wrth eich cydweithwyr yn Llundain a dweud y gellid goesgyn y broblem asesu hon pe byddem yn cynnig gofal personol am ddim, yn ogystal â gofal nrysio, yn yr un ffورد â'r Alban?

**Janet Hutt:** Fel y dywedais, byddaf yn cyflwyno fframwaith asesu a rheoli gofal unedig, a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â llawer o'r materion a drafodwyd, ac a gaiff eu trafod yn ddiweddarach, ynglŷn ag opsiynau i bobl allu dychwelyd gartref neu symud i leoliadau gofal priodol. Mae'r strategaeth pobl hŷn, y mae Dr Brian Gibbons yn ei llywio ac yn ei chadeirio, yn ystyried gofal a gofal hirdymor, y byddwn yn eu trafod maes o law. Pwysleisiaf i David, oherwydd y fframwaith asesu a rheoli gofal unedig hwn, y byddwn yn galluogi asesiad arbenigol am mai asesiad iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol aml-ddisgyblaeth fydd hyn.

Yr oedd pwyntiau pwysig yng ngwelliannau Jocelyn Davies, ond byddent yn methu pe derbynnyd fy ngwelliant i. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddaf eich bod wedi gwneud rhai pwyntiau pwysig. Cytunaf ar yr angen i hyrwyddo'r sector gofal cartref annibynnol fel sector busnes cymunedol bach cynhenid, er enghraifft, a chydubyddaf ei gyfraniad i'r economi. Bydd ein trafodaethau cyfredol gyda'r sector hefyd yn cynnwys Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru.

Cytunaf hefyd fod cyfraniad llwyr y sector yn

in the strategic planning of services is vital. Current statutory planning guidance and, in the future, the development of local health boards, will enable that to happen. We must consider our social care workforce, which we have debated in the past. Seventy thousand people work in the social care sector. They need good pay and conditions. The best care home owners provide that, and see that this issue is about driving up standards and ensuring that they have the advantage in terms of choice when carers and individuals consider care options. It is vital that we consider the work of the social care workforce task and finish group, in which we have invested a minimum of £500,000, to take forward some of their recommendations to raise the profile of the social care workforce.

We have not discussed the importance of recognising the training needs of our social workers, although it is noted in the motion. David, we are working towards an all-Wales social work training scheme for social services work with children. That will be an important development. We must ensure that our reformer social work training improves standards of practice and helps recruitment.

William, you also mentioned having one social care sector. It will be one sector as a result of the establishment of the Care Council for Wales, which has a vital role to play through its responsibilities for workforce registration, regulation and development. This Government is backing one sector by having a care council in Wales alongside the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales, which will again ensure that we have the necessary standards to provide for the most vulnerable people in Wales.

The range of issues raised in this debate can only be tackled by close working between all partners. Dai, that includes the health service and partnership with local government, social services and the independent sector. This is about partnership. I hope that we can close this debate positively. That is what people want. The independent care sector, which I meet with regularly and met with last week,

y broses o gynllunio'r gwasanaethau yn strategol yn hollbwysig. Bydd y canllawiau cynllunio statudol presennol ac, yn y dyfodol, datblygiad byrddau iechyd lleol, yn galluogi hynny i ddigwydd. Rhaid inni ystyried ein gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, a drafodwyd gennym yn y gorffennol. Mae tua 70,000 o bobl yn gweithio yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol. Mae angen cyflog ac amodau da arnynt. Mae perchenogion y cartrefi gofal gorau yn darparu hynny, ac yn gweld mai mater o godi safonau yw hyn a sicrhau bod ganddynt y fantais o ran dewis pan fo gofalwyr ac unigolion yn ystyried opsiynau gofal. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn ystyried gwaith grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi isafswm o £500,000 ynddo i ddatblyg rhai o'u hargymhellion i godi proffil y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol.

Nid ydym wedi trafod pwysigrwydd cydnabod anghenion hyfforddi ein gweithwyr cymdeithasol, er i hynny gael ei nodi yn y cynnig. David, yr ydym yn gweithio tuag at gynllun hyfforddi gwaith cymdeithasol i Gymru gyfan ym maes gwaith gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gyda phlant. Bydd hynny'n ddatblygiad pwysig. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein hyfforddiant diwygio gwaith cymdeithasol yn gwella safonau arfer ac yn helpu o ran reciwtio.

William, bu ichi sôn hefyd am gael un sector gofal cymdeithasol. Bydd yn un sector o ganlyniad i sefydlu Cyngor Gofal Cymru, sydd â rhan allweddol i'w chwarae drwy ei gyfrifoldebau dros gofrestru, rheoleiddio a datblygu'r gweithlu. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn cefnogi un sector drwy gael cyngor gofal yng Nghymru ochr yn ochr ag Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru, a fydd unwaith eto yn sicrhau bod gennym y safonau angenreidiol i ddarparu ar gyfer pobl mwyaf diamdiffyn Cymru.

Dim ond drwy sicrhau cydweithio rhwng yr holl bartneriaid y bydd yn bosibl mynd i'r afael â'r materion amrywiol a godwyd yn y ddadl hon. Dai, mae hynny'n cynnwys y gwasanaeth iechyd a phartneriaeth gyda Llywodraeth leol, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r sector annibynnol. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â phartneriaeth. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddirwyn y ddadl hon i ben ar nodyn cadarnhaol. Dyna

wants to hear the Assembly backing it in partnership with local government ensuring that the resources that we are providing—the extra £5 million will make a difference—stabilises the sector and provides options. It must come back to the issue of choice and options. We have considered the importance of domiciliary care. Our policy has been that vulnerable people should be cared for at home as far as is possible. As Brian Gibbons has said, based on strategy discussions held around the country, there is strong support for domiciliary care. People want to live at home independently as long as possible. We must ensure that intermediate care—

sydd ei angen ar bobl. Mae pobl yn y sector gofal annibynnol, yr wyf yn cwrdd â hwy yn rheolaidd a gwelais hwy yr wythnos diwethaf, am glywed bod y Cynulliad yn ei gefnogi mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol gan sicrhau bod yr adnoddau yr ydym yn eu darparu—bydd y £5 miliwn ychwanegol yn gwneud gwahaniaeth—yn sefydlogi'r sector ac yn darparu opsiynau. Rhaid dychwelyd i'r mater o ddewis ac opsiynau. Yr ydym wedi ystyried pwysigwydd gofal yn y cartref. Ein polisi yw y dylid gofalu am bobl ddiamddiffyn yn eu cartrefi cyn belled ag y bo hynny'n bosibl. Fel y dywedodd Brian Gibbons, yn seiliedig ar drafodaethau strategaeth a gynhaliwyd ledled y wlad, ceir cefnogaeth gref i ofal yn y cartref. Mae pobl am fyw gartref yn annibynnol cyhyd ag y bo hynny'n bosibl. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gofal canolraddol—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is nearly up, Jane. You have already had nine minutes.

**Jane Hutt:** We must ensure that intermediate care, which covers health, social care and the independent sector, is the way forward, and I hope that we can debate that again fully in the future.

**David Melding:** I apologise in advance to Members that I will not be able to respond to every contribution.

Dai, part of Plaid Cymru's problem is that it does not know whether there should be a large independent sector providing care. When Dai speaks about nursing care being privatised in the 1980s and 1990s, he would rather see elderly people warehoused in large NHS institutions than receiving innovative care in a modern setting. We reject your approach. You need to go back to the drawing board and work out your philosophy in this field.

You also criticise the last Conservative Government's position and the level of fees in the early 1990s. You argue that those fee levels were inadequate and poor. Ann Jones tells us that fee levels were too high and brought in all sorts of charlatans as providers of nursing care. Perhaps you can resolve these contradictions between you. I will then

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar fin dod i ben, Jane. Yr ydych eisoes wedi cael naw munud.

**Jane Hutt:** Rhaid inni sicrhau mai gofal canolraddol, sy'n cwmpasu iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a'r sector annibynnol, yw'r ffordd ymlaen, a gobeithiaf y gallwn drafod hynny'n llawn eto yn y dyfodol.

**David Melding:** Ymddiheuraf ymlaen llaw i'r Aelodau na allaf ymateb i bob cyfraniad.

Dai, rhan o broblem Plaid Cymru yw nad yw'n gwybod a ddylid cael sector annibynnol mawr sy'n darparu gofal ai peidio. Pan soniodd Dai am ofal nyrsio'n cael ei breifateiddio yn y 1980au a'r 1990au, byddai'n well ganddo weld pobl oedrannus wedi'u gosod mewn sefydliadau mawr yr NHS yn hytrach na derbyn gofal arloesol mewn lleoliad modern. Gwrthodwn eich ymagwedd. Mae angen ichi ailystyried a datblygu athoniaeth yn y maes hwn.

Yr ydych hefyd yn beirniadu sefyllfa'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf a lefel y ffioedd ar ddechrau'r 1990au. Yr ydych yn dadlau bod lefelau'r ffioedd hynny yn annigonol ac yn wael. Dywedodd Ann Jones wrthym fod lefelau'r ffioedd hynny yn rhy uchel ac wedi cyflwyno pob math o dwyllwyr fel darparwyr gofal nyrsio. Efallai y gallwch

attempt to respond to any coherent position you manage to form. It will be difficult.

I congratulate Kirsty on her excellent contribution, as Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee. You did not concentrate on partisan points at all. A few of us have made partisan points, but let us hope that we have been generally productive. You emphasised looking forward, getting things right today, and we can then spend time debating who is to blame for the fact that we are in this situation and have a more sterile debate if we need to. You are right, we need to live life forward, and your emphasis was correct. We need to consider issues such as why we spend less per capita in Wales than the local authorities spend in England, and the Minister is right to say that local authorities are responsible for their priorities.

The ‘Learning the Lessons’ report is excellent. It outlines much of the good practice that we need in the sector. That is one way of spending the existing money better. I have not said that we should be spending more overall—we spend a vast sum, about £700 million. Let us start by spending that money effectively. We may need more at some point, but that must be the start.

In response to the Minister, you say that fee levels are a concern for the sector. We need to get beyond that. I acknowledge that you will try to issue guidance on the local authorities’ commissioning role, and I will look at that carefully, but we need action from local authorities. They need to commission effectively. They have been told to concentrate on this, but they continue to concentrate on the fact that they are providers—a point illustrated par excellence by Pauline Jarman’s contribution. We have difficulties here. We need to review the fees directly, but if we do that by the commissioning role—

ddatrys y gwrthgyferbyniadau hynny rhyngoch eich hunain. Ceisaf ymateb i unrhyw farn gyson y llwyddwch i’w ffurfio. Bydd hynny’n anodd.

Hoffwn longyfarch Kirsty ar ei chyfraniad gwych, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Ni fu ichi ganolbwytio ar bwyntiau gwleidyddol o gwbl. Gwnaeth rai ohonom bwyntiau gwleidyddol, ond gadewch inni obeithio inni fod yn gynhyrchiol ar y cyfan. Bu ichi bwysleisio edrych tua’r dyfodol, cael pethau’n iawn heddiw, ac y gallwn dreulio amser wedyn yn trafod pwy sydd ar fai am yffaith ein bod yn y sefyllfa hon o hyd a chael dadl fwy dilys os bydd angen. Yr ydych yn iawn, mae angen inni fyw drwy edrych i’r dyfodol, ac yr oedd pwyslais eich sylwadau’n addas. Rhaid inni ystyried materion fel pam ein bod yn gwario llai y pen yng Nghymru nag y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei wario yn Lloegr, ac yr oedd yn briodol i’r Gweinidog ddweud mai awdurdodau lleol sy’n gyfrifol am eu blaenoriaethau.

Mae’r adroddiad ‘Dysgu o’r Gwersi’ yn wych. Mae’n amlinellu llawer o’r arfer da sydd ei angen yn y sector. Dyna un ffordd o wario’r arian sydd ar gael eisoes yn well. Ni ddywedais y dylem fod yn gwario mwy yn gyffredinol—yr ydym yn gwario swm enfawr, tua £700 miliwn. Gadewch inni ddechrau drwy wario’r arian hwnnw yn effeithiol. Efallai y bydd angen mwy arnom rywbryd, ond dylid sicrhau mai dyna yw’r man cychwyn.

Mewn ymateb i’r Gweinidog, dywedasoch fod lefelau’r ffioedd yn destun pryer i’r sector. Mae angen mynd y tu hwnt i hynny. Cydnabyddaf y byddwch yn ceisio cyhoeddi canllawiau ar rôl gomisiynu awdurdodau lleol, ac edrychaf ar hynny’n ofalus, ond mae angen i awdurdodau lleol weithredu. Rhaid iddynt gomisiynu’n effeithiol. Dywedwyd wrthynt am ganolbwytio ar hynny, ond maent yn parhau i ganolbwytio ar yffaith eu bod yn ddarparwyr—pwynt a amlwgwyd yn wych yng nghyfraniad Pauline Jarman. Yr ydym yn wynebu anawsterau gyda’r mater hwn. Mae angen inni arolygu’r ffioedd yn uniongyrchol, ond os gwnawn hynny drwy’r rôl gomisiynu—

**Janet Ryder** *rose—*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Are you giving way, David?

**David Melding:** I am not giving way. I will respond to Members' contributions. I thank you for your response to Jonathan Morgan, Minister. He has discussed a delicate and serious issue in a sombre way. I will monitor that on his behalf, and I am sure that you will write to him directly. I look forward to the publication of the unified assessment framework in April, especially how you hope to address specialised assessment. That needs to be addressed, and I would be interested in that. You did not say anything about statistics—I suspect that you will be happy to review that. Perhaps you could deal with that in Committee at some point. I would welcome a response on that, which I am sure I will get. We all agree that the quality of statistics needs to be improved.

I thank Members for the way that they have contributed to this debate. As I have said, we have not achieved a consensus, but we have emphasised social care and that it should be a high political priority. We agree with much—I am afraid that we will be rather divided on the motion when we vote on it—but we agree on many fundamentals. I thank Members for entering into this productive debate.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** If amendment 1 is carried, all remaining amendments will fall, because they will be deselected. We will now vote on amendment 1.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 32, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 7.  
Amendment 1: For 32, Abstain 12, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew

**Janet Ryder** *a gododd—*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A ydych yn ildio, David?

**David Melding:** Nid ildiaf. Ymatebaf i gyfraniadau'r Aelodau. Diolch ichi am eich ymateb i Jonathan Morgan, Weinidog. Trafododd fater anodd a difrifol mewn ffordd ddwys. Byddaf yn monitro hynny ar ei ran, ac yr wyf yn sicr y byddwch yn ysgrifennu ato yn uniongyrchol. Edrychaf ymlaen at gyhoeddi'r fframwaith asesu unedig ym mis Ebrill, yn arbennig sut yr ydych yn gobeithio trafod asesiadau arbenigol. Mae angen ymdrin â hynny, a byddai diddordeb gennfyd yn hynny. Ni fu ichi sôn o gwbl am ystadegau—yr wyf yn amau y byddwch yn fodlon arolygu hynny. Efallai y gallich drafod hynny gyda'r Pwyllgor rywbryd. Byddwn yn croesawu ymateb i hynny, yr wyf yn sicr y byddaf yn ei gael. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod angen gwella ansawdd yr ystadegau.

Hoffwn ddiolch i Aelodau am y modd y bu iddynt gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Fel y dywedais, nid ydym wedi sicrhau consensws, ond yr ydym wedi pwysleisio gofal cymdeithasol ac y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth wleidyddol uchel iddo. Cytunwn ar lawer—ofnaf y bydd gennym safbwytiau gwahanol ar y cynnig pan fyddwn yn pleidleisio arno—ond yr ydym yn cytuno ar rai o'r pwyntiau sylfaenol. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am gymryd rhan yn y ddadl gynhyrchiol hon.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Os derbynir gwelliant 1, bydd gweddill y gwelliannau yn methu, am y byddant wedi'u dadethol. Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar welliant 1.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Davies, David  
Graham, William  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwin  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment carried.*

Amended motion:

*the National Assembly*

*acknowledges the growing pressures facing social services in Wales and their importance in supporting vulnerable people. It recognises the important contribution of the independent care sector and therefore welcomes the action which the Assembly is taking, working in partnership with that sector, the voluntary sector, local government and others to:*

*a. promote higher quality and standards through national minimum standards, regulation and consistent, independent inspection through the Care Standards*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn cydnabod y pwysau cynyddol sydd ar y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru a'u pwysigrwydd wrth gynnal pobl hyglwyf. Mae'n cydnabod cyfraniad pwysig y sector gofal annibynnol ac felly'n croesawu'r camau y mae'r Cynulliad yn eu cymryd, gan weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r sector hwnnw, y sector gwirfoddol, llywodraeth leol ac eraill er mwyn:*

*a. hybu ansawdd a safonau uwch drwy safonau lleiafol cenedlaethol, rheoleiddio ac archwilio cyson ac annibynnol drwy Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru;*

*Inspectorate for Wales;*

- b. support the development of the social care workforce in the light of the Chief Social Services Inspector's report;*
  - c. develop revised statutory guidance on the commissioning of social care;*
  - d. support measures to tackle delayed transfer of care and to provide greater stability to the care home sector through the provision of £5 million in 2001-02 and 2002-03; and*
  - e. maintain a constructive and open dialogue about issues of joint concern through regular meetings between the Minister for Health and Social Services and representatives of the independent care sector.*
- b. cefnogi datblygiad y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yng ngoleuni Adroddiad Prif Arolygydd y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol;*
  - c. datblygu canllawiau statudol diwygiedig ar gomisiynu gofal cymdeithasol;*
  - d. cefnogi mesurau i fynd i'r afael ag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal a darparu mwy o sefydlogrwydd i'r sector cartrefi gofal drwy ddarparu £5 miliwn yn 2001-02 a 2002-03; ag*
  - e. cynnal deialog adeiladol ac agored ynghylch materion o ddiddordeb cyffredin drwy gyfarfod y rheolaidd rhwng y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a chynrychiolwyr y sector gofal annibynnol.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 32, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 6.*

*Amended motion: For 32, Abstain 13, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Davies, David  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.25 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.25 p.m.*