



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 30 Ebrill 2002  
Tuesday 30 April 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |   |
|----|---|
| 3  | Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru<br><i>Questions to the First Minister</i>  |
| 23 | Datganiad ar Gynllun Elite Cymru<br><i>Statement on the Elite Cymru Scheme</i>  |
| 35 | Datganiad ar Ynni<br><i>Statement on Energy</i>   |
| 51 | Datganiad Busnes<br><i>Business Statement</i>   |
| 52 | Datganiad gan y Llywydd<br><i>Statement by the Presiding Officer</i>  |
| 53 | Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.12 a 6.13<br><i>Suspension of Standing Orders Nos. 6.12 and 6.13</i>   |
| 54 | Pwynt o Drefn<br><i>Point of Order</i>  |
| 55 | Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) (Rhif 6)<br>(Cymru) 2002<br><i>Approval of the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 6)</i><br><i>(Wales) 2002</i> |
| 71 | Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru)<br><i>Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)</i>   |
| 99 | Cynnig Trefniadol<br><i>Procedural Motion</i>   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambwr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.*  
*The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru** **Questions to the First Minister**

### **Gwella Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus** **Improving Public Services**

**Q1 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the First Minister make a statement on efforts to improve public services based upon commitments in the 'Plan for Wales 2001'? (OAQ17088)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** In line with our strategy for improving public services in Wales, and in the health service in particular, I commend the heroic efforts of Ian Botham and those of Catherine Zeta Jones and Charlotte Church, in raising money for the children's hospital for Wales project. One could call it 'Beauty and the Beefy'—not excluding the belle canto either. Their efforts fit in extremely well with the £4.5 million for phase 1b of the project that was announced by Jane Hutt last week. We will have to meet the revenue commitments, but the capital that we allocated last August will be supplemented by the money raised on the walk from Machynlleth to Cardiff over the past nine days, which is thoroughly commendable and welcome.

**Nick Bourne:** We all congratulate Ian Botham, Catherine Zeta Jones, Charlotte Church and the many others who helped to raise money on that occasion. However, to bring you back to the health service, and to public services in particular, we all recall that you were invisible during the floods crisis, the fuel crisis and the foot and mouth disease crisis, and we have heard nothing from you about the woeful shortfall in economic performance. We have, however, heard much about you running the Welsh Rugby Union, which you ought not to be concerned about as a Minister. When will you associate yourself with the Minister for Health and Social Services's comments and take action on the massive waiting lists that we face in Wales?

**C1 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar yr ymdrechion i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn unol â'r ymrwymiadau a wnaed yn 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'? (OAQ17088)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Yn unol â'n strategaeth ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn arbennig, cymeradwyaf ymdrechion arwrol Ian Botham ac ymdrechion Catherine Zeta Jones a Charlotte Church, i godi arian tuag at brosiect yr ysbyty plant i Gymru. Gellid ei alw'n 'Beauty and the Beefy'—heb anghofio'r belle canto ychwaith. Mae eu hymdrehigion yn cydrededig yn eithriadol o dda gyda'r £4.5 miliwn ar gyfer cam 1b y prosiect a gyhoeddwyd gan Jane Hutt yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd yn rhaid inni fodloni'r ymrwymiadau refeniw, ond caiff y cyfalaf a ddyrannwyd gennym fis Awst diwethaf ei ategu gan yr arian a godwyd ar y daith gerdded o Fachynlleth i Gaerdydd dros y naw diwrnod diwethaf, sydd i'w gymeradwyo'n fawr ac i'w groesawu.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydym i gyd yn llonygfarch Ian Botham, Catherine Zeta Jones, Charlotte Church a'r llu o bobl eraill a helpodd godi arian ar yr achlysur hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, i ddod â chi'n ôl at y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac at wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn arbennig, mae pawb ohonom yn cofio y buoch yn anweledig yn ystod yr argyfwng llifogydd, yr argyfwng tanwydd ac argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, ac nid ydym wedi clywed smic gennych am y diffyg truenus yn ein perfformiad economaidd. Yr ydym, serch hynny, wedi clywed llawer amdanoch chi'n rhedeg Undeb Rygbi Cymru, na ddylech ymboeni amdan fel Gweinidog. Pa bryd yr ymgysylltwch â sylwadau'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a gweithio ar y

Your Government pledged to cut waiting lists as a first step in 1997. Since then, the number of in-patients waiting in Wales has increased by 214 per cent. That is over 18 months. The number of out-patients waiting over six months has increased by a staggering 1,084 per cent. Would it not be a better use of your time and energy to tackle that?

rhestrau aros enfawr a wynebwn yng Nghymru? Addawodd eich Llywodraeth gwtogi rhestrau aros fel cam cyntaf yn 1997. Ers hynny, mae nifer y cleifion mewnol sy'n aros yng Nghymru wedi codi 214 y cant. Mae hynny dros 18 mis. Mae nifer y cleifion allanol sy'n aros dros chwe mis wedi cynyddu 1,084 y cant, sy'n ganran anhygoel. Oni fyddai mynd i'r afael â hynny yn ddefnydd gwell o'ch amser a'ch egni?

**The First Minister:** If you think that I was invisible during the fuel crisis, the foot and mouth disease crisis and what you referred to as the economic crisis—during which unemployment in Wales has dropped to its lowest level for 27 years—then I suggest that you take advantage of the eye treatment services that are improving to such an extent that the target of a four-month wait for cataract surgery will shortly be met. Also, in case you missed it due to your eyesight—which clearly needs treatment if you think that I am invisible—I draw your attention to the fact that we have already achieved the target of eliminating all waits of over 12 months for cardiac surgery. When you have studied that, you will also notice that we are hoping to hit our target of no-one having to wait over 18 months for orthopaedic surgery, which remains outstanding for July, as regards particular problems in Bro Taf Health Authority and Gwent Health Authority.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Os ydych yn meddwl imi fod yn anweledig yn ystod yr argyfwng tanwydd, argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau a'r hyn y cyfeiriasoch chi ato fel yr argyfwng economaidd—ym mha un y cwymppodd diweithdra yng Nghymru i'w lefel isaf ers 27 mlynedd—yna awgrymaf y dylech fanteisio ar y gwasanaethau trin llygaid sy'n gwella i'r fath raddau fel y caiff y targed o arhosiad pedwar mis am lawdriniaeth cataract ei gyrraedd cyn bo hir. Eto, rhag ofn y bu ichi ei golli oherwydd eich golwg—sydd yn amlwg angen triniaeth os ydych yn meddwl fy mod yn anweledig—tynnaf eich sylw at yffaith ein bod eisoes wedi cyrraedd y targed o ddileu pob arhosiad o dros 12 mis am lawdriniaeth ar y galon. Pan fyddwch wedi astudio hynny, fe sylwch hefyd ein bod yn gobeithio taro'n targed o sicrhau nad oes neb yn gorfol aros dros 18 mis am lawdriniaeth orthopedig, sy'n dal i fod yn ddisgwylidig ar gyfer mis Gorffennaf, yn wyneb problemau arbennig yn Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf ac Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent.

**Nick Bourne:** Many of the people on waiting lists will note the flippancy of your response, which is not appropriate given the growing waiting lists that I have just outlined, which you did not address. The promise was to cut waiting lists as a first step. That promise was made over five years ago and has not been honoured. It was an early pledge. Instead, the position has become increasingly worse. It is far worse in Wales than in England. I will give you an example from my constituency postbag last week: a wait of up to 22 months for an initial appointment with an orthopaedic surgeon. You just mentioned the orthopaedic waiting list. Do you not consider the Labour Party's, and now also the Liberal Democrats' performance on health to be an issue on which the electorate of Wales should judge

**Nick Bourne:** Bydd llawer o'r bobl sydd ar restrau aros yn nodi gwamalrwydd eich ymateb, sy'n amhriodol yn wyneb y rhestrau aros cynyddol yr wyf fi newydd eu disgrifio, na fu ichi sôn amdanynt. Yr addewid oedd cwtogi rhestrau aros fel cam cyntaf. Gwnaethpwyd yr addewid honno dros bum mlynedd yn ôl ac nis anrhydeddwyd. Addewid gynnar ydoedd. Yn hytrach, mae'r sefyllfa wedi mynd yn gynyddol waeth. Mae'n llawer gwaeth yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Rhoddaf engraifft ichi o fag llythyrau fetholaeth yr wythnos diwethaf: arhosiad o hyd at 22 mis am apwyntiad cychwynnol gyda llawfeddyg orthopedig. Yr ydych newydd sôn am y rhestr aros am driniaeth orthopedig. Oni chredwch fod perfformiad y Blaid Lafur, a pherfformiad y

you at the next Assembly elections?

**The First Minister:** If you want to be taken seriously as a person who is against flippancy at all times, why did you raise the subject of the WRU? If you want to ask questions about the health service, do so, but do not try to bring rugby into it. That is a different issue. Do not criticise me for being flippant when you raised rugby as if it had something to do with the health service, when it clearly does not.

On Labour's performance on health, I am sure that you will have noticed—perhaps somehow or other it has become invisible to you, no doubt temporarily—that Gordon Brown, in his budget, has allocated an additional sum of money for health, which will result in us receiving an additional £128 million to spend on health from April next year on top of the £400 million increase that is already in the 2000 spending review sums. That will rise to an additional £1.8 billion in the fifth year, 2007-08. Can you not bring yourself to notice these announcements when they are made, or do you have some sort of condition, for which I know of no medical treatment, which makes you averse to hearing good news about the health service?

**Kirsty Williams:** In your 'Plan for Wales 2001', you made a commitment to support Wales's most deprived communities through the Communities First programme. This is beginning to have great success in many areas in Wales. Will you consider extending the Communities First programme to wards in Wales, including many in the Ystradgynlais area, which fall just outside the first 100 most deprived wards?

**The First Minister:** Communities First is part of our pincer movement to get to the root causes of poverty and to discover what potential community leadership exists in these communities and to help them to help themselves. We facilitate that; we do not

Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hefyd erbyn hyn, ar iechyd yn fater y dylai etholwyr Cymru eich barnu arno yn ystod etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Os ydych chi am gael eich cymryd o ddifrif fel rhywun sydd yn erbyn gwamalrwydd bob amser, pam y bu ichi godi pwnc Undeb Rygbi Cymru? Os ydych am ofyn cwestiynau am y gwasanaeth iechyd, gwnewch hynny, ond peidiwch â cheisio cynnwys rygbi yn y ddadl. Mater gwahanol yw hwnnw. Peidiwch â'm beirniadu i am fod yn wamal a chithau wedi codi rygbi fel pe bai ganddo rywbed i'w wneud â'r gwasanaeth iechyd, pan ei fod yn amlwg ym amherthnasol.

Ynglŷn â pherfformiad Llafur ar iechyd, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch wedi sylwi—efallai rywsut neu'i gilydd ei fod yn anweledig ichi, ond dros dro, mae'n siŵr—fod Gordon Brown, yn ei gyllideb, wedi dyrannu swm ychwanegol o arian ar gyfer iechyd, a fydd yn golygu y cawn ni £128 miliwn yn ychwanegol i'w wario ar iechyd o Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf, ar ben y cynnydd o £400 miliwn sydd eisoes yn symiau yr adolygiad o wariant ar gyfer 2000. Bydd hynny'n codi i £1.8 biliwn ychwanegol yn y bumed flwyddyn, sef 2007-08. Oni allwch ymorol eich bod yn sylwi ar y cyhoeddiadau hyn pan wneir hwynt, ynteu a ydych yn dioddef rhyw fath o gyflwr, na wn i am unrhyw driniaeth feddygol iddo, sy'n eich rhwystro rhag clywed newyddion da am y gwasanaeth iechyd?

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn eich 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001', gwnaethoch ymrwymiad i gefnogi cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru drwy'r rhaglen Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Mae hyn yn dechrau llwyddo'n dda mewn sawl ardal yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi ystyried ymestyn y rhaglen Cymunedau'n Gyntaf i wardiau yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys llawer yn ardal Ystradgynlais, sydd fymryn y tu allan i'r 100 ward fwyaf difreintiedig?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn rhan o'n symudiad gefail i fynd at achosion gwreiddiol tlodi a darganfod unrhyw arweiniad posibl sy'n bodoli yn y cymunedau hyn, a'u cynorthwyo i helpu eu hunain. Hwyluso hynny a wnawn, nid ei

provide it. We help them to develop the leadership that is necessary to bring themselves up by their own bootstraps. It is still in the early stages. We are in the stage of converting from the People in Communities programme, which was the forerunner of Communities First two years ago. It is perhaps too early to consider extending the programme to other deprived wards, but the time will come when we will want to consider the next 50 or 100 communities beyond the 100 on the current list.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod pawb yma'n croesawu'r arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, ond pe byddai fformiwla Barnett yn cael ei hadolygu, onid ydyw'n wir y byddai mwy o arian ar gael ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru? Os nad yw Prif Weinidog Cymru'n ymladd i gael yr adolygiad hwnnw, ac o ganlyniad yn sicrhau bod pobl Cymru'n cael y gwasanaeth y maent yn ei haeddu, beth fydd hynny'n ei olygu i bobl Sir Gaerfyrddin a Chymru gyfan sydd yn ddibynnol ar y gwasanaeth iechyd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Pe byddai fformiwla Barnett yn cael ei hadolygu, nid oes sicrwydd y byddem yn derbyn arian ychwanegol. Yr wyf wedi clywed Phil ac eraill yn trafod fformiwla Barnett a'r angen mawr i'w hadolygu, fel pe baent yn holol sicr o ganlyniad y broses honno. Ochr arall y ddadl yw nad ydym yn siŵr beth fyddai canlyniad adolygiad o'r fath.

Efallai mai ar ôl y datblygiad nesaf yng nghyfansoddiad Prydain Fawr, sef datganoli rhanbarthol yn Lloegr, fyddai'r amser gorau i adolygu'r fformiwla. Yr wyf yn eithaf hyderus na fyddem mewn sefyllfa waeth ar ôl adolygu fformiwla Barnett, ond nonsens llwyr yw dweud ein bod yn sicr o dderbyn arian ychwanegol. Dyna un o'r mythau y mae Plaid Cymru yn hoffi eu lledaenu ar hyd a lled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n gwneud unrhyw synnwyr.

2:10 p.m.

### Hiliaeth Racism

**Q2 Janice Gregory:** What action is the First

ddarparu. Helpwn hwy i ddatblygu'r arweinyddiaeth sy'n angenrheidiol iddynt godi'u hunain gerfydd eu careiau esgidiau eu hunain. Mae hyn yn y camau cynnar o hyd. Yr ydym wrthi'n trosglwyddo o'r rhaglen Pobl mewn Cymunedau, sef rhagflaenydd Cymunedau'n Gyntaf ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Mae'n rhy gynnar, efallai, i ystyried ymestyn y rhaglen i wardiau difreintiedig eraill, ond daw'r adeg pryd y bydd arnom eisaiu ystyried yr 50 neu 100 cymuned nesaf ar ôl y 100 sydd ar y rhestr gyfredol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am sure that everyone here welcomes the additional funding for the health service in Wales, but, if the Barnett formula were reviewed, is it not true that more money would be available for the health service in Wales? If the First Minister does not fight for that review, which would ensure that the people of Wales get the service they deserve, what impact would that have on people in Carmarthenshire and the whole of Wales who are dependent on the health service?

**The First Minister:** If the Barnett formula were reviewed, there is no guarantee that we would receive additional funding. I have heard Phil and others discuss the Barnett formula and the urgent need to review it, as if they were certain of the outcome of that process. The truth is that we are not certain what the outcome of such a review would be.

The most opportune time to review the formula may be after the next development in the UK's constitution, namely regional devolution in England. I am fairly confident that we would not suffer as a result of a review of the Barnett formula, but to claim with absolute certainty that there would be no additional money is a nonsense. That is one of the myths that Plaid Cymru likes to spread across Wales. However, it does not make sense.

**C2 Janice Gregory:** Pa gamau y mae

Minister's Welsh Assembly Government taking to tackle racism in Wales? (OAQ17087)

**The First Minister:** The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to tackling racism in Wales. I want us to lead civic society in Wales on this issue as on others. I recently chaired the first meeting of the Interfaith Council for Wales, which other party leaders, and leaders of the different faiths in Wales, attended. I hope that the council will facilitate better discussion between politicians and representatives of the major faiths in Wales, including faiths whose followers mainly come from ethnic minorities.

**Janice Gregory:** I commend you on the Government's work on this. Will you join me in congratulating the community of Caerau in my constituency, which is in a deprived Valleys area? It has given overwhelming support to an Asian shopkeeper, Mohammed Nawaz, and his family, who have suffered horrendous racial abuse from a convicted racist, who has served time but has since returned to the community. His return is a cause of concern for the community. I wish to put on record my thanks to this deprived community for its support for Mr Nawaz and the intolerance of racism it has shown.

**The First Minister:** I am pleased that you have raised this issue today. I do not think that there is a single Assembly Member who would dissent from your proposition. We have heard about Alan Beshella, who claims to represent the Ku Klux Klan in Wales. He has attempted to bring the worst values of the United States of America's deep south to the Welsh Valleys and he has failed. It was wonderful that the Caerau community responded as it did when Mr Beshella was being convicted of racially harassing Mr Nawaz, the shopkeeper. Mr Nawaz, who thought that he would have to leave Caerau, has now changed his mind and is staying because of the community's wonderful support. It is easy for people to believe the stereotype that racial tolerance is easy to discuss and inculcate around Hampstead, or

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i drechu hiliaeth yng Nghymru? (OAQ17087)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael â hiliaeth yng Nghymru. Mae arnaf eisiau inni arwain cymdeithas sifig yng Nghymru ar y mater hwn fel ar eraill. Yn ddiweddar, cadeiriai gyfarfod cyntaf o Gyngor Rhyng-grefyddol Cymru, gydag arweinwyr pleidiau eraill ac arweinwyr y gwahanol grefyddau yng Nghymru yn bresennol. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y cyngor hwyluso gwell trafodaeth rhwng gwleidyddion a chynrychiolwyr y prif grefyddau yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys crefyddau y daw eu dilynwyr yn bennaf o leiafrifoedd ethnig.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn eich cymeradwyo ar waith y Llywodraeth ar hyn. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch cymuned Caerau yn f'etholaeth, sydd mewn ardal ddifreintiedig yn y Cymoedd? Mae wedi rhoi cefnogaeth aruthrol i siopwr Asiaidd, Mohammed Nawaz, a'i deulu, a ddioddefodd sarhad hiliol echrydus gan hiliwr a fu yn y carchar, ond sydd bellach yn ôl yn y gymuned. Mae'r ffaith ei fod wedi dychwelyd yn achos pryder i'r gymuned. Dymunaf gofnodi fy niolch i'r gymuned ddifreintiedig hon am ei chefnogaeth i Mr Nawaz ac am ddangos na wnaiff oddef hiliaeth.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi codi'r mater hwn heddiw. Nid wyf yn meddwl y byddai unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn anghydweld â'ch cynnig. Yr ydym wedi clywed am Alan Beshella, sy'n honni cynrychioli'r Ku Klux Klan yng Nghymru. Mae wedi ceisio dod â gwerthoedd gwaethaf pellafoedd y de yn Unol Daleithiau America i Gymoedd de Cymru ac mae wedi methu. Yr oedd yn fendigedig fod cymuned Caerau wedi ymateb fel y gwnaeth pan gafwyd Mr Beshella'n euog o blagio Mr Nawaz, y siopwr, yn hiliol. Mae Mr Nawaz, a gredodd y byddai'n rhaid iddo adael Caerau, bellach wedi newid ei feddwl ac mae am aros oherwydd cefnogaeth wych y gymuned. Mae'n hawdd i bobl gredu'r ystryddeb ei bod yn hawdd trafod a phleidio goddefgarwch hiliol dros swper yn Hampstead, neu hyd yn

even Cyncoed, dining tables but much tougher to inculcate in deprived communities such as Caerau. The people of Caerau have proved that stereotype wrong and I commend them on it.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I endorse Janice Gregory's and the First Minister's comments about that community. It deserves our commendation. However, in the spirit of removing the beam from one's own eye before taking the splinter out of another's, what are you doing to ensure that any element of racism in the culture of bullying identified by the Permanent Secretary in the civil service in Wales is effectively and swiftly addressed?

**The First Minister:** I am sure that we could address that effectively and swiftly. Staff management is a matter for the Permanent Secretary, not for me. However, since the press report about the staff meeting held in this building a week ago was published, I have discussed the issue with him. He said that there is an anti-bullying policy to identify and nip in the bud any culture of bullying within the office. There is a problem, but I would not say that it is a serious one. The point is to nip it in the bud before it becomes serious. If there is a racial element to the bullying, that makes it worse. That has not been identified so far. I am sure that we all commend the Permanent Secretary's efforts to eliminate bullying from the culture of the civil service that serves us.

**David Melding:** Do you agree with His Grace, the Archbishop of Wales, that faith schools could help to unite our communities in Wales, including different racial groups?

**The First Minister:** I am sure that they do that; they make commendable efforts. I have visited many faith schools. There may be different interpretations of what the Archbishop said. He may have been recommending establishing more faith schools or commending the efforts of the faith schools that already exist. Developing more faith schools in Wales is a matter for the communities that see a need for those schools. Seeking to create more faith schools is not our policy, although it is for the

oed Gyncoed, ond yn llawer anoddach ei feithrin mewn cymunedau difreintiedig fel Caerau. Mae pobl Caerau wedi gwrthbrofi'r ystrydeb honno ac yr wyf yn eu cymeradwyo am hynny.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ategaf sylwadau Janice Gregory a'r Prif Weinidog am y gymuned honno. Mae'n haeddu'n cymeradwyaeth. Er hynny, yn ysbryd tynnu'r trawst o'n llygad ein hunain cyn tynnu'r brycheuyn o lygad arall, beth yr ydych chi'n ei wneud i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir yn effeithiol a buan ag unrhyw elfen o hiliaeth yn y diwylliant bwlio a ganfuwyd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn y gwasanaeth sifil yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem ymdrin â hynny'n effeithiol a buan. Mater i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol, nid i mi, yw rheoli staff. Serch hynny, ers cyhoeddi'r adroddiad yn y wasg am y cyfarfod staff a gynhaliwyd yn yr adeilad hwn wythnos yn ôl, yr wyf wedi trafod y mater gydag ef. Dywedodd mai diben y polisi gwrth-fwlio yw nodi unrhyw ddiwylliant o fwlio yn y swyddfa a'i ladd cyn iddo egino. Y mae problem, ond ni ddywedwn ei bod yn un ddifrifol. Y pwynt yw ei lladd cyn iddi egino a thyfu'n broblem ddifrifol. Os oes elfen hiliol i'r bwlio, mae hynny'n waeth. Ni welwyd hynny hyd yma. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn canmol ymdrechion yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol i ddileu bwlio o ddiwylliant y gwasanaeth sifil sy'n ein gwasanaethu.

**David Melding:** A ydych yn cytuno gyda'i Ras, Archesgob Cymru, y gallai ysgolion ffydd helpu uno cymunedau Cymru, gan gynnwys gwahanol grwpiau hiliol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnânt hynny; gwnânt ymdrechion gwiw. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â llawer o ysgolion ffydd. Fe all fod gwahanol ddehongliadau o'r hyn a ddywedodd yr Archesgob. Efallai mai argymhell sefydlu mwy o ysgolion ffydd yr oedd, neu gymeradwyo ymdrechion yr ysgolion ffydd sy'n bodoli eisoes. Mae datblygu mwy o ysgolion ffydd yng Nghymru'n fater i'r cymunedau hynny sy'n gweld angen am ysgolion o'r fath. Nid yw'n bolisi gennym ni i geisio creu mwy o

Department for Education and Skills in England. ysgolion ffydd, er ei bod yn bolisi gan yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yn Lloegr.

### Is-swyddfeydd Post Sub-post Offices

**Q3 Brian Gibbons:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the implications of Consignia's plans for the sub-post office network in the most socially excluded communities in Wales? (OAQ17084)

**The First Minister:** I understand that Consignia—while it still retains that name before it returns to having a sensible name—divides the urban network into commercial and social categories. Its restructuring proposals include additional and substantial safeguards in relation to sub-post offices in deprived urban or rural areas, to protect their future.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am grateful for that answer because much of the publicity surrounding the threat to the sub-post office network concentrated on rural areas, when there is also a heavy dependence on the network in urban council estates and Valley communities, which are neither strictly urban nor rural. Your answer provides some reassurance, but do you agree that we need to keep an eye on the situation?

**The First Minister:** I commend you on those words. The particular problem in deprived urban communities is the high degree of dependency on benefit payments. Sometimes as much as 80 per cent of a sub-post office's turnover will be in benefit payments. Obviously, if the payment of benefits is changed to the smartcard system, the post offices will lose the vast bulk of their turnover and will be seeking alternatives. The ideas about them acting as a universal bank and a one-stop shop for Government general practitioner services are part of the programme to replace that loss of turnover in benefits, which can amount to 80 per cent of the total turnover in such post offices.

**Alun Cairns:** What representations have the

**C3 Brian Gibbons:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar oblygiadau cynlluniau Consignia i'r rhwydwaith o is-swyddfeydd post yn y cymunedau yng Nghymru sy'n dioddef waethaf o allgáu cymdeithasol? (OAQ17084)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Deallaf fod Consignia—tra'i fod yn dal i gadw'r enw hwnnw cyn mynd yn ôl at ddefnyddio enw call—yn rhannu'r rhwydwaith trefol yn gategorïau masnachol a chymdeithasol. Mae ei gynigion ailstrwythuro'n cynnwys mesurau diogel ychwanegol a sylweddol ar gyfer is-swyddfeydd post mewn ardaloedd gwledig neu drefol difreintiedig, er mwyn gwarchod eu dyfodol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ateb hwnnw oherwydd yr oedd llawer o'r cyhoeddusrwydd yngylch y bygythiad i rhwydwaith is-swyddfeydd post yn canolbwytio ar ardaloedd gwledig, pan fo dibyniaeth drom ar y rhwydwaith hefyd mewn stadau cyngor trefol ac yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd, sydd heb fod yn drefol nac yn wledig mewn gwirionedd. Mae eich ateb yn rhoi peth sicrwydd, ond a gytunwch fod angen inni gadw llygad ar y sefyllfa?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn eich canmol am y geiriau hynny. Y broblem arbennig mewn cymunedau trefol difreintiedig yw'r lefel uchel o ddibyniaeth ar fudd-daliadau. Weithiau bydd cymaint â 80 y cant o drosiant is-swyddfa bost yn fudd-daliadau. Yn amlwg, os newidir i dalu budd-daliadau drwy system cardiau clyfar, bydd y swyddfeydd post yn colli rhan helaeth o'u trostant a byddant yn chwilio am fusnes arall. Mae'r syniadau yngylch eu cael i weithredu fel banc cyffredinol ac fel siop un stop am wasanaethau ymarferwr cyffredinol y Llywodraeth yn rhan o'r rhaglen i gymryd lle y trostant coll, a all fod yn 80 y cant o gyfanswm trostant swyddfeydd post o'r fath.

**Alun Cairns:** Pa sylwadau a wnaeth y Prif

First Minister or his Government Ministers made to the Westminster Government as a result of our recent debate on the Postal Services Commission's proposals? How much responsibility should the Westminster Government accept for the increasing closures of post offices? Finally, do you accept that the universal bank idea is dead in the water because the main high street banks are moving to establish their own community-based banks regardless of the Westminster Government's actions in seeking to support the Post Office, because they are not working?

**The First Minister:** Let us get this right: the number of post offices being closed in Wales has been reducing, not increasing. I accept that following the current crisis faced by Consignia / the Royal Mail / Post Office—they may increase again. We must face that dire possibility, although I think that the trend is still downwards at present. As to whether the universal bank is dead in the water before it starts, I do not believe that the Post Office, the Department of Trade and Industry, the National Federation of SubPostmasters, or—as far as I know—the high street banks, accept that proposition. However, if you want to write to me on this, Alun, because you have some new inside knowledge from the banking world, I would be grateful to receive it. I will then pass it on to the DTI and make the same point to the Secretary of State for Wales. However, I would need to be persuaded that that was true.

Weinidog neu Weinidogion y Llywodraeth i Lywodraeth San Steffan yn sgil ein dadl ddiweddar ar gynigion y Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Post? Faint o gyfrifoldeb y dylai Llywodraeth San Steffan ei dderbyn am y niferoedd cynyddol o swyddfeydd post sy'n cau? Yn olaf, a dderbynwch fod syniad y banc cyffredinol yn farw yn y dŵr gan fod prif fanciau'r stryd fawr yn symud i sefydlu'u banciau cymunedol eu hunain er gwaethaf gweithredoedd Llywodraeth San Steffan i geisio cefnogi Swyddfa'r Post, oherwydd nad ydynt yn gweithio?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gadewch inni gael hyn yn iawn: mae nifer y swyddfeydd post sy'n cael eu cau yng Nghymru wedi bod ar drai, nid ar gynnydd. Derbyniaf y gallant gynyddu eto yn sgil yr argyfwng presennol sy'n wynebu Consigna / y Post Brenhinol / Swyddfa'r Post. Rhaid inni wynebu'r posiblirwydd cas hwnnw, er fy mod yn meddwl mai ar i lawr y mae'r duedd o hyd ar hyn o bryd. Ynghylch a ydyw'r banc cyffredinol yn farw yn y dŵr cyn cychwyn, ni chredaf fod Swyddfa'r Post, yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol yr IsBostfeistri na—hyd y gwn i—banciau'r stryd fawr, yn derbyn y gosodiad hwnnw. Er hynny, os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf ar hyn, Alun, oherwydd bod gennych ryw wybodaeth fewnol newydd o'r byd bancio, byddwn yn ddiolchgar o'i derbyn. Byddaf fi wedyn yn ei throsglwyddo i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ac yn gwneud yr un pwynt wrth Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, byddai arnaf angen fy narbwyllo fod hynny'n wir.

### Benefits of Assembly Government Policies Buddion Polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad

**Q4 Janet Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on measures the Assembly Government has taken to ensure that its policies benefit all of Wales? (OAQ17071)

**The First Minister:** In terms of the spread of prosperity across Wales, I have already mentioned Communities First, which concerns economic regeneration in Wales's poorest 100 communities. That is conducted at a ward, or sometimes village, level. At an

**C4 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y mesurau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'u cymryd i sicrhau bod ei pholisïau'n dod â budd i Gymru gyfan? (OAQ17071)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** O ran lledaenu ffyniant dros Gymru, yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am Gymunedau'n Gyntaf, sy'n ymwneud ag adfywiad economaidd yng 100 cymuned dlotaf Cymru. Gwneir hynny ar lefel ward, neu bentref weithiau. Ar lefel ardal, rhoddw

area level, we give priority in terms of economic development to the less well-off areas of Wales. That includes the 65 per cent of Wales's population, almost 2 million people, who live in the Objective 1 areas. When a factory expands or opens in those areas it gets the highest rate of grant. I mentioned in recent weeks that the year up to 1 April was a record year, certainly in the last seven years, and probably for longer than that—although we have not delved further back than that—in terms of agreeing grants under the regional selective assistance scheme to create additional jobs. That is a priority in the tier 1 areas, in which 65 per cent of Wales's population lives, and a second priority in the tier 2 areas of Wales, in which a further 9 per cent of Wales's population lives.

**Janet Davies:** To consider the children of Wales, if the Assembly Government was consulted by the United Kingdom Government on the issue, what would your contribution be with regards to the policy of removing child benefit for truanting children in the care of local authorities and foster parents?

**The First Minister:** It is much too early for us to have been consulted on this. That idea is under consideration by Ministers in the Westminster Government. It is not the Westminster Government's policy; it is part of a suite of ideas that is currently under consideration. The clear message from the various people that I have heard being interviewed on the issue—Alastair Darling MP, primarily—is that there is no commitment to introducing such a policy.

2:20 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** The biggest cause of premature death in Wales is smoking. Will you join me in congratulating the UK Government on banning tobacco advertising, which will save around 150 lives a year in Wales? Do you share my regret that the Conservatives will oppose this legislation, and will you consider further measures to reduce the death toll from smoking in Wales?

flaenoriaeth yn nhermau datblygu economaidd i ardaloedd llai cefnog Cymru. Mae hynny'n cynnwys y 65 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru, bron 2 filiwn o bobl, sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1. Pan fydd ffatri'n ehangu neu'n agor yn yr ardaloedd hynny caiff y gyfradd grant uchaf. Soniais mewn wythnosau diweddar fod y flwyddyn hyd at 1 Ebrill wedi creu record, yn sicr am y saith mlynedd diwethaf, ac am ragor na hynny, mae'n debyg—er nad ydym wedi twrio ymhellach yn ôl na hynny—o ran cytuno ar grantiau dan y cynllun cymorth dewisol rhanbarthol i greu swyddi ychwanegol. Mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth yn yr ardaloedd haen 1, lle mae 65 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru'n byw, ac yn ail flaenoriaeth yn ardaloedd haen 2 Cymru, lle mae 9 y cant eto o boblogaeth Cymru yn byw.

**Janet Davies:** Ag ystyried plant Cymru, pe ymgynghorid â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ar y mater, beth fyddai'ch cyfraniad yngylch y polisi o gymryd budd-dal plant i ffwrdd yn achos plant sy'n chwarae triwant a hwythau yng ngofal awdurdodau lleol a rhieni maeth?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n llawer rhy gynnar i ni fod wedi cael ymgynghoriad ar hyn. Mae'r syniad hwnnw dan ystyriaeth gan Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth San Steffan. Nid dyna bolisi Llywodraeth San Steffan; mae'n rhan o gyfres o syniadau sydd dan ystyriaeth ar hyn o bryd. Y neges glir gan yr amryfal bobl a glywais yn cael eu cyfweld ar y mater—Alastair Darling AS, yn bennaf—yw nad oes unrhyw ymrwymiad i gyflwyno polisi o'r fath.

**Alun Pugh:** Ysmyu yw'r achos mwyaf dros farwolaeth gynnari yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch Llywodraeth y DU ar wahardd hysbysebu tybaco, a fydd yn achub rhyw 150 o fywydau y flwyddyn yng Nghymru? A rannwch fy ngofid y bydd y Ceidwadwyr yn gwrthwynebu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon, ac a wnewch chi ystyried mesurau pellach i leihau nifer y marwolaethau oherwydd ysmyu yng Nghymru?

**The First Minister:** You are right about the Bill, which is to receive its second reading in the House of Commons this week. It is a major step forward. I wish that it had happened three or four years ago, when I was still a Member of Parliament in the House of Commons; as well as cheering on the sidelines, I would have been able to actively participate in the debate. However, it is better late than never, and I am pleased that the Bill is going through Parliament now. I share your disbelief that the Conservatives think it appropriate to oppose such a measure, given that smoking not only damages people's health, but damages it preferentially—if that is the right word—and disproportionately among the less well off classes of society. In America, smoking is almost entirely a blue-collar habit now. I would not say that that is as true in Britain, but a much higher proportion of working-class people take up smoking, and therefore have their health badly damaged by smoking, than people who are better off.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydych yn gywir ynglŷn â'r Mesur, sydd i gael ei ail ddarlleniad yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yr wythnos hon. Mae'n gam mawr ymlaen. Hoffwn petai wedi digwydd dair neu bedair blynedd yn ôl, pan oeddwn i'n dal i fod yn Aelod Seneddol yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin; yn ogystal â chymeradwyo o'r ystlys, buaswn wedi gallu cymryd rhan weithredol yn y ddadl. Fodd bynnag, gwell hwyr na hwyrach, ac yr wyf yn falch fod y Mesur yn mynd drwy'r Senedd yn awr. Rhannaf eich anghrediniaeth fod y Ceidwadwyr yn meddwl ei bod yn briodol gwrthwynebu mesur o'r fath, o gofio bod ysmigu nid yn unig yn niweidio iechyd pobl, ond ei fod yn ei niweidio'n ddewisol—os dyna'r gair iawn—ac yn anghymesur ymhllith dosbarthiadau llai cyfoethog cymdeithas. Yn America, mae ysmigu erbyn hyn bron yn gyfan gwbl yn arferiad coler las. Ni ddywedwn fod hynny mor wir ym Mhrydain, ond mae cyfran lawer uwch o bobl ddosbarth gweithiol yn dechrau ysmigu, ac felly'n dioddef niwed drwg i'w hiechyd drwy ysmigu, na phobl sy'n fwy llewyrchus eu byd.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Cyfeiriaf at eich ateb i gwestiwn Rhodri Glyn Thomas ar adolygu fformiwlw Barnett. Fe'ch atgoffaf fod mwyafrif y bobl sydd wedi edrych yn wrthrychol ar y mater hwn yn cydnabod, pe bai'r fformiwlw yn cael ei bennu ar sail angen, y byddai Cymru yn derbyn mwy o arian.

Ar ba sail y dywedwch na fyddai Cymru'n elwa ar adolygiad o'r fath? Mae Plaid Cymru wedi cyflwyno tystiolaeth i Bwyllgor Dethol y Trysorlys yn awgrymu y byddai Cymru yn elwa gan £800 miliwn ychwanegol y flwyddyn o leiaf. A gymerasoch y cyfle i gyflwyno tystiolaeth i Pwyllgor Dethol y Trysorlys ar y mater hwn ac a fwriadwch roi tystiolaeth i Bwyllgor Dethol Tŷ'r Arglwyddi sy'n dod i Gymru i gymryd tystiolaeth ddiwedd mis Mai?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni dderbyniaf fod y mwyafrif llethol o bobl neu arbenigwyr gwrthrychol sydd wedi archwilio'r mater hwn yn cydnabod yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud. Hyd y gwelaf, mae Plaid Cymru wedi tynnu'r ffigur o £800 miliwn o'r awyr.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I refer to your answer to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's question on the Barnett formula. I remind you that most of those who have examined this matter objectively concede that, if the formula were determined on a needs basis, Wales would receive more money.

On what grounds do you claim that Wales would not benefit from such a review? Plaid Cymru has given evidence to the Treasury Select Committee, which suggests that Wales would receive an increase of at least £800 million a year. Did you take the opportunity to give evidence to the Treasury Select Committee on this matter, and do you intend to give evidence to the House of Lords Select Committee, which comes to Wales to gather evidence at the end of May?

**The First Minister:** I do not accept that the vast majority of people or independent experts who have examined this matter accept your claims. As far as I can tell, Plaid Cymru has plucked the figure of £800 million out of thin air. It goes around Wales asking

Mae'n mynd o gwmpas Cymru yn gofyn pam na chawn yn arian ychwanegol hwn pan yr ydym newydd glywed y byddwn yn derbyn £1.8 miliwn ychwanegol yn 2007, gyda chodiadau eraill yn y blynnyddoedd yn arwain at hynny. Yr ydym hefyd wedi derbyn £400 miliwn yn ychwanegol at fformiwlau Barnett yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn 2000. Gwnaethom yr hyn y siaradwch amdano eisoes. Yn ein trafodaethau, bu ni sicrhau £400 miliwn dros dair blynedd, yn ogystal â'r arian ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd yng nghyllideb Gordon Brown. Mae hynny'n fwya o arian na'r hyn y soniwrch amdano.

### **Cynrychiolaeth Cymru Dramor Representation of Wales Abroad**

**Q5 Janet Ryder:** What has been done to improve the representation of Wales abroad over the last three months? (OAQ17073)

**The First Minister:** Over the last three months, the major dates of the missions to present Wales's case and raise its profile fell in the St David's Day week. Even though it was exhausting, it was a major achievement to celebrate St David's Day and raise Wales's profile in New York and Brussels. In terms of a strategy for the next few years, we have made an announcement, linked to our visits to Brussels and New York, of our intention to set up a network of Wales international centres, the first of which will open in New York before the end of the year.

**Janet Ryder:** You just mentioned Wales centres abroad, but far from improving the representation of Wales abroad, your decision concerning membership of the Wales European Centre has reduced it. Will you enlighten us on Harry Jones's comment that you informed him of your decision to withdraw support for WEC on 10 April? Will you tell us what discussions you had with the Welsh Local Government Association or the WDA before informing the Assembly of your decision on 12 April?

**The First Minister:** I am not clear about the purpose of these discussions about the minutiae of on what day which person was told what. We should be concerned about the

why we are not receiving this extra money when we have just heard that we will receive an additional £1.8 billion in 2007, with other increases in the years leading up to that. We also received £400 million over and above the Barnett formula allocation in the 2000 comprehensive spending review. We have already achieved what you are talking about. In our discussions, we secured £400 million over three years, as well as the extra money announced in Gordon Brown's budget. These sums are far higher than those that you have mentioned.

**C5 Janet Ryder:** Beth sydd wedi'i wneud dros y tri mis diwethaf i wella cynrychiolaeth Cymru dramor? (OAQ17073)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dros y tri mis diwethaf, cynhalwyd y prif ymgyrchoedd i gyflwyno achos Cymru a chodi ei phroffil yn ystod wythnos Gŵyl Ddewi. Er ei bod yn wythnos hynod flinedig, camp fawr oedd dathlu Gŵyl Ddewi a chodi proffil Cymru yn Efrog Newydd a Brwsel. O ran strategaeth am yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, yr ydym wedi gwneud cyhoeddiad, yn gysylltiedig â'n hymweliadau â Brwsel ac Efrog Newydd, ynghylch ein bwriad i sefydlu rhwydwaith o ganolfannau Cymru a'r byd, y bydd y gyntaf ohonynt yn agor yn Efrog Newydd cyn diwedd y flwyddyn.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr ydych newydd sôn am ganolfannau Cymru dramor, ond yn hytrach na gwella cynrychiolaeth Cymru dramor, ei lleihau a wnaeth eich penderfyniad ynglŷn ag aelodaeth Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru. A wnewch chi'n goleuo ar sylw Harry Jones y rhoesoch wybod iddo ef am eich penderfyniad i roi'r gorau i gefnogi'r ganolfan ar 10 Ebrill? A ddywedwch wrthym pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru neu'r WDA cyn hysbysu'r Cynulliad am eich penderfyniad ar 12 Ebrill?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn glir ynghylch pwrrpas y trafodaethau hyn am y manylion ynghylch ar ba ddiwrnod y dywedwyd beth wrth bwy. Dylem fod yn

outcome. There is a widespread feeling that this is about the possibility of expanding the Welsh Assembly Government presence in Brussels, in the same location as at present, by perhaps occupying more of the house used by both sides of Wales's representation there. Following the WLGA's decision—and we do not yet know whether it will follow it through; that was one reason for talking to Harry Jones—if they occupy less and we occupy more of the building, which I see as the most likely outcome, even though it is not all in my hands, it should not be treated as if we have declared the third world war.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Will you join me in congratulating my constituent Rosa Crean? In Adelaide last week, she won a gold medal, with her team, in the international paralympic championships.

**The First Minister:** I am grateful to you for drawing that outstanding feat of sporting endeavour to our attention; I would put it alongside the weekend's other outstanding feats of sporting endeavour. Cardiff City Football Club won the first leg of the division two play-off semi-final; I am sure that we all—even people from Swansea and Wrexham—wish them luck for the return leg tomorrow night. There was also an astonishing effort by Pontypridd Rugby Football Club in the semi-final of the Parker pen cup. We sympathise with Llanelli Rugby Football Club on the extraordinary events which meant that the team did not quite make it to the Heineken cup final. We will have to buy new goal posts and less slippery crossbars for rugby matches held at Nottingham's City Ground.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Two years ago, the National Assembly for Wales collectively and unanimously decided to enhance its representation abroad by joining the Wales European Centre. Your recent decision to unilaterally withdraw Assembly funding—or rather to give notice to withdraw such funding—was taken without consulting the National Assembly for Wales, which had taken the initial decision. Can you indicate how you view the unanimous decision that was taken two years ago?

ymboeni am y canlyniad. Mae teimlad cyffredinol fod a wnelo hyn â'r posibilrwydd o ehangu presenoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym Mrwsel, yn yr un lleoliad ag y mae ar hyn o bryd, drwy efallai feddianu mwy o'r tŷ a ddefnyddir gan y ddwy ochr o gynrychiolaeth Cymru yno. Yn dilyn penderfyniad Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru—ac ni wyddom eto a wnaiff ei weithredu; dyna un rheswm dros siarad â Harry Jones—os cymerant hwy lai ac y cymerwn ni fwy o'r adeilad, sef y canlyniad mwyaf tebygol yn ôl a welaf fi, er nad yw'n gyfan gwbl yn fy nwylo i, ni ddylid ei drin fel pe baem wedi cyhoeddi trydydd rhyfel byd.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch fy etholwraig Rosa Crean? Yn Adelaide yr wythnos diwethaf, enillodd fedal aur, gyda'i thîm, yn y chwaraeon paralympaidd ryngwladol.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am dynnu'n sylw at y gamp arbennig honno ym myd chwaraeon; byddwn i'n ei gosod ochr yn ochr â llwyddiannau eraill y penwythnos ym myd chwaraeon. Enillodd Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd gymal cyntaf rownd gyn-derfynol gemau ail gyfle'r ail adran; yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod ni i gyd—hyd yn oed bobl o Abertawe a Wrecsam—yn dymuno'n dda iddynt am yr ail gymal nos yfory. Cafwyd ymdrech anhygoel hefyd gan Glwb Rygbi Pontypridd yn rownd gyn-derfynol Cwpan Parker Pen. Cydymdeimlwn â Chlwb Rygbi Llanelli ar y digwyddiadau anghyffredin a olygodd na lwyddodd y tîm i gyrraedd rownd derfynol Cwpan Heineken. Bydd raid inni brynu pysst newydd a thrawstiau llai llithrig ar gyfer gemau rygbi a gynhelir yn y City Ground yn Nottingham.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ddwy flynedd yn ôl, penderfynodd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gyfan ac yn unfrydol wella'i gynrychiolaeth dramor drwy ymuno â Chanolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru. Gwnaethoch eich penderfyniad diweddar, i ddileu cyllid y Cynulliad yn unochrol—neu'n hytrach i roi rhybudd eich bod am ddileu'r cyllid hwnnw—heb ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, sef y corff a wnaeth y penderfyniad gwreiddiol. A allwch ddweud wrthym sut yr edrychwr ar y penderfyniad

unfrydol a wnaethpwyd ddwy flynedd yn ôl?

**The First Minister:** It was an important decision, but circumstances have changed. We made our announcement because circumstances had changed following the WLGA's decision—which has been already been mentioned—to give 12 months' notice of withdrawal of its membership. That was about a month prior to our decision.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 6, OAQ17075, has been withdrawn.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oedd yn benderfyniad pwysig, ond mae amgylchiadau wedi newid. Gwnaethom ein cyhoeddiad oherwydd bod amgylchiadau wedi newid yn dilyn penderfyniad Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru—a grybwyllyd eisoes—i roi rhybudd 12 mis ei bod am derfynu ei haelodaeth. Yr oedd hynny ryw fis cyn ein penderfyniad ni.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6, OAQ17075, yn ôl.

### **Blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth Government Priorities**

**C7 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar flaenoriaethau ei Lywodraeth dros y chwe mis nesaf? (OAQ17069)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Y prif flaenoriaethau yw sicrhau ein bod yn cyflawni'r targed mewn perthynas â rhestrau ac amseroedd aros o ran cleifion sy'n aros am fwy na 18 mis am driniaeth orthopedig, y gofeithiwn ei gyflawni erbyn mis Gorffennaf, a chyflwyno grantiau dysgu newydd y Cynulliad yn y flwyddyn academaidd newydd ym mis Medi.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Bûm yn gwrando'n ofalus ar eich atebion y prynhawn yma mewn perthynas â'r gwariant a geir yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru rhwng hyn a 2007-08. Mae Edwina Hart wedi bod yn ofalus i beidio â dweud bod penderfyniad wedi'i wneud i wario'r £1.8 biliwn sydd wedi'i roi gan y Canghellor, yn ôl yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud heddiw, ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Serch hynny, yng nghyfarfod yr Uwch Bwyllgor Cymreig yn San Steffan yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd Paul Murphy yn bendant y byddai'r Cynulliad yn gwario hyd at £1.8 biliwn yn 2007-08. Pwy sydd yn siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth—chi, Paul Murphy ynteu Edwina Hart? A ddywedwch wrthym yn bendant a fydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, erbyn 2007-08, yn gwario £1.8 biliwn yn ychwanegol at yr hyn sy'n cael ei wario ar hyn o bryd ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru?

**Q7 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his Government's priorities for the next six months? (OAQ17069)

**The First Minister:** The main priorities are to ensure that we achieve the targets in relation to waiting lists and times with regard to patients waiting longer than 18 months for orthopaedic surgery, which we hope to achieve by July, and to introduce the Assembly's new learning grants in time for the new academic year in September.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I have been listening carefully to your answers this afternoon in relation to health service expenditure in Wales between now and 2007-08. Edwina Hart has been careful not to state that a decision has been made to spend the £1.8 billion given by the Chancellor, according to what you have said today, on the health service in Wales. However, in the Welsh Grand Committee meeting at Westminster last week, Paul Murphy said that the Assembly would definitely spend up to £1.8 billion in 2007-08. Who speaks on behalf of the Government—you, Paul Murphy or Edwina Hart? Will you give us a definite answer as to whether the National Assembly, by 2007-08, will spend £1.8 billion in addition to the amount already spent on the health service in Wales?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Na, nid ar y gwasanaeth iechyd; ni ddywedais hynny. Dywedais y byddai'r arian yn cael ei wario ar iechyd. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth. Mae Ieuan yn hoff o holtti blew fel hyn, ond nid wyf yn siŵr faint o ddiddordeb sydd gan pobl Cymru yn y gwahaniaethau hynny. Y peth pwysig yw bod Edwina, Jane Hutt a minnau wedi dweud ein bod yn diffinio'r maes iechyd yn llydan. Os oes modd gwario £5 yn y sector gofal er mwyn arbed gwario £10 yn y GIG—ac mae gennym bum mlynedd i gynllunio yn awr, nad ydym wedi'i gael o'r blaen—mae'n weddus, yn deilwng ac yn synhwyrol gwneud hynny. Dyna pam ein bod wedi dweud ers cyhoeddiad Gordon Brown mai'r maes iechyd yw'r diffiniad a ddefnyddiwn ar gyfer y cyfnod presennol.

2:30 p.m.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You have made an important announcement today, First Minister. You acknowledged that Wales will not be maintaining the current differential with spending in England on the health service. Now that you have acknowledged that the £1.8 billion will not be spent on the health service in Wales—it may be used in other measures such as housing and all the others that you have indicated—you are breaking that current differential of 15 per cent in spending over and above England. Will you now acknowledge that Wales's spending on the health service as a proportion of spend in England between now and 2007 will decrease?

**The First Minister:** I have not made any important announcement this afternoon: I have repeated what we have said since budget day. Edwina Hart and I, and everybody else who has spoken on behalf of the Government, have done that, Ieuan. If you have not noticed it, your researchers should be sharpened up a bit. If it makes sense to avert expenditure in the health service by spending more money in the care sector, for example, what else is the purpose of having five years over which to plan your health expenditure? What else is the purpose of devolution but to give you the freedom to do that? Are you anti-devolution now, Ieuan? Would you prefer it, one year before the elections to the Welsh Assembly, if we went back to the Treasury block expenditure that

**The First Minister:** No, not on the health service; I did not say that. I said that the money would be spent on health. That is the difference. Ieuan likes splitting hairs in this way, but I am not sure that the people of Wales are interested in such distinctions. The important point is that Edwina, Jane Hutt and I have said that we define health in broad terms. If it is possible to spend £5 in the care sector to save spending £10 in the NHS—and now for the first time we have five years to plan ahead—it is appropriate, laudable and sensible to do so. That is why we have said since Gordon Brown's announcement that the definition we use at present is the health field.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr ydych wedi gwneud cyhoeddiad pwysig heddiw, Brif Weinidog. Yr ydych wedi cydnabod na fydd Cymru'n cynnal y gwahanrediad cyfredol â gwariant yn Lloegr ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gan eich bod wedi cydnabod na chaiff yr £1.8 biliwn ei wario ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru—fe ellir ei ddefnyddio ar fesurau eraill fel tai a'r holl rai eraill y soniasoch amdanyst—yr ydych yn torri'r gwahanrediad cyfredol hwnnw o 15 y cant o wariant dros ac uwch ben Lloegr. A wnewch chi gydnabod yn awr y bydd gwariant Cymru ar y gwasanaeth iechyd fel cyfran o'r gwariant yn Lloegr rhwng heddiw a 2007 yn lleihau?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf wedi gwneud unrhyw gyhoeddiad pwysig y prynhawn yma: yr wyf wedi ailadrodd yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i ddweud ers diwrnod y gyllideb. Mae Edwina Hart a mi, a phawb arall sydd wedi siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth, wedi gwneud hynny, Ieuan. Os nad ydych wedi sylwi ar hynny, dylech ddeffro eich ymchwilwyr. Os yw'n gwneud synnwyr osgoi gwariant yn y gwasanaeth iechyd drwy wario mwy o arian yn y sector gofal, er enghraifft, beth arall yw pwrrpas cael pum mlynedd i gynllunio'ch gwariant iechyd? Beth arall yw pwrrpas datganoli ond i roi'r rhyddid ichi wneud hynny? A ydych chi yn erbyn datganoli'n awr, Ieuan? A fyddai'n well gennych, flwyddyn cyn yr etholiadau i'r Cynulliad, pe aem yn ôl at y gwariant bloc

we had before 1980, before the Barnett formula was brought in, when the Treasury approved all Welsh Office expenditure? I am astonished by your approach to this subject.

**Peter Black:** Given the importance of preventing as well as treating ill health, and the link between poor housing and ill health, will you give a commitment, as part of the budget process, to consider how we can invest more money to deal with poor housing and some of the health issues that arise from that?

**The First Minister:** The totality of the budget, when other aspects of the spending review become apparent in July, will give us the full picture. Although there is a principle that warmer, better housing means less arthritis, bronchitis and so on, I will not commit myself by saying that we will take money out of the health budget for housing, because we may also get a good settlement for housing. We will not know that until July. What we have so far is the health expenditure, the consequentials of Gordon Brown's announcement and the £1.8 billion over five years from April next year.

gan y Trysorlys a gaem cyn 1980, cyn cyflwyno fformiwla Barnett, pan fyddai'r Trysorlys yn cymeradwyo pob gwariant gan y Swyddfa Gymreig? Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu at eich agwedd at y pwnc hwn.

**Peter Black:** O gofio pwysigrwydd atal afiechyd yn ogystal â'i drin, a'r cysylltiad rhwng tai gwael ac iechyd gwael, a roddwch chi ymrwymiad, fel rhan o broses y gyllideb, i ystyried sut y gallwn fuddsoddi mwy o arian i ddelio â thai gwael a rhai o'r problemau iechyd sy'n codi o hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd y gyllideb yn ei chyfarwydd, pan ddaw agweddau eraill ar yr adolygiad gwariant i'r amlwg ym mis Gorffennaf, yn rhoi'r darlun llawn inni. Er bod egwyddor bod tai gwell, cynhesach yn golygu llai o arthritis, broncitis ac ati, nid ymrwymaf drwy ddweud y tynnwn arian allan o'r gyllideb iechyd ar gyfer tai, oherwydd efallai y cawn setliad da ar gyfer tai hefyd. Ni chawn wybod hynny tan fis Gorffennaf. Yr hyn sydd gennym hyd yma yw'r gwariant ar iechyd, symiau canlyniadol cyhoeddiad Gordon Brown a'r £1.8 biliwn dros bum mlynedd o fis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf.

### **Blaenoriaethau a Restrir yn 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'** **Priorities Contained in 'Plan for Wales 2001'**

**C8 Elin Jones:** Sut mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn gofalu bod y cyhoedd yn cael gwybod a yw ei weinyddiaeth yn llwyddo i gyflawni'r blaenoriaethau a restrir yn y ddogfen strategol, 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'? (OAQ17072)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r cyhoedd yn flynyddol drwy gyfrwng adroddiad blynnyddol y Prif Weinidog. Cyhoeddir yr adroddiad nesaf ym mis Hydref. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i hymrwymo'n gryf i egwyddor llywodraeth agored. Yr ydym yn flaenllaw—efallai y tu ôl i Sweden—yn Ewrop o ran sut yr ydym yn rhoi gwybodaeth a pha mor agored yr ydym gyda'r cyhoedd.

**Elin Jones:** Un mater o bryder i'r cyhoedd yng Ngheredigion yw mai un o amcanion eich 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' yw cynyddu

**Q8 Elin Jones:** How is the First Minister keeping the public informed on the progress of his administration in fulfilling the priorities contained in the 'Plan for Wales 2001' strategic document? (OAQ17072)

**The First Minister:** I provide the latest information to the public annually through the First Minister's annual report. The next report will be published in October. The Assembly Government is strongly committed to the principle of open government. With the possible exception of Sweden, we are at the forefront in Europe in terms of disseminating information and openness with the public.

**Elin Jones:** One cause for concern for the people of Ceredigion is that one of the objectives of your 'Plan for Wales 2001' is to

nifer prentisiaethau. Yr ydych yn ymwybodol bod colledion yn y cynllun prentisiaethau yn Aberporth. Yn wreiddiol, cyhoeddodd y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn y byddai'r prentisiaethau yn dod i ben yn Aberporth a Boscombe Down, ond, erbyn hyn, ymddengys eu bod am barhau yn Boscombe Down gan ei fod yn fwy canolog, yn ôl pob tebyg.

Yr ydych wedi ymweld ag Aberporth ac yr ydych yn ymwybodol o'r cynlluniau economaidd ehangach yno. A ydych yn barod yn awr i drafod yn uniongyrchol gyda'r Is-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, Lewis Moonie, i roi pwysau ar y Weinyddiaeth i fynnu parhad y prentisiaethau hyn fel rhan o'r cytundeb 25 mlynedd sydd rhwng y Weinyddiaeth â QinetiQ yn Aberporth?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn rhannu'ch pryder am hyn. Nid wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gywir i ddweud y bydd yn parhau yn Boscombe Down. Yr hyn a ddeallaf yw bod y system Rolls-Royce o hyfforddi prentisiaid gan y Weinyddiaeth yn Aberporth a Boscombe Down yn cael ei gau fel rhan o'r broses breifateiddio a gwerthu'r safleoedd profi yn Aberporth a Boscombe Down—nad yw wedi digwydd hyd yn hyn—i QinetiQ, y cwmni newydd sydd, dros dro o leiaf, yn y sector cyhoeddus. Cred y cwmni y gall dorri ei gostau ac nad oes angen prentisiaethau ar y raddfa Rolls-Royce bresennol. Mae rhywfaint o le i ambell system brentisiaeth Rolls-Royce, ond nid ydym wedi bod yn llwyddiannus hyd yn hyn i berswadio'r Weinyddiaeth ei bod yn werth chweil parhau â'r system bresennol, er mor uchel yw'r safon.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that open government requires accurate information? In that capacity in the health service, will you today commit the Assembly to joining the health commission established by the Government to audit the Government's promises on health?

**The First Minister:** This is an interesting issue. I do not think that we are far apart on this. We know of the proposal to merge the inspectorial functions of the Audit Commission with the Commission for Health

increase the number of apprenticeships. You will be aware that the apprenticeship scheme in Aberporth is suffering losses. Originally, the Ministry of Defence announced that apprenticeships would come to an end at Boscombe Down and Aberporth, but it now appears that they are to continue at Boscombe Down, probably because it is more centrally located.

You have visited Aberporth and you are aware of the broader economic plans there. Are you willing to hold discussions with the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State, Lewis Moonie, to bring pressure to bear on the MoD to insist on the continuation of these apprenticeships as part of the 25-year agreement between QinetiQ and the MoD in Aberporth?

**The First Minister:** I share your concern. I am not sure that you are correct in saying that it will continue at Boscombe Down. As I understand, the Rolls-Royce system of training apprentices used by the MoD at Aberporth and Boscombe Down will be closed down as part of the privatisation process and the sale of the test sites at Aberporth and Boscombe Down, which has not happened yet, to QinetiQ, the new company that is, temporarily at least, in the public sector. The company believes that it can cut costs and that it does not need the current Rolls-Royce level apprenticeships. There is scope for some Rolls-Royce apprenticeship systems, but we have not been successful thus far in persuading the MoD that it is worthwhile carrying on with the existing system, notwithstanding its high quality.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch fod llywodraeth agored yn gofyn am wybodaeth gywir? Yn y capasiti hwnnw yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, a wnewch chi heddiw ymrwymo'r Cynulliad i ymuno â'r comisiwn iechyd a sefydlwyd gan y Llywodraeth i arolygu addewidion y Llywodraeth ar iechyd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyma bwnc didorol. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod gagendor mawr rhyngom ar hyn. Gwyddom am y cynnig i gyfuno swyddogaethau arolygu'r Comisiwn Archwilio â'r Comisiwn Gwella

Improvement. We are dependent on CHI, and I am impressed by the standard of its work. It follows our instructions to carry out inspections to meet our objectives. The only issue, therefore, is to request assurances that CHI, when it is merged with the Audit Commission's inspectorial functions, continues to follow our guidelines.

Iechyd. Yr ydym yn ddibynnol ar y Comisiwn Gwella Iechyd, a gwnaeth safon ei waith argraff arnaf. Mae'n dilyn ein cyfarwyddiadau i gynnal arolygon i gyflawni'n hamcanion. Yr unig fater, felly, yw gofyn am sierwydd y bydd y Comisiwn Gwella Iechyd, pan gaiff ei gyfuno â swyddogaethau arolygu'r Comisiwn Archwilio, yn parhau i ddilyn ein canllawiau.

### **Cyfrifoldebau'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Responsibilities of the Deputy First Minister**

**C9 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar dyletswyddau a chyfrifoldebau'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog? (OAQ17078)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Gweithredol yn gyfrifol am ddiwylliant, chwaraeon a'r iaith Gymraeg.

**Owen John Thomas:** Sawl gwaith y bu i'ch dirprwy gymryd eich lle wrth gadeirio cyfarfodydd Cabinet? Sawl gwaith y bu iddi gynrychioli'r Cynulliad fel Prif Weinidog yn hytrach nag fel Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant? Yn olaf, pwy yw'r dirprwy i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes dirprwy i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Nid wyf yn siŵr o'r atebion i'ch cwestiynau cyntaf, ond ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â hynny.

**Rod Richards:** Will the Deputy First Minister's duties include accompanying the First Minister on his visit to South Africa in the summer with the Welsh rugby team? Before he goes, will the First Minister undertake to read the Tasker Watkins report? Will he also undertake to discuss the report with members of the Culture Committee, and with members of the Welsh Rugby Union? Will he also tell us who persuaded him to intervene in this most extraordinary way in an internal matter of the Welsh Rugby Union?

**The First Minister:** I have received overwhelming support for what Jenny and I said from people involved in rugby. Therefore, your attempt to characterise it as extraordinary is right, but positively so, which becomes clear when you talk to people

**Q9 Owen John Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the duties and responsibilities of the Deputy First Minister? (OAQ17078)

**The First Minister:** The Acting Deputy First Minister is responsible for culture, sport and the Welsh language.

**Owen John Thomas:** How many times has your deputy taken your place in chairing Cabinet meetings? How many times has she represented the Assembly as First Minister rather than as Minister for Culture? Finally, who is the deputy to the Deputy First Minister?

**The First Minister:** There is no deputy to the Deputy First Minister. I am not sure of the answers to your first questions, but I will write to you.

**Rod Richards:** A fydd dyletswyddau'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn cynnwys mynd gyda'r Prif Weinidog ar ei daith i Dde Affrica yn yr haf gyda thîm rygbi Cymru? Cyn mynd, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ymrwymo i ddarllen adroddiad Tasker Watkins? A wnaiff ymrwymo i drafod y mater hefyd gydag aelodau'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, a chydag aelodau Undeb Rygbi Cymru? A wnaiff ddweud wrthym hefyd pwy a'i perswadiodd i ymyrryd yn y ffordd hynod anghyffredin hon mewn mater mewnol i Undeb Rygbi Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cefais gefnogaeth aruthrol i'r hyn a ddywedodd Jenny a mi gan bobl sy'n ymwneud â rygbi. Felly, mae'ch ymgais i'w ddarlunio fel peth anghyffredin yn gywir, ond mewn ffordd gadarnhaol, rhywbeth a ddaw'n glir pan siaradwch â

involved in rugby, with one or two well-known exceptions. I am visiting South Africa in the summer, but, unfortunately, not with the Welsh rugby team and, as far as I know, neither is Jenny, because it would not be appropriate to go to South Africa twice during the summer. There is a reform faction in the Welsh Rugby Union, and there is an anti-reform faction, for obvious reasons, which has a vested interest in the present structure. However, anybody who considers the efforts of Pontypridd and Llanelli, or the Wales under-21, under-19 or under-16 squads, can see that the problem is not with the talent available at club, junior or under-21 level. However, something is preventing that from coming through into the national team. Something is wrong with the structure. That is why I have given my support to what you might loosely call the reform faction in the Welsh Rugby Union. I do not know whether you have views on this, Rod, but you have not mentioned them so far.

**David Davies:** If you agree that the Deputy First Minister should be prepared to appear on a public platform to defend Government policy, why was the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning not prepared to appear on a platform at Ysgol Rhydfelen over the weekend to defend the Government's Welsh language policies? Not only that, but she was not prepared to send anyone else on her behalf. Only members of the Conservative Party, the Liberal Democrat Party and Plaid Cymru attended that meeting.

**The First Minister:** You should not work yourself into a lather over a Minister not turning up to a meeting, David. There are times when we can attend meetings, and times when we cannot. You cannot guarantee to be present at every meeting. I sometimes have to turn down engagements, and sympathise with Jane if she was unable to attend the meeting. I am sorry if a Labour representative was not present, because obviously you would not have covered for the Labour point of view very well, David, but these things happen.

2:40 p.m.

phobl sy'n ymhél â rygbi, gydag un neu ddau eithriad adnabyddus. Byddaf yn ymweld â De Affrica yn yr haf, ond, gwaetha'r modd, nid gyda thîm rygbi Cymru a, hyd y gwn i, ni fydd Jenny ychwaith, oherwydd ni fyddai'n briodol mynd i Dde Affrica ddwy waith yn ystod yr haf. Mae carfan o blaid diwygio yn yr Undeb Rygbi, ac mae carfan yn erbyn diwygio, am resymau amlwg, sydd yn elwa ar y strwythur presennol. Fodd bynnag, gall unrhyw un sy'n ystyried ymdrechion Pontypridd a Llanelli, neu garfanau Cymru dan 21, dan 19 neu dan 16, weld nad yw diffyg doniau ar lefel clwb, iau, neu dan 21 yn broblem. Er hynny, mae rhywbeth yn atal hynny rhag dod drwedd i'r tîm cenedlaethol. Mae rhywbeth o'i le ar y strwythur. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi rhoi fy nghefnogaeth i'r hyn y gallech ei galw'n garfan ddiwygio yn Undeb Rygbi Cymru. Ni wn a oes gennych chi farn ar hyn, Rod, ond nid ydych wedi sôn amdani hyd yma.

**David Davies:** Os cytunwch y dylai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog fod yn barod i ymddangos ar Iwyfan cyhoeddus i amddiffyn polisi'r Llywodraeth, pam nad oedd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn barod i ymddangos ar Iwyfan yn Ysgol Rhydfelen dros y Sul i amddiffyn polisiau'r Llywodraeth ar yr iaith Gymraeg? Nid yn unig hynny, ond nid oedd yn barod i anfon cynrychiolydd. Dim ond aelodau o'r Blaid Geidwadol, Plaid y Democratioaid Rhyddfrydol a Phlaid Cymru a fynychodd y cyfarfod hwnnw.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni ddylech gynhyrfu gormod am nad yw Gweinidog yn ymbresenoli mewn cyfarfod, David. Y mae adegau pan allwn fynychu cyfarfodydd, ac adegau pan na allwn. Ni allwch warantu y byddwch yn bresennol ymhob cyfarfod. Weithiau bydd yn rhaid i mi wrthod gwahoddiadau, a chydymdeimlaf â Jane os na allodd hi fynychu'r cyfarfod. Mae'n flin gennyl os nad oedd cynrychiolydd Llafur yn bresennol, oherwydd yn amlwg ni fuasech chi wedi cyflwyno safbwyt Llafur yn dda iawn, David, ond mae'r pethau hyn yn digwydd.

## Cau Is-swyddfeydd Post Closure of Sub-post Offices

**Q10 Peter Black:** What further discussions has the First Minister had with Consignia about the impact on Wales of its announcement that it is seeking to close 3,000 urban sub-post offices around the UK? (OAQ17067)

**The First Minister:** I believe that it has been mooted that around 300 post offices in Wales are possibly in the frame; the number of post offices in Wales included in these urban restructuring proposals is unclear. I doubt whether this will affect those in deprived urban areas, as they have an additional degree of protection, though not a guarantee, in relation to their post offices. The reinvention of the urban post office network is an active programme. That is what we are talking about here, rather than post offices in deprived urban areas or in rural areas. There is a successful example in my constituency, where a superb new post office has opened in place of the old-fashioned one. If the programme works, it will be good, but undoubtedly the retirement of sub postmasters and mistresses who do not wish to push it through will be an issue. Capital investment is also required. However, where it works, it can produce impressive results. A new, modernised post office can reinforce a shopping parade. However, it will not work every time and we accept that there will be problems in some places.

**Peter Black:** Given the huge concern around Wales about the loss of post offices and the impact that it will have on urban and rural communities, could the Assembly better focus its efforts in working with Consignia and with the UK Government to minimise those losses and to improve the existing network? Could the relevant Committee have a report on how to take this forward?

**The First Minister:** It is mostly a reserved function. I am trying to think of where we could provide services via the post office network. Much of what the post office does are reserved functions: vehicle licensing, the payment of benefits and pensions and so on.

**C10 Peter Black:** Pa drafodaethau pellach y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Consignia am yr effaith ar Gymru yn dilyn eu cyhoeddiad eu bod am gau 3,000 o is-swyddfeydd post trefol yn y DU? (OAQ17067)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Credaf yr awgrymwyd fod oddeutu 300 o swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru o dan ystyriaeth; nid yw'n glir faint o swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn y cynigion ailstrwythuro trefol hyn. Amheuaf a fydd hyn yn effeithio ar y rheini mewn ardaloedd trefol difreintiedig, gan fod ganddynt hwy radd ychwanegol o warchodaeth, er nad gwarant, parthed eu swyddfeydd post hwy. Rhaglen weithredol yw ailddyfeisio'r rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post trefol. Dyna'r hyn yr ydym yn sôn amdano yma, yn hytrach na swyddfeydd post mewn ardaloedd trefol difreintiedig neu mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae enghraift Iwyddiannus yn f'etholaeth i, lle mae swyddfa bost newydd wych wedi agor yn lle'r un hen-ffasiwn. Os gweithia'r rhaglen, bydd yn dda, ond yn sicr bydd rhaid ystyried ymddeoliad is-bostfeistri a phostfeistresi nad ydynt yn awyddus i'w weithredu. Mae angen buddsoddi cyfalaf hefyd. Fodd bynnag, lle gweithia, gall gyflwyno canlyniadau da. Gall swyddfa bost newydd, fodern, atgyfnerthu man siopa. Serch hynny, ni fydd yn gweithio bob tro a derbynw yn ceir problemau mewn ambell le.

**Peter Black:** O gofio'r pryder enfawr o amgylch Cymru ynglŷn â cholli swyddfeydd post a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar gymunedau trefol a gwledig, a allai'r Cynulliad ganolbwytio'i ymdrechion yn well ar weithio gyda Consignia a chyda Llywodraeth y DU i leihau'r colledion hyn ac i wella'r rhwydwaith presennol? A allai'r Pwyllgor perthnasol gael adroddiad ar sut i fynd â hyn yn ei flaen?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Swyddogaeth a gadwyd yn ôl ydyw yn bennaf. Yr wyf yn ceisio meddwl am sut y gallem ddarparu gwasanaethau drwy rwydwaith y swyddfeydd post. Mae llawer o'r hyn a wna swyddfa'r post yn swyddogaethau a gadwyd yn ôl:

All of those are reserved functions and not matters for us. If there are ways in which we could direct business via the post office network, I would be pleased to do so, but I cannot think of any offhand. If you can, perhaps we could correspond on the issue.

trwyddedu cerbydau, talu budd-daliadau a phensiynau ac ati. Swyddogaethau a gadwyd yn ôl yw'r rheini i gyd ac nid materion i ni. Os oes ffyrdd y gallem gyfeirio busnes drwy rwydwaith y swyddfeydd post, byddwn yn falch o wneud hynny, ond ni allaf feddwl am un ar hyn o bryd. Os gallwch chi, efallai y caem ohebu ar y mater.

**Glyn Davies:** Last Friday, First Minister, you, in effect, demanded the resignation of the entire leadership of a body because you thought that it was not serving the morale or interests of Wales. You should not have done that. If the Labour Government, as a result of its policies, forces Consignia to close urban post offices by the thousand, and continues to close rural post offices, will you show leadership where you should and demand the resignation of the hapless Stephen Byers and, indeed, the entire Cabinet?

**Glyn Davies:** Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, Brif Weinidog, bu i chi, mewn effaith, fynnu ymddiswyddiad arweinyddiaeth gyfan corff oherwydd eich bod o'r farn nad oedd yn gwasanaethu morâl na buddiannau Cymru. Ni ddylasech fod wedi gwneud hynny. Os bydd y Llywodraeth Lafur, o ganlyniad i'w pholisiau, yn gorfodi Consignia i gau swyddfeydd post trefol fesul mil, a pharhau i gau swyddfeydd post gwledig, a wnewch chi ddangos arweiniad lle y dylech a mynnu ymddiswyddiad yr anffodus Stephen Byers ac, yn wir, y Cabinet cyfan?

**The First Minister:** I do not know that I even want to characterise that as a good try, Glyn. I did not demand anyone's resignation last Friday. We mentioned no names; we merely gave support to the reform faction, which wants the main contents of the Tasker Watkins report implemented promptly. I did not mention any names and neither did Jenny Randerson. The response seemed to imply that we had mentioned names, but I cannot take responsibility for how people responded to our call. However, we did not demand anyone's resignation and named no names.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni wn a fyddwn hyd yn oed am alw honno'n ymgais dda, Glyn. Ni fynnais ymddiswyddiad neb ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Ni wnaethom grybwyl enwau o gwbl; dim ond rhoi cefnogaeth i'r garfan ddiwygio, sydd yn gofyn am i brif gynnwys adroddiad Tasker Watkins gael ei weithredu'n brydlon. Nid enwais unrhyw enwau ac ni wnaeth Jenny Randerson ychwaith. Yr oedd yr ymateb fel pe bai'n awgrymu ein bod wedi enwi enwau, ond ni allaf fi gymryd cyfrifoldeb am y ffordd yr ymatebodd pobl i'n galwad. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaethom fynnu ymddiswyddiad neb nac enwi enwau.

As regards Consignia, this is an unhappy period, but you should never judge matters too early. Allan Leighton, whom I am seeking to have a meeting with, has come from industry with a good name for how to run a happy ship at a large scale of commercial activity. That may be what the post office needs now. It faces increasing competition within the British regulatory system as a result of the recommendations of the independent regulator, the Postal Services Commission. Also, the EU has set a date of 2006, I believe, for much lighter post to be opened to competition than was previously the case. That puts enormous pressure on the universal, single price letter delivery system.

Ynghylch Consignia, mae hwn yn gyfnod anhapus, ond ni ddylech fyth farnu materion yn rhy gynnar. Mae Allan Leighton, yr wyf yn ceisio cael cyfarfod ag ef, wedi dod o ddiwydiant ag enw da am redeg sefydliad hapus ar raddfa fawr o weithgarwch masnachol. Efallai mai dyna beth sydd ar swyddfa'r post ei angen yn awr. Mae'n wynebu cystadleuaeth gynyddol o fewn system reoleiddiol Prydain o ganlyniad i argymhellion y rheoleiddiwr annibynnol, y Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Post. Hefyd, mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi pennu dyddiad yn 2006, mi gredaf, ar gyfer agor cludiant post llawer ysgafnach nag o'r blaen i cystadleuaeth. Mae hynny'n rhoi pwysau

I do not know how it will get around that, but it needs outstanding leadership.

You should encourage Consignia, unless the new management shows that it has failed. Beginning by reverting to the original name of the Post Office or Royal Mail indicates that it recognises the essential values of the Post Office, and not the trendy names, such as Consignia, which may be at the heart of what has gone wrong over the past few years.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae pawb yn cydnabod y bydd cyflawni gwahanol swyddogaethau yn rhan o'r ateb yn y tymor hir i swyddfeydd post. A fuoch yn pwysol ar Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol er mwyn i swyddfeydd post lleol ddarparu gwasanaethau megis treth car, cyfnewid arian, cardiau llenwi ffonau symudol, ac yn y blaen? A oes modd defnyddio cyfran o'r adnoddau ariannol sydd yn cael eu gwario ar hyn o bryd ar alluogi postfeistri i ymddeol, i ddatblygu'r swyddfeydd post er mwyn eu diogelu yn hytrach na phrysuro eu cau?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae helpu is-bostfeistri i ymddeol yn rhan o'r cynllun a'r trawsnewid y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio eu hyrwyddo. Yr ydym yn aros am ganlyniadau'r arbrawf yn Swydd Caerlŷr o ran sicrhau'r gwasanaethau a restrwyd gennych, o ystyried y bydd swyddfeydd post yn colli hyd at hanner cant y cant o'u busnes pan delir budd-daliadau drwy drosglwyddiad credyd awtomataidd i gyfrifon banc. Dyna'r math o newid sydd ei angen i lenwi'r bwlch pan na fydd swyddfeydd post yn talu budd-daliadau.

### **Datganiad ar Gynllun Elite Cymru Statement on the Elite Cymru Scheme**

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** It is appropriate to make this statement prior to the Commonwealth Games this summer because it gives me an opportunity to tell a success story and move away from the tales of gloom sometimes associated with sport in Wales. Unfortunately, the public perception

anferth ar y system gyffredinol o ddanfon llythyr am un pris i bawb. Ni wn sut yr aiff o'i chwmpas hi, ond mae angen arweinyddiaeth wych.

Dylech annog Consignia, oni ddengys y rheolwyr newydd eu bod wedi methu. Mae dechrau drwy fynd yn ôl at enw gwreiddiol Swyddfa'r Post neu y Post Brenhinol yn dangos eu bod yn cydnabod gwerthoedd sylfaenol Swyddfa'r Post, ac nid yr enwau ffasiynol, fel Consignia, sydd efallai wrth wraidd yr hyn a aeth o'i le dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf.

**Cynog Dafis:** Everyone acknowledges that performing different functions will be part of the long-term solution for post offices. Have you put pressure on the UK Government so that local post offices are able to provide services such as car tax, currency exchange, top-up cards for mobile phones, and so on? Is it possible to use part of the financial resources currently being spent on enabling postmasters and mistresses to retire, to develop post offices in order to safeguard them, rather than accelerating their closure?

**The First Minister:** Encouraging sub postmasters to retire is part of the scheme and the change that the Government is striving to promote. As far as securing the services that you listed, we await the results of the Leicestershire experiment, bearing in mind that post offices will lose up to 50 per cent of their business when benefits will be paid directly into bank accounts through automated credit transfer. That is the kind of change required to fill the plug gap when post offices cease to pay benefits directly.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Mae'n briodol gwneud y datganiad hwn cyn Gemau'r Gymanwlad yr haf hwn oherwydd mae'n rhoi cyfle imi adrodd hanes llwyddiant a symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth y straeon digalon sydd weithiau'n gysylltiedig â chwaraeon yng Nghymru. Yn

of Welsh sport is often based solely on the performances of our national football and rugby teams.

So are we underperforming as a sporting nation? I do not think so. Last month, at the European indoor athletic championships, Wales won gold and silver medals. This performance was better than any other nation in Europe, on a per capita basis. Last year, seven Welsh golfers were ranked in the top 100 in Europe. This was more, per head of population, than any other nation. In amateur golf, Wales has won three international prizes in the last month including the European nations team championships. Perhaps we are already beginning to see evidence of the impact of securing the Ryder Cup.

At the Sydney Paralympic Games, Wales provided 20 per cent of the Great Britain team and won 25 per cent of the medals won by British athletes—this from 5 per cent of the population. Wales won the same number of medals, per head of population, as Australia—the most successful country in the world. Last year, Wales won the European netball championship. The best singles badminton players in Britain, both male and female, are Welsh, Richard Vaughan and Kelly Morgan, as is the current number one snooker player in the world, Mark Williams. Craig Bellamy recently won the Young Footballer of the Year award and Tanni Grey-Thompson's achievement in winning the London marathon for the sixth time so soon after the birth of her daughter was phenomenal. Joe Calzaghe has recently retained the WBO super-middleweight title for the tenth time.

Wales is performing better than ever before on the international stage in a wide range of sports. These successes are down to the hard work of athletes and coaches alike but the Sports Council for Wales's Elite Cymru and Coach Cymru schemes have certainly made a contribution. There can be no doubt that the establishment and development of the Elite Cymru programme has contributed to this success. This lottery-funded programme—which has provided support to over 620

anffodus, mae syniad y cyhoedd am chwaraeon Cymru'n aml wedi'i seilio ar berfformiadau'n timau pêl-droed a rygbi cenedlaethol yn unig.

Felly, a ydym yn tangyflawni fel cenedl ym myd chwaraeon? Nid wyf yn credu hynny. Y mis diwethaf, ym mhencampwriaeth athletau dan-do Ewrop, enillodd Cymru fedalau aur ac arian. Yr oedd y perfformiad hwn yn well nag unrhyw genedl arall yn Ewrop, ar sail poblogaeth. Y llynedd, yr oedd saith golffwr o Gymru yn y 100 uchaf yn Ewrop. Yr oedd hyn yn fwy, fesul pen o'r boblogaeth, nag unrhyw genedl arall. Mewn golff amatur, mae Cymru wedi ennill tair gwobr ryngwladol yn y mis diwethaf, gan gynnwys pencampwriaeth timau cenhedloedd Ewrop. Efallai ein bod eisoes yn dechrau gweld dystiolaeth o effaith sicrhau Cwpan Ryder.

Yn Chwaraeon Paralympaidd Sydney, darparodd Cymru 20 y cant o dîm Prydain Fawr ac enillodd 25 y cant o'r medalau a enillwyd gan athletwyr Prydeinig—a hyn gan 5 y cant o'r boblogaeth. Enillodd Cymru yr un nifer o fedalau, fesul pen o'r boblogaeth, ag Awstralia—y wlad fwyaf llwyddiannus yn y byd. Y llynedd, enillodd Cymru bencampwriaeth bêl-rwyd Ewrop. Mae'r chwaraewyr senglau badminton gorau ym Mhrydain, o blith y dynion a'r merched, ill dau'n Gymry, sef Richard Vaughan a Kelly Morgan, ac felly hefyd chwaraewr snwcer gorau'r byd ar hyn o bryd, Mark Williams. Yn ddiweddar enillodd Craig Bellamy wobr Peldroediwr Ifanc y Flwyddyn ac yr oedd yr hyn a gyflawnodd Tanni Grey-Thompson wrth ennill marathon Llundain am y chweched gwaith mor fuan ar ôl geni ei merch yn anhygoel. Mae Joe Calzaghe wedi cadw teitl uwch-bwysau canol y WBO yn ddiweddar am y degfed tro.

Mae Cymru'n perfformio'n well nag erioed o'r blaen ar y llwyfan ryngwladol mewn amrediad eang o chwaraeon. Mae'r llwyddiannau hyn yn ganlyniad gwaith caled athletwyr a hyfforddwyr fel ei gilydd ond, yn sicr, mae cynlluniau Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, Elite Cymru a Coach Cymru, wedi gwneud cyfraniad. Ni ellir amau nad yw sefydlu a datblygu rhaglen Elite Cymru wedi cyfrannu at y llwyddiant hwn. Mae'r rhaglen hon, sy'n derbyn nawdd gan y loteri—ac

schemes, involving some £2.8 million since 1995—identifies and supports talented competitors. Currently, there are 150 Elite Cymru members, who are given financial support—the amounts provided depend on the sport, the competition costs and the necessary equipment—sports medical back-up; sports science support; free access to training facilities, and lifestyle management training. Past and current members include Tanni Grey-Thompson, Iwan Thomas, Jamie Baulch and Olympic sailing silver medallist, Ian Barker.

2:50 p.m.

Elite Cymru is focused on supporting of individuals, but in the last year or so, the programme has also helped to establish team sport academies in netball, hockey and cricket. It is anticipated that these will make a significant difference in the next few years.

Those identified for the Elite Cymru programme can progress onto the world class performance programme, through attending Great Britain squad sessions, and through being nominated in any development plans submitted by UK governing bodies of sport to UK Sport, which administers the programme. Wales currently has 34 representatives on the world class performance plan.

The Sports Council for Wales's Coach Cymru scheme has been designed to complement the work of Elite Cymru, and aims to develop coaches to meet the needs of sport at regional and national level, provide funding for the training, support and employment of coaches, and quality coaching for national squads. Coach Cymru is lottery funded, and allows governing bodies to employ coaches at a national and regional level. The number of coaches employed by governing bodies equates to 30 full-time posts. Prior to the introduction of lottery funding, the governing bodies in Wales employed only around five coaches. The 30 or so professional coaches support the work of over 12,000 volunteer coaches, who operate in clubs the length and breadth of

sydd wedi darparu cefnogaeth i dros 620 o gynlluniau, gan wario rhyw £2.8 miliwn ers 1995—yn canfod ac yn cefnogi cystadleuwyr dawnus. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gan Elite Cymru 150 o aelodau, a gaiff gymorth ariannol—mae'r symiau a roddir yn dibynnu ar y gamp costau cystadlu a'r offer angenrheidiol—meddygon chwaraeon wrth gefn; cefnogaeth gwyddoniaeth chwaraeon; mynediad am ddim i gyfleusterau hyfforddi, a hyfforddiant rheoli ffordd o fyw. Mae aelodau ddoe a heddiw'n cynnwys Tanni Grey-Thompson, Iwan Thomas, Jamie Baulch ac enillydd y fedal arian am hwyllo yn y gemau Olympaidd, Ian Barker.

Mae Elite Cymru'n canolbwytio ar gefnogi unigolion, ond yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae'r rhaglen hefyd wedi helpu i sefydlu sawl academi chwaraeon tîm, mewn pêl-rwyd, hocia a chriced. Rhagwelir y gwnaiff y rhain wahaniaeth arwyddocaol yn y blynnyddoedd nesaf.

Gall y rhai a ddewisir ar gyfer rhaglen Elite Cymru symud ymlaen i'r rhaglen berfformiad o safon byd, drwy fynychu sesiynau carfan Prydain Fawr, a thrwy gael eu henwebu mewn unrhyw gynlluniau datblygu a gyflwynir gan gyrff llywodraethu chwaraeon y DU i UK Sport, sy'n gweinyddu'r rhaglen. Mae gan Cymru 34 o gynrychiolwyr ar hyn o bryd ar y cynllun perfformiad o safon byd.

Bwriad cynllun Coach Cymru gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yw ategu gwaith Elite Cymru, a'i nod yw datblygu hyfforddwyr i gwrdd ag anghenion chwaraeon ar lefel ranbarthol a chenedlaethol, darparu cyllid ar gyfer hyfforddi, cefnogi a chyflogi hyfforddwyr, a hyfforddiant o safon dda i garfanau cenedlaethol. Caiff Coach Cymru arian loteri, ac mae'n caniatâu i gyrff llywodraethu gyflogi hyfforddwyr ar lefel genedlaethol a rhanbarthol. Mae nifer yr hyfforddwyr a gyflogir gan gyrff llywodraethu yn gyfwerth â 30 swydd amser llawn. Cyn cyflwyno arian loteri, dim ond rhyw bum hyfforddwyr a gyflogid gan y cyrff llywodraethu yng Nghymru. Mae oddeutu 30 o hyfforddwyr proffesiynol yn cefnogi gwaith dros 12,000 o hyfforddwyr

Wales.

I have talked about talent and coaching. However, we also need to consider facilities and competition, if, as I do, you believe that the formula for success in elite sport is: talented competitor plus gifted coach plus access to facilities plus appropriate competition equals success.

In general terms, Wales is well provided for in national facilities for training and competition, for example, the National Watersports Centre at Plas Menai, the Bala Canoe Centre and the Welsh Institute of Sport in Cardiff. The institute is now 30 years old and the Sports Council for Wales is working on proposals for modernising the facility.

Lottery funding has also helped to establish new facilities across Wales: for cricket at Sophia Gardens; for athletics at the University of Wales Institute Cardiff; for swimming at the University of Wales, Swansea; and for cycling in Newport. Other national and regional facilities are being planned.

Currently, many individuals are provided with appropriate competition at the highest level via the Elite Cymru programme. The main issue at present lies with team sports. In general terms, domestic competition is insufficiently high to prepare individuals for international competition. This is central to the ongoing debate in Welsh rugby, but it applies equally to other team sports such as football, netball and hockey. The Sports Council for Wales believes that Wales needs to be innovative and outward looking to solve these problems, and in many instances, the solution may lie in increased cross-border competition.

Today's statement is about elite sport and coaching, but—make no mistake—support for elite sport and support to increase participation are not mutually exclusive. Increasing the number of people playing sport at grass roots level is not only good for the wellbeing of the nation; it also increases

gwirfoddol, sy'n gweithredu mewn clybiau ar hyd a lled Cymru.

Yr wyf wedi sôn am dalent a hyfforddi. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ystyried cyfleusterau a chystadleuaeth os credwch, fel fi, mai'r fformiwl a gyfer llwyddo mewn chwaraeon ar y lefel uchaf yw bod gennych gystadleydd talentog, hyfforddwr dawnus, mynediad at gyfleusterau a chystadleuaeth briodol; yr hafal i lwyddiant.

Yn gyffredinol, mae gan Gymru ddarpariaeth dda o gyfleusterau cenedlaethol ar gyfer hyfforddi a chystadlu, er enghraifft, y Ganolfan Chwaraeon Dŵr Genedlaethol ym Mhlas Menai, Canolfan Ganwio'r Bala a Sefydliad Chwaraeon Cymru yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'r sefydliad bellach yn 30 mlwydd oed ac mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru'n gweithio ar gynigion i foderneiddio'r cyfleuster.

Mae arian y loteri wedi helpu hefyd i sefydlu cyfleusterau newydd ledled Cymru: ar gyfer criced yng Ngerddi Soffia; ar gyfer athletau yn Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd; ar gyfer nofio ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Abertawe; ac ar gyfer beicio yng Nghasnewydd. Mae cyfleusterau cenedlaethol a rhanbarthol eraill i ddod.

Ar hyn o bryd, darperir cystadleuaeth briodol ar y lefel uchaf i lawer o unigolion drwy raglen Elite Cymru. Gyda chwaraeon tîm y mae'r brif broblem ar hyn o bryd. Yn gyffredinol, nid yw cystadleuaeth ddomestig yn ddigon uchel i baratoi unigolion ar gyfer cystadleuaeth ryngwladol. Mae hyn yn ganolog i'r ddadl barhaus am rygbi Cymru, ond mae yr un mor wir am chwaraeon tîm eraill fel pêl-droed, pêl-rwyd a hociaid. Cred Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru fod angen i Gymru fod yn arloesol ac edrych tuag allan i ddatrys y problemau hyn, ac mewn sawl achos, gall yr ateb orwedd mewn mwy o gystadlu trawsffiniol.

Am chwaraeon a hyfforddiant y goreuon y mae datganiad heddiw, ond—peidiwch â chamgymryd—nid yw cefnogi chwaraeon i'r goreuon yn golygu na ellir cefnogi mwy o gyfranogiad. Mae cynyddu'r nifer o bobl sy'n chwarae chwaraeon ar lawr gwlad nid yn unig yn dda i les y genedl; mae hefyd yn

the pool of talent from which elite performers may be drawn. In turn, the success of elite performers creates role models to increase participation. I am committed to working with the Sports Council for Wales to develop sport in Wales at all levels.

Wales is performing better than ever across a wide range of sports. Elite Cymru and Coach Cymru are playing their part in making Wales fit for the future. To merely maintain current standards is not an option. Today's gold medal winning performance may not be enough to reach a final tomorrow. Continued investment in our elite competitors is an absolute necessity. Currently, Wales punches above its weight in the sporting world, which brings us international profile. We must continue to support our elite athletes and coaches if we are to maintain Wales's position on the world stage.

**Owen John Thomas:** Weinidog, yr oedd yn galonogol i chi ein hatgoffa o llwyddiant Cymru mewn nifer o chwaraeon dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf: golff, y gemau paralypmaidd, pêl-rwyd, badminton ac ati. Cyfeiriasoch at gefnogaeth ar gyfer hyfforddwyr o safon a thimau cenedlaethol. A fyddwch felly yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda thîm pêl-fas Cymru i sicrhau ei fod yn derbyn ychydig o arian? Mae'n gwneud llawer o waith da mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, yn sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn chwarae pêl-fas yn hytrach na pheri problemau.

Rhoddyd £2.8 miliwn i Elite Cymru dros saith mlynedd, sef £400,000 y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd. Nid yw ffigurau'r gyllideb gennyf ar hyn o bryd. Beth yw'r radd gyfredol, ac a ydych yn bwriadu ychwanegu ati yn y dyfodol?

Bu ichi sôn am hyfforddi carfanau cenedlaethol. A fyddwch yn cynnal trafodaethau gydag Undeb Rygbi Cymru i weld a fydd am wneud cais am arian i wella ei hyfforddiant? Bu ichi hefyd sôn am yr her o gynnal gemau ar draws y ffin. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r ffaith bod undeb rygbi Lloegr wedi gwrthod creu cynghrair i Brydain ac Iwerddon, lle y gallai timau clybiau'r pedair gwlad chwarae yn erbyn ei gilydd yn rheolaidd. Hyderaf y byddai timau Cymru yn

cynyddu'r gronfa o dalent y gellir tynnu'r goreuon ohoni. Yn ei dro, mae llwyddiant y goreuon yn creu modelau rôl i gynyddu cyfranogiad. Yr wyf yn ymroddedig i weithio gyda Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i ddatblygu chwaraeon yng Nghymru ar bob lefel.

Mae Cymru'n perfformio'n well nag erioed ar draws amrediad eang o chwaraeon. Mae Elite Cymru a Coach Cymru'n chwarae eu rhan i wneud Cymru'n ffit ar gyfer y dyfodol. Nid yw dim ond cynnal y safonau presennol yn opsiwn. Efallai na fydd y perfformiad sy'n ennill y fedal aur heddiw yn ddigon da i gyrraedd y rownd derfynol yfory. Mae'n gwbl angenrheidiol parhau i fuddsoddi yn ein cystadleuwyr gorau. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Cymru'n perfformio'n well nag y dylai yn y byd chwaraeon, sy'n rhoi proffil rhyngwladol inni. Rhaid inni barhau i gefnogi'n hathletwyr a'n hyfforddwyr gorau os am gadw safle Cymru ar lwyfan y byd.

**Owen John Thomas:** Minister, it was heartening to hear you remind us of Wales's successes in many sports during the last year: golf, the paralympic games, netball, badminton and so forth. You referred to support for quality coaches and national teams. Will you therefore hold discussions with the Welsh baseball team to ensure that it receives some money? It does a great deal of good work in deprived areas, ensuring that young people play baseball rather than cause problems.

Elite Cymru was given £2.8 million over seven years, which on average is £400,000 per year. I do not have the budget figures at the moment. What is the current rate and do you intend to add to it in future?

You mentioned coaching for national squads. Will you hold discussions with the Welsh Rugby Union to see whether it will apply for funding to improve its coaching? You also mentioned the challenge of staging matches across the border. I know that the English rugby union refused to create a British and Irish league, where club sides from the four home nations could have played against each other regularly. I am confident that Welsh teams would welcome regular fixtures

falch o allu chwarae fel yr oedd ynt yn arfer ei wneud yn rheolaidd yn erbyn timau fel yr Harlequins.

Y broblem yn awr yw dod o hyd i'r arian. Yr wyf wedi derbyn cwynion gan nifer o bobl fod y dulliau o ddod o hyd i arian yn gymhleth. A oes modd o symleiddio'r broses o geisio am arian Elite Cymru a Coach Cymru?

**Jenny Randerson:** I did not think that I would get a set of questions from Owen John without a reference to baseball. If the Welsh baseball team writes asking to see me, I would be pleased to talk to them.

You asked about Elite Cymru funding. This year, the Sports Council for Wales will provide £850,000 for the scheme, for approximately 150 sportsmen, sportswomen and athletes. The scheme has built up over time and is still developing.

On rugby, I am happy to talk to the Welsh Rugby Union if it wishes to see me again. It is important to clarify the level of support that rugby gets through various means. The sports council gives approximately £125,000 per year to the development of rugby, including women's rugby and other aspects of the game. That is in addition to the £4.5 million of lottery funding that has gone to Welsh rugby clubs since the lottery began, which is a significant slice of the lottery money available for sport.

Cross-border competition must be developed with the sports council and the governing bodies concerned. The sports council is working hard on that, and you may wish to take it up with the council's representatives when they next come to the Committee to discuss sports issues.

I am interested in your comments on the application process. Elite Cymru was the first national scheme of its kind. The UK World Class Performance Programme was developed from this. Elite Cymru has been held up as a model of excellence. If there are weaknesses in the application procedure, the sports council and I would be interested to have details of the perceived complexities. Although applying could be seen as difficult,

against teams such as the Harlequins.

The problem now is finding the funding. I have received several complaints that the process of securing funding is complex. Is there a way to simplify the application process for Elite Cymru and Coach Cymru money?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni feddyliais y cawn i set o gwestiynau gan Owen John Thomas heb gyfeiriad at bêl-fas. Os ysgrifenna tîm pêl-fas Cymru ataf yn gofyn am fy ngweld, byddwn yn falch o siarad â hwy.

Holasoch am gyllid Elite Cymru. Eleni, bydd Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru'n darparu £850,000 i'r cynllun, ar gyfer oddeutu 150 o fabolgampwyr, mabolgampwagedd ac athletwyr. Mae'r cynllun wedi datblygu dros amser ac mae'n dal i ddatblygu.

Ar rygbi, yr wyf yn hapus i siarad ag Undeb Rygbi Cymru os dymuna fy ngweld eto. Mae'n bwysig egluro'r lefel o gefnogaeth a gaiff rygbi drwy wahanol ffyrdd. Bydd y cyngor chwaraeon yn rhoi rhyw £125,000 y flwyddyn at ddatblygu rygbi, yn cynnwys rygbi merched ac agweddu eraill ar y gêm. Mae hynny ar ben y £4.5 miliwn o arian loteri a aeth i glybiau rygbi Cymru ers dechrau'r loteri, sy'n dalp sylweddol o'r arian loteri sydd ar gael ar gyfer chwaraeon.

Rhaid datblygu cystadleuaeth drawsffiniol gyda'r cyngor chwaraeon a'r cyrff llywodraethu perthnasol. Mae'r cyngor chwaraeon yn gweithio'n galed ar hynny, ac efallai y dymunwch godi'r mater gyda chynrychiolwyr y cyngor pan ddeuant nesaf i'r Pwyllgor i drafod materion chwaraeon.

Mae'ch sylwadau ar y broses wneud cais yn ddiddorol. Elite Cymru oedd y cynllun cenedlaethol cyntaf o'i fath. Datblygwyd Rhaglen Berfformiad Safon Byd y DU ar sail hyn. Ystyrir Elite Cymru fel patrwm o ragoriaeth. Os oes gwendidau yn y drefn weithredu, byddai gan y cyngor chwaraeon a minnau ddiddordeb mewn cael manylion am y cymhlethdodau a welir. Er y gellid meddwl bod gwneud cais yn anodd, am fod yn rhaid

as it involves filling in forms and so on, talented athletes are strongly encouraged and helped to make an application. As the scheme only consists of 150 people, it is possible to deal with athletes on an individual basis.

3:00 p.m.

**Rosemary Butler:** This positive statement shows that the Sports Council for Wales is doing an excellent job. The Elite Cymru scheme is the envy of the other home nations. The achievements that you listed in your statement show how successful it is. It is a shame that you did not mention crown green bowling, as Tom Middlehurst would have been interested in that. I am delighted that you mentioned sports other than male team sports.

You made the essential point that this is part of a jigsaw. We need high quality coaches. You mentioned that the sports council is working up proposals to modernise some of its facilities. We have an excellent watersports facility in north Wales, and we also have the mountain centre. However, I am concerned about the Welsh Institute of Sport in Cardiff. It has provided an amazing service over the years. However, it needs a little tender loving care. During the budget round, will you allocate money to upgrade that good facility?

**Jenny Randerson:** Anyone who visits the institute of sport can tell its age. I have had discussions with the sports council over a long period of time, and I am strongly encouraging it to work up detailed proposals for the modernisation of the institute, which is now due. It is working on this and I expect the proposals to come to fruition in the not too distant future. At that point, it would become subject to the budget planning process. That is all I can say at the moment.

**Glyn Davies:** Although Wales is a small nation, we produce many stars. You were right to say that we are a successful nation. However, you should always mention David Evans when you are listing Welsh stars, because of his fantastic achievements in

llenwi ffurflen i ac ati, caiff athletwyr talentog anogaeth gref a chymorth i wneud cais. Gan mai dim ond 150 o bobl sydd ar y cynllun, mae modd delio ag athletwyr fel unigolion.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae'r datganiad positif hwn yn dangos fod Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru'n gwneud gwaith ardderchog. Mae cynllun Elite Cymru'n destun eiddigedd yng ngwledydd eraill Prydain. Mae'r llwyddiannau a restrwyd gennych yn eich datganiad yn dangos pa mor llwyddiannus ydyw. Mae'n drueni na sonioch am fowlia lawnt gefngrom, oherwydd buasai gan Tom Middlehurst ddiddordeb yn hynny. Yr wyf yn falch iawn ichi sôn am chwaraeon ar wahân i rai i dimau o ddynion.

Gwnaethoch y pwynt hanfodol mai rhan o jig-so yw hyn. Mae angen hyfforddwyr o safon uchel. Bu ichi grybwylod y cyngor chwaraeon yn gweithio ar gynigion i foderneiddio rhai o'i gyfleusterau. Mae gennym gyfleuster chwaraeon dŵr ardderchog yn y Gogledd, ac mae'r ganolfan fynydda gennym hefyd. Er hynny, yr wyf yn bryderus am Sefydliad Chwaraeon Cymru yng Nghaerdydd. Mae wedi rhoi gwasanaeth rhyfeddol dros y blynyddoedd. Serch hynny, mae angen ychydig o ofal cariadus a thyner arno. Yn ystod cylch y gyllideb, a wnewch chi ddyrrannu arian i uwchraddio'r cyfleuster da hwnnw?

**Jenny Randerson:** Gall unrhyw ymwelydd weld pa mor hen yw'r sefydliad chwaraeon. Cefais drafodaethau gyda'r cyngor chwaraeon dros gyfnod maith, ac yr wyf yn ei annog yn gryf i lunio cynigion manwl ar gyfer moderneiddio'r sefydliad, fel y mae'n hen bryd gwneud. Mae'n gweithio ar hyn a disgwyliaf i'r cynigion ymddangos cyn bo hir. Bryd hynny, cai ei gynnwys ym mhroses gynllunio'r gyllideb. Dyna'r cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud ar hyn o bryd.

**Glyn Davies:** Er mai cenedl fechan yw Cymru, cynhyrchnwn lawer o sêr. Yr oeddech yn iawn i ddweud ein bod yn genedl llwyddiannus. Er hynny, dylech bob amser sôn am David Evans pan fyddwch yn rhestru sêr o Gymru, oherwydd ei llwyddiannau

squash. He is a brilliant sportsman. We should always try to be even more successful than we are. Today's statement is about creating the conditions for success, and we must continue to do that. However, we must be careful not to give the impression that we want to take over a sport. I disagreed with the First Minister's comments on rugby union last Friday, and with your association with them. That was not necessary because of the content, but because of the opportunism and the impression that it gave that you were trying to take over the management of a sport. Do you agree that the next thing that will happen is that you will want to take over the management of football? Do you accept that you must be careful not to give the impression that you or the Government want to take over the management of a sport? That would be a recipe for disaster.

Do you recognise the fantastic achievement of Glanmor Griffiths in delivering the Millennium Stadium on time and within budget? It has done as much to put Wales on the sporting map of the world and to inspire interest among young people to become involved as anything that has happened in the last 10 years. More money will probably be lost in preparing to build the national stadium in England than was spent on building our fantastic stadium in Cardiff.

I support the objectives of the Elite Cymru and Coach Cymru schemes; I cannot do otherwise. I hope that you and the First Minister will agree that producing Welsh national coaches is also important, because almost as much profile is given to coaches as to players. Finally, do you agree that we must focus more in both schemes on women's participation? This will build on the terrific performances of the netball team, Tanni Grey-Thompson, Kelly Morgan, who you mentioned, and Nicole Cooke, the cyclist, who you did not mention.

**Jenny Randerson:** You obviously did not read the same reports and interviews as I did. I was there when the First Minister was interviewed, and I know what was said. We made it clear that there was no question of wishing to take over a sport, although we

anhygoel ym myd sboncen. Mae'n chwaraewr gwyd. Dylem bob amser geisio bod hyd yn oed yn fwy llwyddiannus nag yr ydym. Mae a wnelo datganiad heddiw â chreu'r amodau i lwyddo, a rhaid inni barhau i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ofalu na roddwn yr argraff ein bod eisiau cymryd yr awenau mewn rhyw gamp. Anghytunais â sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog ar rygbi'r undeb ddydd Gwener diwethaf, ac â'ch cefnogaeth chi iddynt. Nid oherwydd y cynnwys yr oedd hynny o reidrwydd, ond oherwydd y bachu ar gyfle a'r argraff a roddai eich bod yn ceisio cymryd rheolaeth ar chwaraeon. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r peth nesaf a ddigwydd yw y bydd arnoch eisiau cymryd rheolaeth dros bêl-droed? A dderbyniwch fod yn rhaid ichi fod yn ofalus i beidio â rhoi'r argraff fod arnoch chi neu'r Llywodraeth eisiau cymryd rheolaeth dros ryw chwaraeon? Byddai hynny'n ffordd sicr o wneud llanast ohoni..

A ydych yn cydnabod camp aruthrol Glanmor Griffiths yn sicrhau bod Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn barod mewn pryd ac o fewn y gyllideb? Gwnaeth gymaint i roi Cymru ar fap chwaraeon y byd ac i ysbrydoli diddordeb ymyst pobl ifanc i gymrud rhan ag a wnaeth unrhyw beth arall yn y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae'n debyg y collir mwy o arian wrth baratoi i adeiladu'r stadiwm genedlaethol yn Lloegr nag a warwyd ar adeiladu'n stadiwm wych ni yng Nghaerdydd.

Cefnogaeth amcanion cynlluniau Elite Cymru a Coach Cymru; ni allaf wneud fel arall. Gobeithiaf y gwnewch chi a'r Prif Weinidog gytuno fod cynhyrchu hyfforddwyr cenedlaethol o Gymru'n bwysig hefyd, gan y rhoddir bron gymaint o broffil i hyfforddwyr ag i chwaraebyr. Yn olaf, a gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni ganolbwytio mwy yn y ddau gynllun ar gyfranogiad menywod? Bydd hyn yn adeiladu ar berfformiadau penigamp y tîm pêl-rwyd, Tanni Grey-Thompson, Kelly Morgan, a grybwylwyd gennych, a Nicole Cooke, y feicwraig, na chrybwylwyd gennych.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yn amlwg ni ddarllenoch yr un adroddiadau a chyfweliadau ag a ddarllenais i. Yr oeddwn i yno pan gyfwelwyd y Prif Weinidog, a gwn beth a ddywedwyd. Dywedasom yn glir nad oedd dim cwestiwn o fod eisiau cymryd rheolaeth

have a perfectly legitimate interest in it, and as Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language, rugby development is within my remit. As I said earlier, we give significant amounts of money to rugby development every year, and a large slice—£4.5 million—of lottery funding has gone to rugby clubs in Wales. That is a great deal of money, and is in addition to the £46 million of Millennium Commission money that went to the Millennium Stadium. These are significant amounts of money that have been raised from the public by various means, and therefore, there is a legitimate public interest.

I believe that it would have been startling if we had not expressed an interest in the current problems. I set up the football forum, and no-one criticised that as not being a legitimate way of attempting to deal with some of the issues facing football in Wales. We have a legitimate right and interest in sport that affects our national morale, as the First Minister said on Friday. Whether I wanted to be involved or not, the question of funding for the Millennium Stadium, which is intimately linked with the Welsh Rugby Union, has been put to me on numerous occasions in public. Therefore, it is an issue with which we are associated.

I agree with you on the importance of developing the participation of women in sport. I am delighted that some of the money the Sports Council for Wales gives to rugby is for the development of women's rugby, and the football forum has a place for a representative of women's football. I am keen to develop, in particular, those sports that are traditionally associated with women, as well as those in which women's participation is relatively new.

**Mick Bates:** Elite Cymru is a success story, and I congratulate you, Minister, and all those involved in it. It has provided support for such athletes as Tanni Grey-Thompson and Jamie Baulch, and is now supporting the next generation of potentially outstanding Welsh athletes.

Athletics is a success story for Wales, with

dros chwaraeon, er bod gennym ddiddordeb cwbl ddilys ynddynt, ac fel Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg, mae datblygiad rygbi o fewn fy nghylch gwaith. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, rhoddown symiau sylweddol o arian bob blwyddyn i ddatblygiad rygbi, ac mae talp mawr—£4.5 miliwn—o arian loteri wedi mynd i glybiau rygbi yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n arian mawr iawn, ac mae ar ben y £46 miliwn o arian Comisiwn y Mileniwm a aeth i Stadiwm y Mileniwm. Dyma symiau sylweddol o arian a godwyd oddi wrth y cyhoedd drwy sawl modd, ac felly, y mae diddordeb cyhoeddus cyfawn.

Credaf y buasai'n ysgytvol pe na baem wedi mynegi diddordeb yn y problemau cyfredol. Sefydlais y fforwm pêl-droed, ac ni feirniadodd neb hynny ar y sail nad oedd yn ffordd gyfreithlon o geisio delio â rhai o'r problemau sy'n wynebu pêl-droed yng Nghymru. Mae gennym hawl a diddordeb cyfreithlon mewn chwaraeon sy'n effeithio ar ysbryd y genedl, fel y dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru ddydd Gwener. P'un ai a oeddwn eisiau ymwneud â hyn ai peidio, mae cwestiwn y cyllid ar gyfer Stadiwm y Mileniwm, sydd yn y pen draw'n gysylltiedig ag Undeb Rygbi Cymru, wedi'i ofyn imi sawl gwaith yn gyhoeddus. Felly, y mae'n fater y cysylltir ni ag ef.

Cytunaf â chi ynghylch pwysigrwydd datblygu cyfranogiad menywod mewn chwaraeon. Yr wyf wrth fy modd fod rhywfaint o'r arian a roddir gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i rygbi wedi'i glustnodi ar gyfer datblygu rygbi merched, ac mae gan y fforwm pêl-droed le i gynrychiolydd pêl-droed merched. Yr wyf yn eiddgar i ddatblygu, yn arbennig, y chwaraeon hynny a gysylltir yn draddodiadol â merched, yn ogystal â'r rheini lle mae cyfranogiad menywod yn beth cymharol newydd.

**Mick Bates:** Mae Elite Cymru'n stori lwyddiannus, ac fe'ch llonyfarchaf, Weinidog, a phawb sy'n ymwneud â hi. Darparodd gefnogaeth i athletwyr fel Tanni Grey-Thompson a Jamie Baulch, ac mae'n awr yn cefnogi'r to nesaf o athletwyr Cymreig a allai gyrraedd y brig.

Mae athletau'n stori lwyddiant i Gymru, gyda

figures such as Colin Jackson, Christian Malcolm, and Britain's finest female sprinter, Katharine Merry, choosing to live and train in Wales. Elite Cymru is playing a major role in securing the future of Welsh athletics.

We must also secure the future of Welsh rugby. There is much discussion on this at present, and I will add my contribution. The structure of the Welsh Rugby Union must be reformed to enable the national side to flourish again. The English Rugby Football Union has undertaken a restructuring process, and I believe that it was Will Carling who came up with a memorable expression that was used to energise some of the gentlemen there.

**Glyn Davies:** What was the expression?

**Mick Bates:** It escapes me for the moment—

**Carwyn Jones:** Sound fellows?

**Mick Bates:** Yes, I believe that it was 'sound fellows'.

Success is not always about winning. It is about providing access to all sport, and encouraging participation. That is the fundamental point of Elite Cymru.

I have two questions on football. Will you ensure that there is an increasing commitment to funding our young disabled people to form a Welsh national team? I believe that England is ahead of us in that. Secondly, there is a problem with the UEFA rule that demands that all League of Wales teams establish a football academy for players up to the age of 16. In two years' time, the age limit will increase to 19. This will put extra pressure on resources, pitches, training grounds and the provision of coaches. Will the Coach Cymru scheme enable League of Wales teams to get support to meet the increase in demand?

3:10 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am proud of the fact that one of the areas of sport in which we

ffigurau fel Colin Jackson, Christian Malcolm, a gwibwraig orau Prydain, Katharine Merry, yn dewis byw a hyfforddi yng Nghymru. Mae Elite Cymru'n chwarae rhan fawr o ran sicrhau dyfodol athletau Cymru.

Rhaid inni sicrhau dyfodol rygbi Cymru hefyd. Mae llawer o drafodaeth ar hyn ar hyn o bryd, ac fe ychwanegaf fy nghyfraniad i. Rhaid ailffurfio strwythur Undeb Rygbi Cymru i alluogi'r tîm cenedlaethol i ffynnu eto. Mae Undeb Rygbi Lloegr wedi ymgymryd â phroses ailstrwythuro, a chredaf mai Will Carling a ddefnyddiodd ymadrodd cofiadwy i roi hwb i rai o'r gwyr bonheddig yn y fan honno.

**Glyn Davies:** Beth oedd yr ymadrodd?

**Mick Bates:** Ni allaf yn fy myw gofio ar y funud—

**Carwyn Jones:** Hogiau da?

**Mick Bates:** Ie, credaf mai 'hogiau da' ydoedd.

Nid ennill yw'r mesur o lwyddiant bob tro. Mae a wnelo llwyddiant â darparu mynediad at bob chwaraeon, ac annog cyfranogiad. Dyna bwynt sylfaenol Elite Cymru.

Mae gennyl ddau gwestiwn ar bêl-droed. A wnewch chi sicrhau y ceir ymrwymiad cynyddol i ariannu'n pobl ifanc anabl i ffurfio tîm cenedlaethol i Gymru? Credaf fod Lloegr ar y blaen inni yn hynny o beth. Yn ail, mae problem gyda rheol UEFA sy'n mynnu fod pob tîm yng Nghynghrair Cymru'n sefydlu academi bêl-droed i chwaraewyr hyd at 16 oed. Ymhen dwy flynedd, bydd y terfyn oed yn codi i 19. Bydd hyn yn rhoi pwysau ychwanegol ar adnoddau, caeau, meysydd hyfforddi a darpariaeth hyfforddwyr. A fydd cynllun Coach Cymru'n galluogi timau Cynghrair Cymru i gael cefnogaeth i gwrdd a'r cynnydd yn y galw?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r ffaith mai un o'r meysydd ym myd chwaraeon y

participate and are particularly successfully in disability sport. Wales's record in disability sport is unparalleled and it should be a great source of pride to us. I knew that if I mentioned individuals, other Members would refer to other sports and individuals, as it is difficult to list everyone. In relation to the football forum, there is a representative with responsibility for football for people with disabilities. This is therefore an issue that is under discussion as part of the forum. Your question on UEFA, football academies and the role of Coach Cymru is a technical one, and it is best, therefore, if I write to you setting out the full details in order to ensure clarity.

**The Presiding Officer:** The lead spokespeople from each party group have spoken, and we now have barely five minutes left. If the five remaining speakers ask 30-second questions, and they receive 30-second answers from the Minister, there will be time for all five to contribute.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, you said that rugby falls within your remit. Do you mean both codes of rugby, because you have not mentioned rugby league? Last weekend, the successful rugby league Challenge Cup final was held in Edinburgh. It brought £10 million to the city. The event will be held in Cardiff next year. Many rugby league fans live in north Wales. Colwyn Bay rugby league—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry, but you have taken too long.

**Jenny Randerson:** I cannot be specific about every sport, but I am aware that rugby league is a great interest in north Wales. I often tell people, as I did in an interview this morning, that more people in Wales play and watch football than there are keen rugby fans and so we associate ourselves specifically with it.

**Alun Pugh:** Two of my constituents in Colwyn Bay have been invited to represent Wales in netball. Training for many sports takes place in Cardiff, but there is no

cyfranogwn ynddo ac yr ydym yn arbennig o lwyddiannus ynddo yw chwaraeon i'r anabl. Mae record Cymru mewn chwaraeon i'r anabl yn ddigymar a dylai fod yn destun balchder mawr inni. Gwyddwn pe bawn yn enwi unigolion, y byddai Aelodau eraill yn cyfeirio at chwaraeon ac unigolion eraill, gan ei bod yn anodd rhestru pawb. Ynglŷn â'r fforwm pêl-droed, mae cynrychiolydd sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros bêl-droed i bobl ag anableddau. Mae hyn felly'n fater sy'n cael ei drafod fel rhan o'r fforwm. Mae'ch cwestiwn ynglŷn ag UEFA, academiâu pêl-droed a'rôlei Coach Cymru'n un technegol, a gwell, felly, fyddai imi ysgrifennu atoch yn amlinellu'r manylion llawn er mwyn sicrhau eglurder.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r prif lefarwyr o bob grŵp plaid wedi siarad, ac yn awr prin bum munud sydd gennym ar ôl. Os gofynnâ'r pum siaradwr sydd yn weddill gwestiynau hanner munud, ac os cânt atebion hanner munud gan y Gweinidog, bydd amser i'r pump gyfrannu.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, dywedasoch fod rygbi o fewn eich cylch gwaith. A ydych yn golygu'r ddau god rygbi, oherwydd nid ydych wedi sôn am rygbi'r gynghrair? Y penwythnos diwethaf, cynhaliwyd rownd derfynol lwyddiannus Cwpan Her rygbi'r gynghrair yng Nghaeredin. Daeth â £10 miliwn i'r ddinas. Cynhelir yr achlysur yng Nghaerdydd y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae llawer o ddilnwyr rygbi'r gynghrair yn byw yn y Gogledd. Mae clwb rygbi'r gynghrair Bae Colwyn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond yr ydych wedi siarad yn rhy hir.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni allaf siarad yn benodol am bob camp, ond yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod rygbi'r gynghrair yn ddiddordeb mawr yn y Gogledd. Dywedaf wrth bobl yn aml, fel y dywedais mewn cyfweliad y bore yma, fod mwy o bobl yng Nghymru'n chwarae ac yn gwyllo pêl-droed nag sydd o gefnogwyr rygbi brwd, ac felly uniaethwn yn benodol â'r gamp honno.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae dau o fy etholwyr ym Mae Colwyn wedi'u gwahodd i gynrychioli Cymru mewn pêl-rwyd. Mae hyfforddi ar gyfer llawer o chwaraeon yn digwydd yng

assistance with travel expenses and subsistence. Will you take up this issue with the Sports Council for Wales as a matter of principle?

**Jenny Randerson:** Assistance is available for travelling expenses. There was money in last year's budget to enable people to represent Wales in various sports. It was intended specifically for people who need assistance with travelling expenses.

**Christine Chapman:** Do you agree that, in order to increase the participation of women in sport, it is important that more women are involved in the management, coaching and officiating of sports, particularly at the higher level?

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree. One of the ways of ensuring that there is equality is to secure a good representation of women on the sports council, which we have.

**John Griffiths:** Will you look at ways of supporting the contribution made by comprehensive schools, such as Hartridge Comprehensive School in my constituency, which has soccer and rugby schools of excellence, and is seeking to expand the provision to include other sports, such as golf? Will you confirm that you will not abdicate your responsibility regarding the much-needed reform of the Welsh Rugby Union and, in conjunction with the First Minister—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time has come to an end.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am interested in school-based developments. At the weekend, while people were watching Cardiff City play football, and yet more were watching the Llanelli and Pontypridd rugby matches, I was at the Gwent under-14 rugby sevens competition in Pontypool park, watching the development of the young rugby players of the future.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for that succinct statement, Minister.

Nghaerdydd, ond ni cheir cymorth at gostau teithio a chynhaliaeth. A wnewch chi godi'r mater hwn gyda Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru fel mater o egwyddor?

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae cymorth ar gael at gostau teithio. Yr oedd arian yng nghyllideb y llynedd i alluogi pobl i gynrychioli Cymru mewn amryfal chwaraeon. Fe'i bwriadwyd yn benodol ar gyfer pobl sydd angen cymorth gyda threuliau teithio.

**Christine Chapman:** A ydych yn cytuno, er mwyn cynyddu nifer y merched sy'n cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon, ei bod yn bwysig fod mwy o fenywod yn ymwneud â rheoli, hyfforddi a dyfarnu mewn chwaraeon, yn enwedig ar y lefel uwch?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf. Un o'r ffyrdd o sicrhau cydraddoldeb yw sicrhau cynrychiolaeth dda o fenywod ar y cyngor chwaraeon, ac mae hynny gennym.

**John Griffiths:** A wnewch chi edrych ar ffyrdd i gefnogi'r cyfraniad a wneir gan ysgolion cyfun, megis Ysgol Gyfun Hartridge yn fy etholaeth i, sydd a chanddi ysgolion rhagoriaeth mewn pêl-droed a rygbi, ac sy'n ceisio ehangu'r ddarpariaeth i gynnwys chwaraeon eraill, fel golff? A wnewch chi gadarnhau na wnewch ymwrthod â'ch cyfrifoldeb ynghylch yr angen mawr i ddiwygio Undeb Rygbi Cymru ac, ar y cyd â'r Prif Weinidog—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn datblygiadau mewn ysgolion. Ar y penwythnos, tra'r oedd pobl yn gwyllo Dinas Caerdydd yn chwarae pêl-droed, a mwy eto'n gwyllo gemau rygbi Llanelli a Phontypridd, yr oeddwn i yng nghystadleuaeth rygbi saith-bob-oehr dan-14 Gwent ym mharc Pontypwl, yn gwyllo datblygiad chwaraewyr rygbi ifanc y dyfodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch am y datganiad cryno hwnnw, Weinidog.

## Datganiad ar Ynni Statement on Energy

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** A major public debate is taking place on energy, following publication of the Cabinet Office report 'Energy 2050'. The Assembly Government has the opportunity to take part in that review and I encourage all in Wales to take the opportunity to address the big issues it raises. The Economic Development Committee has already embarked on this process with the launch of its consultation report on renewable energy last week, and I pay tribute to the Committee for that important initiative.

At this stage, I will put on record my initial reactions to the UK-wide view and identify some of the key issues and challenges for Wales, on which we need to reflect further. Dealing with human-induced global warming will be one of the world's biggest challenges this century. Reducing the emission of greenhouse gases has a strong economic, humanitarian and moral imperative and must be the main focus of our energy policy. Action must be world-wide, but each country must play its part. Wales's geography, climate and manufacturing base, combined with the Assembly's sustainable development duty, provides us with the opportunity to play a full part. Our economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales', shows the way forward against the background of our plan for Wales and its showcase global clean energy ambitions.

Looking at the way forward, I will first consider the opportunities presented by energy efficiency. If we are to achieve significant targets such as those suggested by 'Energy 2050', that is, a 20 per cent improvement in energy efficiency by 2010, and a further 20 per cent improvement by 2020, we need a step change in the initiatives aimed at increasing awareness of the importance of energy efficiency in all sectors of our society. There are also long-term opportunities for the large-scale commercial development of a wide range of domestic level technologies, such as micro-generation, combined heat and power, and photovoltaic

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Mae dadl gyhoeddus fawr yn digwydd ar ynni, yn dilyn cyhoeddi adroddiad Swyddfa'r Cabinet 'Ynni 2050'. Mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn yr adolygiad hwnnw ac anogaf bawb yng Nghymru i fanteisio ar y cyfle i roi sylw i'r materion mawr a godir ganddo. Mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd eisoes wedi cychwyn ar y broses hon wrth lansio'i adroddiad ymgynghorol ar ynni adnewyddadwy'r wythnos diwethaf, a thalaf deyrnsged i'r Pwyllgor am y cam pwysig hwnnw.

Ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf am gofnodi fy adweithiau cyntaf i'r farn ledled y DU a nodi rhai o'r materion a'r heriau allweddol i Gymru, y mae angen inni eu hystyried ymhellach. Bydd delio â chynhesu byd-eang o waith dyn yn her gyda'r mwyaf i'r byd y ganrif hon. Mae rheidrwydd economaidd, dyngarol a moesol cryf dros leihau gollyngiad nwyon tŷ gwydr, a rhaid i hyn fod yn brif nod ein polisi ynni. Rhaid gweithredu ledled y byd, ond rhaid i bob gwlad chwarae ei rhan. Mae daearyddiaeth, hinsawdd a sylfaen weithgynhyrchu Cymru, ochr yn ochr â dyletswydd y Cynulliad o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, yn rhoi'r cyfle inni chwarae rhan lawn. Mae'n strategaeth ddatblygu economaidd, 'Cymru'n Ennill', yn dangos y ffordd ymlaen, ar gefndir ein cynllun i Gymru sydd â'r uchelgais o ddangos esiampl i'r byd o ran ynni glân.

Wrth edrych ar y ffordd ymlaen, ystyriaf yn gyntaf y cyfleoedd a gyflwynir gan effeithlonrwydd ynni. Os ydym am gyflawni targedau arwyddocaol fel y rheini a awgrymir gan 'Ynni 2050', hynny yw, gwelliant 20 y cant mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni erbyn 2010, a gwelliant 20 y cant pellach erbyn 2020, mae angen newid cam yn y mentrau sy'n anelu at gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd effeithlonrwydd ynni ym mhob sector o'n cymdeithas. Mae cyfleoedd tymor hir hefyd i ddatblygu'n fasnachol, ar raddfa fawr, amrediad eang o dechnolegau ar lefel ddomestig, fel micro-gynhyrchu, cyfuno gwres a phŵer, a systemau ynni haul

solar energy systems, which will enable us to replace our central heating boilers and produce electricity in our own homes.

There are, however, complicated institutional, commercial, cultural and technological issues involved. As a first step, we need to consider urgently the value of establishing, perhaps with structural funds support, a 'low carbon technology' internet portal, which will help act as a focal point for debate in Wales. In addition, we will continue to work closely with local authorities and other partners in our efforts to improve the energy efficiency of our housing stock. That can be done through programmes such as the home energy efficiency scheme and the achievement of the housing quality standard for social housing by 2012.

Secondly, we need to develop a clear framework for taking sensible decisions on further investment in renewable energy, recognising that balances need to be struck and that difficult decisions must be taken once we are confident that the framework is a robust one. Given global warming, we cannot avoid our sustainable development duties. I am conscious that, of all the forms of renewable energy, wind power is commercially viable but can have a visual impact on our high quality landscape. Currently we have around 350 wind turbines and 12 major windfarms. We are therefore already punching well above our weight, with about 40 per cent of UK installed capacity located in Wales.

As I said when we debated wind energy in the short debate in February, we must proceed sensitively with on-shore developments in the least problematic locations, preferably with strong community support. I would also like the possibility of repowering our existing windfarms with the latest, largest turbines to be extensively explored; we shall shortly be commissioning work to consider this further. On off-shore wind installations, we welcome the progress that is being made on proposals in Wales. We must work with the Department of Trade and Industry to provide a favourable development framework.

ffotofoltäig, a fydd yn ein galluogi i ddisodli'n bwysleri gwres canolog a chynhyrchu trydan yn ein cartrefi ein hunain.

Y mae, serch hynny, faterion sefydliadol, masnachol, diwylliannol a thechnolegol cymhleth ynglwm wrth hyn. Fel cam cyntaf, mae angen inni ystyried ar fylder beth fyddai gwerth sefydu, efallai gyda chymorth arian strwythurol, borth rhyngrywd 'technoleg carbon isel', a fydd yn helpu i weithredu fel canolbwyt i ddadl yng Nghymru. At hynny, byddwn yn parhau i weithio'n agos gydag awdurdodau lleol a phartneriaid eraill yn ein hymdrehchion i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni ein stoc dai. Gellir gwneud hynny drwy raglenni fel y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref a sicrhau'r safon ansawdd tai ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol erbyn 2012.

Yn ail, mae angen inni ddatblygu fframwaith clir ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau call ar fuddsoddi pellach mewn ynni adnewyddadwy, gan gydnabod fod angen taro cydbwysedd ac y bydd rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd unwaith y byddwn yn hyderus fod y fframwaith yn un cadarn. Yn wyneb cynhesu byd-eang, ni allwn osgoi'n dyletswyddau o ran datblygu cynaliadwy. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol mai ynni gwynt, o'r holl ffurfiau ar ynni adnewyddadwy, sy'n fasnachol ymarferol, ond y gall gael effaith weledol ar ein tirwedd sydd o ansawdd uchel. Ar hyn o bryd mae gennym ryw 350 o felinâu gwynt a 12 fferm wynt fawr. Yr ydym felly yn gwneud mwy na thynnau'n pwysau, gyda rhyw 40 y cant o allu cynhyrchu sefydlog y DU wedi'i leoli yng Nghymru.

Fel y dywedais pan drafodasom ynni gwynt yn y ddadl fer yn Chweffor, rhaid inni symud ymlaen yn sensitif gyda datblygiadau tir yn y mannau lleiaf problemus, gorau oll gyda chefnogaeth gref y gymuned. Hoffwn hefyd weld ymchwil helaeth i bosiblirwydd adnewyddu'n ffermydd gwynt presennol gyda'r melinau mwyaf, diweddaraf; byddwn yn comisiynu gwaith i ystyried hyn ymhellach cyn hir. Ynghylch offer gwynt ar y môr, croesawn y gwaith sy'n digwydd ar gynigion yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni weithio gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i ddarparu fframwaith datblygu ffafriol.

Biomass is, potentially, of particular interest to Wales. However, the way forward is not clear agriculturally, technologically or commercially. That is why my colleague Carwyn Jones, the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business, has set up the woodland development and biomass strategy group. The group is due to report in early summer and we look forward to it identifying beneficial and feasible ways of developing this sector for the benefit of Welsh rural economies.

Our extensive coastline and estuaries have a wealth of potential for tidal stream, tidal barrage and possibly wave power technologies to be developed, though at a price. If the global need to bring these schemes on-stream develops, then Wales can provide the locations for them. That includes, in theory, the River Severn, which has the potential to produce up to 8,000 MW of electricity, were a major barrage thought desirable. However, we recognise that a great deal of in-depth reflection and consideration of environmental and other major ramifications are associated with such a significant project. As you are aware, we have held discussions with the Department of Trade and Industry on the possibility of transferring the legal power to consent large power stations of above 50 MW to the Assembly. These discussions are continuing, but it is too early to give any indication of progress.

3:20 p.m.

Thirdly, we need to give serious weight to the views of our communities and to community solutions for generating clean energy on a human scale. Our new planning policies and associated guidance reflect the importance of minimising global warming and other environmental consequences. However, it must also enable the generation of clean energy in a way that is acceptable to the communities where the plants are located.

Sue Essex is conscious of the importance of this issue. She attaches particular importance to developing an integrated policy approach and gaining the benefits from better relationships between developers, local authorities, community groups and our

Mae biomas, efallai, o ddiddordeb arbennig i Gymru. Er hynny, nid yw'r ffordd ymlaen yn glir yn amaethyddol, yn dechnolegol nac yn fasnachol. Dyna pam y mae fy nghyd-Weinidog Carwyn Jones, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad, wedi sefydlu'r grŵp datblygu coetiroedd a strategaeth bio-mas. Disgwylir adroddiad gan y grŵp yn gynnar yn yr haf ac edrychwn ymlaen iddo nodi ffyrdd buddiol ac ymarferol o ddatblygu'r sector hwn er budd economiau gwledig Cymru.

Mae gan ein harfordir a'n haberoedd helaeth gyfoeth o botensial ar gyfer datblygu technolegau ffrwd llanw, bared llanw ac o bosibl bŵer tonnau, er na wneir hynny heb gost. Os datblyga'r angen byd-eang i gyflwyno'r cynlluniau hyn, yna gall Cymru ddarparu'r lleoliadau ar eu cyfer. Mae hynny'n cynnwys, yn ddamcaniaethol, Afon Hafren, sydd â'r potensial i gynhyrchu hyd at 8,000 MW o drydan, pe bernid bod argae mawr yn ddymunol. Fodd bynnag, sylwedolwn fod angen llawer iawn o feddwl ac ystyriaeth ddwys ynghylch y goblygiadau amgylcheddol, ac eraill, mawr sydd i brosiect mor arwyddocaol. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ynghylch posibilrwydd trosglwyddo'r gym cyfreithiol i'r Cynulliad i ganiatáu gorsafoedd pŵer mawr o fwy na 50 MW. Mae'r trafodaethau hyn yn parhau, ond mae'n rhy gynnar i roi unrhyw arwydd o ba gamau ymlaen a gymerwyd.

Yn drydydd, mae angen inni roi sylw difrifol i farn ein cymunedau ac i atebion cymunedol i gynhyrchu ynni glân ar raddfa ddynol. Mae'n polisiau cynllunio newydd a'r canllawiau cysylltiedig yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd lleihau cynhesu byd-eang a chanlyniadau amgylcheddol eraill. Er hynny, rhaid iddo hefyd alluogi cynhyrchu ynni glân mewn ffordd sy'n dderbynol gan y cymunedau lle lleolir y gweithfeydd.

Mae Sue Essex yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd y mater hwn. Mae hi'n gosod pwysigrwydd arbennig ar ddatblygu agwedd polisi integredig ac elwa ar well perthynas rhwng datblygwyr, awdurdodau lleol, grwpiau cymunedol a'n hasiantaethau

economic development and environmental agencies. The redrafting group for the technical guidance note on renewable energies—TAN8—is already demonstrating the greater willingness of these parties to engage in a stronger policy dialogue.

More needs to be done under our structural funds programmes to ensure that strong clean energy projects get the support that they deserve. I also look forward to the new experimental European innovative actions structural fund programme in Wales, providing considerable insight into new ways forward.

Finally, while the energy policy will include a focus on efficiency improvements, in stimulating more combined heat and power systems and developing the renewables option, we must not forget that now and for some considerable time, our main electricity needs will be supplied from gas, coal and nuclear power stations. At present renewable sources only supply around 2.5 per cent of the electricity used in Wales. Even if, for example, we had a further 1000 MW of intermittent renewables capacity in Wales, that is only equivalent to replacing a 300 or 400 MW conventional power station that operates continuously.

We have an installed capacity of around 1500 MW of coal, 1000 MW of nuclear, 2500 MW of gas plants as well as major pumped storage stations capable of 2000 MW of rapid power production at Dinorwig and Ffestiniog. All these operations play an important part in our economy, as do the two oil refineries in Milford Haven in respect of conventional transport fuels. Therefore, we must ensure that our short and medium-term policies reflect the importance of this level of conventional baseload provision.

We consume around 50 terawatt hours per year of gas. We have initiatives, such as Baglan Energy Park, which is beginning to demonstrate the positive interaction between the world's highest efficiency gas power station and a dynamic industrial and business park. A gas transmission infrastructure covering the whole of Wales is increasing in

amgylcheddol a datblygu economaidd. Mae grŵp ailddrafftio'r nodyn canllaw technegol ar ynni adnewyddadwy—TAN8—eisoes yn dangos parodrwydd cynyddol y partïon hyn i gyfranogi mewn deialog cryfach ar bolisi.

Mae angen gwneud mwy dan ein rhaglenni arian strwythurol i sicrhau bod prosiectau ynni glân cryf yn cael y gefnogaeth a haeddant. Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at raglen Ewropeaidd newydd arbrofol y gronfa strwythurol yng Nghymru ar gyfer gweithredoedd arloesol, gan obeithio y gwnaiff fwrw goleuni sylweddol ar ffyrdd newydd ymlaen.

Yn olaf, tra bydd y polisi ynni'n cynnwys ffocws ar welliannau effeithlonrwydd, o ran hybu mwy o systemau gwres a phŵer cyfunol a datblygu'r opsiwn adnewyddadwy, rhaid inni gofio y cyflenwir ein prif anghenion trydan yn awr ac am gryn amser eto gan orsafoedd pŵer nwy, glo a niwclear. Ar hyn o bryd dim ond rhyw 2.5 y cant o'r trydan a ddefnyddir yng Nghymru a gyflenwir gan ffynonellau adnewyddadwy. Hyd yn oed pe bai gennym, er enghraift, 1000 MW eto o gapasiti ynni adnewyddadwy ysbeidiol yng Nghymru, nid yw hynny ond yn gyfwerth â disodli gorsaf bŵer gonfensiynol 300 neu 400 MW sy'n gweithredu'n ddi-dor.

Mae gennym allu cynhyrchu sefydlog o ryw 1500 MW o bwerdai glo, 1000 MW o rai niwclear, 2500 MW o rai nwy yn ogystal â gorsafoedd storfa bwmp mawr a all gynhyrchu 2000 MW o bŵer cyflym yn Ninorwig a Ffestiniog. Mae'r holl weithfeydd hyn yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn ein heonomi, fel y gwna'r ddwy burfa olew yn Aberdaugleddau o ran tanwyddau trafnidiaeth confensiynol. Felly, rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein polisiau tymor byr a chanolig yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd y lefel hon o ddarpariaeth llwyth gwaelodol gonfensiynol.

Defnyddiwn oddeutu 50 awr terawat y flwyddyn o nwy. Mae gennym fentrau, fel Parc Ynni Baglan, sy'n dechrau dangos rhyngweithiad positif rhwng gorsaf bŵer nwy fwyaf effeithlon y byd a pharc busnes a diwydiant deinamig. Mae cael isadeiledd trawsyrru nwy dros Gymru gyfan yn mynd yn fwyfwy pwysig. Mae arnaf fi eisiau i fwy

importance. I want more attention to be paid to the possibilities of using Objective 1 funding to extend the current network. At the UK level, there is a growing need for alternative means of importing gas other than by pipeline. In particular, liquefied natural gas terminals seem to have good prospects. In Milford Haven, we have one of the UK's best sites for such a project.

Security of supply is essential, and in the medium term, we could be at risk from an over-dependence on gas. Coal is still an important part of the south Wales economy. However, if it is to play a significant part in our energy future, we must move to cleaner ways of using this resource. There would be global advantages to establishing clean coal technologies in Wales.

In the short term, coal-burning power stations, such as Aberthaw, should consider investing in emissions-reducing technologies, such as flue gas desulphurisation, and super-critical steam turbine equipment. These technologies would also provide improved prospects for our coal extraction industry, including Tower Colliery, which is one of our entrepreneurial flagships.

In the longer term, our history reminds us that we sit on enormous reserves of coal, and trapped within that resource, copious quantities of methane. Much more should be done to exploit disused coalmine methane, and I expect that in the longer term, underground coal seam gasification could be a possibility. All coal projects, whether operating current stations, building new gasification stations or exploiting in-situ reserves, need to be taken forward in a way that takes account of the long-term possibility of underground carbon dioxide sequestration. However, much more research must be undertaken to properly assess the long-term consequences of sequestration.

On nuclear energy, 'Energy 2050' suggests that the option for expanding electricity production from these sources should be kept open in case the renewables do not live up to their potential. However, the report does not recommend any major new initiatives at this time other than to start an informed public

o sylw gael ei roi i bosibiliadau defnyddio arian Amcan 1 i ymestyn y rhwydwaith presennol. Ar lefel y DU, mae angen cynyddol am ddulliau eraill o gludo nwy yn hytrach na thrwy bibell. Yn arbennig, mae'n ymddangos fod rhagolygon da i derfynfeydd nwy naturiol hylifedig. Yn Aberdaugleddau, mae gennym un o'r safleoedd gorau yn y DU ar gyfer prosiect o'r fath.

Mae diogelwch cyflenwad yn hanfodol, ac yn y tymor canolig, gallem fod mewn perygl o orddibynnau ar nwy. Mae glo'n dal i fod yn rhan bwysig o economi'r De. Fodd bynnag, os ydyw i chwarae rhan arwyddocaol yn ein dyfodol o ran ynni, rhaid inni symud at ffyrdd glanach o ddefnyddio'r adnoddau hyn. Byddai manteision byd-eang o sefydlu technolegau glo glân yng Nghymru.

Yn y tymor byr, dylai gorsafoedd pŵer sy'n llosgi glo, fel Aberdawan, ystyried buddsoddi mewn technolegau i leihau allyriadau, fel datswlffureiddio nwy simnai, ac offer tyrbin ager uwch-gritigol. Byddai'r technolegau hyn hefyd yn cynnig gwell rhagolygon i'n diwydiant cloddio glo ni, gan gynnwys Glofa'r Tŵr, sy'n un o'n harweinwyr entrepreneuriaidd.

Yn y tymor hwy, mae'n hanes yn ein hatgoffa ein bod yn eistedd ar gronfeydd enfawr o lo, ac wedi'i gloi o fewn yr adnodd hwennw, lawer iawn o'r nwy methan. Dylid gwneud llawer mwy i elwa ar fethan diddefnydd mewn pyllau glo, a disgwyliaf yn y tymor hwy y gallai nwyeiddio gwythiennau glo tanddaearol fod yn bosiblwydd. Mae angen symud ymlaen â phob prosiect yn ymwneud â glo, boed yn weithredu gorsafoedd presennol, adeiladu gorsafoedd nwyeiddio newydd neu ecsbloetio cronfeydd yn y fan a'r lle, mewn modd sy'n ystyried posibilrwydd hirdymor ynysu carbon deuocsid tanddaearol. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn asesu canlyniadau hirdymor ynysu yn iawn, rhaid gwneud llawer mwy o ymchwil.

Ar ynni niwclear, awgryma 'Ynni 2050' y dylid cadw'r dewis i gynhyrchu mwy o drydan o'r ffynonellau hyn ar agor rhag ofn na fydd y ffynonellau adnewyddadwy'n cyflawni'u potensial. Er hynny, nid yw'r adroddiad yn argymhell unrhyw gynlluniau mawr newydd ar hyn o bryd ac eithrio

debate on these important issues, which includes the important and crucial, but difficult, issue of handling radioactive waste materials and maintaining our skills base. The Assembly must participate fully in this debate, which the Economic Development Committee has already initiated, starting with the consultation paper on radioactive waste management.

On transport, I echo the report's call for stepped changes on vehicle efficiency with targets for 20 per cent improvement by 2010 and a further 20 per cent the following decade. The transport sector is likely to remain oil-based until at least 2020, though prospective advances in vehicle technology offer the possibility of significant reductions in fuel use. The potential long-term requirement for significant reductions in carbon dioxide emissions by the transport sector, combined with the possibility that oil will become scarcer, raises the need to develop alternative fuels. The UK Government's consultation paper, 'Powering Future Vehicles', sets out the issues well. We are contributing directly to this debate to ensure that Welsh interests are reflected. Our transport and economic development policies will need to take account of the importance of transport fuel switching. In the medium to long term, there will be good prospects for hybrid and fuel cell vehicles, although the costs are currently high. In Wales, we want to play our part by supporting local demonstration and development projects as we are already doing with initiatives such as PowerShift in Gwynedd with liquefied petroleum gas stations.

In conclusion, the importance of energy to our way of life cannot be overstated. My Cabinet colleagues and I are determined that the Assembly Government and its agencies will play their full part in rising to the challenge of a clean energy future by finding innovative means to promote energy efficiency or working in partnership with all parties; maximising acceptable on and off-shore windfarm developments; fully exploiting biomass opportunities for the benefit of our rural economies; ensuring that

cychwyn dadl gyhoeddus wybodus ar y materion pwysig hyn, sy'n cynnwys y cwestiwn pwysig ac allweddol, ond anodd, o drafod defnyddiau gwastraff ymbelydrol a chynnal ein sylfaen sgiliau. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad gymryd rhan lawn yn y ddadl hon, y mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd eisoes wedi ei chychwyn, gan ddechrau gyda'r papur ymgynghori ar reoli gwastraff ymbelydrol.

Ar drafnidiaeth, adleisiaf alwad yr adroddiad am newidiadau fesul cam i effeithlonrwydd cerbydau gyda thargedau ar gyfer gwelliant o 20 y cant erbyn 2010 ac 20 y cant pellach yn y degawd dilynol. Mae'n debygol y bydd y sector trafnidiaeth yn dal i fod yn seiliedig ar olew tan o leiaf 2020, er bod datblygiadau arfaethedig yn nhechnoleg cerbydau'n cynnig y posiblirwydd o gwtogi'n sylweddol ar ddefnydd tanwydd. Mae'r gofyniad hirdymor posibl am gwtogi'n sylweddol ar allyriadau carbon deuocsid gan y sector trafnidiaeth, ynghyd â'r posiblirwydd y bydd olew'n prinbau, yn codi'r angen i ddatblygu tanwyddau amgen. Mae papur ymgynghori Llywodraeth y DU, 'Powering Future Vehicles', yn amlinellu'r sefyllfa'n dda. Yr ydym yn cyfrannu'n uniongyrchol at y ddadl honno er mwyn sicrhau yr adlewyrchir buddiannau Cymru. Bydd angen i'n polisiau trafnidiaeth a datblygu economaidd ystyried pwysigrwydd newid tanwydd trafnidiaeth. Yn y tymor canolig i hir, bydd rhagolygon da ar gyfer cerbydau croesryw a chelloedd tanwydd, er bod y costau'n uchel ar hyn o bryd. Yng Nghymru, mae arnom eisaiu chwarae'n rhan drwy gefnogi prosiectau arddangos a datblygu lleol fel y gwnawn eisoes gyda mentrau fel PowerShift yng Ngwynedd gyda gorsafoedd nwy petroliwm hylifedig.

I gloi, ni ellir gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd ynni i'n ffordd o fyw. Mae fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet a mi'n benderfynol y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i asiantaethau'n chwarae eu rhan lawn wrth ymateb i'r her o sicrhau dyfodol ynni glân drwy ddarganfod ffyrdd dyfeisgar o hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni neu weithio mewn partneriaeth â phawb sydd yn gysylltiedig â hyn; gwneud y mwyaf o ddatblygiadau ffermydd gwynt derbynol ar dir a môr; manteisio i'r eithaf ar gyfleoedd bio-mâs er budd ein heconomiau gwledig;

we become a world leader in marine and fuel cell energy technologies with long-term potential; and seizing mainstream gas and coal opportunities. I urge us all to engage constructively in the massive consultation that will be underway shortly, and ensure that Wales's voice is heard. I am certain that the Economic Development Committee's review of energy policy will help my Cabinet colleagues and me to contribute effectively to this debate.

**Phil Williams:** I agree with your emphasis on the importance of energy, but your statement raises several questions. First, to improve energy efficiency, what plans does the Government have to provide a greatly increased budget for research and development, sufficient extra funding for local authorities and housing associations to boost the energy efficiency scheme, and to establish Building Research Establishment environmental assessment method excellence standards for all new public buildings, including schools and hospitals?

Secondly, in planning for renewable energy, the UK target is 10 per cent of electricity to come from renewable resources by 2010. Do you accept that, to meet this UK target, Wales must produce more than 10 per cent of our electricity consumption through renewable energy—perhaps 10 per cent of our total production—to compensate for areas such as London and Birmingham? Is the Government of Wales negotiating with the UK to ensure that, were we to produce a larger percentage of renewable energy to meet the UK target, we would receive a corresponding economic benefit, especially in rural areas such as Pembrokeshire, where today's news on job losses is so dreadful? Will you also ensure that, were we to take a bigger share, we would acquire total planning control over large power stations, including nuclear power stations?

Thirdly, do you accept that, at present, the main obstacle to renewable energy, especially wind and biomass, is the number of projects called in by the Government that still await a decision? Yet another delay in publishing the revised technical advice note 8 is causing much frustration for our vibrant renewable

sicrhau y deuwn yn arweinydd drwy'r byd mewn technolegau ynni cell tanwydd a môr sydd â photensial hirdymor; a chydio mewn cyfleoedd glo a nwy prif ffrwd. Anogaf bawb ohonom i gyfranogi'n adeiladol yn yr ymgynghori mawr a fydd yn digwydd yn fuan, a sicrhau y clywir llais Cymru. Yr wyf yn sier y bydd adolygiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd o'n polisi ynni yn helpu fy nghyd-Aelodau Cabinet a mi i gyfrannu'n effeithiol at y ddadl hon.

**Phil Williams:** Cytunaf â'ch pwyslais ar bwysigrwydd ynni, ond mae'ch datganiad yn codi sawl cwestiwn. Yn gyntaf, er mwyn gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni, pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Llywodraeth i ddarparu cyllideb lawer mwy ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu, digon o gyllid ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol a chymdeithasau tai i hybu'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni, ac i sefydlu safonau rhagoriaeth dull asesu amgylcheddol. Y Sefydliad Ymchwil Adeiladu ar gyfer pob adeilad cyhoeddus newydd, gan gynnwys ysgolion ac ysbytai?

Yn ail, wrth gynllunio ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, targed y DU yw y dylai 10 y cant o drydan ddod o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. A ydych yn derbyn bod yn rhaid i Gymru, er mwyn cyrraedd y targed hwn yn y DU, gynhyrchu mwy na 10 y cant o'n defnydd trydan ni drwy ynni adnewyddadwy—efallai 10 y cant o'n cyfanswm cynhyrchu—i wneud iawn am ardaloedd fel Llundain a Birmingham? A ydyw Llywodraeth Cymru'n negodi gyda'r DU i sicrhau, pe baem ni'n cynhyrchu canran uwch o ynni adnewyddadwy i gwrdd â tharged y DU, y derbyniem fudd economaidd cyfatebol, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel Sir Benfro, lle mae newyddion heddiw am golli swyddi mor ofnadwy? A wnewch chi sicrhau hefyd, pe baem yn cymryd cyfran fwy, y byddem yn cael rheolaeth gynllunio lwyd dros orsafoedd pŵer mawr, gan gynnwys atomfeydd?

Yn drydydd, a ydych yn derbyn mai'r prif rwystr ar hyn o bryd i ynni adnewyddadwy, yn enwedig ynni gwynt a bio-mâs, yw nifer y prosiectau a alwyd i mewn gan y Llywodraeth ac sy'n dal i aros am benderfyniad? Mae'r oedi arall eto fyth cyn cyhoeddi'r nodyn cyngor technegol 8

energy industry, as reflected in the discussions of the National Assembly sustainable energy group, which is one of the most successful of the Assembly's all-party groups.

3:30 p.m.

Finally, you refer to Objective 1 funding. Will you explain why, for almost two years, the Government of Wales rejected Plaid Cymru's proposal for an energy partnership to implement a regional plan so that, in Objective 1's third year, the large sums of money available for clean energy and energy infrastructure are mostly uncommitted? These delays in renewable energy policy implementation belie the welcome emphasis in your statement. Will you promise that, in my last year as an AM, I will see real progress in the cause that first brought me here?

**Andrew Davies:** We probably share the same commitments to a much stronger emphasis on the use of renewable energy sources. It is not only environmentally beneficial, but also makes economic sense, particularly where we have the expertise to develop those technologies.

On Objective 1, that is a new issue for me as a Minister and I will need to consider it in more detail and examine the background to this matter.

On your third point you mentioned that many proposals have been called in. I said in my statement that considerations for alternative sources of energy production must be constantly balanced with community use. We have seen that most contentiously in the case of windfarms. As I said in my statement, we must always keep a balanced view, particularly with regard to our commitment to sustainable development and energy. Today, I am laying down some broad principles. However, we must consider the Economic Development Committee's consultation, which will inform our own policy as well helping to inform our response to the Performance and Innovation Unit's report. Therefore, at present, the statement draws no

diwygiedig yn achosi rhwystredigaeth fawr i'n diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy bywiog, fel a adlewyrchir yn nhrafodaethau grŵp ynni adnewyddadwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, sydd yn un o grwpiau holl-bleidiol mwyaf llwyddiannus y Cynulliad.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriwch at arian Amcan 1. A esboniwrch pam, am ymron i ddwy flynedd, y gwrthododd Llywodraeth Cymru gynnig Plaid Cymru am bartneriaeth ynni i weithredu cynllun rhanbarthol sy'n golygu nad yw'r symiau mawr o arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer ynni glân ac isadeiledd ynni wedi eu hymrwymo ar y cyfan yn nhrydedd flwyddyn Amcan 1? Mae'r oedi hwn gyda gweithredu polisi ynni adnewyddadwy yn gwrth-ddweud y pwyslais a groesewir yn eich datganiad. A wnewch chi addo, yn fy mlwyddyn olaf fel AC, y caf weld gwir gynnydd yn yr achos a ddaeth â mi yma yn y lle cyntaf?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'n debyg y rhannwn yr un ymroddiad i bwyslais llawer cryfach ar ddefnyddio ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy. Nid yn unig y mae'n fanteisiol i'r amgylchedd, ond mae hefyd yn gwneud synnwyr economaidd, yn enwedig lle mae gennym yr arbenigedd i ddatblygu'r technolegau hynny.

Ar Amcan 1, mae hynny'n fater newydd i mi fel Gweinidog a bydd angen imi ei ystyried yn fanylach ac archwilio'r cefndir i'r mater hwn.

Ar eich trydydd pwynt, soniasoch fod llawer o gynigion wedi'u galw i mewn. Dywedais yn fy natganiad fod yn rhaid i ystyriaethau am ffynonellau cynhyrchu ynni amgen gael eu cydbwys o'n gyson â defnydd y gymuned. Yr ydym wedi gweld hynny'n fwyaf dadleol yn achos ffermydd gwynt. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, rhaid inni bob amser gadw agwedd gytbwys, yn enwedig ynghylch ein hymrwymiad i ynni a datblygu cynaliadwy. Heddiw, yr wyf yn amlinellu rhai egwyddorion cyffredinol. Serch hynny, rhaid inni ystyried ymgynghoriad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a fydd yn hysbysu'n polisi ni yn ogystal â helpu i hysbysu'n hymateb i adroddiad yr Uned Perfformiad ac Arloesedd. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r

firm conclusions; it just lays down broad principles. However, we must balance many considerations.

On hitting the target of 10 per cent by 2010, that will mean greater use of renewable energy in Wales. In terms of the relationship with the UK Government, we must work with it in the meantime, particularly on that broad policy agenda. On the more specific questions about increasing research and development into energy efficiency, that is something that I will look at with the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities. We want to increase the number of buildings in Wales that comply with BREEAM standards. The innovative building at Baglan Energy Park is a great example of how to incorporate high quality building standards into buildings that have low energy consumption and high-energy conservation. However, many of your points, Phil, will come out of the Economic Development Committee's consultation, which will inform our policy. It is a consultation and we are just establishing broad principles.

**Christine Chapman:** Thank you for your statement. Do you agree that, to maximise our energy efficiency potential, we must capture the hearts and minds of energy consumers in Wales, particularly business? Will you join with me in congratulating Arena Network in Treforest, which I visited this morning in my capacity as chair of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee? Arena Network has secured £1.5 million of Objective 1 funding for its environmental, innovation and competitiveness project, which will be used to support 300 businesses to work towards incrementally improving their environmental performance. It was good to hear how much progress is being made in getting businesses on board. This is mainly due to the Assembly's collaborative work. We have collaborated with the WDA, Groundwork Trust, and a range of other organisations.

**Andrew Davies:** I join you in congratulating Arena Network on its achievements. When businesses consider energy conservation,

datganiad yn tynnu unrhyw gasgliadau pendant; dim ond amlinellu egwyddorion cyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni gydbwys o ystyriaethau.

O daro'r targed 10 y cant erbyn 2010, bydd hynny'n golygu mwy o ddefnydd o ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. O ran y berthynas â Llywodraeth y DU, rhaid inni weithio gyda hi yn y cyfamser, yn enwedig ar agenda'r polisi cyffredinol hwnnw. Ar y cwestiynau mwy penodol ynghylch cynyddu ymchwil a datblygu ym maes effeithlonrwydd ynni, mae hynny'n rhywbeth y byddaf yn ystyried gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau. Mae arnom eisiau cynyddu nifer yr adeiladau yng Nghymru sy'n cydymffurfio â safonau BREEAM. Mae'r adeilad arloesol ym Mharc Ynni Baglan yn engraifft wych o sut i ymgorffori safonau adeiladu o ansawdd da mewn adeiladau sy'n defnyddio ychydig o ynni ac sy'n arbed llawer o ynni. Fodd bynnag, bydd llawer o'ch pwyntiau, Phil, yn codi allan o ymgynghoriad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a fydd yn hysbysu'n polisi ni. Ymgynghoriad ydyw a dim ond sefydlu egwyddorion cyffredinol yr ydym.

**Christine Chapman:** Diolch am eich datganiad. A ydych yn cytuno bod yn rhaid inni, er mwyn gwneud y gorau o'n potensial ar gyfer effeithlonrwydd ynni, ennill calonau a meddyliau defnyddwyr ynni yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ym myd busnes? A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Arena Network yn Nhrefforest, yr ymwelais â hwy y bore yma yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel cadeirydd Pwyllgor Monitro'r Rhaglenni Amcan 1? Mae Arena Network wedi sychau £1.5 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 ar gyfer eu prosiect ar yr amgylchedd, arloesedd a chystadleurwydd, a ddefnyddir i gefnogi 300 o fusnesau i weithio tuag at wella'u perfformiad amgylcheddol yn raddol. Yr oedd yn dda clywed bod cymaint yn cael ei gyflawni i gael busnesau i ymuno yn hyn. Mae hyn yn bennaf oherwydd cydweithio ar ran y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi cydweithio gydag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Groundwork Trust, ac amrediad o gyrrff eraill.

**Andrew Davies:** Ymunaf â chi i longyfarch Arena Network ar yr hyn y maent wedi'i gyflawni. Pan fydd busnesau'n ystyried arbed

they always look is reduce their costs. Energy for many companies is a major element of their cost profile. Therefore, it is in their own interests to reduce their use of energy. As you have pointed out, it is a wide issue, but one where we need to engage with the private sector, the Confederation of British Industry, employers' organisations, and the construction industry—particularly when constructing new buildings. We also need to look at our own public bodies—the WDA and the other quangos and ASPBs—and how we can work together to reduce energy consumption and improve energy efficiency. The more we can do to highlight the achievements of organisations such as Arena Network, the better. We need to highlight those as well as good practice, and try to generalise that wherever we can.

**Alun Cairns:** I am perplexed by the purpose of today's statement on energy policy. The Economic Development Committee, as the Minister rightly highlights in his statement, is conducting an energy policy review. We are about to embark on the second stage of that energy review. I would have thought that the most constructive way that the Minister could have played a part, rather than coming in the full glare of the television cameras to make a statement, would have been in that Committee, by contributing positively and constructively and seeking to influence the Committee's policy-making role. Would it not have been more sensible for the Minister to make a statement after the Committee had completed its consultation and made its general recommendations? That would have recognised the Committee's policy-making role, rather than sidelining the Economic Development Committee's work, as this does. Will the Minister respond to that point?

This statement is premature. There is no action plan in it. It mentions a range of issues. It lists them threefold, then mentions discussions and so on with other Ministers and Cabinet colleagues. That is welcome and needs to happen. However, there is little in here to do with an action plan, and, particularly bearing in mind that the portfolio is economic development, the focus and support that there should be with business

ynni, byddant bob amser yn ceisio lleihau eu costau. Mae ynni, i lawer o gwmniau, yn un o brif elfennau eu proffil costau. Felly, mae er eu budd eu hunain i leihau eu defnydd o ynni. Fel yr ydych wedi nodi, mae'n fater eang, ond yn un lle mae angen inni gydweithio â'r sector preifat, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, sefydliadau cyflogwyr, a'r diwydiant adeiladu—yn enwedig pan godir adeiladau newydd. Mae angen edrych ar ein cyrff cyhoeddus ni'n hunain hefyd—yr Awdurdod Datblygu a'r cwangos a chyrff cyhoeddus eraill a noddir gan y Cynulliad—a gweld sut y gallwn weithio gyda'n gilydd i leihau'r defnydd o ynni a gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni. Po fwyaf y gallwn ei wneud i danlinellu'r hyn a gyflawnwyd gan gyrff fel Arena Network, gorau oll. Mae angen pwysleisio'r rheini yn ogystal ag arferion da, a cheisio cyffredinoli hynny lle bynnag y gallwn.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf mewn penbleth ynghylch pwrrpas datganiad heddiw ar bolisi ynni. Mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, fel y pwysleisia'r Gweinidog yn gywir yn ei ddatganiad, yn cynnal adolygiad o'r polisi ynni. Yr ydym ar fin cychwyn ar ail gam yr adolygiad ynni hwnnw. Buaswn wedi meddwl mai'r ffordd fwyaf adeiladol y gallasai'r Gweinidog fod wedi chwarae rhan, yn hytrach na dod wyneb yn wyneb â'r camerâu teledu i wneud datganiad, fuasai yn y Pwyllgor hwnnw, drwy gyfrannu'n bositif ac adeiladol a cheisio dylanwadu ar rôl y Pwyllgor o lunio polisi. Oni fuasai'n gallach i'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad wedi i'r Pwyllgor gwblhau ei ymgynghoriad a gwneud ei argymhellion cyffredinol? Buasai hynny wedi cydnabod rôl y Pwyllgor o lunio polisi, yn hytrach na gwthio gwaith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i'r cyrion, fel y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ymateb i'r pwynt hwnnw?

Mae'r datganiad hwn yn gynamserol. Nid yw'n cynnwys unrhyw gynllun gweithredu. Mae'n crybwyl amrediad o faterion. Mae'n eu rhestru dair gwaith, wedyn yn sôn am drafodaethau gyda Gweinidogion eraill a chyd-Aelodau'r Cabinet. Croesewir hynny; mae angen iddo ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, nid oes fawr ddim yma yn ymwneud â chynllun gweithredu, nac, yn enwedig o gofio mai datblygu economaidd yw'r portffolio, â'r

efficiency, as well as domestic efficiency, which Phil Williams has already highlighted. There is little direction in that.

On the positive side, I welcome Christine Chapman's comments on Arena Network. That is great—positive news is being presented. However, we discussed this sort of issue in the Economic Development Committee even before the single programming document was completed. Manweb came to give evidence along those lines. Why has it taken so long to get this initiative up and running? Why is it so far into the Objective 1 programme? It is better late than never, but is a shame that the influence on that area of policy will be limited before the next Assembly elections. We will let businesses and the electorate decide on that.

There is little in here about the renewable energy obligation. That is a real problem for companies that have little choice in where they receive their energy from. Will the Minister undertake to discuss with the Department of Trade and Industry and the Treasury the impact of the renewable energy obligation? Energy generators may well have to pass that on to those companies that do not have a wide range of choice as to from where they source their energy because of geographic difficulties or difficulties in terms of electricity generators. They might well be limited, by statute or otherwise, as to how they can generate electricity and in terms of diversifying to more renewable means of energy production.

A Severn barrage was briefly mentioned. We look forward to that debate because of the huge negative environmental impact that it would have, as well as the enormous costs of such an initiative. I remind the Minister and the Assembly that Associated British Ports visited the Economic Development Committee a short while ago. As soon as a Severn barrage was mentioned, it was aghast. In terms of its plans to expand ports, to underline their role and for the Minister to recognise the role of ports in terms of the economic development regeneration, that was a surprise. ABP was surprised by the

ffocws a'r gefnogaeth a ddylai fod gydag effeithlonrwydd busnesau, yn ogystal ag effeithlonrwydd domestig, y mae Phil Williams eisoes wedi tynnu sylw ato. Ychydig o gyfeiriad sydd yn hynny o beth.

Ar yr ochr gadarnhaol, croesawaf sylwadau Christine Chapman ar Arena Network. Mae hynny'n wych—dyma gyflwyno newyddion cadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, trafodasom y math yma o fater yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd hyd yn oed cyn y cwblhawyd y ddogfen raglennu sengl. Daeth Manweb yma i roi dystiolaeth ar hyd y llinellau hynny. Pam y mae wedi cymryd cyhyd i gael y fenter hon ar ei thraed? Pam mae hyn mor bell i mewn i'r rhaglen Amcan 1? Gwell hwyr na hwyrach, ond mae'n drueni y bydd y dylanwad ar y maes polisi hwnnw'n gyfyngedig cyn yr etholiadau Cynulliad nesaf. Gadawn i fusnesau a'r etholwyr benderfynu ar hynny.

Ychydig sydd yma am y ddyletswydd ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae hynny'n broblem wirioneddol i gwmniau sydd heb fawr o ddewis ynghylch o ble y cânt eu hynni. A wnaiff y Gweinidog addo trafod gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys effaith y ddyletswydd ynni adnewyddadwy? Efallai'n wir y bydd yn rhaid i gynhyrchwyr ynni basio hynny ymlaen i'r cwmniau hynny sydd heb amrediad mawr o ddewis ynghylch ble y cânt eu hynni oherwydd anawsterau daearyddol neu anawsterau yn nhermau cynhyrchwyr trydan. Fe allant yn wir fod wedi'u cyfyngu, drwy statud neu fel arall, o ran sut y gallant gynhyrchu trydan ac o ran arallgyfeirio i fod mwy adnewyddadwy o gynhyrchu ynni.

Soniwyd yn fyr am argae yn Afon Hafren. Edrychwn ymlaen at y ddadl honno oherwydd yr effaith negyddol enfawr a gâi ar yr amgylchedd, yn ogystal â chostau anferthol menter o'r fath. Atgoffaf y Gweinidog a'r Cynulliad fod Associated British Ports wedi ymweld â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ychydig yn ôl. Cyn gynted ag y soniwyd am fared ar Afon Hafren, yr oeddent yn arswydo. O ran eu cynlluniau i ehangu porthladdoedd a thanlinellu eu rôl ac i'r Gweinidog gydnabod rôl porthladdoedd yn nhermau adfywio datblygiad economaidd, yr oedd hynny'n

announcement of such a consideration and I ask the Minister to reflect on that.

3:40 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** Thank you, Alun, for your warm welcome of my statement. I sometimes feel that I am damned if I do and damned if I do not. The statement is responding to 'Energy 2050' by the Cabinet Office Performance and Innovation Unit. I did not commit the Government or the Assembly to any action. I mentioned the Economic Development Committee on several occasions in my statement and have mentioned it again in many of my responses. The statement was not intended to pre-empt the Economic Development Committee's consultation or deliberation on the report. I look forward with interest to its conclusions. My statement was given largely to establish our initial response to the PIU report without pre-empting the Economic Development Committee's or the Government's response. It was about establishing broad principles. The PIU report also covers transport, which the Economic Development Committee was not going to consider initially, although there may have been a movement towards that at the last Economic Development Committee meeting on this issue.

Most Assembly Members have probably received representations from companies in their constituencies on the renewables energy obligation and will have made appropriate representations, as the Assembly Government has, to the Department of Trade and Industry where they felt that certain issues should be discussed by central Government. I also noticed ABP's surprise at hearing about the proposals for a Severn barrage. However, at this stage, the issue needs to be discussed. The capital costs alone for constructing such a major development would be significant. It would also have an environmental impact and an impact on many towns, ports, and companies such as ABP. We are considering the potential of a barrage at present. It is a consultation and we should deal with it in that context.

syndod. Cafodd ABP eu syfrdanu pan gyhoeddwyd ystyriaeth o'r fath a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog fyfyrion ar hynny.

**Andrew Davies:** Diolch, Alun, am eich croeso cynnes i'm datganiad. Teimlaf weithiau fy mod yn golledig os gwnaf ac yn golledig os na wnaf. Mae'r datganiad yn ymateb i 'Ynni 2050' gan Uned Berfformiad ac Arloesedd Swyddfa'r Cabinet. Ni rwymais y Llywodraeth na'r Cynulliad i unrhyw weithredu. Crybwylais y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd sawl gwaith yn fy natganiad ac yr wyf wedi'i grybwyl eto mewn llawer o f'atebion. Ni fwriadwyd i'r datganiad achub y blaen ar ymgynghoriad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd na'i ystyriaeth o'r adroddiad. Edrychaf ymlaen gyda diddordeb at ei gasgliadau. Rhoddwyd fy natganiad yn bennaf i sefydlu'n hymateb cyntaf i adroddiad yr Uned heb achub y blaen ar ymateb y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd na'r Llywodraeth. Y bwriad oedd sefydlu egwyddorion cyffredinol. Mae adroddiad yr Uned yn ymdrin hefyd â thrafnidiaeth, nad oedd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn mynd i'w hystyried i ddechrau, er efallai y bu symudiad tuag at hynny yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar y mater hwn.

Mae'n debyg bod y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi derbyn sylwadau gan gwmniau yn eu hetholaethau ynglŷn â'r ddyletswydd ynni adnewyddadwy a byddant wedi gwneud sylwadau priodol, fel y gwnaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, lle teimlent y dylai materion penodol gael eu trafod gan y Llywodraeth ganolog. Sylwais innau ar syfrdandod ABP pan glywsant am y cynigion am fared ar draws Afon Hafren. Fodd bynnag, ar y pwyt yma, mae angen trafod y mater. Byddai'r costau cyfalaf yn unig am adeiladu datblygiad mor fawr yn arwyddocaol. Byddai hefyd yn effeithio ar yr amgylchedd ac ar nifer o drefi, porthladdoedd, a chwmniau fel ABP. Yr ydym yn ystyried potensial bared ar hyn o bryd. Ymgynghoriad ydyw a dylem ddelio ag ef yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Arweinydd Grŵp Democraidaid

**Democrat Group (Michael German):** The issue of global warming is coming centre stage. We hope that the missionary work undertaken by Mick Bates and Phil Williams will come to fruition and that the people who have taken this issue forward over time, and were often viewed as enthusiasts without purpose, are now being seen as central to the purpose.

I raise several questions. First, is the timescale for the PIU's response. Your statement is aimed at the response to the Cabinet paper. Will you indicate whether the Assembly's response to the ongoing review will be included in the timescale at some point in order to take forward some of the issues that have already been raised by colleagues in the Chamber?

You have not included the issue of waste to energy in your statement. Will you give us any information that you have about that? This issue also presents a challenge to the public sector. It was suggested that public bodies should report on their use of renewables in their annual reports so that we can see whether they are assisting the progress of the use of renewable energy.

An important issue from an economic development perspective is the use of Government mechanisms to support industries and innovators in Wales who can contribute to new technologies. Converting the good ideas that are in place into viable, marketable and sustainable businesses in the full context is a large problem that we face with regard to renewable energy. Will you comment on the way in which you would support innovation across the board?

Colleagues have raised the question of whether this is only an issue for the Economic Development Committee. If you consider local government, building regulations, environmental health departments and the planning sector, it is clear that this issue, including training and awareness, encompasses a great deal of our involvement with public life in Wales. How do you propose to take this forward with

**Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Mae pwnc cynhesu byd-eang yn dod i ganol y llwyfan. Gobeithiwn y bydd y gwaith cenhadu a wnaethpwyd gan Mick Bates a Phil Williams wedi dwyn ffrwyth ac y gwelir bod y bobl sydd wedi gwthio'r mater hwn yn ei flaen dros amser, ac a welwyd yn aml fel selogion heb bwrrpas, bellach yn bobl sy'n ganolog i'r pwrrpas.

Codaf nifer o gwestiynau. Yn gyntaf, yr amserlen ar gyfer ymateb yr Uned Berfformiad ac Arloesedd. Mae'ch datganiad chi wedi'i anelu at yr ymateb i bapur y Cabinet. A wnewch chi ddweud a gaiff ymateb y Cynulliad i'r adolygiad sy'n mynd rhagddo ei gynnwys yn yr amserlen ar ryw bwynt er mwyn symud ymlaen rai o'r materion a godwyd eisoes gan gyd-Aelodau yn y Siambr?

Nid ydych wedi cynnwys cwestiwn troi gwastraff yn ynni yn eich datganiad. A roddwch chi unrhyw wybodaeth sydd gennych ynglŷn â hynny inni? Mae'r mater hwn hefyd yn gosod her i'r sector cyhoeddus. Awgrymwyd y dylai cyrff cyhoeddus gyflwyno adroddiad ar eu defnydd o ynni adnewyddadwy yn eu hadroddiadau blynnyddol fel y gallwn weld a ydynt yn cynorthwyo hynt y defnydd o ynni adnewyddadwy.

Mater pwysig o safbwyt datblygu economaidd yw defnyddio mechanweithiau'r Llywodraeth i gefnogi diwydiannau ac arloeswyr yng Nghymru a all gyfrannu at dechnolegau newydd. Mae troi'r syniadau da sydd ar gael yn fusnesau hyfyw, marchnadadwy a chynaliadwy yn y cyddestun llawn yn broblem fawr a wynebwn yng nghyswilt ynni adnewyddadwy. A wnewch chi roi sylw ar sut y byddech yn cefnogi arloesedd ar draws y bwrdd?

Mae cyd-Aelodau wedi codi'r cwestiwn ai mater i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn unig yw hwn. Os ystyriwch llywodraeth leol, rheoliadau adeiladu, adrannau iechyd yr amgylchedd a'r sector cynllunio, mae'n amlwg fod y mater hwn, yn cynnwys hyfforddi ac ymwybyddiaeth, yn cwmpasu llawer iawn o'n hymwneud â bywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Sut y bwriadwch fynd â hyn ymlaen gyda chyd-Aelodau'r

Cabinet colleagues to ensure that these issues are picked up and treated across the board by all Cabinet Ministers?

Finally, the Severn barrage issue has been on the agenda for several years. I was pleased to note that Phil said in his contribution to the Economic Development Committee's debate, that this issue has survived his business in this area, so I feel like a youngster in the matter. However, this issue has been on people's agendas since the early 1970s at least. We have not yet got to grips with how we take this major issue forward. Three-quarters of the impact will be in England. Will you tell us what discussion you have had with the Government in England to take this debate forward so that we can have that discussion?

The technology has moved on over those decades and the issue of simply using tidal energy on the surface has now perhaps been replaced by using tidal energy on the seabed. Will you outline your views on this matter and tell us whether you intend to take this issue forward? Will you indicate whether you are prepared to draw together the interested parties around the Severn estuary in the south-west of England and in the west Midlands, which covers Gloucestershire, as well as the National Assembly, to see if there is some consensus on how we take this proposal forward? In the words of Sir John Bourne, tidal power could satisfy a great deal of our need to reduce carbon dioxide emissions, but it may not be in the way that was originally proposal suggested.

**Andrew Davies:** There are few policy issues that fall entirely within one portfolio. Health is a classic example, where health relates to people's prosperity or poverty levels and housing, as well as a range of other issues. Energy is similar in that regard. I have responsibility for energy policy within the Cabinet, but there are major planning implications, for which Sue Essex is responsible. On your question about how we identify business opportunities, Sue Essex and I have discussed this recently and have been considering where we can maximise

Cabinet i sicrhau y codir y materion hyn a'u trafod ar draws y bwrdd gan holl Weinidogion y Cabinet?

Yn olaf, mae cwestiwn argae Hafren wedi bod ar yr agenda ers nifer o flynyddoedd. Yr oeddwn yn falch o nodi bod Phil wedi dweud yn ei gyfraniad at ddadl y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, fod y mater hwn wedi goroesi ei fusnes ef yn y maes hwn, felly yr wyf i'n teimlo fel lleflyn ifanc yn y mater. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mater hwn ar agenda pobl ers dechrau'r 1970au o leiaf. Nid ydym eto wedi mynd i'r afael â sut yr awn â'r mater pwysig hwn ymlaen. Yn Lloegr y bydd tri-chwarter yr effaith. A wnewch chi ddweud wrthym pa drafodaeth yr ydych wedi'i chael gyda'r Llywodraeth yn Lloegr i fynd â'r ddadl hon yn ei blaen fel y gallwn gael y drafodaeth honno?

Mae'r dechnoleg wedi symud ymlaen dros y degawdau hynny ac mae'r syniad o ddefnyddio ynni'r llanw ar yr wyneb yn unig erbyn hyn efallai wedi'i ddisodli gan y syniad o ddefnyddio ynni'r llanw ar wely'r môr. A wnewch chi amlinellu'ch syniadau ar y mater hwn a dweud wrthym a ydych yn bwriadu mynd â'r mater hwn yn ei flaen? A wnewch chi nodi a ydych yn barod i alw ynghyd y partïon sydd â diddordeb o gwmpas Aber Hafren yn ne-orllewin Lloegr ac yng ngorllewin Canoldir Lloegr, sy'n cynnwys Swydd Gaerloyw, yn ogystal â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, i weld a oes rhyw gonsensws yngylch sut yr awn â'r cynnig hwn yn ei flaen? Yng ngeiriau Syr John Bourne, gallai pŵer y llanw fodloni llawer iawn o'n hangen i leihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid, ond efallai nid yn y ffordd yr awgrymai'r cynnig gwreiddiol.

**Andrew Davies:** Ychydig o faterion polisi sydd yn syrthio'n gyfan gwbl o fewn un portffolio. Mae iechyd yn enghraifft glasurol, lle mae iechyd yn gysylltiedig â lefelau cyfoeth neu dlodi a thai pobl, yn ogystal ag amrediad o faterion eraill. Mae ynni'n debyg yn hynny o beth. Mae gennyl fi gyfrifoldeb dros bolisi ynni yn y Cabinet, ond y mae goblygiadau mawr o safbwyt cynllunio, sef cyfrifoldeb Sue Essex. Ynglŷn â'ch cwestiwn yngylch sut y nodwn gyfleoedd busnes, mae Sue Essex a mi wedi trafod hyn yn ddiweddar ac wedi bod yn ystyried ble y gallwn

business opportunities for companies in Wales. We have also been discussing how we can make the most of people's ideas and innovation, but also support and nurture existing business in this area. Those discussions are at an early stage, but we are both committed to this issue. Wales has a unique selling point in terms of economic development. We have huge areas of expertise, which we have already seen in submissions for the Economic Development Committee review. In terms of the timescale of the response to the PIU report, we hope that the Economic Development Committee's deliberations will help inform our response to the PIU report. That would be helpful.

You are correct that there is no reference to waste in the statement. However, we are limited to 1,000 words per statement. I am sure that the Presiding Officer is pleased that we try to stick to that. There are many issues that were not included in my statement because I wanted to limit it to broad principles and raise questions in areas that needed to be addressed. You made the point about ASPBs and how we can get the public sector in general to sign up to this huge agenda and crucial priorities. We will be discussing with ASPBs how to take that forward in the most effective way. This is an initial statement in response to the Performance and Innovation Unit's report. A more detailed response will follow the Economic Development Committee's deliberations, and further developments in this area.

3:50 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the Minister for continuing with some of his old responsibilities as the Minister for Assembly Business, in reminding me of the rules governing our statements. We are five minutes behind our scheduled time, but I am reluctant to close down the opportunity for Members, who are not lead spokespeople, to ask questions on statements, and therefore I will extend this item by a few minutes.

**David Davies:** I feel that I must give

sicrhau'r cyfleoedd busnes mwyaf i gwmnïau yng Nghymru. Yr ydym hefyd wedi bod yn trafod sut y gallwn wneud y mwyaf o syniadau ac arloesedd pobl, ond drwy hefyd gefnogi a meithrin busnesau sy'n bodoli eisoes yn yr ardal hon. Nid ydym wedi mynd yn bell iawn â'r trafodaethau hynny eto, ond yr ydym ein dau wedi ymrwymo i'r mater hwn. Mae gan Gymru bwynt gwerthu unigryw o ran datblygu economaidd. Mae gennym feysydd arbenigedd enfawr, yr ydym eisoes wedi'u gweld mewn cyflwyniadau i adolygiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. O ran amserlen yr ymateb i adroddiad yr Uned Berfformiad ac Arloesedd, gobeithiwn y bydd trafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn helpu i hysbysu'n hymateb i adroddiad yr uned. Byddai hynny'n fuddiol.

Yr ydych yn gywir nad oes cyfeiriad at wastraff yn y datganiad. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi'n cyfyngu i 1,000 o eiriau i bob datganiad. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod y Llywydd yn falch ein bod yn ceisio cadw at hynny. Mae llawer o faterion nad oedd wedi'u cynnwys yn fy natganiad oherwydd yr oedd arnaf eisiau ei gyfyngu i egwyddorion cyffredinol a chodi cwestiynau mewn mannau a oedd angen sylw. Gwnaethoch y pwynt am gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a sut y gallwn gael y sector cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol i dderbyn yr agenda anferth a'r blaenoriaethau allweddol hyn. Byddwn yn trafod gyda'r cyrff hyn sut i fwrw ymlaen â hynny yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Datganiad cyntaf yw hwn mewn ymateb i adroddiad yr Uned Berfformiad ac Arloesedd. Bydd ymateb mwy manwl yn dilyn trafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a datblygiadau pellach yn y maes hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am barhau gyda rhai o'i hen gyfrifoldebau fel Trefnydd, wrth iddo f'atgoffa am y rheolau ynglŷn â'n datganiadau. Yr ydym bum munud ar ôl ein hamser penodedig, ond yr wyf yn gyndyn o gau'r cyfle i Aelodau, nad ydynt yn llefarwyr arweiniol, i ofyn cwestiynau ar ddatganiadau, ac felly fe barhawn â'r eitem hon am ychydig o funudau.

**David Davies:** Teimlaf fod yn rhaid imi roi

something of a welcome to this because the Minister has given us a statement, which, for once, does not include an irrelevant diatribe about the economic policies of the Conservative Government in the 1980s.

Why is there nothing here on solar power, which has proved to be much more efficient than wind power? Why is there more discussion of a Severn barrage, which will fuel the concerns of many of businesses in the River Severn area? Finally, why is this a concern for the Economic Development Committee? Energy is clearly an environmental matter, and should therefore be dealt with by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee.

**Andrew Davies:** If David Davies wants me to indulge in a diatribe against the former Conservative Government, I am more than happy to do so.

It is a matter for each Committee to decide on its agenda. I welcome the Economic Development Committee's decision to consider this important issue, and I hope to play a full part in its final report. As I was on Alun Cairns's question, I am bewildered by the thrust of David's approach. It is a matter for the Committee to decide what it studies.

Issues such as converting sunlight into electricity need to be considered, as has been done by the Economic Development Committee. There are clearly problems in using solar power as a reliable source of energy in the UK, compared with Mediterranean countries, but, like other renewable sources, it has its part to play.

**Elin Jones:** A allwch gadarnhau bod eich Llywodraeth yn gofyn i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant drosglwyddo'r holl bwerau mewn perthynas â gorsafoedd ynni dros 50 MW i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac y byddai hynny'n cynnwys nid yn unig ffermydd gwynt ond gorsafoedd niwclear hefyd?

**Andrew Davies:** As I indicated to Nick Bourne in his short debate, we have been in discussions with the Government, and with the DTI in particular, about the transfer of powers for planning consent for power stations of over 50 MW. It is early days, and

rhyw lun o groeso i hyn oherwydd mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi datganiad inni sydd, am unwaith, heb gynnwys bytheirio amherthnasol am bolisiau economaidd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn y 1980au.

Pam nad oes dim yma am ynni haul, sydd wedi profi'n llawer mwy effeithlon nag ynni gwynt? Pam y mae mwy o drafod ynghylch argae ar Afon Hafren, a fydd yn bwydo pryderon llawer o fusnesau yn ardal Afon Hafren? Yn olaf, pam y mae hyn yn fater i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd? Mae ynni yn amlwg yn fater amgylcheddol, a dylai felly gael ei drafod gan Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth.

**Andrew Davies:** Os oes ar David Davies eisiau imi ddechrau bytheirio yn erbyn yr hen Lywodraeth Geidwadol, yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon i wneud hynny.

Mater i bob Pwyllgor yw penderfynu ar ei agenda. Croesawaf benderfyniad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i ystyried y mater pwysig hwn, a gobeithiaf chwarae rhan lawn yn ei adroddiad terfynol. Fel yr oeddwon gyda chwestiwn Alun Cairns, yr wyf mewn penbleth gydag ergyd gosodiad David. Mater i'r Pwyllgor yw penderfynu beth yr astudia.

Mae angen ystyried materion fel troi golau'r haul yn drydan, fel y gwnaethpwyd gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Mae problemau amlwg o ddefnyddio ynni'r haul fel ffynhonnell ddibynadwy o ynni yn y DU, o gymharu â gwledydd ardal Môr y Canoldir, ond, fel ffynonellau adnewyddadwy eraill, mae ganddo ei ran i'w chwarae.

**Elin Jones:** Can you confirm that your Government is requesting that the Department of Trade and Industry transfer all responsibility for power stations of over 50 MW to the National Assembly, and that that would include not only windfarms, but also nuclear power stations?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais wrth Nick Bourne yn ei ddadl fer ef, yr ydym wedi bod yn trafod gyda'r Llywodraeth, a chyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn arbennig, ynghylch trosglwyddo pwerau caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer gorsafoedd ynni dros 50

we are still in the process of negotiating, and, as I said in my statement, it would be premature to comment any further on those discussions and negotiations.

MW. Mae'n ddyddiau cynnar, ac yr ydym yn dal yn y broses o negodi, ac, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, byddai'n gynamserol rhoi unrhyw sylw pellach ar y trafodaethau a'r negodiadau hynny.

## Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

**The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones):**

Members will wish to be aware that there are no changes to this week's business, with the exception of the next item, which relates to the suspension of Standing Orders. However, the Llywydd will speak to that motion after it has been formally proposed. This morning, the Business Committee discussed my draft business statement for the next three weeks' business, as shown on the Chamberweb, under supporting documents.

Finally, under Standing Order No. 22.5, the Presiding Officer has determined that the following items of legislation need not be referred to Subject Committees for extended consideration: the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2002 and the Meat (Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Point) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

**Jonathan Morgan:** I have raised the issue of the timing and frequency of Government statements in this Chamber in the past. It is my view, and the view of my group, that statements should be used for up-to-date information that is urgent and important, and which cannot be given at any other time. The Minister is scheduling many statements many months in advance, and we feel that this allows the Government to avoid proper scrutiny and debate, as, where debates could be held on some issues, we are having statements instead. I get the feeling that this is being used to fill our time, the consequence of which is business being shuffled off the end of the day. If we keep going at this rate, the short debate will be postponed yet again.

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones):**

Bydd Aelodau'n dymuno gwybod nad oes newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon, ac eithrio'r eitem nesaf, sy'n ymwneud ag atal y Rheolau Sefydlog. Fodd bynnag, bydd y Llywydd yn siarad ar y cynnig hwnnw wedi iddo gael ei gynnig yn ffurfiol. Y bore yma, trafododd y Pwyllgor Busnes fy natganiad busnes draft ar gyfer busnes y tair wythnos nesaf, fel a ddangosir ar we'r Siambra, dan y dogfennau ategol.

Yn olaf, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, mae'r Llywydd wedi penderfynu nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau deddfwriaeth canlynol i Bwyllgorau Pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2002 a Rheoliadau Cig (Dadansoddi Peryglon a Phwynt Rheoli Critigol) (Cymru) 2002.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments on the business statement?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf wedi codi mater amseriad ac amlder datganiadau'r Llywodraeth yn y Siambra hon yn y gorffennol. Fy marn i, a barn fy ngrŵp, yw y dylid defnyddio datganiadau ar gyfer gwybodaeth ddiweddar sydd yn bwysig ac yn fater brys, ac na ellir ei rhoi ar unrhyw adeg arall. Mae'r Gweinidog yn trefnu llawer o ddatganiadau fisoedd lawer ymlaen llaw, a theimlwn fod hyn yn caniatáu i'r Llywodraeth osgoi archwiliad a dadl go iawn, oherwydd lle gellid cynnal dadleuon ar rai materion, cawn ddatganiadau yn eu lle. Caf y teimlad fod hyn yn cael ei ddefnyddio i lenwi'n hamser, ac o ganlyniad fod busnes yn cael ei wthio o'r neilltu iddiwedd y dydd. Os daliwn ati fel hyn, caiff y ddadl fer ei gohirio eto fyth.

**Carwyn Jones:** In view of the need to move on quickly, I note your comments, but it is not the intention of the Government to stifle debate.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Yn hytrach na gadael y gadair ar gyfer yr eitem nesaf, gan ei fod yn ymwneud â’m swyddfa i, yr wyf am ofyn i’r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad gynnig y cynnig yn ffurfiol yn dilyn fy natganiad.

Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chais i ohirio Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.12 a 6.13. Tynnwyd fy sylw at yffaith bod y drefnlen gyflwyno a bostiwyd ar y fewnrwyd ddydd Gwener diwethaf yn anghywir, gan nad oedd yn ystyried gwyl banc Calan Mai ar 6 Mai. O ganlyniad, derbyniodd Aelodau wybodaeth anghywir ynglŷn â dyddiad cyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad ar 7 Mai. Canfuwyd y camgymeriad yn gynnar bore ddoe, ond, er bod y drefnlen gyflwyno bellach wedi ei chywiros, nid yw Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales wedi gallu cyflwyno cynnig ar gyfer ei dadl plaid leiafrifol ar 7 Mai.

Ystyriwyd y mater hwn gan y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, a chytunodd mai’r ffordd gall ymlaen fyddai gwneud cais i ohirio Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.12 a 6.13 am un diwrnod yn unig, er mwyn caniatâu i’r cynnig, ac unrhyw welliannau, gael eu cyflwyno fel y bwriadwyd yn wreiddiol. Gofynnwyd i mi ystyried, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34.5—credaf mai dyma’r tro cyntaf imi orfod defnyddio’r Rheol Sefydlog hon—a fyddwn yn barod i gytuno i gynnig gael ei gyflwyno y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf wedi ystyried hyn yn ofalus, a deuthum i’r casgliad y byddwn yn barod i wneud hyn ar ran unrhyw blaidd, nid dim ond ar ran Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Yr wyf wedi ystyried, yn unol â’r Rheol Sefydlog, na fyddai caniatâu’r cynnig hwn yn gamddefnydd o weithdrefnau’r Cynulliad nac

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn wyneb yr angen i symud ymlaen yn gyflym, nodaf eich sylwadau, ond nid bwriad y Llywodraeth yw mygu dadl.

**The Presiding Officer:** As the next item involves my office, rather than leave the chair, I will ask the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business to formally propose the motion following my statement.

This relates to a request to suspend Standing Orders Nos. 6.12 and 6.13. It was brought to my attention that the tabling schedule posted to the intranet last Friday was incorrect, in that it did not take into account the May Day bank holiday on 6 May. As a consequence, Members were incorrectly advised of the date for tabling motions for the Assembly Plenary on 7 May. The error was discovered early yesterday morning, but, although the tabling schedule has now been corrected, Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales has been unable to table the motion for its minority party debate scheduled for 7 May.

This matter was considered by the Business Committee this morning, and it agreed that the sensible solution would be to make a request to suspend Standing Orders Nos. 6.12 and 6.13 for one day only, in order to allow the motion, and any amendments, to be tabled as was originally intended. I was asked to consider, under Standing Order No. 34.5—I believe that this is the first time I have had cause to make use of this Standing Order—whether I would be prepared to permit a motion to be proposed this afternoon. I have considered this carefully, and I came to the conclusion that I would be willing to do this for any party, not only for Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. I have considered, in accordance with the Standing Order, that to allow this motion would not be an abuse of Assembly procedures or an infringement of

yn tarfu ar hawliau pleidiau lleiafrifol. Felly, yr wyf wedi caniatáu i'r cynnig a gyflwynwyd heddiw yn enw'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad i ohirio'r Rheolau Sefydlog gael ei gynnig. Bydd y cynnig hwn yn cael yr effaith a nodais yn fy natganiad.

Yr wyf wedi pwysleisio i'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno y dylid ceisio osgoi camgymeriadau fel hyn yn y dyfodol, ac eithrio ar y dydd gwych hwnnw pan fydd Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn wyl banc. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod y Swyddfa Gyflwyno wedi darganfod ei chamgymeriad, ac wedi cymryd cyfrifoldeb ac ymddiheuro amdano a'i gywiro.

### **Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.12 a 6.13 Suspension of Standing Orders Nos. 6.12 and 6.13**

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones):**  
Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 34.4 a 34.5, yn penderfynu bod Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.12 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13 yn cael eu hatal dros dro, er mwyn caniatáu i'r cynnig ar gyfer dadl plaid leiafrifol Plaid Cymru sydd i'w chynnal dydd Mawrth 7 Mai, ac unrhyw welliannau pellach, gael eu cyflwyno.*

*Caiff Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.12 ei atal dros dro ddydd Mawrth 30 Ebrill yn unig. Caiff Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13 ei atal dros dro ddydd Iau 2 Mai yn unig. (NDM1042)*

the rights of minority parties. Therefore, I have allowed the motion tabled today in the name of the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business to suspend Standing Orders to be proposed. This motion will have the effect outlined in my statement.

I have stressed to the Table Office the need to avoid such errors in future, apart from on that great day when St David's Day becomes a bank holiday. I am grateful to the Table Office for discovering its error, for taking responsibility and for its apology and subsequent correction.

**The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Orders No. 34.4 and 34.5, resolves that Standing Order No. 6.12 and Standing Order No. 6.13 be suspended to enable the motion for the Plaid Cymru minority party debate on Tuesday 7 May, and any subsequent amendments, to be tabled.*

*The suspension of Standing Order No. 6.12 will have effect for Tuesday 30 April only. The suspension of Standing Order No. 6.13 will have effect on Thursday 2 May only. (NDM1042)*

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Pwynt o Drefn**  
**Point of Order**

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** Point of order. During my Plenary question session last week, reference was made to proposed developments in my constituency, Cardiff North. I wish to put on record, for the purpose of clarification, that, in terms of current proposed planning developments, or any future planning developments within my constituency, I would not be involved in a ministerial capacity in any decision-making.

4:00 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to you for putting that on record.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Pwynt o drefn. Yn ystod fy sesiwn gwestiynau mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf, cyfeiriwyd at ddatblygiadau arfaethedig yn f'etholaeth, Gogledd Caerdydd. Hoffwn gofnodi, er mwyn eglurder, na fyddwn i, o ran datblygiadau cynllunio a gynigir ar hyn o bryd, neu unrhyw ddatblygiadau cynllunio yn y dyfodol yn f'etholaeth, yn ymwneud ag unrhyw broses o wneud penderfyniad yn fy swydd fel Gweinidog.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi am gofnodi hynny.

**Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru)  
(Rhif 6) (Cymru) 2002**  
**Approval of the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report  
(No. 6) (Wales) 2002**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 6) (Wales) 2002 which was laid in the Table Office on 22 April 2002. (NDM1038)*

I am pleased to bring forward this special grant report for approval by the Assembly. It distributes in total an additional £3.2 million to local education authorities in Wales for improving standards in schools. The funding is made up of two distinct elements: £2 million to develop and support innovative ways of delivering education in a rural setting and in small schools and £1.2 million to support local education authorities to develop improved pupil information systems.

In the partnership agreement, we undertook to develop a rural schools policy that encouraged options such as federation, information technology networking and other methods of supporting smaller schools. The paper that I presented to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee last October setting out this policy, made it clear that our priority, as for all children in all areas in Wales, was that children in rural areas should have access to education of the highest standard. We also recognise that local education authorities are best placed to decide whether there is a need to rationalise or consolidate their existing provision in order to deliver that objective.

We will shortly be issuing revised guidance to LEAs, emphasising that they must take into account the role of the school in the local community before bringing forward any proposals to close a rural school. I will look for evidence that imaginative alternatives to closure have been fully explored and that any such proposals do not lead to unreasonably

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan adrann 88B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) (Rhif 6) (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Ebrill 2002. (NDM1038)*

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r adroddiad grant arbennig hwn i'w gymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad. Mae'n dosbarthu cyfanswm o £3.2 miliwn yn ychwanegol i awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru ar gyfer gwella safonau mewn ysgolion. Mae dwy elfen wahanol i'r arian: £2 filiwn i ddatblygu a chefnogi ffyrdd arloesol o gyflwyno addysg mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac mewn ysgolion llai, ac £1.2 miliwn i helpu awdurdodau addysg lleol i ddatblygu gwell systemau gwybodaeth ar ddisgyblion.

Yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, ymgymerasom i ddatblygu polisi ar ysgolion gwledig a fyddai'n annog opsiynau fel ffedereiddio, rhwydweithio technoleg gwybodaeth a dulliau eraill o gefnogi ysgolion llai. Yn y papur a gyflwynais i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes fis Hydref diwethaf yn amlinellu'r polisi hwn, nodwyd yn glir mai ein blaenoriaeth, fel i'r holl blant ymhob ardal yng Nghymru, oedd y dylai plant mewn ardaloedd gwledig gael mynediad at addysg o'r safon uchaf. Sylweddolwn hefyd mai'r awdurdodau addysg lleol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i benderfynu a oes angen rhesymoli neu atgyfnerthu eu darpariaeth bresennol er mwyn cyflawni'r amcan hwnnw.

Cyn hir byddwn yn cyhoeddi canllawiau diwygiedig i AALLau, yn pwysleisio fod yn rhaid iddynt ystyried rôl yr ysgol yn y gymuned leol cyn cyflwyno unrhyw gynigion i gau ysgol wledig. Byddaf yn edrych am dystiolaeth fod dewisiadau dychmygus eraill yn lle cau wedi eu harchwilio'n llawn ac na fydd unrhyw gynigion o'r fath yn arwain at

long journeys to school. My prime consideration will be whether the proposal is in the best interest of all pupils in the area.

Our decisions must be focused primarily on educational issues and on using the available resources as effectively as possible to maintain and improve standards. As well as setting out the policy framework for LEAs, I felt that there was a need to help stimulate and support new and alternative ways for schools working together and with the local community. That is why I am making the £2 million in additional funding available. I hope that the funding will help to improve school organisation and standards by supporting innovation and assisting in developing schemes for schools to work together through informal association or collaboration, through clustering, federation, IT networking, by helping with initiatives to increase the community use of school buildings—whether for lifelong learning or non-education related uses—and by providing administrative support in schools, particularly where the headteacher has a significant classroom teaching workload.

I have deliberately put in place fairly broad criteria of acceptable uses for this funding, with the expectation that it will be used to directly benefit schools. I hope that authorities will be able to use this flexibility to respond to circumstances of real need and to support innovative proposals.

Responding flexibly to local need is also the approach behind the allocation of a further £1.2 million to LEAs to support improvements to the information that is available on pupils in Wales. Information on pupils' achievements and needs is a vital plank in our work to improve attainment in Wales. Better information will enable the impact and performance of educational initiatives to be properly assessed and measured, supporting teachers and LEAs in their passion to drive up standards and helping to ensure that the needs of all our pupils are met. For the first time it will also be possible to target more effectively the needs of groups of children, such as ethnic minorities. To achieve this, we have

deithiau afresymol o hir i'r ysgol. Fy mhrif ystyriaeth fydd a yw'r cynnig er budd gorau holl ddisgyblion yr ardal.

Rhaid i'n penderfyniadau ganolbwytio'n bennaf ar faterion addysgol ac ar ddefnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael mor effeithiol ag sy'n bosibl er mwyn cynnal a gwella safonau. Yn ogystal â gosod y fframwaith polisi ar gyfer AALLau, teimlais fod angen helpu i symbolu a chefnogi ffyrdd newydd a gwahanol i ysgolion weithio gyda'i gilydd a chyda'r gymuned leol. Dyna pam yr wyf yn cynnig y £2 filiwn o gyllid ychwanegol. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr arian yn helpu i wella trefniadaeth a safonau ysgolion drwy gefnogi arloesi a helpu i ddatblygu cynlluniau i ysgolion weithio gyda'i gilydd drwy gysylltiad anffurfiol neu gydweithio, drwy glystyru, ffedereiddio, rhwydweithio TG, drwy helpu gyda chynlluniau i gynyddu defnydd y gymuned o adeiladau'r ysgol—boed hynny ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes neu ddefnyddiau heb fod â chysylltiad ag addysg—a thrwy ddarparu cefnogaeth weinyddol mewn ysgolion, yn enwedig lle bo gan bennaeth yr ysgol faich gwaith sylweddol yn dysgu yn yr ystafell ddosbarth.

Yr wyf yn fwriadol wedi sefydlu mein prawf eithaf eang o ran ffyrdd derbynol o ddefnyddio'r arian hwn, gan ddisgwyl y defnyddir yr arian er budd uniongyrchol i ysgolion. Gobeithiaf y bydd awdurdodau'n gallu defnyddio'r hyblygrwydd hwn i ymateb i amgylchiadau o wir angen ac i gefnogi cynigion arloesol.

Ymateb hyblyg i angen lleol yw'r amcan hefyd y tu ôl i ddarparu £1.2 miliwn pellach i AALLau i gefnogi gwelliannau i'r wybodaeth sydd ar gael ar ddisgyblion yng Nghymru. Mae gwybodaeth ar gyflawniadau ac anghenion disgyblion yn elfen hanfodol yn ein gwaith i wella cyrhaeddiad yng Nghymru. Bydd gwybodaeth well yn caniatáu inni asesu a mesur effaith a pherfformiad mentrau addysgol yn iawn, gan gefnogi athrawon ac AALLau yn eu hawydd i godi safonau a helpu i sicrhau yr atebir anghenion ein disgyblion i gyd. Am y tro cyntaf bydd modd hefyd i dargedu anghenion grwpiau o blant, fel lleiafrifoedd ethnig, yn fwy effeithiol. I gyflawni hyn, yr ydym wedi cychwyn ar brosiect pedair blynedd i ddatblygu systemau

embarked on a four-year project to develop pupil level information systems, working in partnership with key organisations, including the Welsh Local Government Association, LEAs, schools, teachers' unions, the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, Estyn and the Welsh Language Board.

Last year's pilot scheme was well received by local authorities and they and we are keen to move towards pupil-based systems and the more accurate information that we made available. The replacement of existing statistical returns with a new pupil level annual school census will also contribute to a lighter administrative burden on schools and LEAs since information will be collected only once and will follow each pupil throughout his or her school career.

However, to secure these benefits, we must invest. Although many secondary and primary schools already have pupil level systems, the additional resources for local authorities today will enable them to support schools needing additional hardware, software and training. I am aiming for a measurable outcome: that all schools in Wales have in place the hardware, software and trained staff to collect, hold and transfer electronically the agreed data at pupil level. That cannot be achieved overnight but these additional resources, along with a further tranche in April 2003, will support the schools and local authorities in undertaking this work. The cost will be much the same for all schools, irrespective of size, and therefore I calculated the allocations for local authorities simply on the number of maintained schools, including special schools and pupil referral units.

My approach will be one of flexibility in responding to local need. I am adopting a light touch, allowing authorities to decide how best to use these resources to secure the outcome that we all support. I hope that authorities and Members will welcome that and I commend this special grant report to Members.

**Helen Mary Jones:** The Party of Wales will

gwybodaeth ar lefelau disgyblion, gan weithio mewn partneriaeth â chyrff allweddol, yn cynnwys Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, AALLau, ysgolion, undebau athrawon, Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, Estyn a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg.

Cafodd cynllun peilot y flwyddyn ddiwethaf dderbyniad da gan awdurdodau lleol ac maent hwy a ninnau'n awyddus i symud tuag at systemau sy'n seiliedig ar ddisgyblion a'r wybodaeth gywirach a ddarparwyd gennym. Bydd disodli'r ystadegau presennol â chyfrifiad ysgol blynnyddol ar lefel disgyblion newydd yn cyfrannu at ysgafnhau'r baich gweinyddol ar ysgolion ac AALLau gan mai dim ond un waith y cesglir gwybodaeth, gan ddilyn pob disgybl drwy ei yrfa neu ei gyrrfa ysgol.

Fodd bynnag, er mwyn sicrhau'r manteision hyn, rhaid inni fuddsoddi. Er bod gan lawer o ysgolion uwchradd a chynradd systemau lefel disgyblion yn barod, bydd yr adnoddau ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol heddiw'n eu galluogi i gefnogi ysgolion sydd angen caledwedd, meddalwedd a hyfforddiant ychwanegol. Yr wyf yn anelu at ganlyniad mesuradwy: fod gan bob ysgol yng Nghymru y caledwedd, y meddalwedd a'r staff hyfforddedig i gasglu, dal a throsglwyddo'n electronig y data y cytunwyd arno ar lefel disgyblion. Ni ellir cyflawni hynny dros nos ond bydd yr adnoddau ychwanegol hyn, ynghyd â chyfran arall yn Ebrill 2003, yn cefnogi'r ysgolion a'r awdurdodau lleol wrth iddynt wneud y gwaith hwn. Bydd y gost yn ddigon tebyg i bob ysgol, ni waeth beth fo'u maint, ac felly cyfrifais y dyraniadau i awdurdodau lleol ar sail nifer yr ysgolion a gynhelir yn unig, gan gynnwys ysgolion arbennig ac unedau cyfeirio disgyblion.

Af ati mewn modd hyblyg i ymateb i angen lleol. Yr wyf yn delio â hyn â chyffyrddiad ysgafn, gan adael i awdurdodau benderfynu sut orau i ddefnyddio'r adnoddau hyn i sicrhau'r canlyniad yr ydym i gyd yn ei gefnogi. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff awdurdodau ac Aelodau groesawu hynny a chymeradwyaf yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn i Aelodau.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Bydd Plaid Cymru'n

support the approval of this special grant report. There will be two parts to my comments on the special grant report, referring, as the Minister did, to the areas of activity covered by funding columns A and B separately.

The grants under column B will be used, as the Minister said, to ensure that data can be much more effectively collected at schools, using up-to-date information and communications technology hardware and software and transferring that information electronically. The grant report refers to training for staff in using this equipment, which is obviously vital. I seek the Minister's assurance that that training will include appropriate input on the implications of the Data Protection Act 1998 for staff and schools using computers to collect, store and share information on pupils. I suspect that many staff, especially in primary schools, will be doing so for the first time. The implications of that Act for schools could be considerable and staff must be fully aware of them, particularly when transferring data between schools.

The additional funding under column A to support schools—particularly small and rural schools—in seeking innovative ways of working together is welcome. However, I have concerns, which I invite the Minister to address in her response. The nature of some of the activities cited as examples eligible for funding, such as the administrative costs of managing change, may have financial implications beyond the financial year covered by these grants. Will authorities be able to make applications for similar funds in succeeding years to fund processes of change all the way through?

**Cynog Dafis:** Fel y gŵyr Helen Mary Jones, mae rhieni o Ysgol Trewyddel yn bresennol yn y Siambra heddiw ac y maent yn teimlo y byddai'r fath grant yn ddefnyddiol wrth ystyried y posibilrwydd o ddatblygu ysgol gynradd, sydd yn awr o dan fygythiad, i fod yn ysgol gymuned, ac yn adnodd i'r gymuned. A gytunwch y byddai'r fath gam yn ddefnydd da o'r grant hwn ac y dylid gohirio unrhyw benderfyniad i gau ysgol tan

cefnogi cymeradwyo'r adroddiad grant arbennig hwn. Ceir dwy ran i fy sylwadau ar yr adroddiad grant arbennig, gan gyfeirio, fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog, at y meysydd gweithgaredd a geir yng ngholofnau cyllid A a B ar wahân.

Defnyddir y grantiau dan golofn B, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, i sicrhau y gellir casglu data'n llawer mwy effeithiol mewn ysgolion, gan ddefnyddio'r caledwedd a'r meddalwedd technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu diweddaraf, a throsglwyddo'r wybodaeth honno'n electronig. Cyfeiria'r adroddiad grant at hyfforddi staff i ddefnyddio'r offer hyn, sydd yn amlwg yn hanfodol. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd yr hyfforddiant hwnnw'n cynnwys mewnbwn priodol ar oblygiadau Deddf Diogelu Data 1998 i staff ac ysgolion sy'n defnyddio cyfrifiaduron i gasglu, cadw a rhannu gwybodaeth ar ddisgyblion. Amheuaf y bydd llawer o staff, yn enwedig mewn ysgolion cynradd, yn gwneud hynny am y tro cyntaf. Gallai goblygiadau'r Ddeddf i ysgolion fod yn sylweddol a rhaid i staff fod yn gwbl ymwybodol ohonynt, yn enwedig wrth drosglwyddo data rhwng ysgolion.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r cyllid ychwanegol dan golofn A i gefnogi ysgolion—yn enwedig ysgolion bach a gwledig—i geisio ffyrdd arloesol o gydweithio. Er hynny, mae gennyf bryderon, y gwahoddaf y Gweinidog i'w hateb yn ei hymateb. Gall natur rhai o'r gweithgareddau a ddyfynnwyd fel engrheifftiau a fyddai'n gymwys i dderbyn arian, megis costau gweinyddol rheoli newid, fod â goblygiadau ariannol y tu hwnt i'r flwyddyn ariannol pan delir y grantiau hyn. A fydd awdurdodau'n gallu gwneud ceisiadau am arian tebyg yn y blynnyddoedd wedi hynny i ariannu prosesau newid o'r dechrau i'r diwedd?

**Cynog Dafis:** As Helen Mary Jones knows, parents from Moylegrove School are present in the Chamber today and they feel that such a grant would be helpful when considering the possibility of developing a primary school, which is currently under threat, as a community school and as a resource for the community. Do you agree that such a measure would represent a good use of this grant and that any decision to close a school

bo'r posibiliadau wedi'u harchwilio gyda'r math hwn o gymorth ariannol?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cytunaf, yn naturiol, a mawr obeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn dod o hyd i amser i ateb y pwynt hwnnw wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon.

The need for these additional funds in itself raises questions about the inability of local authorities to meet such innovative costs from core funding. It also raises questions about the extent to which issues of rurality are effectively addressed in the current funding formulae. I expect that we will return to consider these issues.

I would also be interested to hear the Minister's views on the extent to which there is a widespread desire in local government in Wales to take advantage of this scheme to facilitate the development—indeed survival—of smaller and rural schools. I submit that the experience of parents and communities across Wales suggests that there are authorities that are determined to rush towards closure for purely economic and administrative, rather than educational, reasons.

Will the Minister clarify what the position would be if, for example, the governors of a group of schools wished to access these funds to enable them to develop a federation in the face of a local authority's decision to close? Would they be able to make a direct bid to the Government of Wales for these resources without the authority's support? If not, how will these grants support genuinely grassroots schemes? I am pleased about what the Minister said about issuing new guidance with regard to closure. I put it to her that governors, communities and local authorities would benefit from much clearer and more detailed guidance from the Assembly on the nature of the consultation that should be undertaken if there are proposals for closure, particularly about what issues should be covered and how authorities can ensure that all options are fairly presented in consultation.

should be deferred until the possibilities afforded by this kind of financial aid have been examined?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Naturally, I agree, and I hope that the Minister finds time to address that point in her response to the debate.

Mae'r angen am yr arian ychwanegol hwn ynddo'i hun yn codi cwestiynau am anallu awdurdodau lleol i dalu costau arloesi o'r fath o'u cyllid craidd. Mae'n codi cwestiynau hefyd ynghylch i ba raddau yr ymdrinnir â'r materion sy'n codi mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn effeithiol yn y fformiwlâu ariannu cyfredol. Disgwyliaf y deuwn yn ôl i ystyried y materion hyn.

Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb hefyd mewn clywed sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynghylch i ba raddau y mae awydd eang mewn llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru i fanteisio ar y cynllun hwn i hwyluso datblygiad—goroesiad, yn wir—ysgolion bach a gwledig. Awgrymaf fod profiad rhieni a chymunedau ledled Cymru'n awgrymu bod rhai awdurdodau sy'n benderfynol o ruthro tuag at gau am resymau economaidd a gweinyddol pur, yn hytrach na rhai addysgol.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro beth fyddai'r sefyllfa pe bai, er enghraift, llywodraethwyr grŵp o ysgolion eisiau cael rhywfaint o'r arian hwn i'w galluogi i ddatblygu ffederasiwn yn wyneb penderfyniad awdurdod lleol i gau? A fyddent yn gallu gwneud cais uniongyrchol i Lywodraeth Cymru am yr adnoddau hyn heb gefnogaeth yr awdurdod? Os na, sut y gwnaiff y grantiau hyn gefnogi cynlluniau sydd wirioneddol yn tarddu o'r cymunedau? Yr wyf yn falch ynghylch yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog am gyhoeddi canllawiau newydd ynglŷn â chau. Cynigiaf iddi hi y byddai llywodraethwyr, cymunedau ac awdurdodau lleol yn elwa ar ganllawiau llawer cliriach a mwy manwl gan y Cynulliad ar natur yr ymgynghori a ddylai ddigwydd os oes cynigion i gau, yn enwedig o ran pa faterion y dylid ymdrin â hwy a sut y gall awdurdodau sicrhau y cyflwynir y dewisiadau i gyd yn deg wrth ymgynghori.

4:10 p.m.

It has been suggested that recent consultations in Carmarthenshire have failed to adequately present the option of federation. Without wishing to invite the Minister to comment on particular cases—I fully understand that she cannot do so—she and her officials should consider recent consultation processes before they issue the new guidance, with a view to learning lessons. I firmly believe that clearer, stronger, central guidance is urgently needed, and would be of benefit to all. I look forward to the Minister's response, and I commend this special grant report to the National Assembly.

**Nick Bourne:** I will reiterate some of Cynog Dafis's points, because they are important to the Moylegrove primary school parents and governors who are here today. It is an excellent local school. I realise that the Minister cannot say anything about this issue, as she will decide on the appeal. I welcome much of what she said in her statement, but Moylegrove school, which I have visited, is already doing much of what she was talking about. I hope that she will bear that in mind when she decides on the appeal. This issue has cross-party support. I believe that Delyth Evans, as a local Assembly Member, is supporting this school, and I hope that all of this can be borne in mind when the decision is reached.

I disagreed with one point in the Minister's statement, when she talked about having a light touch. That did not ring true with some of her previous statements. I encourage her to have a firmer touch in relation to this matter, because the policy is patchy. Pembrokeshire, I regret, takes an axe to many excellent rural schools, which is not the policy in Powys or elsewhere. I believe that we need a national position so that we do not suffer such great discrepancies between different areas. I am not sure that local education authorities always take decisions that accord with what their electors want, which is what we should try to reflect here.

**Mick Bates:** On behalf of the Welsh Liberal

Awgrymwyd fod ymgynghori diweddar yn Sir Gaerfyrddin wedi methu cyflwyno opsiwn ffedereiddio yn ddigonol. Heb ddymuno gwahodd y Gweinidog i roi sylw ar achosion penodol—deallaf yn iawn na all hi wneud hynny—dylai hi a'i swyddogion ystyried prosesau ymgynghori diweddar cyn cyhoeddi canllawiau newydd, gyda golwg ar ddysgu gwersi. Credaf yn gryf fod angen canllawiau canolog cliriach a chryfach ar fyrder, ac y byddent o fudd i bawb. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb y Gweinidog, a chymeradwyaf yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

**Nick Bourne:** Ailadroddaf rai o bwyntiau Cynog Dafis, oherwydd maent yn bwysig i rieni a llywodraethwyr ysgol gynradd Trewyddel sydd yma heddiw. Mae'n ysgol leol ardderchog. Sylweddolaf na all y Gweinidog ddweud dim am y mater hwn, gan mai hi fydd yn penderfynu ar yr apêl. Croesawaf lawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd yn ei datganiad, ond mae ysgol Trewyddel, yr wyf fi wedi ymweld â hi, eisoes yn gwneud llawer o'r hyn yr oedd hi'n siarad amdano. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff hi gofio hynny pan benderfyna ar yr apêl. Mae gan y mater hwn gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol. Credaf fod Delyth Evans, fel Aelod Cynulliad lleol, yn cefnogi'r ysgol hon, a gobeithiaf y gellir cofio hyn i gyd pan wneir y penderfyniad.

Anghytunais ag un pwyt yn natganiad y Gweinidog, pan soniodd am gyffyrddiad ysgafn. Nid oedd hynny'n taro deuddeg gyda rhai o'i datganiadau blaenorol. Anogaf hi i fod â chyffyrddiad cadarnach yn y mater hwn, oherwydd mae'r polisi'n dameidiog. Mae Sir Benfro, mae gennyl ofn, yn chwifio bwyell dros lawer o ysgolion gwledig ardderchog, nad yw'n bolisi ym Mhowys nac mewn mannau eraill. Credaf fod angen safbwyt cenedlaethol arnom fel na fyddwn yn dioddef cymaint o anghysonder rhwng gwahanol ardaloedd. Nid wyf yn siŵr fod awdurdodau addysg lleol bob amser yn gwneud penderfyniadau sy'n unol â'r hyn y mae ar eu hetholwyr ei eisiau, sef beth y dylem geisio'iadlewyrchu yma.

**Mick Bates:** Ar ran Democratiaid

Democrats, I welcome this special grant report. We are convinced that it is the beginning of an exemplary rural schools policy, which will be developed by the Assembly in years to come.

At this juncture, I recognise the efforts of many individuals and organisations that have long waited to see this development. I am pleased to have been a part of that process, and am proud of the part played by the Welsh Liberal Democrats in partnership with Labour in this Government.

I make special mention of the parents and wider community of Moylegrove school, on the Pembrokeshire coast. Other speakers have already made reference to the work of parents and the community there. They are an exemplar, I believe, of everything that we have fought for, to ensure that communities are encouraged to be innovative in looking for ways to retain their schools.

These schools are part of the fabric of our rural communities. They are the building blocks on which our culture, language and heritage rest. For many, schools have become the vehicle to retain these facets. Without the local school, transport becomes a key issue, acting as a disincentive for parents with young children to live in our rural communities. I was interested to hear the Minister say that, as part of her review of suggested closures, unnecessarily long journeys would be taken into account. We should hear more about the definition of unnecessarily long journeys.

In light of this document, is it also possible to ask authorities to review their closure programmes? We have several cases where authorities have implemented their closure programmes without due consideration being given to this special grant. It would be fitting for the Minister to remind them that a fund now exists to assist communities to sustain their schools.

Wherever we have schools that take up this innovative special grant, we should also look at how effectively that money is spent, to gain a better understanding of good practice, and how to encourage our small rural schools

Rhyddfrydol Cymru, croesawaf yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn. Yr ydym yn argyhoedddegig mai dyma ddechrau patrwm o bolisi ar ysgolion gwledig, a gaiff ei ddatblygu gan y Cynulliad yn y blynnyddoedd a ddaw.

Yn y fan yma, cydnabyddaf ymdrechion llawer o unigolion a chyrff sydd wedi aros yn hir i weld y datblygiad hwn. Yr wyf yn falch o fod wedi bod yn rhan o'r broses honno, ac yn falch o'r rhan a chwaraewyd gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru mewn partneriaeth â Llafur yn y Llywodraeth hon.

Hoffwn sôn yn arbennig am rieni a chymuned ehangach ysgol Trewyddel, ar arfordir Sir Benfro. Mae siaradwyr eraill eisoes wedi cyfeirio at waith y rhieni a'r gymuned yn y fan honno. Maent yn esiampl, fe gredaf, o bopeth yr ydym wedi ymladd drosto, i sicrhau yr anogir cymunedau i fod yn arloesol wrth edrych am ffyrdd i gadw'u hysgolion ar agor.

Mae'r ysgolion hyn yn rhan o wead ein cymunedau gwledig. Y rhain yw'r blociau adeiladu y mae'n diwylliant, ein hiaith a'n treftadaeth yn gorffwys arnynt. I lawer, ysgolion yw'r modd bellach i gynnal yr agweddu hyn. Heb yr ysgol leol, aiff cludiant yn broblem fawr, gan gymhell rhieni â phlant ifanc i beidio â byw yn ein cymunedau gwledig. Diddorol i mi oedd clywed y Gweinidog yn dweud y byddai, fel rhan o'i hadolygiad o raglenni cau awgrymedig, yn ystyried siwrneiau diangen o faith. Dylem glywed rhagor am y diffiniad o siwrneiau diangen o faith.

Yng ngoleuni'r ddogfen hon, a oes modd hefyd ofyn i awdurdodau adolygu eu rhaglenni cau? Cawsom sawl achos lle mae awdurdodau wedi gweithredu'u rhaglenni cau heb roi ystyriaeth ddyledus i'r grant arbennig hwn. Byddai'n addas i'r Gweinidog eu hatgoffa fod cronfa ar gael bellach i helpu cymunedau i gynnal eu hysgolion.

Lle bynnag y bydd gennym ysgolion sy'n manteisio ar y grant arbennig arloesol hwn, dylem edrych hefyd ar ba mor effeithiol y gwerir yr arian hwnnw, er mwyn cael gwell dealltwriaeth o arfer da, a sut i annog ein

to continue in existence. Thus far, little work has been undertaken to assess the economic, environmental and cultural impact of small rural schools and how these communities sustain themselves.

Thirdly, I would like an answer to what Helen Mary referred to earlier, namely the commitment to future budgets that may result from accepting money to consider innovative ways of continuing schools. There is an implication for future budgets, which we must answer before taking this first tranche of the money. I was heartened by the thanks that were sent to the Minister by Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg. I support its fine words—*[Interruption.]*

**Glyn Davies:** What about its actions?

**Mick Bates:** I do not support all of its actions. However, that is another issue, which we will leave for now. I support its fine words of encouragement to the Minister in bringing forward this special grant. The grant and its policies will bring credit to the Assembly and will develop into a major tool to sustain not only our schools, but also our language and our communities.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am interested in the report's definition of rurality. There are many examples where the problems facing rural communities are similar to those faced by many isolated and socially deprived communities in our valleys. When I looked at the supporting documents, I was unable to see precisely and transparently whether or not areas such as Neath Port Talbot would be eligible for the grants. For example, the document states that a 70 per cent weight is given for sparsity, 20 per cent is given for small schools and 10 per cent for deprivation. It also gives the figure for the amount of people, who live outside settlements, needed to support a school: 1,000 for primary schools and 7,500 for secondary schools. Many geographical isolated communities in our valleys would be eligible under this scheme. Will the Minister confirm that they are as eligible for this scheme as are many other areas in Wales?

hysgolion gwledig bach i barhau i fodoli. Hyd yma, ychydig o waith a wnaethwyd i asesu effaith economaidd, amgylcheddol a diwylliannol ysgolion gwledig bach a sut y mae'r cymunedau hyn yn cynnal eu hunain.

Yn drydydd, hoffwn gael ateb i'r hyn y cyfeiriodd Helen Mary ato'n gynharach, sef yr ymrwymiad i gyllidebau yn y dyfodol a all ddeillio o dderbyn arian i ystyried ffyrdd arloesol o gadw ysgolion ar agar. Mae goblygiad i gyllidebau'r dyfodol, y mae'n rhaid inni ei ateb cyn cymryd y gyfran gyntaf hon o'r arian. Fe'm calonogwyd gan y diolch a anfonwyd at y Gweinidog gan Gymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg. Cefnogaf ei geiriau da—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Glyn Davies:** Beth am ei gweithredoedd?

**Mick Bates:** Nid wyf yn cefnogi ei gweithredoedd i gyd. Fodd bynnag, mater arall yw hynny, un y gadawn ni am y tro. Cefnogaf ei geiriau da o anogaeth i'r Gweinidog wrth iddi gyflwyno'r grant arbennig hwn. Bydd y grant a'i bolisiau'n dod â chlod i'r Cynulliad ac yn datblygu'n arf bwysig i gynnal nid yn unig ein hysgolion, ond hefyd ein hiaith a'n cymunedau.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn niffiniad yr adroddiad o wledigrwydd. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau lle mae'r problemau sy'n wynebu cymunedau gwledig yn debyg i'r rhai a wynebir gan lawer o gymunedau ynysig a chymdeithasol ddifreintiedig yn ein cymoedd. Pan edrychais ar y dogfennau atodol, ni allwn weld yn union ac yn amlwg a fyddai ardaloedd fel Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn gymwys i dderbyn y grantiau ai peidio. Er enghraifft, dywed y ddogfen y rhoddir pwysau o 70 y cant am deneurwydd poblogaeth, 20 y cant am ysgolion bychain a 10 y cant am amddifadedd. Mae'n rhoi'r ffigur hefyd am y nifer o bobl, yn byw y tu allan i bentrefi neu drefi, sydd eu hangen i gynnal ysgol: 1,000 i ysgolion cynradd a 7,500 i ysgolion uwchradd. Byddai llawer o gymunedau daearyddol ynysig yn ein cymoedd yn gymwys dan y cynllun hwn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau eu bod yr un mor gymwys ar gyfer y cynllun hwn ag ydyw llawer o ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru?

**Jonathan Morgan:** I will ask a few questions. In terms of the money that has been allocated, I notice that the document states that the money will, in the main, go to schools. However, that seems to indicate that a proportion could be held centrally by local education authorities for whatever purposes they determine. In terms of this statement, it seems that it would be better if all of the money went directly to schools, though obviously it would have to go through the LEAs, because they would know how best to spend it. Will you set a minimum delegation rate? Mine would be 100 per cent, but will you set one to ensure that the bulk of the money goes directly to the schools concerned? I am not convinced by the amount that has been allocated, particularly the £2 million under column A. I do not know whether that will be sufficient, but we will support it if it lays the foundations for future allocations. If clustering, federation and information technology are possible solutions to the problems faced by small and rural schools, how many small and rural schools do you anticipate being saved? We know that many small schools face the prospect of closure. How many will be saved under this policy?

You announced the status of the consultation process some months ago, but I did not know whether that process has been concluded and its results included in any forward work—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Jonathan, you make great play of the need to safeguard small rural schools but, at the same time, you want money to go directly to those schools. Will you accept that the schools that are most dependent on the services offered by the LEAs are the small rural schools? If you take LEA funding away, those schools will not be able to exist.

4:20 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I do not know whether you were listening. I did not say that we favoured getting rid of LEAs. I said that the people who are best placed to spend education money are those who deliver the service on the ground. Many people who

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf am ofyn ychydig o gwestiynau. O ran yr arian a ddyrannwyd, sylwaf fod y ddogfen yn dweud yr aiff yr arian, yn bennaf, i ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny fel pe bai'n awgrymu y gallai cyfran gael ei dal yn ganolog gan awdurdodau addysg lleol i ba bynnag ddibenion a benderfynant. Yn nhermau'r datganiad hwn, mae'n ymddangos y byddai'n well pe bai'r holl arian yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion, er yn amlwg y byddai'n rhaid iddo fynd drwy'r AALLau, gan y byddent hwy'n gwybod sut orau i'w wario. A wnewch chi osod cyfradd isaf i'w ddirprwyo? Cant y cant fyddai fy nghyfradd i, ond a wnewch chi bennu un er mwyn sierhau yr aiff swmp yr arian yn uniongyrchol i'r ysgolion dan sylw? Nid wyf yn argyhoedddeg gan y swm a ddyrannwyd, yn enwedig y £2 filiwn o dan golofn A. Ni wn a fydd hynny'n ddigon, ond fe'i cefnogwn os bydd yn gosod y sylfeini ar gyfer dyraniadau yn y dyfodol. Os yw clystyru, ffedereiddio a thechnoleg gwybodaeth yn atebion posibl i'r problemau a wynebir gan ysgolion bach a gwledig, sawl ysgol fach a gwledig y rhagwelwch y caint eu hachub? Gwyddom fod llawer o ysgolion bach yn wynebu cael eu cau. Faint ohonynt a achubir dan y polisi hwn?

Cyhoeddasoch statws y broses ymgynghori rai misoedd yn ôl, ond ni chefais wybod a gwblhawyd y broses honno a chynnwys ei chanlyniadau mewn unrhyw waith dilynol—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Jonathan, yr ydych chi'n gwneud yn fawr o'r angen i ddiogelu ysgolion bach gwledig ond, ar yr un pryd, mae arnoch eisiau i arian fynd yn uniongyrchol i'r ysgolion hynny. A dderbyniwch mai'r ysgolion sy'n fwyaf dibynnol ar y gwasanaethau a gynigir gan yr AALLau yw'r ysgolion bach gwledig? Os cymerwch gyllid yr awdurdod lleol i ffwrdd, ni fydd yr ysgolion hynny'n gallu bodoli.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ni wn a oeddech yn gwrando. Ni ddywedais ein bod o blaids cael gwared o AALLau. Dywedais mai'r bobl sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i wario arian addysg yw'r rhai sy'n rhoi'r gwasanaeth ar y ddaear. Gall llawer o bobl sy'n darparu addysg ddewis sut

deliver education can choose how to spend the money. I have no problem with those schools that choose to contract services provided by the LEAs. There are many good LEAs in Wales, and there are some poor ones. However, when you allocate a specific amount of money, albeit a small amount, that money should be directed to schools for them to decide how to spend it.

There is a large wish list in this document, and we expect it all to be achieved through £2 million of expenditure. That is a small sum of money. The schools are best placed to spend that money. Will the Minister indicate whether further funding will be made available in the future, particularly to alleviate the burden on headteachers? I am pleased to see this item in the document, but the scheme could be extended. For example, teachers, particularly headteachers, spend much of their time dealing with behavioural problems in their schools, and dealing with pupils who have poor behaviour, who cannot cope with being taught on the school site. Much of the classroom teacher's time and the headteacher's time is taken up in dealing with discipline. It might be the case in future that further funding arrangements could be made, and extended to provide additional assistance for a wide range of burdens faced by headteachers and teachers. We look forward to the guidance being issued and to giving further support to the Government in this policy area.

**Delyth Evans:** Croesawaf y grant arbennig hwn ac ymdrechion y Gweinidog i ddatblygu strategaeth newydd ar ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig. Mae hyn yn engraifft arbennig o dda o sut y mae'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn datblygu agenda newydd sy'n berthnasol i Gymru ac sy'n ymateb i anghenion arbennig ein cymunedau yng Nghymru.

Canolbwytiaf ar dri phwynt a wnaethoch, Jane. Yn gyntaf, y pwyslais arbennig a roesoch ar yr angen i ystyried pwysigrwydd yr ysgol i'r gymuned leol. Mae hynny'n bwysig dros ben. Yn ail, tanlinelloch y ffaith fod angen i'r arian hwn fynd yn uniongyrchol i'r ysgolion fel y gallant elwa'n llawn ohono. Hefyd, dywedasoch y byddai hyn yn rhoi llai

i wario'r arian. Nid oes gennyf fi ddim problem gyda'r ysgolion hynny sy'n dewis contractio gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan AAllau. Mae llawer o AAllau da yng Nghymru, ac mae ambell un gwael. Fodd bynnag, pan ddyrannwch swm penodol o arian, er mai swm bychan ydyw, yna dylai'r arian hwnnw gael ei gyfeirio i ysgolion iddynt hwy benderfynu sut i'w wario.

Ceir rhestr ddymuniadau hir yn y ddogfen hon, ac yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r cyfan gael ei gyflawni drwy wario £2 filiwn. Swm bach o arian yw hynny. Yr ysgolion sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i wario'r arian hwnnw. A wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi a fydd arian pellach yn cael ei ddarparu yn y dyfodol, yn enwedig i ysgafnu'r baich ar brifathrawon? Yr wyf yn falch o weld yr eitem hon yn y ddogfen, ond gellid ymestyn y cynllun. Er engraifft, bydd athrawon, a phrifathrawon yn enwedig, yn treulio llawer o'u hamser yn delio â phroblemau ymddygiad yn eu hysgolion, ac yn delio â disgyblion sydd ag ymddygiad gwael, sy'n methu ymdopi â chael eu dysgu ar safle'r ysgol. Cymerir llawer o amser yr athro neu athrawes dosbarth a'r prifathro neu brifathrawes gan ddyletswyddau disgyblu. Yn y dyfodol efallai y gellid gwneud trefniadau ariannu pellach, a'u hymestyn i ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol tuag at amrediad eang o feichiau sy'n wynebu prifathrawon ac athrawon. Edrychwn ymlaen at gyhoeddi'r canllawiau ac at roi rhagor o gefnogaeth i'r Llywodraeth yn y maes polisi hwn.

**Delyth Evans:** I welcome this special grant and the Minister's efforts to develop a new strategy for small and rural schools. This is an exceptionally good example of how the Assembly and the Assembly Government is developing a new agenda that is relevant to Wales and which responds to the particular needs of our communities in Wales.

I will concentrate on three points that you made, Jane. First, the particular emphasis you placed on the need to consider the importance of the school to the local community. That is exceptionally important. Secondly, you underlined the fact that this money needs to go directly to schools so that they can benefit in full from it. Also, you said that that would

o bwysau gweinyddol ar ysgolion. Mae hynny'n bwysig, a byddem i gyd am weld hynny.

Croesawaf y pwyslais yn eich dogfen bolisi ar ddatblygu ffyrdd newydd o weithio a chydweithio rhwng ysgolion, ac ar yr angen i ymateb yn greadigol i heriau darparu addysg mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Nid yw awdurdodau lleol bob amser, neu ddim eto, wedi deall yn llwyr yr agenda newydd a osodir yn y Cynulliad. Maent yn dal i fod yn sownd yn yr hen ffyrdd o edrych ar ddarparu addysg. Fe'ch anogaf i bwyo'n gryf arnynt yr angen i fod yn fentrus ac yn greadigol, ac nid i ddilyn trywydd cau ysgolion a chwarae cymunedau yn erbyn ei gilydd heb eu bod yn rhoi ystyriaeth ddigonol i'r opsiynau eraill sydd ar gael.

Yr ydym wedi clywed y prynhawn yma am ysgol Trewyddel. Talaf deyrnged i waith fy nghyd-Aelod, Richard Edwards, sydd wedi gweithio'n galed ar ran yr ysgol hon, ac sydd wedi ysgrifennu atoch ac wedi siarad â chi am yr ysgol, Jane. Gwn na allwch ymateb yn benodol ar yr ysgol. Fodd bynnag, dyma enghrafft o ysgol sydd wedi gwneud ymdrech arbennig i ddilyn yr agenda newydd hon yr ydych yn ceisio ei gosod, drwy ddatblygu cynllun mentrus a blaengar i gydweithio ag ysgolion eraill ac i ymestyn rôl yr ysgol fel adnodd cymunedol. Yn anffodus, mae'r cyngor lleol am gau'r ysgol, ac mae hyn dan apêl.

Mae angen inni ddatblygu modelau newydd. Yr ydym yn hoffi sôn llawer am bweru cymunedau. Gadewch inni brofi ein bod yn credu'n wirioneddol yn y cysyniad hwnnw drwy gefnogi mentrau fel un ysgol Trewyddel, a gadael i gymunedau lleol fynd i'r afael â'r cwestiynau pwysig hyn ynglŷn â darpariaeth addysg ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Croesawn y swm newydd o arian a gyhoeddwyd heddiw. Fodd bynnag, a fydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau addysg lleol, sy'n gweinyddu addysg o fewn eu rhanbarthau, yn glir ynglŷn â sut y mae'r arian newydd hwn yn bodoli ochr yn ochr â'r arian arall sydd ar gael? Mae'n bwysig bod y Gweinidog yn trafod gyda'r awdurdodau hyn ac yn sicrhau bod y

place less of an administrative burden on schools. That is important, and we would all want to see that.

I welcome the emphasis in your policy document on developing new ways of working and collaboration between schools, and on the need to respond creatively to the challenge of providing education in rural areas. Local authorities have not always understood the new agenda that has been put forward in the Assembly. Their ideas on the provision of education remain entrenched. I encourage you to impress strongly on them the need to be innovative and creative, and not to follow the path of closing schools and playing communities against each other without giving due consideration to the other options available.

We have heard this afternoon about Moylgrove school. I pay tribute to the work of my fellow Member, Richard Edwards, who has worked tirelessly on behalf of this school, and has written and spoken to you about the school, Jane. I know that you cannot refer specifically to the school. However, this is an example of a school that has made a great effort to follow this new agenda that you are trying to implement, through developing an innovative and progressive scheme to co-operate with other schools and to extend the school's role as a community resource. Unfortunately, the local council wishes to close the school, and this is under appeal.

We need to develop new models. We make constant reference to empowering communities. Let us prove that we really believe in that concept through supporting initiatives such as the one in Moylgrove school, and allowing local communities to get to grips with these important questions on the provision of education for the future.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We welcome the new funding announced today. However, will the Minister ensure that local education authorities, which must administer education within their regions, are clear as to how this new funding will co-exist with other available funding? It is important that the Minister holds discussions with these authorities to ensure that everything is co-

cyfan yn cael ei gydlyn. Nid ydym am weld sefyllfa lle mae rhai ysgolion yn ceisio am swm o arian a bod yr awdurdod yn llunio strategaeth heb ystyried hynny. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo i ymgynghoriad llawn gyda'r awdurdodau addysg lleol?

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I will start with the data protection issue, which Helen Mary Jones raised. You are right, it is a key issue. We will develop strict data sharing protocols and put appropriate security measures in place to ensure that the rights of pupils and parents are protected. The pupil identifiers used for this project will not be used for any other administrative records. The project team is already in regular dialogue with the information commissioner, and no aspect of the project will progress without her approval. I am committed to improving our evidence base and our data systems, but I am also firmly committed to having the right kind of strict controls in place for the Government's role in collecting and using data. That is why it is appropriate that we have clear guidance and training.

In terms of the broader points that Helen made about financing this policy, I am announcing £3.2 million today, £2 million of which is for the rural and small schools agenda, and £1.2 million for the pupil number identifier process. Next year, there will be £3.2 million in the budget for rural and small schools development. We wanted to ensure that we were putting sufficient money on the table to ensure that schools and local authorities can work together—as Helen and Cynog said—and can consider changes in arrangements over a financial year. We can reconsider that.

I am grateful that Assembly Members realise that I cannot comment on individual schools. However, I reassure Members that we issued draft guidance in October last year and that, broadly speaking, the majority of the responses to it were positive. The decisions that I make in a quasi-judicial role as Minister will be made in line with the guidance circular that we are about to issue. That circular contains little changes to the

ordinated. We do not want a situation where some schools apply for a sum of money that the authority does not take into account when creating its strategy. Will the Minister commit herself to a full consultation with local education authorities?

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Dechreuaf gyda'r cwestiwn diogelu data, a godwyd gan Helen Mary Jones. Yr ydych yn iawn, mae'n fater allweddol. Byddwn yn datblygu protocolau llym ar rannu data ac yn sefydlu mesurau diogelwch priodol i sicrhau y gwarchodir hawliau disgylion a rhieni. Ni fydd y dynodwyr disgylion a ddefnyddir ar gyfer y prosiect hwn yn cael eu defnyddio ar gyfer unrhyw gofnodion gweinyddol eraill. Mae'r tîm prosiect eisoes mewn deialog rheolaidd gyda'r comisiynydd gwybodaeth, ac ni symudir ymlaen gydag unrhyw agwedd ar y prosiect heb ei chymeradwyaeth hi. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i wella ein sylfaen dystiolaeth a'n systemau data, ond yr wyf hefyd wedi ymrwymo'n gadarn i gael y math cywir o fesurau rheoli yn eu lle ar gyfer rôl y Llywodraeth o ran casglu a defnyddio data. Dyna pam y mae'n briodol inni gael canllawiau clir a hyfforddiant.

O ran y pwyntiau ehangach a wnaeth Helen yngylch ariannu'r polisi hwn, yr wyf yn cyhoeddi £3.2 miliwn heddiw, £2 filiwn ohono ar gyfer yr agenda ysgolion gwledig a bychain, ac £1.2 miliwn ar gyfer y broses dynodi niferoedd disgylion. Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd £3.2 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer datblygu ysgolion gwledig a bychain. Yr oedd arnom eisiau sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi digon o arian ar y bwrdd i sicrhau y gall ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol weithio gyda'i gilydd—fel y dywedodd Helen a Cynog—ac y gallant ystyried newid trefniadau dros flwyddyn ariannol. Gallwn ailystyried hynny.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar fod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn sylweddoli na allaf roi sylwadau ar ysgolion unigol. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn sicrhau Aelodau y cyhoeddasm ganllawiau drafat ym mis Hydref y llynedd, a bod y rhan fwyaf o'r ymatebion iddynt, a siarad yn gyffredinol, yn rhai cadarnhaol. Bydd y penderfyniadau a wnaef fi mewn rôl led-farnwrol fel Gweinidog yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r cylchlythyr canllawiau yr

one that members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee debated in October and which they broadly welcomed.

Helen Mary also suggested that closure proposals were based on economic and administrative grounds rather than educational ones. We have been clear in the Assembly that educational grounds are paramount. That is important. As the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, I would not normally be prepared to approve the closure of a popular and effective school, unless there was evidence that the alternative provision would offer at least the equivalent quality and diversity of education at a lower total cost. We also require the impact on the local community to be considered. However, the educational considerations are paramount.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I accept that you have made your position clear on that. However, the experience of some local communities and school governors suggest that, in some local authorities, it is perceived that there is an administrative and economic sub-text to what the local authority tries to do. I suggested that, in creating your central guidance, you should be clear that local authorities cannot run with sub-texts and that options should be genuinely consulted upon. I am sure that you will be able to address that in the new guidance.

**Jane Davidson:** Before you joined us, Helen Mary, the Education and Lifelong Committee examined the issue of school places closely. Committee members were faced with some unpalatable evidence about the costs of small schools. You cannot make any general statement about the quality of education in any school related to size. It is about how teaching operates in the school, and about how the school relates to its community. That is why we need an inspection system that can draw such evidence out.

4:30 p.m.

School stock throughout Wales is being examined under asset management plans, although many Members will know that the

ydym ar fin ei gyhoeddi. Ychydig sydd yn wahanol yn y cylchlythyr hwnnw i'r un a drafododd aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ym mis Hydref gan roi croeso cyffredinol iddo.

Awgrymodd Helen Mary hefyd fod cynigion i gau yn seiliedig ar resymau economaidd a gweinyddol yn hytrach nag addysgol. Yr ydym wedi bod yn glir yn y Cynulliad mai seiliau addysgol sydd oruchaf. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Fel Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ni fyddwn fel rheol yn barod i gymeradwyo cau ysgol boblogaidd ac effeithiol, oni bai fod dystiolaeth y byddai'r hyn a ddarperid yn ei lle yn cynnig addysg a fyddai o leiaf yn gyfwerth o ran ansawdd ac amrywiaeth, a hynny am gyfanswm cost is. Byddwn hefyd yn mynnu yr ystyriwr yr effaith ar y gymuned leol. Fodd bynnag, yr ystyriaethau addysgol sydd bwysicaf oll.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Derbyniaf eich bod wedi datgan eich safbwyt yn glir ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae profiad rhai cymunedau a llywodraethwyr ysgol lleol yn awgrymu y teimlir mewn rhai awdurdodau lleol fod is-destun gweinyddol ac economaidd i'r hyn y mae'r awdurdod lleol yn ceisio'i wneud. Awgrymais y dylech, wrth lunio'ch canllawiau canolog, fod yn glir na all awdurdodau lleol redeg gydag is-destunau ac y dylid ymgynghori'n ddidwyll ar yr opsiynau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwch roi sylw i hynny yn y canllawiau newydd.

**Jane Davidson:** Cyn ichi ymuno â ni, Helen Mary, edrychodd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn fanwl ar gwestiwn lleoedd mewn ysgolion. Bu raid i aelodau'r Pwyllgor wynebu dystiolaeth annifyr ynglŷn â chostau ysgolion bychain. Ni allwch wneud unrhyw ddatganiad cyffredinol ynghylch ansawdd addysg mewn unrhyw ysgol mewn perthynas â'i maint. Mae'n ymwneud â'r modd y mae dysgu'n gweithio yn yr ysgol, ac â'r berthynas rhwng yr ysgol a'i chymuned. Dyna pam mae arnom angen system arolygu a all ganfod y dystiolaeth honno.

Caiff y stoc ysgolion ledled Cymru ei harchwilio dan gynlluniau rheoli asedau, er y bydd llawer o Aelodau'n gwybod bod y term

term ‘liability management plans’ may be more appropriate for the stock of some schools in Wales. That is why we have pledged to get all schools fit for purpose by 2010. However, many small schools have appalling facilities. As the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, I will not advocate continuing with education in such facilities, nor will I make an automatic assumption that schools built in the nineteenth century serve the education agenda of the twenty-first century. That is why it is appropriate that we provide help and support, and that we also consider decisions on their individual merit.

Nick, I was interested to hear that you welcomed my reference to ‘a light touch’, although that may imply that you thought that I had a heavier touch in previous statements. My ‘light touch’ in this statement refers to encouraging innovation. This approach has never been taken in Wales before, nor anywhere in the UK; it is uniquely Welsh. We want schools, local education authorities and communities to consider together the kind of proposals that would be appropriate for federation, clustering and so on—we have used a general set of titles. If we were more prescriptive, we could end up editing out an approach that was working effectively. Therefore, the ‘light touch’ means that everyone who has an interest in the quality of education—because that is what this is about—is able to work together to develop that.

Mick, on the length of journeys to school, I know that you picked up on this issue in Committee at the time. If you remember, the draft guidance, which was strongly supported, suggested that, for primary school pupils, the journey should not exceed 45 minutes and, for secondary school pupils, no more than 60 minutes. That will be incorporated in the guidance. I will send a letter to all local education authorities clarifying how the new grant will be used; many Members commented on the importance of that. It will be up to the education authorities to decide whether the additional finance available makes them

‘cynlluniau rheoli rhwymedigaethau’ efallai’n fwy priodol ar gyfer stoc rhai ysgolion yng Nghymru. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi addunedu i sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn addas i’w phwrpas erbyn 2010. Fodd bynnag, mae gan lawer o ysgolion bychain gyfleusterau gwarthus. Fel Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ni wnaf siarad dros barhau i addysgu mewn cyfleusterau o’r fath, ac ni wnaf ragdybio’n awtomatig ychwaith fod ysgolion a adeiladwyd yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg yn gwasanaethu agenda addysg yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Dyna pam y mae’n briodol inni ddarparu cymorth a chefnogaeth, ac inni hefyd ystyried penderfyniadau yn ôl eu teilyngdod unigol.

Nick, diddorol oedd clywed eich bod yn croesawu fy nghyfeiriad at ‘gyffyrddiad ysgafn’, er y gallai hynny awgrymu eich bod yn meddwl bod gennyl gyffyrddiad trymach mewn datganiadau blaenorol. Mae fy ‘nghyffyrddiad ysgafn’ yn y datganiad hwn yn cyfeirio at annog arloesi. Nid yw’r ffordd hon erioed wedi ei chymryd yng Nghymru o’r blaen, nac yn unman yn y DU; mae’n unigryw Gymreig. Mae arnom eisiau i ysgolion, awdurdodau addysg lleol a chymunedau ystyried gyda’i gilydd y math o gynigion a fyddai’n briodol ar gyfer ffedereiddio, clystyru ac ati—yr ydym wedi defnyddio set gyffredinol o deitlau. Pe baem yn fwy cyfarwyddol, gallem yn y diwedd gau allan ddull a oedd yn gweithio’n effeithiol. Felly, ystyr y ‘cyffyrddiad ysgafn’ yw fod pawb sydd â diddordeb yn ansawdd addysg—oherwydd dyna sydd wrth wraidd hyn i gyd—yn gallu cydweithio i ddatblygu hynny.

Mick, ynghylch hyd siwrneiau i’r ysgol, gwn ichi godi’r testun hwn yn y Pwyllgor ar y pryd. Os cofiwrch, awgrymodd y canllawiau drafft, a gefnogwyd yn gryf, na ddylai’r siwrnai, i blant ysgol gynradd, fod yn hwy na 45 munud ac, i ddisgyblion ysgol uwchradd, dim mwy nag awr. Ymgorfforir hynny yn y canllawiau. Anfonaf lythyr at bob awdurdod addysg lleol yn egluro sut y defnyddir y grant newydd; nodwyd pwysigrwydd hynny gan sawl Aelod. Mater i’r awdurdodau addysg fydd penderfynu a fydd y cyllid ychwanegol sydd ar gael yn gwneud iddynt ailystyried eu penderfyniadau. Mater iddynt hwy yw hynny, oherwydd mae gan awdurdodau lleol olwg

reconsider their decisions. That is a matter for them, because local authorities have an overview of the educational provision in their area.

Brian, you will see from the grant's distribution that we have picked up on rurality, low school numbers—we have a large number of small schools throughout Wales—and deprivation. I felt that it was important to keep deprivation in this sum, so that some Valleys communities, which have similar problems to sparse communities, can act with sparse settlements. If you consider the grant distribution, you will see that sparsity and the issue of small schools are reflected in the sum for Valleys communities. I hope that you feel reassured by that. Holding a dialogue was also a strong principle.

Jonathan, once again you want money to go directly to schools, so that there is an individual amount per school. That would not be the most effective use of money if you want to consider new systems relating to federation, clustering, and, perhaps, proposals about non-educational new uses such as libraries, out-of-school childcare, and other community approaches. The local authorities—not local education authorities—need to work with the schools in terms of designing what the most appropriate—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I apologise Minister, but you have had nine minutes in addition to your time at the start of the debate. We have a minority party debate and a short debate to follow, which will require a procedural motion to extend the session. I would be grateful if you could draw your remarks to a close.

**Jane Davidson:** The consultation finished on 25 February. Schools will be required to tell us how they plan to spend the money in October. I agree with Delyth about the importance of schools engaging with communities and vice versa. I have spoken about community and lifelong learning in schools in Wales many times in this Chamber. We must operate that principle throughout Wales. I commend this special

gyffredinol ar y ddarpariaeth addysgol yn eu hardal.

Brian, fe welwch o ran dosbarthiad y grant ein bod wedi canolbwntio ar ysgolion gwledig, niferoedd disgylion isel—mae gennym nifer fawr o ysgolion bach ledled Cymru—ac amddifadedd. Teimlais ei bod yn bwysig cadw amddifadedd yn y swm hwn, fel y gall rhai cymunedau yn y Cymoedd, sydd â phroblemau tebyg i gymunedau tenau eu poblogaeth, weithredu gyda phentrefi tenau eu poblogaeth. Os ystyriwch ddosbarthiad y grant, fe welwch fod teneurwydd poblogaeth a mater ysgolion bychain wedi eu hadlewyrchu yn y swm i gymunedau'r Cymoedd. Gobeithio bod hynny'n tawelu'ch meddwl. Yr oedd cynnal deialog yn egwyddor bwysig hefyd.

Jonathan, unwaith eto yr ydych am i arian fynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion, fel bod swm unigol i bob ysgol. Nid dyna fyddai'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol i ddefnyddio arian os oes arnoch eisiau ystyried systemau newydd yn ymwneud â ffedereiddio, clystyru, ac, efallai, gynigion ar gyfer ambell ddefnydd newydd anaddysgol fel llyfrgelloedd, gofal plant y tu allan i'r ysgol, ac agweddau cymunedol eraill. Mae angen i'r awdurdodau lleol—nid yr awdurdodau addysg lleol—weithio gyda'r ysgolion o ran cynllunio beth fyddai fwyaf priodol—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ymddiheuraf, Weinidog, ond yr ydych wedi cael naw munud yn ychwanegol at eich amser ar ddechrau'r dadl. Mae gennym ddadl plaid leiafrifol a dadl fer i ddilyn, a bydd gofyn am gynnig trefniadol i ymestyn y cyfarfod. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddirwyn eich sylwadau i ben.

**Jane Davidson:** Daeth yr ymgynghori i ben ar 25 Chwefror. Bydd gofyn i ysgolion ddweud wrthym sut y bwriadant wario'r arian ym mis Hydref. Cytunaf â Delyth ynghylch pwysigrwydd bod ysgolion yn ymwneud â'u cymunedau ac i'r gwrthwyneb. Yr wyf wedi siarad am ddefnydd cymunedol a dysgu gydol oes mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru lawer gwaith yn y Siambra hon. Rhaid inni weithredu'r egwyddor honno drwy Gymru

grant report to you.

gyfan. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn ichi.

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru)**  
**Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

**Darlledu**  
**Broadcasting**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones, a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Yr wyf wedi gosod cyfyngiad amser o dri munud i bob siaradwr ac eithrio y rhai sy'n agor y ddadl, yn cynnig gwelliant neu'n siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cynigiaf fod  
*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

1. *yn nodi mawr bwysigrwydd darlledu i ansawdd bywyd y werin, i hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru ac i iechyd ein democraciaeth;*
2. *yn cydnabod yr angen am wasanaeth cenedlaethol integredig, gan gynnwys sianel deledu Saesneg i Gymru;*
3. *yn derbyn mewn egwyddor briodoldeb trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros ddarlledu a thelegyfathrebu yng Nghymru i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol;*
4. *yn cefnogi yn y cyfamser ddwyn y BBC o dan oruchwyliaeth y Swyddfa Gyfathrebu ac i sicrhau cynrychiolaeth Gymreig ar Ofcom;*

5. *yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gomisiynu astudiaeth drwyndl o'r opsiynau ar gyfer darlledu yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys dulliau cyllido ac ystyriaethau cyfreithiol.* (NDM1039)

Y mae'r ddadl hon yn amserol wrth ystyried y newyddion anffodus am ITV Digital a'r cysgod y mae methiant y cwmni hwnnw yn ei daflu dros gynlluniau Llywodraeth San Steffan i gyflwyno teledu digidol fel patrwm darlledu ar draws Prydain. Mae darlledu, a theledu yn enwedig, o ddiddordeb parhaol i'r rhan fwyaf ohonom. Mae'r cynnydd a wnaed o ran teledu digidol, a'r newid ym mhatriwm gwyliau llawer ohonom o ganlyniad, yn golygu bod nifer cynyddol o bobl yn troi at

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones, and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. I have set a time limit of three minutes for every speaker except those opening the debate, proposing an amendment or speaking on behalf of the Government.

**Owen John Thomas:** I propose that  
*the National Assembly*

1. *notes the major importance of broadcasting to the quality of life of the people, the cultural identity of Wales, and the health of our democracy;*
2. *recognises the need for an integrated national service, including an English-language channel for Wales;*
3. *accepts in principle the appropriateness of transferring responsibility for the regulation of broadcasting and communications to the National Assembly;*
4. *supports in the meanwhile bringing the BBC into the remit of the Office of Communications and to ensure Welsh representation on Ofcom;*
5. *calls upon the Government of Wales to commission a detailed study of the options for the future of broadcasting in Wales, including methods of funding and legal issues.* (NDM1039)

This debate is timely given the unfortunate news about ITV Digital and the shadow that the company's failure is casting over the Westminster Government's plans to introduce digital television as a broadcasting model across Britain. Broadcasting, and television in particular, is of continuing interest to most of us. The advancements in digital television, and the changes that this has brought about in many of our viewing patterns, mean that an increasing number of

sianelau masnachol a throi oddi wrth y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a fu'n asgwrn cefn i'r diwydiant a'n diwylliant ar lefel Brydeinig a Chymreig, yn Saesneg ac yn Gymraeg. Mae diogelu'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn ganolog i weledigaeth Plaid Cymru o ddyfodol darlleu yng Nghymru. Wrth adael darlleu yn nwyo cwmnïau preifat, mae perygl y bydd rhai o'r prif ffrydiau gwybodaeth, o newyddion i faterion cyfoes, yn diflannu mewn môr o ffilmiau a dramâu Eingl-Americanaid, cartwnau rhad a chwaraeon. Go brin y bydd Rupert Murdoch yn ceisio egluro i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru y dadleuon a gaiff eu cynnal yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n debyg y bydd gwasanaethau digidol masnachol yn cynnig llai o wir amrywiaeth, er yn costio llawer mwy i'w gwyllo gan greu elw mawr i'r cwmnïau sy'n eu darparu. Fel y dywedodd cadeirydd y BBC, Gavyn Davies, wrth gynulleidfa fforwm cyfryngau San Steffan yn ddiweddar:

'When you sample 200 channels, 10 seconds at a time, with your remote control in your hand, you can be forgiven for concluding that most of the output is of dubious quality'.

Teledu yw'r cyfrwng mwyaf pwerus i amlygu hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol, i gyfleo gwybodaeth am faterion cenedlaethol a chreu diddordeb ynddynt, boed yn ymneud â rygbi, drama, newyddion neu wleidyddiaeth. Mae'n than annatod o'n horiau hamdden ac yn fod o ddiogelu ein democratiaeth. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn cytuno ar hynny.

Yr hyn sydd ei angen arnom felly yw gwasanaeth cyflawn integredig i Gymru, gan gynnwys sianel deledu Saesneg i Gymru. Rhaid sicrhau bod y cyfrifoldeb dros ddarlledu a thelegyfathrebu yng Nghymru yn cael ei drosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yn y cyfamser, rhaid sicrhau bod cynrychiolaeth o Gymru ar Ofcom a bod y BBC yn dod o dan oruchwyliaeth y corff hwnnw. Mae angen cynnal astudiaeth fanwl o'r opsiynau sydd ar gael ar gyfer dyfodol darlleu yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys dulliau cyllido ac ystyriaethau cyfreithiol.

Cyfeiriaf at y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn enwau Carwyn Jones a Jonathan Morgan. Mae gwelliant 1, pwynt 2, yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd darlleu, ond nid yw'n cynnig unrhyw weledigaeth tymor hir. Mae'n osodiad na all neb ei wrthwynebu mewn

people are turning to commercial channels rather than the public services that have been the backbone of the industry and our culture on a British and Welsh level, in English and in Welsh. Safeguarding public service broadcasting is central to Plaid Cymru's vision for the future of broadcasting in Wales. By placing broadcasting solely in the hands of private companies, there is a danger that some of the main sources of information, from news to current affairs, will disappear in a sea of Anglo-American films and dramas, cheap cartoons and sport. It is unlikely that Rupert Murdoch will provide the Welsh public with analysis of the debates held in the Assembly. It is likely that commercial digital services will offer less real diversity, while costing much more to watch and generating great profit for the companies that provide them. As the chairman of the BBC, Gavyn Davies, said recently to the Westminster media forum:

Television is the most powerful medium to showcase cultural identity, to convey information and create interest in national issues, whether that involves rugby, drama, news or politics. It is an integral part of our leisure time and a means of safeguarding our democracy. I believe that we all agree on that.

Therefore, we need a comprehensive and integrated service for Wales, including an English language television channel for Wales. We must ensure that responsibility for broadcasting and telecommunications in Wales is transferred to the National Assembly. In the interim, we must ensure that Wales has a representative on Ofcom and that the BBC is brought under the remit of that body. We need to conduct a detailed study of the options available for the future of broadcasting in Wales, including methods of funding and legal considerations.

I will refer to the amendments tabled in the names of Carwyn Jones and Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1, point 2, acknowledges the importance of broadcasting, but does not offer any long-term vision. It is a statement that nobody

egwyddor, ond nid oes unrhyw beth ynddo gwerth ei gefnogi ychwaith. A yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn erbyn ein hawgrym o gael sianel Saesneg i Gymru? Os felly, rhowch eich rhesymau i'r genedl.

4:40 p.m.

Ynghylch pwynt 3, gwelliant 1 yr wyf yn falch bod y Comisiwn ar Bwerau'r Cynulliad, dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Arglwydd Richard, yn bwriadu cynnwys darlledu yn ei faes llafur. Gadewch inni, felly, lynu wrth ein galwad am drosglyddo cyfrifoldebau darlledu i'r Cynulliad. Bydd derbyn y cynnig yn cryfhau llaw y comisiwn.

Yr ydym bron yn gytûn ar bwynt 4, gwelliant 1. Yn sicr, mae angen cynrychiolaeth Gymreig ar Ofcom, ond credwn hefyd y dylai fod cysondeb, a dylai awdurdodau darlledu y BBC a theledu masnachol ddod o dan yr un oruchwyliaeth.

Gwendid pwynt 5, gwelliant 1, yw'r ffaith nad oes gan Cymru'n Creu ysgrifenyddiaeth. Mae ein cynnig yn galw ar y Cynulliad i roi ei adnoddau y tu ôl i'r astudiaeth, ond mae'r gwelliant yn gofyn i Cymru'n Creu ysgwyddo baich arall, heb, fel y dywedais, ysgrifenyddiaeth i'w gynorthwyo.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Did your party in Westminster call for the BBC to be brought under Ofcom?

**Owen John Thomas:** Nid oeddwn yn San Steffan ar y pryd; ni chofiaf. Ysgrifennaf atoch. [*Chwerthin*.]

Trof yn awr at welliannau'r Ceidwadwyr, nad ydynt yn ychwanegu dim at y ddadl. Maent yn ailwampio'r manion yn unig yn hytrach na gosod egwyddorion newydd. Yn wir, yr oedd eu canmoliaeth am S4C yn rhan o gynnig a dderbyniwyd dros flwyddyn yn ôl.

Dylai gwelliant 3 fod yn rhywbeth y gallwn ei gymryd yn ganiataol, ac mae gwelliant 4 yn aralleirio gwelliant Plaid Cymru a dderbyniwyd ym mis Chwefror 2001. Fodd bynnag, mae eu cymeradwyaeth o S4C yn cryfhau ein hachos dros sianel Saesneg i Gymru. Wedi'r cyfan, os gall S4C lwyddo yn

could oppose in principle, but there is nothing in it worth supporting either. Does the Assembly Government oppose our suggestion of an English-language channel for Wales? If so, make your reasons known to the nation.

On point 3 of amendment 1, I am pleased that the Commission on Assembly Powers, under the chairmanship of Lord Richard, intends to include broadcasting in its remit. Let us, therefore, stand firm in our demand for broadcasting responsibilities to be transferred to the Assembly. Carrying the motion will strengthen the commission's hand.

We are virtually in agreement on point 4 of amendment 1. There is certainly a need for Welsh representation on Ofcom, but we also believe that there should be consistency, and that the BBC and commercial television should come under the same supervision.

The problem with point 5 of amendment 1 is that Cymru'n Creu does not have a secretariat. Our motion calls for the Assembly to put its resources behind the study, but the amendment asks Cymru'n Creu to shoulder another burden, without, as I said, a secretariat to assist it.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A alwodd eich plaid yn San Steffan am ddod â'r BBC o dan Ofcom?

**Owen John Thomas:** I was not at Westminster at the time; I do not remember. I will write to you. [*Laughter*.]

I turn now to the Conservatives' amendments, which add nothing to the debate. They simply revamp the details instead of setting out new principles. Indeed, their praise for S4C was included in a motion carried over a year ago.

We should be able to take amendment 3 for granted, and amendment 4 paraphrases a Plaid Cymru amendment that was carried in February 2001. However, their commendation of S4C strengthens our case for an English language channel in Wales. After all, if S4C can succeed in Welsh, it

y Gymraeg, byddai'n haws byth i sianel Saesneg. Byddai mwy o adnoddau dynol ar gael, ac, felly, gallai'r sianel gyfrannu hyd yn oed mwy at fywyd y genedl.

Byddai sianel Saesneg yn rhoi'r cyfle i ddatblygu sgiliau ein hawduron, dramodwyr, actorion, cerddorion, a diddanwyr di-Gymraeg. Ar hyn o bryd, y mae'n rhaid iddynt chwilio am gyfleoedd y tu allan i Gymru. Hoffwn eu gweld yn ennill eu bywoliaeth yma gan gryfhau'r economi drwy greu'r math o swyddi sydd yn dod yn sgil datblygiad o'r fath. Dim ond gwasanaeth cyhoeddus a all wireddu'r freuddwyd hon.

Wrth drafod gwasanaeth Saesneg i Gymru, a'r cyfan y mae hynny'n ei olygu ar gyfer newyddion, drama ac adloniant, dylem gyfeirio at lwyddiant Radio Wales, sydd wedi creu cysnail drwy ddarparu gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i'r di-Gymraeg. Mae'r egwyddor, felly, wedi cael ei derbyn. Yn awr, mae angen yr ewyllys a'r adnoddau arnom i ddatblygu'r egwyddor honno er mwyn sefydlu sianel deledu gyflawn.

Wrth alw am wasanaeth darlledu integredig gyda sianelau radio a theledu yn y ddwy iaith, cyfeiriaf eto at arraith cadeirydd y BBC. Soniodd am y ffaith bod llawer o bobl ifanc yn cefnu ar y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus traddodiadol, a bod angen eu denu yn ôl gyda sianel arbennig ar eu cyfer. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ein pobl ifanc yng Nghymru, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau darpariaeth addas iddynt, yn enwedig ar y radio, gyda thonfeddi pwrrpasol, poblogaidd a neilltuwyd ar eu cyfer.

Mae darparu ar gyfer darlledu yn y dyfodol yn her. Os na lwyddwn i osod seiliau gwasanaeth integredig cyn i'r gwasanaeth analog ddod i ben, gall fod yn rhy hwyr. Mae'n rhaid inni adeiladu ar y gwaith ardderchog y mae'r BBC, HTV ac S4C wedi ei gyflawni hyd yn hyn, a sicrhau mai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fydd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros reoleiddio a llywio'r diwydiant, er lles pobl Cymru.

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete all after point 1 and replace

would be even easier for an English language channel. More human resources would be available and the channel could, therefore, contribute even more to the life of the nation.

An English language channel would provide the opportunity to develop the skills of our authors, dramatists, actors, musicians and entertainers who do not speak Welsh. At present, they have to seek opportunities outside Wales. I would like to see them earn their living here, and strengthen the economy by creating the kind of jobs that come in the wake of such a development. Only a public service can realise this dream.

In discussing an English language service for Wales, and all that that means for current affairs, drama and entertainment, we should refer to the success of Radio Wales, which has set a precedent in providing a national service for non-Welsh speakers. The principle, therefore, has been accepted. We now need the will and the resources to develop that principle in order to establish a comprehensive television channel.

In calling for an integrated broadcasting service with radio and television channels in both languages, I refer again to the speech made by the chairman of the BBC. He said that many young people are turning their backs on traditional public services, and that we need to attract them back with a channel specifically for them. The same is true of young people in Wales, and it is important that we secure appropriate provision for them, especially on the radio, with dedicated, popular channels aimed specifically at them.

Providing for the future of broadcasting is a challenge. If we do not succeed in establishing the foundations of an integrated service before the analogue switch-off, it may be too late. We must build upon the excellent work carried out to date by the BBC, HTV and S4C, and ensure that the National Assembly for Wales is responsible for regulating and steering the industry, for the benefit of Welsh people.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu popeth ar ôl pwynt 1, ac

with:

2. recognises the need to ensure good quality English and Welsh-medium broadcast access and provision during the transfer from analogue to digital;
3. recognises that broadcasting will be considered by the Commission on Assembly Powers established under the chairmanship of Lord Richard;
4. supports the need for Welsh representation on Ofcom;
5. calls upon the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language to commission a study on Welsh broadcasting under the auspices of Cymru'n Creu.

This amendment recognises the reality of point 1 of Plaid Cymru's motion, which notes the importance of broadcasting, of which we are all aware. However, our amendment departs from the basic proposition behind point 3 of Plaid Cymru's motion, which reveals the naivety of its approach. In an age of increasing globalisation, it wants to cut Wales off from the rest of the UK.

**Cynog Dafis** rose—

**Jenny Randerson:** Could I make a little progress?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has only just begun.

**Jenny Randerson:** This approach is all the more surprising because this is the first that we have heard of it, although broadcasting has been debated at length in Committee and in Plenary. There has been no suggestion in Committee that Plaid Cymru wants to make a unilateral declaration of independence on broadcasting. In February 2001, when the Assembly debated the White Paper on communications, which led to the Office of Communications Act 2002, the concept of Ofcom was unanimously accepted in the Chamber. All Plaid Cymru Members voted for Ofcom, and that was for an Ofcom which excluded much of the BBC's work from its

yn ei le rhoi:

2. yn cydnabod yr angen i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth darlledu Saesneg a Chymraeg yn cynnig mynediad a darpariaeth o safon uchel yn ystod y cyfnod trosglwyddo o analog i ddigidol;
3. yn cydnabod y bydd darlledu yn cael ei ystyried gan y Comisiwn ar Bwerau'r Cynulliad dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Arglwydd Richard;
4. yn cefnogi'r angen am gynrychiolaeth Gymreig ar Ofcom;
5. yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg i gomisiynu astudiaeth o ddarlledu yng Nghymru dan nawdd Cymru'n Creu.

Mae'r gwelliant hwn yn cydnabod realiti pwyt 1 cynnig Plaid Cymru, sy'n nodi pwysigrwydd darlledu, rhywbeth yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol ohono. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gwelliant ni'n ymbellhau oddi wrth y gosodiad sylfaenol y tu ôl i bwynt 3 cynnig Plaid Cymru, sy'n dangos naïfrwydd ei hagwedd. Mewn oes lle ceir globaleiddio cynyddol, mae arni eisiau torri Cymru i ffwrdd oddi wrth weddill y DU.

**Cynog Dafis** a gododd—

**Jenny Randerson:** A gaf fi fynd ymlaen ychydig bach?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dim ond newydd gychwyn y mae'r Gweinidog.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'r agwedd hon yn gymaint mwy o syndod otherwydd dyma'r tro cyntaf inni glywed amdani, er y trafodwyd darlledu'n drylwyr yn y Pwyllgor ac mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn. Ni chafwyd dim awgrym yn y Pwyllgor fod Plaid Cymru am wneud datganiad annibyniaeth unochrol ym myd darlledu. Ym mis Chwefror 2001, pan drafododd y Cynulliad y Papur Gwyn ar gyfathrebu, a arweiniodd at Ddeddf y Swyddfa Gyfathrebu 2002, derbynwyd cysyniad Ofcom yn unfrydol yn y Siambro. Pleidleisiodd holl Aelodau Plaid Cymru dros Ofcom, a hynny dros Ofcom a oedd yn cau llawer o waith y BBC allan o'i gylch gwaith.

remit. Owen John Thomas said, in proposing amendments on a consumer panel, the take-up of Welsh television and the importance of creative industries:

‘I welcome the Cabinet’s response to the White Paper, and although Plaid Cymru is proposing three amendments, none of them contradict the spirit of the original motion.’

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae polisi, wrth gwrs, yn symud ymlaen, ac mae syniadau pobl a phleidiau yn datblygu. Mae ein syniadau ni wedi datblygu ers y dyddiau y cyfeiria’r Gweinidog atynt. Y cyhuiddiad yw bod y syniad o greu Ofcom i Gymru yn naif a’n bod eisiau torri i ffwrdd. A yw’r Gweinidog yn derbyn felly bod Geraint Stanley Jones, un o’r arbenigwyr pennaf ar ddarlledu Cymreig, yn naif wrth argymhell yn gryf y dylid sefydlu rheoleiddiwr Cymreig—Ofcom Cymru—i gymryd y cyfrifoldeb yng Nghymru? Onid synnwyr cyffredin ydyw?

**Jenny Randerson:** I cannot understand how we could have a regulator for Wales, for reasons which I will outline. I accept that there are legitimate alternative ideas, but I find it difficult to accept that Plaid Cymru’s views have not just moved on, but have turned on their head.

What has happened to bring about this moving on or revolution in Plaid Cymru’s thought? Is it the case of the left hand of Plaid not knowing what the right hand is doing or, should I say, the northern branch not knowing what the southern branch is thinking? We are used to hearing some confused thoughts from Plaid Cymru, but this is more confused than usual. Owen John Thomas failed to explain in any way that I can understand point 2 of the motion, which is particularly peculiar. We have three English language channels in Wales. In fact, if you include BBC 2W, we have four.

**Owen John Thomas:** We asked the Government in London to give us representation on Ofcom. We did not get it. It is clear that, if we do not do things ourselves in Wales, we will not get anywhere.

**Jenny Randerson:** That has nothing to do

Dyweddodd Owen John Thomas, wrth gynnig gwelliannau ar baner defnyddwyr, y nifer a wyliai deledu Cymru a phwysigrwydd y diwydiannau creadigol:

‘Croesawaf ymateb y Cabinet i’r Papur Gwyn, ac er bod Plaid Cymru yn cynnig tri gwelliant, nid ydynt yn anghytuno ag ysbryd y cynnig gwreiddiol.’

**Cynog Dafis:** Policy, of course, moves on, and the ideas of individuals and parties develop. Our ideas have developed since the days to which the Minister refers. The allegation is that the idea of creating an Ofcom for Wales is naive and that we want to break away. Does the Minister therefore accept that Geraint Stanley Jones, one of the most eminent experts on Welsh broadcasting, is naive in strongly recommending that a Welsh regulator—Ofcom Wales—should be established to shoulder that responsibility in Wales? Is it not a matter of common sense?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni allaf ddeall sut y gallem gael rheoleiddiwr i Gymru, am resymau a amlinellaf. Derbyniaf fod yna syniadau eraill teg, ond fe’i caf yn anodd derbyn bod syniadau Plaid Cymru nid yn unig wedi symud ymlaen, ond wedi troi wyneb i waered.

Beth sydd wedi digwydd i achosi’r symud ymlaen neu’r chwyldro hwn ym meddylfryd Plaid Cymru? Ai mater ydyw nad yw llaw chwith y Blaid yn gwybod beth mae’r llaw dde’n ei wneud, neu, a ddylwn ddweud, nad yw’r gangen ogleddol yn gwybod beth mae’r gangen ddeheuol yn ei feddwl? Yr ydym wedi arfer clywed syniadau dryslyd gan Blaid Cymru, ond mae hyn yn fwy dryslyd nag arfer. Methodd Owen John Thomas ag egluro mewn unrhyw ffordd y gallaf fi ei deall, bwynt 2 y cynnig, sydd yn arbennig o od. Mae gennym dair sianel Saesneg yng Nghymru. Yn wir, os cynhwyswch BBC 2W, mae gennym bedair.

**Owen John Thomas:** Gofynasom i’r Llywodraeth yn Llundain roi cynrychiolaeth inni ar Ofcom. Nis cawsom. Mae’n amlwg, os na wnawn bethau ein hunain yng Nghymru, nad awn ni fyth i unman.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid oes gan hynny ddim

with an integrated channel.

**Owen John Thomas:** On the integrated channel, yes, we have three English language channels, and many more digital ones. However, we are talking about a dedicated channel for Wales, with Welsh-interest programmes. We have Radio Cymru and Radio Wales in Welsh and English, and we want the same set-up for television. I explained that when I was speaking. Were you not listening?

**Jenny Randerson:** I listened to your speech, and I tried to understand it. However, I wonder what BBC Wales television thinks it is, if it is not a dedicated channel for Wales.

Amendment 1 is straightforward. It recognises the need for good quality access to broadcasting throughout Wales. I welcome the fact that Nick Bourne chose that subject—

**Brian Hancock rose—**

**Jenny Randerson:** I will not take any more interventions. I was pleased that Nick Bourne chose that subject for his short debate last week. We will not support amendment 4 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, as it duplicates point 2 of our amendment. However, I agree with the spirit of the amendment.

Point 3 of our amendment recognises the fact that broadcasting will be discussed by the commission on Assembly powers, chaired by Lord Richard. There are various ways of considering the issue of powers and broadcasting. I am convinced that the Assembly needs more powers, but I have reservations about us swimming against the globalisation tide in broadcasting. The Scottish Parliament, which is often cited in the Chamber as having the powers that we may want, does not control broadcasting. I want us to have a strong voice on Ofcom at all appropriate levels. It is essential that we are strong in our support for that view. We must address today's problems today, because events are moving fast. We do not need to set out on a road to an independent nirvana in the future. We need a Welsh representative—

i'w wneud â sianel integredig.

**Owen John Thomas:** Ar y sianel integredig, oes, mae gennym dair sianel Saesneg, a llawer mwy o rai digidol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn sôn am sianel benodol i Gymru, gyda rhaglenni o ddiddordeb i Gymru. Mae gennym Radio Cymru a Radio Wales yn Gymraeg a Saesneg, ac mae arnom eisiau'r un trefniant ar gyfer teledu. Eglurais hynny pan oeddwn yn siarad. Onid oeddech chi'n gwrando?

**Jenny Randerson:** Gwrandewais ar eich arraith, a cheisiais ei deall. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn gofyn tybed beth mae teledu BBC Wales yn meddwl ydyw, os nad sianel benodol i Gymru.

Mae gwelliant 1 yn symbl. Mae'n cydnabod yr angen am fynediad o ansawdd da at ddarlledu drwy Gymru gyfan. Croesawaf yffaith i Nick Bourne ddewis y pwnc hwnnw—

**Brian Hancock a gododd—**

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni chymeraf ragor o ymyriadau. Yr oeddwn yn falch i Nick Bourne ddewis y pwnc hwnnw ar gyfer ei ddadl fer yr wythnos diwethaf. Ni chefnogwn welliant 4 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, gan ei fod yn dyblygu pwynt 2 yn ein gwelliant ni. Er hynny, cytunaf ag ysbryd y gwelliant.

Mae pwynt 3 ein gwelliant yn cydnabod yffaith y trafodir darlledu gan y comisiwn ar bwerau'r Cynulliad, dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Arglwydd Richard. Mae sawl ffordd o ystyried cwestiwn pwerau a darlledu. Yr wyf fi'n argyhoedddeg bod ar y Cynulliad angen mwy o bwerau, ond mae gennyl amheuon ynglŷn â nofio yn erbyn llanw globaleiddio ym myd darlledu. Nid yw Senedd yr Alban, y sonnir amdani yn y Siambro yn aml fel corff sydd â'r pwerau yr hoffem ni efallai eu cael, yn rheoli darlledu. Mae arnaf fi eisai inni gael llais cryf ar Ofcom ar bob lefel briodol. Mae'n hanfodol inni fod yn gryf yn ein cefnogaeth i'r farn honno. Rhaid inni roi sylw i broblemau heddiw heddiw, oherwydd bod pethau'n symud yn gyflym. Nid oes angen inni gychwyn ar daith i wynfyd annibynnol yn y dyfodol. Mae arnom angen cynrychiolydd Cymreig—

4:50 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose—*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has indicated that she is not giving way. She only has eight minutes in which to speak.

**Jenny Randerson:** We need a Welsh representative on the content board and the consumer panel and the Assembly is committed to pressing for a seat on the main board.

Forty per cent of people in Wales watch English television. Regulating the other 60 per cent will not solve that problem. I want Wales to have a strong voice at the UK table to ensure that we deal with the problems which have led to that 40 per cent choosing English television, or being forced to do so by the lack of a Welsh signal.

Our proposals tackle that issue and I am committed to working hard, in conjunction with my colleagues in other devolved administrations, to put forward our point of view. The Culture Committee will again be fully involved in the process when the new Bill is published in a week or so.

The final point of amendment 1 recognises the need for an in-depth and ongoing study of broadcasting in Wales. I envisage that this will not look at broadcasting independence for Wales, but at the practical issues thrown up by the increasing convergence of communications. Welsh broadcasters are members of Cymru'n Creu and it is therefore an appropriate forum to develop this approach.

Today's debate will clearly be lively. However, we are all united on broadcasting's central importance in our lives. This importance increases daily as global media becomes more pervasive and as convergence occurs. The pace of internet access development has caught many by surprise, and access to broadband is a key challenge. The need for modern legislation to reflect the speed of this transition is vital to a modern

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd—*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dywedodd y Gweinidog nad yw am ildio. Dim ond wyth munud sydd ganddi i siarad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae arnom angen cynrychiolydd Cymreig ar y bwrdd cynnwys a'r panel defnyddwyr ac mae'r Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i bwysu am sedd ar y prif fwrdd.

Mae 40 y cant o bobl yng Nghymru'n gwyllo teledu o Loegr. Ni fydd rheoleiddio'r 60 y cant arall yn datrys y broblem honno. Mae arnaf fi eisiau i Gymru gael llais cryf wrth fwrdd y DU i sicrhau ein bod yn delio â'r problemau a arweiniodd y 40 y cant hwnnw i ddewis teledu Lloegr, neu gael eu gorfodi i wneud hynny oherwydd diffyg signal o Gymru.

Mae ein cynigion yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw ac yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i weithio'n galed, ar y cyd â'm cymheiriad mewn gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill, i gyflwyno'n safbwyt. Bydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn ymdrin yn llawn â'r broses eto pan gyhoeddir y Mesur newydd ymhen wythnos neu ddwy.

Mae pwyt olaf gwelliant 1 yn cydnabod yr angen am astudiaeth drwyndl a pharhaus o ddarlledu yng Nghymru. Rhagwelaf na fydd hyn yn edrych ar annibyniaeth darlledu i Gymru, ond y materion ymarferol a godir wrth i gyfathrebu ddod yn fwyfwy cydgyfeiriol. Mae darllewyr Cymru'n aelodau o Cymru'n Creu ac felly mae'n fforwm priodol ar gyfer datblygu hyn.

Yn amlwg cawn ddadl fywiog heddiw. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym i gyd yn gytûn ynghylch pwysigrwydd canolog darlledu i'n bywydau. Mae'r pwysigrwydd hwn yn cynyddu bob dydd wrth i gyfryngau byd-eang ddod yn fwy hollbresennol ac wrth i gydgyfeiriant ddigwydd. Mae cyflymder datblygiad mynediad i'r rhyngrwyd wedi dal llawer o bobl yn ddirybudd, ac mae mynediad i'r band llydan yn her allweddol. Mae'r angen am

economy and society. The demarcation lines between traditional broadcasting methods have disappeared. We need a joint regulator to take a cross-cutting perspective and to replace the disjointed approach provided by the five existing regulators. We cannot turn the clock back and pull down the shutters between England and Wales on this one—

ddeddfwriaeth fodern i adlewyrchu cyflymder y trawsnewid hwn yn allweddol i economi a chymdeithas fodern. Mae'r ffiniau rhwng y dulliau darlledu traddodiadol wedi diflannu. Mae angen cyd-reoleiddiwr i weithio yn drawsbynciol a disodli'r dull digyswllt a ddarperir gan y pum rheoleiddiwr presennol. Ni allwn droi'r cloc yn ôl a thynnur llenni i lawr rhwng Cymru a Lloegr ar hyn—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had over eight minutes, Minister.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2: add as a new point:

*acknowledges the substantial contribution by S4C to broadcasting in Wales and the development of our national culture.*

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point:

*recognises the responsibility of the main broadcasters to provide comprehensive, balanced programming and news coverage for Wales.*

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point:

*calls on the Government of Wales to press for access to Welsh TV and radio channels for all parts of Wales.*

I agree with Plaid Cymru that broadcasting, and the media as a whole, is important to many aspects of Welsh life. I was pleased to hear that Owen John agrees with our amendments, even though, by some strange logic, it seems that he may not support them.

Over recent decades, the importance of the media to the democratic life of Wales—‘the health of our democracy’, as stated in the motion—has become increasingly significant. There is no doubt that people are becoming less engaged with governance and less willing to listen to politicians and people involved in Government. The media plays an increasingly important part in encouraging

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael dros wyth munud, Weinidog.

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn cydnabod cyfraniad sylwedol S4C i ddarlledu yng Nghymru ac i ddatblygiad ein diwylliant cenedlaethol.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn cydnabod cyfrifoldeb y prif ddarlleddywyr i ddarparu gwasanaeth rhagleni a gwasanaeth newyddion cynhwysfawr a chytbwys ar gyfer Cymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ddwyn pwysau o blaid rhoi'r cyfle i bob rhan o Gymru allu derbyn sianeli teledu a radio Cymreig.*

Cytunaf â Phlaid Cymru fod darlledu, a'r cyfryngau'n gyffredinol, yn bwysig i sawl agwedd ar fywyd Cymru. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed bod Owen John yn cytuno â'n gwelliannau, er ei bod yn ymddangos, drwy ryw resymeg ryfedd, efallai na wnaiff eu cefnogi.

Dros y degawdau diwedd, daeth pwysigrwydd y cyfryngau i fywyd democrataidd Cymru—‘iechyd ein democratiaeth’ ys dywedir yn y cynnig—yn gynyddol arwyddocaol. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw pobl yn colli diddordeb mewn llywodraeth ac yn mynd yn llai bodlon gwrando ar wleidyddion a phobl sy'n ymwneud â'r Llywodraeth. Mae'r

young people in particular to engage with the Government process. That is hugely important. The broadcasting media has also played a huge part in supporting the culture of Wales, not only by way of sponsorship, but also in connecting the people of Wales to the country's culture.

We agree with several aspects of Plaid Cymru's motion, but we cannot support it. I agree with the Minister that the motion has an isolationist tinge. That can be damaging to Wales in the long run.

**Owen John Thomas** *rose—*

**Glyn Davies:** I will not give way, because although you have had several attempts at making sense, it is still difficult to follow you. You will only add confusion to the debate if I allow you to speak again.

I am not sure what point 2 means—you may well have wanted to intervene on that—as we already have an excellent national English-language service. Our party is not always happy with the provision; there is an element of cut and thrust on this. However, generally speaking, we have a terrific national service in Wales. We Conservatives are particularly proud of S4C, of which we have a sense of ownership. It is truly a monument to the Conservative Party's commitment to Wales and the Welsh language and identity.

I know that Plaid Cymru often tries to portray the Conservative Party as being unsympathetic to Wales and the language. I understand why it does that, because it is petrified that all the natural Conservatives who currently support Plaid Cymru, will return to us as it is increasingly recognised that the Conservative Party stands four-square for Wales and the language. If you read recent copies of *Golwg*, you will see Gwilym Owen's writings. He is not a natural sympathiser of the Conservative Party, but he speaks in glowing terms about how the Conservative Party now stands four-square for Wales. You should be worried, because we are going to get all that support back at the next election—[*Interruption.*]

cyfryngau'n chwarae rhan gynyddol bwysig o ran annog pobl ifanc i ymgysylltu â'r broses o Lywodraeth. Mae hynny'n aruthrol o bwysig. Mae'r cyfryngau darlledu hwythau wedi chwarae rhan enfawr i gefnogi diwylliant Cymru, nid yn unig drwy gyfrwng nawdd, ond hefyd drwy gysylltu pobl Cymru â diwylliant y wlad.

Cytunwn â sawl agwedd ar gynnig Plaid Cymru, ond ni allwn ei gefnogi. Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog fod gan y cynnig naws ynysol. Gall hynny fod yn niweidiol i Gymru yn y tymor hir.

**Owen John Thomas** *a gododd—*

**Glyn Davies:** Ni wnaf ildio, oherwydd er ichi gael sawl cynnig ar wneud synnwyr, mae'n dal i fod yn anodd eich dilyn. Dim ond ychwanegu dryswch at y ddadl a wnewch os caniatâf ichi siarad eto.

Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw ystyr pwynt 2—efallai'n wir mai eisiau torri i mewn ar hynny yr oeddech—gan fod gennym eisoes wasanaeth Saesneg cenedlaethol ardderchog. Nid yw'n plaid ni bob amser yn hapus â'r arlwyr; mae elfen o daro a gwrthdaro yn hyn. Er hynny, a siarad yn gyffredinol, mae gennym wasanaeth cenedlaethol rhagorol yng Nghymru. Yr ydym ni Geidwadwyr yn arbennig o falch o S4C, y mae gennym ni ymdeimlad o berchnogaeth drosti. Mae'n wir yn gofgolofn i ymrwymiad y Blaid Geidwadol i Gymru a'r iaith a'r hunaniaeth Gymraeg.

Gwn fod Plaid Cymru yn aml yn ceisio portreadu'r Blaid Geidwadol fel plaid nad oes ganddi gydymdeimlad â Chymru a'r iaith. Deallaf pam y gwna hynny, oherwydd ei bod ag ofn marwol y bydd yr holl Geidwadwyr naturiol sy'n cefnogi Plaid Cymru yn dychwelyd atom ni wrth i'r ymwybyddiaeth bod y Blaid Geidwadol yn sefyll yn gadarn dros Gymru a'r iaith gynyddu. Os darllenwch rifynnau diweddar o *Golwg*, mi welwch erthyglau Gwilym Owen. Nid yw'n gefnogwr naturiol i'r Blaid Geidwadol, ond fe sonia mewn termau disgrair am y modd y mae'r Blaid Geidwadol bellach yn sefyll yn gadarn dros Gymru. Dylech boeni, oherwydd byddwn yn adennill yr holl gefnogaeth honno yn yr etholiad nesaf—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is important that we hear Glyn Davies.

**Glyn Davies:** Absolutely, Llywydd. It is important that all those people who are misguidedly supporting Plaid Cymru hear exactly what I am saying, and what Gwilym Owen is saying.

There have been calls for broadcasting to be devolved and I recognise that that will be considered by the independent commission on Assembly powers. There will be different views on that when the matter comes before the Assembly. I do not know whether we will all be here when it does, but we will all have expressed our views on it. I have real concerns about Wales becoming an isolated, underfunded broadcasting island. There may be some way in which we can enable the Assembly and Wales to become involved in broadcasting policy, but we have to be careful that we do not isolate Wales because there are many extra costs involved in broadcasting in Wales. Nick Bourne outlined a few of those in his short debate last week. He was absolutely right, and there is cross-party support on that. It is expensive to deliver broadcasting across Wales and we have to be part of the UK to do that. We have to be careful and accept the reality of sparsity. Many parts of Wales are sparsely populated and we have to ensure that costs do not result in the delivery of a poorer service.

I might accuse the Labour luvvie who currently chairs the BBC, of dumbing down, political bias, and often, a general lack of gravitas and style. However, I will never accuse him of not giving Wales the proper level of resources. The broadcasting media in London has done that well. We should recognise that and congratulate it.

Finally, on having a Welsh voice on the Communications Bill, I am currently unsure how we will secure that, but it must happen. This matter will go before the Committee and I am looking forward to taking part in the debate and to arguing for a strong Welsh voice in that Bill.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Canolbwytiaf ar un mater,

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n bwysig inni glywed Glyn Davies.

**Glyn Davies:** Yn hollo, Lywydd. Mae'n bwysig i'r holl bobl hynny sydd wedi'u camarwain i gefnogi Plaid Cymru glywed yn union beth yr wyf yn ei ddweud, a beth mae Gwilym Owen yn ei ddweud.

Bu galwadau am ddatganoli darlledu ac yr wyf yn sylweddoli y caiff hynny ei ystyried gan y comisiwn annibynnol ar bwerau'r Cynulliad. Ceir gwahanol syniadau am hynny pan ddaw'r mater gerbron y Cynulliad. Ni wn a fyddwn ni i gyd yma pan ddaw, ond byddwn i gyd wedi mynegi'n barn amdano. Mae gennyf bryderon gwirioneddol y bydd Cymru yn mynd yn ynys ddarlledu unig, prin o arian. Efallai fod rhyw ffordd y gallwn alluogi'r Cynulliad a Chymru i gael ymh l   pholisi darlledu, ond rhaid inni ofalu nad ydym yn ynysu Cymru oherwydd bod llawer o gostau ychwanegol ynghlwm wrth ddarlledu yng Nghymru. Amlinellodd Nick Bourne ychydig o'r rheini yn ei ddadl fer yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr oedd yn llygad ei le, ac mae cefnogaeth traws-bleidiol ar hynny. Mae'n ddrud darlledu ar draws Cymru ac mae'n rhaid inni fod yn rhan o'r DU i wneud hynny. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus a derbyn realiti ein teneurwydd poblogaeth. Mae llawer o rannau o Gymru'n brin o ran poblogaeth a rhaid inni sicrhau na fydd costau'n arwain at roi gwasanaeth salach.

Gallwn gyhuddo'r cyfryngi Llafur sy'n cadeirio'r BBC ar hyn o bryd o ostwng safonau, o duedd wleidyddol, ac o ddiffyg urddas ac arddull yn gyffredinol. Er hynny, ni wnaf byth ei gyhuddo o beidio   rhoi'r lefel briodol o adnoddau i Gymru. Mae'r cyfryngau darlledu yn Llundain wedi gwneud hynny'n dda. Dylem gydnabod hynny a'u llonyfarch.

Yn olaf, yngl n   chael llais Cymreig ar y Mesur Cyfathrebu, yr wyf yn ansicr ar hyn o bryd sut y gallwn gyflawni hynny, ond rhaid iddo ddigwydd. Aiff y mater hwn gerbron y Pwyllgor ac yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at gymryd rhan yn y ddadl ac at ddadlau dros lais Cymreig cryf yn y Mesur hwnnw.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I will focus on one issue,

sef y trafodaethau yn y Siambra hon ac ym mhwyllgor sefydlog Tŷ'r Cyffredin ar gwestiwn cynrychiolaeth Cymru ar Ofcom. Gwrandewais ar ddadleuon Jenny Randerson heddiw a methodd yn llwyr ag ymwneud â'r cwestiwn canolog hwn. Mewn datganiad a gyflwynodd y Llywodraeth i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar 24 Ionawr 2001, nododd:

'We recommend that the board of Ofcom should likewise include a member representing the interests of Wales. We suggest that that member for Wales should be appointed by the National Assembly.'

Dyna oedd polisi'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n amlwg ei bod wedi methu â chyflawni ei pholisi yn Llundain. Mae'n amlwg bod y Gweinidogion y cyfeiriodd Jenny atynt fel rhai a oedd yn sefyll yn ddewr ac efn dros fuddiannau Cymru wedi gwrrthod gwrandio ar gais gan Lywodraeth Lafur/Ryddfrydol y Cynulliad hwn.

5:00 p.m.

Mae'n amlwg o sylwadau Kim Howells yn y Pwyllgor ac yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin gymaint o ddirmyg oedd ganddo tuag at unrhyw awgrym o'r fath. Yn y Senedd ar 24 Ionawr, dywedodd:

'I am loth to accept the amendment, or the return of the days of Buggin's turn, or people being nominated for committees only to make up the numbers.'

Dyna oedd ei agwedd tuag at gael cynrychiolydd o Gymru a'r Alban ar Ofcom fel rhan o'r Ddeddf. Gwrrthodwyd gwelliant Plaid Cymru i'r perwyl hwnnw yn y Senedd.

Faint o sylw a gymer Llywodraeth San Steffan o'r Llywodraeth yma? Beth yw gwerth addewidion Llywodraeth Rhodri Morgan os nad ydynt yn cael gwrandawiad yn Llundain, nac esboniad o baham y cawsant eu gwrrthod? Holl bwynt cael Cynulliad—a'r pwynt y mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur/Ryddfrydol yn ei ddadlau—yw inni gael perthynas agos â Llywodraeth Tony Blair yn Llundain. Ar y mater hwn—ybiddai'n cael cefnogaeth pob plaid yn y Cynulliad, dybiwn i—sef cael llais statudol i Gymru o fewn Ofcom, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi methu â chael unrhyw wrandawiad na chydymdeimlad. O dan yr amgylchiadau hyn,

namely the discussions that took place in this Chamber and in the House of Commons standing committee on the question of Wales's representation on Ofcom. I listened to Jenny Randerson's arguments today and she failed to deal with this central question. In a statement that the Government presented to the Culture Committee on 24 January 2001, it noted that:

That was the Government's policy. It is clear that the Government has failed to realise that policy in London. It is clear that the Ministers to whom Jenny referred as standing bravely and fearlessly for the interests of Wales have refused to listen to a request from the Labour/Liberal Government of this Assembly.

Kim Howells's derision for any such suggestion has become clear in Committee and in the House of Commons. In Parliament on 24 January, he said:

That was his attitude toward including a representative from Wales and Scotland on Ofcom as part of the Act. Plaid Cymru's amendment to that end was defeated in Parliament.

How much notice does the Westminster Government take of the Government here? What are Rhodri Morgan's Government's promises worth if they are ignored out of hand in London? The whole point of having an Assembly—and the point that the Labour/Liberal Government is arguing—is for us to have a close relationship with Tony Blair's Government in London. On this issue—which I assume all parties in the Assembly would support—of giving Wales a statutory voice within Ofcom, the Government has failed to get any kind of hearing or understanding. In these circumstances, the Government stands to be

saif y Llywodraeth i gael ei chondemnio am ei methiant wrth siomi Cymru ar fater mor hanfodol bwysig.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Croesawaf y ddadl bwysig hon. Mae problemau gyda'r cyfryngau Cymreig ar y teledu yn y ddwy iaith, ac mae angen gwella'r sefyllfa. Teledu yw prif ffynhonnell newyddion y mwyaf o bobl, ac os oes nifer enfawr o bobl yn methu â derbyn y newyddion Cymreig, mae'n broblem sylweddol i ddemocratiaeth yng Nghymru.

The 1999 Welsh Affairs Select Committee report on broadcasting in Wales highlighted that many people in Wales do not watch Welsh television—the figures in the report ranged from 330,000 to 400,000 people. That is a huge figure when you consider that the report estimated that only 2.8 per cent of the Welsh population could not receive the Welsh signal. Much effort and investment has been expended, but we must do better.

Television is the main source of news for the majority of people, and it is of great concern that it has been estimated that many people in Wales choose not to watch Welsh television, or cannot access it. With the advent of devolution and the Assembly, it is more important than ever for people living in Wales to be able to access television and follow what we are doing here, as well as Welsh news, sport and politics.

**Elin Jones:** Gwrandewais heddiw ar yr arraith ryfeddol gan Weinidog o'r Llywodraeth hon, ac ni chefais fy synnu nad oedd yr un aelod arall o'r Cabinet yma i uniaethu â'i sylwadau bryd hynny.

Darniog dros ben yw darlleu yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae rhai eithriadau i hynny, sef y gwasanaethau cenedlaethol S4C, Radio Cymru a Radio Wales. Mae gwasanaeth BBC Cymru ar deledu yn y Saesneg ar dair sianel. Dywedodd y Gweinidog fod BBC Wales yn bod, ond darlledir y gwasanaeth ar dair sianel y BBC: BBC 1, BBC 2, a BBC 2W, a hynny am oriau amrywiol. Nid oes ymwybyddiaeth o sianel genedlaethol Saesneg gan y BBC.

condemned for its failure in letting Wales down on such a crucial matter.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I welcome this important debate. There are problems facing television in Wales in both languages, and we need to improve the situation. Television is the main source of news for the majority of people, and if a great many people do not receive news from Wales, that is a fundamental problem for democracy in Wales.

Amlygodd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ar ddarlledu yng Nghymru yn 1999 y ffaith bod llawer o bobl yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn gwyllo teledu Cymreig—amrywia'r ffigurau yn yr adroddiad o 330,000 i 400,000 o bobl. Mae hynny'n ffigur enfawr pan ystyriwch yr amcangyfrifodd yr adroddiad mai dim ond 2.8 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru oedd yn methu derbyn y signal Cymreig. Ymdrechwyd a buddsoddyd yn helaeth, ond rhaid inni wneud yn well.

Teledu yw'r brif ffynhonnell newyddion i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl, ac mae'n destun pryer mawr yr amcangyfrifwyd bod cymaint o bobl yng Nghymru'n dewis peidio â gwyllo rhagleni Cymreig, neu'n methu eu cael. Gyda dyfodiad datganoli a'r Cynulliad, mae'n bwysicach fyth i bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru allu cael teledu a dilyn beth yr ydym yn ei wneud yma, yn ogystal â newyddion, chwaraeon a gwleidyddiaeth Cymru.

**Elin Jones:** I listened today to the strangest speech from a Minister of this Government, and I was not surprised that no other Cabinet member was here to identify with her comments at that time.

Current broadcasting provision in Wales is piecemeal. There are a few exceptions to that, namely the national services of S4C, Radio Cymru and Radio Wales. BBC Wales's English-language provision is on three television channels in Wales. The Minister said that there is a BBC Wales, but the provision is broadcast on BBC 1, BBC 2 and BBC 2W, and all at varying times. There is no sense of a national English-language

channel from the BBC.

Erbyn hyn, yn anffodus, mae HTV lawn cynddrwg. Mae HTV wedi diflannu o dan frand ITV1, gydag ambell raglen Gymreig yma ac acw. Nid oes unrhyw gyfraniad strwythurol, ac nid oes radio cenedlaethol annibynnol ychwaith, sy'n drueni mawr, er bod enghreifftiau clodwiw o wasanaethau lleol a rhanbarthol yn y sector annibynnol.

Mae gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gael yn y Gymraeg, ond bratiog a distrwythur yw'r gwasanaeth Saesneg cenedlaethol. Ar rai agweddau, mae'r gwasanaeth yn gwaethyg. Nid oes amheuaeth bod achos dros sianel Saesneg i Gymru, a hwnnw'n achos cryf iawn erbyn hyn, gyda'r ffaith bod teledu digidol bellach wedi cael gwared ar rai o'r rhwystrau o ran diffyg gofod.

Ar un adeg, yr oedd sôn y byddai BBC Choice yn datblygu sianel Saesneg i Gymru. Mae BBC 2W yn gwneud rhyw ymgais ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r system ar hyn o bryd yn gymysglyd tu hwnt i'r gwylwr. Mae angen brand clir ar fodel S4C: sianel annibynnol Saesneg, gyda'r BBC yn darparu rhagleni a newyddion ar ei chyfer, ar y cyd â'r sector annibynnol ehangach.

Ble y dylai'r sianel hon fod? Mae un gofod gwag eithaf amlwg, sef y sianel yr wyf yn cael fy narlledu arni yn fyw yn awr—S4C2. Y tu hwnt i ddarlledu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gellid defnyddio gweddill yr oriau i ddarlledu gwasanaeth Saesneg cyflawn i Gymru. Hoffwn weld y Gweinidog yn arddel agwedd ychydig yn fwy adeiladol a radicalaidd, gan arwain trafodaethau â'r darlledwyr i ystyried pa mor ymarferol yw hynny, yn hytrach na gwrrthod y syniad yn syth bin fel y gwnaeth y prynhawn yma.

Dylid cymryd un cam pwysig arall, cyn sefydlu sianel Saesneg hyd yn oed, sef darparu gwasanaeth newyddion teledu cenedlaethol a rhwngwladol yn y Saesneg. Ceir hynny eisoes yn y Gymraeg ond nid yn y Saesneg yng Nghymru. Gwyddom oll fod canran sylweddol o'r newyddion domestig yn y rhagleni newyddion am 6 p.m. a 10 p.m. yn gwbl amherthnasol ac yn gallu bod yn

By now, unfortunately, HTV is just as bad. HTV has been subsumed by the ITV1 brand, with a few Welsh programmes here and there. There is no structured contribution, and there is no independent national radio either, which is a great shame, although there are some commendable examples of local and regional services in the independent sector.

A national service is available in Welsh, but the national English-language provision is patchy and unstructured. In some aspects, that provision is worsening. There is, without doubt, a case for an English-language channel for Wales, and that case is being strengthened, given that digital television has broken down some of the barriers of lack of space.

At one time, there was talk of BBC Choice developing an English-language channel for Wales. BBC 2W is making some attempt at this. However, the current system is extremely confusing for viewers. We need a clear brand along the lines of S4C: an independent English-language channel, with the BBC providing programming and news, in collaboration with the wider independent sector.

Where should this channel be? There is one quite obvious space available, the channel on which I am now being broadcast live—S4C2. In addition to broadcasting live from the National Assembly, the remainder of the hours could be used to broadcast a comprehensive English-language service for Wales. I would like to see the Minister take a somewhat more positive and radical approach, taking the lead in discussions with broadcasters to consider the practicality of that, rather than rejecting the idea out of hand as she has done this afternoon.

There is one other important step that should be taken, even before establishing an English-language channel, and that is the provision of a national and international television news service in English. That is already available in Welsh but not in English in Wales. We all know that a substantial percentage of the domestic news on the 6 p.m. and 10 p.m. news broadcasts is

hollo gamarweiniol i bobl yng Nghymru. Clywsom heddiw, er enghraifft, ar y BBC am adroddiadau Ofsted, sy'n berthnasol i Loegr yn unig. Bob hyn a hyn yr ydym yn clywed am gyhoeddi gwariant newydd gan adrannau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Eto, mae hynny'n amherthnasol erbyn hyn i Gymru. Felly, mae gan y Cymry Cymraeg wasanaeth newyddion cenedlaethol a rhingwladol gan BBC Cymru ac mae'r Cymry di-Gymraeg yn haeddu'r un math o wasanaeth. Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gychwyn trafod hyn â'r BBC a darlledwyr eraill fel man cychwyn i sefydlu sianel genedlaethol Saesneg yn y dyfodol rhagweladwy.

**Huw Lewis:** It is good to able to welcome, again, at least the subject matter of a debate tabled by Plaid Cymru. I welcomed Plaid Cymru's recent minority party debate on the Valleys, which helped to expose the divisions between that party's different wings. This debate illustrates more holes in its plans for self-government, this time concerning broadcasting. Its policy is shot through with dishonesty; there is perhaps no better illustration of Plaid Cymru's dishonest and perverse attitude to Britain than broadcasting.

In November 1999, we debated this issue and I clearly remember asking Cynog Dafis, who was, I believe, Plaid Cymru's spokesperson on these issues, how a comprehensive and quality-driven service such as the BBC could be funded in a self-governing Wales? I remember clearly that his answer was that they had not really thought about that. That was the party spokesperson's answer to that point. It is fair to say that no real answer was given then, and I am not sure whether Plaid Cymru could give an answer now either. How, in a Wales cut adrift from the rest of the United Kingdom—a self governing Wales, or whatever euphemism that you want to use—could Plaid Cymru hope to maintain the Welsh and English broadcasting services?

**Cynog Dafis rose—**

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Member is not giving way.

**Huw Lewis:** My time is quite short. I will try

completely irrelevant and can be utterly misleading to the people of Wales. Today, for example, we heard on the BBC about Ofsted reports, which are only relevant to England. Occasionally we hear announcements of new spending by United Kingdom Government departments. Again, that is now irrelevant to Wales. Therefore, Welsh speakers have a national and international news service from BBC Cymru and non-Welsh speakers in Wales deserve the same sort of service. The Assembly Government should begin to discuss this with the BBC and other broadcasters as a starting point in establishing an English-language national channel in the foreseeable future.

**Huw Lewis:** Da yw gallu croesawu, eto, bwnc trafod dadl a gyflwynir gan Blaid Cymru. Croesewais ddadl plaid leiafrifol ddiweddar Plaid Cymru ar y Cymoedd, a helpodd ddatgelu'r rhaniadau rhwng gwahanol adeiniau'r blaid honno. Mae'r ddadl hon yn dadlennu mwy o dyllau yn ei chynlluniau ar gyfer hunan-lywodraeth, ar fater darlledu y tro hwn. Mae anonestrwydd yn britho'i pholisi; efallai nad oes gwell esiampl o agwedd anonest a gwrthun Plaid Cymru at Brydain na darlledu.

Ym mis Tachwedd 1999, trafodasom y mater hwn a chofiaf yn glir imi ofyn i Cynog Dafis, sef, mi gredaf, llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar y materion hyn ar y pryd, sut y gellid ariannu gwasanaeth cynhwysfawr a safonol fel y BBC mewn Cymru hunan-lywodraethol? Cofiaf yn glir ei ateb nad oeddent wedi meddwl am hynny, mewn gwirionedd. Dyna oedd ymateb llefarydd y blaid i'r pwynt hwnnw. Mae'n deg dweud na roddwyd ateb go iawn bryd hynny, ac nid wyf yn siŵr a allai Plaid Cymru roi ateb yn awr ychwaith. Sut, mewn Cymru wedi'i thorri i ffwrdd oddi wrth weddill y Deyrnas Unedig—Cymru hunan-lywodraethol, neu ba bynnag air llednais y dymunwch ei ddefnyddio—y gallai Plaid Cymru obeithio cynnal y gwasanaethau darlledu Cymraeg a Saesneg?

**Cynog Dafis a gododd—**

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Aelod yn ildio.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae fy amser yn eithaf prin.

to accept an intervention later, Cynog.

Plaid Cymru Members must see the irony of their vision of a self-governing Wales. If you have any intellectual honesty, you must see the irony of the fact that public funds from the United Kingdom provide S4C with £78 million a year from the Department of Culture, Media and Sport. The BBC and British licence-payers—not Welsh licence-payers—provide BBC Wales with £66 million a year. Where will the money come from when the S4C grant dries up altogether and the 21 million licence-payers in Great Britain shrink to less than 1 million in Wales alone? Where will the money come from? There is no substance to this debate. You cannot approach this debate with any kind of honesty until you answer those questions. It is crazy and you are being dishonest with the Welsh people. It might be hard for Plaid Cymru Members to accept, but with the advent of devolution, the Welsh language, in particular, is best served and safeguarded in broadcasting by being a part of Great Britain, not apart from it.

Cynog Dafis admitted in 1999 that the BBC has been a powerful influence in cementing a Welsh identity. You cannot have it both ways: to say that on one hand, while another candidate for your party is saying that the British state is engaged in an attempt to exterminate Welsh-speaking Welsh people. The two wings of your party must sort out this schizophrenic nonsense. You cannot on one hand congratulate the BBC and British state and on the other attack it so viciously.

**Cynog Dafis rose—**

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Member is not giving way. You are out of time, Huw.

5:10 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn yr oes wybodaeth hon, mae'n hanfodol bod gan Lywodraeth Cymru weledigaeth glir o sut y gall ein dinasyddion gymryd rhan yn y dechnoleg fyd-eang fel Cymry gyda'u hunaniaeth

Ceisiaf dderbyn ymyriad toc, Cynog.

Rhaid i Aelodau Plaid Cymru weld eironi eu gweledigaeth o Gymru hunan-lywodraethol. Os oes gennych unrhyw onestrwydd deallusol, mae'n rhaid ichi weld yr eironi yn y ffaith bod arian cyhoeddus o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn darparu £78 miliwn y flwyddyn i S4C o'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon. Mae talwyr trwydded y BBC a Phrydain—nid talwyr trwydded Cymru—yn darparu £66 miliwn y flwyddyn i BBC Wales. O ble y daw'r arian pan fydd grant S4C wedi'i ddihysbyddu'n llwyr ac y bydd yr 21 miliwn o dalwyr trwydded ym Mhrydain Fawr wedi crebachu i lai nag 1 filiwn yng Nghymru'n unig? O ble y daw'r arian? Nid oes dim sylwedd i'r ddadl hon. Ni allwch fynd i mewn i'r ddadl hon gydag unrhyw fath o onestrwydd hyd nes byddwch wedi ateb y cwestiynau hynny. Mae'n wallgof ac yr ydych yn bod yn anones gyda phobl Cymru. Efallai ei bod yn anodd i Aelodau Plaid Cymru dderbyn hyn, ond gyda dyfodiad datganoli, y ffordd orau i wasanaethu a diogelu'r iaith Gymraeg, yn arbennig, mewn darlledu yw drwy fod yn rhan o Brydain Fawr, nid ar wahân oddi wrthi.

Cyfaddefodd Cynog Dafis yn 1999 fod y BBC wedi bod yn ddylanwad cryf yn cadarnhau hunaniaeth Gymreig. Ni allwch ei chael y ddwy ffordd: dweud hynny ar y naill law, tra bod ymgeisydd arall dros eich plaid yn dweud bod y wladwriaeth Brydeinig yn ymgeisio i ddileu'r Cymry Cymraeg. Mae'n rhaid i ddwy adain eich plaid roi heibio'r dwli sgitsoffrenaidd hwn. Ni allwch ar y naill law longyfarch y BBC a'r wladwriaeth Brydeinig ac ar y llaw arall ymosod arnynt mor giaidd.

**Cynog Dafis a gododd—**

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Aelod yn ildio. Mae'ch amser ar ben, Huw.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** In this information age, it is essential that the Government of Wales has a clear vision of how our citizens can participate in global technology as Welsh people with their own national identity. I was

genedlaethol eu hunain. Nid oeddwn yn synnu i glywed Huw Lewis yn camddefnyddio cyfle i gyflwyno gweledigaeth yn y ddadl hon. Fodd bynnag, cefais fy synnu a'm siomi i glywed y Gweinidog yn gwneud hynny. Gwaith y Gweinidog yw cynnig y weledigaeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd trafodaeth fwy sylweddol ar y mater hollbwysig hwn o hawliau gwylwyr yng Nghymru pan ddaw gerbron y Pwyllgor eto.

Nid yw rhai Aelodau'n deall bod dau Fesur dan sylw. Mae'r Mesur i sefydlu Ofcom eisoes wedi'i droi'n Ddeddf, tra bo'r Mesur Cyfathrebu yn dechrau ar ei daith drwy'r Senedd yr wythnos hon. Byddai'n llesol pe bai Aelodau'n deall y gwahaniaeth hwnnw cyn cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Cyn i'r Mesur Cyfathrebu gychwyn ar ei ffordd drwy'r Senedd, mae'n hollbwysig bod y Cynulliad yn datgan yn glir bod hawliau gwylwyr yng Nghymru yn fater o bryder inni, ac nad ydym yn fodlon bod ar gyrrion y drafodaeth. Dylem ddatgan ein bod am fod yn gyfrifol am hawliau ein dinasyddion.

Gellid codi sawl pwynt, ond nid yw amser yn caniatáu hynny. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym lais o ran cynnwys darlledu yng Nghymru. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddatgan yn glir nad ydym yn fodlon bod ar ymylon y drafodaeth ar gynnwys. Bu sôn am sianel cyfrwng Saesneg yn benodol ar gyfer Cymru. A yw *Eastenders* yn benodol ar gyfer Cymru? Mae'r math hwnnw o ddatganiad yn ffafn llwyr. Dylem gymryd y drafodaeth hon o ddifrif.

Mae dosbarthu hefyd yn bwysig. Ar hyn o bryd, mae dosbarthwyr megis Sky yn sicrhau bod rhaglenni o Gymru ar ymylon y canllaw rhaglenni electronig. A fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn sicrhau y bydd rhaglenni o Gymru yn cael lle canolog o fewn y canllaw rhaglenni electronig? A ydym am dderbyn y ffaith bod NTL wedi cuddio S4C mewn cornel anghysbell o'r canllaw rhaglenni electronig i wylwyr cebl yn ne Cymru, ac nad ydyw'n fodlon dangos S4C2 o gwbl?

Mae hyn yn ein harwain at yr angen i sefydlu Ofcom Cymru. Dadleuais yr achos dros gael

not surprised to hear Huw Lewis abusing the opportunity to present a vision in this debate. However, I was surprised and disappointed to hear the Minister doing that. The Minister's job is to offer a vision. I hope that there will be a more wide-ranging discussion on this crucial issue of the rights of viewers in Wales when it comes before the Committee again.

Some Members have failed to understand that we are discussing two separate Bills here. The Bill to establish Ofcom has already been enacted, while the Communications Bill begins its passage through Parliament this week. It would be beneficial if Members understood that distinction before contributing to this debate. Before the Communications Bill begins its passage through Parliament, it is crucial that the Assembly states clearly that we are concerned about the rights of viewers in Wales, and that we are not willing to be at the periphery of the debate. We should state that we want to take responsibility for our citizens' rights.

I could raise several points, but time does not allow me to do so. We must ensure that we have a voice in terms of the content of broadcasting in Wales. The National Assembly must state clearly that we are not willing to be on the periphery of the debate on content. There has been mention of a dedicated English-language channel for Wales. Is *Eastenders* specifically for Wales? That kind of statement is absurd. We should take this discussion seriously.

Distribution is also important. At the moment, distributors such as Sky ensure that programmes from Wales are on the periphery of the electronic programme guide. Will the Government of Wales ensure that programmes from Wales have a central position within the EPG? Are we willing to accept the fact that NTL has hidden S4C in a remote corner of the EPG for cable viewers in south Wales, and that it is not willing to show S4C2 at all?

This leads us to the need to establish Ofcom Wales. I argued the case for the establishment

Ofcom Cymru yn ystod y ddadl yn y Siambra hon flwyddyn yn ôl. Nid wyf wedi symud modfedd o'm safbwyt bryd hynny. Mae'n abswrd bod Gweinidog mewn Llywodraeth ddatganoledig yn cyflwyno dadl dros beidio â datganoli grym a chyfrifoldeb dros ddarlledu. Ni ddeallaf y ddadl honno. Onid yw'n bryd inni gael hyder ac i beidio â dadlau'n barhaus dros gael un llais ar Ofcom, ond yn hytrach cael corff a fyddai'n gyfrifol am ddarlledu yng Nghymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** I welcome this debate, which highlights the fact that television is not just about entertainment, but also involves promoting social, cultural and political inclusion in our society. Lack of access to proper television reception and services can be a major barrier to tackling social exclusion in Wales. Hundreds of my constituents in the upper Afan valley face that situation following the decision by MCTV, a part of NTL, to withdraw cable provision from that community.

The people of Glyncorrwg, Cymmer and Blaengwynfi have no opportunity to access free-to-air television, even if we go down the road of the digital revolution. Even with the nine free-to-air digital transmitters in Wales, between two-thirds and three-quarters of the country will still remain uncovered. Consequently, there is no realistic prospect of these communities being able to receive adequate television reception or coverage. Much has been said about the problems of television coverage in rural Wales. However, if we consider the spatial distribution of possible television reception in the digital age, many of the upper Valley communities in Wales will be disadvantaged. These communities are among the most socially and economically deprived in Wales, and the fact that they will not be able to receive adequate television reception will further aggravate the social exclusion that they feel.

In his report on BBC funding, Gavyn Davies pointed out that the poorest 10 per cent of the population spend almost 2 per cent of their income on receiving adequate television reception. If people cannot receive free-to-air programming, they will have to resort to satellite television. This will increase income

of Ofcom Wales during the debate in this Chamber a year ago. I have not moved an inch from that stance. It is absurd that a Minister in a devolved Government presents an argument for not devolving power and responsibility for broadcasting. I do not understand that argument. Is it not time for us to have confidence and not argue perpetually for one voice on Ofcom, but rather establish a body to be responsible for broadcasting in Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** Croesawaf y ddadl hon, sy'n tanlinellu'r ffaith fod a wnelo teledu nid yn unig ag adloniant, ond â hyrwyddo cymhwysiant cymdeithasol, diwylliannol a gwleidyddol yn ein cymdeithas. Gall diffyg derbyniad a gwasanaethau teledu iawn fod yn rhwystr fawr i fynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae cannoedd o'm hetholwyr yng nghwm Afan uchaf yn wynebu'r sefyllfa honno yn dilyn y penderfyniad gan MCTV, rhan o NTL, i dynnu'r ddarpariaeth gebl o'r gymuned honno.

Nid oes gan bobl Glyncorrwg, Cymer a Blaengwynfi gyfle i weld teledu rhad-i'r-awyr, hyd yn oed os dilynwn ffordd y chwyldro digidol. Hyd yn oed gyda'r naw trosglwyddyd digidol rhad-i'r-awyr yng Nghymru, bydd rhwng dwy ran o dair a thri chwarter y wlad yn dal heb wasanaeth. Felly, nid oes posiblwydd realistic y gall y cymunedau hyn dderbyn signalau teledu digonol. Dywedwyd llawer am broblemau dosbarthiad teledu yn y Gymru wledig. Fodd bynnag, os ystyriwn ddosbarthiad gofodol derbyniad teledu posibl yn yr oes ddigidol, bydd llawer o cymunedau uwch y Cymoedd yng Nghymru dan anfantais. Mae'r cymunedau hyn ymhlið y rhai mwyaf difreintiedig yn gymdeithasol ac yn economaidd yng Nghymru, a bydd y ffaith na allant gael derbyniad teledu digonol yn ychwanegu at yr allgáu cymdeithasol a deimlant.

Yn ei adroddiad ar gyllid y BBC, nododd Gavyn Davies fod 10 y cant tlotaf y boblogaeth yn gwario bron 2 y cant o'u hincwm ar gael derbyniad teledu digonol. Os na all pobl gael rhagleni rhad-i'r-awyr, bydd yn rhaid iddynt droi at deledu lloeren. Bydd hyn yn cynyddu'r incwm a werir ar deledu ac

spent on television and social exclusion by 75 to 100 per cent. This is unacceptable to my constituents in the upper Afan valley, where we have an above-average number of people over 65 years of age, 12 to 13 per cent of the population receives income support, and 12 to 13 per cent of the population receives disability benefits.

We are presented with three opportunities to address this particular challenge. Because of the delay in digital television roll-out, we could suggest extending the relay coverage of the analogue channels. However, that would be short sighted in view of the commitment to digital television. We must therefore consider either discounted television licences for those communities unable to receive television, or discounted satellite dish receivers and associated equipment for all those communities that cannot receive free-to-air television.

**Peter Rogers:** The media is in danger of reinforcing a language divide that could stifle debate in Welsh politics. We must have debates on the basis of what people have to say; not according to what language they speak. Welsh should not be confined to S4C and English should not be excluded. There are programmes on S4C where a lack of subtitling makes it virtually impossible for non-Welsh speakers to follow what is going on, let alone contribute. The problem is just as acute on the other side. For example, I am sometimes surprised to see hard-line language activists not speaking Welsh on English-medium channels, as though they feel obliged to speak English or their message will not be broadcast. They should not feel that they must do that. There is a danger in broadcasters only seeking contributions to their programmes in a particular language. Broadcasters should not exclude those voices that we need to hear. We should guard against a media language divide stifling debate on the issues that matter to us all, whatever our first language.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I have two small points. First, does Plaid Cymru think that the people of Wales would be happy to pay extra on the television licence to fund a new English-language channel for Wales? Have they costed that? Secondly, while I support

allgáu cymdeithasol ryw 75 i 100 y cant. Mae hyn yn annerbyniol i'm hetholwyr yng nghwm Afan uchaf, lle mae gennym nifer uwch na'r cyfartaledd o bobl dros 65 mlwydd oed, mae 12 i 13 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn derbyn cymorth incwm, ac mae 12 i 13 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn derbyn budd-daliadau anabledd.

Mae gennym dri chyfle i ymateb i'r her arbennig hon. Oherwydd yr oedi wrth gyflwyno teledu digidol, gallem awgrymu ymestyn amrediad trosglwyddo'r sianeli analog. Fodd bynnag, ateb byrdymor fyddai hynny yn wyneb yr ymrwymiad i deledu digidol. Rhaid inni felly ystyried naill ai roi trwyddedau teledu rhad i'r cymunedau hynny sy'n methu derbyn teledu, neu ddysglau lloeren ac offer cysylltiedig rhad i'r holl gymunedau hynny na all dderbyn teledu rhad-i'r-awyr.

**Peter Rogers:** Mae perygl i'r cyfryngau atgyfnerthu rhaniad iaith a allai fygu dadl yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru. Rhaid inni gael dadleuon ar sail yr hyn sydd gan bobl i'w ddweud, nid yn ôl pa iaith a siaradant. Ni ddylid cyfyngu'r Gymraeg i S4C ac ni ddylid cau Saesneg allan. Mae rhaglenni ar S4C lle mae diffyg is-deitlo'n ei gwneud hi bron yn amhosibl i bobl ddi-Gymraeg ddilyn yr hyn sy'n digwydd, heb sôn am gyfrannu. Mae'r broblem lawn cyn waethed ar yr ochr arall. Er enghraifft, weithiau caf fy synnu o weld gweithredwyr di-ildio dros yr iaith yn siarad Saesneg ar sianeli Saesneg, fel pe baent yn teimlo rheidrwydd i siarad Saesneg er mwyn i'w neges gael ei darlledu. Ni ddylent deimlo fod rhaid iddynt wneud hynny. Mae perygl wrth i ddarllledwyr geisio cyfraniadau i'w rhaglenni mewn iaith benodol yn unig. Ni ddylai darllledwyr gau allan y lleisiau hynny y mae angen inni eu clywed. Dylem ochel rhag i raniad iaith ar y cyfryngau fygu dadl ar y materion sy'n bwysig inni i gyd, waeth beth fo'n mamiaith.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae gennyf ddau bwynt bach. Yn gyntaf, a ydyw Plaid Cymru'n credu y byddai pobl Cymru'n hapus i dalu mwy am eu trwydded deledu i ariannu sianel Saesneg newydd i Gymru? A ydynt wedi ystyried cost hynny? Yn ail, tra fy mod yn

amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, I am slightly nervous when I read ‘national culture’. Whose definition of culture is it? We must remember that Wales is multi-cultural. I wished to place that on the record, to remind Members that it should not be just the stereotypical view of Welsh people and Welshness often seen on television; we must reflect the wider cultural richness of the country.

**Dafydd Wigley rose—**

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Will you give way to Dafydd Wigley?

**Lorraine Barrett:** I have finished now.

**Delyth Evans:** Yr wyf wedi'm drysu'n llwyr gan reswm Plaid Cymru dros ddewis cynnig y ddadl hon. Disgwyliais rywfaint o oleuni yn arraith Owen John Thomas, ond ni chawsom hynny. Ni ddeallaf resymeg Plaid Cymru. Beth fyddai pwrrpas rhoi cyfrifoldeb rheoleiddio i'r Cynulliad pan fo Llywodraeth Prydain ar fin sefydlu corff rheoleiddio newydd sydd wedi cael croeso eang gan bob un sydd â rhan i'w chwarae yn y diwydiant hwn? Sut byddai rheoleiddio gan y Cynulliad yn gwella'r drefn honno mewn unrhyw ffordd? Mae'r Gweinidog yn iawn; ni fyddai—

**Owen John Thomas:** Syniad hirdymor yw hynny. Yr ateb uniongyrchol oedd i gael cynrychiolaeth ar Ofcom yn y cyfamser. Yr oedd hynny'n holllol glir.

**Delyth Evans:** Yr wyf yn deall y pwyntiau yn eich cynnig, ond teimlaf o hyd nad oes rhesymeg y tu ôl i'r ddadl.

Sut y byddai rheoleiddio gan y Cynulliad yn gwella'r drefn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan yn ei chynnig? Byddai'r newid yr ydych yn ei gynnig yn ein hynysu yma yng Nghymru. Nid oes dwywaith am hynny. Mae angen y gwrthwyneb i hynny arnom, sef sicrhau bod Cymru yn rhan gref o'r datblygiadau technolegol a darlledu anferth sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid i Gymru gael cyfran deg o'r datblygiadau hynny, hyn hytrach na thorri ei hunan i ffwrdd oddi wrthynt.

cefnogi gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, yr wyf ychydig yn nerfus pan ddarllenaf ‘diwylliant cenedlaethol’. Pwy sy'n diffinio'r diwylliant hwn? Rhaid inni gofio bod Cymru'n aml-ddiwylliant. Yr oeddwn eisiau cofnodi hynny, er mwyn atgoffa Aelodau na ddylid ystyried dim ond y wedd ystrydebol o Gymry a Chymreictod a welir yn aml ar y teledu; mae'n rhaid inni adlewyrchu cyfoeth diwylliannol ehanguach y wlad.

**Dafydd Wigley a gododd—**

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A wnewch chi ildio i Dafydd Wigley?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf wedi gorffen yn awr.

**Delyth Evans:** I am baffled as to why Plaid Cymru tabled this motion. I expected Owen John Thomas's speech to shed some light on the issue, but it did not. I do not understand Plaid Cymru's reasoning. What would be the point of giving regulatory responsibility to the Assembly when the British Government is poised to establish a new regulatory body that has received a broad welcome from everyone with a role to play in this industry? How would regulation by the Assembly in any way improve on that system? The Minister is right; it would not—

**Owen John Thomas:** That is a long-term idea. The immediate solution was representation on Ofcom in the interim. That was totally clear.

**Delyth Evans:** I understand the points in your motion, but I still feel that there is no logic behind the debate.

How would regulation by the Assembly improve on the system that the Westminster Government is proposing? The change that you are proposing would isolate us here in Wales. That is a certainty. What we need is the opposite to that, which is to ensure that Wales plays a full part in the massive technological and broadcasting developments that are taking place at present. Wales must have a fair share of those developments, and not cut herself off from them.

5:20 p.m.

**Cynog Dafis:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Delyth yn sylweddoli ein bod yn deal mai Ewrop yw cyd-destun teledu'r dyfodol. Ceir rheoleiddio a chyfraniad pwysig ar lefel Ewropeaidd a byd-eang. Prydain sydd yn gul ac yn fach yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Mae'n rhaid inni edrych yn ehangach na hynny, ac, ar yr un pryd, ystyried sut y gallwn greu plafform effeithiol i Gymru fod yn rhan o'r broses fydeang honno.

**Delyth Evans:** Nid wyf yn derbyn y ddadl honno. Mae'r model newydd ar gyfer Ofcom, a gynigiwyd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, wedi ei groesawu fel rhywbeth creadigol a mentrus i'r dyfodol. Mae pob rhan o'r sector yn ei groesawu, nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond mewn gwledydd eraill, oherwydd y ffordd y mae'n rhyddhau'r diwydiant gan osod seiliau cryf ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Mae eich cynnig heddiw yn dangos pa mor gwl eich meddwl yr ydych fel plaid. Eich unig ateb i bob sialens yw torri Cymru i ffwrdd o'r hyn sydd yn digwydd ym mhobman arall. Nid oes cefnogaeth i'r fath gynnig ymhlið y darlledwyr. Byddai eich ffrindiau yn y BBC ac yn S4C yn dweud wrthych nad ydynt am weld yr hyn a gynigiwch. Nid datganoli yw'r ateb i bopeth. Enghraifft glir yw hon o sut y gallai datganoli niweidio dyfodol y sector pwysig hwn yng Nghymru

Cyfeiriad yn fyr at ITV Digital a'r colli swyddi yn Noc Penfro. Dengys hynny yn y ffordd fwyaf creulon—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'ch amser ar ben.

**Cynog Dafis:** Cyfeiriad at ITV Digital gan fod Delyth Evans wedi cyfeirio ato, a diolchaf iddi am hynny. Pan gyflwynwyd y ddadl hon, nid oeddem wedi rhagweld y cyhoeddiad difrifol hwn am golli 900 o swyddi o ganlyniad i gwmp ITV Digital. Mae'n ergyd drom i ran bwysig o Gymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn gwneud datganiad ar hynny ddydd Mawrth nesaf i ddangos sut y bydd modd defnyddio'r cyfleuster gwych yn

**Cynog Dafis:** I am sure that Delyth realises that we understand that Europe is the context of television in the future. There will be regulation and an important contribution on a European and global level. It is Britain that is narrow and small in that context. We must look further afield, and, at the same time, consider how we can create an effective platform for Wales to be a part of that global process.

**Delyth Evans:** I do not accept that argument. The Ofcom model, proposed by the Westminster Government, has been welcomed as innovative and adventurous for the future. Every part of the sector welcomes it, not only in Wales, but in other countries because of the way in which it frees up the industry and lays strong foundations for the future.

Your motion today shows how narrow-minded you are as a party. Your only answer to every challenge is to cut Wales off from what is happening elsewhere. There is no support for this kind of proposal among the broadcasters. Your friends in the BBC and S4C would tell you that they do not wish to see the kind of developments that you are proposing. Devolution is not the answer to everything. This is a clear example of where devolution would be detrimental to the future of this important sector in Wales.

I will refer briefly to ITV Digital and the job losses in Pembroke Dock. That shows in the cruellest way—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is up.

**Cynog Dafis:** I will say a few words about ITV Digital as Delyth Evans referred to it, and I thank her for that. When we proposed this debate, we did not foresee this serious announcement about the loss of 900 jobs as a result of the collapse of ITV Digital. It is a great blow to an important part of Wales. I hope that the Minister for Economic Development will make a statement next Tuesday to show how we can use the splendid facility in Pembroke Dock in the

Noc Penfro ar gyfer y dyfodol yng nghyd-destun y math o ddatblygiadau technolegol a fydd yn digwydd ym maes darlledu.

Pan gyflwynwyd y cynnig, fe'i cyflwynwyd mewn ffordd gadarnhaol er mwyn cael dadl a gwahanol safbwytiau ynglŷn â dyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi fy siomi gan ymateb plentynnaidd y Gweinidog, a chan ddiffig gweledigaeth Delyth Evans. Ni chafwyd awgrym gan neb, heblaw am Blaid Cymru, o unrhyw weledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru. Os nad ein gweledigaeth ni, pa weledigaeth a gawn ar gyfer dyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru? Soniwyd am Gymru'n encilio i ryw fath o gulni—i'r gwrthwyneb, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod y math o newidiadau technolegol sydd yn digwydd yn y byd yn golygu nad yw'r *status quo* yn opsiwn bellach.

Caiff hynny i gyd ei sguo i'r naill ochr gan y chwyldro sydd yn digwydd. Mae cartrefi yn derbyn cannoedd o sianeli; mae gwahanol dechnolegau yn cydgyfeirio; mae pobl yn gwyllo'r teledu ar eu ffonau symudol; ac mae'r rhyngrwyd yn dod at ei gilydd yn un. Mae gwylwyr yn dewis beth i'w wyllo fwyfwy gyda'u canllawiau rhaglenni electronig. Mae plant eisoes yn gwrthod y syniad o sianel a chyfres o raglenni ag amserau neilltuol. Maent yn chwilio am yr hyn y maent eisiau, lle bynnag y'i mynnant.

Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, codir cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r patrwm presennol a sail ariannol y ddarpariaeth bresennol. Nid oedd Huw Lewis wedi dechrau deall hynny. Efallai na fydd y drwydded deledu, sydd yn sail i gyllido'r BBC ar hyn o bryd, yn gallu parhau ar ôl 2006, ac mae'n gwestiwn mawr i ba raddau y bydd S4C yn gallu dibynnu ar gyllid oddi wrth—

**Huw Lewis a gododd—**

**Cynog Dafis:** Na, nid oeddech am glywed yr hyn a oedd gen i i'w ddweud. Ni fydd S4C yn medru dibynnu yn y dyfodol ar y math o ardoll a dderbynia ar hyn o bryd oddi wrth y cwmnïau masnachol. Mae'r ffaith y bydd cannoedd o sianeli ar gael yn golygu y bydd y refeniw a dderbynia sianeli masnachol cydnabyddedig yn lleihau. Felly mae

future in the context of the kind of technological developments that will take place in broadcasting.

When we tabled this motion, it was presented in a positive way so that we could have a debate and hear different perspectives on the future of broadcasting in Wales. I have been disappointed by the Minister's childish response and by Delyth Evans's lack of vision. No vision has been suggested by anyone, apart from Plaid Cymru, for the future of broadcasting in Wales. If not our vision, then whose vision will we have for the future of broadcasting in Wales? There has been talk of Wales regressing into some kind of narrowness—on the contrary, we recognise that the kind of technological advances that are happening in the world mean that the status quo is no longer an option.

All that will be swept aside by the revolution that is taking place. Homes have hundreds of channels, various technologies are converging; people are watching television on their mobile phones; and the internet is coming together as one. Viewers choose what to watch with their electronic programme guides. Children are already rejecting the idea of a channel and a series of programmes at particular times. They look for what they want, wherever they want it.

In that context, the current pattern and financial basis of the current provision is called into question. Huw Lewis has not even begun to understand that. The licence fee, which is the basis for funding the BBC at present, might not be able to continue after 2006, and it is a big question as to what extent S4C will be able to depend on funding from—

**Huw Lewis rose—**

**Cynog Dafis:** No, you did not want to listen to what I had to say. S4C will not be able to rely in future on the kind of levy that it receives at present from the commercial companies. The fact that there will be hundreds of channels available means that the revenue of recognised commercial channels will decrease. Therefore we have a

chwyldro technolegol yn digwydd, a rhaid inni ystyried sut i baratoi Cymru i ddelio â hynny i'r dyfodol.

Mae'n rhaid nodi hefyd fod y *status quo* yn holol annerbyniol. Mae'n wir bod gennym wasanaeth Cymraeg rhagorol sydd yn integredig a chydlynol, ond mae'r ddarpariaeth Saesneg yn anfoddhaol. Pwy all ddisgrifio BBC 1 a BBC 2 fel sianeli Saesneg i Gymru? Y cyfan sydd gennym yw cyfres o raglenni disodli. Nid oes gennym wasanaeth cenedlaethol cynhwysfawr. Cyfeiriodd Delyth Evans at y ffaith bod darlleddwyr yn trafod sianel Saesneg i Gymru. Dywed Huw Jones fod S4C2 ar gael, ac mae partneriaeth eisoes rhwng S4C a'r BBC o ran darlledu rhaglenni'r Cynulliad ar S4C2. Pam nad yw'r sianel honno'n cael ei datblygu? Mae'r BBC wedi sôn am BBC Choice fel opsiwn arall ar gyfer sianel Saesneg i Gymru.

Mae hwn yn fater pwysig. Pe ystyrid S4C2 yn opsiwn, y cam cyntaf fyddai defnyddio'r sianel fel ail gartref ar gyfer y deunydd a ddarperir gan HTV a'r BBC ar hyn o bryd. Dros amser, gellid symud y cyfan i'r sianel honno. Dyna fydd yn ein galluogi i greu plattform ar gyfer y dyfodol er mwyn inni ddarparu gwasanaeth gwirioneddol effeithiol i Gymru. Nid yw'r *status quo* yn opsiwn, ac mae ein hyfory yn cael ei newid gan chwyldro technolegol na allwn ragweld beth fydd ei ddyfodol.

Trof at fater radio lleol, y gŵyr Elin Jones dipyn amdano hefyd. Mae'n afresymol fod yr holl awdurdod o ran radio lleol yn gorwedd gyda'r Awdurdod Radio yn Llundain. Caiff yr awdurdod hwnnw ei drosglwyddo i Ofcom, ond dylai fod gennym lais yng Nghymru i fynegi barn ynglŷn â pha gwmnïau ddylai gael trwyddedau ar gyfer darlledu yn y dyfodol.

Er mwyn dweud rhywbeth cadarnhaol am welliant y Llywodraeth, yr wyf yn falch ei bod yn derbyn ein galwad am astudiaeth o ddyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru. Pe na baem wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn, ni wn pa un ai a fyddem wedi cael yr ymrwymiad hwnnw. Nid wyf yn gwybod pam y mae angen cynnal yr astudiaeth dan nawdd Cymru'n Creu. Mae

technological revolution on our hands, and we must consider how to prepare Wales to deal with its consequences in the future.

It must also be noted that the *status quo* is wholly unacceptable. It is true that we have an excellent Welsh-language service that is integrated and cohesive, but the English-language provision is inadequate. Who could describe BBC 1 and BBC 2 as English-language channels for Wales? All we have is a series of opt-out programmes. We do not have a comprehensive national service. Delyth Evans referred to the fact that discussions are taking place among broadcasters about an English-language channel for Wales. Huw Jones has said that S4C2 is available, and a partnership already exists between S4C and the BBC in terms of Assembly coverage on S4C2. Why is that channel not developed? The BBC has mooted BBC Choice as another option for an English-language channel for Wales.

This is an important matter. If S4C2 were to be taken as an option, the first step would be to use the channel as a second home for material currently provided by HTV and the BBC. In time, it could all be moved to that channel. This is what will enable us to build a platform for the future, in order to provide a truly effective service for Wales. The *status quo* is not an option, and our future is being transformed by a technological revolution, whose future we cannot predict.

I now turn to the matter of local radio, about which Elin Jones is also quite knowledgeable. It is unreasonable that all the authority in terms of local radio lies with the Radio Authority in London. The authority will be transferred to Ofcom, but Wales should be able to voice its opinions in terms of which companies should be granted licences to broadcast in future.

In order to say something positive about the Government's amendment, I am pleased that it accepts our call for a study of the future of broadcasting in Wales. Had we not tabled this motion, I do not know whether that commitment would have been forthcoming. I do not know why the study needs to be conducted under the auspices of Cymru'n

angen sicrhau bod adnoddau digonol ar gael i wneud yr astudiaeth yn iawn. Mae'n bwysig bod yr astudiaeth yn ystyried yr opsiynau i gyd ar gyfer y dyfodol. Dylid ystyried y cwestiwn ariannol hefyd. Dylem gydnabod bod y cyllid a ddaw i Gymru ar hyn o bryd yn hael. Mae S4C yn cael cyllid sylweddol dros ben, a gall Cymru hefyd ddefnyddio adnoddau'r BBC ar gyfer y gwasanaeth newyddion ac ati. Nid oes rheswm pam na ddylai Cymru yn y dyfodol, neu Gymru ymlywodraethol hyd yn oed, allu taro bargin gyda'r BBC i brynu a defnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd, pe bai'n dod i hynny. Anodd yw rhagweld pa fath o ddyfodol sydd o'n blaen. Serch hynny, credwn yn gryf yn yr angan am wasanaeth cenedlaethol integredig.

Gobeithiaf y bydd yr astudiaeth yn ystyried modelau tramor, gan gynnwys modelau rhanbarthau Ewropeaidd megis Fflandrys, Euskadi, Catalonia ac ati. Dylid edrych hefyd ar sut y mae cenhedloedd bach megis Iwerddon a gwledydd y Baltig yn cyllido gwasanaeth darlledu cyhoeddus sydd yn seiliedig, i raddau, ar drethiant ac incwm masnachol. Rhaid i'r astudiaeth fod yn un pellgyrhaeddol sydd yn ystyried yr opsiynau i gyd. Mawr obeithiaf y bydd y canlyniadau yn rhoi cyfeiriad inni ynglŷn â datblygiad darlledu yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 30, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amendment 1: For 30, Abstain 13, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann

Creu. We need to ensure that sufficient resources are available to carry out this study properly. It is important that the study takes into account all options for the future. The question of funding should also be considered. We should acknowledge that Wales receives generous financial provision at present. S4C receives substantial funding, and Wales can also draw on the BBC's resources for news services and so on. There is no reason whatsoever why Wales, even an autonomous Wales, could not in future come to an agreement with the BBC to buy and use the resources already available, if it came to that. It is difficult to predict what kind of future faces us. However, we believe strongly in the need for an integrated national service.

I hope that this study will consider foreign models, including those of European regions such as Flanders, Euskadi, Catalonia and so on. It should also look at how small nations, such as Ireland and the Baltic countries, fund public service broadcasting that is based, to some extent, on taxation and commercial income. This must be a far-reaching study that considers all the options. I very much hope that its conclusions will give us a direction as to how broadcasting in Wales should progress in the future.

Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 31, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Amendment 2: For 31, Abstain 13, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny

Rogers, Peter  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment carried.*

5:30 p.m.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 34, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Amendment 3: For 34, Abstain 13, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 8, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 4: For 8, Abstain 13, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet

Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Amended motion:

*the National Assembly*

*1. notes the major importance of broadcasting to the quality of life of the people, the cultural identity of Wales, and the health of our democracy;*

*2. recognises the need to ensure good quality English and Welsh-medium broadcast access and provision during the transfer from analogue to digital;*

*3. recognises that broadcasting will be considered by the Commission on Assembly Powers established under the Chairmanship of Lord Richard;*

*4. supports the need for Welsh representation on Ofcom;*

*5. calls upon the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language to commission a study on Welsh broadcasting under the auspices of Cymru'n Creu;*

*6. acknowledges the substantial contribution by S4C to broadcasting in Wales and the development of our national culture;*

*7. recognises the responsibility of the main broadcasters to provide comprehensive, balanced programming and news coverage for Wales.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. yn nodi mawr bwysigrwydd darlledu i ansawdd bywyd y werin, i hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru ac i iechyd ein democrataeth;*

*2. yn cydnabod yr angen i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth darlledu Saesneg a Chymraeg yn cynnig mynediad a darpariaeth o safon uchel yn ystod y cyfnod trosglwyddo o analog i ddigidol;*

*3. yn cydnabod y bydd darlledu yn cael ei ystyried gan y Comisiwn ar Bwerau'r Cynulliad dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Arglwydd Richard;*

*4. yn cefnogi'r angen am gynrychiolaeth Gymreig ar Ofcom;*

*5. yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg i gomisiynu astudiaeth o ddarlledu yng Nghymru dan nawdd Cymru'n Creu;*

*6. yn cydnabod cyfraniad sylwedol S4C i ddarlledu yng Nghymru ac i ddatblygiad ein diwylliant cenedlaethol;*

*7. yn cydnabod cyfrifoldeb y prif ddarlleddywyr i ddarparu gwasanaeth rhaglenni a gwasanaeth newyddion cynhwysfawr a chytbwys ar gyfer Cymru.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amended motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary

Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.10, postpones the short debate scheduled for today.*

I am in danger of following in the footsteps of Janice Gregory in the short debate merry-go-round. However, I propose this motion in view of the lateness of the day.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10, yn gohirio'r ddadl fer a drefnwyd ar gyfer heddiw.*

Yr wyf mewn perygl o ddilyn yn ôl troed Janice Gregory ar feri-go-rownd dadleuon byrion. Fodd bynnag, cynigiaf y cynnig hwn oherwydd ei bod mor hwyr.

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close. I thank Members for their contributions.

**Y Llywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.31 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.31 p.m.*